

LIST OF MEMBERS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

SPEAKER

Dr T-B Gurirab (Mr)

DEPUTY SPEAKER AND CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE

Ms Loide Kasingo

THE CABINET

MINISTERS

(21 March 2010 – Elected in terms of Article 133 of the Constitution)

Mr N Angula	<i>(Prime Minister)</i>
Mr M Hausiku	<i>(Deputy Prime Minister)</i>
Dr G H Geingob (Mr)	<i>(Trade and Industry)</i>
Ms P Iivula-Ithana	<i>(Justice)</i>
Mr N Mbumba	<i>(Safety and Security)</i>
Dr A Kawana (Mr)	<i>(Presidential Affairs & Attorney-General)</i>
Ms S Kuugongelwa-Amadhila	<i>(Finance)</i>
Mr J Ekandjo	<i>(Regional and Local Government, Housing and Rural Development)</i>
Mr U Nujoma	<i>(Foreign Affairs)</i>
Mr E Nghimtina	<i>(Works and Transport)</i>
Dr A Iyambo (Mr)	<i>(Education)</i>
Ms D Sioka	<i>(Gender Equality and Child Welfare)</i>
Mr J Mutorwa	<i>(Agriculture, Water & Forestry)</i>
Mr J Kaapanda	<i>(Information & Communication Technology)</i>
Ms N Nandi-Ndaitwah	<i>(Environment and Tourism)</i>
Dr N Iyambo (Mr)	<i>(Veterans Affairs)</i>
Mr I Ngatjizeko	<i>(Labour & Social Welfare)</i>
Mr A !Naruseb	<i>(Lands & Resettlement)</i>
Dr R Kamwi (Mr)	<i>(Health and Social Services)</i>

Ms R Nghidinwa	<i>(Home Affairs and Immigration)</i>
Mr C Namoloh	<i>(Defence)</i>
Mr B Esau	<i>(Fisheries and Marine Resources)</i>
Mr I Katali	<i>(Mines and Energy)</i>
Mr K Kazenambo	<i>(Youth, National Service, Sport and Culture)</i>

DEPUTY MINISTERS

(21 March 2010 – Elected in terms of Article 133 of the Constitution)

Ms P Haingura	<i>(Health and Social Services)</i>
Ms A Muharukua	<i>(Gender Equality and Child Welfare)</i>
Mr A Muheua	<i>(Labour and Social Welfare)</i>
Ms L Lucas	<i>(Defence)</i>
Mr P Iilonga	<i>(Agriculture, Water & Forestry)</i>
Mr E Utoni	<i>(Safety and Security)</i>
Mr T Nambahu	<i>(Justice)</i>
Mr T Tweya	<i>(Trade and Industry)</i>
Dr S C Ankama (Mr)	<i>(Works and Transport)</i>
Mr P Mushelenga	<i>(Foreign Affairs)</i>
Mr P Shifeta	<i>(Youth, National Service, Sport & Culture)</i>
Mr W Isaacks	<i>(Mines and Energy)</i>
Mr S Simataa	<i>(Information and Communication Technology)</i>
Mr E Kaiyamo	<i>(Home Affairs and Immigration)</i>
Ms P Beukes	<i>(Regional and Local Government, Housing and Rural Development)</i>
Mr U Herunga	<i>(Environment and Tourism)</i>
Mr C Schlettwein	<i>(Finance)</i>
Dr. D Namwandi (Mr)	<i>(Education)</i>

SECRETARY

Mr. J Jacobs

DEPUTY SECRETARY

Mr F S Harker

LIST OF MEMBERS AND PARTIES WHICH THEY REPRESENT

ALL PEOPLE'S PARTY (APP)

Mr I Shixwameni *(Chief Whip and Party Leader)*

CONGRESS OF DEMOCRATS (COD)

Mr B Ulenga *(Chief Whip and Party Leader)*

DTA OF NAMIBIA

Mr K Kaura *(Party Leader)*

Mr P Moongo *(Chief Whip)*

NATIONAL UNITY DEMOCRATIC ORGANISATION OF NAMIBIA (NUDO)

Mr K Riruako *(Party Leader)*

Mr A Tjihuike *(Chief Whip)*

RALLY FOR DEMOCRACY AND PROGRESS (RDP)

Mr S Bezuidenhout

Mr Hidipo Hamutenya *(Party Leader)*

Ms A Limbo

Mr H Lucks

Mr P Naholo

Mr K Nehova

Mr J Nyamu

Mr A Von Wietersheim

REPUBLICAN PARTY

Ms C Gowases

SWANU

Mr U Maamberua *(Chief Whip and Party Leader)*

SWAPO OF NAMIBIA

Mr B Amathila	
Dr M Amweelo (Mr)	<i>(Chief Whip)</i>
Mr N Angula	<i>(Prime Minister)</i>
Dr S C Ankama (Mr)	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Ms P Beukes	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Mr E Dingara	
Mr J Ekandjo	<i>(Minister)</i>
Mr B Esau	<i>(Minister)</i>
Dr H Geingob (Mr)	<i>(Minister)</i>
Dr T-B Gurirab (Mr)	<i>(Speaker)</i>
Ms P Haingura	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Mr M Hausiku	<i>(Deputy Prime Minister)</i>
Mr U Herunga	
Mr P Iilonga	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Mr W Isaacks	
Ms P Iivula-Ithana	<i>(Minister)</i>
Dr A Iyambo (Mr)	<i>(Minister)</i>
Dr N Iyambo (Mr)	<i>(Minister)</i>
Mr J Kaapanda	<i>(Minister)</i>
Mr E Kaiyamo	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Dr R Kamwi (Mr)	<i>(Minister)</i>
Mr P I Kapia	
Ms L Kasingo	<i>(Deputy Speaker)</i>
Mr I Katali	<i>(Minister)</i>
Ms J Kavetuna	
Dr A Kawana (Mr)	<i>(Minister)</i>
Mr K Kazenambo	<i>(Minister)</i>
Ms S Kuugongelwa – Amadhila	<i>(Minister)</i>
Ms L Lucas	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Ms S Makgone	
Ms A Manombe-Ncube	
Mr N Mbumba	<i>(Minister)</i>
Ms A Muharukua	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Mr A Muheaua	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Mr P Mushelenga	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Mr J Mutorwa	<i>(Minister)</i>
Mr B Mwaningange	
Mr T Nambahu	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>

Mr C Namoloh	<i>(Minister)</i>
Dr D Namwandi (Mr)	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Mr A !Naruseb	<i>(Minister)</i>
Ms E !Nawases-Taeyele	<i>(Assistant Whip)</i>
Mr I Ngatjizeko	<i>(Minister)</i>
Ms N Nandi-Ndaitwah	<i>(Minister)</i>
Ms R Nghidinwa	<i>(Minister)</i>
Mr E Nghimtina	<i>(Minister)</i>
Mr U Nujoma	<i>(Minister)</i>
Mr P Shifeta	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Ms D Sioka	<i>(Minister)</i>
Mr T Tweya	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Mr F Ueitele	
Mr E Utoni	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Mr Piet Van der Walt	
Ms L Witbooi	

UNITED DEMOCRATIC FRONT (UDF)

Mr J //Garoëb	<i>(Party Leader)</i>
Mr S Tjongarero	<i>(Chief Whip)</i>

APPOINTED BY THE PRESIDENT IN TERMS OF ARTICLE 32(5)(c) OF THE CONSTITUTION

Ms M Jankowski	
Prof. P Katjavivi (Mr)	<i>(Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee)</i>
Mr C Schleittwein	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Mr S Simataa	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Ms S Swartz	
Ms A Tjongarero	

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS
WINDHOEK
08 MARCH 2012**

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any Petitions? Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Deputy Minister of Finance.

TABLING: REPORTS OF THE AUDITOR-GENERAL

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: I lay upon the Table the Reports of the Auditor-General on the Accounts of –

1. Municipality of Windhoek for the Financial Year ended 30 June 2008;
 2. Municipality of Gobabis for the Financial Year ended 30 June 2011;
 3. Town Council of Omuthiya for the Financial Year ended 30 June 2011; and
 4. Town Council of Okahao for the Financial Year ended 30 June 2011.
-

08 March 2012

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON DR KAMWI**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Member please table the Reports? Any Notice of Questions? Any Notice of Motions? Ministerial Statements? Minister of Health and Social Services.

MINISTERIAL STATEMENT

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES:
Honourable Deputy Speaker, thank you, for giving me the Floor. Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, I rise to make a statement correcting something that appeared in the *Confidenté* article on the Global Fund against HIV, TB and malaria.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, I am sure that the majority of the Honourable Members may have seen and read the headlines of today's edition of *Confidenté* about, "*Kamwi Accused of Conspiring Against his own Ministry.*"

For seasoned politicians that we all are, I am sure that some of you may have laughed when you read it, as no politician, no Minister, no matter how incompetent one may be or inexperienced, would conspire against his or her own Ministry.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Global Fund against AIDS, TB and Malaria and PEPFAR support to Namibia since 2002/2003 have brought about immense support to our country. We have been able to dramatically reduce malaria cases and deaths to what is termed today an elimination stage. TB programme reached 85% treatment success rate and the number of new cases are steadily declining. On HIV/AIDS I believe I do not need to remind everyone in this Chamber how far we have come. 90% of those in need of ART, Anti-Retroviral Therapy and morality due to AIDS-related illnesses have significantly decreased. PEPFAR, on the other hand, has since informed us that their funding to Namibia will steadily be declining over the next few years since we are no longer in an

08 March 2012

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON DR KAMWI**

emergency situation regarding HIV/AIDS.

Regarding the Global Fund against AIDS, TB and malaria, I am sure you are all aware of the suspension of funding to the Global Fund against AIDS, TB and malaria by major donor countries following allegations of mismanagement of grants in some countries. This has resulted in the Global Fund against AIDS, TB and malaria cancelling its call for proposals for Round 11 last year as funds at hand were unable to meet countries' expectations for funding.

In commenting on the *Confidenté* article, I would like to start by saying that all these are well-engineered and highly destructive operations mounted by a handful of people who have their own interest over and above the interest of the Namibian people. It is all about keeping unsustainable and exorbitant salaries that are given to some expatriates who are working at the Programme Management Unit of the Global Fund here in Namibia. I have never asked the Global Fund against AIDS, TB and malaria to cut its funding to Namibia. The letters are available for scrutiny, I have them.

The letter of 15 February 2012 which I was poorly briefed about and rushed to sign is indeed the one that on its Paragraph 5 calls for an end of the Global Fund against TB and malaria programmes in Namibia over a period of three to four years. This same letter implores the Global Fund against AIDS, TB and malaria's board chair to intervene with the Global Fund against AIDS, TB and malaria Secretariat to approve the retention of all current staff at current salary levels until more clarity on the future of the programme prevails. In other words, *sine die* that is what is in Paragraph 7 of that letter. Hence my second letter to correct the facts and to put the record straight.

The Global Fund against AIDS, TB and malaria had made it categorically clear from the Technical Review Panel, (TRP) that the salary levels of the Namibia supported Global Fund against AIDS, TB and malaria programme were indeed exorbitant in some cases and certainly unsustainable. The TRP called for a review of the salary levels back in 2010. In November 2011 a team of the Global Fund against AIDS, TB

08 March 2012

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON DR KAMWI**

and malaria visited Namibia and we discussed the salary issue among other matters. It was agreed that the Government would allow on-going contracts to come to an end with current salary levels to avoid disruption of services and labour disputes. Government however needed to urgently find ways and means of negotiating new salary levels which were compatible with equivalent national positions and sustainable to the Global Fund against AIDS, TB and malaria. This position had been cleared with my principals and it is the stand of the Government.

The letter date the 15th of February 2012 grossly disregards this agreement and requests the Global Fund against AIDS, TB and malaria to maintain current salary levels until “*we see clear.*” This is not only unprofessional, but also irresponsible. I regret that people that I trust may have misled me into signing such a letter.

The writer of the article has been misinformed about on-going negotiations between the Ministry’s top management and the Global Fund against AIDS, TB and malaria. For the information of the Honourable Members, for the past 18 months or so, meaningful constructive discussions between the Ministry’s top management and the Global Fund against AIDS, TB and malaria have been protracted, inconclusive, unmanageable and stagnant, to say the least, mainly because of issues related to conditions precedent that have not been fulfilled by the Ministry’s top management, including the salary issue.

I had to intervene to clarify the position of Government, which I summarised below. Whoever wants further details can consult me at the office of outside.

1. Namibia is extremely grateful for the Global Fund against AIDS, TB and malaria support to date
2. In recognition of on-going global financial hurdles, Namibia will strategize for a responsible and orderly transition to increased domestic funding for our programme. The current Budget tabled by the Honourable Minister of Finance already makes provision for a component of the challenged programmes to be addressed.

08 March 2012

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON DR KAMWI**

3. Unsustainable and exorbitant salaries paid to expatriates that are performing duties that can be performed by available and competent Namibians should be discontinued henceforth as soon as their contracts come to an end in March and April 2012. I am, in reference to the Programme Management Unit of the Global Fund here in Windhoek and the Programme Management Unit Finance Manager. With the current unemployment levels in this country it amounts to conspiring against this Government's position to keep paying such levels of salaries to expatriates.
4. For the information of the Honourable Members, I have reviewed the CVs of the expatriates in question and there is nothing special about their academic qualifications or experiences that cannot be matched by a Namibian. Their job descriptions can easily be managed by Namibians. What they are doing is not rocket science. Namibians with equivalent qualifications in those positions can only fail if there is no proper handover and if all the available information is not passed on to them. In this regard we are in agreement with my Senior Colleague behind me, the Honourable Minister of Home Affairs and Immigration that work permits for these expatriates in question should not be renewed.
5. I have requested the Global Fund against AIDS, TB and malaria to allow current contracts to come to an end at the end of Phase 1, that is towards the end of this month. The end of Phase 2 is in June 2013 although committed funds end in June 2012. It should be clear to everyone that no doctor or pharmacist or NGO should be misled that I requested Global Fund against AIDS, TB and malaria to cut funding to Namibia. Paragraphs 7, 9 and 10 of my letter mentioned above are very clear. I do not want disruption of activities, I am interested in an orderly transition and want to avoid negative impact to the programme. Please ensure that my letter is carefully read and understood in that context.
6. The Global Fund against AIDS, TB and malaria is very clear that unless the salary levels are reviewed, there will be limited or no flow of funds from Namibia. Since this is a long overdue condition

08 March 2012

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON DR KAMWI**

precedent, amongst others, the negotiations are stalled for the past eighteen months. As a result I acted promptly as the responsible Minister.

Finally, Honourable Deputy Speaker let me say that I stand ready for further clarification that may be required, as I said.

I have the full support of my principals and I am acting in the best interest of the Namibian people in need of the services. Thank you for your kind attention.

HON NYAMU: May I kindly ask the Honourable Minister a question regarding his presentation?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, that is on the basis of what we have agreed yesterday and that we have a Budget to deal with. Thank you for the very important information. Any other Ministerial Statements? Today is Thursday and normally we start with the Questions, but we agreed earlier on that because we are dealing with the Budget. We will start with the *Appropriation Bill*. However, I was instructed to make an exception to that rule just for today to allow two Questions to be put. That is per agreement between the Honourable Member who put the Questions and the Honourable Member who is supposed to answer the questions. Question 6 is by Honourable Maamberua, does the Honourable Member put the Question?

RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS

QUESTION 6:

HON MAAMBERUA: I put the Question.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Maamberua, the Member of Parliament for the South West Africa National Union (SWANU) posed a question which insinuates that certain appointments in the Public Sector contravene the letter and spirit of the National Constitution or are in violation of Article 10 of the Constitution. He further alleged that certain appointments are based on ethnicity and regionalism. My answer to Honourable Maamberua's question is as follows:

Whereas the majority of Namibia's Nation is found north of Otavi town; noting that the Government of the Republic of Namibia is controlled by the SWAPO Party which won the 2009 National Assembly elections by 74.29% and securing 54 seats in the National Assembly; reaffirming that the Republic of Namibia is governed on the basis of the rule of law and appointments to the Public Service have to comply with the laws and conscience that Namibia is a unit in diversity; therefore I wish to inform Honourable Maamberua and the public at large as follows:

1. Holding of public office or a position in the Public Service is regulated by the Constitution, law or conventions applicable in Namibia.
 - 1.1. The President of Namibia is elected under the provisions of Article 28 of the Namibian Constitution. The current President was elected during the 27th-28th November 2009 presidential elections. President Hifikepunye Pohamba of the SWAPO Party received 611,241 votes out of 812,237 votes cast or 75,25% of the national votes. It is, therefore, impertinent for Honourable Maamberua to question the will of the people of Namibia.

08 March 2012 **RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS -HON MAAMBERUA
RT HON N ANGULA**

- 1.2 The Prime Minister, the Deputy Prime Minister and Ministers are appointed under Article 35 and Deputy Ministers are appointed under Article 37 of the Constitution. In the case of the Prime Minister and Deputy Prime Minister and Ministers, they should first and foremost be Members of the National Assembly. The Deputy Ministers may be appointed from either the National Assembly or the National Council. During the 2009 National Assembly elections the SWAPO Party garnered 602,580 votes out of 811,143 votes cast or 74,29% and gained 64 seats. The President had to appoint the Prime Minister, Ministers and Deputy Ministers from those elected by the people through his Party. The President enjoys direct mandate from the people. His Prime Minister, Deputy Prime Minister, Ministers and Deputy Ministers also passed the democratic test of the electorate. It is, therefore, impertinent for Honourable Maamberua to question both the wisdom of the President and that of the electorate.
- 1.3 Appointment of Judges is provided for in Article 82 of the Constitution. The appointment of the Prosecutor-General, on the other hand, is provided for in Article 88 of the Constitution. The Judicial Service Commission is the constitutional body. It makes recommendations to the President for the appointment of the Judges and the Prosecutor-General. It is, therefore, impertinent for Honourable Maamberua to bring into disrepute the honour and reputation of the Judicial Service Commission by his impertinent question.
- 1.4 The appointment of the Attorney-General is provided in Article 86 of the Constitution, read together with Article 32(i). Similarly, the appointment of the Prime Minister, Deputy Prime Minister, Ministers and Deputy Ministers, Director-General of the National Planning Commission is provided for in Article 32(i) of the Constitution. It is

08 March 2012 **RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS -HON MAAMBERUA
RT HON N ANGULA**

insolent for Honourable Maamberua to insinuate that the President made these appointments on the basis of ethnicity or regionalism.

- 1.5 The Secretary to Cabinet post is provided for in Article 43 of the Constitution. The incumbent is appointed by the President mainly on the basis of competence, loyalty and trust. Honourable Maamberua is, therefore, guilty of accusing the President of ethnicity and regionalism or denying anyone from north of Otavi to be appointed as Secretary to Cabinet. If the current Secretary to Cabinet is not fit for occupying such position, Honourable Maamberua should state the reason why.
- 1.6 The Chairman of the Public Service Commission; Honourable Members, the Chairman of the Public Service Commission is appointed in accordance with Article 112(3) of the Constitution. This Assembly appointed the Public Service Commissioners including its Chairperson on the recommendation of the President. Honourable Maamberua must have been sleeping on the job when the National Assembly approved the appointment of members of the Public Service Commission for him to pose this question.
- 1.7 Article 114 of the Constitution established the Security Commission. The Commission makes recommendations to the President on the appointment of the Chief of Defence Force, the Inspector-General of Police and the Commissioner of Prisons. Honourable Maamberua should provide evidence to show that the Security Commission acted improperly in recommending to the President the appointment of the incumbent officials to their positions.
- 1.8 The appointment of Permanent Secretaries is done in terms of the Public Service Act. In addition, the Public Service Commission, established under Article 112 of the Constitution, advises the Prime Minister and the Cabinet on

08 March 2012 **RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS -HON MAAMBERUA
RT HON N ANGULA**

the appointment of Permanent Secretaries. It is, therefore, impertinent for Honourable Maamberua to single out a few Permanent Secretaries and allege that they were appointed on the basis of ethnicity or regional considerations. This is demeaning of the Permanent Secretaries concerned.

- 1.9 Appointment of heads of what Honourable Maamberua termed public finance nerve centres. These appointments are regulated by Statutes, Boards and Line Ministers who make recommendations to the Cabinet. Rather than generalising, Honourable Maamberua should produce evidence of wrongdoing in the appointment of such officers.
- 1.10 Promotion in the Defence Force: Promotion in the Defence Force is regulated by tradition and promotion in Defence Force is strictly rang-based. You cannot just jump from somewhere and become the Chief of Defence Force when you never even saw a battlefield.

Deputy Speaker, on the basis of the above, it is fair to conclude that Honourable Maamberua and his ilk are suffering from ethnic phobia. His question is aimed at incitement, ethnic hatred and ethnic cleansing. However, Honourable Maamberua and his ilk should be reminded that they are inviting the attention of the International Criminal Court. I thank you for your attention.

HON MAAMBERUA: First of all I should thank the Honourable Prime Minister for replying to the question and I need to bring to the attention of the Honourable Prime Minister that unfortunately he did not answer my question, he formulated his own question that he answered, because my question is clear here. What he read out in terms of the question was not the question that I formulated.

Secondly, I think we have rule of law in this country and for the Prime Minister to declare me guilty without due legal process, I wish to confirm

08 March 2012

PUBLIC SERVICE AMENDMENT BILL
RT HON N ANGULA

from him whether he is adhering to the rule of law in Namibia or not. Honourable Deputy Speaker, he answered a question that I did not pose, with a lot of insinuations, justifying the appointment of these positions on the basis of SWAPO votes and the northern majority. Hence, much as I have thanked him, I reject the answer categorically. Thank you very much.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Question 8 was put by Honourable Shixwameni, but since he is not here, the Question will stand over. The First Notice of Motion is the one by the Right Honourable Prime Minister.

Does the Honourable Prime Minister Move that the Bill be now introduced?

INTRODUCTION AND FIRST READING:
PUBLIC SERVICE AMENDMENT BILL

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: I so Move, Honourable Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Who seconds? Any objections? Agreed to. Will the Honourable Prime Minister please table the Bill? The Secretary will now read the Bill a First Time.

SECRETARY: *Public Service Amendment Bill.*

08 March 2012

**PUBLIC SERVICE AMENDMENT BILL
RT HON N ANGULA**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Does the Right Honourable Prime Minister Move that the Bill be now read a Second Time?

**SECOND READING:
PUBLIC SERVICE AMENDMENT BILL**

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: I so Move.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Who seconds? Any objection? Agreed to. The Right Honourable Prime Minister has the Floor.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. Honourable Members, I rise to motivate the *Public Service Amendment Bill* which is before this august House.

The people of Namibia, as we all know, took up arms to fight for freedom and Independence. One of the many objectives was to bring about justice for all. Today Namibia is a mature democracy, founded on the principle of the rule of law. I am proud to state that on this point we have kept to the letter and spirit of the Namibian Constitution.

Honourable Members will recall that Sections 27 of the Public Service Act provides for disciplinary action against Civil Servants. In terms of that provision Permanent Secretaries take disciplinary action against staff members under them. In turn, the Secretary to Cabinet takes disciplinary action against Permanent Secretaries.

Where Permanent Secretaries are required to charge staff members with misconduct and establish disciplinary committees from which they are excluded, to inquire into the alleged misconduct, the procedure which involves the Secretary to Cabinet took a different route. The Section

08 March 2012

PUBLIC SERVICE AMENDMENT BILL
RT HON N ANGULA

states that the Secretary to Cabinet charges the Permanent Secretary, establishes a disciplinary committee to which he or she is the chairperson to inquire into the misconduct. This procedure makes the Secretary to Cabinet a judge and a jury at the same time. There is no doubt that the provision is clearly unconstitutional and violates the most tenets on natural justice.

Article 18 of the Namibian Constitution provides that: *“Administrative bodies and administrative officials shall act fairly and reasonably and comply with the requirements imposed upon such bodies and officials by common law and any relevant legislation, and persons aggrieved by the exercise of such acts and decisions shall have the right to seek redress before a competent Court or Tribunal.”*

Honourable Members will recall that Article 18 of the Namibian Constitution is part of Chapter 7 under the heading, *“Fundamental Human Rights and Freedoms.”* You will further recall that this part of our Constitution cannot be amended with a view to diminish the protection and enjoyment of fundamental human rights and freedoms. It is against this background that the Attorney-General recommended an Amendment to the Public Service Act of 1992 so as to bring the provision under discussion in line with the requirements of our Constitution.

In the same vein, an Amendment is also effected to Section 27(6) to enable the Secretary to Cabinet to charge other staff members other than Permanent Secretaries where it is established that a Permanent Secretary conspire with other staff members to commit a misconduct. This is logical because a Permanent Secretary cannot be expected to charge other staff members with misconduct in a case in which he or she is also implicated. In this regard the Secretary to Cabinet would be the right person to charge all those who are involved, regardless of their rank.

Honourable Members, in my view this is a straightforward technical Amendment. I, therefore, Move that this august House passes the proposed Amendment without any further delay. I so Move and count on your support. I thank you.

08 March 2012

PUBLIC SERVICE AMENDMENT BILL
HON TJIHUIKO / HON NYAMU / HON NEHOVA

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any further discussion? Honourable Tjihuiko.

HON TJIHUIKO: Thank you very much, Honourable Deputy Speaker. I have only one question. The Permanent Secretaries will be charged by the Secretary to Cabinet. Right Honourable Prime Minister, in the event where the Secretary to Cabinet finds him or herself in that situation, who is going to charge the Secretary to Cabinet? Is it the Prime Minister or who will charge the Secretary to Cabinet?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any further discussion? Honourable Nyamu.

HON NYAMU: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I sincerely welcome the proposed Amendment the Honourable Prime Minister has just introduced because I thought that our Permanent Secretaries have been their own masters to the extent that they are not accountable to anybody, not to the President, not to the Minister, not to the public. However, I would like the law to stipulate specifically what follows when a Permanent Secretary is investigated and found guilty. It is not stipulated in this Bill. Will they be fired or is it just a hearing and it stops there? I think this Amendment should go further and stipulate the punishment. Thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any further discussion? Honourable Nehova.

HON NEHOVA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I have a very small

08 March 2012

PUBLIC SERVICE AMENDMENT BILL
RT HON ANGULA / HON NEHOVA

question that I wish to put to the Honourable Prime Minister. In terms of our laws or Constitution, who appoints the Permanent Secretaries and even their Deputies? I was under the impression that they are appointed by the Prime Minister. Is that the case? Thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any further discussion? Does the Honourable Prime Minister wish to respond?

RI HON PRIME MINISTER: Thank you for your very pertinent questions. The Secretary to Cabinet will be charged on the recommendation of the appointing authority, which is the President. The President will cause the Secretary to Cabinet to be charged and will, therefore, appoint a committee or body to investigate and charge.

When a Permanent Secretary is charged, found guilty, depending on the severity of his conduct, he might be fired on the extreme or might be warned. In-between there are also penalties, reduction in salary, for example, demotion, reprimand, whatever, but it depends upon the severity of the misconduct.

Permanent Secretaries are appointed by the Prime Minister on the recommendation of the Public Service Commission. Thank you.

HON NEHOVA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, if the appointing authority is the Prime Minister, then it stands to reason that it should be the Prime Minister who should discipline them in case of violation of the Public Service rules or laws. He or she is the appointing authority and, therefore, he or she must be the one to discipline his or her appointees. Why then the need for this law?

08 March 2012

PUBLIC SERVICE AMENDMENT BILL
HON KAURA / RT HON ANGULA

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Kaura.

HON KAURA: Honourable Prime Minister, I want clarity under Clause 1(4). *“If the staff member charged denies the charge, the Secretary to the Cabinet, in consultation with the Prime Minister and the Minister of the Permanent Secretary concerned shall within seven days from the date of receipt of the written denial establish a disciplinary committee consisting of three suitable persons, who may or may not be staff members, to inquire into the charge of misconduct and the Secretary to Cabinet shall designate one of the persons so appointed to be the chairperson of the committee.”*

My question is, three suitable persons who may or may not be staff members. What would be the qualification of the non-staff members to inquire into the activities of the charge person? What would be the qualification for those people?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Right Honourable Prime Minister.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. The Permanent Secretaries are Civil Servants. If we allow them to be charged by politicians it might not promote good governance. Therefore, since the Secretary to the Cabinet is their chairperson who supervises the administrative aspects of the work of the Permanent Secretaries, the law was originally correct to empower the Secretary to Cabinet to charge the Permanent Secretaries rather than to subject them to being charged by a politician. I think that is correct. The only defection is that he was supposed to charge and to appoint himself as the chairperson of the disciplinary committee, which violates natural justice. This is what we are trying to correct, to also protect the interest of the person charged.

Normally persons who conduct these hearings are people with legal

08 March 2012

**PUBLIC SERVICE AMENDMENT BILL
HON BEZUIDENHOUDT**

background and I think the idea here is to allow the Secretary to Cabinet to appoint qualified people who can actually conduct a procedure which would meet the high standards of the law. This is what is implied here, because if you do not meet the legal standards, the accused person will go to Court and say that the hearing was unfair. It is just to make sure that these people are qualified to conduct this hearing or investigation. Thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now put the Question, that the Bill be read a Second Time. Any objection?

HON BEZUIDENHOUDT: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I want to draw your attention to Rule 26 of the Standing Rules and Orders.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think the practice we have endorsed is that if no one objects, we proceed with the procedure. Unless you want to adjourn it. I do recall that there was a time we have done this. Otherwise I will adjourn this Debate until Tuesday.

HON BEZUIDENHOUDT: Honourable Deputy Speaker, all I did was to draw your attention to the Rules of the House and not to some practice that we do not know about, just for you to give clarity to me about the Rules of the House. If that is in order with you, I do not have anything to contribute, but if it is in contravention of the Rules of the House, just be careful.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: You do not have an objection, so we can

08 March 2012

PUBLIC SERVICE AMENDMENT BILL

go ahead. I am aware of the Rules, but there have been incidents where we proceeded. The Secretary will now read the Bill a Second Time.

SECRETARY: *Public Service Amendment Bill.*

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The House will now adjourn for refreshment.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:47

HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:20

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The House is called to order. The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

**RESUMPTION OF SECOND READING:
APPROPRIATION BILL**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on Second Reading – *Appropriation Bill.*

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When the House adjourned yesterday, the 7th of March 2012, in terms of Rule 90, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Minister of Finance, that the Bill be read

08 March 2012

APPROPRIATION BILL: SECOND READING
HON MAAMBERUA

a Second Time. Honourable Maamberua had the Floor and he still has 10 minutes to continue with his speech.

HON MAAMBERUA: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. I am not going back to where I stopped yesterday, but I will proceed to look at some articles of the Constitution considering the obligation of the National Assembly in terms of approving the Budget and in so doing, I wish to quote Article 126(1) on Appropriation and also (2), “*that the National Assembly shall consider such estimates and pass pursuant thereto such Appropriation Acts as are in its opinion necessary to meet the financial requirements of the State from time to time*” and the word to be underlined is “*financial requirements of the State.*” On that basis my first intervention in this respect is that I would want to look at the old-age pensions as provided for in the Article 95(f) of the Constitution: (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: On a Point of Order.

HON MAAMBERUA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I only have ten minutes and I have not said anything that needs to be interrupted, otherwise I will just stop here and not proceed.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Let us hear what she wants to say on a Point of Order. Do you want to ask a question?

08 March 2012

APPROPRIATION BILL: SECOND READING
HON MAAMBERUA

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: Comrade Deputy Speaker, follow what you said, but please, as the Chair of this august House, tell the people not to mention the things already done by this Government, like the old-age pensions. When they talk like that, we will intervene according to the procedures of this Chamber. Thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I really do not understand the Honourable Member's point.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: I said, tell him not to mention the pension money, because the Minister of Finance already talked about it. Why does he want to talk about it here?

HON MAAMBERUA: I was saying Article 195(f) states: "*The State shall ensure that senior citizens are entitled to and do receive regular pension **adequate** for the maintenance of a decent standard of living and the enjoyment of social and cultural opportunities.*"

The basis of the N\$550 is not given anywhere in the Budget, however my own scientific calculations to determine an approximate of what is to be regarded as adequate pension is hereby attached and has the following outcomes:

For a pensioner in the towns the adequate provision would be N\$1,470.00 and for a rural-based pensioner, it would be N\$1,727.00 and since this is a State requirement, in my opinion this Budget does not meet this State requirement and for your information, my calculations are attached here, I have taken into account the municipal water rates in Windhoek, electricity, 12,5 maize-meal, 5 kg of sugar, etcetera. The full calculations

08 March 2012

APPROPRIATION BILL: SECOND READING
HON MAAMBERUA

are here and I shall not belabour that point. Therefore, in this respect my recommendation is that the adequate pension should actually take these figures into account and I would also like to recommend, having due regard that we may not have enough resources, that we need to introduce a differentiated pension, meaning that pensioners who receive pension from elsewhere at a certain threshold should get less. Those who have no other pension or pension above a certain threshold should get more. I think we should have that differentiated pension scheme, because some are already millionaires, some earn a lot of money, like former Members of Parliament and they should not receive the same amount as the pensioner who does not have any other pension at all. That is my recommendation.

In the same vein, the N\$200 given to the orphans and vulnerable children should have been increased and I take note that in the Minister's speech there is some increase that is not actually indicated. They should actually increase that to the level of the pensioners for the following reason:

The orphans and vulnerable children in most cases do not have either one or both of the parents and, therefore, it is unfair that they should receive only N\$200. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: On a Point of Order. Comrade Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, the Honourable Member knows that the orphans are inherited. You want the Government to give money or when are you going to inherit the children from your brother?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Proceed, you have two minutes.

HON MAAMBERUA: If I have two minutes I cannot proceed, because I have more. What I am trying to say is, this is my official contribution to

08 March 2012

APPROPRIATION BILL: SECOND READING
HON S TJONGARERO

the Budget and I want it to be recorded like that in the HANSARD.
Thank you very much.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Tjongarero.

HON S TJONGARERO: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members. It is indeed a great pleasure and honour to have an opportunity to participate and make my contribution on the 2012/2013 *Appropriation Bill*.

Allow me, first of all, to congratulate our Minister of Finance and her Ministry for the pride and confidence we have in her leadership. To join this Debate, I am inspired or guided by the following two great themes, namely, “*Striving for Better Parliament and Regulation for Leadership Transition*” and secondly, “*Jointly Doing More with Less.*”

Financial management is always a very sensitive issue. Where you think you did well, there are always questions. Broad participation is one way to answer such questions. To better our Parliament to have a platform for broad participation and involvement in the preparation of the National Budget will surely encourage joint collaboration for common understanding.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, smaller families have a better chance to live healthy than bigger families. That is why we introduced family planning.
(Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: May I ask my former Governor from Kunene a question? Honourable Governor, you talk about the Budget being sensitive, but last month there was a big and heavy Debate in your Region, that your Party only employs UDF members.

08 March 2012

APPROPRIATION BILL: SECOND READING
HON S TJONGARERO

HON S TJONGARERO: The same principle applies for countries with smaller populations than others. (Intervention)

HON KAURA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I just want to remind ourselves of the Rules. “*A Point of Order may be raised when any of these Rules and Orders are alleged to have been infringed, as soon as an irregularity occurs in the customary proceedings, to give an explanation in terms of Rule 116 and to seek clarification on a procedural matter.*” This is what stands in this little red book on Points of Order. The Points of Order that have been raised by especially Honourable Muharukua is just there to disrupt and it should not amount to denying a Member his freedom of speech in this august House.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, I hope all of us will adhere to that particular Rule you have advised us on. All of us must abide to that Rule you have quoted. You are a senior Member and I am sure you have also interrupted people not on unprocedural points, but just for the sake, but it is very good that you have done that. I would also like to advise the Honourable Members that the more we interrupt, the more we encroach upon the times of even Honourable Members this side. The time is limited. You have the right to interrupt, but again, you also have the right to take the Floor and contradict the previous speaker, if you wish. I just want you to keep in mind that we also encroach upon the time of our own Members.

HON S TJONGARERO: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker, our country, with a very small population and with rich natural resources and above average blessings of mineral deposits, cannot be happy with the current unacceptable high unemployment rate. To address this matter, we support any effort, whether it comes from our Government or from the Private Sector. Let us seriously create jobs to employ our people.

08 March 2012

APPROPRIATION BILL: SECOND READING
HON S TJONGARERO

The TIPEEG intervention was a well-accepted initiative to start with. The first fiscal year is almost over with achievements and areas that need improvement to bring in change for better results and to attend to the general concerns of our public as part of better understanding. Lack of timely information-sharing puts us in a difficult position to support TIPEEG wholeheartedly.

While on the same TIPEEG, one should like more allocations to Local Authorities and Regional Councils to employ more unemployed people. Option through tender application cannot be allowed to remain as the only solution. Proposal or idea to employ at least one adult in each household to reduce poverty may be an idle future dream, based on the right approach that every adult person has the right to be employed.

Budget Allocation Measurement: If you have the opportunity to travel abroad, one realises how difficult it is to maintain items like national road networks. Sufficient Budget allocation is observable on conditions of national roads. In our case, the main challenge is construction of bridges to enable our people to cross big rivers at crucial points during the rainy season. I hope the Otjimbingwe-Swakop River and Okombahe-Omaruru River will be reached through our planning in our lifetime.

Expansion of the Budget: Every Financial Year we add a little more on the previous year's allocation while we end the Fiscal Year with big amounts of money not spent. A well-informed source mentioned N\$6 billion not spent for 2011/2012 Financial Year. Even with the German Special Initiative, concern has been raised about the slow pace of utilisation. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: May I ask the Member a question? You are suggesting that for people to be employed, an adult in each and every house should be employed. How would that advertisement read? Would it say adults up to fifty years, regardless of any qualification or will you just do a household survey? How would that work?

08 March 2012

APPROPRIATION BILL: SECOND READING
HON S TJONGARERO

HON S TJONGARERO: Honourable Deputy Minister, for that we have authorities and leaders on the ground and these leaders know each and every household. If enough funds are allocated to the Local and Regional Authorities, they can use their mandate to appoint people according to merits to do the job.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, even with the German Special Initiative concern has been raised about the slow pace of utilisation of that Fund that was mentioned to be N\$20 million. We applied for funding and when approved, we failed to use it in time. What should we do to overcome this negative situation?

Climate Change: I want to congratulate the Minister of Environment and Tourism together with her Ministry for the excellent work done with the UNFCCC Programme in Durban COPE 17 Conference. However, one would like to have more support from our Government to strengthen what the Honourable Minister is busy with. I appreciate the Budget allocation for this global challenge.

Community-based Conservancies: The initiative of Community-based Conservancies brings us national pride with a lot of diversity in developmental challenges. Although the programme operations are basically independent, there may be areas whereby they need Government financial support.

Improvement of Service Delivery: It is vitally important to focus on efficient service delivery. A team of dedicated Civil Servants who know where we are on our way to and why it is essential to do more will be our answer. Those who are involved must own what they are supposed to do and have the desire to complete their task in time.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, a great deal of the Budget Allocation is earmarked for remuneration and if we fail to deliver improved services, then we are wasting Public funds.

Honourable Members, I thank you all for your attention and I have the honour to support the *Appropriation Bill* 2012/2013. I thank you.

08 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MUSHELENGA**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Mushelenga.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, rain in African culture signifies good omen, positive prospects and a hopeful tomorrow. The tabling of the Budget against the environment of sky showers therefore makes the Budget that was introduced by Honourable Saara Kuugongelwa-Amadhila a fiscal instrument that brings optimism and reassurance to the general Namibian economy.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the current global economic conditions are uncertain. We have felt the impact of the 2008/2009 financial crisis with an impact on our economic growth, especially in 2009 when growth fell from 3.4% to negative growth of 0.4%. Then our real sector was really affected by the effect of the crisis as output fell, especially in the primary industries as a result of subdued demand in the global market for our commodities.

Safe for the visionary guidance of the SWAPO Party Government, the able Minister of Finance provided a cushion to serve as a shock absorber to our domestic economy through expansionary fiscal policy which in effect stimulated domestic demand and accelerated growth by increased public investment and Government expenditure. As a result of such good policies our economy recovered in 2010, registering a positive growth of 6.6%.

Honourable Members will agree with me that the growth and transformation of international markets in recent decades has seen increased volatility and such fluctuations manifest themselves in the global commodity markets, which clearly translate to change in prices for our energy imports, mineral exports and food supplies. Therefore, the macroeconomic environment facing us can be destabilised by those internal shocks.

08 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MUSHELENGA**

As we have heard during the presentation of this Budget, the Honourable Minister has maintained expansionary expenditure patterns over the next two Financial Years in order to consolidate the envisaged gains under the expansionary policy. (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, may I ask the Honourable Deputy Minister a question, please? I do not know whether it is allowed, listening to what the Honourable Deputy Minister has read up to now, it sounds exactly like the statement that he read last year. Is it a coincidence or is that exactly the same statement and is that allowed?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I really want to caution Honourable Members, as Honourable Kaura said. Honourable Tjiuiko knows very well this is not the case and I really do not want Points of Order either from Opposition or from SWAPO for the purpose of disrupting. Yesterday SWAPO could not speak simply because of these types of interjections. Please let us grow mature as legislators and let Points of Order be Points of Order.

Let me repeat, as we have heard during the presentation of this Budget, the Honourable Minister has maintained expansionary patterns over the next two Financial Years in order to consolidate the envisaged gains under the expansionary policy, but the Budget also cautions that in the Financial Year in this Medium Term Expenditure Framework we have to contain our expansion. We consider these principles to be not only noble, but also considerate if we are to guard against unsustainable levels of fiscal debts.

Expansion programmes go for additional financial resources which have to be raised through collections of taxes and non-taxes as well as through borrowing. In the former, for us to enhance the collection taxes, the following variables need to be certain. They should include the base numbers from which to collect taxes and also the sources of such taxes. I

08 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MUSHELENGA**

have noted with a degree of optimism on the tax administration reforms that the Minister outlined which are aimed at achieving this objective. We, therefore, should support the Minister of Finance as she rolls out her tax education campaigns to enhance understanding of tax matters. Such initiative was launched in this august House last year. Accordingly I support the allocation of N\$630.4 million to the revenue management in respect of both Inland Revenue collection and Customs and Excise Management.

The solid foundations on which our financial institutions are based, together with sound macroeconomic policies Namibia continues to pursue, sheltered our economy from the previous shocks in the global financial markets in 2008/2009. This is also evidently supported by our 36th position out of 142 in the Global Competiveness Report of 2011. In this context I wish to express that the majority of our populace continue to operate outside the financial system and the challenge to accelerate such inclusion should be on all of us to educate our communities and our people about the potential of operating within the financial system. Such inclusion would also complement Government policies aimed at supporting SMEs and tax administration, amongst others.

I also support the call on the financial institutions to continue to be more accommodative and design products which cut across all market needs. It is a concern to know that most of our people remain to be prey to Card and (PIN) Personal Identification Numbers, especially the exorbitant fees and charges associated with micro-lenders. Our policies must also aim at developing our Micro-Finance Sector.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, as a Nation we still have a challenge to address the problem of unemployment. As an advanced youth I know that the majority of unemployment is in the category of the youth, who are the elders of tomorrow. As the saying goes, “*waana omutanda kuna ngombe*”, (16:41) this category is the future and such future needs to be ascertained if we are to guarantee a stable future for our economy. High unemployment is not good for any Nation, more so also in countries like ours where the income distribution is unequal and skewed.

08 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MUSHELENGA**

I am, however, pleased to note that Government, through the consolidation of its expansionary policy, continue to avail resources through TIPEEG to sectors with potential to create high employment in order to contain the levels of high unemployment.

Coupled with the goal of addressing the unemployment problem, TIPEEG programme is also aimed at enhancing economic growth, increased public investment and Government expenditure in such projects and programmes. In this vein we need to promote speedy implementation of development projects, coupled with on-going monitoring and evaluation so that intended objectives are attained.

The funding priorities in the current Medium Term Expenditure Framework are convincingly aimed at addressing the challenge facing our Nation. Infrastructure development in areas such as roads, port facilities and other strategic assets serve to support not only our TIPEEG goals, but also to enhance our regional integration programme.

We have noted the increased level of urbanisation of our locations and the extension of some basic infrastructure, such as potable water, access to roads and other social institutions, such as schools and health centres. I also note that Government, under the proposed appropriation, continue to extend such services to our communities as part of TIPEEG. In relation to the above, if we are to succeed in putting our economy on a more rapid course to 2030, we need to effectively direct and promote change that will activate both Public and Private Sector capacities in investments to drive:

- Our infrastructure programme;
- Our industrial development policies to support our regional integration programmes;
- Continued increased investment in education and skills with emphasis on science and technology;
- Support for SMEs, amongst others.

08 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MUSHELENGA**

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the mentioning of rain at the very beginning of my speech compels me to also pay attention to the allocation on agriculture. Agriculture is fundamental to the survival of all Namibians, including the rural poor who live on subsistence farming. The Commercial Agricultural Sector contributes to employment and through agronomic trade it further contributes to boosting the balance of payment account.

Among the primary objectives of engaging in agricultural projects is food self-sufficiency which is vital for the economy and it reduces the high cost associated with food imports. Peter Warr, an academic from the Economics Department of the Australian National University writes: *“Recent research in international food prices has exposed a mistrust felt within many food importing countries towards the dependability of the international market as a supplier of affordable food. One possible response is to become less reliant on food imports.”*

The learned academic further asserts that while people can survive without adequate supply of other goods, it cannot be the same in the case of food. Consistent supply of food is a matter of necessity. However, food sufficiency will only be ensured if the necessary measures are in place to boost agricultural techniques employed in crop production. It is pleasing to note that an amount of N\$337.4 billion has been provided for the 2012/2013 Financial Year to cater for the crop horticultural improvement. There is expectation that much will be done in this field in the next three years given the total allocation of N\$1.023 billion for the MTEF period.

The envisaged increase from 35% to 42% in horticultural production during the MTEF period is welcomed. I am further pleased to note that provision has been made to train small-scale irrigation farmers. They too make a meaningful contribution to the general agricultural output. Some people appear to be overwhelmed by their hatred towards the Government that they cannot observe these obvious positive aspects of the Budget.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the road to Independence was long and bitter, and the self-sacrifices of our heroes and heroines who waged this

08 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MUSHELENGA**

struggle continue to bear no price tag that as a Nation we can afford to settle. I am mindful, Honourable Deputy Speaker, that some Honourable Members on the other side, who too made a valuable contribution to the liberation struggle, are on record as having said that they regret their respective participation in the just cause of the Namibian people for self-determination. Nevertheless, as a Nation we should support special programmes for the veterans as appreciation for the hard-won Independence and freedom. Some of the freedom fighters remain without jobs and other sources of income after Independence. The creation of the Ministry of Veterans Affairs was aimed at addressing this problem. Accordingly, I welcome the allocation of N\$238 million in the 2012/2013 Financial Year for the veterans support package and the amount of N\$750 million for the lump sum payment.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, let me now turn to international relations.

Last year the world witnessed the emergence of the Arab uprisings where the people in that Region demanded, among others, democratic reforms within their respective States. The Namibian Constitution, which I have taken an oath to protect and defend, underscores values of democracy, justice and the rule of law. It is in that context that I challenge the idea that such values should be applied universally as enshrined in international law, such as the UN Charter, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the AU Charter, among others. However, it is my submission that international law should be applied and be binding equally to all members of the international community.

Some centres of power have over the past twelve months espoused foreign policies in respect of the Arab Spring. It is contrary to normative values of international relations that NATO could claim to defend the lives of people, whereby in fact they caused high death tolls and then got away with it. It remains compounding and mind-boggling when power is used corruptively for the sake of self-serving interest of a few to the disadvantage of the less fortunate many.

08 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MUSHELENGA**

Our foreign policy principles, as embodied in the Namibian Constitution, advocate the promotion of international peace. Peace cannot be promoted through manipulations that result in anarchy and confusion. Problems are not solved by problematic solutions. Today the post-Gaddafi Libya has more problems than before. Only recently the Benghazi Group unilaterally declared semi-autonomy. Such course of action breeds divisions, instability and fragmentation. Militia are at large and some are refusing to be integrated in the national army. They detain people outside the framework of judiciary procedures. There is no due process of law. Is this now what the so-called external messiah of the Libyan people wanted?

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the world has also over the past years watched with horror the suffering being endured by the stateless Nation of Palestinians. Those that are responsible for such a state of affairs warrant a firm reaction from the United Nations if their prestige of the very essence of its existence is to be upheld. Since the United Nations is made up of Member States, it follows logic to state that time has come for all Member States to commit themselves to the Middle East solution. It is baffling that those who are found to be wanting on the question of Palestine unfortunately enjoy the support of their powerful allies as the politics of hypocrisy continue to find its ways in the corridors of the centres of international decision-making. What has been tolerated over the past years in this respect, remains indefensible and, therefore, reprehensible.

It is time to stop biasness and hide-and-seek diplomacy that yields no progress. Namibia continues to support the cause of the Palestinian people. It is indeed saddening to note that the compliance with decisions of the main structures of the UN, such as the UN Security Council and General Assembly, appears to be imposed only when it is convenient to some power brokers in the international political system. Sadly, they are used against smaller States in a manner that amounts to violation of international law, but some entities within the international political system do cross to the opposite side of the legal and moral spectrum, deliberately abrogating on the obligations placed upon them by the international law, yet without facing any consequences whatsoever. We

08 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MUSHELENGA**

have observed with indignation instances where the darlings of the collossuses are allowed to behave with impunity.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the prominence of trade in foreign relations is inevitable and incontestable. The effectiveness of Diplomats in this regard can only be better measured not by looking at the number of occasions when they dine and wine with business moguls in foreign capitals, but by looking at the flow of Foreign Direct Investment into our country. Their interactions with business personalities should bear results. We should see captains of industry flocking to Namibia to invest in our economy. The Minister of Finance has generously allocated an amount of N\$104.6 million in the 2012/2013 Financial Year for diplomatic representation and promotion of trade. We want to see a return on investment for that amount, that our Diplomats bring into the State coffers a reasonable higher amount than the one we invest in them through attracting trade and investment to Namibia. The contrary will reflect failure on our economic diplomacy.

In their duties of trade promotion, Diplomats from the Ministry of Foreign Affairs are complemented by the Commercial Councillors who come from the Ministry of Trade and Industry and by a number of trade promotion officials at that Ministry's head office. The total allocation for trade promotion and facilitation for the Ministry of Trade and Industry amounts to N\$155.1 million for the 2012/2013 Financial Year. This amount is accordingly welcomed.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, moving to conclusion, I would like to say that overall the Budget clearly sets to put the interest of the Nation first by cautiously and prudently aiming at ensuring the fiscal sustainability of the State finances. This Budget encourages efficiency and truly advocates "*Doing More with Less.*" Without doubt Budget preparation is a mammoth task which requires due consideration, but the product we have before us shows that the Honourable Minister of Finance and her team endured long hours of professional hard work. We, therefore, need to congratulate Honourable Nandjila Kuugongelwa-Amadhila and her team that includes Honourable Calle Schlettwein, Deputy Minister, for the job well done. The Honourable Member took us through a budgeting

08 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MUSHELENGA**

framework in her speech delivered in this august House on 28th February 2012. Her statement seeks to provide help and guide to those who need to comprehend the underlying dynamics of the Budget, to be specific, to assist Honourable Members of the opposition who are otherwise bent on turning a blind eye to the positive aspects of the Budget and invest their already diminished energy on criticisms. Though they had a unique opportunity to benefit from the Honourable Minister's generosity as she emptied the coffer of fiscal policy guidance and advice before them, the Doubting Thomases are still in their shells that know no liberation of mind.

The day before yesterday I listened to the intervention by Honourable Nyamu of the RDP, which was characterised more by rhetoric attacks that were not really substantiated by facts. He has not argued from any persuasive viewpoint, like pointing out what he would have wanted to be achieved by the Budget. For example, he could not raise pertinent issues, such as employment or education. This is because he knows too well that the Budget addresses those needs of the public. I will, therefore, waste no time to respond to superficial arguments.

Yesterday Honourable Maamberua was a worst case as he tried to misinform the public with inaccuracies, particularly in the area of her expenditure. It will be recalled, Honourable Deputy Speaker, that last year during the Budget Debate I had something to say to the same two Honourable Members for shallow and erroneous arguments they made. I hope today they have listened attentively and benefited from my humble contribution. Accordingly, I hereby reprimand them for misleading the public about the Budget. I now register my unequivocal support for the Budget for the Financial Year 2012/2013 and the Medium Term Expenditure Framework for the Financial Years 2012/2013 to 2014/2015. I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Ankama.

08 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON DR ANKAMA**

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Thank you, Comrade Deputy Speaker. First my congratulations go to Comrade Nandjila and Comrade Schlettwein and their team for a job well done.

Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members, the National Budget is about how the Government raises money from the people and how this money will be spent for the people. This quote is from the Your Money, Your Budget 2012/2013 Citizens Guide to the National Budget. This is well said as this clearly tells us all that the money we have in each Financial Year as our National Budget is legally raised through our elected Government. As Government we cannot spend what we have not collected, it thus makes sense that we divide this money equitably and that we must spend within our limit despite our needs.

Equally important, in spite of our desires, our lifestyles should be dictated by what is available and what we as a Nation can reach through our prudent spending. We are all aware that Budget is a financial tool that can trigger off economic development and we are all expected to be business-minded in order for us to sail through these limited resources at our disposal.

Therefore, those who are crying, knowing much about budgeting, especially the RDP and the rest, while they cannot even financially manage their Political Parties financially, let alone their personal finances, should first interrogate themselves and then be realistic in giving recognition where success is visible. Opposition Parties should learn to appreciate and not just to criticise for the sake of criticism.

Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members, the Budget should, therefore, be used to unlock and stimulate employment opportunities and creation of sustainable wealth. This is mostly possible when as Government we engage ourselves to advance project planning. In other words, the Budget should remain in tandem with our Budget cycle, from prefeasibility study stage to implementation so that each single stage is managed in a manner that will not allow money to be returned to Treasury by the end of the Financial Year. Project identification, planning and execution are, therefore, of crucial importance in our National Development Plans, for

08 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON DR ANKAMA**

example NDP3 and NDP4 soon to be introduced.

In instances where some of our national projects move on a slow pace, such as in the TIPEEG case, we should, with the urgency it deserves review our approach and eliminate the bottlenecks. The words of Comrade Saara Kuugongelwa-Amadhila rightfully in her speech were; *“the core message emanating from the first year of TIPEEG implementation is that more money per se does not guarantee success, we have to inculcate the culture of innovation and efficient service delivery.”*

Comrade Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, one of the nasty things I fail to understand is the budgeting for posts in our Ministries that are not filled or never filled. I would love to see a survey conducted in all our Ministries and entities that receive Government funding to reveal how many posts are budgeted annually and not filled, even if the survey has to go back a few years retrospectively. It is unacceptable that we keep money in our Ministries unused whereas such money could be used productively somewhere else. The culprits in this exercise, in my view, rest with the officials responsible for recruitment, for various reasons. For example, keep vacant posts open, waiting for their friends, their children or members of their families who are studying at some institutions to graduate while the country has unemployed graduates roaming the streets. In some instances interviews are conducted without feedback, just as many applicants do not receive acknowledgement of their applications. This tells us that we have some Civil Servants who are not reliable and who knows, maybe they are members of the Opposition, sabotaging our system, thereby derailing the SWAPO Party Government's successes. Notwithstanding, whoever does this must be castigated, shamed and shunned.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, review of prime instruments is an urgent requirement by this august House, because they stall the smooth implementation of our National Budget to full use. Imagine how heads of institutions are unable to dismiss a thief, an alcoholic or a lazy person or undisciplined Civil Servant who deliberately and with impunity continues to neglect work they are paid for. I strongly feel for this and I know the Prime Minister has just brought the Bill to amend the Public Service Act

08 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON DR ANKAMA**

but we still have to do more. I feel strongly that the Public Service Act (Act 13 of 1995) be repealed and a new Public Service bill be brought here, even if it requires that Public Servants be contracted for a limited time of five years or more with the possibility of renewal, depending on individual skills, commitment, etcetera.

Money appropriated by this august House must be used sparingly, for instance, long-term projects lasting five to ten years, such as apprehending the effects of floods and/or drought by constructing mega dams and water channels to keep or direct water for irrigation, drinking and to reclaim land, thereby minimising closure of schools or to and fro movement of people to high lands during the rainy season.

Comrade Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, for employment we can create institutions that will easily direct planning, monitoring and evaluation of Budget use, such as the National Databank or Bureau of National Statistics. These are very essential. With this in place we will be able to determine the actual rate of unemployment in the country, career opportunities in our economy, business types and categories existing and those needed in our country, types of educational institutions available and those needed, skills availability and shortages in the market, the products available. The products that we have in this country should be known and their level of processing. Can we have by-products, for example?

Comrade Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, to create a skilled Nation we must embark upon a serious on-going programme by instituting a national multi-skills training task force, proper and practical skills incubation centre nationally, a meaningful link between training institutions and Public-Private Ssector to mentor graduates with the kind of skills needed in the market for job opportunities or self-employment.

Comrade Deputy Speaker, this Budget is adorable and inspiring, we just have to do our level best in deliverance. I strongly support it and I thank you for your attention.

08 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON TJIHUIKO**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Chief Ankama. Honourable Tjihuiko.

HON TJIHUIKO: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. Before I start I just want to ask the Deputy Speaker to use all the provisions in the Rules and Orders to protect me.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, the Minister of Finance once again presented the annual Budget with her known trademark – unfulfilled promises or wealth and jobs for all. In her speech, Honourable Deputy Speaker, she concentrated on four core areas for fiscal policy during the Medium Term Expenditure Framework. Firstly, she said, “*we have to continue in strengthening economic stability by ensuring that our fiscal operation remains on a sustainable path*”, but our deficit right now has reach an alarming level. That is a complete contradiction.

Secondly she said: “*The Budget is unrelenting in its resources allocation in the priority economic and infrastructure sector with the objective of placing the economy on the high path from the episode of jobless growth by any nature. Unemployment and poverty level remains unacceptably high.*” This is what she said, Honourable Deputy Speaker, but money that was budgeted last time was not spent through TIPEEG to create employment. The reason that was given was that the Region does not have the capacity to implement TIPEEG. The best that one could have done before we put more money into TIPEEG was to capacitate the Regions in order for them to be able to implement Government programmes. What we did was to throw more money into the problem.

Thirdly, the Minister went on and informed the public that “*the 2012/2013 Budget summons the duty of individual Offices, Ministries and Agencies to reduce wastage and to waste neither time, nor energy to implement programmes and to realise internal efficiency and value for money.*” It sounds very good, Honourable Deputy Speaker. If you look at it, this is a statement, there is no measure that was put in place to address this problem.

08 March 2012

**SECOND READING APPROPRIATION BILL
HON TJIHUIKO**

Having said that, Honourable Deputy Speaker, the core message emanating from the first year of TIPEEG implementation is that more money *per se* does not guarantee success. We have admitted that we can put more money into this programme, we can put billions into TIPEEG and any other programmes, but unless we have done the right thing, nothing will happen. Where we need to start is that we need to know what we want to do. In order for us to know what we want to do, we need to plan. Some people are allergic to that idea, we cannot do it otherwise.

We will continue wasting money, we will continue throwing money to projects that will not take off as long as we do not pause, sit back and ask how best we can do this and how best we can achieve this, planning until we perfect what we want to do. To continue throwing money at the problem will not solve the problem.

Fourthly, Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Minister said: *“The Budget deploys resources to a strategic infrastructural development projects to facilitate regional trade and to expand our domestic production.”* Here I agree with her hundred percent, this is indeed commendable. There is nothing that we can do, being a small economy that is the best way to go about it and you have my support, Honourable Minister.

You must have noted that through the Honourable Minister’s speech of almost two hours, the Minister did not once mention the number of jobs that were created through TIPEEG, not once, but the purpose of the billions that we have put aside was to create jobs. Any sound-minded person was expecting to hear that the money we have spent has created this number of jobs. Not one was mentioned. She mentioned that 33.1% of the allocated money was spent. There was nothing said about the Sector in which the money was spent, the areas where the money was spent or Regions or Constituencies and, of course, no number of jobs created. This was kept as the Minister’s top secret. The only person who knows what has transpired, how the money was spent is only the Minister of Finance and, hopefully, the entire Cabinet, but some of us sitting in this House, approving the Budget, hoping that we will know that the money we budgeted was spent for the purpose it was budgeted for, are still in the dark. (Intervention)

08 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON TJIHUIKO**

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: May I ask Honourable Tjihuiko a question? I have travelled the whole world and I have not seen a single country which has managed to solve the problem of poverty, unemployment and housing completely. They are still struggling. Singapore has not completely solved these problems and Singapore is independent, it was never colonised, it was an agreement between the super powers and eventually it got its Independence and it is a service centre. We know they have done very well, but Honourable Tjihuiko, you must be honest to yourself, this is a country which is just twenty years old. It was colonised for hundreds of years, it has that deficit of underdevelopment. You should not be unfair to yourself, this is your country and where praise must be given, we must congratulate the Minister, she has done the best. As we have said numerous times, this is a people-centred Government, we have the interest of our people at heart. We know there is poverty. When you are in the implementation stage, you do not go to the field, plant and get the results tomorrow. You have to plant and nourish whatever you have planted, it grows and then you harvest. We are in the implementation stage of TIPEEG and, therefore, you must wait until the results come. Honourable Tjihuiko, you have been speaking too many times in this Parliament and I have never heard you coming with a single plan as to how to solve the unemployment problem. When will you come with a plan? You are criticising for the sake of criticising and it does not help, my brother. Thank you very much.

HON TJIHUIKO: Thank you very much, Honourable Minister of Foreign Affairs. I have not yet mentioned poverty, I am concentrating on the 73.1% of the Budget money that was meant to create short and long-term employment. One would have expected to hear that the 73% that we have spent has created two jobs. That is all what I wanted to know. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: The Honourable Member said that the Minister of Finance has not mentioned how the money that was

08 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON TJIHUIKO**

appropriated in this House for 2011/2012 has been spent. First and foremost, I want to say that this House has agreed to an accountability system by the Executive to this House, in terms of which every year the Minister tables in this Parliament together with the *Appropriation Bill* and the background documents to the *Appropriation Bill*, an accountability report outlining how each Office, Ministry and Agency has utilised the moneys that were appropriated to it in this House in respect of that Financial Year and that is in addition to the Report of the Auditor-General that is tabled in this House every year by the Minister of Finance. This year, as was the case with all the other years, we have submitted our Accountability Report and whatever the Minister of Finance has said in the tabling statement is only a summary. However, it would seem that some Honourable Members have decided to completely just ignore the Budget documents and claim this and that and the other was not said by the Minister because it is not contained in the statement. It was never the intention for the statement of the Minister to outline each and every activity of Government during the year. Otherwise, what would be the need for the background documents? Then the Minister should just bring the MTEF here and read it. Therefore, the Honourable Member is misinforming the public. It is false to say that this House is in the dark as to how the money was spent, because the Accountability Report is here and I have even made an attempt in my Budget statement to highlight some of the main programmes and their outcome and even the TIPEEG which is coordinated by the National Planning Commission. I have indicated how we have fared in terms of the implementation of TIPEEG and the problems that we face. Honourable Member, you can criticise, but do so fairly, do not misinform the public.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Honourable Minister got me wrong. I did not say that the Honourable Minister did not report on the finances, what I said and I repeat: *“Honourable Members, you must have noted that through the Honourable Minister’s speech of almost two hours, the Minister did not mention, not once, the number of jobs that were created through TIPEEG.”* I am talking about the number of jobs that were created through the spending of 73.1% of the money that

08 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON TJIHUIKO**

was allocated. What I am looking for is how many jobs have been created with the money that we have spent, which is close to N\$6 billion. That is my question and not the Accountability Report. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: What he cited is only a portion of the statement and that I have responded to by saying it was never the intention that the statement of the Minister should contain a report on each and every activity. What is important is that the documents that accompany the Bill to Parliament should contain that information and whatever information is not contained in the statement of the Minister is contained in the background documents. That is the point I am making.

HON TJIHUIKO: Let me continue. The jobs created is the Minister's top secret. One would, therefore, assume that the 73.1% or N\$5.9 billion that were spent must have been spent on what we call "*suitcase businesses*."

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, the factors, according to the Minister, which hampered smooth implementation of TIPEEG were the following and it is very important for us to look at this: Scarcity of engineering capacity in regard to project preparation. This is the situation that we have, we will continue with the programme. Have we done something about this problem or are we continuing with the same identified problem? Who is helping the implementation of this project in the Regions and Constituencies? It was reported that in places like Omaheke the money was not spent because the in-house capacity in that area is not there. It was not provided for before they were given the money. So, you throw money to Omaheke and you expect results. It does not work like that. You start with preparation, the capacity-building and then you give the money to the people who know how to deal with that issue, not the other way around.

08 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON TJIHUIKO**

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the biggest problem facing this great Nation of ours is lack of proper planning. That is the biggest problem. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: On a Point of Information. I rise to give information or to correct the misinformation given. The Honourable Member is known for his negativity through and through. The Honourable Member is on record to have insinuated that development is taken to certain Regions or parts of this country only. Now the same Honourable Member is arguing that since certain Regions do not have the capacity, according to him, they should not benefit from TIPEEG. Where did he get this discriminatory tendency from? This country is being served equally. TIPEEG is decentralised and therefore, no Region will be discriminated against on the basis of this alleged lack of capacity.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I do not know where the Secretary-General is getting the information that I am negative. This is more of a comradely criticism that you should accept. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: The Honourable Member mentioned here that the problem facing this Government is lack of planning. Honourable Tjihiuko, you have been a Director in the Ministry of Trade and Industry, you left on your own accord to go and join a Political Party and you came to Parliament as a Parliamentarian. You were a Director where you were supposed to plan for those things you are talking about. Why did you abandon it? You went there, stayed in the wilderness for a couple of years, what were you doing? Now you are telling us there are no people in Omaheke who can do the planning and make use of the money. To whom are you complaining? You ran away. It is hard to understand your logic.

08 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON TJIHUIKO**

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I am not complaining, I am just highlighting what was said by the presenter and it is not me, it is here in the report of the Minister. Therefore, you should not refer to me as complaining, I am just highlighting what was said. (Intervention)

**HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT,
HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:** May I ask a question? Honourable Tjihuiko, first question, are you sincere in what you are saying? (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: Yes.

**HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT,
HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:** You are sincere. In your doing?

HON TJIHUIKO: Very much.

**HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT,
HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:** You were a Director in the Ministry of Trade and Industry, then when election came you were bribed to leave SWANU for NUDO, promised that if you join NUDO you will be number two on the list. Does it mean that I can also bribe you? Because you are usually bribed from one Party to another.

08 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON TJIHUIKO**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The last intervention is not relevant. Can you proceed?

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, you must always know that people who know that other people are stealing are also thieves. People who are always thinking that if somebody bought a car then the person must have stolen the car, are the ones who are always stealing.

Coming back to the point of the Minister of Justice, which was very much relevant, the question of the Region that I have referred to, I was saying we have budgeted money to the Regions, we have given money to the Regions to build capacity and to create employment. We did not create the in-house capacity for the money to be spent for the purpose for which the money was given. I am not saying that the money should not have been given to Omaheke, I am saying that before the money was given to any Region, you could have built the in-house capacity so that the money could be spent for the purpose it was given, namely to create jobs and grow the economy. If the money is lying in Omaheke or wherever, what is the point? (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: On a Point of Information. You are talking in this House but not to the public out there. A gravel road was built this year from Orumana to Ombombo under TIPEEG. Many people are involved in this project in Kaoko. Please let our people get their projects from the Government, do not mislead them.

HON TJIHUIKO: I am not surprised that even the SWAPO Women Council rejected you.

08 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON TJIHUIKO**

Coming back to the point and I think this is where the Honourable Minister of Foreign Affairs, if he had listened, could have come in. Honourable Deputy Speaker, the biggest problem facing this great Nation of ours is lack of proper planning. For the last 22 years SWAPO has consistently refused to accept the reality that good things can only happen through the painstaking process of planning. You cannot run away from that. (Intervention)

HON VAN DER WALT: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I and Honourable TjiHuiko travel together a lot over the world and to my surprise and I believe we as leaders stand here today because we were elected by the people and we are here to inform them what we have learned, what we have seen across the world and what our experience is and what will be the best for our country. You will agree with me that wherever we went we have seen poverty, unemployment, discrimination. We have seen everything and we thought it is only in Namibia. We are only 21 years old and I want to tell the Nation there that the SWAPO Party-led Government protected this country for 21 years and maintained this country peacefully with a Budget which helps us every year. We are one of the countries in the world with the least debt ever. I want to tell the Nation that the SWAPO Party-led Government may make mistakes, but not because they want to harm you, they just do it because we are all busy with a learning curve. We are only 21 years old and we are moving forward. Honourable TjiHuiko, my brother, I do not mind that we criticise each other during this Budget, but what bothers me is that we must not confuse the Nation, we must not play cheap politics to get in charge on day. Let us tell the truth, let us say yes, SWAPO, this and this is wrong, but this and this we do right. Let us be very grateful and thank God for the SWAPO Party-led Government.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, what my Colleague and good friend, Petrus Van Der Walt has just said is exactly what I am saying. I am saying, let us highlight the areas where you have not done

08 March 2012

well and this is exactly what I am saying. If I am saying you have given money to the Regions but we do not have the in-house capacity to do the job there, it is a fact. Therefore, we agree, we are together.

I am saying we need to have transparent, inclusive, well-thought out plans. It is the only vehicle that would help us to jumpstart economic growth, job creation and poverty alleviation. We cannot do it otherwise and I will continue emphasising the point that doing things without planning is like feeling in the dark and this is what SWAPO has been doing for the past twenty years. It is feeling in the dark. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The House adjourns under automatic adjournment until next Tuesday, 14:30.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:45 UNTIL 2012.03.13 AT 14:30

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS
WINDHOEK
13 MARCH 2012**

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any Petitions? Any Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Honourable Schlettwein.

TABLING: REPORTS OF THE AUDITOR-GENERAL

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I lay upon the Table, Reports of the Auditor-General on the Accounts of:

1. Town Council of Ruacana for the Financial Year ended 30 June 2011;
2. Town Council of Helao Nafidi for the Financial Year ended 30 June 2011;
3. Town Council of Otavi for the Financial Year ended 30 June 2011;
4. Village Council of Gibeon for the Financial Years ended 30 June 2005, 2006 and 2007, 2008, 2009 and 2010.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please table the Reports. Any other Reports and Papers? Notice of Questions? Notice of Motions? Message

13 March 2012

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
RT HON N ANGULA**

from the Head of State? Ministerial Statements? I recognise the Right Honourable Prime Minister.

MINISTERIAL STATEMENT

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members of Parliament. I have been directed by the SWAPO Party Caucus to inform you as follows:

On Wednesday, March 21 2012, Namibia will celebrate its 22nd birthday as a free, united and democratic Nation. At the eve of this momentous occasion the Legislature, as the representative voice of the sovereign people of Namibia, is called upon to reflect on the daunting challenges facing the Nation. One of such challenges is the welfare of the Namibian people.

The welfare of the Namibian people has been a concern for all of us. His Grace, Bishop Kameeta, taking the lead from the Brazilian law on Basic Income Grant, that is law number 10.535 of January 2004, has proposed a stimuli intervention for implementation in the Namibian context.

Currently on the Order Paper of this august House is a Motion by Honourable Ignatius Shixwameni of the All Peoples Party, proposing the implementation of a basic poor household income grant. Recently a Fin Scope survey on financial inclusion found there is a significant number of Namibians who do not receive regular income worth of opening a bank account. The welfare of the people remains a challenge in our patrimony. This condition, however, is not a result of lack of care, concern or compassion on the part of the Namibian Government, this condition is historical and social. The consequences of colonial and apartheid pauperization of our people through the dispossession of their means of production and the exploitation of their labour are still visible among our people. Social exclusion, inequality and lack of technical skills inhibit the

13 March 2012

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
RT HON N ANGULA**

people to unleash their potentialities in favour of their own welfare.

Namibia, at the age of 22 years old, must reflect on this state of affairs. Our reflection should be guided by Article 95 of our National Constitution. Article 95 is about the principle of a State policy on the promotion of the welfare of the people. Article 95 enjoins the Namibian Government, among others, to:

- (a) Ensure that every citizen has a right to fair and reasonable access to public facilities and services;
- (b) Ensure that senior citizens are entitled to and do receive a regular pension;
- (c) Ensure that the unemployed, the incapacitated, the indigent and the disadvantaged are accorded social benefits and amenities
- (d) and raise and maintain an acceptable level of nutrition and standards of living of the Namibian people and to improve public health.

Article 95 of the Constitution is the moral yardstick we must judge ourselves with as to whether we are promoting the welfare of the people.

This now brings me to the **Budget Response to the Welfare**. The Global Budget Ceiling for 2012/2013 is N\$37,760,702,889.00. Votes 10 - Education, 12 – Gender Equality and Child Welfare, 13 – Health and Social Services, 27 – Youth and National Service, Sport and Culture and 31 – Veterans Affairs are Social Sector Votes. Just looking at the allocation, in the 2012/2013 Budget it is N\$15,549,722,100.00. This means that roughly 42% of the 2012/2013 Budget shall be spent on the welfare of the people in response to Article 95 of the Constitution.

I now venture here to indicate some of the targeted allocations to social groups.

13 March 2012

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
RT HON N ANGULA**

1. Senior Citizens:

Namibia has a comprehensive programme addressing the needs of the senior citizens. This programme includes the following benefits:

- Social grants and funeral benefits, which are budgeted to the amount of N\$1,031,842,000.00
- Old-age homes and Welfare Organisations with a Budget of N\$2,706,000.00.

2. Veterans of the War of National Liberation:

The Ministry of Veterans Affairs cares for the veterans of the war of national liberation after their dependents. These benefits include the following:

- Support package which is budgeted for, for N\$228,838,000.00;
- Lump Sum Payment with a Budget of N\$750 million;
- Subsidy for certain services – N\$15 million;
- Education and Training – N\$2,580,000.00;
- Veterans Resettlement Programme – N\$2 million and
- Veterans Economic Project – N\$20 million.

3. Orphans and Most Vulnerable Children:

The Ministry of Gender Equality and Child Welfare caters for the needs of the orphans and vulnerable children. The programme includes provision of grants, placements of orphans under legal care of guardians and placement in places of safety.

13 March 2012

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
RT HON N ANGULA**

The benefits include:

- Grants, subsidies, places of safety, allowance and emergency assistance and their Budget in the current Budget is N\$222,008,000.00;
- Namibia Children's Home, after-school and essential care, with a Budget of N\$13,272,000.00 and
- Counselling and Provision of Professional Services with a Budget of N\$85,456,000.00.

4. Marginalised Communities Development Programme

The Office of the Prime Minister was tasked by Cabinet to develop programmes of socio-economic inclusion of the San and other marginalised communities. These are the communities whose traditional means of livelihoods were completely or partially destroyed by colonialism and the so-called modernity. The goal of this programme is to eradicate extreme poverty through resettlement programmes, educational support and income-generation projects. An amount of N\$5 million is provided for in the current Budget for this purpose.

5. Residential and Institutional Care and Disability

The Ministry of Health and Social Services provides residential and institutional care and disability prevention and rehabilitation services. The Ministry further provides services aimed at prevention of substance abuse and drug abuse, control and rehabilitation. An amount of N\$23,421,000.00 is provided for in the Budget of 2012/2013 for this purpose.

Besides the services directed at improving the welfare of targeted groups, there are also programmes of empowerment and enterprise development.

13 March 2012

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
RT HON N ANGULA**

These include the following:

6. The Namibia Student Financial Support Assistance Fund (NSFAF)

The Namibia Student Financial Support Assistance Fund (NSFAF) provides grants and loans to enable students to study for careers and professions. An amount of N\$512,240,000.00 is provided for in the 2012/2013 Budget for this purpose.

7. Youth Development Programmes

The Ministry of Youth, National Service, Sport and Culture provides resources targeting the youth for the purpose of youth development. These include:

- National Youth Service with a Budget of N\$86,332,000.00;
- National Youth Credit Scheme with a Budget of N\$25,531,000.00;
- National Youth Council with a Budget of N\$10,332,000.00 and
- Children of the Liberation Struggle with a Budget of N\$1,5 million.

8. Grants to Women Projects

The Ministry of Gender Equality and Child Welfare provides resources to women projects for capacity-building and an amount of N\$1,110,000.00 is provided for in the 2012/2013 Budget for this purpose.

9. National Training Authority (NTA)

The National Training Authority (NTA) provides resources through subventions to training providers, vocational training centres and subsidy grants to trainees in order to promote skills development, vocational training and career development. An amount of N\$232,206,000.00 is

13 March 2012

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
RT HON N ANGULA**

provided for in 2012/2013 Budget.

10. SME Support

The Ministry of Trade and Industry has a comprehensive programme for SME support. An amount of N\$15,926,000.00 is provided for in 2012/2013 Budget for that purpose.

11. Agricultural Bank Affirmative Action Loans

The Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry provides a subsidy to AgriBank with the purpose of subsidising interest on Affirmative Action Loans. The Affirmative Action Loans enable the previously disadvantaged aspiring commercial farmers to acquire land. For 2012/2013 Budget an amount of N\$50 million is provided for.

12. Land Acquisition, Distribution and Resettlement

The Ministry of Lands and Resettlement administers a programme for land acquisition, distribution and resettlement. For the Financial Year 2012/2013 an amount of N\$156,962,000.00 is budgeted for this purpose.

Honourable Members, the abovementioned programmes are aimed at improving the welfare of the people with a view of enhancing their quality of life. There are other programmes dedicated to the welfare of specific target groups. The Government Medical Aid targets the health needs of the Public Servants. The Government Institutions Pension Fund provides for the retirement needs of the Public Servants. The Social Security Commission services cater for the needs of women and other social groups and the School-feeding Programme of the Ministry of Education is aimed at improving the nutritional needs of school-going children.

The sum total of these programmes qualifies Namibia to be described as a social market economy. This is an economy which is based on social justice and Private Sector development. Yet there are many other people in our country falling between the cracks as far as their welfare is concerned. It will however not be wise to increase the allocation to the

13 March 2012

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA**

Social Welfare Sectors in our Budget without establishing the target groups. There is a need for a thorough study aimed at identifying those households which need further social support in the framework of Article 95 of our Constitution. In this regard it is noteworthy to report that the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare is currently undertaking a gap analysis of its social protection arrangements. The goal is to assess whether the current arrangements adequately meet the needs of society. In addition, the Ministry is modernising the National Pension Act (Act 10 of 1992) into the *Basic Grant Bill*. Similarly, the Social Security Commission is in the process of implementing the National Pension Fund and the National Medical Benefit Fund.

Some of the current social support interventions may have to be restructured on the basis of the means testing. Parliament is therefore advised to wait for the result of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare studies.

Ladies and gentlemen, as Namibia enters the age of maturity, the Nation should rededicate itself towards building a society on the basis of core values of caring and sharing. We are each other's keepers. I thank you for your attention.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any further Ministerial Statements? Honourable Minister of Finance.

MINISTERIAL STATEMENT

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members. As I have stated in my presentation of the 2012/2013 *Appropriation Bill*, on the 15th of March this year I will launch a National Literacy Programme which will educate the public on financial

13 March 2012

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA**

management and raise awareness on, amongst others, financial services consumer rights.

The financial literacy initiative is a national platform initiated by the Ministry of Finance and supported by GIZ under the partnership for Economic Growth on behalf of the German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development. The initiative comprises of more than thirty platform partners from the Namibian Public, Private and Civil Society Sector, striving to address the needs in the area of financial education and financial services consumer protection in an coordinated effort.

The main objective of the Financial Literacy Initiative is to enhance financial education for individuals and micro, small and medium-sized enterprises and aims at creating awareness on good and responsible practices both for private and business finances.

I invite all Honourable Members to the official launch of the Financial Literacy Initiative on Thursday, March 15, 2012, at 09:00 at the Soweto Market in Katutura. The launch is coinciding with the World Consumer Rights Day celebrated worldwide every year on the 15th of March. This year's theme is, "*Our Money, Our Rights.*" As part of the financial education awareness campaign there will be set of theatre plays at the Zoo Park in Windhoek between 13:00 and 14:00. Further launches of this Initiative will take place in Erongo Region at the end of March 2012 in cooperation with the Namibia Chamber of Commerce and Industry. Subsequent financial literacy education campaigns will be rolled out to different Regions and towns of Namibia during the course of the year and beyond.

The main theme of the first financial literacy educational campaign, "*Be Wise*", will cover financial matters around budgeting, spending and savings behaviour. The campaign is directed to individuals as well as micro, small and medium-sized enterprises in the country, as I have indicated. It will comprise interactive approaches, such as street theatre, TV and radio shows, cooperation with schools, workplace activities and

13 March 2012

**COMMITTEE STAGE: PUBLIC SERVICE
AMENDMENT BILL
RT HON ANGULA**

training for entrepreneurs, support by print materials, such as posters, flyers and booklets.

Training for micro-entrepreneurs on basic financial management will be conducted on the 15th and 16th of March in Windhoek in cooperation with the Chamber of Commerce and Industry. I am looking forward to seeing all the Honourable Members at this launch on Thursday, the 15th of March. Thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any further Ministerial Statements? The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

**COMMITTEE STAGE:
PUBLIC SERVICE ADMENTMENT BILL**

SECRETARY: Committee Stage – *Public Service Amendment Bill*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Does the Honourable Prime Minister Move that the Assembly now goes into Committee?

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: I so Move, Honourable Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is moved that I leave the Chair. Any

13 March 2012

**THIRD READING: PUBLIC SERVICE
AMENDMENT BILL
RT HON ANGULA**

objections? Agreed to. I now call on the Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee to take the Chair.

ASSEMBLY IN COMMITTEE:

DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: The Committee has to consider the *Public Service Amendment Bill*.

Clauses and Title put and agreed to.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: I shall report the Bill without Amendment.

ASSEMBLY RESUMED:

Bill reported without Amendment.

**THIRD READING:
PUBLIC SERVICE AMENDMENT BILL**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Does the Right Honourable Prime Minister Move that the Bill be now read a Third Time?

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: I so Move, Honourable Deputy Speaker.

13 March 2012

**THIRD READING: PUBLIC SERVICE
AMENDMENT BILL
RT HON ANGULA**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections? Who seconds? Agreed to.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: I thank all the Honourable Members for their support and understanding and commitment to democracy.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the Bill a Third Time.

SECRETARY: *Public Service Amendment Bill.*

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the Second Order of the Day.

**RESUMPTION OF SECOND READING:
APPROPRIATION BILL**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on Second Reading – *Appropriation Bill.*

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When the Debate was adjourned on Thursday, the 8th of March 2012, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Minister of Finance, that the Bill be read a Second Time. Honourable Tjihiuko has the Floor.

13 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON TJIHUIKO**

HON TJIHUIKO: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. On agriculture, the construction of agro irrigation projects for the promotion of horticulture food crops processing and marketing of projects, construction of silos as storage facilities that the Government through the Ministry of Agriculture has embarked upon are very much commendable. I appreciate an effort of that nature.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, the Government's effort in encouraging our people to get back to the land to produce enough food for our consumption and a surplus for export has the support of any sound-minded Namibian. I sincerely hope that the expected output of Sikudu, Shadikongoro, Vungu-Vungu, Etunda Phase 5, 6, 7 and 8 will measure with the huge investment put into these areas.

I am also happy to hear that a 300 tons silo has been completed in Omuthiya and the Okongo silo was upgraded from 500 to 3,000 tons.

As much as I am excited about the good news, I am equally worried about one thing and that is, when the people produce the capacity, when we filled our silos, what would happen to the surplus products? I am sure that the answer will be that we would export that. The question that bothers me is that when we produce vegetables, we need to have proper transport that would transport perishable products, because tomatoes produced in Rundu should be fresh when it reaches Lüderitz. I have not seen in the Budget of the Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry, neither in the Ministry of Works and Transport or the Ministry of Trade and Industry where the link of making these products reaching the communities has been seriously considered. Obviously, we are all excited that the Ministry of Agriculture is now busy producing, but going through the Budget, no provision is made for the transporting of these products to the market. Therefore, it would be very difficult for me sitting in Okakarara to get fresh tomatoes coming from Rundu, because obviously, if you transport it by taxi it would be spoiled by the time it reaches Okakarara. The transport must have been considered to link up with the production. (Intervention)

13 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON TJIHUIKO**

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: May I ask Honourable Tjihuiko a question? Honourable Tjihuiko, do you really feel you cannot produce tomatoes in Okakarara, therefore you want to depend on tomatoes coming from Rundu?

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Minister, the reason why we are saying we should concentrate our efforts on Kavango and Caprivi Regions for food production is obviously because of the viability of those areas. How on earth can one think of producing tomatoes in Okakarara where there is no water?

Honourable Deputy Speaker, my concern is the transport of the products from the Kavango Region to the market. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Honourable Tjihuiko, I only want to ask a small question. What prevents you from growing tomatoes in Okakarara? Or is it the dependency syndrome of *Okuhaama kehijomuti nekori kotjiuru*? (Sitting under the tree with your hat on)

HON TJIHUIKO: If the Executive has accepted the Motions of Honourable Kaura and Honourable Venaani and my Motion that is on the table to write off the water debts in Okakarara, we could have considered to produce tomatoes in Okakarara, but with NamWater costs there is no way you can produce tomatoes there.

Let me come back to the point and this is a very serious one. I do not know whether the Ministry of Trade and Industry has seriously considered this, but I know the Ministry had a programme called, Vendor Development Programme which linked the producers with the market. These products that you are producing, knowing that 80% of our supermarkets are South African based and buying their products in bulk from South Africa and distributing it all over SADC, how would it be

13 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON TJIHUIKO**

possible for our products to have a space on the shelves of these supermarkets? What has the Ministry of Trade and Industry done to ensure that our produce from Katima will be on the shelves? I know what I am talking about, that it is not easy to get tomatoes from Etunda onto the shelves of supermarkets. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: On a Point of Information. Currently the Shoprites of this world are looking for Namibian products, not only to market in Namibia, but also in the neighbouring countries. If you produce meat, sell to them, the market is there just produce.

HON TJIHUIKO: I am surprised to hear this from the Prime Minister. Honourable Prime Minister, before you export you perfect your product. You satisfy the market, you get experience and then you export. What I am saying is that the products that are now being produced through the Green Scheme, how are we going to sell these products? I will guarantee you that they will not get shelf space. The supermarkets that are supposed to sell these products have long-term contracts with suppliers in South Africa. Obviously you must be concerned about these products, not exporting, get it onto our shelves. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: On a Point of Information. Honourable Tjihuiko from NUDO is a very difficult Member of Parliament to understand because I thought Members of Parliament would market their country, would encourage the citizens out there to work productively countrywide. Now Honourable Tjihuiko, a Member of Parliament from NUDO is discouraging people to produce. I fail to understand and perhaps the people will not be able to understand you, because you are discouraging people from producing. Do you want people to be lazy or just to be the same as they used to be? People should be encouraged to produce, to work harder and to market this country.

13 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON TJIHUIKO**

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, this is very serious. If you have a Deputy Minister who does not understand the basics, then it is serious. I am saying, let us encourage our people to produce and we must create the opportunity, the environment for them to be able to produce. It is only then they will be able to sell. If someone could stand up and say the marketing chain has been put in place, then it is a different matter. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: On a Point of Information. Comrade Deputy Speaker, I would like to advise the former staff member of the Ministry of Trade and Industry to listen very carefully when we are going to motivate our Vote to hear what we are planning for the producers. He must come and listen and learn. Thank you.

HON TJIHUIKO: Thank you, Honourable Minister. I will critically look at the Ministry of Trade and Industry and I also want to know how many jobs have been created through TIPEEG by the Ministry of Trade and Industry. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable TjiHuiko, in this country we are trying to encourage our business people to do business, but you are saying the Government should take the produce to other areas. Who is transporting the beer from Windhoek to other areas? Is it the Government?

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Minister, the Green Scheme is a Government programme and we are not producing for the dustbin, we are producing for the people. As the Minister of Transport you were

13 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MOONGO

supposed to inform this august House and through this House, the public out there what type of transport facilities have you put in place to get perishable products from Rundu to the market, not asking what the Private Sector is doing. Maybe the Honourable Minister is not aware that Green Scheme is a Government programme. It is a Government programme and that is why we are asking Government what system they have put in place. The Ministry of Trade and Industry is saying we will hear what they have put in place and we want to hear from you. These products are all going to rot in Rundu because there is no proper transport in place.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is up. I give the Floor to Honourable Moongo.

HON MOONGO: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members. First of all, I am happy that Minister Ekandjo went to the North to witness the demolition of houses. This is the first time he went to investigate after I have put a question to him and I am happy about that.

Honourable Members, the 2012/2013 Budget is just another attempt at hopeless, empty promises of more jobs and economic growth in Namibia. Unemployment is at an alarming rate, strikes in Government and in many companies are devastating the Namibian economy.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, allow me to give a practical marshal plan on how TIPEEG should be carried out. (Interjections). You must listen carefully, you are the implementers and I do not want you to fail. The amount of N\$14,7 billion must be used for projects right in the Namibian communities, such as women and men organisations, vulnerable and disabled people's organisations, street kids, bush mechanics, vendors, taxi organisations, where people are affected by unemployment, hunger and extreme poverty. First of all, they must be trained in their different economical fields, get skills, identify their projects and carry them out responsibly. Project directors and

13 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MOONGO**

management committees must use their talents and skills they gained from training so that the projects can be successfully, excellently, accurately and effectively carried out.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, the Government must address the plight of the people affected by the flood. We cannot talk of economic growth if we do not address the devastating floods which are destroying the economy of Namibia. The Government must implement a marshal plan on how to divert the water from the community. It is now five years that nothing has been done. How can we talk about job creation and economic growth if the Government fails to solve the devastating situation caused by floods? Now you say TIPEEG will do best and I say that is a daydream.

Some SWAPO Members in Parliament are here to pull down the progressive Opposition, divert the attention from unfair and unequal distribution of resources and they suppress the Opposition Party Motions not to be implemented. They want to silence those who introduce progressive issues affecting the Namibian Nation, but that must stop now because they are misusing their two-thirds majority.

I appeal to the Nation to stand firm and fight against poverty, corruption, unemployment and unequal distribution of wealth and stop voting them into power. You see, I said they want to suppress us and they are already doing so. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY: May I ask Honourable Moongo a question? Honourable Moongo, you are calling on the people not to vote for the SWAPO Party. Why is your office in Oshakati blue now?

13 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MOONGO**

HON MOONGO: I know SWAPO has been organising the people to stone the office of the Opposition so that we are silenced, but that is prohibited by the Namibian law.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, in my speech on the previous Budget I talked about change at every roadblock in Namibia as a whole to protect Police Officers from the sun and cold winds.
(Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, in order that wrong information does not go on the records of this august House, our Rules state that a Member may not make a statement unless it can be authenticated by facts. Honourable Moongo has made a statement that SWAPO has organised its members to stone the office of the Opposition. That is a very serious allegation and unless the Honourable Member can provide evidence, I would want him to withdraw that.

HON MOONGO: It is a historical fact that some Opposition Parties cannot have public meetings because they are prevented by SWAPO members. Who organises that indirectly? Here you are talking about unity of all Parties. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The House will break for tea.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:40

HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:15

13 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MOONGO

HON MOONGO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I was saying that for years and years our people have been exposed to the hot sun at the roadblocks. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Moongo, Honourable Mushelenga stood up on a point you have raised earlier and he was insisting that you withdraw the statement. I would like him to repeat what he was saying.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I am rising on the question of Rules. Our Standing Rules and Orders that we have adopted and which guide the proceedings in this House state: “*A Member may not make a statement unless it can be authenticated by facts.*” Honourable Moongo in his speech made a statement that SWAPO has organised its members to go and stone the offices of an Opposition Party. It is one thing to say SWAPO members are stoning offices, it is another to say SWAPO has sent its members, because what the Honourable Member implies is that an organisation SWAPO has taken a decision that such course of action be taken and unless the Honourable Member can provide evidence that SWAPO has sent its members to go and stone offices of Opposition Parties, I really want the Honourable Member to withdraw his statement, because as far as I am concerned there is no such policy in SWAPO and he is actually violating the Rules of this House.

HON MOONGO: I understand the concern, but this matter is *sub judice* because it has been reported to the Police Station in Oshakati and the law has to take its course. (Intervention)

13 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MOONGO

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When you say it is *sub judice* it means there is a case before the Court of law which will determine whether the SWAPO Party leaders sent the members to stone the office and then you must withdraw the statement.

HON MOONGO: I withdraw. I was saying that they must provide the roadblocks with toilets and other amenities. (Intervention)

HON NYAMU: I want to ask my Colleague a question.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I hope you are not going to ask a question relating to the statement which was withdrawn, because when it is withdrawn it closes the chapter.

HON NYAMU: But I think it was wrongly withdrawn.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Senior Member, please sit down.

HON MOONGO: I have been praying night after night in order for people to understand democracy and equality. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can you just stick to your well-prepared speech as time is against you?

13 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MOONGO

HON MOONGO: I was praying anyway, but evil angels were thrown from heaven and are on earth and are still with us and we do not know where to throw them again. Therefore, I appeal to you all that we want unity between Parties and we want the leaders to cooperate. We want unity in Namibia, but if seems the spirit of this demon is within you.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, I call upon Government institutions, private companies, shebeens and banks to provide public toilets. One stands in a long queue to bank your money, they pocket their share but they do not want to provide us with public toilets. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Comrade Deputy Speaker, I want to ask Honourable Moongo a question. It appears to be unparliamentary language to say that the Honourable Members on this side are demons. I think Honourable Moongo must withdraw that word. (Interjection)

HON MOONGO: They say the spirits...(Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Or to say the other Honourable Members are possessed by spirits. That is not parliamentary language and it must be withdrawn for the sake of peace in this House.

HON MOONGO: For the sake of progress, but I do not think we have a word to describe the demons, the demons sent from heaven are among us here. (Intervention)

13 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MOONGO

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Member, on a serious note, can you just withdraw the words that the demons are sent from heaven to be amongst us.

HON MOONGO I withdraw it. Honourable Deputy Speaker, I urgently call on the Ministry of Health and Social Services and the Ministry of Environment and Tourism that they Budget for the elimination of mosquitoes. When you one day visit Omuthiya or Amilema, I want to see whether you will be able to sleep. All cattle have been withdrawn from that area and the goats are dying and you do not want to listen here.

That is why I suspect that that spirit is with you. The mosquitoes are killing goats and children. The bad spirit is with us here. I request the two Ministries to allocate funds and take action by spraying the mosquitoes before the situation worsens. Colleagues, you can laugh here but the people there are suffering. You see, the evil spirit is still coming.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Health Ministry has a persistent problem of low salaries. This demand lasted from 2010/2011 and the Ministry is using delaying tactics while huge amounts of money are lost through corruption, not in thousands but in hundreds of millions. Is the Ministry ready to give a special adjustment to pay our health workers, including doctors who are treating our critically ill patients in the hospitals? Does the Budget include a special payment to our health workers? I call upon the Ministry to increase the security guards at every hospital because of the alarming rate of vehicle theft within hospital premises as well as theft of wheels from the cars. Cars are broken into to steal valuable items, such as radios, etcetera.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Government has to employ more foreign specialist doctors and provide special funds to acquire medical equipment, such as machines for CT scan, radiation, thermotherapy and render health services at the regional hospitals in order to prevent the referral of thousands of patients, thereby causing overcrowding at some hospitals.

13 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KAIYAMO**

With regard to the Ministry of Works and Transport, the road to Omungwelumbe is causing many accidents and has many potholes. I would like the Minister to be on the road from Ongwediva to Oshakati at 08:00 in the morning to see the queue which starts from Ongwediva to Oshakati for three, four hours. Colleagues, we need another road from Ondangwa directly to northern Oshakati. We are in an awkward situation and we do not want to live that way. People cannot arrive to work in time and here you are laughing, the spirit is with you. Thank you very much.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Kaiyamo.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, I rise to support the Budget, but before that, I have been listening to the Colleagues from the other side talking too much, attacking SWAPO and I just want to make a statement.

The SWAPO Party is the guarantee for continuation of Namibian peace and success and we as SWAPO members enter the 2012/2013 in that spirit. We have every right to be proud of the fact that our Party is much stronger, better organised, more experienced, more cultured and more deeply and solidly rooted in respect and affection of the broader masses of our people than before. With this impressive strength we have always been a vanguard, not because of the Political Party ourselves but what the people think about the Party of choice.

It is against this background that no force on earth can separate SWAPO Party from the people of Namibia. The clock of history can never be turned back and it is against that background I would like to approach the 2012/2013 Budget.

The Minister's statement talks about the Budget Document and I notice that some of the Colleagues never read the Budget Document, they made

13 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KAIYAMO**

their own Budget Documents. This Budget Document talks about fiscal sustainability, how to sustain our fiscal policies, how to create jobs in our Republic, how to do more with less funds. That is the point of departure. Honourable Saara, a young SWAPO cadre from the youth section of our Party did a good job by bringing this document to Parliament.

When one listened to what Honourable Maamberua, the President of SWANU and Chairperson of the Public Accounts Committee of Parliament, was saying the other day, you could see that he is not speaking from that point of departure. As Chairman of the Committee on Public Accounts you are in charge of the public accountability of Ministries, thus it means you did not do your duty. He claims to be a socialist, but socialism is about a classless society and the mode of production and the relationship between the capitalist and the classless society. It is about capitalism and a classless society, but he did not mention that.

The Budget is our target and TIPEEG increased from N\$5.8 billion to N\$14 billion and the Minister talked about hopefully creating a hundred thousand jobs. What is wrong with that? This is the commitment SWAPO made and now people are doubting our commitment. The Budget is committed to creating a hundred thousand jobs and the Ministries must deliver. You as chairperson must check whether the Ministries are delivering and give advice so that you can do the best for our Republic.

The youth are happy with the money budgeted for youth empowerment and they will continue voting for SWAPO, here and in Oranjemund. The Minister of Finance improved on the language and I like the language of the Minister. She talked about BRIC countries, Brazil, Russia, India and China. That is in line with the tested ideology of South-South cooperation which was started by President Nyerere in his time. Therefore, in this Budget we want to promote South-South cooperation and we want to get rid of this Eurocentric mentality.

The Minister is also telling us in this Budget Book that the African Union agreed to have a trade-free area by 2017, which is a good thing. This

13 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KAIYAMO**

means that Namibia, under the SWAPO Government, is trying to be in line with the AU policies and programmes.

I am sure we all read these capitalist newspapers in our country. They told us that in the Global Competitive Report of 2012, Namibia is 32nd out of 142 countries, which means Namibia is doing well in the world.

The Minister also talks about the majority of our people being excluded from the economy of our Republic and now this Budget bringing them in. The Minister says the Ministries must control their Budgets and this message is going to all of us. If you look into the Manifesto that brought us to Parliament, it is clearly indicated that everybody should be a watchdog for the Budget and for Government. It means the Government is there for all the people, you must just do the right thing.

I am happy that the Minister is also talking about literacy programme to start on the 15th. Comrade Minister, we look forward to joining you at this occasion. Education is very important in our society. I want to call on every parent to make time for his or her children, to bring them under control culturally, morally and socially so that we have children who are properly brought up, the way we were brought up. Let us have time for our children, let us go back to the old school of a child belonging to the village. This means that every parent in that village is your parent and if we could go back to that, it would be good.

I also want us to congratulate the Kavango Region for achieving good results last year, including the Otjozondjupa Region. I would like to mention here Shifidi School where I started with Comrade Marco Hausiku, which also improved from 20th to 11th.

I also thank the Minister for giving us funds for libraries. I read in the book that by 2015 all the libraries will be having computers. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Honourable Kaiyamo, if you talk about the achievement by Shifidi School, I would also like you to

13 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KAIYAMO**

talk about Havana Primary School which has also achieved outstanding results. It is one of the most overcrowded schools deep in the informal areas of Katutura but it has done very well. We must give credit where it is due.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Yes, we need to congratulate the parents of those schools.

The other issue I want to mention is the performance agreements of our parastatals. Colleagues, honestly speaking, the executive officers of our parastatals are earning a lot of money and they must work and all of us should ensure that they perform. It should not just be cheap politics, we must work.

The Minister of Health and Social Services also deserves our collective congratulations, because by establishing the Medical School, Namibia is one of the few countries in Africa which can boast with a Medical School and that is a good start and that also goes for the Cardiac Unit. What I also like in this Budget is the fact that the Minister increased the tax on beer and reduced the tax on *Omalodhu* (Home brew). Minister, keep it up.

I also want to thank the Vice-President of the mighty SWAPO for pushing for the SME Bank. The people on the ground are very happy and are looking forward to making use of this SME Bank.

Colleagues, sometimes we are not honest with ourselves. The N\$50 increase in the old-age pension is something to talk about. Our people are very happy and appreciative. (Intervention)

HON MOONGO: Maybe I did not catch properly what the Honourable Member said. Are you saying you want to tax *tombo*, which is the liquor of the poor masses? If you do that it would be unfair to the poor people.

13 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KAIYAMO**

That is the only drink the poor can afford. It must be tax-free.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I said the Members of Parliament do not read the Budget Documents. In this Budget Document the Minister increased the tax on beer, but there is a zero tax on *Omalodhu*.

I am not talking about *tombo*. (Intervention)

HON NYAMU: May I ask a question? You are saying that the people are happy with the increase of N\$50 to the pensions. Can the Honourable Member tell us where did he get this information from, that the people are happy? Can he substantiate his statement that the old people are happy for this small increase or is he making it up himself?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Honourable Member, your brother was my teacher and he taught me very well. I am putting the N\$50 in context. The old people are happy because the SWAPO Government is giving them N\$50 more than they had before. It gives grants to their grandchildren who are orphans and the veterans are getting N\$50,000, including you. Are you not happy with the money you got as a veteran?

On top of the drought relief that the Government gives to the old people they also receive free hospital services. My call to the news media is to please report objectively about the Budget. With this I thank you very much.

13 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON LUCKS**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Honourable Lucks.

HON LUCKS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, as I rise today for my contribution to the Debate on the National Budget, I note with pleasure that this Budget has been tabled earlier in the new year, which to me is a sign of the commitment to pass this most important Bill and start with the execution thereof as soon as possible.

In my contribution I will speak about the planned expenditure, but also about the income or revenue side of the Budget, as I believe that this is where our Government will face serious challenges that, if not urgently addressed, will lead to a revenue crisis in the very near future.

Author Ed Sylvoso described the marketplace as “*the combination for business, education and Government*” and he compares the marketplace in a Nation to what the heart is to the body and I quote. He says: “*Through these three arteries flows the life of a Nation. In the same way that a body cannot exist without a heart, a Nation cannot exist without a healthy marketplace.*”

We often find a general consensus that once a problem or a need is identified, people respond with a call for more Government involvement. I reason that the solution is more often than not that the Namibian Nation needs more freedom. We are a Nation born from a fight for political freedom, let us not suffocate economic freedom through political over-governance. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: Honourable Member, you say the body cannot function without a heart. I want you to explain to the public, are you saying that the SWAPO Government is not working or what? Please tell the Nation.

13 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON LUCKS**

HON LUCKS: Not at all, Honourable Member, that is not at all what I was saying. I was saying that we need business, we need private business in this country. This is the heart of our economy.

To illustrate this point, I would like the House to consider with me this illustration of three different general types of spending processes. The first type is where you have spending where he is both the owner of the money he spends and the recipient of the object to be purchased. This person will obviously try to get the maximum value, usefulness and cost effectiveness, but spend the least amount of money because it is his or her own money.

The second type is the person that is not the owner of the money but will become the owner of the object to be purchased, for example someone who is given money by his or her employer to purchase a vehicle for him or herself. This person will also aim at maximum usefulness and effectiveness, but will not likely consider any possible cost savings, but will most likely spend the maximum amount allowed.

The third type is someone who is neither the owner of the money, nor the recipient of the object to be purchased. An example is an employee who has to spend his employer's money to buy a gift for a colleague. Since it is not his own money, he is less likely to consider cost savings and since the gift is not for himself, he is also less likely to consider usefulness and effectiveness. The gift might very well turn out to be an expensive novelty without much use.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the first type of spending typically is found in private business, whereas the third type is typically found in Government. Government officials that have to spend tax money, which is someone else's money, on goods, services and projects that are not directly for their own benefit, are at bigger risk of not spending this money cost effectively and for maximum benefit. I know this is a generalisation, but regrettably, in Namibia many examples of such spending exist, from Air Namibia to the proposed Neckertal Dam in the South and TIPEEG in general. The huge expansionary Budget of the previous year is another telling example of this type of spending. (Intervention)

13 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON LUCKS**

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: On a Point of Information. The Honourable Member has carefully worded his statement and I want to debunk it because it is based on misconception. Government officials that you are trying to portray in the fashion that you are doing, also pay tax. There is nobody in this country who does not pay tax. It is therefore not true that we are spending money that does not belong to us. Government is spending money that belongs to it, because the Private Sector in this country is so minute and I have heard what you are talking of, the business people and the double standards of the Private Sector. By talking about the Private Sector we are also including the Chinese which some of the people here are not happy with. The Chinese are also business people and the Government money spent here comes from mining, money generated through Government services and Government officials also pay tax. Your statement is based on false premises and false economic grounds.

HON LUCKS: Honourable Minister, I disagree. The tax revenue, rightly as you said, belongs to Government, but it does not belong to the Government official who is entrusted with spending the money. I was talking about the person who is spending the money. There is a difference.

The huge Expansionary Budget of the previous year is another telling example of this type of spending. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND ATTORNEY-GENERAL: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable Member, for clarity's sake, you referred to a dam in the South of our country, I believe the Neckertal Dam. Are you opposed to the construction of that dam which we believe will assist this country economically and, indeed, our citizens in the South? Are you opposed to that or can you clarify for the sake of the record?

13 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON LUCKS

HON LUCKS: Thank you, Honourable Members. Indeed I am opposed. My personal belief is that that money could be spent better elsewhere, for example if we look at the flood situation in the North, if we could construct a dam in the North where we harvest water that is causing floods and where many more people live. The majority of our population live in the North, so it would make perfect sense to construct a dam in the north of Namibia.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Would you have a problem if the Government embarks on both projects, building a dam there and also build some dams in the North? Would you have a problem with that?

HON LUCKS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, if Namibia could afford it and use the money to construct two dams, by all means. But I stand by my point that I believe the money could be spent better elsewhere. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: On a Point of Information. I find that we are not really making progress. The RDP is expounding its position as far as the South is concerned. They do not want that dam in the South. What is the problem with this part of the House? If they do not have Members there, they do not have sympathy with the people of the South. Why can we not take the position being articulated by the RDP? This House is a public House, everybody is hearing them, why are we contradicting them? Let us make progress.

HON LUCKS: What does the Ruling Party have against the North? Huge amounts of money were spent to create jobs and I am not convinced that many sustainable jobs have in fact been created. This means that this

13 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON LUCKS**

spending was ineffective for the objective of economic growth and job and wealth creation. The silence by the Honourable Minister on numbers of jobs created seems to prove this point. I am, however, open to be convinced otherwise.

My argument is that sustainable job creation is the result of true wealth creation and wealth creation is by definition a process whereby all parties working together are better off. Tax money can hardly be considered as wealth. Government should thus not risk tax money directly in enterprise, but should rather use it as an enabler for private enterprise to flourish.

Based on this, I argue that Government is simply not positioned to create jobs as effectively as the Private Sector where the entrepreneur accepts the risk and responsibility of his venture and employ people who contribute to wealth creation. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: On a Point of Information. The SWAPO Party-led Government cannot be described as if it is wanting when it comes to the economic environment that it has put in place. My friend, the Private Sector that you are trying to portray here, maybe the shops that you call Private Sector here are just retailers who are waiting desperately for this Government Budget. They are just retail instruments and it is good that the Government since Independence had expanded this economy, have revived the Fisheries Sector, revived the Mining Sector, are now busy with the industrial policy, we have expanded the economy and drawn in small entrepreneurs and the Agricultural Sector. What is the Private Sector generating in the economy? Shoprite? Mercedes Benz, Toyota? The Private Sector here has no industrial base, there is no Private Sector. The entrepreneurs are selling *vetkoek*, how many people are they employing? The biggest employer in this country remains Government. Let us face facts, your Private Sector is non-existent, zero.

13 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON LUCKS**

HON LUCKS: And that is exactly where our problem lies.
(Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: I just want to inform the Honourable Member that there is no Private Sector here. What does Pupkewitz do? He imports everything and he has been here for how many years? Everything is imported. The Government is trying its best to promote a mixed economy, but it has been proven that the classic capitalism is dead. All of them are bankrupt. What works is a Public-driven economy and it has been proven in Asia, Singapore, Malaysia. It has been proven in China. China is bailing out all these so-called capitalist enterprises. It is a total failure, so come up with some ideas.

This Government is going to promote a Public-driven economy, that is what we are going to do.

HON LUCKS: Again, the lack of a so-called Private Sector is exactly where our problem in Namibia lies.

I am, therefore, disappointed again this year that Government is not doing more to support the Private Sector and create tangible opportunities for Private Sector growth. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND ATTORNEY-GENERAL: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable Member, are you aware that in the heartbeat of capitalism, as you put it, the United States of America, the Government rescued all major private companies in America. They were bailed out by Government with public funds. Are you aware of that?

13 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON LUCKS

HON LUCKS: I am acutely aware of that. For the record, there is a difference between capitalism and free enterprise. The Minister herself has mentioned that the growth in the Public Service bill is not sustainable and the Civil Service simply cannot remain the main source of jobs in Namibia. This is what the Honourable Minister has said herself. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: On a Point of Information. I think we should really go and think a bit originally. The fact that our Constitution talks about a mixed economy and did not use the term “*free economy*” is for a reason and the fact that up to now the classical economics have not worked for those that invented them and those that corrupted it along the way, the definition now of a “*free economy*” is that it is free for predators, free from regulation, free for the 1%, free from you who do not have any means. In the system itself you would find the School of Chicago having another anti-thesis to that school. When you talk about the Private Sector that is also racially aligned in this country, it is a veiled argument that is actually empowering those that are already empowered, because when you go to a pharmacy, you would find there is only race on the other side of the counter. As scholars we should really question these theories that have not worked for other people. Therefore, what you are saying does not work.

HON LUCKS: Honourable Member, I find it interesting that you speak about a mixed economy while you want to have no Private Sector.

Honourable Minister, the theme of “*Doing More with Less*” sounds like a step in the right direction to curb ineffective spending. However, an 8 percent increase in spending on top of the big increase of last year does not sound like less to me. (Intervention)

13 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON LUCKS**

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY: On a Point of Information, Comrade Deputy Speaker. Honourable Lucks, Article 98 does not speak of a free economy, it says *the Namibian economy shall be based, inter alia, on the following forms of ownership*. This Government, the SWAPO Party Government, is authorised by the Constitution to participate directly in the economy and does not need the permission of anybody. The problem is that we read and quote selectively. That is why Honourable Lucks now wants to misinterpret the Constitution. You are young and we want progressive thinking to build this country. That is the information I wanted to give you, Honourable Lucks.

HON LUCKS: Let me make some other general observations. Number one, our Budget is again hugely skewed towards the operational side with only 17% to be spent on the development side. I believe that this must change, especially in the light of an increase in strain on our infrastructure which is in desperate need of upgrading and maintenance.

Secondly, the massive growth in the MTEF of the S&T bill is of real concern.... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: On a Point of Information. Again those who are pretending to be more economist than others are preaching that the operational side of this Budget is more than the development expenditure side. Today the Right Honourable Prime Minister read the expenditure on the social activities of this Government and what we also forget is that this SWAPO-led Government inherited eleven, almost twelve Governments, consisting of the White Administration which consisted of Germans, Afrikaners, Portuguese and so on and then the Bantustans. This Government has combined these Governments into one Central Government and then the Public Sector was bloated from the beginning as we could not throw the people out on the street. It was done for

13 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON LUCKS**

reconciliation and peace. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Minister, please summarise.

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: The operational expenditure of the Budget is based on the historical background and legacy of the system we have and Government has been spending on capital projects, such as the Trans-Kalahari, Trans-Capriivi, expansion of the ports and harbours and many other programmes and projects.

HON LUCKS: The Auditor-General has identified contraventions in S&T pay-outs as one of the biggest contributors of unauthorised spending. For many Civil Servants the S&T system has become a source of additional income and Government stands to lose millions if this cannot be managed more effectively. In this regard it is very interesting that our Government intends to spend more on S&T than on the upgrade and maintenance of hospitals, schools and sanitation.

Thirdly, the outcry over the pitiful increase of N\$50 per month in the old-age pension should be a clear indicator to Government that our poverty-stricken pensioners are in need of urgent additional assistance. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: I am really very sorry, Honourable Member, but some of the utterances cannot just be left unchallenged. The Honourable Member is saying that the S&T that the Government officials are taking is a waste of money. You have Development Budgets and you have projects and these projects are not in

13 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON LUCKS

Windhoek, they are in the Regions where most of the people are. When these officials travel, they are going to implement the projects that have been budgeted for and, therefore, it cannot be characterised as a waste of money when people are going to help out the poor in the Regions.

HON LUCKS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, that is not what I said. I proposed that the whole old-age pension scheme is reconsidered together with other social grants and the proposed Basic Poor Household Income Grant to find more effective ways of looking after the vulnerable in our society. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: I always say we must try to be honest. What is the difference between the S&T you get as a member of the Economics Committee and those of the Civil Servants? What is the difference?

HON LUCKS: The Honourable Member should listen to what I said. It is the misuse, not the use.

Fourthly Budget shortfalls and Government debts are ever-increasing and although still low by international standards, the trend is worrying. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: On a Point of Information. Comrade Deputy Speaker, I do not know about now, but in our days this Chamber was not allowed to speak of people who are not Members of this House, such as the Government officials. How can the Honourable Member say the Government officials are misusing the money? Those people are not

13 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON LUCKS**

Members of this House. When we have new Rules he can do that.

HON LUCKS: Honourable Member, I am talking on Reports by the Auditor-General that are tabled in this House and that are also available to you for reading.

Debt servicing will take an increasingly larger chunk out of our National Budgets and I believe action should be taken sooner rather than later, as was done with the current Budget.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, looking at the revenue side, it is my earnest opinion that we in Namibia are sitting on a time-bomb. Our tax base is very narrow and also very vulnerable to extreme downsides. Namibia's main revenue streams are the SACU revenues and the Agriculture, Tourism, Fishing and Mining Sectors. While abnormally high SACU revenue for 2012 is predicted, this could change very quickly and Namibia has learned that over-reliance on this income stream could be very dangerous.

In the Agriculture Sector Namibia has experienced a few years of good rains. I am, however, very worried that even a short period of drought will have a disastrous effect on the industry and the revenues it generates. Our resettlement programme has failed to establish farmers who are able to provide meaningful revenue and even worse, to be able to withstand adverse effects like a drought. In such a case Government would not only lose revenue from farming activities, but would also be faced with large capital outflows in order to help these emerging farmers to survive. The resettlement programme thus also needs urgent attention and perhaps a complete overhaul.

The Tourism Industry has already sharply contracted due to the global financial situation. I foresee only a very gradual and slow recovery in this Industry, meaning that revenue from this Sector will take very long to recover.

13 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON LUCKS

The Fishing Industry, likewise, has been hit by global financial troubles, however this Industry is also very vulnerable to climate changes and it could very quickly become necessary to drastically cut quotas to protect this resource, which could lead to drastic decreases in revenue from this Sector.

The Mining Industry, although it has huge potential to create wealth and sustainable jobs, has seen drastic decreases in investment after the establishment of Epangelo. Again Government, through Epangelo, is going to risk big capital while we do not have the expertise in Namibia needed to ensure success. In my view, we should encourage more foreign investment in the Mining Industry. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: On a Point of Information. Honourable Member, you are saying that Epangelo has threatened, however you put it. Why are the investors not shying away from investing in the Oil Industry in Angola? Why should they shy away from investing in Namibia if we have Epangelo?

HON LUCKS: Perhaps it is a matter of expertise. Foreign mining houses bring capital, transfer skills and provide job opportunities more effectively. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FISHERIES AND MARINE RESOURCES: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable Member, you mentioned the challenges faced by the fishing sector. You talked about quota reduction. Are you privy to the scientific reports before those reports reach our Advisory Council? Can you please enlighten the House and myself as the Minister where you got the information?

13 March 2012

SECOND READING : APPROPRIATION BILL
HON LUCKS

HON LUCKS: Honourable Member, I did some reading. Let us open our mineral wealth to them and let them risk their capital, but let us make it clear that they should use local labour, they should transfer skills, procure locally and support local businesses through the use of suppliers and contractors that are Namibians. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Just a question. Honourable Member, you are saying we should not put in place organisations like Epangelo because of lack of expertise. Are you aware of how many foreigners are working in NASA and since when? Did the Americans have to wait until they had the expertise to create NASA and to start flying the Apollos and all these other things? Can you really be patriotic and come up with suitable African solutions so that we can take you seriously?

HON LUCKS: I would like to encourage the Honourable Member to listen carefully. I would also like to see the establishment of a mining school, able to train many times more workers than the current Namibian Institute of Mining and Technology, which will ensure that we produce trained mineworkers and mining experts to be employed in this potentially huge Industry.

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: Honourable Deputy Speaker, on a Point of Order. Maybe this is the policy of the Honourable Member's Party, that they are allergic to Epangelo Mining Company. Is the Honourable Member aware that most of the companies that he proposes must invest in this country's natural resources are companies belonging to other countries' Governments? How could we then allow another Government to send its company here to exploit our resources and not create our own companies? (Interjections). Areva, CMDP, Rössing, you name them. All these are owned by foreign Governments.

13 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON LUCKS

HON LUCKS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Foreign Direct Investment has decreased by a staggering 81% from 2010 to 2011. I fail to understand how we can welcome Chinese and Korean construction companies with open arms... (Intervention)

HON KAURA: Honourable Member, do you see that the Ruling Party is so nervous? Do you not think that is a sign of lack of self-confidence?

HON LUCKS: My thoughts exactly. I fail to understand how we can welcome Chinese and Korean construction companies with open arms that invest little, import labour and do not even support local business.

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Can I ask my son a small question? Is it true that my son is a mixture of Chinese-Korean origin?

HON LUCKS: These companies invest little, import labour and do not even support local business because they import all their tools and equipment from their countries of origin and elsewhere. This practice must stop immediately.

In conclusion, I sincerely believe that all people want a higher standard of living but often do not know how to attain it. Thus a Budget that truly aims at maximum national benefits will focus on ways to allow individuals freedom to invent their standing of living and engage in enterprise and then also to protect their rights to create wealth. In 2 Thessalonians 3:10 it is stated:(Intervention)

13 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON IIVULA-ITHANA**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: You can sit down now because I have given you one minute. Honourable Minister of Justice.

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Comrade Deputy Speaker, thank you very much for the opportunity to participate in the general Debate of the Annual Budget for this year.

At the onset allow me to commend the Honourable Minister of Finance, her Deputy, the Director-General of the National Planning Commission and the staff of their offices for a very comprehensive and positive Budget and reassuring promise for the Namibian people.

The Budget theme for this year is titled, *“Poverty Alleviation, Improved Service Delivery and Job Creation – Doing More with Less”*. This is truly a reflection of what we have been presented with, do more with less. What a meaningful expression!

Comrade Deputy Speaker, the courage of the team responsible for the formulation of our Budget by providing measures to address the problems facing the Namibian Nation cannot go unnoticed. This Budget is truly doing more with less. The issue at the heart of the Namibian people is the reduction of unemployment in our country, particularly among the youth and the women. A stand has been made which is supposed to be welcomed by all concerned Namibian leaders, irrespective of our political affiliation. We are supposed to say thank you that this Government is showing determination to fight against unemployment in the country. It is our responsibility as political leaders to grab the opportunity to encourage our youth, to encourage our entrepreneurs, to encourage our Civil Servants to pave the way for this N\$14 billion allocated for job creation, other than for us to come to the House and just criticise the lack of implementation. Why do we not talk about how to implement this strategy? Come forward with actions and strategies and say this one cannot succeed, this one should succeed. (Intervention)

13 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON IIVULA-ITHANA**

HON KAURA: May I ask the Honourable Minister a question? Honourable Minister, if we all come to this House and indulge ourselves in self-praise on both sides of the House, do you not think it would be boring?

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: That is precisely what I did not say because I did not intend to be boring. I am advocating for the two sides of the House to constructively face issues facing our country, other than to always be negative for the sake of being the Opposition. Just because you are the Opposition Parties, therefore you must oppose anything even if it is good for the country, just like this young MP. The young Member of Parliament is sacrificing the whole of the South by asking why that dam should be built in the South. What kind of politics is that?

HON LUCKS: Does the Honourable Minister notice the maturity shown by this side in listening to the Honourable Minister? Do you notice this?

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: I have just started, maybe you are still waiting to hear what I have to say. We also listen and when we see the way things are being taken... (Intervention)

HON NYAMU: May I ask Honourable Maria a question? Honourable Member, you suggested that we should give you credit, so to speak. We want to give you credit, but what do you say about the average D grade by the Insight Magazine?

13 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON IIVULA-ITHANA**

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I was addressing the issue of job creation because the country is faced with that problem, but the team given the responsibility to address that problem has come up with a solution. The solution is here. If we do not want to face it, we become negative and that is how some people in this country want to portray this Government as not performing. They want to tell the world that there is nothing happening in Namibia. They pick events around which they will now evaluate the performance of a person. I do not come from a teaching, economic or diplomatic background. I am who I am and what you see is what you get. That is me. Therefore, I would like to appeal that we should not throw out the baby with the bathwater.

When the Vice-President was Prime Minister he used to say, we are all on this boat, all of us on the high seas and if it sinks, all of us will drown. Once the ship on which we are sinks, all of us will drown. If some of us think that by trashing this Government we are building Namibia, we are fooling ourselves, big time. Reputable international organisations that are qualified to evaluate countries are evaluating Namibia among the top best performers, yet we are pulling Namibia down ourselves. What are we doing to ourselves? Shame on us!

Honourable Deputy Speaker, we need to support TIPEEG efforts. I know the implementation rate is not up to expectations but it is picking up and we must encourage our young people to become enthusiastic about this programme, because it is meant for them.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The House is adjourned, you will continue tomorrow.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:45 UNTIL 2012.03.14 AT 14:30

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS
WINDHOEK
14 MARCH 2012**

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

ANNOUNCEMENT

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Commonwealth is inviting all of us to a function which is going to be held at the Parliament Restaurant between 12:00 and 13:00. I understand some of you have received invitations, so I hereby invite everybody to attend.

Another invitation is from the Governor of the Khomas Region to those of us who are not assigned to other Regions for the Independence Celebrations to celebrate same on the 21st in Katutura Independence Arena.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any Petitions? Any Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Honourable Minister of Finance.

**TABLING: REPORTS OF THE AUDITOR-GENERAL
AND ANNUAL REPORTS**

14 March 2012

TABLING OF REPORTS
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I lay upon the Table, Reports of the Auditor-General on the Accounts of:

- Town Council of Rehoboth for the Financial Year ended 30 June 2009 and 2010;
- Annual Report of the Agricultural Bank of Namibia for the Financial Year ended 2009; and
- Annual Report of the Road Fund Administration for the Financial Year ended 2010.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please table the Reports. Any other Reports and Papers? Notice of Questions? Notice of Motions? Message from the Head of State? Ministerial Statements? The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

**RESUMPTION OF SECOND READING:
APPROPRIATION BILL**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on Second Reading – *Appropriation Bill*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When the Debate was adjourned yesterday, the 13th of March 2012, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Minister of Finance, that the Bill be read a Second Time. The Honourable Minister of Justice has the Floor to finalise her contribution.

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON IIVULA-ITHANA**

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. Honourable Deputy Speaker, before the House adjourned yesterday, I was on the point of urging Members of Parliament across the political divide to encourage our youth to take up the challenge to make use of the N\$14 billion put at their disposal to create employment and to create wealth for the country. In the same vein, I would also like to encourage our business community, particularly the young entrepreneurs who have access to national resources to invest their income from there in their country.

The allegations being made against some of them, is that they invest their income in other countries, buying assets there and opening foreign bank accounts, and that is not a patriotic deed. While at home we are encouraging foreigners to come and invest in Namibia, our own nationals are taking our resources and moneys abroad.

I would further like to commend the Ministry of Finance for exempting certain medical services from VAT. In a country where so many of our people are on medical treatment because of either TB or HIV/AIDS, we truly need to become proactive in helping those who are helping our people to prolong their lives. In the same vein, I would like to appeal to the Honourable Minister of Finance to in future consider introducing VAT exemption on agricultural input. Agricultural input, Honourable Deputy Speaker, is so expensive. While we are encouraging investors and ourselves to produce food for our country, the price of seeds, tractors, planters, harvesters, etcetera, are unaffordable. By doing so we will see that many local entrepreneurs will venture into agricultural production.

I am a communal farmer from Oshikoto Region where we produce crops in abundance, such as mahangu, beans and others and that is probably why the Minister of Agriculture, Water and Forestry has talked of creating silos at Omuthiya. We have been filling them and we are in actual fact requesting the Honourable Minister to expand those silos because they have become too small.

This year, however, Honourable Deputy Speaker, I would like to bring to the attention of the House that a serious situation has developed there.

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON IIVULA-ITHANA**

This is not new, I think this is the second year that Oshikoto Region has been invaded by an unprecedented number of mosquitoes. These mosquitoes are the size of flies and they are terrorising farmers. Many farmers have lost animals, particularly small stock – small goats, lambs, piglets and chicken. These mosquitoes are very dangerous, they fly throughout the day and throughout the night and the people are now even too scared to even venture into the fields because of these attacks. I do not know which Line Ministry should initiate control of these mosquitoes. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: May I please ask the Honourable Minister of Justice a question? Honourable Minister, you have indicated that you are a communal farmer and you also indicated that you produce a lot of crops that you sell even to the Government. My question is, what makes a person to be communal? Is it the area where you live or is it what you are doing with your products? If somebody lives on a freehold and that person is only producing for subsistence, can that person be called a commercial farmer just because he is in the area that is termed to be commercial? I thought the commercial aspect is what you do with what you produce.

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: The question of the Honourable Minister is complicated. It is not up to me to tell what is the divide between communal and commercial, because there are two Acts, one governing that area of our country called the commercial area and I thought “*commercial area*” was a term coined through the act of acquisition of that particular area. Those who bought land or who occupy that land which was either acquired through the exchange of money is what is called commercial area. Whatever term you use is up to you.

Communal, on the other hand, is that part of the country where land is owned communally. What you do on the land which you own as a community is not a determining factor whether you are communal or

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON IIVULA-ITHANA**

commercial. However, the products can generate money or crops or whatever you want. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: May I ask the Secretary-General of the SWAPO Party, Honourable Pendukeni Iivula-Ithana, a question? Yesterday an Honourable Member was speaking of demons and spirits and I want to find out whether these mosquitoes were probably brought by the demons and the spirits? I am concerned about these mosquitoes and if I recall my biology, there are three types of mosquitoes and I will ask Dr Kamwi to enlighten us. However, my understanding is that the mosquito which carries malaria is a tiny one, not the big one. The big ones are in the gardens, they are not really dangerous. Maybe the big ones are carrying demons and that is why the cattle are dying.

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Thank you, Minister of Foreign Affairs, it is true the mosquitoes which carry malaria are those small ones.

I do not think these big ones carry malaria, but they suck the blood of animals and human beings. I can tell you that when you hit it after it has bitten you, there is so much blood coming from it. That is why small animals die, because there are so many mosquitoes and you develop blisters where they have bitten you. They cause hardship, they cause irritation, but since apparently they do not cause malaria, neither our health institutions nor the people responsible for environmental protection are much concerned. However, I really think we must do something as this situation cannot be allowed to continue the way it is. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, I rise on a Point of Information. It is unusual when your senior is addressing this Chamber to interrupt, but this is rather to give some information. To allay the fears of

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON IIVULA-ITHANA**

the Secretary-General of the SWAPO Party, there is on-going work to face the challenges that we are faced with in Oshikoto around Omuthiya. I have in my hand here a report from the meeting in Omuthiya from the 7th to 9th of March this year. I only shared this with the Right Honourable Prime Minister. Three Ministries are collaborating, namely the Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry, the Ministry of Environment and Tourism and my Ministry. In terms of the preliminary results, these mosquitoes are known as culex. They are vectors of filariasis and Rift Valley fever, but fortunately they are non-vectors of any of these diseases south of Angola, south of Zambia, south of Zimbabwe and south of Mozambique and that is where we fall, fortunately.

The plan that is underway is that we have sprayed to prevent bites indoors, that is intra-domicilium and we are also supplying treated mosquito bed nets. For the animals we are working around the clock with the veterinarians. For now my Colleague could leave this in the capable hands of the experts, we are working around the clock and we think we will be able to address this challenge.

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Very useful information, Comrade Minister, however the people are suffering. While you are seized with the matter, there is no remedy. I am saying people are even scared to go into the mahangu fields and cultivate out of fear of these insects which bite. (Intervention)

HON SHIXWAMENI: May I ask the Honourable Minister a question? Does the Minister not think that it is time that an emergency be declared around the Oshikoto Region in order to fight this plaque properly and to contain it?

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON IIVULA-ITHANA**

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: I do not know what the Honourable Member qualifies as a situation to be an emergency, but I thought I should reveal this information to the House because of my interest. I told you I am from there, that is where my house is and sometimes I have to think twice before I go there for a weekend because it is very uncomfortable. If you fear to go there for self-preservation, what about the people who are living there on a daily basis? That is why I feel that something could have been done last year already, because this is the second year this invasion has occurred. We are moving towards the end of the rainy season, by April, May the cold will be setting in and these mosquitoes will disappear. I thought if there is anything to be done, it is now the time to alleviate this problem. However, I am comforted by the assurance of the Honourable Minister of Health and Social Services that they are seized with the matter.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, I was moving to my last point which is indirectly related to the Budget, because of what is happening in the country. We have too many young men standing and sitting around the street corners, selling newspapers and wandering around. Those who dropped out of Grade 10 and 12, and those who are just loafing around. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: On a Point of Information. Those young men are not loafing, they are looking for jobs.

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Honourable Prime Minister, I mentioned several categories of people, those seeking jobs, sitting on the street corners, those selling newspapers who are also looking for a better job and then there are those who are loafing.

Comrade Deputy Speaker, what I want to address is the issue that we have many young men who grow up without having lived close to other men. They are brought up by their mothers or grandmothers and in the process

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON IIVULA-ITHANA**

they lack the social skills of how to deal with society as men. That is a reality and that is probably why we are observing a phenomenon of suicides, murders and passion killings. If a young man has never lived close to an older man just to observe the behaviour of a man, what do you expect this young man to do? Women have their own way of dealing with society, men have their own way of dealing with society and therefore, the two sexes complement each other. That complementarity is no longer there in the majority of the cases and therefore, I feel strongly that our men – and I am saying this in all sincerity – should start thinking seriously about the future of men in this society. Tomorrow they are no longer going to be young and these are the ones who ten years from now are supposed to be role models to our young brothers, sons and cousins. If they themselves do not have anything to give to the next generation of men, what kind of society are we going to have?

My appeal to our menfolk is that they should start thinking how to mentor these young men. When women started their women's organisation it was not taken positively. (Intervention)

HON DINGARA: May I ask the Honourable Minister of Justice a small question? While you are on that point, we also have people who grew up with both parents, but have never been shown the difference between good and bad, the treatment remains the same, no recognition. When this person beats someone and the friend praises him for doing well, it is the first time he receives recognition and the person now keeps on doing bad things because he receives recognition.

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Comrade Deputy Speaker, I do not intellectualise this subject, I am only touching on the surface. We can go deeper into the subject and analyse it, but I am just relating the little I have observed.

I am a mother of three biological children, but a mother of so many, two

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON IIVULA-ITHANA**

sons and a daughter and I precisely know the behaviour of young men in a home. In my upbringing, when we used to behave out of the norm and our father was not home and we did not want to conform, there was always that warning, "*I will tell your dad.*" (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION:

May I ask the Honourable Minister a question? Honourable Minister, do you want to tell us that the behaviour of boys who are not brought up by their fathers and given care and love are not as good as those who were staying with their fathers all the time and given love? It seems the Honourable Member is saying the men of today do not really mentor their children and setting a good example.

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: I understand what the Honourable Minister is saying, but what I was addressing is not really children from homes where the father and the mother are. I am addressing a situation that is prominent in our society today, that many of the homes are headed by women and the children are brought up either by that mother alone or by the grandmother and the child has never heard a thick voice in the house, just to feel this bad I cannot do because this uncle, brother or uncle will reprimand me. That is the area of concern that I am raising and it is a reality and I am asking, what are we going to do with this sector of our young men (Intervention)

HON BEZUIDENHOUDT: I am sorry to disturb, may I ask Honourable Ithana a question? You mentioned something yesterday which is linked to this subject you are raising. Do you also see the same link I see when you said yesterday that the children used to belong to the community and that has been taken away from them? When I grew up, every parent in the area used to tell me what to do and all of us were looked after by a broader

14 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON NEHOVA

community other than the household. Do you agree that there is a link to that?

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Indeed and I just mentioned that small aspect, but the larger picture is that which I think some of our institutions could venture in, such as the University of Namibia and the Polytechnic, to do research and come up with remedial proposals of how we should control this situation. Otherwise our generation who remembers that the upbringing of children was that of the community will disappear and what is left behind are those children who have not benefited from the social structure as we used to know it.

Before Honourable Dingara's intervention I said that our men should also become involved and see what can be done to address this situation seriously. If we just leave it that maybe one day it will resolve itself, it could be too late.

Comrade Deputy Speaker, I addressed a few of my concerns but at the end of everything I support the Budget. Thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Kandy Nehova.

HON NEHOVA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members of this august House. I wish to join other Members of this House in congratulating the Minister of Finance, Honourable Saara Kuugongelwa-Amadhila, for once again tabling the Annual Budget for the Financial Year 2012/2013. As provided for under the Namibian Constitution under Chapter 16, Article 126(1), *the Minister in charge of the Department of Finance shall at least once every year and thereafter at set intervening stages as may be necessary, present for the consideration of the National*

14 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON NEHOVA

Assembly estimates of revenue, expenditure and income for the prospective year.

The Constitution further provides that “*the National Assembly shall consider such estimates and pass pursuant thereto such Appropriation Acts as are in its opinion necessary to meet the financial requirements of the State from time to time.*”

Honourable Speaker, the point I wish to emphasise here is that it is the National Assembly, after having been presented with the estimates by the Minister of Finance, which shall consider such estimates and pass them as are in its opinion, in the opinion of the Assembly, necessary to meet the financial requirements of the State. This means that the National Assembly has the overall power to ultimately decide on the actual amounts required for each Vote presented by the Minister. That is to say, the current practice or view that the National Assembly is rather an institution for rubber-stamping the estimates as drafted by Cabinet is contrary to the letter and spirit of the referred constitutional provision.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members of the august House, like in the preceding years ... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: May I ask the Honourable Kandy Nehova a question?

HON NEHOVA: Yes, Honourable Deputy Speaker, but before that the Honourable Utoni must withdraw the statement that he made here last year to the extent that I am the one who prevented the development in Ongwediva. That statement was uncalled for and unless he withdraws that statement, I will not accept his question. Can I continue?

14 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON NEHOVA

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yesterday is yesterday, today is today, but of course, you have the right to refuse a question. You may proceed.

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: On a Point of Information. Honourable Deputy Speaker, is it allowed for the Honourable Member, Honourable Kandindima, to rubberstamp the other Member on the head in Parliament?

HON NEHOVA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members of this House, like in the preceding years the Minister of Finance has emphasised the need to address the acute problems of unemployment, poverty and hunger, particularly in rural communities. To address these pressing national problems, the Government has, as from last year, introduced a special development programme referred to as Targeted Intervention Programme for Employment and Economic Growth (TIPEEG) to run over a period of three years. However, the much-lauded programme has not been accompanied by a comprehensive study outlining potential economic projects which would serve as conduits to create employment, generate income and reduce poverty and hunger. The Government has rather introduced this programme for short-term job creation. This will certainly not resolve the problems of poverty and hunger as a long-term solution. In addition, the Government was really categorical in reassuring that this programme will create over that period 104,000 jobs. We would like to receive feedback from the Honourable Minister of Finance as to how many jobs have now been created one year after TIPEEG has been introduced.

In the absence of any feedback in terms of jobs created through TIPEEG, one would conclude that the disbursement of TIPEEG funds is just the usual way of Government allowing the corrupt misuse of State moneys through swindling and embezzlement like it happened in other cases, such as GIPF, ODC, Social Security and many others.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, I would further like to get clarity as to the

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON NEHOVA**

relationship between TIPEEG and the already existing budgeted for capital projects under various Government Departments and Government Agencies. For example, the Minister of Works and Transport has a capital Budget for the rehabilitation of many highways and roads throughout the country, but TIPEEG also covers the construction of roads and other infrastructures. What is the relationship there, Honourable Deputy Speaker?

Honourable Deputy Speaker, are we talking about the same Government projects being financed by two programmes, that is TIPEEG and the Capital Budget? (Intervention)

**HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT,
HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:**

May I ask the Honourable Member a small question? Do you remember what you said in Walvis Bay in 1971, 1972 as a member of SWAPO Youth League, that you will die as a SWAPO member? When we were organising the workers' strike in Walvis Bay you said you will die as a SWAPO member. Even when the whites came and they arrested all of us, you said you will die a SWAPO member whatever happens. Do you still remember those years which are now forty years ago? Do you recall those words at that meeting in 1971 in Walvis Bay forty-three years ago?

HON NEHOVA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I will answer the Honourable Jerry Ekandjo. It is true what he says. We worked together in Walvis Bay, in fact we organised that general strike in Namibia in 1971, 1972. (Intervention)

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:40

HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:15

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON NEHOVA**

HON NEHOVA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, to answer the question...
(Intervention)

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The question is irrelevant or do you want to answer?

HON NEHOVA: Yes, the question is relevant. What my Colleague Ekandjo said is true. I said to him I will never leave SWAPO. Now listen here, I never left SWAPO until SWAPO successfully completed its objective in 1990, SWAPO, the liberation movement. Now listen to this: In 1991, SWAPO was transformed into SWAPO Party. This was an ideological stand. I left SWAPO in 2007 because the SWAPO Party refused and is still refusing to fulfil the principles prescribed in this Constitution. That is why I left SWAPO Party, not SWAPO the movement. (Intervention)

**HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT,
HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:** On a Point of Information. After the Honourable Member was arrested in 1971, 1972, he was sent by the then Administrator of South Africa to Angola. The Portuguese put him in a hole for many years, he suffered there in Angola and there in the darkness where he was for years, he later got used to the darkness and he could see everything in the dark. When the coup took place in Portugal in 1974 he was released by the junta. When he came out the sunlight destroyed his eyes because he spent many years in the dark. As a result of that his eyes are bad, so he really suffered because of SWAPO.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you for that information, for the others who do not have that information.

14 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON NEHOVA

HON NEHOVA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Roadmap for Socio-Economic Development of Namibia is prescribed in clear terms and referenced in various articles and sections in the Namibian Constitution. I will take extra pains to quote just some of those very important provisions which were supposed to guide us in our quest for socio-economic development.

Chapter 11, Article 98 refers to the Principles of Economic Order under Section (1) and I quote: “*The economic order of Namibia shall be based on the principles of a mixed economy with the objective of securing economic growth, prosperity and a life of human dignity for all Namibians.*”

Section (2) of the same article states: “*The Namibian economy shall be based, inter alia, on the following forms of ownership*” and this is where I have a problem with the Colleagues that side: Number one, public ownership form of ownership, secondly, private and somebody said that there should be no private ownership. Thirdly, joint Public-Private, fourthly, cooperative, fifthly, co-ownership, namely joint ventures or partnerships and lastly, small-scale family.

The fallacious assumption that the Private Sector is the engine of economic development in Namibia is certainly in contradiction with the above-stated economic order that recognises clearly the role of the Public Sector and the Private Sector. The President and the Cabinet have a sacred responsibility... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: On a Point of Information. Honourable Kandy Nehova, I think the RDP is clearly confused, you have no policy. Yesterday your Colleague was talking about the Private Sector, today you are talking about the Public Sector. Where do you stand? This gentleman yesterday clearly said the Private Sector is the engine for economic development. Your policies are confused.

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON NEHOVA**

HON NEHOVA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I am quoting what is provided in the Constitution of the Republic of Namibia, I am not referring to what is written in the political programme of our Political Party. The Constitution is for all of us. I said here it is both, the Private Sector has its role, the Government has its role. I will continue, Honourable Deputy Speaker.

The President and the Cabinet have a sacred responsibility to intervene directly or indirectly in the planning, execution, coordination and control over the management of our economy. I have not written those things. Honourable Hamutenya, Honourable Kaura, the Chief, Honourable Hage and Honourable Nahas Angula put this in the Constitution. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: I would like to ask the Honourable Member a question. Honourable Member, last year your Party spoke almost in the same rhetoric as today. Last year we had a Budget in this House, you had ample chance to come up with an alternative. You talk about Budget right now, but you do not come with an alternative. What is the alternative, where is the paper that you are talking about? Give us your alternative, your economic policy. Where is it?

HON NEHOVA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, frankly, the Honourable Colleagues are not listening to what I am saying, I am not inventing anything here, I am referring to what was put in the Constitution by many of your senior Colleagues sitting in front of me, including the Right Honourable Prime Minister. I am not inventing anything. I only want to demand the fulfilment of what is written here.

It should be emphasised that the Government should refrain from abdicating its responsibility to fulfil these provisions. Further, the Constitution under Chapter 17, Article 129, refers to the National Planning Commission and in Section (1) it states that: *“There shall be established*

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON NEHOVA**

in the Office of the President a National Planning Commission whose task shall be to plan the priorities and direction of the national development.”
It is clear in the Constitution.

In this regard, the National Planning Commission is the principal agency that advises the President and Cabinet on all matters pertaining to economic planning. Short of these constitutional provision the National Planning Commission is merely used as a recipient Government Agency of foreign financial donations. When shall the Government Agency, this National Planning Commission, fully execute its constitutional mandate, which is to plan the priorities and direction of the national development?
(Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: May I ask a question? Honourable Nehova, in your statement you underlined certain things. As the former Chairman of the National Council you were planning certain things. Are the people you left behind implementing those plans or what happened?

HON NEHOVA: I am saying planning is a continuing thing. In fact, I am protesting because I do not see a proper plan for job creation and poverty eradication.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Constitution under Chapter 11, Article 95 also provides, amongst others, for the promotion and maintenance of the welfare of the people and “*ensurance that senior citizens are entitled to and do receive a regular pension adequate...*” and as I went through the Minutes of the Constituent Assembly, this word “*adequate*” was proposed by Honourable Nahas Angula. It says, “*regular pension adequate for the maintenance of a decent standard of living and the enjoyment of social and cultural opportunities.*” (Intervention)

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON NEHOVA**

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable Member, where were you in 1990? You were here?

HON NEHOVA: I was here.

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Can you remember how much the old people used to get monthly as a pension, particularly the blacks? It was N\$30. Although Honourable Kandy Nehova belongs to an Opposition Party, I think he can adequately answer my question. How much are the old persons getting currently? N\$550 from this Financial Year. Can you tell the Honourable House what is the difference?

HON NEHOVA: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. Yes, maybe there is something wrong with what they received then and what they are receiving now, but even us as Government officials started with a smaller salary but we kept improving on that. (Intervention)

HON KAURA: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable Member, are you aware of the fact that in 1990 I could buy a goat for N\$15. Today a goat costs me N\$1,200.00. Is it not clear that the purchasing power in 1990 and the purchasing power today are not comparable at all?

HON NEHOVA: You are correct, this is economics. This is now the 21st century.

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON NEHOVA**

Honourable Deputy Speaker, in this regard it should be clearly understood by the Government that providing social grants... (Intervention)

HON DINGARA: This paper which we have on tables was not prepared by the SWAPO Government. This Democracy Report is not a SWAPO paper. On Page 8 of this paper it clearly indicates what happened with regard to pensions from 1990 until today. This is a scientifically researched paper and it is a professional body that researched and released the information and this is the truth. It shows how the pension was improved with inflation from 1990 up to now and we must just congratulate the SWAPO Government based on this independent Report.

HON NEHOVA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I am saying that my intervention is guided by this most important instrument. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND ATTORNEY-GENERAL: Honourable Deputy Speaker, the former Chairman of the National Council was saying that the function of the National Planning Commission is really to receive grants, which is not true. May I remind this House that we started with the National Development Plan 1 and now we are busy with NDP4, which is a function stated in the Constitution. The Honourable Member should not misinform this House and the Nation.

He is even protesting about the current function of the NPC. The NPC is carrying out its functions within the letter and spirit of the Constitution.

HON NEHOVA: I was saying in this regard it should be clearly understood by the Government that providing social grants and other

14 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON NEHOVA

amenities to senior citizens and other vulnerable Namibians is certainly not an act of goodwill from the Government, but it is a fulfilment of a constitutional obligation. (Intervention)

HON VON WIETERSHEIM: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Did you know, Honourable Colleague, that the pension which is today N\$550.00, according to this highly professional paper the value of the Independence pension today is N\$578.00?

HON NEHOVA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Constitution under the same chapter requires, and this is very important, that “*subordinate legislation be created by the Parliament of Namibia to regulate the provision of the referred social amenities.*” I never mentioned here that they are lower or higher, I want to say it is high time that we have a law to regulate these grants that the Right Honourable Prime Minister articulated yesterday. There must be a law to regulate these things.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members of this august House, I am on record for commending the Government for implementing realistic and patriotic policies. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? The Honourable Member is my mentor, there are certain ideological things I learned from him. Do you think the way you are articulating the ideological inclination that you are talking about, with the current broad changed nature of the Party you are in, those inclinations are ever going to be realised or you are going to have to criticise from that perspective without coming up with a homogenous paper ideologically inclined as you are stipulating to us, given the current nature and composition of your organisation?

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON IILONGA**

HON NEHOVA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I am certainly not inventing anything here, I am demanding that what is written in this Constitution by the mothers and fathers of the Constitution, whom I see there, has to be fulfilled and the Government has that responsibility, nobody else, not the Opposition, nor the Private Sector.

In conclusion, Honourable Deputy Speaker, I am on record for commending the Government for implementing realistic and patriotic policies, particularly with regard to borrowing funds from external sources. In her Budget Statement the Honourable Minister of Finance has stated that the Government would borrow funds locally and from the open market in order to finance the Budget deficit. That is fine. So far the Government has prudently been avoiding borrowing money from well-known international financial institutions mainly based in the capitals of the capitalist Europe. What these institutions are doing to their fellow European countries, particularly to Greece, should serve as a lesson to Namibia, being an economically dependent country.

Thank you very much for the attention, Honourable Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Iilonga.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. Before I start with my prepared speech, I just want to remind ourselves that today is the day of the heroes, today is the day we have lost one of the heroes, Comrade John Alfons Pandeni. May his soul rest in eternal peace. He said during our trial on the 14th of November: *“I believe that the raid by South African Defence Force at Cassinga in southern Angola was the murder of hundreds of innocent women and children. This shows the insincerity of the South African regime towards accepting the peace proposed that will bring freedom and Independence to our country. Therefore, I and my Comrades will continue the armed liberation struggle*

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON IILONGA**

*as the only alternative to free ourselves, our country of colonial rule.
John Alfons Pandeni, 14 November 1978, High Court, Room B.”*

Comrade Deputy Speaker, this is the 22nd National Budget in our Independent Republic of Namibia. Salutation to Comrade Saara, her Deputy and Director-General.

The 22nd National Budget went far from the general expectations. Even those who used to ask what a pro-poor Budget means can see for themselves that Comrade Saara with her team have simplified this Budget and they still have that responsibility towards our senior citizens. It must be clear from this House to our people outside that no one from the SWAPO Party Government said that the N\$550.00 is enough, but the process is there, we started from N\$100.00. (Interjections). We are not like you people who are not consistent. You will find that what I say is what is said by all my Comrades and Honourable Tjihuiko, next time when you are going to read this, you are going to find that these people already receive over a thousand.

Comrade Deputy Speaker, last year I called upon our Government not only to concentrate on policy intervention, but it is a must to intervene in economic activities in order to broaden its asset capacity, negotiation power as well as employment opportunities of our young people, especially the school drop-outs. As a country we need to look for good examples around the world, such as the Asian Tiger, Cuba and many other countries where their Governments intervened in the policy as well as the economic development simultaneously, together with their Private Sector, especially the local or national Private Sector. Because the expatriates are not permanently in any country, therefore we need to overcome these problems. Let us embark on skills development of our young people. You can have doctors, but the doctors will still import the equipment they use in theatres and hospitals. Therefore, we need to develop those skills so that we can manufacture the equipment we need.

Therefore, Comrade Deputy Speaker, I call upon Government to get involved in the training of our young people in all different fields of

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON IILONGA**

excellent skills development in order to fulfil the dream of our Vision 2030. (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: May I ask the Honourable Deputy Minister a small question, please? Honourable Deputy Minister, I really do appreciate your call to the SWAPO-led Government to do the things that you have just mentioned. My question is, being a Deputy Minister and I believe you are also on the Central Committee of the SWAPO Party, do you not think that the questions that you are now asking could have been better asked at the level where policies are formulated, programmes are being developed and approved instead of coming to Parliament and calling on the others for this to be done? Are you not part of the SWAPO planning system? Are you now outside SWAPO? Where are you?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY: Comrade Deputy Speaker, I am not one of those who wavered and forgot where they came from. I know where I come from, where I am and where I am going.

Comrade Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, I mentioned earlier that we need to look at good examples. Here in SADC we have the President of Malawi, His Excellency Bingu wa Mutharika who vehemently refused when the western donors wanted to devalue Malawi's currency further from 10% to 40%. I quote: *"If any donor wants to withdraw from this country, Malawi, let them withdraw."* We as SADC need to support this stand so that our currencies cannot be devaluated in order to benefit the western economy. We all struggle, it is a reality. When you go to the Euro zone and spend 400 Euro, but when you convert that to our currency, it is actually N\$4,000. I want Honourable Nehova to consider that instead of just copying what is already implemented. We want to see that our economy must go beyond that ceiling. We feel proud that we are professors or economists, but we cannot go beyond that. Why we are not in a position to pay back the debt is because we cannot afford. If you call

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON IILONGA**

yourself a millionaire in Namibia, you are not a millionaire there. Honestly speaking, what we use is our money which we took from our banks there and when you go there you think it costs only 400, but in reality it is N\$4,000. I want us to follow the example of Malaysia where it is two to one. If you have one US Dollars, it is two in the Malaysian currency. In Singapore it is one to one. It is something we need to do. The US Dollar was second to the Pound, today it is no longer the second, it is the third currency in the world. They sabotage you so that you believe that you cannot carry on with what you want if it is not their wish.

I informed this august House that some of the countries I mentioned above make it possible for intervention in economic development. Yesterday I lectured to the RDP, I took this Constitution, and I read Article 98 to tell Honourable Lucks that the Namibian Government is mandated by this Constitution to participate directly in the economy and this is what you must do, that is all.

On education, education is the best equaliser. The strong Education Sector, which is capable to create an educated Nation, is the backbone of every Nation. I really want to thank the SWAPO Party Government for taking a decision that as from now full bursaries will be paid to our student doctors. I further want to ask our Government to carry on because this will create patriotism among our students, because the one whose schooling is paid by his or her father or a private company will not have the same alliance toward the Government. That is why this step taken to fully pay the bursaries of our student doctors needs to be expanded and we take a fifteen-year period in which to identify students for various scholarships, such as medical engineers, mechanical engineers and many other sciences and skills, so that we ensure our people take over from the expert who are expatriates.

Comrade Deputy Speaker, I now make the usual recommendation to our Government: Our Government must ensure that the SWAPO Party resolution of the year 2002 on land owned by absentee landlords must be implemented without delay. To make the Constitution a living document we need to revisit and make sure that the sovereignty of the State is secured, which is the land, water and natural resources. Land must not be

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON IILONGA**

owned individually. Long-term lease is the solution.

NamPost Savings Bank must become a fully-fledged State bank. It has the potential as well as the competence and commitment to compete with commercial banks. AgriBank should become a fully-fledged State agricultural bank, not only giving loans but for people to deposit their money or invest in the bank, while the Development Bank of Namibia can concentrate on investing in the economy of the country and manufacturing.

The Ministers and their Deputies should be accountable for all Parastatals which fall under their Ministries. The Government should control its business. The theory of saying that Political Office-Bearers are not administrators cannot be accepted any longer. Article 40 of the Constitution must be fulfilled and I quote: *“To direct, coordinate and supervise the activities of Ministries and Government Departments, including Parastatal enterprises and to review and advise the President and the National Assembly on the desirability and wisdom of any prevailing subordinate legislation, regulations or orders pertaining to such Parastatal enterprises, regard being had to the public interest.”* No privatisation of State properties and its services. That is not the mandate we were given by the Namibian Nation. Let us inform our staff members and the Nation-at-large that Government properties are their properties. (Intervention)

HON NEHOVA: May I ask a small question to the Honourable Deputy Minister? Honourable Member, in this regard I think we are more or less of the same thinking, but do you know that a move is afoot to privatise a very important Government Parastatal called Meatco? Are you aware of it?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY: Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Honourable Member is

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON IILONGA**

wrongly informed, that is not going to happen as long as my Minister and myself are there in that Ministry. That is the assurance I give you and the people out there.

In conclusion, let us inform our staff members and the Nation at large that Government properties are their properties and they must be the whistle-blowers. By doing that, they will jealously protect their properties. (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: May I ask the Honourable Deputy Minister a question? Honourable Deputy Minister, you mentioned a very important point on the Meatco issue. Can you just enlighten us on what is the Government's position on Meatco right now, because we thought it is moving in that direction.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY: Honourable Tjihuiko should not jump the gun as he usually does. Wait and you are going to hear. On my paper there is nothing on Meatco, I just responded to Honourable Kandy Nehova, former Chairman of the National Council and now from the RDP.

Whistle-blowing will jealously protect our properties day and night. Honourable Tjihuiko, tell your members that Government properties are their properties and they need to protect them. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: May I ask a question? You mentioned a name, *RADOPA*, and I want you to translate the name to me as a Himba. Secondly, people talk about SWAPO Party. Yes, it was SWAPO of Namibia by then, then with Resolution 435 each small Party started to say "*Party of Namibia, House of Namibia*". That is why SWAPO as a Liberation Party of this

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON IILONGA**

country decided no longer to compete with the small Parties by saying SWAPO of Namibia. Now it is the SWAPO Party. I even want to inform the former Chairman of the National Council to come back because he was not even aware why we became the SWAPO Party.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY: Comrade Deputy Speaker, I was saying that it is true that the SWAPO Liberation Movement of that time came and liberated this country and became the Governing Party and it is definitely continuing with its same principles as when it was created in 19 April 1960.

Comrade Deputy Speaker, constant vigilance is the price of honesty, efficiency, accountability and responsibility. I want to call upon our Parastatals and vocational institutions to introduce free primary skills training of our young children at their primary schools and during school holidays to invite the schools to participate in skills training, such as bricklaying or to design or make toys.

Finally I want to conclude on this call, that while we embark on the capacity-building of our Nation we must remember that our workforce is characterised in several ways of designation, job description, gender, linguistic background, educational qualification, etcetera. In most cases we make ourselves believe that we do not have the technical knowhow, but in reality we have it. Honourable Tjihuiko, I want to take you to those high-rise buildings being constructed to see who are the people building those. It is the same people we say do not have qualifications. When you built your house, you did not go to those professionals, you went to those people to build your house and it never had a crack. We need to recognise the skills of these people. (Interjection). Yes, the Chinese can come in order to inculcate courage and speed. Our vocational institutions must train those with practical experience so that instead of laying one hundred bricks a day, they must bring it to two hundred until we reach or surpass those we think have more capacity. That is the aim and the objective of the SWAPO Party Government. (Intervention)

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON IILONGA**

HON KAURA: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable Member, in the *New Era* of Thursday, the 23rd of February 2012, there is an article written by the Honourable Prime Minister, “*The Anatomy of Social Schism*” and I quote: “*It is therefore understandable that some people blame the Ovambo Government for their social conditions.*

Some people feel excluded.” He goes on: “*If we do nothing about massive employment creation, the Ovambo Government will not escape the blame.*” Now, are we dealing with an Ovambo Government or a SWAPO Party Government?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY: Comrade Deputy Speaker, that question is misdirected and I advise the Honourable Member to use the normal Rules and procedures of this House and then redirect that question to the right person to answer it.

Comrade Deputy Speaker, I want to thank our Founding Father of the Namibian Nation, Comrade Dr Sam Shafiishuna Nujoma and our President, Dr Hifikepunye Pohamba for their excellent leadership.

In conclusion, Comrade Deputy Speaker, we need to be honest, our media and newspapers need to be honest, ourselves here need to be honest, as we are talking today, TIPEEG is four months and fourteen days old. The 51% of the work done was done within four months and fourteen days and we still have much to conclude.

With these remarks, I thank you all and I support the National Budget. Long live SWAPO Party, long live the Republic of Namibia. I thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Makgone.

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MAKGONE**

HON MAKGONE: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. Let me from the onset congratulate the Honourable Minister and her team that prepared this Budget that is in line with the Namibian Vision 2030. In Vision 2030 the expected changes are stipulated as follows: *“Our future is about people, therefore as the centre visioning exercise is concerned for the population in relation to their social, particularly their health, economic and overall well-being, for example how many Namibians are there, how they live, where do they live and what do they do for a living?”* In my opinion, the Budget has taken into account this quotation, as the Minister of Finance has articulated it in her speech when she said: *“This Budget proposes policy actions aimed at accelerating inclusive economic growth, job creation and efficient service delivery.”*

Therefore, within this quotation of Vision 2030 we can see that health is stressed and that is what we all observe within the Budget. Paragraph 97 of the Budget speech highlights the achievements within the Health Sector. It is also said that the Budget will sustain critical programmes previously funded by donors, because they are pulling out. Therefore, we should be realistic, did we ever pause and think what is the total cost of these programmes and what the money transferred to these programmes could have been used for if the donors were still funding the programmes.

I heard the critics hammering on the aspect of the old-age pensions.
(Intervention)

HON NYAMU: On a Point of Information. The assertion that the donors are running away appears to be incorrect in light of the statement by the Minister of Health and Social Services who admitted that he signed letters which he did not read and in that letter he was chasing those donors away from Namibia. Now who are you blaming? Yourself?

HON MAKGONE: The Right Honourable Prime Minister yesterday outlined all the welfare programmes of the Government. (Intervention)

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MAKGONE**

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Honourable Deputy Speaker, may I give the correct information to the Honourable Secretary-General of the RDP? The Minister of Health and Social Services did not stop the Global Fund programmes, he rather made sure that the money flows into the country to assist the Namibian people who need that money.

HON MAKGONE: No one claimed that what is currently given is enough, but we look at what is available.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, John Maxwell said: *“People are funny. In church they want to sit at the back, in the bus they want to sit in front. A person could have expected that it should be vice versa.”* Why do I say this? Because people know that Namibia has limited resources that we are working on. If we borrow, they will be the ones who talk the loudest and now that the Minister is saying let us *“Do More with Less”*, it is again a problem. What do they want?

What we see is panic buttons. They think there is one recipe for everything. If one says *“poverty”*, they say BIG, if you say *“unemployment”*, they say BIG, if you say *“people on the street”*, they say BIG. There is no one recipe for all. Therefore we should learn from medicine and treat economics like medicine, because it means if I bring a baby who has fever to them, they will just have one recipe and say, *“oh, it is fever, give the baby that.”* Another one coming, it is fever, give the same. That is not how it works. The human body is complex and economics is also as complex as the human body. We know that fever can lead to additional complications and the same will happen in economics. Therefore, complexity requires differential diagnosis. If we have a problem, we should not have one recipe, we should diagnose because we can have different causes.

For the key underlying causes of economic distress, remedies should be well-tailored. There is no one-size-fits all. All medicine is family medicine, when that baby is ill, you would want to find out whether the

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MAKGONE**

mother, father and brother had this kind of disease and the same in economics. We should view treatment in family terms, not as individuals.

While we are sitting here we are in the world economy. We want technology transfer for climate change. Are they doing it for us to mitigate? The other issue that we can learn from medicine is monitoring and evaluation. Monitoring and evaluation is essential and that is why the doctors are keeping charts there so that they can take notes every time. In the same way we should look at goals and outcomes. Therefore, it is not just a case of saying BIG should be implemented, that is not how it works and medicine is also a profession and a profession requires strong ethics, strong laws and codes of conducts. The same in economics, ethical and professional standards and profound commitment, not just to settle for superficial approaches.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, we should not walk around the world with closed eyes. Let us learn from the mistakes of others. We should not copy everything from the West, we need to look at Europe to find a model to avoid. We should know that pensions, jobless benefits, welfare assistance and health care spending are entitlements. If you have granted them, you cannot easily take them away. It is difficult to roll them back and that is why we need to plan properly and not just come with BIG.

We are seeing the ongoing protests in Europe because of the austerity measures taken by the Government and let me give one example: For them to give all that BIG that they are giving, they raised the age at which one qualifies for a State pension. Is it what you want to happen here in Namibia? They also increased the number of years of contribution to the social security system to qualify for a full pension. In 2011 they came with a new one to say pensions are frozen, you will not receive a pension when you reach that age.

Someone said Namibia is sitting on a time-bomb but we will not accept that. This is just an example of the pensions that I am giving. Welfare programmes are also a powder of debt bounce. How can you give someone a benefit today, just to cut it the following day?

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MAKGONE**

Creating welfare for nothing will not be easy, let us support the Government with job creation, infrastructure development, so that a conducive environment is created for economic growth.

Most of the projects that are given are once-off and once the project is completed, that money can be transferred to another one. Let us stop the “*them*” and “*us*” attitude.

During the 2008/2009 financial crisis we as Namibians were very pleased to realise that our economy was not so hard hit because of the expansionary fiscal policy that was in place. We need to have the right growth policies in place and we must see financial reserves as cushions against the future crises.

The policy interventions for the MTEF are mentioned and clarified on Pages 26 and 27 of the Budget speech and I do not need to repeat them. During the Budget speech I listened carefully and I noted that the expansion of Budget was not costless as the Budget Deficit reached 11.2% of GDP and Central Government debt has increased from 16 to 27%.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, we should know that the cost of not spending is even higher. If the economy remains stuck in high unemployment for years, workers will lose their skills, human capital will be destroyed, the economic potential growth will be impaired. Naturally we should not evaluate the benefits solely in terms of the impact on Public debt, Government has a responsibility to maintain the economy as close as possible to full employment and that is why the intervention policies are crafted, they are there. Poverty and unemployment are challenges and need our collective responsibility and action. Unemployment numbers are statistics, but behind every number is a family whose dreams of their retirement, for the education of their children, for their future are being dashed, replaced with mounting anxieties.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, I am of the opinion that poverty is so evident because it touches women and the youth. If gender and the youth are not made explicit in politics, the differential

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MAKGONE**

impact on women, men and the youth will not be realised. If we can desegregate the number of jobs based on facts, we will never know what the Government is doing to ensure that women are being integrated into the job market.

It is mentioned that the national procurement rules have been amended to provide for preferential consideration for youth empowerment. This needs to be applauded and it is my wish that women can also be taken on board.

The Minister mentioned four core areas and one of them is for Offices, Ministries and Agencies to reduce wastage and to waste neither time, nor energy to implement programmes and to realise internal efficiency and value for money. That aforesaid takes me back to the Auditor-General's Report that we regularly receive in the National Assembly, stating the following: "*Poor internal financial controls, no supporting documents, no Bank reconciliation year-in and year-out.*" It goes so far that an officer who was in a mismanagement case in one Ministry jumped for a vacancy to another Ministry. Perhaps it is time that we come with the Amendment of the law that was passed yesterday. I agree with the Minister that internal processes need to be strengthened to realise internal efficiency and value for money.

Today we see Greece as a dysfunctional case, but we can learn something from the reforms that are taking place there. It is about good governance, about changing structure of Government and making it more transparent, effective and efficient.

In conclusion, Honourable Minister of Finance, when dealing with the Budget it is difficult to satisfy everyone, but I hope that you will be able to say like Madiba, that "*I wondered whether I had done the right thing to try and help the public, but every time I used to end up by saying, 'well, this was the correct decision on my part.'*" I support the Bill and I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Shixwameni.

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON SHIXWAMENI**

HON SHIXWAMENI: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, first of all let me take this opportunity to thank the Minister of Finance and her team for the efforts and commitment in preparing yet another Budget. All of us know it takes a lot of effort and hard work to produce a National Budget and to introduce it on time. For that, congratulations.

Having said that, let me focus my Budget contribution for this year on a few topical issues included in the Budget. In total I have highlighted seven items that I would like to talk on, that is on the pro-poor, poverty reduction and job creation theme of the Budget, the TIPEEG programme, SME and youth empowerment, agriculture and the Green Scheme Programme, land reform, sport and culture and tax reform. I would like to start by talking about the theme.

This is the seventh consecutive Budget of the Pohamba administration, seven budgets all titled the same when I looked at them but just in different ways, but they recreate the same theme of pro-poor, job creation, accelerated economic growth and the list goes on and on.

When we talk about poverty, which is the very sad Namibian reality, which is the reality on the ground, then this Budget is far from being a pro-poor Budget, it is rather a pro-rich Budget. The reality on the ground year-in and year-out, with all pro-poor Budgets presented to this House is completely and radically different. No fundamental significant change has happened on the ground for the poorest of the poor in this country. The poor remain and even become poorer by the day whilst the elite and politically well-connected get filthy rich and become even richer, graduating from being millionaires to billionaires. I hope the next list of Forbes would be able to place our billionaires on that list and this is being done at the expense of the poor, the working class and the great majority of our Nation.

We need to get a better Budget yet which is truly pro-poor and for the working class. Reducing poverty means increased household incomes for the rural poor, it means reducing income inequalities between men and women, it means reducing income inequalities between blacks and whites

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON SHIXWAMENI**

and, indeed, reducing inequalities between the well-off and the poor Regions in this country. It means creating sustainable and secured jobs that last for more than ten to fifteen years and not jobs that only last for three to six months. It indeed means moving farmers from being subsistence farmers to commercial farming.

One can guess from this Budget how many Namibians will have more bread on the plate by March 2013. I am sure it will be a very insignificant number which will even aggravate our Nation and country's income inequality. Thus the theme of the Budget and the previous Budgets has become a broken record which can better be described as serving opium to the masses whilst the Minister has for the past seven years been serving the best cognac and champagne to the well-off and the rich.

On TIPEEG I would like to say the following: It is indeed high time that whilst we are right at the beginning stages of its implementation, that we must have a revisit and serious evaluation of the whole programme. We need to look at both its viability as a project aimed at fighting unemployment and poverty. The question that I would ask is, can it really achieve its goals in spite of the Government's bureaucracy in its current format? The answer to me is a big no.

TIPEEG is a special project and as such it needs to be treated in a special way if it is to succeed at all and if we are serious and not taking TIPEEG as a project for self-enrichment. But TIPEEG can succeed, of course, if it is given the necessary administrative power and free from the ordinary Government bureaucracy, which is sluggish and lethargic. Our proposal is that TIPEEG must have a dedicated central coordinating unit, a secretariat of its own away from the National Planning Commission, as is the case with the Millennium Challenge Account with its own board. The role of the TIPEEG unit should be to fast-track administration and awarding of tenders, direct and coordinate the programme and projects and then account for it to the National Planning Commission. Recruit to the team, that is the secretariat, the best talent which Namibia can offer in project management, coordination and implementation and not political cronies. Then you will be able to see the results in rather a shorter time. The unit will be given annual targets, priorities and measures and must report to the

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON SHIXWAMENI**

Minister of Finance and the National Planning Commission on a quarterly basis.

Secondly, allocate TIPEEG resources on a regional basis to the thirteen Regional Councils. Development must happen there in the rural towns and must reach villages and settlements. That is only when we can impact our rural communities and see them grow and prosper instead of only empowering the towns' petty bourgeois which parasites on State tenders.

Each Region must get a fair share of TIPEEG funds and give them the power through the appropriate channels to have control over the funds which they can disburse to contractors within their own Regions to avoid outsiders from grabbing resources allocated to the development of a specific Region. This will even help eliminate bureaucracy and red tape.

Special funds from TIPEEG must be made available to youth projects every year for the next two years per Region, say 30 to 40% of that which should go to the youth. In this case the youth will be encouraged to submit their project proposals to their Regional Council and get funding immediately without the national bureaucracy's involvement.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, I would like to shortly speak about agriculture and the Green Scheme project. We in the APP appreciate the Government's renewed commitment to the implementation of agricultural projects to especially the Green Scheme projects around the country. We would like to urge the Government to keep it up. However, I have a problem with the model of ownership of the scheme whereby the local people give up their land for free and Green Scheme farms are owned by a big company whilst the locals are mere workers and/or owners of small pieces of garden plots on the projects and receive peanuts.

The scheme needs reform and/or overhauling in terms of ownership in order to provide for at least up to not more than 50% shareholding in the companies by the surrounding local peasant communities who have given up big parts of their land in order to accommodate the so called new Green Scheme projects.

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON SHIXWAMENI**

Alternatively we are proposing that each Green Scheme project must have a dedicated community trust from which the local surrounding communities can benefit directly now and in the future. This will indeed, in our view, be a great move in the direction of empowering the local communities economically in a sustainable manner since they will be sharing in wealth creation and progress and ensure at the same time fair and just wealth redistribution.

Shortly on the land issue, land is a source of wealth and livelihood for many Namibians. The focus of Government is more on resettlement in so-called commercial areas than on land management in the communal areas. Anyway for me land is land and this land discrimination must come to an end. Government must encourage development and investment in communal land. In this way people can remain in their villages, thus reducing urban migration.

All communal farmers must be able to get loans from commercial banks just like commercial farmers. Communal farmers must not be forced to give up their communal land if they want to farm commercially. Who say you cannot go to your ancestral village and farm there whilst you are a commercial farmer? But illegal fencing of land in the villages by the rich and well-off must be stopped as a matter of urgency by both the Traditional Leaders and the Government.

On the SMEs and youth empowerment, I must say Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, many Namibian youth have very good business ideas, but are unable to get financial support unless they are politically well-connected. This situation is indeed frustrating to many young men and women. Indeed, TIPEEG funds could make a very great difference if the funds were channelled to help support and long-term sustainable youth SMEs. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: May I inform Honourable Shixwameni that I do not see any other Members from your Party except your family member who is sitting around here. Now it is an

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON SHIXWAMENI**

undisputed fact that you are a family Party.

HON SHIXWAMENI: I do not deny my brother, I am not Judas Iscariot. You and your father, Sam Nujoma, can we say that that is a Sam Nujoma Party?

The commercial banks have failed our Nation big time and now even the Development Bank whose bureaucracy is behaving like the old established commercial banks. I hope the yet-to-be launched SME Bank will behave radically different by eliminating red tape and bureaucracy in the allocation of funds to people and will also do away with the monstrous and infamous demands for collateral and make the process for loan application shorter and smoother.

I must say that, indeed, it is the SMEs that constitute the future guarantee and insurance for our country's solid, sustainable socio-economic development and to make a distinction between poverty and unemployment.

We need more and more investment in sports, arts and culture if we are serious about fighting unemployment and poverty, particularly among the youth. Sport must be recognised and be given the priority that it deserves, not only as a hobby but as a business where jobs can be created for Namibians. We should take politics out of sports and sport must be managed on business principles. We ask for a closer collaboration between Government and the various sport codes, particularly soccer, rugby, boxing, tennis and other sport codes where individuals can make for themselves and their Nation mega bucks.

It also will help to instil discipline and keep young people off the streets and away from all kinds of anti-social behaviour, making them responsible and law-abiding citizens of our Nation. We just have to look at Cuba, Brazil, Nigeria, Ghana and Cameroon which are great sporting Nations indeed where youngsters are making money overseas and repatriating those funds back home.

14 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON SHIXWAMENI**

Let there also be more musicians and art workers in our land, but they also need support from the Government.

My last point I would like to speak on is on the tax regime and tax reform. I have taken note and I should acknowledge the good proposals made in the Budget by the Minister of Finance on tax reform and tax proposals. All I would like to plead for is that we need to move on these things, because some of the things come from 1990 up to now. However, I must still say that our tax regime indeed favours the rich. We would like to see a situation where the rich are taxed more by creating two or three more tax brackets above the amount of N\$750,000, whilst upping the lowest taxable bracket to a threshold of at least lower than N\$50,000 per annum, whilst nailing tax avoiding big companies and their advising auditors.

If we are serious, sin taxes need to be higher than they are currently in the Budget. Namibia is one country where it is very cheap to buy any type of alcohol and tobacco. To curb abuse of alcohol, we propose higher increments of the sin taxes, or the question that we are asking is; are we obliged to implement what the South African Government or SACU set out? We need to see whether we can up the sin taxes.

In order for us to be able to collect all taxes which are due to the State, corporate and individual income tax and to ensure that everything is accounted for properly to the Treasury, we need to seriously think about the establishment of an independent revenue collection authority which would guarantee that the above happens.

In conclusion, the fight against corruption has become nothing else but a joke for the past five years. We need to do more in fighting corruption. It is sickening to always day-in and day-out open all the daily newspapers and read about how the State coffers are being plundered left and right by the very same officials to whom the Nation has entrusted the custody of its resources. I urge the Anti-Corruption Commission and the President to become tougher on white collar crime and corruption if we are to stem the ever-rising tide of corruption in our society. Give more powers to the Anti-Corruption Commission, reform and review the Anti-Corruption Act

14 March 2012

to give it more teeth to bite. Let us all be serious about corruption and white collar crime.

With these few remarks, Honourable Deputy Speaker, I rest my case and thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The House is adjourned until tomorrow, at 14:30.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:45 UNTIL 2012.03.15 AT 14:30

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS
WINDHOEK
15 MARCH 2012**

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any Reports of Standing of Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Minister of Finance.

**TABLING: ANNUAL REPORT: NAMIBIA
FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS SUPERVISORY AUTHORITY**

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Honourable Speaker, I lay upon the Table, Annual Report of the Namibia Financial Institutions Supervisory Authority for the year 2011 and follow-up Report of the Auditor-General on Performance Audit Study on the Ministry of Health and Social Services Referral System for the Financial Years 2008, 2009 and 2010.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please table the Report. Any further Reports and Papers? Notice of Questions? Notice of Motions? Message from the Head of State? Ministerial Statements? The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

**RESUMPTION OF SECOND READING:
APPROPRIATION BILL**

15 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON UUTONI**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on Second Reading –
Appropriation Bill.

HON SPEAKER: When the House adjourned yesterday, the 14th of March 2012, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Minister of Finance, that the Bill be read a Second Time. The Deputy Minister of Safety and Security had the Floor and he may now continue

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Thank you very much, Honourable Deputy Speaker. I also rise to support the Budget and I want to make a very brief statement so that other people also get an opportunity to speak.

Let me join the Honourable Members who have congratulated the Minister of Finance, Comrade Saara Kuugongelwa-Amadhila, her Deputy, Comrade Calle Schlettwein, the Director-General of the National Planning Commission, General Tom Alweendo, the Governor of the Bank of Namibia, Mr Ipumbu Shiimi, the entire staff of the Ministry of Finance and that of the National Planning Commission. Allow me to start by saying a job well done, Honourable Minister, for all the efforts you put in to make sure that your Ministry appropriate a sound Budget despite the world economic challenges.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, in her 2012/2013 Budget Statement the Minister highlighted a number of achievements made as a result of the 2011/2012 performance and many of these achievements are visible in Sectors such as Agriculture, Education, Health, Environment, Tourism, Transport and many others. I would, therefore, agree with the Minister of Finance that what she has reported is clearly a true reflection of the 2011/12 Budget. I am proud to mention to this House that in the past years I was unable to visit my family members in Omindaungilo Constituency in Ohangwena Region coming from Eenhana, but as we speak now there is a well-structured gravel road which will allow me to

15 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON UUTONI**

reach there in less time. I believe this is an indication that this is a Ruling Party with a vision, despite what other people are saying.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, my contribution today will mainly focus on the TIPEEG Programme and its implementation mechanisms and structures in relation to the decentralisation policy. The initial idea of TIPEEG is really a good one as it aims at creating employment, alleviating poverty and bringing much-needed development to our people. However, I strongly believe that some small adjustments here and there are needed.

What I have identified as one of the challenges of TIPEEG is the question of decentralisation and the planning mechanisms in place. If TIPEEG was fully decentralised, I believe the pace of implementation would have been much faster and I want to tell the Members of this House that the people in the Regions really want to work and they want it implemented as soon as possible.

Let us just take a practical example of TIPEEG projects in the Regions. It so happens that the Regional and Local Authorities do not have the power to appoint consultants under the TIPEEG programme. At the close of tenders in the Regions, they are being sent to the TIPEEG Implementation Committee which is housed at the National Planning Commission here in Windhoek. As I said, when we talk about the Budget, we should not only criticise, but also make positive criticism to advise what can be done. By the time these documents reach Windhoek the Evaluation Committee, on the other hand, do not constitute a quorum to work on the documents, while the consultants appointed are overloaded and some lack the necessary competence with regard to the designing and drawing of the given projects as part of the tender documents.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, in line with Local Authorities Tender Board regulation under Section 94(a) in the Local Authorities Act (Act 23 of 1992), the Local Authorities are empowered to deal with: *“the establishment and composition of local Tender Board including examination, evaluation, comparison and non-acceptance of tenders; acceptance of tenders and entry into force of agreements; the*

15 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON UUTONI

granting by local Tender Board of price preferences when comparing tenders, including the basis on which such preferences may be granted; the imposition by local Tender Board of monetary penalty, calculated on such basis as may be prescribed, on any person with whom local Tender Board has concluded an agreement on behalf of a Local Authority on the strength of information furnished by that person which, after the conclusion of such agreement, is shown to have incorrect information including the manner in which any such penalty may be recovered.”

The question remains, Honourable Deputy Speaker, why can this institution not appoint their own consultants whom they think have the capacity to expedite the process of drafting the tender documents and also establish their own evaluation committee, as this is in line with the decentralisation policy, and allow Central Government to also play a monitoring role. We need to give some of the powers to Local and Regional Authorities and put pressure on them to appoint consultants and if they do not perform, the necessary steps have to be taken.

In line with decentralisation, the Central Government needs to devolve some functions to these structures of Government in order to effectively expedite the process for faster development and growth. It is my view that if we decentralise some of these functions to Regional and Local Authorities it will enable the TIPEEG programme to run smoothly and also provide a much faster pace of implementation.

As Honourable Ilonga said, the TIPEEG programme has only been running for four months, but these are some of the small challenges we have identified. I understand the funds are with the Regional and Local Authorities, but the problem lies with the appointment of consultants. Therefore, let us give them the power to appoint consultants and set up their implementation committees. I support the Bill and I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Van Der Walt.

15 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON VAN DER WALT**

HON VAN DER WALT: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. Honourable Members, I am very pleased to address this august House in support of the Budget presented by our Honourable Minister of Finance, Honourable Saara Kuugongelwa-Amadhila, on the 28th of February 2012. The theme of the Budget, “*Jointly Doing More with Less*”, is a demonstration of the Government’s commitment to invest smartly in projects of the Economic Sectors with a high spin-off effect to the economy. Investing wisely is also expected to enable the country to overcome and tackle some key social challenges facing our country today, such as unemployment, income inequality and poverty.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, for the past four years the world economy has been uncertain and unpredictable. We have seen countries in Europe and North America struggling to resolve their problems, stemming from most challenging financial and economic crises since the Second World War. This has led to a recession, high unemployment, downgrading of credit-worthiness and civil unrest in some parts of the world. In spite of these challenges, Comrade Kuugongelwa-Amadhila and her Colleagues at the Ministry of Finance have performed superbly in their job. In so doing, new innovative strategic policy initiatives were introduced to shield Namibia from economic meltdown. The outcome of these initiatives manifested itself in high economic growth for Namibia, prudent fiscal position and admiration of Namibia’s micro-economic management, as shown by the successful issuance of the Euro bond and good credit rating.

The current MTEF for the year 2012/2013 and the year 2014/2015 is formulated in challenging the global economic environment. This is true for a small and open economy like Namibia. During the tabling of the Budget in 2011, the Minister announced the biggest public works programme in the history of our country, TIPEEG. TIPEEG and other development spending have laid a strong foundation for the Namibian economy to expand at sustainable levels, as envisaged in the National Development Plans for Vision 2030. The Budget also aims at addressing the supply side on trade and promotes participation of the Private Sector in economic development. This will be achieved under micro-economic stability and fiscal prudence.

15 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON VAN DER WALT

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, this is a huge challenge. Are we going to go ahead or will remain another African country which could not provide a better living for its people who remain in poverty? According to the World Bank Report for 2006, diamonds and oil are what Africa is renowned for, but if you look at the retail value of Africa, you will find that companies like Coca-Cola have relocated their headquarters to South Africa from London in 2007 already. The reason for this is that there is a sign of improvement of infrastructure and there are growing opportunities for business on this continent.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, did you know that on a per unit basis, Africa is the third most profitable market in the world? We as the Namibian Nation have to get beyond the perception that we cannot make it and look and see the opportunities of Africa ahead of us.

In the 1800s it was a gold rush, now it is retailers. In the 1800s the West Europeans and everybody came to Africa for our gold and minerals, today we are buying all their products from Europe as the third-biggest market in the world. Only China's trade with Africa has risen from roughly US\$10 billion to more than US\$55 billion in the year 2006.

Sometimes our politicians are our own biggest enemies when it comes to economic emancipation. Remember, as much as politics affects business, business affects politics, the reason being that politicians look at changing regulations. (Intervention)

HON SHIXWAMENI: May I ask a question? You mentioned that Coca-Cola has relocated their headquarters to South Africa. Do you not think that Coca-Cola imperialism has suddenly arrived in Africa and that we as a continent are basically being recolonized or having neo-colonialism?

HON VAN DER WALT: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable

15 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON VAN DER WALT**

Members, I think we need to get to the point where we all realise that this is the 21st century. Many things have changed and during my speech you will find your answer.

Remember, as much as politics affect business, business affect politics, the reason being that politicians look at changing regulations and charitable organisations make up deficiencies, while entrepreneurs create wealth and ask what are the opportunities. The problem with Africa is that we have a reputation of war, corruption, diseases and begging.

Because of that it makes it easy to overlook the business opportunities which are busy growing tremendously in the 21st century.

I am standing here today to call on my fellow politicians and to hear the voice of the Founding Father of our Nation and our current President and our older leaders in our country when they demonstrate that law and education, technical education, entrepreneurial success can become a driver for political and social development. You can lead a horse to the water, but you cannot make it drink. When there is a gap between reality and perceptions, there is good business to be made. Namibia has all the resources at our disposal, we need to think out of the box, we need to create synergies in our economy by exploring new markets, like the new agreements with China by our Honourable Minister of Trade and Industry, which they have accomplished recently. We need to teach the Namibian Nation, for the benefit of our children's future, to create their own wealth.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, we need to transform aid to trade, we need to move beyond charity to sustainable market development and projects that improve living conditions and produce a profit. Education is the key in our country, but now strategic development needs to take place in our country. If we develop, our people will see the opportunities there. If we have educated people within the next 21 years, then we need to provide the infrastructure for these people to come back, so that they can start working in our country and for Government. It is very important that we come up with plans for the water in the North. Our people are suffering as a result of the floods and that water needs to be

15 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON VAN DER WALT**

utilised. There are huge opportunities for the use of communal land in our country.

I said the other day that we need to work out something for our communal farmers, they need to become productive and we need to train them. We also need to empower our women, because women are caretakers, the ones looking after the families and we need to empower our women to do something every day of their lives. A simple idea is providing sewing machines, materials and training. Then every month we send somebody to collect all the clothes, open a market in Windhoek and sell the clothes.

I agree with the Bank of Namibia that the Financial Sector should be more in the hands of our Namibian people, not only banks but also the insurance and retail companies. This is our money which is sent to South Africa and over the rest of the world. We need to keep some of that money in our country so that we can run our own economy. We do not say they cannot take money out, but we need to ensure that we benefit from all the money they take from our people in this country. These are our funds for our people and need to be controlled by our people.

I believe we need to empower our communal farmers with rental agreements with the Headmen in the communities. This land belongs to the community and there is a Headman, thus if a person comes with a rental agreement, he must be able to get a loan to buy cattle for that land so that he can become productive.

We are busy handicapping our own economy, we need to create jobs and produce food. The future of the West is Africa. We need to increase Foreign Direct Investment, Private Sector growth and tighten bank policies to stem illegal transfers. Then we can control our own money.

There is a variety of diverse stakeholders who have interest in the success of all African markets. They all need to focus on banking social development to sustainable economic progress. We believe in the future, many companies who are trading in Africa will move their headquarters to Africa. No human being will ever become bigger than humanity and the time has come where we as a Nation in Namibia need to take the lead to

15 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON VAN DER WALT**

understand that all of us are the same, we all have the same needs. We all need love, we all need shelter and food. We all have families. The days of saying you are this and you are that are gone forever. Many years when you heard a noise ten kilometres away, you thought there is a war and you prepared for war because you did not know what is there. Today things have changed, we have communication technology, we can talk to each other and we do not need to fight. It is only very unintelligent people who are still fighting today, that is how I feel.

We now need to move with the new challenges in the 21st century. It is a new era and for the sake of our Nation we need to realise that human beings will never become bigger than humanity.

As a country we should not rest on our laurels, but continue to aim high and dream high. While we aim high to improve the living standards of our people, there is a need to introduce new policy initiatives consistently, new legislation to realise our vision of becoming a developed Nation by 2030.

During the Budget presentation in February 2012, the Honourable Minister of Finance enlightened this august House of some of those positive issues which I fully support. First, the Honourable Minister stated that the ten-year Financial Sector Strategy will commence this year. The Financial Sector Strategy envisions to provide the majority of the Namibian population access to financial services. (Intervention)

HON KAURA: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable Van Der Walt, do you know that if we were in Rehoboth and you were talking that way, we would have said “*so praat ‘n bek.*”.

HON VAN DER WALT: Thank you, Honourable Kaura. The Financial Sector Strategy envisions to provide the majority of the Namibian Nation access to financial services. The skewed distribution of financial services

15 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON VAN DER WALT**

and products to our fellow Namibians is disheartening. A study done by Fin Scope revealed that only half of the bankable population of Namibians have access to banking services. Moreover, the Strategy is also looking at establishing reliable financial markets in Namibia where resources can be raised to fund our reform agenda to develop our country. Building skills, especially in the Financial Sector, is another area identified by our Strategy. Thank you, Minister.

Secondly, the finalisation of Amendments to Domestic Asset Requirements is long overdue. I was delighted to know these Amendments are now finalised and this legislation will come into force during the current Financial Year. Honourable Members, Namibia is a net exporter of capital, while at the same time we go out to attract Foreign Direct Investment to our country. It is not a bad thing to promote Foreign Direct Investment in our country, nevertheless, we should also ensure that Namibian-owned funds can be put into good use to develop the country.

Thirdly, it is also gratifying that Namibia is moving towards fulfilling its potential as a transport hub for the SADC Region by smart positioning. The expansion and the deepening of the port facilities will enable Namibia to accomplish this goal and assist our neighbouring landlocked countries to have short routes to the sea for their imports and exports. This is a huge opportunity we have. We in Namibia live in a First World country, there is no doubt about that. If you visit the rest of the world, we are very privileged and I want to thank the SWAPO Party that they maintain Namibia and built Namibia to where we are today. Everybody wants to come and stay in this country. You can ask our Minister of Home Affairs and Immigration, I believe there are 18,000 applications per month only from South African people who want to relocate to Namibia to invest here.

The country's roads and road networks as well as the airport facilities will also improve, contributing further to the economic development.
(Intervention)

15 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON VAN DER WALT**

HON SHIXWAMENI: May I ask the Honourable Member a tiny question? He has just reaffirmed that we are a First World country. Do you not think it is time that we act on eradicating poverty in this country and reducing unemployment to a single digit level as a First World country?

HON VAN DER WALT: Honourable Member, to be quite frank, I still believe that some people walk around blindfolded in Namibia. We are very, very privileged. If you look at the unemployment figure of our country, yes, I believe we have an unemployment problem, but we are very lucky in the sense that when our children in the communal areas wake up in the morning, their schools are nearby. Many improvements can still be made, but for now I believe we are on the right track. We had a war and all of a sudden we were independent and I believe that my Party has done very well in 21 years and we will proceed. You know the saying that “*haastige honde verbrand hulle monde.*” (Intervention)

HON LUCKS: The Honourable Member is doing very well, however I want to ask a small question. Are you aware that the unemployment rate at Independence was less than half of what it is now?

HON VAN DER WALT: The reason why I say I do not believe in our unemployment rate at this stage being so high, is that many of the people in communal areas are looking after their cattle or sheep, but they have shelter. I am not so sure about the unemployment figure.

The country can only spend resources at its disposal and complement these funds with prudent borrowing strategies. (Intervention)

15 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON VAN DER WALT

HON SHIXWAMENI: It was said clearly in the SWAPO Party Manifesto of 1989 that the unemployment rate was standing at 23% and today it is 51%. Can the Honourable Member confirm that the unemployment has doubled during the past 22 years?

HON VAN DER WALT: There are many reasons, such as the influx of other African people into our country and I agree that there might be confusion with the statistics, but nevertheless, let me continue. I still believe that we are hundred percent on the right track.

The country can only spend resources at its disposal and complement these funds with prudent borrowing strategies. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Comrade Deputy Speaker, just to correct the former Youth League Secretary for SWAPO Party, in 1989 the demographic situation of Namibia was...(Interjections). I do not know what the problem is, but I just want to share information with the Honourable Members, that in 1989, 41,000 people returned from exile. They were all unemployed. Former South African soldiers were demobilised, Koevoet, SWATF, name them, including the Police and they were rendered unemployed. The unemployment strategy started after Independence, as to what to do with all these categories of people who were found unemployed and, therefore, the figure of unemployment being mentioned here by one Honourable Member cannot be true because of those facts that I have just mentioned.

HON VAN DER WALT: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. Given the limited resources, the SWAPO Party Government is prepared to jointly do less with more, as reflected in several achievements presented by the Honourable Minister of Finance.

15 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON VAN DER WALT**

With persistent global economic turmoil and increasing trade liberalisation, reliance on traditional revenue resources, without thinking out of the box, is risky and dangerous. I am glad that Namibia has already started thinking out of the box and there is a greater need to diversify the revenue resources and reduce reliance on some of these sources, in particular SACU receipts which are highly volatile.

Honourable Members, our Government has been proactive on the front with new taxes in the pipeline to be introduced during 2012/2013. The Ministry of Finance has embarked upon a tax policy reform agenda to identify alternative sources of revenue, improve tax administration, modernise the tax system and strengthening audit capacity. With no doubt, the domestic revenue collection will increase, giving much-needed fiscal space to the fiscus.

On top of that, the Ministry of Finance is undertaking a study to investigate the viability of having an independent Revenue Authority. This model has worked successfully in some countries, especially in South Africa where revenue collection increased significantly.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, Namibia is on the right track and is admired greatly by our fellow Africans for what we have accomplished as a small Nation. Often we see countries coming to learn from experiences in various fields. International communities also place great value on Namibia, as demonstrated in the maintenance of the Investment Credit Rating by the rating agencies, the only fourth African country to achieve this feat.

In conclusion, this is indeed a fiscal sustainable Budget aimed at having a greater positive impact on the economy and uplifting the standard of living of the Namibian people. Key to the expected outcomes of the Budget is empowerment of the have-nots, creation of employment and distribution of resources fairly to reduce income inequality and all these are expected to be achieved with few resources invested smartly to have huge positive impact on the economy. Prudent micro-economic management will always be our guiding light in executing the development agenda.

15 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON ULENGA

I found that currently we have some young entrepreneurs who are very successful in our country, but what worries me is that they just focus on their own welfare and needs, while our poor and unemployed are not really their concern and many of these entrepreneurs are investing money outside our country, which I do not understand. Our people these days are much more informed and technology plays a big role in this. We as young people need to learn from our elders, our men need to man up, we need to stand up and be strong leaders. We need to be groomed to be political leaders with vision and compassion as well as business leaders. We have the drive, the knowledge, the perspective to lead the enterprises through the many challenges we face in Namibia. We need to groom leaders to demonstrate the kind of compassion and commitment, literally following in the footsteps of our Founding Father, our President, leaders like Namunjebo, Frans Indongo. We as young people need to take over in the future, but we need to do it with pride and we need to learn from the older people.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, on this path we are marching with pride to becoming a developed country by the year 2030 as envisaged in our Vision. I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Honourable Ulenka.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I must say I am very pleased to be speaking just after that very pleasant-sounding intervention from the Comrade over there who was full of “*voom*” and it was indeed speaking out of the box, if not shooting from the hip. I hope that will be the spirit on both side of the House.

Madam Deputy Speaker, I want to start my intervention with some remarks about what I have been observing recently. While travelling throughout the country, I had the opportunity to look at a few projects of recent years, launched by Government and carried out by Government in

15 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON ULENGA**

collaboration with its development partners. If I can mention a few of these, Honourable Deputy Speaker, which I left being very pleasant with what I saw, they are namely, firstly, the deepening of the harbour at Walvis Bay by NamPort. Secondly, the construction and tarring of the Kamanjab-Opuwo highway. It is a beautiful road to drive on, it is a lovely piece of work. It is a far cry from what we used to experience along that road in the past and I thank God and I hope that in future we will not have as many accidents as we used to have on that gravel road.

The third project is the Rundu-Katwitwi-Eenhana highway. About three or four years ago I have been able to drive along this road from Windhoek to Rundu, from Rundu to Eenhana and Oshakati and I must say it was almost heavenly, just very good to drive along that road especially with a car that has no problems and very minimal traffic on the road. I must say it is a really good achievement.

Finally I can mention the Gobabis-Otjinene connection, not to talk about the Oshikuku-Okalongo connection.

Madam Deputy Speaker, as you may remember, I have been one of the vocal persons in this country or in this House when it came to demanding the implementation and completion of the Rundu-Katwitwi-Eenhana highway project as we consider it to be a very vital project for our national economy, linking, as it does, the north central Regions with the central southern African hinterlands, namely Eastern Angola, Zambia, Malawi, Mozambique, Zimbabwe, Botswana, amongst others. I would like to make a request to the Honourable Members despite the fact that these are exciting times and I will appreciate that you listen to what I have to say.

The reason why I mentioned the Rundu-Eenhana highway is also partly that it is an ancient route and has great symbolical meaning to many Namibian freedom fighters. During an earlier stage of its long existence this was simply referred to as the so-called "*Elondo lya Kanyandi*". Many of the older generation of freedom fighters know what I am talking about. This literally meant, "*the formidable rise of Kanyandi*" and was as such recognised and feared as an indomitable, almost impenetrable forest which one had to cross before emerging on "*the other side*". Crossing this forest

15 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON ULENGA**

was like passing the test of bravery or commitment to the liberation cause which demanded self-sacrifice and I know that a number of Comrades in this House have gone through this forest which is now a highway, Jesaya Nyamu being one of them and I think Nahas Angula and a few others. To see that this route that took weeks to cross only about 40, 45 years ago is now an open highway... (Intervention)

**HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT,
HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:** May I put a question? You are talking about that road and I wonder what SWANU has been doing all the years, being the oldest Party. Has somebody ever sacrificed, except one who went to the island? What were they doing all along? Do they also know that route or where they only dining and wining in America?

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I really do not have much to say about what the Honourable Member was saying. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: On a Point of Information. When Honourable Ulenga mentioned this route, he mentioned names. The people he mentioned used that route to go into exile, but Utoni Nujoma used that route to come and fight in the country. That is the difference.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Speaker, as I was saying, I was very pleased... (Intervention)

15 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON ULENGA

HON MAAMBERUA: On a Point of Information. I wish to put on record that had SWANU not been formed in 1959, SWAPO would not have existed.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can you speak to the essence of the Budget, please?

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I really believe that I am with the essence of the Budget because I am talking about development projects which are part and parcel of our Government policy.

I must say I was very pleased to find all these infrastructural projects completed and beautifully rounded off. They are so important to the transportation of goods and movements of people throughout the country and throughout the hinterland beyond. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY: Honourable Member, with all those achievements you have so clearly articulated with precision, would you honestly agree with the grading of the President of this country?

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I did not get the question at all. However, as a local observer remarked to me when I was travelling along the Rundu-Nkurenkuru highway... (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: We will break for tea and then you will proceed.

15 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON ULENGA**

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:40

HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:10

HON ULENGA: Honourable Madam Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members of the National Assembly, the tabling of the Annual National Budget in the National Assembly by the Minister of Finance has been, right from the inception of the first National Assembly in 1990, almost 22 years ago, not just one of the most important, but indeed the main event of the yearly sessions of the National Assembly. If we can reminisce, when the first of its kind was performed in April 1990 by the first Minister of Finance in the first administration under the first independent Government, the Honourable Dr Otto Herrigel, it was quite a colourful and memorable event, with the Minister in bow tie, classic suit, accompanied by his wife, equally well-dressed Madam Herrigel and the Minister carrying a small brown leather-bound case, the so-called original Budget container, according to the English language, because that is where the term “budget” is derived from, the small money container, leather case. There was pomp and funfair all over the place that day and it was also lent extra colour by the fact that this was a very strange and uncommon occurrence in a country whose citizens never before had the power to decide on when or what or how much to spend on the management of the public affairs of its citizens.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, unfortunately that was perhaps the only really unpretended and truly honest Budget Debate that we conducted that year, a Budget Debate carried out in the true hope and expectation that whatever one said with regards to the amounts opposed for appropriation and expenditure, would be considered during the final decisions of the Committee Stage in the House.

At the end of that first Debate that year, in his response the Minister, Dr Herrigel, proposed to amend his proposal by undertaking in writing, in the

15 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON ULENGA

form of an Amendment, to table later during the same Financial Year an Additional Budget to meet additional needs as were pointed out during the Debate that might have not been catered for in the initial *Appropriation Bill*. It was on the basis of that formal undertaking for an Additional Budget that the first Budget was passed by the House.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members and Comrades, to tell you the honest truth, all the subsequent *Appropriation Bills* passed into Acts in this House were merely rubberstamped by the National Assembly. In other words, these were decisions written in stone in the Cabinet and brought to the National Assembly just to be showed. Even the current Minister, Honourable Deputy Speaker, has justified this on numerous occasions by arguing that there is no need to change a document which in itself is a result of such a lengthy process of consultations – of course outside this House – and of final consensus reached also outside this House.

Therefore, Honourable Deputy Speaker, the question can be asked: Why does the Minister have to table the Budget in this House if there has already been consensus and lengthy consultations outside the House? The answer to this question lies in what has become now quite a major “*hallmark*” of the Ruling Party. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY:

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Ben Ulenga is making a statement that needs some elucidation. Therefore, may I pose a question to you just to enable you to elucidate on the statement that you have just made?

I just want to find out what is your understanding of Article 63(2)(a) and (b) of the Namibian Constitution in light of your use of the word “*rubberstamping*” of the Budget. This article states the following: “*The National Assembly shall further have the power and function, subject to this Constitution, (a) to approve Budgets for the effective Government and*

15 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON ULENGA

administration of the country and (b) to provide for revenue and taxation.” Do you not agree that that is exactly what we are doing and there is no use of the word “*rubberstamping*” in the Namibian Constitution? It is further specifically stated in the Constitution that it is the duty of the Executive to prepare the Budget and to table it here for discussion and approval by the National Assembly.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Speaker, I was posing the question rhetorically: Why does the Minister have to table the Budget in this House if there have already been “*lengthy consultations and consensus outside the House?*” I was saying the answer to this grave question lies in what has now become a major hallmark of the Ruling Party, that is the SWAPO Party and its Government, namely to put up a show, to pretend to be doing one thing, while in actual fact doing quite another, the pretence to be doing one thing, to discuss the Budget, for example, while they have already taken a final decision in consultations or consensus on the very same document.

Comrade Deputy Speaker, this particular thread has been woven intrinsically into the cloth of the history of our liberation movement before Independence and now for the moment... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? The Honourable Member is concerned that apparently what is being done here is not what the Constitution provides. I want him to tell this House as to what he understands by the word “*approval*”.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, sometimes some people do not make a difference between what is theory and what is practice, but I was talking about this particular thread of behaviour that has been woven intrinsically into the cloth of the history - and the answer is coming if you

15 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON ULENGA

listen carefully – of our liberation movement and for this moment, the country's Ruling Party. Let me give you examples:

Consider, for example, such historic documents as the SWAPO Constitution of 1976 and its unconditional commitment to the ideology of “*scientific socialism*” and numerous other documents attending to the same ideology of socialism when the term suited the authors. Secondly, consider the Namibian Constitution itself – and this is now coming to the issue that the Minister is raising and I do not even talk about Article 29(3) that says a person shall hold office as President not more than two terms. This was a decision taken in all earnest when everything else has been considered, only to be changed with the stroke of a pen a few years later.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, consider further this serious preaching of the one thing and doing the other.... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: On a Point of Order, Honourable Deputy Speaker. The Honourable Member makes an attempt, in my view, to belittle and ridicule a decision passed by this House in terms of the provisions of the Constitution and it would seem that we want to allow that to pass as though it is the right of the Honourable Member to express himself. The Honourable Member feels entitled to do that just because he personally did not agree with it. Is this House agreeing that if a single Member is not in agreement with a decision taken in this House either to pass or amend a law or to adopt a resolution, he is therefore entitled to ridicule it in this House? If that is so, what becomes of the decisions that we take in this House? I believe that the Opposition Parties in this House have adopted an attitude of condemning the Government and even the decisions of this House because they are unable to convince the public to vote for them to have greater numbers here so that their views can prevail and because they are not able to do that, they vent their frustration by trying to mislead the public into believing that there is something untoward that is happening in this House. I feel that cannot be allowed and it should not be allowed.

15 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON ULENGA

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can I get clarity from you, when you quote the specific provision in the Constitution, are you against that provision or are you saying we are not adhering to that provision?

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I appreciate the comments made by the Colleagues on the other side of the House. It is, indeed, a matter of expressing opinions, but I must state, far from that, Honourable Minister, I am not at all trying to belittle or ridicule the Constitution, I am just trying to point out by means of example what I am talking about. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: On a Point of Information, because a serious statement was made here about the Constitution, that the Constitution says a person holding that office will hold it for two five-year terms. That Clause is intact, it was never touched. What we have done and I was leading that process, is that there is a transitional Clause which says that the first President shall be elected by the Constituent Assembly and shall serve for two five-year terms. We said there in transition that we change that and say the first President shall be elected by the Constituent Assembly and serve for three five-year terms. The Clause that limits the term to two five-year terms is there. Do not distort the Constitution, two five-year terms is entrenched, it is there. Are you aware that was a transitional Clause which says the first President shall be elected by the Constituent Assembly and shall serve for two five-year terms? We only put from two to three five-year terms. That is what we did.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, again I appreciate the input by the Honourable Minister of Trade and Industry and I must say my only comment on that one...(Intervention)

15 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON ULENGA

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND ATTORNEY-GENERAL: I am sorry to interrupt my Colleague, but I want to add a footnote so that when he responds, he must also respond to this question, if he is amenable to answering my question. Honourable Ulenga, I stand to be corrected, during the time Parliament interpreted that provision which enabled our Founding President to be elected directly by this Nation for two terms, I suppose you were a Member of Parliament and I suppose you even voted for that and today you are condemning what you yourself voted for. Is that true?

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I would like to comment as follows on the information given by the Honourable Minister of Trade and Industry. Honourable Deputy Speaker, it was adeptly carried out. It is almost equivalent to eating your intellectual cake and having it.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you going to direct us or what?

HON ULENGA: I still have to deal with the question of Dr Kawana. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I should think we are somehow Out of Order. The subject matter is not to doubt some provision of the Constitution and try to interpret it. If there are people who have a problem with it, that we have a suspicion that using this provision is not democratic, then we have institutions which will interpret the correctness of that provision, even though it is too late, because the Constitution was amended and agreed to by the majority. Democracy dictates that the minority should follow the majority, therefore, why should we quote provisions here as if we have doubts on that? I do not think that is the

15 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON ULENGA

subject matter, for us to interpret a provision of the Constitution.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, that was just a passing remark and I want to continue with my speech. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, this House has adopted the National Assembly Standing Rules and Orders. I want to draw the attention of the House to Rule 108, General Restrictions. “(a) *A Member may not speak against or reflect upon any decision or act of the Assembly except for the purpose of moving that it be rescinded.*” This means that if a Member has a problem with a provision of a law passed by this House, he may bring a Motion proposing Amendment. What the Honourable Member is doing is exactly speaking and reflecting upon a decision and that cannot be allowed, he must withdraw. Honourable Nyamu tried to do the same last year, I reprimanded him and the Speaker said he must withdraw. Therefore, the Honourable Member must withdraw.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: For the sake of progress, can you just proceed with your statement.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, that is exactly what I am doing. I am not criticising any law and I am not criticising the Constitution. If you listen carefully to what I am saying, I am talking about a particular behaviour of a particular organisation and not about a law or the Constitution and that is what the Honourable Members do not like.

15 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON ULENGA**

Honourable Deputy Speaker, consider further this serious Article 20...
(Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY: Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Honourable Member cannot continue misleading the public and continue to ridicule the Constitution, because the behaviour he describes is that of the Executive power drafting the Budget and to present it to Parliament. There is no other way for approval. How can he call it a behaviour? I think his whole statement is just Out of Order.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, consider further the serious Article 20 and listen carefully, that solemnly states that “*all persons shall have the right to education*”; secondly, “*primary education shall be compulsory and the State shall provide reasonable facilities to render effective this right for every resident within Namibia by establishing and maintaining State schools at which primary education will be provided free of charge*”; thirdly, “*children shall not be allowed to leave school until they have completed their primary education or have attained the age of sixteen years, whichever is the sooner*.” (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: On a Point of Information, Comrade Deputy Speaker. I have asked the Honourable Member a question as to what he understood by the word “*approval*”. I want to help him now although I know he understands what it means, but as a result of the quandary in which he finds himself, he is unable to disentangle himself. “*Approval*” means allowing, authorising, let it go and the opposite is equally within that definition. You can disapprove. If you can approve, you can also disapprove. Therefore, the Honourable Member has two choices and these are given by the law. He can approve the Budget, as the Constitution allows him to do or he can equally disapprove the Budget

15 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON ULENGA

because the Constitution and the laws allow him to do so. Let him choose between the two, but what the Honourable Member is not entitled to do is to jointly compile the Budget with the Honourable Minister of Finance. He is not a member of the Executive and, therefore, cannot demand other than what the Constitution allow him to do.

HON ULENGA: Madam Deputy Speaker, the term “right” means...
(Intervention)

HON KAURA: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable Member, I want to find out whether there is true separation of powers in Namibia between the Legislature, the Executive and the Judiciary given the fact that the Executive is dominating the Legislature and they are the ones drawing up the Budget, with the result that because of their overwhelming majority there is no separation and they are steamrolling the Budget through to the National Assembly and, therefore, we are there to rubberstamp it.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Member, could you ignore that particular question because it is not in line with what we are discussing here.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, the word “*right*”, as used in Article 20, means something to which one has a just claim, the power or privilege to which one is justly entitled, something that is both legally and morally exactable, in other words, something which I have the right or legal power to demand from the State, something that people can call for forcibly or urgently and obtain from the State. This is according to Webster Dictionary, Tenth Edition, first printed in 1993.

15 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON ULENGA

I can continue to give examples, Honourable Deputy Speaker, we can talk about Article 95 on the promotion of the welfare of the people, namely that the State shall actively promote and maintain the welfare of the people by adopting, *inter alia*, policies aimed at ensuring... (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY: On a Point of Order. Honourable Ulenga has been advised by the Deputy Speaker that if he is against any Article of the Constitution, he must say so, but he still continues. Article 95 which he wants to quote is still being implemented by the SWAPO Government. Honourable Ulenga, you started off well, thanking the Government for doing good things, but you again wavered in what you started doing.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can you proceed? Your time is limited.

HON ULENGA: Tell the people who are interrupting. That was a completely useless intervention.

Despite highfaluting eloquence with which the Constitution enjoins Parliament and Members of Parliaments to act and despite the oath we take at our swearing-in ceremony and subsequently, every single day of our sitting, namely that "*I do hereby swear that I shall be faithful to the people of Namibia, uphold, protect and defend the Constitution*" and not defend the Government or the Party, there is still no unemployment benefit available for Namibians 22 years after the coming into life of the Constitution, nor is there any assistance to the incapacitated, the indigent, the poor and the disadvantaged, as they should be accorded such social benefits and amenities as will be determined by Parliament. We have not seen it here.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Cabinet tends to present an already

15 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON ULENGA

cooked and chewed Budget to Parliament. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: On a Point of Information. I realise the Honourable Member was not here when the Right Honourable Prime Minister delivered a Ministerial Statement, tabulating the social welfare programme of this Government, but I want to tell the Honourable Member that every year the Ministry of Justice budgets for indigent persons of this country to get a fair trial by allocating over N\$700 million for Legal Aid. Therefore, when the Opposition Parties write their speeches, they should also be realistic and reasonable.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, now I would like to speak about the veterans of the liberation struggle. I just recently received my letter of approval as a veteran of the struggle. The policies of the Government regarding assistance to veterans of the liberation struggle are to be commended. (Intervention)

HON SHIXWAMENI: May I ask my fellow veteran a question? When you say you received whatever you have received, I do not want to mention it, does he not think that it is a conflict of interest to speak on the same topic?

HON ULENGA: I thank the Honourable Member, I did not receive anything actually, but the point I want to touch on is that this policy has received mixed reaction, to say the least. While many have welcomed this policy and actually considered it as long overdue, many others have felt that too much attention is paid to those who were involved in the liberation struggle on the SWAPO part, especially those who were in exile at the expense of other equally needy categories of Namibians.

15 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON ULENGA

Honourable Deputy Speaker, a N\$50,000 cheque once and N\$2,000 on a monthly basis is really not much. How does one expend N\$50,000? Can you buy a house? Can you buy a car? You cannot even pay a child's university fees or perhaps you can pay part thereof.

However, Honourable Deputy Speaker, why can this meagre means of assisted not be extended to other categories of Namibians, especially those in comparable situations? I have in mind, for example, the returnees who came from Botswana, who returned home after they have been exiled for three or four generations. Secondly, other landless Namibians, especially those who are in comparable situations, like landless people in towns and in rural areas who have been evicted from their land or who had their land expropriated and have lived for several generations without any other home apart from the so-called white man's farm where once upon a time their great-grandparents were employed. There are other fitting categories as well, people fitting the same situation or even worse situations and I am now referring to the elderly poor who have water bills amounting into tens of thousands or even hundreds of thousands of dollars in debt.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, as I walk or drive around in Namibia, many people ask me, what is the difference between the former exiles and other poor Namibians and my other answer is, there is no difference. The question is, why are they preferred above the rest? (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: On a Point of Information, Honourable Deputy Speaker. What is given to the veterans is as per definition of the Act, the law passed here. If there are other assistance to be given to other Namibians, let that be so, but not to link it to the veterans. The veterans are people both who were in exile and those that were here, they are not excluded at all.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can I give you one minute to round up?

15 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON ULENGA

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, as you know, I have only spoken now for 25 minutes.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the next point that I want to take up now is the policy of Government with regard to the reparations issue. I want to critically assess the Government's lukewarm stand on our people's justified demands for reparations, restoration and restitution from the Government and the State of Germany, which reparations are the only material way in which the current State of Germany can make amends for atrocities committed during the time of oppression or of colonisation in Namibia, especially between 1894 to 1910. Note, I am not saying 1884, but 1894 to 1910.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, we propose that there should be a far stronger support and stance coming from the Government's side on this issue. With the way they have been treating the matter so far I am not surprised at all that the German Government has been treating our demands with utter contempt, to say the least.

Comrade Deputy Speaker, colonisation itself as it happened in Namibia about a hundred years ago was the vile act of aggression and unprovoked act of war and I am talking about actions of the German Imperialist State and not of the people.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time has lapsed according to the correct calculation. Honourable Namwandi.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Honourable Deputy Speaker, let peace reign in the House. I join the rest of the Honourable Members who congratulated the Minister, Deputy Minister and the entire staff of the Ministry of Finance for a job well done. During Budget time there is a need to participate and contribute in a productive and constructive manner along the expectations of the Budget and that of the

15 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON DR NAMWANDI

Nation. In fact, the Budget represents the expectations of the people for a better an improved life in many ways.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Member, you have only fifteen minutes available and I hope you will finish within that.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF EDUCATION: No, some of us believe in consultation as opposed to confrontation. If the Deputy Speaker discovered that I have cheated, just stop me.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Deputy Minister, I am just advising you according to the time allocation.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. In this respect, the Government is entrusted with undertaking many economic endeavours on priority basis. As a result, it is inevitable that the size of the Budget sometimes becomes bigger than the percentage of GDP. In fact, we have witnessed this phenomenon since Independence. However, some economists and policy-makers argue that the bigger Government Budget hinders economic growth and welfare of the people, as expansion of the size of Government is not conducive to economic growth due to some reasons.

Today, in view of challenges of the economy and, hence, priorities of the Government, I would like to discuss whether expansion of Budget will support or whether it would hinder economic growth and development.

Advocates of bigger Government Budget argue that Government expenditure provides value public goods, such as education, health and

15 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON DR NAMWANDI**

infrastructure. They also claim that increases in Government expending can boost economic growth by putting money into people's pockets and improve purchasing power. In fact, people have hopes and Government needs to accommodate and support those hopes to be realised on the ground. People are encouraged to work hard for basic needs, their concerns about their children's education, health, housing and future. In this instance, the Government, business, Non-Governmental Organisations and other organisations work together to create a better future.

In the same vein, citizens want Government to enhance skills development, create jobs, reduce poverty and narrow economic disparities. In other words, people will therefore be committed and devoted to economic growth and development. In this way Government is left with no option to effectively lead and assist the people to realise their expectation.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, when I said that the Government should effectively lead and support, I actually mean that policies and strategies of the Government must stimulate economic growth and realise development objectives. In my honest opinion, this is what is happening as it is clearly reflected in the just tabled Budget.

The Government policy, in the broader sense of the word, is to transform and strengthen the economy, paving the way by creating skills, generating more jobs, diversifying the sources of economic growth and hence, expanding our regional markets to the entire African continent and the rest of the world as part and parcel of globalisation. With respect to the above, we are ambitious yet realistic. We will be bold yet pragmatic. We will be creative and inventive, yet we will build on a sound and secure foundation.

Our Government's policy is to transform the economy, as explained above. So what is our strategy for this transformation then? As I indicated above, structural transformation is the foundation and the key element for a better future. Furthermore, structural transformation should take place through diversification of the sources of economic growth, reduction of poverty and income inequality as well as employment

15 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON DR NAMWANDI

creation, which should be stable and sustainable. This means that we need to focus on inclusive economic growth in which the poor and unemployed should participate and contribute to the growth of the GDP figure and in turn benefit from GDP growth. In other words, the poor and unemployed should be integrated in economic growth, an employment sensitive economic growth, hence the introduction of TIPEEG.

Thus, the concept of inclusive economic growth refers to the pace of economic growth, pattern of economic growth and the enlarging size of the economy in many ways. In other words, in a broader sense inclusive growth economic growth refers to the fact that no economy can grow by excluding some citizens of this country. It must be noted that the economy that is not growing cannot integrate all citizens in a meaningful way. Furthermore, as a Nation there is a substantial agreement that our key challenges are unemployment, poverty, ignorance and inequality.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, in light of the above, Government is committed and devoted and depict it in the Budget to undertake many pro-development initiatives with limited means, as economic law dictates. History of economic growth and development in any country...(Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Honourable Namwandi, you are doing very well, I am enjoying your intervention, but I just want to ask you a question on the inclusiveness of the poor. How do you include the poor in the economic development if you do not own the means of production, if you do not have access to capital? As a professor I want to ask you, because I am also a believer in scientific socialism and it has been proven now by the former Soviet Socialist Republic that they have failed because of the onslaught. However, China is proving that it can deliver because it is a public-driven economy. Vietnam has proved that it is working and already the capitalist system is also proving that it is collapsing, it is not sustainable. I wanted you to elaborate on those factors.

15 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON DR NAMWANDI

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you, Comrade Minister. People are crucial for development, crucial for the future and, therefore, any Government that neglects its people is doomed to failure. It is, therefore, important that the Government takes into account the means of production and transfer the ownership of means of the production into the hands of the people.

History of economic growth and development in any country has gone through bigger Budgets at the initial stage of economic growth development and hence Namibia is not an exception. If we assume a situation that there is zero spending by the Government, there will be little economic growth and development, because enforcing contracts, protecting property, provision of education, health and infrastructural development will be very difficult. In other words, at least some or minimum level of Government spending is unavoidable. In fact, economic activities are very low or non-existent in the absence of Government spending. As a result, the benefits outweigh the costs. However, some economies claim that cost of Government interventions in the economy outweighs the benefits, which cannot be ignored as well. Therefore, it is useful and relevant to look into such claims. The extraction cost is among such claims. Government spending requires costly financial changes as Government cannot spend money without taking that money from someone or other sources, such as taxes and levies. Taxes discourage production behaviour in many ways. Another instance is that Public borrowing consumes capital that could otherwise be available for companies and individuals for investment.

Further, it could be contested that due to Public borrowing, increased interest rates and inflation cause widespread economic distortions in the economy. To allay the fear of this line of thinking, overall environment support and stimulation of productive behaviour, conversely benefits and outweigh the cost of tax or negative impacts of tax, as argued by critics of this Budget.

Another argument refers to displacement costs. Some critics believe that Government spending displaces Private Sector economic activity, because

15 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON GOWASES**

every dollar that Government spends necessarily means one less dollar in the productive Sectors of the economy, as Private Sector is part and parcel of economic growth and development. At the surface this argument appears to be right, however it should be noted that the Private Sector investment is not decided or determined with money alone as the Private Sector faces challenges due to skilled labour, lack of entrepreneurship, limited markets and competition, to mention but a few.

Further, well functional legal regulatory system and conducive investment climate provided by the Government has high rate of return, which cannot be measured on the basis of narrowly defined benefits on the ground alone.

Subsidy and social security measures are part and parcel of Government expenditure, but some economists believe that subsidy creates market distortions with respect to prices and the third party peer problem. It should be pointed out that subsidy is not a widespread phenomenon, as strictly speaking only the poor and the vulnerable need such subsidy. This applies to the provision of social security as well. Social security measures consume substantial Government expenditure in developed countries as well. Accordingly, it is not appropriate to indicate or to argue that such measures are counter-productive, misallocation of resources or underutilisation of resources. In fact, such Government expenditure needs objective judgment, rather than confining it to how it contributes to the size of the Government. In other words, due to many historical economic and social reasons, benefits, subsidy and social security outweighs the cost.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your time is over. Honourable Gowases.

HON GOWASES: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, I am indeed honoured to address this House as I rise to join the Debate on the National Budget 2012/2013 on behalf of the Republican Party of

15 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON GOWASES**

Namibia, driven by the need of the Namibian people whom we represent.

I congratulate the Honourable Minister of Finance and her team for a well-prepared Budget and in the same vein, I applaud the Budget theme, “*Do More with Less.*” It is, however, my prayer that we do not end up with doing less with more.

I agree with the Honourable Minister of Finance that the unemployment rate is unacceptably high and urgent intervention is very much needed. For 22 years we have developed one programme after the other to address the plight of the poor Namibians, yet we still face major socio-economic challenges, such as high level of unemployment, poverty, socio-economic inequalities, labour skills shortage, a narrow industrial base, as stated by His Excellency President Pohamba during his State of the Nation Address.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, TIPEEG implementation has progressed at a very slow pace, which is understandable as it is still in its infancy. In principle, TIPEEG presents a solution to economic challenges that our country faces and the Minister and her Ministry have evaluated the implementation rate and came up with possible avenues for smooth implementation of the programme. However, the programme needs thorough control, monitoring and precise implementation as per its core objectives and principle. As a Government we should guard against TIPEEG becoming yet another tool to empower a selected few, as many other programmes did, such as the fishing quotas. We have seen that fishing quotas were given to individuals or organisations who have submitted proposals for community development projects which they wish to fund from the proceeds of the quotas, only to end up in the pockets of individuals without benefiting the people whom the quotas were intended for.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, we have seen that the Ministry of Education has received the lion share of the Budget. This has been the case each and every Fiscal Year, yet we still fail to produce able human resources to operate the engine of our economy. For example, TIPEEG implementation is limited by the scarcity of engineering capacity with regard to project preparation. We should have our own engineers

15 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON GOWASES**

now to handle our projects. We spend so much to prepare our children, only to import expatriates 22 after Independence. As a teacher myself I believe that is not... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Honourable Member, which channels do you watch on television in your free time? If you can tell me, then I will be able to proceed with my question. If you watch these programmes you will see that educational challenges are not only unique to Namibia, they are everywhere. Just two days ago I was watching SABC and South Africa has serious problems in education despite the massive injection of capital, similarly in England and everywhere. We must appreciate the efforts by the Government although there are challenges. If you can broaden your mind, it will be very helpful for the RP to make a constructive contribution. Thank you.

HON GOWASES: Thank you for the intervention. As a teacher myself I believe that it is not how much money we put into education that would save our country, but the reintroduction... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF DEFENCE: I stand on a Point of Information. The Honourable Member spoke about the Ministry of Education not providing opportunities for engineering courses, etcetera. I wonder if she has read a very thick book released recently, Who is Who in Namibia in Engineering, which lists all the Namibian engineers at mining companies and not only foreigners. Have you read that?

HON GOWASES: No. I believe what would save our country is the reintroduction of disciplinary measures at our schools right from pre-

15 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON GOWASES

primary school. A person without discipline will never succeed in life even if he or she has a high IQ. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF EDUCATION: On a Point of Information, Honourable Deputy Speaker. One old man told me some time back that there are some people who say what they do not know, when they do not even know what they think they know. I am very disappointed as a fellow teacher. She is saying she is a teacher, yet she does not know what is happening in the Ministry of Education and there are so many people with the same belief. However, I want to make it very clear here that the Ministry of Education is doing everything in its power to educate as many Namibians as possible. We believe in mass education. On the issue of engineers, we are sending our children all over the world to be trained in all critical fields. Therefore, please do not criticise for the sake of criticising.

HON GOWASES: We are productive people in this august House, I believe so, because we came from a community which formed us through strict discipline. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FISHERIES AND MARINE RESOURCES: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable Member, you have made reference to fishing quotas and you also stated that people are misusing the income generated from those quotas. Can you do this House a favour and tell us who are those ones?

HON GOWASES: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, the Honourable Minister of Finance has mentioned that the Agriculture

15 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON GOWASES**

Sector is a source of livelihood of 55% of the Namibian population.
(Intervention)

HON KAURA: Honourable Member, are you aware of the fact that the young people referred to as studying as engineers in China are the children of Ministers?

HON GOWASES: The resettlement programme was designed to give agricultural land to landless Namibians. The Ministry of Lands and Resettlement buys a farm which employed people and contributed to the GDP and gives it to people who do not have enough livestock to sustain the farm, while there are successful communal farmers who could have been promoted to become commercial farmers. And so some commercial units become a liability.

A lot of money is invested in the Green Scheme projects but it is difficult to find Namibian markets for many Namibian products, as most retailers rely heavily on South African imports. When we invest so much money in projects, we should devise policies that would force open Namibian markets for Namibian products.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, once again, a lot of money is allocated to the servicing of land. We have seen that land was serviced in Otjomuise “*Sewende Laan Location*” and these serviced erven were promised to the landless Namibians. For the past four years these plots have still not been allocated.

The City of Windhoek seems to keep the land until the demand increased so that they could rake profit and therefore making it impossible for those people to access land. Women and children are sleeping in harsh conditions in corrugated iron shacks. Only the nail that holds the corrugated sheet to the pole is the only guarantee to their safety and security. Anyone can pull the zinc away anytime. Children are bitten by

15 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON GOWASES**

snakes and scorpions, they do not have shelter against the rain and cold, they live like foreigners in their motherland. I wish to see that our Government will see to it that these women are given the land they are entitled to and stop the speculation with land.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, I have observed a great developmental imbalance in the allocation of resources to the Regions in Namibia and that is very evident in the allocated funds per Vote per Region. I would highlight only one Vote to substantiate the above statement. Vote 25 – Development of Communal Areas. Karas and Hardap Regions received close to 60% less than Kavango, Omusati, Ohangwena, etcetera.

People of the South live predominantly on livestock farming, they farm with very high quality boer goats, which are being exported to South Africa on large scale. Our people sell these rare high quality products to survive. The livestock totals are diminishing at an alarming rate. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: May I ask a question? Now that the Honourable Member of the RP has done calculations on the allocations per Region and being a professional teacher, what is the per capita allocation? What is the ratio?

HON GOWASES: I will tell you when we deal with the relevant Vote. If we as lawmakers would not intervene and assist the people of the South to hold onto these products for a little longer, we will face a situation of rural-urban migration of people in search of employment, although not having the right skills. I, therefore, wish to see a budgetary will by the Line Ministry to address the abovementioned dilemma.

15 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON GOWASES**

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, in conclusion, I wish to state that in front of us we have a well-prepared Budget, but it goes beyond figures as it will only become tangible to the people when implemented. (Intervention)

**HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT,
HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:** May I put a tiny question to the Honourable Member? Honourable Member, you mentioned that the people in Kavango received a large amount and then you said “*our people*.” Are you not proud of your people in Kavango or are they not your people if you talk about “*our people*?” Does it mean the people of Kavango are not your people or what do you mean?

Secondly, I want you to be sincere and *praat die waarheid uit jou eie hart voor God*, who drafted your speech, because I know it is not your speech.

HON GOWASES: We have a frustrated Nation out there who have become tired of hope and promises made during election campaigns. A woman hung herself with her six-months old baby on her back. Babies are dumped because mothers do not see hope for themselves and the babies. You need to put the national interest first and treat all Namibians as equals. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Comrade Deputy Speaker, may I ask the Honourable Member a small question? Are you trying to instigate the women to commit suicide?

15 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON GOWASES**

HON GOWASES: People from all Regions voted us into our political offices to address their needs and they trust us with the distribution of the resources. They wait on the delivery of our promises.

Finally, the 21st century should be a century for women. (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, may I ask my neighbour a small question? Before I ask my question, I must admit that where somebody made a mistake we should criticise, but where somebody has done something good we should also give credit. I just want to use this opportunity to give credit to the Honourable Minister of Finance because she was in Katutura for the first time today and she was so happy. My question is, Honourable Deputy Speaker, there was a point of liberation movements, do you not think it has become clear now, whether it is in South Africa or Namibia, that the liberation movements were good at the liberation struggle, but since they do not have the capacity to run Political Parties and the country, that is why we are in this dilemma. Do you not think it is time for them to make way for people who can do that?

HON GOWASES: We should try to expand the frontiers of political representation for women, which in turn will be a gateway for higher socio-economic and political achievement nationwide. The industrial era was for male domination, but the era of Information Technology and a knowledge-based economy should be the era for women to attain equality. If we refuse to develop together and equally as men and women, then our development agenda is equally defeated.

Let us move from promises to targeted interventions, translated into actions for a prosperous Namibia. Budget wise, spend wise, save wise and be wise on finance. I thank you, I support the Bill.

15 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON BEZUIDENHOUDT**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Bezuidenhout, you have the Floor.

HON BEZUIDENHOUT: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker, for this opportunity to contribute to the Debate on the National Budget as tabled by the Honourable Minister of Finance on behalf of the Government of the Republic of Namibia . The content of my speech will touch on some of the issues in the Budget and I would also like to make recommendations to the Executive as how to expand some Sectors of the economy so that we can gain more revenue in taxes to be redistributed among so many priorities of Government spending. That will be the gist of my statement to this Honourable House.

I declare that this is my original, self-crafted statement, nobody must ask me who crafted it, it is a product of my brain cells.

Honourable Deputy Speaker and Honourable Members, I echo the congratulations of previous speakers to the Honourable Minister and her team for manoeuvring the financial ship through very stormy waters over the last two to three years. I am in agreement with the macro-economic picture painted by the Honourable Minister and I appreciate her bluntness that previous Expansionary Budgets have placed us on the upper limits of our fiscal benchmarks and that Government is making a timely and collective decision to gradually withdraw significant fiscal expansion in order to regain fiscal space and my contribution will assist in trying to see where we can regain more fiscal space.

From the honest and blunt assessment comes the realisation that Namibia and Namibians must tighten the financial belt to avoid what we have seen now in other European countries, namely severe and devastating austerity measures, in the future and for that very same reason the Minister of Finance has asked us to do more with less. Although it is a challenge it may be doable, depending on how we proceed.

Equally commendable is the realisation that the priority must be to create

15 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON BEZUIDENHOUDT**

productive jobs in the Private Sector – and I must stress the “*Private Sector*” because sometimes we get the feeling there is no Private Sector and another Member said the Private Sector is vital. We got constitutional quotations from various sides that the Private Sector does exist and it is their main responsibility to create productive jobs and the Government, as an employer, complements what they cannot do, because Government should only be employing people to service the State and not take up their responsibility to create jobs. I know why Government is doing this, because if they do not, somebody must do it because we are facing a problem and I would like to call on the Private Sector to really take their mandate seriously. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: May I ask a question? Honourable Bezuidenhoudt, you are a learned man, when you analyse the anatomy of the economy of the so-called BRICS countries, that is Brazil, India, China, Russia and South Africa, is that physiology of the economy structured along the Private Sector approach you are prescribing or is it different?

HON BEZUIDENHOUT: It is structured along the lines of a mixed economy, which Namibia also has, from Private-Public Sector. I do not deny Government’s right to employ, I have never said that, what I said was that because the Private Sector does not fulfil its role, Government needs to step in. That is what I said and that is why I will request the Private Sector to play its part.

Equally commendable is the realisation that the priority must be to create productive jobs in the Private Sector and to progressively re-orientate TIPEEG towards supporting job creation in the long term. That comes from Paragraph 13 of the Minister’s statement.

15 March 2012

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: You will proceed on the 27th. The House is adjourned until the 27th March 2012 at 14:30.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:45 UNTIL 2012.03.27 AT 14:30

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS
WINDHOEK
27 MARCH 2012**

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

HON SPEAKER: The business of the House shall now commence. We have been informed and reminded that tomorrow we shall transform the Chamber into a workshop to have a look at our Standing Rules and Orders as an outstanding issue many of us have been talking about. The current Standing Rules and Orders have served their purpose and for the most part continue to be helpful to our work as the National Assembly. They were here when I came on board as Speaker, but as a long-serving Member of the National Assembly I know that from time to time we revisit them with a view to improve upon them. Tomorrow that will be done.

HON SPEAKER: Any Petitions? Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Prime Minister.

TABLING: ANNUAL REPORTS:

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Honourable Members, it is my honour and privilege to lay on the Table –

1. Annual Report of the Anti-Corruption Commission for the year 2009/2010;
 2. Report of Namibia National Urban Corruption Perception Survey for the year 2010.
-

27 March 2012

TABLING OF REPORTS
HON !NARUSEB / HON SCHLETTWEIN

HON SPEAKER: Will the Right Honourable Prime Minister table the Reports? Any further Reports and Papers? Deputy Minister of Lands and Resettlement.

HON MINISTER OF LANDS AND RESETTLEMENT: Honourable Speaker, I lay upon the Table:

1. Annual Report of the Ministry of Lands and Resettlement for the year 2010/2011;
2. Annual Report of the Communal Land Boards for the years 2008 and 2009.

It is my fervent expectation that the Honourable august House will be able to digest the Reports and probably refer them to the appropriate Committees for further investigation.

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Minister table the Reports? Other Reports and Papers? Deputy Minister of Finance.

TABLING: REPORTS OF THE AUDITOR-GENERAL

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: Honourable Speaker, I lay upon the Table, Reports of the Auditor-General on the Accounts of:

1. Ministry of Health and Social Services (Central Medical Stores) for the Financial Years 2000 to 2008;

27 March 2012

**TABLING OF REPORTS
HON HAUSIKU**

2. Municipality of Karibib for the Financial Years that ended 30 June 2009 and 2010;
3. Town Council of Karibib for the Financial Year that ended 30 June 2011; and
4. Village Council of Tses for the Financial Year ended 20 June 2010.

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Deputy Minister table the Reports? Any further Reports and Papers? Honourable Deputy Prime Minister.

**TABLING: REPORT ON 7TH CONFERENCE OF
AFRICAN MINISTERS OF PUBLIC AND CIVIL SERVICE**

HON DEPUTY PRIME MINISTER: Comrade Speaker, I lay upon the Table, the Report on the 7th Conference of African Ministers of Public and Civil Service for note-taking and information of the Honourable Members.

HON SPEAKER: Will the Deputy Prime Minister table Report? Deputy Minister

**TABLING: ANNUAL REPORT:
NAMIBIA WILDLIFE RESORTS**

27 March 2012

**TABLING OF REPORTS
HON HERUNGA**

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM:

Honourable Speaker, I lay upon the Table, Annual Report of Namibia .
Wildlife Resorts of April to October 2009.

HON SPEAKER: Any Notice of Questions? Honourable Moongo.

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS

QUESTION 9:

HON MOONGO: I give Notice that on Thursday, the 15th of April 2012, I shall ask the Minister of Labour and Social Welfare:

Whether it is true that the minimum wages of domestic workers are estimated to be N\$1,200.00 per month. Are you aware that the Government cleaners and the lowest paid employees in the Government are paid less than N\$2,000.00 per month? For instance, if an employer has two domestic workers, one being a housekeeper and the other one at the cattle farm, and he is supposed to pay these two workers each N\$1,200.00 per month while his or her salary is only N\$2,000.00, practically and economically-wise we subject the employer to an unaffordable practice. What remedy can the Minister propose to quell the problem? The correct option is for the Government to subsidise the poor and underpaid employer.

QUESTION 10:

HON MOONGO: I further give Notice that on the 15th of April 2012, I shall ask the Minister of Labour and Social Welfare:

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON BEZUIDENHOUDT**

Can the Minister explain whether it is true that the security who protects millions of dollars of Epupa company are not given any benefits, such as pension, S&T and overtime when executing duties in dangerous fieldwork. How much money got lost due to negligence by the abovementioned security since the formation of this company? If none, when will the Minister solve this thorny problem of operating in dangerous and unprotected Regions?

HON SPEAKER: Any further Notice of Questions? Notice of Motions? Ministerial Statements? The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

**RESUMPTION OF DEBATE ON SECOND READING:
APPROPRIATION BILL**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on Second Reading – *Appropriation Bill.*

HON SPEAKER: When the House adjourned on Thursday, 15 March 2012, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Minister of Finance, that the Bill be read a Second Time. Honourable Bezuidenhoudt had the Floor and he may continue.

HON BEZUIDENHOUDT: Honourable Speaker, I only want to recap two issues that I mentioned last time. The first one was that my address will be specifically towards the Executive in the Chamber as the arm that executes policies and programmes as well as to make some

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON BEZUIDENHOUDT**

recommendations with regard to the expansion of our economy to get more revenue for the State.

Honourable Members of the National Assembly, Honourable Speaker, in the same vein, the Executive took a timely and collective decision for a gradual withdrawal of significant fiscal expansion in order to regain fiscal space, Namibian citizens have run out of options to adjust to the ever-increasing cost of living, increased commodity prices, severe and acute poverty levels, escalation of despair and homelessness and the real despair to be positive about tomorrow. To address our reality, our collective challenge is that we must properly analyse these challenges, propose real solutions and Government's Executive Branch must take innovative and bold decisions to decide which solution may best work for which set of challenges.

I will attempt to make some proposals to the Executive and it will be up to the Executive to decide... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND ATTORNEY GENERAL: May I ask the Vice-President of the RDP a question? Honourable Member, one of your members is opposed to the building of the Neckertal Dam. Are you of the same view or do you oppose that view?

HON BEZUIDENHOUDT: I have not come to real investments yet, but the Neckertal Dam is a major investment for this country. It was decided for the South, but investments can equally be made in other Regions.

However, the Neckertal Dam is more than welcome in the arid southern part of Namibia.

Of all these suggestions and proposals that I will make, it will be up to the Executive to decide which proposal may be a possibility, a desirability and

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON BEZUIDENHOUDT**

what is affordable and which may not be a solution at all.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, it is this Assembly's collective responsibility to oversee and assist the Executive Branch of Government in strategies and tactics in dealing with national challenges, to approve financial resources needed to implement strategies, to address the identified national challenges and to oversee approved Government programmes with the sole aim of making Namibia a winning Nation. It is equally the collective responsibility of the Executive to consider proposals that may address national challenges, decide on the best course of action and to be ready, willing and able to do innovative, bold and out-of-the-box thinking to address our national ills and be honest and humble enough to acknowledge when things do not go well and change course accordingly.

The Honourable Minister of Defence, Honourable Retired Major General Charles Namoloh, and any other trained soldier in this House will tell us that in warfare, changed circumstances in the operational reality require fast and on-the-spot decisions to survive or to complete the military mission successfully. The same is true about our war against unemployment, hunger, poverty, social and moral decay.

The well-known Indian politician and ideological leader, named Mohandas Karamchand Gandhi, or better known as Mahatma Gandhi, once said: *"An error does not become truth by reason of multiplied propagation, nor does the truth become an error because nobody sees it"*, meaning that we cannot talk an error, mistake or a failure into the truth, nor can we deny the existence of an error, mistake or failure because nobody sees it or nobody wants to hear it.

We have heard a chorus of protesting voices interrupting speakers in this House on the slightest hint of any alternative view and the repeated propagation of Government's view, therefore the repeat of the Gandhi quotation: *"An error does not become the truth by reason of multiplied propagation, nor does the truth become an error because nobody sees it."* With this as background or the elephant in the room, I want to express my take on some aspects of the 2012/2013 National Budget and suggest

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON BEZUIDENHOUDT**

possible remedies for the Executive Branch of Government for its consideration.

The first item I will deal with, and I took these headings from the Minister's statement, is employment, poverty and inequalities and then I will proceed to State-Owned Enterprise performances, Budget achievements and challenges and then insert my own proposals of legislative reform and the expansion of the domestic economy.

We have reached a broad consensus that employment levels are way too low or, conversely, that unemployment is way too high; that poverty as a consequence of unemployment is at totally unacceptable levels and that economic inequalities degrade the dignity of our citizens. To address this in the short term I suggest that the Executive, in the words of the Minister of Finance, re-orientate, revisit the TIPEEG programme and aggressively pursue its stated objective of job creation to gradually reduce the gini-coefficient ratio to the stated Vision 2030 target of 0.55 or collectively conclude and agree with the Right Honourable Prime Minister, as expressed on *"Inside Politics"*, a programme on NBC, that *"TIPEEG was initially and primarily an immediate reaction to the shocking unemployment rate"*, a view that was expressed last year when TIPEEG was introduced here in the House.

In the re-evaluation process it may become evident that the programme may be halted to establish its operational procedures or it may become clear to establish a TIPEEG operational unit with its own secretariat, as proposed by Honourable Shixwameni in his contribution or, alternatively, apply what Honourable Calle Schlettwein, the Deputy Minister of Finance, said on 13 April 2010 in this House when he made his maiden speech: *"When evaluating programmes and projects, it is crucial to ask the following questions: 1. How many additional jobs are created? 2. How is economic growth accelerated? 3. How is equitable wealth distribution attained? If the answers to these questions are negative, the programme should be abandoned and replaced with one that satisfies these conditions."*

When the Executive takes a decision, it will be the moment for bold and

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON BEZUIDENHOUDT**

innovative decision-taking. In normal financial management, improving your income or reducing your cost is a normal strategy to enhance profitability of any enterprise. For the enterprise called “Namibia Limited” it is no different. As legislators, as indicated earlier, we need to collectively assist with ideas on how to improve revenue or taxes and decrease or control cost so that the Minister of Finance has more financial resources to fund some of the unattended woes in the country. The offer is made, will the Executive accept it?

In the longer term the expansion of our economy to broaden the tax base to improve our income to support the necessary programmes is of paramount urgency. I will attempt to address some ideas on how to go about our domestic economy and economic development to generate more financial resources to the Treasury to propel this country financially for the good of all its citizens. These are made on the business principle of increasing revenue and cut cost. I offer these in the hope that the Executive Branch would consider them:

State-Owned Enterprises: I share the Minister’s concern that low productivity and inefficiency at some of our SMEs remain a concern and that perpetual bail-outs place considerable constraints on the Government’s fiscal position. It cannot remain a constant concern and the bail-outs cannot remain perpetual. The innovative and bold decisions will come into play when we deal with some of our under-performing State-Owned Enterprises in the effort to alleviate the considerable constraints placed on Government’s fiscal position. Non-crucial and non-strategic enterprises and those that should be in a position to compete profitably on the open market should be considered as candidates for equity partners that can really, truly and successfully implement a business strategy. (Intervention)

HON NYAMU: Honourable Vice-President of the RDP, you gave wise advice to the Government that some of these Parastatals, which have been sucking our blood since our birth, should be looked at and even privatised.

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON BEZUIDENHOUDT**

Do you not think it would be in the interest of this Nation if the Government would at least start with Air Namibia, get rid of this burden and share it with others? Do you not think that will be a wise decision to make?

HON BEZUIDENHOUT: Honourable Speaker, he just caught me at the point where I wanted to use that example. When we talk about State-Owned Enterprises in desperate and constant need of Government bail-outs, the Air Namibia always comes up. Yes, Air Namibia has its own set of challenges in the Industry it operates in, but I will suggest that the Executive considers Air Namibia as a candidate for equity partners and over the medium-term become less dependent on perpetual bail-outs. The airline can be transformed into a regional and/or international carrier or airline in cooperation with fellow stakeholders airlines of Botswana, Zambia, Zimbabwe, Angola as equity partners in a joint venture structure where they share regional and international routes. What I am trying to say is that each one has its own routes, each one has its own fleet, each one has its own way of operations, but if Air Namibia, for example, can fly on behalf of these countries that I mentioned to Europe or the UK or the Americas, they can then share the same revenue. All the citizens that fly that route will not go to South Africa, but come here and support their regional or national airlines, which is a joint venture between the many States. It will take some political will to consider such a strategy, but it may just make all airlines more competitive and profitable and this I leave as food for thought.

The Budget Achievements and Challenges: One of the challenges of TIPEEG implementation was suitable human resources, although the output of vocational training and technical education, as per the Minister's statement in Paragraph 96, increased to over 8,000 graduates. This situation begs the question: What type of graduates comes from our education investment?

To expand our economy and to take advantage of our mineral extraction, agricultural production and Tourism Sector, we are in desperate need of

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON BEZUIDENHOUDT**

advanced skills and knowledge in the form of locally produced human resources. As a strategy we must move away from is allowing too many consultants to come into the country who does not transfer skills to the locals. Our vocational and training education should provide these skills. Value addition in the various fields as a job creation strategy should start coming off the pages of policy and into the reality of production.

Honourable Geingob, the Minister of Trade and Industry, has given us a hint in this Chamber that during the motivation of his Ministry's Vote he will expand more on the industrial policy and our Education Sector should listen to that and take up their crucial role of producing competent and skilled human resources for that very same industrial policy.

The issue of our social safety nets was adequately spoken about in this House by previous contributors from all sides and for me it will suffice to say that we need to keep working on our social programmes as we expand our economy and also to prioritise social programmes in relation to some other initiatives.

Legislative Reform: As a Legislative House we must constantly look at potential bottlenecks and unfavourable legislation that may hamper the elusive goal of job creation. As a country we must get our people back to work. I seriously call on and encourage the Executive which is constitutionally charged to implement policies and programmes to leave no stone unturned in rethinking, re-engineering, re-orientating and re-prioritising some of our national policies, procedures and legislative frameworks with the sole aim and purpose of creating jobs without losing our principles.

The Executive should also consider embarking on an exercise of research to see if there are any provisions in both policy and legislation that may hamper the Private Sector from creating the much-needed jobs.

On the development of the expansion of our economy, I wish to say that our economy is for most parts an import or a resell or a retail economy as the biggest chunk, which has the net effect of exporting our cash as we need to buy somewhere else. As a country we should pursue an economic

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON BEZUIDENHOUDT**

policy that keeps, as far as possible, domestic financial resources in the country, while at the same time importing international cash through more exports of commodities and services. That is a long-term goal and the industrial policy may kick in and that can be some of our ideals.

The pre-Independence business model of specifically northern Namibia is a very good example if one takes into consideration that for the most part the movement of cash remained in the Region and circulated amongst households and amongst businesses. I pay, you employ and then the money just goes around and around within the same community. This was also the model used in Japan after the Second World War to build their economy and empower local and regional communities. This is something to think about and if possible, to pursue it.

Another way of expanding our economy is the aggressive expansion of our digital economy. A definition for “*digital economy*” is that it is based on ICT infrastructure, which Namibia has, to allow new opportunities and challenges for businesses and the Government or those economic and social activities that are enabled by the Information and Communication Technologies, such as the internet or mobile networks. There is a lot of activity but we do not do enough and there is an opportunity that we can do more.

In a couple of weeks’ time the much-awaited West-African Cable System (WACS) will go live and connect Namibia to the fastest optic fibre cable this country has ever seen. The country has massive opportunities waiting for us if we are innovative and courageous in our decision-making or policy formation and legislation. We need to develop or have national policies and programmes ready that will unlock the potential of WACS.

Internationally we are already in a favourable position to be an overland carrier for the Republic of Botswana. The Republic of Botswana is a partner in this cable together with the Republic of Namibia, so we are already exporting the data to and from Botswana to the rest of the world. Let us encourage our role-players in that market to connect Zambia, Angola and Zimbabwe and to generate the elusive jobs and the elusive revenue.

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON BEZUIDENHOUDT**

Domestically we have a unique opportunity to develop projects and services to be delivered via WACS that can generate additional revenue or taxes for the State, while at the same time getting our people back to work. I will relate very briefly some of the programmes and business ideas that can give us both the money and the jobs, the two things we are looking for.

We can, for example, establish a 24-hour call centre solution for the various global time zones, because we are uniquely situated between East and West and we have the infrastructure, we have the people and they only need to be trained to deliver that service for companies in different time zones.

We can also pursue regional and international application hosting through cloud computing for southern Africa. For example, we can host in Namibia the amazon.com or Facebook or Google or Oracle applications meant for southern Africa or for Africa. We are in that position. We can equally pursue international data hosting here in this country, because internationally they will not see the difference in New York once they want to get that information, because we have this 5 tera bits per second West-African Cable System.

We can investigate additional available mobile services that take advantage of Namibia's good coverage and the amount of mobile phone users in this country. There are an array of applications where entrepreneurs can make money and the State receive money from that. We can even establish data centres specifically for southern African banks and Namibian international customers. The only requirement in all of this would obviously be security, which we are in a position to supply.

The message here is the aggressive expansion of our digital economy for the dual benefit of additional tax generation and job creation. This will need an innovative legislative framework and policy development.

Another important aspect in this strategy is the speed of implementation. If we do not act fast, Ghana or even South Africa may be faster than us and then the opportunity will be lost. My personal appeal is to drastically

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON WITBOOI**

shorten the pipeline of decision-taking and cut out the suffocating bureaucracy without compromising good governance principles.

In conclusion, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I wish the Executive Branch of Government all the luck in the implementation of the planned 2012/2013 Financial Year programmes and I equally wish them a drastically improved citizens performance grading from, as it was reported, executive failure to executive success. I thank all of you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member. Honourable Witbooi.

HON WITBOOI: Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I take this opportunity to make my contribution to the ongoing Debate on the National Budget.

First of all, I want to thank the Minister of Finance, her Deputy Minister, the Director-General of the National Planning Commission and the staff for a well-presented Budget under the present economic circumstances. I further thank the Minister for presenting a Budget that attracts admiration from all sides of the House. Before I come to my contribution, allow me to thank the Ministry of Education under the leadership of Honourable Iyambo for appointing Life Skills teachers as from 2012. I hope and believe that the schools will use these teachers in order to uplift our education.

My contributions are on the issues of the N\$50 increase on the pension of old-aged people, TIPEEG and the performance of our national education system.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I would like to add my voice to those who welcomed the additional N\$50 to the monthly pension of our old people. We will slowly but surely reach N\$1,000.

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON WITBOOI**

TIPEEG is a well-intended programme that created many expectations at the time it was initiated, however it has not lived up to expectations. One key issue which should be noted here is that the pace at which TIPEEG is being implemented is simply too slow. I heard Honourable Jerry Ekandjo speaking about TIPEEG on the News, telling the Councillors they should work hard to improve so that money will not be returned to the Treasury. Honourable Speaker, to be honest, people are already frustrated about this TIPEEG programme and we should work on it.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I would also like to address the performance of our National Education Sector. I am pleased to note that education still remains the top priority in our Government with the provision to construct and upgrade educational facilities across the country. However, I note with concern two sectors under our education system that I feel should be adequately addressed, namely provision of adequate accommodation facilities for both the learners and the staff and adequate school buildings, uniform provision of teaching materials, for example textbooks.

The need of adequate accommodation facilities for teachers in the rural areas is very significant to the improvement of the quality of education in our country. It saddens me that although the Government made all efforts to renovate and build new facilities, very soon thereafter the facilities started to crumble and crack. Could it be a question of too much sand and too little cement in the construction mix or what is the problem there? Honourable Speaker, the quality of classrooms being built nowadays cannot be compared to the buildings built in the eighties. The Government is losing a lot of money and this is of great concern. Honourable Speaker, we want quality and I would therefore, like to appeal to the concerned authority to ensure that contractors awarded contracts to construct educational facilities have a clean track record in similar assignments and that regular inspections are undertaken during construction work to ensure that the facilities are built according to specifications.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, whereas we appreciate the recent efforts by the Millennium Challenge Account to provide Maths,

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON A TJONGARERO**

Science and English textbooks to schools, I do encourage the upgrading of studies in the country and the encouragement of learners to study specific subjects. This should be a uniform action, it should involve the provision of learning materials for all subjects studied in schools in the country and not only for science subjects.

Honourable Speaker, the storerooms are full of Science and Maths textbooks and we appreciate it, but in other subjects five to seven learners share books, which is of great concern to me. This is because different learners are gifted and talented in varying areas of academic performance for their future careers. I thank you and I support the Bill.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member. Honourable Tjongarero.

HON A TJONGARERO: Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I rise to make my contribution to the Debate on the *Appropriation Bill*. Allow me to congratulate the Minister of Finance, Honourable Saara Kuugongelwa-Amadhila, her Deputy, Honourable Calle Schlettwein, the Director-General of the National Planning Commission, Comrade Tom Alweendo, the Permanent Secretary of both institutions and the staff, as well as the Governor of our Central Bank for a job well done.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, it is a known fact that everybody wants funds, but very few are willing to pay tax. I hope we in Namibia will be in a position where all those who earn money and who are eligible to pay tax will do so, so that we can have more funds to do more for the country.

Honourable Speaker, it is disturbing to note that some of the Ministries request funds for vacancies and after receiving the allocations, do not fill the vacancies and those funds are returned to Treasury at the end of the Financial Year. One wonders how and on which basis the Budget was

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON A TJONGARERO**

made in the first place if the money could not be spent, yet we are faced with the problem of unemployment.

I also read in a news paper that TIPEEG money given to one of the Regions was not spent, yet we are faced with unemployment and poverty. TIPEEG is a very good programme, but not known by those who are to benefit from it. People do not know how to access it, where to go and how to go about it. Some are under the impression that they must come up with projects and project proposals. Let us all make an effort to inform everybody about TIPEEG, especially where to go and how to go about it.

Honourable Speaker, on affordability of land and housing, I am of the opinion that the different layers in the structures dealing with housing and all the services make it more expensive and unaffordable for all of us. Let us do away with the middle layer and all of them be different divisions under the setup of a municipality.

On job creation and poverty alleviation, we as Namibians must start manufacturing goods for our own and also for export purposes. As a sovereign State we cannot rely on imports from other countries only. As long as we keep on importing we will not be able to create enough jobs for our people. How can we talk about industrialisation and Vision 2030 if we keep on importing everything or most of the commodities from other countries? We are at a stage that we are not only importing commodities but also human resources. We can plant fig trees and start producing fig jam. We are importing it, why not export it? It will create the much-needed jobs. Public-Private Partnership is needed and must be strengthened if we want to become an industrialised Nation.

Honourable Speaker, one gets the impression that we are not doing enough on the implementation of development projects. During the Second Reading of the *Appropriation Bill* of 2010 we said that the implementation of the development projects must be accelerated. Here we are in 2012 and we are still saying the same thing. The question is; what is it we are not doing well to implement and do what we are supposed to do?

27 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON !NAWASES-TAEYELE

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, we can address poverty alleviation if resources can be shared in a balanced manner. If the previously disadvantaged population can have ownership of resources, Namibia, with her small Nation and vast mineral resources, can aggressively deal with poverty alleviation.

With regard to human resources, one cannot understand that twenty years down the line we still do not have the necessary human resources. I want to thank the Minister for allocating a large amount for education in the Budget, although not enough. Talking about education, why can we not manufacture our own school uniforms? It will create jobs and who says shoes for the schools cannot be *velskoene*? We can manufacture our own school shoes.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, my concern is mostly on three issues amongst all the others and they are job creation, poverty alleviation and sustainable development. Once again, thank you, Honourable Minister, I support the *Appropriation Bill* and I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable !Nawases-Taeyele.

HON !NAWASES-TAEYELE: Thank you, Honourable Speaker, thank you, Honourable Members. Let me take this opportunity and thank the Minister of Finance and all the stakeholders who were involved in the drafting of this very important Budget. I take note, Honourable Saara Kuugongelwa-Amadhila, that now we are living in a world of scarcity, therefore it is important to focus on “*Doing More with Less*”.

My points of concerns are the triple challenges of unemployment, poverty and inequality that persist despite the progress made by our Government. Women and youth continue to suffer the most from these challenges. With these three challenges that we will face head-on and that are in line with the Government’s approach of strengthening domestic revenue collection

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON !NAWASES-TAEYELE**

and administration to address fiscal constraints, there is a need to strike a balance between these three strategies because they are not mutually exclusive. Government alone cannot solve these challenges faced by the country, but working together with all other stakeholders towards common solutions we will improve the situation.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I applaud the Minister of Mines and Energy for consolidating Namibia's resource integration as this is also in line with the African dream of one Africa, one Voice.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:40

HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:10

HON !NAWASES-TAEYELE: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. I was saying we must realise the African dream of one Africa, one Voice. That is the only way of surviving socially, politically and economically in the 21st century and Pan-African Parliament is resolute on that.

Economic trade amongst the African countries should also be pursued with renewed vigour. We as Namibians should also exploit investment opportunities in the African continent and foster economic integration especially amongst neighbouring countries.

The proposed introduction of the SME Bank under the Ministry of Trade and Industry is a welcome gesture. This will help address SMEs who are key to economic transformation, in developing economies in the face of the current financial meltdown. Many SMEs die in the first year of inception and of those that have survived, many are on the verge of collapse due to very high and unaffordable interest rates from the banks. We, the Government, should cushion SMEs for sustainability. This is a

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON !NAWASES-TAEYELE**

step in the right direction. Let us popularise this institution and at the same time monitor and evaluate them in order to make sure that the suggested outputs are reached.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, big thanks once again to the Minister of Finance for the increment to the Vote of the Ministry of Youth, National Service, Sport and Culture. I am confident that the plight of young people are taken seriously by our Government. The programme of National Youth Credit Scheme is a strong sign of the deliberate State policy of the SWAPO Party Government to empower young people through micro-business enterprises. My only hope is that we do not impose stringent terms and conditions on these funds of the youth. In most cases the stringent terms, like level of education and proof of training in entrepreneurship by way of certificates, are the main causes that render this programme useless and channelling of these funds through commercial banks with high interest rates is also a disincentive. Funds must be made available at reasonable interest rates and capacity-building by way of training should also be implemented. As the saying goes, by investing in the youth, we invest in the future. Youth empowerment should be underpinned by Namibia's flourishing economy.

Honourable Speaker, all Namibians must be able to have access to funding through our natural resources so as to enable the Namibian economy to become self-sustaining without foreign funding. This will increase the Government's commitment to buy locally manufactured goods and services to stimulate employment and production. As a Nation, we cannot continue to go to bed hungry in the land of plenty where a few are rich at the expense of the entire population.

In conclusion, Honourable Speaker, allow me to quote the wise words of the founding President of ANC Women's League, Comrade Charlotte Maseke: *"This work is not for yourselves. Kill that spirit of self and do not live above your people, but leave with them. If you can rise, bring someone with you."* I thank you.

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON JANKOWSKI**

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member. Honourable Jankowski.

HON JANKOWSKI: Honourable Speaker and Honourable Members of the House, I would like to start my comments and contribution on the 2012/2013 Budget on a congratulatory note. It is my view that we will never walk a perfect fine line with the budgetary exercise of a developing country, especially in the middle of so many global economic challenges and other international stability issues of which Third World countries are the primary bearers of these consequences.

Our efforts are also made difficult by Namibia's classification as a middle-income country, whereby we are deprived of the opportunities and incentives which other developing Nations are enjoying.

It is against this background that the Finance Minister must be congratulated for a number of things:

Firstly, for the timing of the Budget submission for Debate. The fact that this Budget was submitted earlier than the anticipated date is a significant sign of improvement in itself, regardless of the extent to which its contents and provisions might be debatable.

The earlier submission allows the beneficiaries and the implementing agents with the necessary grace period to plan for what to do with the new allocations, and to make provision for adequate timeframe to execute the outcomes which are budgeted for.

Secondly, the Budget contains an element of a strategic shift in its ambitions in that some of its key themes, like TIPEEG, have been reconstructed to achieve better outputs. The growth of Revenue in comparison with our GDP from 29.1% in the previous year to the current 34.6% needs a very special and positive acknowledgement.

In the same vein, the decrease of our expenditure in comparison with the GDP from 40.3% in 2011/2012 to 39.2% is a milestone in itself, no matter

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON JANKOWSKI**

how small its impact or significance on the overall economic and financial performance index.

All other items in the key Budget outcomes have been reflected to have a significantly positive movement according to our expectations, ranging from Budget balance, gross debt percentage to Medium Term Expenditure Framework (METF).

On the social significance of the Budget, I wish to remark, Honourable Members of the House, that while there is a general view that we could have done better, it is a good thing that the old-age pension grants were increased with an N\$50.00, rather than not at all.

The impact and the significance of that improvement is always open to debate, and it is our call to conduct self-assessment in this regard, before the next increase would seem as if it was induced from negative public reactions and opinions.

Also, there is a view from bona fide youth leadership institutions like the National Youth Council, that the Budget is not doing enough to cater for the needs of the youth, but a different view for the concerns raised can also ally these concerns to some degree, though it might not fully respond to every burning question:

- The ever-increasing Budget for education in this country is geared at providing tenable conditions for our youth to obtain the required education to become self-sufficient and become productive citizens in the long run.
- Likewise, improved budgetary allocations for the police, defence and correctional services always cater for the recruitment of new staff members, thus budgeting for direct employment opportunities in the Government, which is mostly targeting our youth.

To quell further doubts about our commitment to the future of the youth in the country, the increase of the Namibia Student Financial Assistance Fund (NSFAF) allocation with 32.1% to up to N\$297

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON JANKOWSKI**

million, while expanded funding have been provided for UNAM's School of Medicine. The Line Ministry's National School Feeding Programme, is a serious indication that we want to keep our children in schools and tertiary institutions, an exercise which cannot be divorced from the overall youth empowerment initiatives, especially if one has regard to the assessment reports that the Feeding Programme, which wanted to reach a target of 200,000 children by 2014, already stands at the 224,000 milestone.

- In this regard, it is clear that we are achieving and at times exceeding some of our budgetary goals, no matter how small. They are all significant; otherwise they would not receive a cent from the National Budget.

On the Budget's relevance to National High level statements:

Honourable Speaker, it is important that our Budget is clearly aligned with the national high level statements, including but not limited to key national goals like: the Millennium Development Goals, climate change initiatives, of late TIPEEG and most importantly Vision 2030 and the NDPs.

I am informed from this presentation that we are pretty much in pursuit of national compliance with NDP4, which is now under launch. I congratulate the Honourable Minister of Finance for weaving her way around the NDP3 journey, while it is the duty of the Government's foot soldiers at Local and Regional Authority level to check compliance targets in their respective Regions and Constituencies, and alert us if there are any shortcomings in this regard.

While I may have hesitations that some Constituencies may be saddled with unmet NDP goals of the previous years, it will be unfair to blame Government at parliamentary level for acting on reports and directives received from second and third tier Government levels. If however, we are not following instructions from grassroots development properly, in terms of requests for funds and assistance on time, we will need a serious self-introspection at Cabinet level.

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON JANKOWSKI**

Regarding the 2030 journey, we are making positive movement in this Budget in terms of stepping up provision for quality education in science and other tertiary disciplines.

In this regard, I am a bit concerned that we did not empower the Office of the Prime Minister with adequate funding to set up a planning, directing and monitoring agency, or a Vision 2030 Centre, which would liaise with, and monitor delivery targets by various Ministries and other key stakeholders like the National Planning Commission. Such a function would also make our Budget, which has already been stretched into so many positive dimensions, even more meaningful.

Honourable Members, in line with our Vision 2030 goals to become an industrialised and self-sustaining Nation by the stated deadline, I anticipated that we would have agreed in this Honourable House to make provision for sufficiently increased allocations to the Trade Ministry to speed up the growth of SMEs and the Industrial Sector, given that we are currently an import-driven economy.

Given that we only allocated N\$15 million, this falls short of international benchmarks where about 40% of the US economy, the largest in the world, is driven by the Small and Medium Enterprise Sector, while about 36% of Africa's largest economy, South Africa, is accounted for by the SME Sector.

We still have the opportunity to reconstruct and redefine programmes like TIPEEG, which have money allocated to them, to divert money into important SME growth and industrialisation drive to achieve our long-term goals, without necessarily impacting on the short-run objectives of the TIPEEG itself.

In line with this call, I would share my concurrence with the National Youth Council, and would like to see a tenfold increase in allocation to the National Youth Credit Scheme up to N\$100 million in the next Debate, to enable graduate youth who are not in the formal employment sector to access the much needed funds, and use their knowledge to go into hi-tech business opportunities derived from the growth in the ICT Sector and the

27 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON SWARTZ

construction industries in this country, manufacturing, consulting and other ventures that will turn them from job hunters to job creators.

Lastly, I am disappointed that our Budget does not aim to review Government funding models and approach towards Local Authorities, which are in financial struggles all over the country. If we are willing to subsidise loss-making Parastatals, we must seriously revisit our stance of leaving the Local Authorities to swim it out alone in the sea-wave of poverty and unemployment where communities cannot afford the basic services like water, electricity and other amenities, thus forcing the Local Authorities into involuntary debt trap with bulk suppliers like NamPower and NamWater. My reasoning is based on the premise that our failure or success as Government is not measured by the performance of these Parastatals, but rather by grass-root opinion of what we do at Local Authority levels.

Regardless of these important oversights, which may be addressed by future Debates and engagements, we have made giant leaps into the future and in the right direction, Comrades and Members of the House.

This opinion is highlighted by some key positive reviews received about this Budget from some independent quarters, which one can thus confirm without being comradely biased. Some local economic analysts and critics praised you for being transparent and accommodating past criticisms in your approach. That speaks of professionalism, maturity and a sense of responsibility which we must embrace in a democratic society like ours. I salute you for a job well done and herewith put my weight behind this Budget. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member. Honourable Swartz.

HON SWARTZ: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I also want to congratulate our Minister of Finance,

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON SWARTZ**

the Deputy Minister and the support team for a job well done.

All of us can witness that there is a tremendous improvement of the Budget. We witness it year after year. Whatever we say, there is room for improvement. We live in a changing world, issues of accountability and monitoring are very important. Let all of us support the SWAPO Government so that we can achieve our goals and objectives, as set out in our policy documents.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, Government avails resources for job creation, the Private Sector must play its role and assist Government to create jobs for our people. I am of the opinion that to create sustainable jobs, we have to venture into manufacturing. If there are manufacturing companies, they should be supported financially so as to expand their businesses and employ more people.

The Government can think of giving incentives to manufacturing companies that employ more people so as to curb the scenarios of retrenchments that has become so regular.

We should also think of producing more of our goods locally rather than importing goods from abroad.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, Tender Board is responsible for the allocation of tenders and it will be good if in future our youth, women and SMEs are accommodated in the allocation of tenders.

Tenders should be decentralised so that our people at grassroots level can also benefit. Our people who are given tenders should also learn to deliver quality and on time. We cannot claim entitlement to tenders because we are SMEs and just not deliver.

The Government has to empower our youth with necessary skills so that they can sustain themselves economically. This could reduce the level of unemployment in our country.

Even with the establishment of the SME Bank, we need to give enough

27 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON SIMATAA

training and monitor our clients if we want to succeed.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, we have to establish effective awareness programmes for climate change for our people to avoid natural disasters such as floods in the north and north east. People must know what the contributing factors towards climate change are, such as greenhouse emissions, deforestation and desertification.

In conclusion, in the Budget speech the Minister made it clear that: *“Our policies did not have their expected impact; this should incite us to consider alternative approaches.”* We need to go back to the drawing board before we consider new approaches, so that we know whether the existing policies are not working, or whether it is the implementation or whether it is deliberate moves of failing the system.

Performance agreements will be the answer to all these types of problems. I support the Bill and I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member. Honourable Simataa.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. Honourable Members, let me join those who spoke before me to say well done to the Minister of Finance, the Director-General of the National Planning Commission, my Colleague, the Deputy Minister of Finance and their able team for once again crafting a solid Budget, as has been the case over the years.

In spite of some criticism of the Budget advanced from certain quarters which, in my view, should be appreciated, the Budget under consideration responds favourably to a host of social and economic challenges facing our country which, I hasten to point out, cannot be fully addressed in one Financial Year, let alone one medium-term cycle. With that in mind, I

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON SIMATAA**

would like to make the following very short observations on three issues, one being TIPEEG:

As an honest Government we have acknowledged that concerted, but decisive efforts will have to be made in the coming Financial Year to realise the effective implementation of this programme. Lessons learnt during the first phase of implementation should and must be fully utilised to shape up and accelerate the seemingly pedestrian implementation process. The introduction of the programme has raised employment hopes of a multitude of fellow unemployed Namibians. Failure to implement, therefore, is not an option and should never be an option.

Equally, due care is called for in the process of awarding tenders under this programme. It is imperative to monitor and verify employment figures submitted by every successful tenderer to ensure that the undertakings made to create X-number of jobs at the time of tendering, are scrupulously adhered to. I am, therefore, suggesting that a comprehensive monitoring framework be devised to track progress made in implementing the programme. In so doing, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, we will weed out tenderers whose sole motive in participating in the programme is to line their pockets at the expense of creating the much-needed jobs.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, statistical data generated in this manner will form the basis of our reporting on the number of jobs created. While TIPEEG should not be regarded as the messiah to the current unemployment situation, its successful implementation will undoubtedly serve a springboard to fend the spectre of unemployment in our country. Yes, TIPEEG is a drop of goodness in the vast ocean of unemployment. There is no doubt that given the high unemployment situation in our country, job creation efforts are likely to be a marathon which demands greater endurance and sustainability.

Vocational Education and Training: The sizeable allocation made to vocational education and training is highly appreciated provided it is appropriately utilised. The allocation has potential to equip the masses of unemployed youth with skills needed to drive economic activities, while

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON SIMATAA**

at the same time improving the prospects to set up their own businesses. Hopefully – and this is my prayer – our youth and parents alike will address the prevailing damaging perception of looking at vocational education and training as secondary, because in my view it is not and I think it has never been.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, at this juncture let me reiterate what may have become one of my traditional pleas during this time of the year. That is the need to conclude the long overdue formulation of the National Human Resources Development Plan. As we are all aware, Namibia's global competitiveness has been and continues to be severely constrained by the lack of human resources. At the same time, our industries have repeatedly bemoaned the fact that skills acquired by graduates at institutions of higher learning are not in sync with what they require. The question is, and this is a rhetoric question that I tend to pose to myself: How do we as a Nation respond to these and many other human capital challenges if we do not have a National Human Resources Development Plan? Yes, I am aware of repeated promises made to conclude the formulation of this plan. However, I pray that 2012 will be the year in which we put this matter, which is at the heart of our Nation's prosperity, to rest.

My last contribution is on nationhood and national pride. Past occurrences – and they seem to be continuing – clearly point to the urgency for us to hasten the implementation of this programme. Evidence at our disposal indicates that if we do not, our Nation is likely to be torn by an avalanche of divisive tendencies. Our rights as individuals to belong to a family as the smallest unit, to a community, to a given ethnic group or to a given Political Party of our choice – and this is meant for Honourable Nyamu – should and must not be the source of our division as a Nation. By the way, it is these entities that should form the solid basis of a united Namibia. Our diversity should instead act as the glue that binds our people together and not to divide us. The nationhood and national pride campaign, therefore in my view, should become the business of each and every Member of Parliament, every leader in Namibia. Apart from inculcating certain values in our people, this programme has huge potential to educate our nationals to value and be

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MANOMBE-NCUBE**

supportive, if not loyal to locally produced products and services. Our insatiable appetite as Namibians for foreign produced products and services seriously impairs our efforts to develop local industries and/or develop an adequate base of local expertise.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, if we are not careful, we run the risk of becoming a Nation whose development and prosperity will continue to be at the mercy of others, a situation I am sure is not desirable.

With those few comments, Honourable Speaker, I advance my support to the Bill. Thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member. Next is Honourable Ncube.

HON MANOMBE-NCUBE: Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, allow me to join the others in congratulating the Minister of Finance, Honourable Saara Kuugongelwa-Amadhila, and her entire team for the well-crafted and well-articulated 2012/2013 Budget Statement, whose theme is also well-spelled out as “*Fiscal Sustainable and Job-Creating Growth- Doing More with Less.*” Without hesitation I vehemently concur with the theme that it is through job creation and doing more with less that we can achieve fiscal sustainability.

Let me hasten to say, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, congratulations to Namibia for the 22 years of Independence in an environment where political stability, peace and prosperity are the order of the day. Indeed, the road to Independence and to the attainment of 22 years has not all been rosy, but success does not come on a silver platter like manna from heaven. Rather it is the ability, bravery and courage to face challenges, deal with them accordingly and soldiering on. So, hats off to Namibia for affording us to be where we are today.

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MANOMBE-NCUBE**

I would like to pay tribute to the Minister of Education, Dr Abraham Iyambo, who is not feeling well and currently on sick leave, and express my sincere gratitude for the hard work and the job well done in his Ministry and I wish him a quick recovery. More so, allow me to point out some crucial issues that are mind-boggling.

I would like to start with the policy on pregnancy. Let us first think about the hardship that a pregnant woman generally endures – the morning sickness, the swinging moods, the nausea, name it and let alone a young woman who is just starting. I was also informed that sometimes it is so distractive for other students in the same class with this pregnant girl, therefore it is advisable that the pregnant girl should stay at home and concentrate on her pregnancy, attend the antenatal clinic and not place additional demands on the school. Then maybe a year after delivery she can return to school after undergoing intensive counselling, especially now after the appointment of Life Skills teachers.

I would like to appreciate the efforts that the Government makes to support orphans and vulnerable children. However, in addition to the grants to these children, there is also a great need to support these children through mentoring and psycho-social counselling, for instance, how to deal with their teenage time and adolescence and also to be advised about primary health care, reproductive health, etcetera. Without these the girl-child, being naturally more vulnerable than boy-child, continue to suffer abuse and unwanted pregnancies.

At this particular juncture, allow me to salute and applaud the SWAPO Party-led Government for owning up to their social responsibility and fulfilling their undertaking in its Party Manifesto through the payment and subsequent increment of the old-age pension to the elderly persons and people with disabilities, thus ploughing back into the community where we all come from. They made us who we are today, therefore I applaud our Government for that, as many fellow African countries cannot afford it. To that effect, may we all pause for a second and answer the question on how many African countries are paying pensions to their old citizens?

As much as this Budget is well tailor-made towards economic growth and

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MANOMBE-NCUBE**

job creation, it needs to be more gender responsive. The following could be taken into consideration:

- High rate of gender-based violence in our society;
- Violence prevention efforts to be a key part of any strategy to eliminate violence against women and the girl-child;
- Community should be provided with information and skills needed to take action against the harmful impact of violence against women, families and communities;
- Challenging attitudes that promote men's power over women and acceptance of violence as a legitimate way to resolve conflicts.

Efforts to reduce violence against women must, therefore, be intrinsically linked to women's political, social and economic empowerment and must be considered within the context of changing gender norms and increasing women's human rights.

Therefore it is my wish, hope and prayer that each and every Ministry takes the gender issue with the seriousness it deserves since it is a cross-cutting issue and I would urge each Ministry to channel a portion of its Budget towards issues of gender.

Then I wish to deal with the strengthening of both formal and community-based justice systems. We must improve the Justice Sectors in response to violence against women, particularly the traditional justice system which has been less noteworthy. In the absence of a Civil Court, Community Courts should be given the mandate to issue an immediate protection order for actual threatened or attempted violence.

The improvement of police response to violence cases, especially against women: Police response to violence remains an area of concern. Despite the extensive training carried out, the National Police should coordinate training on various topics related to domestic violence and other

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MANOMBE-NCUBE**

legislation pertaining to gender equality. It should take the trainer's approach, expecting that the superintendents pass on the knowledge to inspectors, inspectors to sergeants, all the way down the chain of command.

I am concerned about the modest successes in the implementation of the law on domestic violence due to the increase in the number of domestic violence cases being reported every day. The challenge of implementation remains enormous. However, I take cognisance of the diversity of languages spoken in rural locations as well as the poor infrastructure connecting remote villages to their nearest police station. This is a big challenge especially for women who will go from home where they may have been raped, to go to the Police and then on their way to the Police, being raped again.

Proper policies need to be introduced for the Police in handling domestic violence cases to discourage partners from withdrawing complaints against abusive husbands and wives due to pressure by the abuser or his or her family. I believe this will strengthen and also remind them that they are legally restricted to withdraw cases, as they are still inclined to send victims home to reconcile, especially with women. (Intervention)

**HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT,
HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:** I want the Honourable Member to repeat as I want to understand properly. You mentioned that a person is raped and when she goes to the Police, she is again raped. Can you substantiate that somebody went to complain to the Police and was raped?

HON MANOMBE-NCUBE: On their way to the Police because of the distances.

I was saying that the Police must be restricted from allowing the

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON MANOMBE-NCUBE**

withdrawal of cases, because they are still inclined to send victims home to reconcile, especially with women, and then the story is so sensational when it comes to women.

Statistics and data on people with disabilities for inclusive development: Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, there is a great need to improve data and statistics on disability. Efforts to make persons with disability and their barriers count. People with disabilities are poorly described and lumped into a general category of vulnerable groups because the focus is on individuals and not general social barriers.

Article 31 of the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities is a stand-alone provision on statistics. The information collected in accordance with this article shall be disaggregated as appropriate and used to help assess, identify and address the barriers faced by persons with disability in exercising their rights. It provides an opportunity to develop this instrument further, particularly to ensure that social and other barriers are adequately taken into account.

Measuring disability helps to tackle obstacles and challenges and gives a better understanding of disability issues, built on reliable statistics. It also helps policy-makers to promote disability-inclusive development at national level and improve the situation.

The Ministry of Health and Social Services, which is the custodian of disability issues, should utilise the Millennium Development Goals as an opportunity to improve data collection as well as involve persons with disabilities and their representative organisations in discussions on this matter. As much as the Ministry of Health and Social Services is the custodian of disability issues, I would also urge the other Ministries to address disability issues, as they are cross-cutting issues and implementation of disability policy is also expected from all these Ministries.

My sincere gratitude goes to the Ministry of Finance for providing allocations for emergency relief for people affected by natural disasters. However, it is my wish and plea that such allocations and the Disaster

27 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON LUCAS

Management Team also prioritise people with disabilities as they are already suffering and the natural disasters exacerbate their suffering. Mechanisms should be put in place to ensure the prioritisation of people with disabilities in cases of natural disasters in the country. There ought to be special programmes that are aimed at assisting them to overcome their ordeal.

TIPEEG is a great intervention with great potential to shun unintended results tremendously. Thanks to the Ministry and the Minister of Finance for providing a hefty Budget for TIPEEG. Limiting factors have also been identified however. What mechanisms have been put in place to ensure its smooth implementation? The achievement of intended objectives through identified impediments that will be addressed. There is more to successful programme implementation than just money. For instance, there are many requirements, which include human resources, viable policies, etcetera. The question is, what is being done with the allocated funds to ensure the creation of at least one hundred thousand jobs and justify the close to 6 billion?

In conclusion, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I would like to once again express my sincere gratitude to the Minister of Finance and the SWAPO Party-led Government for the marvellous job well done. Let us all put heads together in doing more with less and creating jobs to achieve fiscal sustainability. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Deputy Minister of Defence, Honourable Lempy Lucas.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF DEFENCE: Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I am taking the Floor to add my voice to my Colleagues' who spoke before me in congratulating the Minister of Finance, her staff as well as the Director-General of the National Planning Commission and his team for having worked around the clock to ensure that the *Appropriation Bill* is tabled before Parliament earlier than the

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON LUCAS**

previous years and I hope the same trend will continue in the years ahead.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, allow me to commend the Founding President and Father of the Namibian Nation, Dr Sam Shafishuna Nujoma, the founder of the vision for Namibia, Vision 2030, whose primary objective is to industrialise the country by the year 2030 with concomitant improvement in the quality of life of every citizen. For making progress in our march towards this vision, we would need to meet successfully a number of strategic challenges as follows:

1. Strengthening of democracy in all aspects;
2. Building a diversified robust and dynamic economy;
3. Reducing unemployment significantly;
4. Improving old-age pensions;
5. Resolving the land question;
6. Providing quality service to all, including education, health, electricity, clean water and housing;
7. Improving the nutritional status of citizens;
8. Proactively seeking innovative solutions to address the problem of HIV/AIDS infections;
9. Establishing a moral and ethical society where violence, drunkenness, crime, corruption and nepotism are done away with.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, as much as I acknowledged and accepted that we are moving in the right direction, I am concerned about the pace which we have taken to address the abovementioned strategic challenges. I am aware that our Public resources and human talents are insufficient. Our citizens are expecting more, their aspirations are high and their patience is running out. As Parliamentarians this is not

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON LUCAS**

the time to play politics in order to score political gains, we need to take a robust action to address these strategic challenges facing our people.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, many of us were there when Vision 2030 was launched and we know for sure that it will not happen by itself. It needs concerted efforts by all Members of Parliament, irrespective of where you sit in this House, if we are to stand there in 2030 and proudly proclaim that we have achieved the objectives of Vision 2030.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, as a lifelong youth, I would like to commend the Minister of Finance for having allocated a reasonable amount to the Ministry of Youth, National Service, Sport and Culture. As we know that the youth are our hope and our future, the Government will continue to build and care for the leaders of tomorrow by empowering them with the necessary skills and providing them with opportunities for economic growth.

Honourable Speaker, allow me at this juncture to commend His Excellency Hifikepunye Pohamba, President of the Republic of Namibia, for having commissioned the National Youth Service Board recently. The National Youth Service has broad objectives that are not known to many youths in Namibia and I want to call upon the National Youth Service Board to popularise the National Youth Service programme and its objectives to the majority of youths, including those who live in far remote areas of our country. This is the only way that more youth can access and benefit from the National Youth Service programmes.

Honourable Speaker, likewise I would like to express my dissatisfaction on the issue of unfilled posts in Offices, Ministries and Government Agencies. As expressed by other Members of this august House, I am suggesting that there should be a benchmark to compel Accounting Officers to fill posts budgeted for in order to discontinue the practice of returning unutilised money to the Treasury at the end of the Financial Year. As they say, Honourable Speaker, that credit should be given where it is due. The only Agency which is not a culprit in this exercise is the Office of the Auditor-General which has managed to fill all the vacancies

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON LUCAS**

that were budgeted for and I hope this best practice by the Office of the Auditor-General will be emulated. Well done, Auditor-General!

On the Transport Sector, Honourable Speaker, I wish to commend the Minister of Finance for having allocated resources to the Transport Sector aimed at developing and rehabilitating national roads. However, it is disturbing to note that some of the companies which were awarded the tenders to rehabilitate and build roads are producing substandard results. I am suggesting that the Ministry of Works and Transport should introduce road inspectors, if not catered for, to evaluate the work done by those companies from stage one to the final stage in order for the Government to get value for money.

To conclude my intervention, Honourable Speaker, I want to touch on the Defence Budget, which is dear to my heart. Honourable Members, I want to refute the persistent critics of the Defence Budget who always appear to be negative about the Defence Budget and see nothing positive about it.

Again this Financial Year, these perpetual Defence Budget critics have jumped at the chance to criticise the Defence Budget with revisionist analysis and using the traditional media, as it has been the case in the past Financial Years. I am advising them to at least base their criticism on evidence that Defence is being allocated money which it does not deserve. One thing they could do is to have a look at our plans to see the results for the past Financial Years and I am sure their conclusions will not be as baseless as they now sound.

The Defence Budget is allocated based on sound plans which are approved by Cabinet and Treasury. This Budget is matching the needs of the Namibian Defence Force and its mission to possess adequate capacity to defend the people, territorial integrity and national interest of Namibia as a constitutional mandate.

The Government of the Republic of Namibia always takes into account other Social Sectors before allocating money to the Defence Force and does in no way deny any other Sector the money, as pretended by the critics of the Defence Budget.

27 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON NAMBAHU

Lastly, most of the criticism shows little knowledge on how the Ministry operates. We are equipping our Defence Force to defend ourselves in case this may be necessary and not doing so to attack anyone. I want to reassure the Namibian Nation, Honourable Speaker, that the money allocated to the Ministry of Defence is strictly used for the benefit of this country to safeguard peace and stability for all our citizens.

With these few remarks, I support the Appropriation Bill. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: May I ask a question? My dear sister, I want to know from you whether you have tanks, armoured personnel carriers or some aircrafts which are just destroyed on the ground even before attempting to advance or to protect your country. What is the point of buying more tanks if they are destroyed on the ground? Is it not better to move away from buying these offensive weapons and maybe concentrate on ballistic missiles?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF DEFENCE: Honourable Speaker, I understand the sentiments expressed by the Foreign Minister. As time goes I think our people will learn what are the benefits derived from allocating resources to the Ministry of Defence. I thank you very much, Honourable Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Nambahu.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Honourable Speaker, thank you very much for affording me an opportunity to add my voice to those who have congratulated the team that drew up the Budget, namely the Ministry of Finance and the National Planning Commission. I really

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON NAMBAHU**

think that their efforts to do better every time should be commended.

I should then also make reference to some of the issues that have been raised during this Budget, one of them being TIPEEG. I am a very happy man when it comes to TIPEEG. It has shown what the problems are that are compounding our system, namely the lack of capacity. One should really look at the bigger picture.

When Cuba was challenged with an embargo, they had to act fast to come up with initiatives to rise to the challenge. When TIPEEG threw so much money into the economy, the planning potential of our Private Sector came to be questioned, whether we have the capacity in the country to absorb and make use of this money. To those who believe in direct materialism it is the source of contradiction that is actually the source of development. Therefore, when you have these kinds of problems, it propels you into thinking and finding solutions, because you now know that you do not have the capacity in the country, rather than just saying the Private Sector must do this and that while they do not have the capacity. It is in that context that I am a happy man that we will be able to rise to the challenge.

We have seen what has happened in South Africa when they were put under sanctions by the United Nations. They really accelerated, went into fast-forward and then started keeping their eyes on the ball and the shortcomings they have. I think nothing is achieved without enthusiasm and we should not be demoralised, but see the opportunities and come up with serious process re-engineering.

That said; I would like to refer to some of the issues raised by the previous Colleagues. Taking from the speech by the Finance Minister, one of them is the call for value for money and doing more with less. I feel that should be the motto, but are we really getting value for money when it comes to issues such as road construction? Is it true that we are really doing more with less? Is there something known as a Namibian Institute of Road Contractors? If so, where is it situated? Do members of the public have access thereto and what standards do they apply? Who are the site representatives of the principal agent, the Government? Do the

27 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON NAMBAHU

workmanship and materials conform to prescription in each and every case? Who is proposing the names of site representatives of those to be engaged? Is it the contractors or the principal agent? How and by whom are the bills of quantity drawn up, implemented, monitored and how is compliance enforced?

Coming to a portion of a road where I usually pass and I know many Members would know that road in the area of Oningo and Onethindi, there are always camps there and that road is being renovated continuously. Is that value for money? Are we doing more with less in these instances? Our roads are our pride and we used to say, “*come to Namibia*” because of our good infrastructure. Are these colleagues expatriots? Why do I want to take a tender that I cannot handle? This is something we need to look into and I want to commend the President that when the road in the South was washed away, we acted swiftly and with capacity and we solved that problem. I do not know who gave the President that kind of rating while he has acted swiftly in some of these instances and really deserved applauding from all patriotic-minded Namibians.

How come that the relevant Parliamentary Committee never summons these people to explain to the public and the House what is taking place there? I am not criticising a person, I am criticising an issue, a defect that all of us should be concerned about. (Interjection). The Government should be applauded, especially for having caught the thieves at your shop, Mr Moongo. (Intervention)

HON MOONGO: Is the Honourable Member aware that Parliamentary Committees have no power to take persons who have misused fund to Court?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: We were in the same Parliamentary Committee, Honourable Member, and they have the power

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON NAMBAHU**

to summon people. We probably just do not make use of these powers.

Lastly, let me just refer to some of the points made by Members of the Opposition and I am going to read verbatim from one Honourable Member and we will see who it is. *“It is the considered view of RDP that in order to achieve sustainable long-term growth, two key elements are required: (a) You need vision, which SWAPO has lost. (b) You need critical discerning supporters. Governing the SWAPO Party way has become entrenched. I even dare to say, using some of her eloquent terminology, it has become structured. There no longer is a vision for an independent prosperous Nation, there is only a view of who benefits and how much. We present the Budget in such a way that it appears to benefit the majority. The SWAPO Party-led Government is more concerned with maintaining the mirage of growth than with the real outcome of how the huge Government resources benefit every Namibian.”* And listen to this: *“The SWAPO Party-led Government is not really concerned with the poor citizen, it is only concerned with leading the blindfolded to make sure they always vote for their benefactor.”* I wanted this statement to be withdrawn and I was not afforded the opportunity because I think my Members did not hear the insult.

I, therefore, would like to remind the Honourable Member of how many *“blindfolded”* there are in this country. In 1990 during the Constituent Assembly election, South West Africa Peoples Organisation got 384,567 votes from the *“blindfolded”* that you are talking about. Comrade Sam Nujoma got 370,452 votes from the *“blindfolded.”* In 1994, the South West Africa Peoples Organisation got 361,800 votes from the *“blindfolded”*. In December 1999, Sam Nujoma got 414,096 votes from the *“blindfolded.”* The South West Africa Peoples Organisation got 480,174 from the *“blindfolded.”* Candidate Hifikepunye Pohamba in 2004 got 625,605 votes from the *“blindfolded.”* The South West Africa Peoples Organisation got 620,787. In the next election Hifikepunye Pohamba got 611,241 votes. Now let me see how many are those who were not *“blindfolded.”* Only 88,000 out of that number. How do apples compare with melons here?

When you are approached by people whom you refer to as *“blindfolded”*,

27 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON NAMBAHU

tell them nicely that they are “*blindfolded*”, they have nothing to do with you, your Party is for those who are educated. It stems from that practice of saying you need to be discerning, you need to be critical, as if all our masses and these figures I have quoted here are all illiterate.

Therefore, come election time, it is very important for you to know where to vote and to reject those who insult you when the time is right to do so. Thank you very much.

HON NYAMU: On a Point of Information. Honourable Speaker, I want to give some of my Colleagues the background history of “*blindfoldedness*” and I will start with the early formation of SWAPO. (Interjections).

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Nyamu, sit down. Can somebody out of this noise tell me why Honourable Nyamu should not take the Floor according to the Rules?

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Honourable Speaker, I think Nyamu should not take the Floor because there was no one on the Floor. The Honourable Member concluded his speech and then he rose on a Point of Information. According to the Rules that cannot be done, unless we invent new Rules.

HON SPEAKER: We are going to deal with these issues when we have the opportunity tomorrow. A Point of Order does not necessarily mean that you are seeking an answer from the person, you can take the Floor to provide information that is contrary to what the other person said. I will

27 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
RT HON ANGULA

rule this one in favour of the majority and give the Floor to the Prime Minister.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. My contribution this afternoon is titled, “*Children are the first call of a Nation.*”

Honourable Members, first of all, I would like to say that Honourable Saara Kuugongelwa-Amadhila and Mr Tom Alweendo and their staff members deserve our commendations for presenting us with the Revenue and Expenditure Estimates, aimed at doing more with less. This means that the Ministry of Finance and the National Planning Commission had to make hard choices. The hard choices involve the balancing of demand and supply. The demands range from social challenges of health, education, social welfare, unemployment to decent rewards for the Public Servants. The supply of resources is limited. Total tax revenue is indicated to be only N\$33,586,850,000.00. This revenue is mainly generated from taxes on international trade and transactions which amounted to N\$13,795,783,580.00; on taxes on income and profits, which amounted to N\$11,593,827,330.00; on domestic tax on goods and services which generated N\$7,850,760,698.00 and on non-tax revenue which generated N\$1,564,525,407.00. This means that half of our revenue comes from taxes on international trade and transactions, a source which is vulnerable to external forces which we cannot control.

The total Budget estimate is N\$35 billion plus, whereas the revenue is N\$33 billion plus. The shortfall must be borrowed. The call for doing more with less, therefore, makes good sense. The resources provided should be properly targeted to items of expenditure with optimal impact on the lives of our people. This implies efficiency and effectiveness in resource allocation and utilisation. This further means careful identification of expenditure priorities over priorities. In this regard they have identified one priority which, I believe, overrides other priorities, namely our children.

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
RT HON ANGULA**

Children are the future, the children are, therefore, the first call of our Nation, yet almost 30% of our under-fives are malnourished. According to the National Population Census of 2006, the total number of under-five population in Namibia was 291,000 out of a population of 2,140,000. Estimated total number of births per year is 59,000. The total under-five mortality, that is death per one thousand live births, is 69. The infant mortality rate, that is death per one thousand live births, is 46. Infant mortality is by and large a consequence of child malnutrition. Percentage of under-fives who are severely or moderately stunted is 29.

This means that 29% of the children under five years of age are short for their age. In addition, 80% of children under the age of five are wasted or their weight does not correspond to their age.

This condition of our children came about because of a number of factors. The three most contributors to infant and child malnutrition are: inappropriate infant and child feeding practices, especially the lack of exclusive breastfeeding; poor caring practices and poor nutrition and the health status of the mothers.

According to the research findings, malnutrition is directly responsible for the death of at least 6,000 Namibian children annually. Tens of thousands Namibian children start school with diminished capacity to learn due to iron, iodine and other micro-nutrient deficiencies. Such children find it difficult to pay attention and concentrate on schoolwork. Moreover, research has shown a direct link between malnutrition in childhood and chronic deprecating diseases during adulthood. Diseases such as diabetes, chronic heart disease and hypertension are strongly linked to malnutrition and lack of care during the first three years of child.

Needless to say, Honourable Members, the Nation must act on this hidden hunger and the time to act in order to restore the health status of our children is now.

It was against this background that the Office of the Prime Minister started in 2010 to bring together major stakeholders to consult on the nutritional status of our children. After wide-ranging consultations with multi-

27 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
RT HON ANGULA**

sectoral and multiple stakeholders, a consensus was reached to establish the National Alliance For Improved Nutrition (NAFIN). NAFIN was officially launched on December 8, 2010. The objectives of NAFIN are:

- to reduce child mortality through improved maternal nutrition and health before and during pregnancies;
- to vigorously advocate for promotion and support of breastfeeding;
- to support programmes of adequate complementary feeding, using local resourced foods;
- to campaign for the prevention of vitamins and micro-nutrient deficiencies;
- to monitor programmes for prevention and nutrition management of infections;
- to advocate for appropriate food for education policies and
- to conduct public awareness campaigns on nutrition and healthy lifestyles.

Recently NAFIN has joined the Scaling-up Nutrition Movement which is a global movement to improve maternal and child nutrition by focusing on the first one thousand days window of opportunity in the life of a child. The idea is to improve direct nutrition interventions and to integrate nutrition in broader national health and development efforts.

Honourable Members, child nutrition is a responsibility of all of us. A healthy and committed Nation shall depend on the health status of its children. I, therefore, urge the Parliamentary Committee on social issues to join the National Alliance for Improved Nutrition.

Government should advocate for improved maternal health and child well-being. In this regard I am delighted that the Ministry of Gender Equality and Child Welfare is scaling up assistance to the Community Early

27 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
RT HON ANGULA

Childhood Development Centres with the aim of improving child nutrition. In the current Budget an amount of N\$4 million is provided for this purpose.

I am further happy that the Ministry of Health and Social Services is about to launch the National Policy on Productive and Child Health. I pray that the future Budgets will support initiatives and programmes aimed at addressing the welfare of our children.

Honourable Members of Parliament, children are the first call of our Nation. I thank you and I thank the Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: Everything you have said, Honourable Prime Minister, and the efforts that your Office and those that are with you are engaged in speak to the challenge as to whether the Republic of Namibia will be able to meet Millennium Development Goals 4 and 5 come 2015.

The House stands adjourned until Thursday, 14:30.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:47 UNTIL 2012.03.29 AT 14:30.

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS
WINDHOEK
29 MARCH 2012**

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any Petitions? Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Honourable Amathila.

**TABLING: REPORT ON WORKSHOP ON
PARLIAMENTARY ENGAGEMENTS WITH
MILLENNIUM DEVELOPMENT GOALS**

HON AMATHILA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I lay upon the Table –

Report of the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Economics, Natural Resources and Public Administration on the Workshop on Parliamentary Engagements with Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) held in Johannesburg, South Africa, from the 31st of August to the 1st of September 2011 for note-taking.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please table the Report.

TABLING: REPORTS ON ACP ASSEMBLY

29 March 2012

**TABLING OF REPORTS
HON AMATHILA**

HON AMATHILA: I lay upon the Table –

Report of the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Economics, Natural Resources and Public Administration on the 26th Session of the Africa-Caribbean-Pacific Parliamentary Assembly (ACP) and the 22nd Session of the ACP-EU Joint Parliament Assembly held in Lomé Togo from the 16th to the 23rd of November 2011 for note-taking.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please table the Report. Any further Reports of Standing Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Notice of Motions? Ministerial Statements? Minister of information and Communication Technology.

MINISTERIAL STATEMENT

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I rise to respond to a media report attributed to a certain Theofelus Uahongora who accuses the Government, saying it hates the Ovaherero people. This is a lie and it is a false accusation which should, therefore, be dismissed with the contempt it deserves. I wish to point out here that the Government of the Republic of Namibia is there to care, protect and safeguard the welfare and interest of all Namibians, irrespective of their creed, ethnic grouping and political affiliation, just to mention but a few. It is, therefore, not in the interest of the Government to stir up and instigate tribal conflicts amongst Namibian ethnic groups in the country.

In an article which appeared in two English dailies, Uahongora, who is said to be a political activist of the Ovaherero Traditional Authority, publicly and falsely accused the Government of the Republic of Namibia of fuelling tribal conflict in the Omaheke Region. He is implying that the

29 March 2012

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON DR NAMWANDI**

people who were to be settled in that area under the jurisdiction of Chief Stephanus Gariseb at Otjinene were allegedly invited over the radio and had the full blessing of the President of the Republic of Namibia, Comrade Hifikepunye Pohamba, and the Governor of the Omaheke Region, Honourable Laura McCleod-Katjirua, Mr Uahongora claimed.

The incident that occurred on the 9th of March 2012 at Ovizuzu in the area of Okahangu-Goraseb in the Otjinene district was purely a local issue. Neither the Regional Governor, nor the Central Government was involved in fuelling the tribal conflict which nearly erupted into a physical confrontation between a section of Ovaherero-speaking and Damara-speaking Namibians. I, therefore, dismiss this allegation levelled against the Government that it instigated the tribal conflict between the two aforementioned communities.

We appeal to the residents of Otjinene district and the entire Namibian Nation countrywide to embrace the spirit of one Namibia, one Nation. It is incumbent upon Traditional Leaders, wherever they are, to promote unity of our people and shun tribalism. At the same time, I appeal to all political leaders not to use tribalism to canvas for political support.

In conclusion, tribalism in African countries has caused civil wars and ethnic strife, with serious consequences. Any dispute that may occur anywhere within the boundaries of our country should be resolved amicably in order to maintain the peace and stability that we have enjoyed for the last 22 years. I thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any further Ministerial Statements? Honourable Deputy Minister of Education.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Honourable Deputy Speaker, on Friday, the 16th of March 2012, the Windhoek Observer newspaper ran a news article titled, “*Polytechnic at a Tipping Point*”,

29 March 2012

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON DR NAMWANDI**

which quoted the Rector of the Polytechnic of Namibia as saying that “*the Polytechnic might be forced to shelve some of its operations for the next three years unless the Government reconsiders the Budget allocation to the institution.*”

This response is intended to clear the air and ensure that the public is not misled by the said article.

The Namibian economy performed well in 2010 at 6.6% growth. Nonetheless, in 2011 the economic slump in the EU and the USA did not spare Namibia either as its growth was only 4.2%. However, in 2011, through Government interventions, the Repo rate was maintained at 6.0%. This had a negative effect on the Public Sector Budget. The Government also has many other Sectors to finance, including new ones, especially those targeted at encouraging economic growth. In this regard, I want to make special reference to TIPEEG, which stretches from 2011 to 2015. Therefore, while the Government has to maintain funding of all programmes, new programmes like TIPEEG had to be accommodated and it will also have an impact on the financing of other Sectors.

The Polytechnic of Namibia requested N\$500 million. We took this as an ambitious request for 2012/2013 Financial Year, as stated in the said article. This request was received by the Ministry of Education and submitted together with all other requests to the Ministry of Finance. It should be noted that the financial requests are submitted to the Ministry of Finance by all Government Ministries, Agencies and Offices, but granting the request depends on the availability of funds. All Sectors under Education do provide their Budget requests, often far above what the Treasury can afford. Often the Ministry of Finance terms this as a “*shopping list*” when Sectors defend their requests. As such, one need not make a big issue of having submitted half a billion and receiving less than a third, as approval is a privilege and not a right.

As for the claim that the largest portion of Treasury subsidy in 2012/2013 goes to UNAM, it is uncalled for and unfortunate for the Polytechnic to be submitting its Budget based on attempts to compete with UNAM in terms

29 March 2012

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON DR NAMWANDI**

of getting financing from the Government. I advise that this reasoning is reversed as it does not reflect well.

Regarding the threats to hike student tuition and accommodation fees, the Polytechnic Council and its Management are cautioned to take note that the Polytechnic remains a Public institution, therefore as a Public institution, students should not be targeted unduly to raise more funds. Targeting students for raising more funds may simply hurt students and their families as not many of them have secure financial backgrounds. As such, the Ministry would advise the Polytechnic to intensify or to expand its interaction with both Public and Private Sector to raise more and additional revenue for itself. I often say that tertiary institutions can raise additional funding through consultancy, research and joint research projects. Tertiary institutions are not only funded from subsidy by Government, but they benefit from Namibian Student Financial Assistance Fund, whose funding increased from N\$296 million in 2011/2012 Financial Year to N\$512 million in 2012/2013 Financial Year. This massive increase follows the resolution made at a National Conference on Education and these funds are targeting higher education institutions both here and abroad.

The massive increase in the Operational Budget subsidy for the 2011/2012 Financial Year was the result of an additional N\$70 million approved by the Ministry of Finance for an additional request by the Polytechnic of Namibia during the Financial Year 2010/2011. This massive increase was possible as a result of enough vetting in Government coffers to grant the Polytechnic's request at that time, that is 2010/2011.

Due to economic downturn this Financial Year, no additional request for Polytechnic was approved. The Government, through the Ministry of Education, is entrusted with the responsibility of the entire education needs, including pre-primary, primary, secondary education, vocational education and training, adult education and tertiary education. The Ministry of Education is, therefore, equally entrusted with the responsibility of ensuring that there are enough classrooms, hostels, teacher houses and textbooks for every single learner and provision of student loans and scholarships to those who qualify to pursue their studies

29 March 2012

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON DR NAMWANDI**

at tertiary institutions of higher learning.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Ministry of Finance has increased its Budget allocation to Namibian Students Financial Assistance Fund, as I said, from N\$296 million to N\$512 million this year. Last year after the successful hosting of the National Conference on Education, Cabinet directed the Ministry to investigate the possibility of abolishing the school development fund. This will be an expensive undertaking. To start with, an amount of N\$50 million has already been earmarked for this purpose.

It is, therefore, farfetched for an institution to request half a billion dollars and expect the request to be fully granted. It is not a secret that it is not only the Ministry of Education whose Budget was cut, but all Ministries were affected. Logically, for the Ministry to justify additional funding for State-Owned Enterprises, such as Polytechnic, there is a need for a strong motivation and clear evidence of how the previous subsidy was utilised. In the case of the latter this is still awaited despite the Ministry's request.

It should be understood that additional requests are not automatically granted and as much as the Ministry would like to fund all activities, schools, unlike the Polytechnic and UNAM, are hundred percent dependent on Public resources from the Ministry.

Finally, the MTEF ceiling was known to the Polytechnic already last year when the Budget was tabled and passed by this august House. One wonders why the Rector of the Polytechnic just comes to be aware of the fluctuation in the MTEF under review. Furthermore, it is clear from the figures provided under MTEF that the worst is still to come to the Education Sector in 2014/2015 when the Sector is going to lose over a billion of what it has received in the previous Financial Year.

I would ask all stakeholders in Education to realise that the global economic downturn has affected what the Ministry of Finance may raise as revenue and yet to live with whatever Government revenue can afford to finance our respective programmes. Remember Saara's famous quote, "*we have to do more with less*" and not the other way around. I thank you.

29 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON VON WITERSHEIM**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Any further Ministerial Statements? None. The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

**RESUMPTION OF DEBATE ON SECOND READING:
APPROPRIATION BILL**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on Second Reading –
Appropriation Bill.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When the House adjourned on Tuesday, 27 March 2012, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Minister of Finance, that the Bill be read a Second Time. Honourable Von Wietersheim.

HON VON WIETERSHEIM: Honourable Deputy Speaker, thank you very much for this opportunity. I am torn between admiration and frustration - if not desperation! Admiration for the way the Honourable Minister of Finance and her team, in cooperation with the National Planning Commission, have managed to skilfully steer our Public finances through the World Financial Crisis, with comparatively remarkable positive results. For that I wish to join those Honourable Members commending and congratulating the Honourable Minister and her entire team for the competency and commitment with which they approached and handled this very difficult task over the last number of years.

The frustration I am experiencing at the same time does not reflect on the abovementioned commitment and competency of the financial management team, but it concerns the lack of political insight and consequential lack of political action in the light of the increasingly

29 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON VON WITERSHEIM**

desperate situation the majority of our citizens find themselves in.

After all, it is the Cabinet which determines priorities and decides how to spend the scarce resources available to us, not the Ministry of Finance nor the National Planning Commission - and neither the National Assembly, for that matter!

We have a number of benchmarks against which we ourselves, or our partners in the Region or in the world measure our progress on our path of development. These include our own Vision 2030, as well as the Millennium Development Goals.

We have also undertaken to honour the universally accepted Human Rights which, apart from the highly publicised Civil and Political Rights — which are enshrined as such in our Constitution — also include Economic, Social and Cultural rights, which are casted as Principles of State Policy in the Constitution.

Namibia has ratified the '*Covenant of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights*' in 1995, which means that the poor and most vulnerable are entitled to the effective protection and promotion of both their Civil and Political Rights, as well as their Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.

How are we doing, and what are we doing with regard to those benchmarks, and the Economic, Social and Cultural Rights of our citizens, which the Namibian Government is obliged to at least progressively bring to realisation?

We are increasingly experiencing dispossession of houses or auctioning of houses in order to cover puny debts!

Informal settlers are increasingly threatened that their meagre, but only shelters will be bulldozed away, instead of devising drastic measures to deal with the increasing numbers of homeless or houseless citizens!

SWAPO-dominated Swakopmund Town Council is attempting to alienate a N\$2,6 million property to SWAPO Party for N\$30,000 instead of selling

29 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON VON WITERSHEIM**

at a market related value and investing the proceeds in desperately required settlement development. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? You said the SWAPO-dominated Town Council. What about Karasburg which is RDP dominated where they are doing the same?

HON VON WIETERSHEIM: Honourable Member, I am deliberately saying that the Town Council is attempting to alienate, as the Honourable Minister of Regional and Local Government, Housing and Rural Development, to my knowledge, has not approved the sale yet and there is still a slight hope that reason may prevail.

The same Minister last year admitted to a backlog of housing of 90,000 units. At the present pace of providing shelter of any kind, this backlog is in no way going to be addressed effectively. I am mentioning these examples to underline the urgent need of a drastic change in approach and priorities by Government, however, not only with regard to housing. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: May I ask the Honourable Member a small question? Honourable Member, when you walked out of the Cabinet you were so angry. What caused your anger that you just threw all your papers on the ground and walked out of Cabinet some years ago? What was your purpose?

29 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON VON WITERSHEIM**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Member, ignore the question, just proceed.

HON VON WIETERSHEIM: I am so sorry I cannot answer you.

It took the Ombudsman to do recently what we as lawmakers should have been doing long ago, to make it difficult for anybody to take away peoples' homes to cover puny debts. Dignified shelter must be regarded as one of the human right, especially in Namibia where unemployment is rife, and the Ombudsman is to be applauded for his argument that, "*to be left homeless, is not dignified; to lose one's home because of not being able to make a once-off payment to clear a debt, is discriminatory on grounds of economic status*".

With regard to the Economic, Social and Cultural Rights I am quoting from Article 2 of the abovementioned Covenant:

"Each State Party to the present Covenant undertakes to take steps, individually and through international cooperation, especially economic and technical, to the maximum of its available resources, with a view to achieving progressively the full realization of the rights recognized in the present Covenant by all appropriate means, including particularly the adoption of legislative measures."

Turning to Vision 2030 and the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), the record is simply depressing.

While hovering between possible achievement versus possible failure with regard to most of the Goals, glaring failures have been identified regarding the Goals of "*Reduction of Child Mortality*" and "*Improvement of Maternal Health*", both of which have dramatically deteriorated.

The Hon Members may judge for themselves the chances of reaching some of the other goals, such as:

29 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON VON WITERSHEIM**

- “*Eradication of Hunger and Poverty*”
- “*Achieve Universal Primary education*”
- *Promote Gender Equality and Empower Women*”.

The Right Honourable Prime Minister has pre-empted the Debate on a ‘*Basic Poor Household Income Grant*’ by providing a list of all social-related expenditure, thereby illustrating what should be understood as social justice.

With due respect, this is of no consequence for a large number of our citizens, particularly those who are trying to eke out a living at the lower end of our notorious income inequality. Once again, only a drastic intervention, like a ‘*Basic Poor Household Income Grant*’ or similar will provide some measure of relief until further development efforts would have materialised.

As an aside, the Right Honourable Prime Minister mentioned the possible restructuring of some of the current support interventions on the basis of means testing. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: On a Point of Information. The former Minister of Agriculture is misleading the public. Namibia is one of the countries which is highly hailed and rated as far as the child mortality rate is concerned.

HON VON WIETERSHEIM: On a Point of Order!

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can I give you advice? When an Honourable Member asks you a question and you know the answer, whether wrong or correct, you do not respond with a Point of Order, you

29 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON VON WITERSHEIM**

just proceed and respond.

HON VON WIETERSHEIM: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I was under the impression the Honourable Member made a statement and his information was wrong, therefore I wanted to make a Point of Order to correct his information.

Honourable Member, I am sorry, but the information you supplied is wrong.

Right Honourable Prime Minister, through you, Honourable Deputy Speaker, there is no way around means testing if we ever wish to achieve social justice. Means testing is a prerequisite to the idealistic future you referred to, of a society based on the core values of caring and sharing.

It will not be possible to achieve social justice, while some of the privileged continue claiming benefits which are meant to benefit so-called formerly disadvantaged; I refer Honourable Members to the glaring example of free-for-all land distribution, which is supposed to alleviate poverty. It will not be possible to achieve social justice if illegal land grabbing by some of the elite by fencing off communal land is condoned, and rural communities left with even less resources of their own. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY: On a Point of Information. I do not have a farm, but it is not worth mentioning by an Honourable Member who owns thousands of hectares and knows that the Government is busy removing those fences. You have more than 20,000 hectares and you now want to talk about those small pieces of land. Do not invite the anger of the people outside there. The people are capable of taking over your hectares!

29 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON VON WITERSHEIM**

HON VON WIETERSHEIM: This is the problem, Honourable Deputy Speaker. The second Point of Information again was untrue, plain untrue.

How can we speak of social justice, if State-Owned-Enterprises are allowed to squander precious scarce resources, which could much better be applied towards the above-mentioned realisation of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights of our citizens. The State-Owned Enterprises have become the biggest black holes... (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I would like to ask the Colleague from the RDP a question. Honourable Member, you are a farmer. How many farms do you have, by the way? Just tell us how many farms you have and how much did you pay for each farm and from whom did you buy them and whether the owners of the farms that you bought from have bought them. Tell us the truth right away!

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ignore that question and continue with your speech.

HON VON WIETERSHEIM: It is very difficult to ignore, Honourable Deputy Speaker. If we had a register of assets, it would be public knowledge and you would not need to ask me, but I can tell you I do not own a farm.

The State-Owned Enterprises have become the biggest black holes into which a big chunk of our Public resources is dumped year after year without improvement in most instances. This brings me back to the figures of the Budget, where one of the State-Owned Enterprises, Air Namibia, features with yet another '*turnaround strategy*' costing us N\$500 million, bringing the total amount gobbled up over the last ten to

29 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON VON WITERSHEIM**

twelve years to approx N\$3,5 billion! (Intervention)

**HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT,
HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:** I want to ask the Honourable Member a question. You mentioned “*black holes*”. Do you want to say that anything negative is black? Why not “*white holes*?” Can you explain why you use that expression and why not yellow holes or green holes?

HON VON WIETERSHEIM: Honourable Deputy Speaker, this is an English expression which comes from the outside. In the universe when you look at the stars, you would see areas between the stars which are pitch black and they are called black holes, because they are black and not because they are being associated with racism. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM: On a Point of Information. I would like somebody to translate, because it is difficult for me. (*Omunuhu owo otapopi iipupulu iitoka owo*). (Interjections).

HON TJIHUIKO: Could Honourable Kawana please translate it for us, because all of us want to know what it means.

**HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT,
HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:** Honourable Deputy Speaker, in Otjiherero we say “(*Ovizeze ovizorundu*)” and it means a black lie and in Oshiwambo “white lie”.

29 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON VON WITERSHEIM**

HON VON WIETERSHEIM: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I think it was good to have this explanation, also for the outside.

This brings to mind a saying by Albert Einstein, and this is now out of context because it refers to the State-Owned Enterprises which are supported again, again and again. Albert Einstein said that: *“Insanity is doing the same thing over and over again and expecting a different result.”*

To my mind, other areas of possible savings could be found in the present Budget without increasing the worrisome debt burden any further, in order to prioritise social and economic injustices in particular. These include the State House extensions in the Regions requiring a total of N\$1,2 billion over the MTEF, as well as the indicated new construction of a Parliament. Do we seriously consider under the prevalent socio-economic circumstances to replace a perfectly functioning, and, especially, completely renovated and overhauled building with a new one? (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: We break for refreshments.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:40

HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:20

HON VON WIETERSHEIM: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. I mentioned the view points in the Budget that I would think we could save on expenses, amongst others the new Parliament.

Then of course, Honourable Deputy Speaker, comes to mind the huge

29 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON NGHIMTINA

chunk of Public resources wasted through corruptive practices of whatever nature; first and foremost of course the billions lost through the GIPF, where the perpetrators are known, but no progress is made in bringing them to book. What a shame on those responsible!

In conclusion, I would like to quote the Director-General of the National Planning Commission, Tom Alweendo, who, during the launch of the National Development Plan IV (NDP IV) summarised — at least in part — the concern I am trying to raise, especially with regard to our own benchmark for the future: *“At the rate that we are going, I still maintain that we cannot achieve Vision 2030 and we need a serious paradigm shift in implementation the programmes that we create”* Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Honourable Minister of Works and Transport.

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, first and foremost, I would like to thank the Honourable Minister of Finance and her Deputy, the Director-General of the National Planning Commission and their staff members for putting together an inspiring Budget.

I rise to contribute to the National Budget Debate introduced by the Honourable Minister of Finance. My contribution focuses on the current structure and functions of the Tender Board of Namibia. While I am aware of the efforts of the Ministry of Finance to restructure the operations of the Tender Board, I am of the view that more still needs to be done to streamline its operations.

I sincerely believe that if we are to achieve some reasonable success in the execution and delivery of capital projects, it is important that we consider and implement some modifications to the traditional procurement system

29 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON NGHIMTINA**

of Government infrastructure projects. This may entail effecting bold changes to the mandate and functions of Ministries tasked with capital projects implementation, including the Tender Board of Namibia.

Our experience with the current procurement system has shown that it is lengthy, complex and cumbersome. The system has enjoyed minimum success because several procurement functions and processes are duplicated amongst several Ministries. This scenario has generated friction and conflict between Ministries which, instead of being partners in development, have suddenly become adversaries.

We have been with this procurement system for 22 years. Regrettably it has enjoyed mixed results and has not been a very successful tool in our national efforts to deliver the much needed infrastructure required by the Namibian people. It is a fact that efficient Public procurement systems are essential to the achievement of development goals. It would not be practical for the procurement process to be separated from Government's efforts to realise equitable distribution of wealth and Public resources. It is, therefore, important to ensure that Public procurement system's legal instruments address key elements to contribute to overall efficiency of the Public Sector management. A better working system will not only assist in rationalising the process, but it will also contribute to a more efficient distribution of scarce national resources towards development objectives and improved governance in the Public Sector.

Currently, Public procurement is governed by the Tender Board Act 16 of 1996, and implemented by the Tender Board Secretariat under the ambit of the Ministry of Finance. The ultimate aim is to contribute to the development and strengthening of a sound, transparent and competitive Public procurement system and the promotion of efficiency and effectiveness in the use of Public funds. (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, may I ask the Honourable Minister a question, please? When some of us put these questions to the Minister of Finance, we expect answers from the

29 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON NGHIMTINA**

Honourable Minister on the questions that we put to her. Answers that would represent Cabinet's collective position on the Budget that has gone through Cabinet. If a senior Minister raises issues of Tender Board and administration, would you really expect the Minister of Finance to answer these questions or would it not be a good idea to make a Ministerial Statement in order to raise some of those issues? I am becoming confused as one gets the impression that there is no coordination within the Ruling Party. Nobody is helping the Minister of Finance, everybody is blaming the Minister of Finance and she is representing Cabinet. What is going on?

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: We are talking as Members of Parliament and we want to streamline some institutions. Everybody in this country is complaining about capital projects and we want the bottlenecks to be removed so that we can make progress. This is not for today only, but even for the future generation.

In order to reduce the potential for fraud and corruption, we need to make sure that the Tender Board of Namibia is adequately resourced to run its own affairs.

Based on the above arguments, I am proposing that the Tender Board should be transformed into an administrative institution that is independent from the direct supervision and influence of the Ministry of Finance. This institution should be mandated to implement all the processes related to Public procurement and be tasked with the responsibility of responding to all the legal and administrative queries that usually emanate from dissatisfied tenderers.

In addressing the issue of capital projects, the Tender Board should be tasked with the responsibility of handling tenders from the time when tenders are submitted to the time when the tender is awarded to the successful tenderer without sending the tender documents back to the Ministry of Works and Transport or consultants for evaluation and discussion. Once the Tender Board has been transformed into an independent entity, it will then be able to employ a number of qualified

29 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON NGHIMTINA**

professionals in different fields, including quantity surveyors and engineers, to check and verify at source (Tender Board Secretariat) the tender documents that have been received without the involvement of the Ministry of Works and Transport and other stakeholders. If this measure is implemented, I believe that it is possible to reduce the implementation period of projects by at least three to four months. (Interjections). I am the one doing these things, I am talking of something that I know.

However, for this to be successful there is a need for the Government to consider establishing a national register of contractors and other service providers that will be used for Government tenders. In this regard, I propose that a national registration of contractors should be undertaken nationwide by the Ministry of Works and Transport with the participation of other stakeholders. The purpose of this exercise will be to register, evaluate, grade and determine the classification of contractors according to their capacities. What is happening nowadays is a briefcase company and if that one loses the tender, he is the one going to the media and the image created of our country is as if Namibia is corrupt.

The non-existence of a national register of contractors and other service providers, who have been evaluated, graded and classified according to known capacity has contributed to the slow process of project implementation. At present, contractors' capacities are evaluated when they tender for a particular project. The current situation where contractors are free to tender for projects of varied sizes and magnitude regardless of the contractor's own capacity to do the work is not conducive. Someone who cannot even handle a tender of N\$10,000.00 wants to be awarded a tender of N\$100 million.

I further propose that once the register of graded and classified contractors is in place, it should be valid for a period of two years. The Tender Board should advertise, invite and evaluate tenders according to the classifications contained in the register. This means that with a national register in place the evaluation of capital project tenders on per project basis will no longer be necessary. In addition, it will become unnecessary for the Ministry of Works and Transport to evaluate tenders received, thus reducing the implementation time further. This means that we need to

29 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON ISAACKS**

build a tall building for the Tender Board of this country, hosting all the experts who are required, dealing with all the work from A to Z and then the process will improve. Thank you very much.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Deputy Minister of Mines and Energy.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members of the House.

Allow me to participate in this very important Debate and equally to congratulate the Honourable Minister of Finance and her able team for presenting a Budget that is aimed at addressing one of our Nation's most pressing concerns of unemployment and equally on the proposed spending that would be available for rural development.

Honourable Speaker, we are under immense pressure as a Government to revisit our strategic priorities and we, therefore, should continue to be proactive in all our efforts to create employment for our people and to develop rural Namibia. Our high unemployment rate remains one of our Government's biggest challenges and it is commendable that we employ efforts to increase the room for employment creation.

It is clear that this Budget amplifies that there is room for job creation in several areas of Public Service delivery and I agree that there are Sectors of our Government that show potential to create jobs. We should however; as a Government continue to ensure that all our policies should focus on local value addition as well as local employment throughout the country and particularly in rural Namibia.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, one would like to see more Namibians participate and benefit through direct participation in economic projects as SMEs and employment in the possibilities that infrastructure development

29 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON ISAACKS**

brings, particularly in the Regions.

It is true that we will be judged by history and I am, therefore, happy to see that we take deliberate steps to change the legacy we will leave our children and the youth of this country.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, it appears from the statistics and reports that we are clearly in a growth period of our economy and it, therefore, only make sense that we invest in employment creation and through that in employment of youth. (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, may I ask the Honourable Deputy Minister a question, please? You mentioned statistics, but I do not know whether the SWAPO Party believes in statistics now. I remember that the Ministry of Labour produced statistics that tell us that unemployment in Namibia is 51.2% and it was debated in this Chamber that it was not true. We went to the extent of asking the World Bank to verify and they came back with the same figure. These are the statistics of five years ago and one could say unemployment is now over 60% and I can see that you agree with me. What statistics are you talking about if your Party does not believe in statistics and deny their own statistics?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. Equally it is very commendable to note our Government's interest to ensure high value of education to our Namibian youth and in the investment in their skills through the Budget provision of the Education Sector. It is indeed the right and a very wise decision to continuously invest in the future of the country through the youth.

I am further pleased to note that provision is made in the Housing Sector as well as sanitation, both in urban and rural Namibia. This will go a long way in our continuous efforts to service the electorate of this country,

29 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON BEUKES

being those living on the edge of our urban centres and the pheasants in the most remote areas of our country.

I am further pleased to note that the SWAPO Party Government is always thinking about our elderly people by increasing their allowances slowly but surely. In our efforts to help our people, particularly those in rural areas, one would like to see that we, through our efforts to address poverty, should provide our people, those in livestock farming with livestock and those in agricultural production with seeds so that we can take full benefit of the good rains we received for this year in some areas.

In conclusion Honourable Deputy Speaker, we have just celebrated our 22nd year of Independence in taking charge of our resources and destiny as Namibians. We therefore, should continue to increase and protect revenue collection from our natural resources in the Mining and Agriculture Sectors as these Sectors show growth potential. Therefore allow me to express my support for the Budget and once more congratulate my Colleague and able Minister of Finance and her able team. I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Deputy Minister of Regional and Local Government, Housing and Rural Development.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members. First and foremost, I congratulate the Honourable Minister of Finance for having presented a well-prepared 2013/2014 National Budget. The Budget avails funds earmarked for furthering the attainment of our Vision 2030 and for enhancing financial control.

The theme of this year's Budget symbolises that indeed financial prudence is the key element for the progress of our people, doing more with less. I am of the view that the Budget before this august House will, without any

29 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON BEUKES**

doubt in my mind, sustain economic difficulties that all the countries in the world encounter currently. Notable is its characteristics that are geared towards targeting practical needs of the people of Namibia, as were the previous Budgets. I have a premonition that this one will be resilient against the rough socioeconomic conditions currently facing our communities.

The Budget allocations for this will take us a long way in achieving some of the goals set out in Vision 2030. TIPEEG was initiated with two major intentions, firstly, to create employment and secondly, to embark on infrastructural development, which I consider as the starting point for Vision 2030. These are, amongst others, building of schools, bridges and other social amenities, such as upgrading of sanitation and servicing of land for informal settlements in our cities, towns and rural areas.

I cannot emphasise the need for increased funding for the housing of our people enough. After all, this is a secure investment which will bring direct financial returns to Government in the shortest period of time, as houses will be allocated on loan basis. Our people must be pulled out of the abhorring and undignified environment of living in shacks. Therefore, we should consider allocating more funds to Local Authorities and Regional Authorities, being sub-Government structures strategically positioned directly to communities, aimed at individual persons in order that they execute well-considered Government programmes. This will in turn create more employment for the local inhabitants of such places to further stimulate local economies more.

Secondly, I wish to commend the professional service provided by the Office of the Auditor-General. It has lived up to its mandate of keeping checks and balances in the fiscus by identifying flaws in administration, management and governance of State funds and bring any flaws to the open.

Thirdly, with respect to TIPEEG, I consider it as a tool for accelerating alleviation of poverty. For example, if rural communities, such as the ones of Gibeon, Hoachanas, Fransfontein, Berseba, Sesfontein, are provided with skills and technical assistance in order to develop aqua-

29 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON BEUKES**

farming or fish farming as it is generally known, then that in itself can alleviate poverty as these communities will sustain their respective livelihoods from such endeavours.

I make mention of these villages and settlements as they are endowed with natural fountains which are discharging water that runs to waste. The Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry and that of Regional, Local Government, Housing and Rural Development can offer development assistance through agricultural and other applicable projects. Again skills and technical assistance need to be provided. These two Ministries can empower such rural communities rapidly under TIPEEG. Such communities will be self-sustaining if such projects are implemented correctly and supervised accordingly by the respective Ministries.

Fourthly, Honourable Deputy Speaker, education being close to our hearts as the key to development, I should not be hesitant to state that we have to embark on investing heavily in this Sector to open channels for knowledge-based development. My recommendation is to apply, as an example, the scenario employed for medical students at UNAM whose loans were converted to bursaries. For critical fields of studies, such as engineering, be they clinical, civil, mechanical, electrical, science, biology, Government should consider granting full bursaries. We must ensure that conditions are attached to guarantee sustained long-term and broad-based benefits to our people. In my opinion, deserving students who wish to pursue studies in these critical areas should be given priority in terms of funding.

The timeframe for implementation should be the next Financial Year. By so doing, many young Namibians will be encouraged to embark on studies in these fields. The Private Sector should also play a significant role in assisting students with bursaries. There is a significant number of financial institutions and some mining companies that play a vital role, but this horizon needs to be expanded so that all companies and enterprises can play a role, be it small and nominal. Let there be less talking and more action when it comes to this critical area.

Fifthly, I will commend the Honourable Minister on the quest to deploy

29 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON LIMBO

resources that will provide infrastructure for Walvis Bay in order to enable it to be a major trading hub in SADC Region, which has obvious economic spin-offs such as foreign exchange, jobs as well as domestic investment. This will also engender inter-regional trade between SADC countries.

Finally, from the look of things, all systems are gearing up to have the SME Bank being established with the appointment of Board of Directors recently. This is a significant contribution to economic stimulation and employment opportunities. It is a commendable milestone achievement and yet a critical step that has been taken by the SWAPO-led Government, which is meant to diversify and empower small and medium businesses. With these few remarks, I thank you, Comrade Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Limbo.

HON LIMBO: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members. First of all, I would like to thank the Minister, her Deputy and the Director-General of the National Planning Commission and the entire staff of the Ministry of Finance for coming up with this impressive 2012/2013 Budget.

From the theme of this *Appropriation Bill* one can tell that the Minister, as a woman, has the Namibian Nation at heart. In my presentation, Honourable Deputy Speaker, I would like to focus on three areas, such as unemployment, agriculture and TIPEEG.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, on employment I would like to say that Namibia is a country blessed with abundance of natural resources, such as diamonds, uranium, copper, gold, fish, to mention just a few, yet we see an increasing number of underprivileged poor Namibians on our street corners day by day. One wonders whether we as a Nation are planning to fail or failing to plan. For the past years

29 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON LIMBO**

the Nation witnessed continuous discussions on employment intervention strategies, but yet the number of unemployed is increasing yearly.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, the time to act positively is now. Let us as a Nation join hands and confront this monster once and for all, otherwise the peace and stability Namibia is enjoying today is going to be compromised, something that no Namibian wants to see. The people most affected by unemployment, which leads to poverty, are women and the youth. Due to unemployment some of our women are forced to enter into prostitution. Some have even attempted to sell their babies, if not dumping them altogether and others have gone to the extent of becoming drug mules. Is this what we have fought for? The answer is no. If mothers, as a result of poverty are not in a proper state of mind to guide their families, the future generation will definitely be affected.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, as leaders of this great Nation, we need to think out of the box and come up with tangible solutions in order to save the future generations from this scourge of hunger, poverty and unemployment.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, with regard to agriculture, I would like to say the following: For the past 22 years we have depended quite a lot on imported foodstuffs from other countries for our own consumption. This is not good for a developing country like ours. A Nation which cannot feed itself is definitely doomed to failure. Every Namibian must be taught to go back to the land and produce their own food. Those in villages, towns and cities should be encouraged to have small gardens around their houses and all of us should be messengers of change by encouraging our people to change their mindset to produce their food instead of depending on imports. By relying on imports Namibians should know that we are creating jobs for other people outside our own country.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, the Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry must see to it that the communal farmers are properly assisted by the extension officers on how to help them to move away from outdated ways and methods of doing things. In order for

29 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON LIMBO**

them to be able to produce quality and surplus produce for markets, the extension officers should increase the conduct of workshops and demonstrations in order to equip farmers with skills and knowledge.

Apart from the extension officers, there must be some mentorship programmes offered to farmers and rural women should also be trained to preserve food in a hygienic and marketable environment.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, the Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry should also start to market the importance of agriculture and encourage our youth to take up agriculture as a profession. During holidays, schools should visit different agricultural schemes, such as Green Schemes, dairy farming, Meatco and many others in order to expose their young minds to the possibilities that agriculture has to offer as a profession. There must be incentives for those who are interest to pursue agriculture as a profession and it should be part of the curriculum in the education system.

It is through encouraging the youth to study agriculture that they will be able to learn to harvest our annual floodwaters and preserve it for dry seasons.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, last year when TIPEEG was introduced by the Honourable Minister of Finance, many Namibians were joyful, hoping that their dreams of providing for their families will be realised. Unfortunately their hopes were short-lived because TIPEEG money could not be accessed by ordinary Namibians. Instead it benefited the already empowered and well-to-do individuals. Many people did not know where to go and how to go about getting hold of this money. To avoid a repeat of the last Financial Year, I would like to see a different approach in the implementation of TIPEEG. Regional Councillors must inform their own people in their Constituencies about where and how one can access the money. It is about time for the Minister of Finance to clarify one thing to the Nation: If TIPEEG is targeting unemployed people, how are these unemployed men, women and youth going to be assisted in order to create jobs? One should note that most of the unemployed people lack the relevant knowledge to draw

29 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KAPIA

up a business plan. Therefore, the Nation is eager to know whether TIPEEG is mainly created as a short-term unemployment solution. If it is a short-term programme, then how would we expect TIPEEG to address the high unemployment situation in our country?

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, I would like to rest my case and I support the Bill.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Honourable Kapia.

HON KAPIA: Thank you very much, Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members. I rise to add my voice to those who congratulated the Minister of Finance and her team for once again bringing a balanced, well worked out National Budget to the National Assembly for debate and approval for the Executive to spend in order to address the much talked about development of our country.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, during the tabling of this Budget, the Minister of Finance already presented a policy statement and this policy statement outlined important key issues to be taken note of and to be implemented by various Ministries and Agencies in our Government. I would like to call upon our Government to make this statement known to all the staff in the various Ministries and Agencies.

Once we have this statement and remind our staff of the policy statement made by the Minister of Finance, then they will be able to implement this Budget as expected from them to do.

I can even single out one important issue in the statement of the Minister, namely for the Development Bank to implement venture capital programmes to assist our entrepreneurs who apply for loans from the Development Bank. If the Development Bank cannot implement this, then it is a betrayal of the Namibian people, because the Development Bank is not supposed to follow the route of commercial banks when the

29 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KAPIA**

Namibian people apply for financial resources. Therefore, the Development Bank of Namibia must take this policy statement seriously and implement it. The same applies to the Agricultural Bank, the Minister of Finance said it all, I do not want to repeat, they must take note of it and implement it as the SWAPO Party Government wants it to be implemented.

Yes, we are expecting the tabling of the Bill on procurement, which is a long-awaited Government instrument which needs to be approved by this House and implemented so that we address some of the problems which are hampering our developmental programmes.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, we are here to make laws and this is one of the important pieces of legislation we are faced with every year. After passing this law we want to appeal to each and every person in Namibia who is charged with the responsibility of implementing this law to make sure that this law is implemented without failure. We cannot just debate here for the sake of debating, I thought we are here to make laws to be implemented to the letter and whoever is responsible for the failure to implement this law must either chip in or chip out. That is the only way.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, I really want to appeal to the various Line Ministries to do more with less and I want to single out some Ministries. I am very happy with the way the Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry is implementing programmes, particularly the silos and cold storage, so that our produce is not transported to neighbouring countries to again be returned for distribution in the market. This is a step in the right direction. I also want to ask the Minister of Agriculture to ensure that Meatco remains a Parastatals and it must open all abattoirs which were closed down, so that they can become functional, create jobs and produce meat for local consumption and export to our neighbouring countries. (Intervention)

HON MOONGO: Is the Honourable Member aware that Meatco buys

29 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KAPIA

meat in some Regions at a cheaper price than in other Regions? Are you aware of the discrimination practised by Meatco?

HON KAPIA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry should really review the operations of NamWater in this country. We are here to provide services to the Namibian people, it is an open secret, therefore we cannot create Parastatals that do not solve the problems of the people. We had plenty of water for the past three years and if NamWater does not come up with a solution for the supply of water in this country, then we have a serious problem. We want a dam near Etosha. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY: I rise on a Point of Information so that I can assist my Colleague. Comrade Kapia, you are correct that NamWater needs to be looked at. On the issue of harvesting rainwater, the Ministry of Agriculture has two functionaries under Rural Water Supply. Rural Supply has already started with a pilot project in Epyaeshona as well as in Onaanda where we are doing semi-desalination of this saltwater at Amalika and Nakutsima and they are progressing well.

For the information of people, the Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry put out a tender and it has been approved. People went to construct those dams we are talking about, but due to the continuous heavy rains for five years, the underground aquifer is causing problems at a mere depth of two metres. We recalled those tenders because it is a waste of time. I just wanted to share that information as the Ministry is not just sitting idle with doing nothing. We are awaiting a Bill to deal with rural water supply and the issue of corrective punishment. Comrade Prime Minister pays but Ilonga did not pay and then NamWater just cuts the water. The law is already in its last stages with the Office of the Attorney-General and it will deal with all those issues.

29 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KAPIA**

HON KAPIA: Thank you very much for providing that valuable information. I deliberately mentioned NamWater, because after Government developed these water reservoirs and passed them on to NamWater, NamWater started charging exorbitant prices for water. I do not know who determines the price of water in this country, but I have a serious problem. We have a social responsibility to make sure that we provide clean water. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: On a Point of Information, Honourable Kapia. Are you aware that since we had these heavy rains, most of the water depressions which we call *Omadhiya* are filled with water and that villagers decided not to use water provided by NamWater and only get their water from these *Omadhiya*? Are you aware of that?

HON KAPIA: Comrade Prime Minister, I am aware. I visited one household just recently and the water tap in that household is closed. I asked why and they said no, they are taking water from the oshana's because apparently it is a relief. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Can I pose a question? Even if you receive floods and a lot of rain, the price of water remains the same. Is it not probably better to list water on the stock exchange so that sometimes the price can go up or down. When there is too much oil in the market, the price goes down, but when there is too much water, the price stays the same.

HON KAPIA: It is true and that is one of the concerns. I also want to thank the Ministry of Regional and Local Government, Housing and Rural Development for the Rural Sanitation Programme. This is a big Ministry

29 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KAPIA

which touches the lives of the people every day and night. The people do not have a place to sleep, they are sleeping in *kambashus*, there are no plots available. I want to thank the Minister for the very good idea to stop the auctioning of land in urban areas. There are countries which are doing well economically, but they never sell land to individuals. Therefore, I am not happy with the way land in Namibia is handled. Our young people who are graduating and starting their careers cannot afford a house in Otjomuise as we are speaking now. We have Local Authority Councillors, we have Regional Councillors, we have Parliament, we have the Executive, let us decide once and for all to allocate land to our people and they can pay the minimal, but they have a place to build their houses. Let us have the same formula for communal areas in towns and villages. It will allow the municipalities to run their affairs, but at least the communities can access land. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY: May I ask Honourable Kapia a question? Comrade Kapia, when widows in the communal areas are removed from their houses, you will hear that women are being discriminated against, they are chased off the land, but here in town the women are removed and you will be told it is the law. We can look at some of these issues, like we did with the inheritance for which we never had a law. We passed a law and now the women inherit from their husbands. Why can we not do the same in this instance? Women are suffering, poor people are suffering. What are you suggesting, Comrade Kapia?

HON KAPIA: The Minister has a good idea and it is being worked on to put this exorbitant pricing of land and houses in urban areas to an end. We need to control this. (Intervention)

HON MOONGO: On a Point of Information. I wish to inform the

29 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KAPIA

Colleague and other Members that the Traditional Authority is more humane because they provide land at N\$600 so that everybody can afford it, but the municipality and the Government are hesitant to consider that.

HON KAPIA: I know that Traditional Leaders are not allowed to sell land. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: On a Point of Information. The Headman there is economical with truth. When he sells land at Omalaala, he will not ask N\$600, he will ask a head of cattle and there is no place to graze cattle. You know that you will ask a head of cattle.

HON KAPIA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I was saying that Traditional Leaders are only allowed to charge small fees for administrative purposes but not to sell land. If there is a Traditional Leader who is selling land, then that is a serious matter. That is communal land. (Intervention)

HON AMATHILA: I would like to ask Comrade Kapia a question. Comrade Kapia, since you took the Floor you said very beautiful things, from water to land and all these type of things. Will you agree with me when I say that most of the things you said will either end up in our minutes of the House and that is because we do not have an arrangement for the doers of these Ministries, the Permanent Secretaries who are supposed to attend our Sessions as executors and implementers of the ideas, to hear what we feel about some of the things, if they do not attend, they think only narrowly in their sectoral divisions, they do not have a picture in totality of how we feel about the totality of the country. Will you not agree that maybe next time around the Ministers should compel their Permanent Secretaries to be here because the Budget Debate occurs

29 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KAPIA

only once a year? Let them be here to get the totality of the picture we are painting, so that when they are sitting in their offices to implement what they need to implement, they have a feeling, they have an idea as to what we think and they are well informed.

HON KAPIA: I realised that our administrators in Namibia do not take Parliament seriously. We mention many good things here, we take decisions and table Reports with good recommendations, but you will never see them being implemented, except for one which I am aware of. (Intervention)

HON !NAWASES-TAEYELE: May I ask Honourable Kapia a question and also provide information at the same time? Today the Permanent Secretary of the Ministry of Regional and Local Government, Housing and Rural Development appeared before the Committee on Constitutional and Legal Affairs and we were asking him the very same questions that you are mentioning now. The Permanent Secretary was very firm in his response and said the problem does not lie with them as technocrats, the ball should be passed back to the politicians. We should come up with policies or laws for them to make things easier for the people out there. That was the response from the Permanent Secretary.

HON KAPIA: Thank you very much. Yes, the Permanent Secretary can say that, but how many laws are passed in this House? All the laws passed in this House should be implemented by a specific Ministry and that Ministry has a Permanent Secretary to ensure that that Act of Parliament is implemented. When they experience problems with the implementation, he or she must propose Amendments to the Minister to make it easier for them to implement (Intervention)

29 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KAPIA**

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I rise on a Point of Information. Honourable Kapia, is it not exaggeration to say that of all the laws that were passed in this House, none were implemented?

HON KAPIA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, maybe I was misquoted. For the Permanent Secretary to say that they are not implementing because we are to be blamed, while we are passing laws to be implemented, what does that mean? I am saying that when Parliament decided that the Budget of the Ministry of Defence must be increased, it was implemented and when we visited the institutions of the Ministry of Defence, you could see that the Budget we passed here is making a difference. The Ministry of Defence even has their own Defence Industry, they are developing their own industry and it is working very well. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Comrade Deputy Speaker, I want to ask a question. You were touching on the issue of land, particularly in urban areas. There is this problem of people acquiring properties and then when they are unable to honour their obligations, there is a tendency by the banks of repossessing and auctioning. Those who acquire the properties at auctions are mostly people with money and in most cases, companies and foreigners. Where do you think will we be in ten or twenty years' time? Will there still be land available?

HON KAPIA: It is true and I said we must stop this somewhere. If we today conduct a survey in the City of Windhoek, you will find that most of Windhoek is owned by non-Namibians. However, other countries do not sell land, sometimes not even to their own citizens. They have well-worked out systems to ensure that they protect the very important resource

29 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KAPIA**

of their country, which is called land. We can talk about diamonds, we can talk about fish, but if you do not have land, then you are nothing. I do not believe you can today buy a plot of land in Angola, neither in Cuba, China and even Botswana. Why are we so lenient with our only natural asset? (Intervention)

**HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT
AND CULTURE:**

On a Point of Information. You are doing extremely well and I do not want to dilute your input. You have said it all on the question of land, but I would like to agree with the Permanent Secretary of the Ministry of Regional and Local Government, Housing and Rural Development. Let us call a spade a spade. Parliamentary Committees bring issues to Parliament and we become defensive and take it personally. When are we going to listen to one another and build this Nation? Let us call a spade a spade. When issues are brought here, we become defensive, to the point that we do not talk to fellow Members of Parliament or fellow members of the Party, not the Opposition alone. Come on! It cannot continue this way. Let us try to be issue-driven, listen to what people are saying and then appreciate it. Sometimes when we sit here and listen, it seems as if somebody else outside is making laws. We are the lawmakers here, those people are only implementing. If we can pass a law in this House and say that in a certain area of Namibia no land will be bought by a foreigner, that law will definitely be implemented. It is our responsibility right here in this House and that is why we were elected.

We can say that there should be restrictive measures before the house of an elderly is auctioned. Social workers should be involved and that house will not be auctioned. Let us make those laws, we are the lawmakers. Please, can we start governing this country?

HON KAPIA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I want to conclude by saying.... (Intervention)

29 March 2012

SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KAPIA

HON MOONGO: I think I am not the only one who heard a certain Permanent Secretary saying that a recommendation we have made has been on the Minister's table for ten years without being implemented because he is not willing and other proposals lapsed because the Budget has run out. Let us not blame Permanent Secretaries as the true culprits are the Ministers and the Prime Minister can maybe play a role when they are hesitant to implement.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Member, the last comment was serious. Are you saying that the only culprits are the Ministers? I do not think so.

HON MOONGO: I was not the only one who heard a Permanent Secretary saying that the recommendation is on the table of the Minister and the Minister has been sitting on it for five, ten years and they are the culprits who do not want to implement recommendations.

HON MEMBER: Where is the evidence?

HON MOONGO: I am not the only one who heard it, maybe I am the only one who has the freedom to speak my mind and the others fear to do so. I am telling you he was saying that and I do not want to mention names.

HON KAPIA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, in conclusion I want to thank the Minister of Finance for increasing the Budget of the Ministry of Youth, National Service, Sport and Culture. I know it will really bring some changes in the lives of young people, particularly the Credit

29 March 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA**

Scheme, the SME Bank, National Youth Council and National Youth Service. These are all welcome moves. I also want, at this point in time, to congratulate SWAPO Party in general and the SWAPO Party members in Oranjemund in particular, for making sure that what happened in Eenhana and Omuthiya also happened in Oranjemund and it will happen all over this country for the next years to come. I want to ask all the Namibian people to continue trusting SWAPO Party to rule this country, be it in towns, villages and Regions and not to give the country into the hands of a president who sleeps during the Budget Debate. Thank you very much, I support the Bill.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any further discussion? Does the Honourable Minister of Finance wish to reply?

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you very much, Honourable Deputy Speaker. I Move that the Debate be adjourned until next week Tuesday, the 3rd of April, to respond.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Debate is adjourned for the reply by the Minister of Finance to the 3rd of April. The House is adjourned until the 3rd of April 2012.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:45 UNTIL 2012.04.03 AT 14:30

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS
WINDHOEK
03 APRIL 2012**

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any Petitions? Any Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers?

TABLING: REPORTS OF THE AUDITOR-GENERAL

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I lay upon the Table, Reports of the Auditor-General on the Accounts of –

1. The Utilisation of Government Quarters (Ministry of Works and Transport) for the Financial Years 2009, 2010 and 2011; and
2. Town Council of Eenhana for the Financial Years ended 30 June 2009 and 2010.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please table the Reports. Any other Reports and Papers? Notice of Questions? Notice of Motions? Ministerial Statements. The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

03 April 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA**

**RESUMPTION OF DEBATE ON SECOND READING:
APPROPRIATION BILL**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on Second Reading –
Appropriation Bill.

HON SPEAKER: When the House adjourned on Tuesday, 29 March 2012, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Minister of Finance, that the Bill be read a Second Time. Does the Honourable Minister of Finance wish to reply?

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, I have had the honour to follow discussions on the 2012/2013 *Appropriation Bill* which I tabled before this august House on February 28, 2012. I would like to express my gratitude to the Honourable Members of the House for putting forth pertinent issues. The Debate was valuable and would improve the Budget process going forward.

I now take this opportunity to respond to various questions and concerns raised. I have clustered issues according to relevant themes. As such, I will not refer to particular Members who raised the issues, however I will endeavour to address the main pertinent issues raised. I count on the support of the Colleagues from Cabinet to provide more details on their sector programmes.

On the Budget Conceptual Framework, to start with, some questions were raised regarding the poverty focus of the Budget and the extent to which the Budget impacts on the lives of ordinary citizens. In this regard I would like reiterate again that the central theme of this Budget is job creating growth within a sustainable fiscal framework.

03 April 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA**

Achieving high and sustainable economic growth is a prerequisite for reducing poverty, but growth in itself is not a sufficient condition for poverty reduction. Economic growth has to be inclusive in that it draws a large number of the unemployed into the economic stream and enhances the living standard of the broad masses. This is the nexus around which the resource allocation has been done in this Budget. For instance, allocating over N\$2 billion to the Agricultural Sector where about 65% of the population make a living will not only expand our production capabilities, but it will also unlock economic opportunities for small-scale farmers, create jobs and improve food security, thereby making a real dent on poverty over the long term.

In the Tourism Sector we have made targeted interventions aimed at sustaining our attractiveness as a tourist destination by improving tourist park facilities, better tourism marketing, upgrading of tourism facilities and development of community-based tourism and communal Conservancies, thereby placing the people at the centre of development. These investments create business opportunities for private investors and contribute to job creation.

We have scaled up investment in transport infrastructure network as key catalyst for expanded economic activities and Private Sector growth. This will not only induce domestic economic activities, but it will also strengthen our competitiveness by improving the arteries for trade facilitation in an increasingly integrated regional and global economy.

The focus on housing and sanitation aims at accelerating the provision of decent affordable housing and better sanitary standards in rural and urban informal settlements. By investing in these basic services we do not only improve the quality of life of our people, but also render our towns and settlements attractive for private investors. A total of N\$400 million is allocated during 2012/2013 as subsidies to towns, villages and Regional Councils for provision of sanitation and basic services to the people. For the MTEF this allocation amounts to N\$1.2 billion.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, it is an act of a caring Government that our Government has maintained its commitment to

03 April 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA**

social welfare, which provided a cushion against poverty on the most vulnerable. We have not only reached out to more qualifying beneficiaries with our programmes, but we have kept our commitment to periodically review the level of grants that we provide. As the Right Honourable Prime Minister indicated in his contribution to the Budget Debate, public oriented public spending has reached about 42% of the MTEF expenditure, a share which is high by any standard and an indication that we are reaching upper limits in terms of flexibility for further expansion of welfare programmes.

Government is not only aiming at the alleviation of poverty, but rather at the complete eradication of poverty and disease in the long term and the achievement of prosperity in industrial development in accordance with Vision 2030 objectives. Thus, through the provision of education and health care services we are aiming at developing our human capital as a basis for promoting technological advancement in improving the quality of life.

What has been the impact of our policies? Evidence from the successive National Household Income and Expenditure Surveys runs counter to the pessimism that Government efforts to drive back the frontiers of poverty are not paying dividends. The 2009/2010 Household Income and Expenditure Survey result indicated that since 1993 per capita income of our citizens has doubled, bringing Namibia to an upper middle-income status.

Similarly, Namibia's Human Development Index score for 2011 shows an improvement over the last five years, placing Namibia's rank globally at 120 out of 187 countries. This places us midway in the medium human development category. The Human Development Index Report showed that non-monetary poverty, as measured by education and health outcomes, has reduced in recent years, with life expectancy rising from 60 years in 2007 to 62 in 2011. Literacy rate has also improved considerably. We were able to attain these improvements thanks to the well-targeted and persistent pro-poor interventions of our government.

Are the rich getting richer and the poor getting poorer? The 2009/2010

03 April 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA**

National Household Income and Expenditure Survey also shows that the incidence of relative poverty and extreme poverty has been declining over the years. Relative poverty fell by close to one half from 38% in 1993/1994 to 20% in 2009/2010. Extreme poverty fell from 9% in 1993/1994 to 4% in 2003/2004 and further to 2% in 2009/2010. This progress in extreme poverty is in line with MDG objective to eliminate extreme poverty by 2015.

The income of the poorest 20% rose the fastest, increasing six-fold since 1993, while that of the middle income group rose by a factor of three. The richest 20% saw only a moderate improvement in their income levels. The gini-coefficient ratio improved from 0.7 at Independence to 0.58 in 2009/2010, compared to the Vision 2030 target of 0.55 by 2015. I should hasten to add that the gini-coefficient ratio of 0.58 is still high. It is against this background that our Government will continue to make targeted interventions, including under this Budget, to *inter alia* promote job creation, welfare improvement and equitable wealth distribution.

CENTRALITY OF EDUCATION IN NATIONAL DEVELOPMENT:

With regard to calls for more efforts to address educational challenges, I wish to assure you that the Budget recognises that considerable need still exists in the education sector. The sector will, therefore, continue to enjoy the top most priority in resources allocation and in this respect it is taking up a quarter or 25% of the total Budget or 27% of budgeted revenue envelope during 2012/2013.

State funding for education implies that learners do not have to pay a cost recovery fee. Further, the Scholarship Fund has seen a significant rise in allocation with its Budget reaching N\$512 million in this year's Budget, compared to N\$269 million in the Budget of the previous year, which is a remarkable increase of 73% in line with our Government's commitment to empower our youth with the requisite skills for employability and to place our country on course towards Vision 2030 objectives. The scholarships enable those without financial means to access tertiary education.

03 April 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA**

The Human Resource Development Plan will assist to improve targeting the Training Fund to the top most priorities. I should emphasise here that it remains a consistent policy of Government that no Namibian child is turned away from school due to lack of funds.

MACRO-ECONOMIC REVENUE PROJECTION:

I am indeed gratified that there is consensus across the House on the need to maintain fiscal prudence, especially during this time of global economic uncertainty. Concerns were raised about the accuracy of macro-economic forecast for the MTEF given the uncertainties in the global economy as well as the reliance on SACU revenue. In this regard I wish to inform the House that we have exercised due care in ensuring that the projections are in line with global and regional economic developments. Further, the projections represent a downward revision from the projections made in the 2011/2012 to 2013/2014 MTEF. The fiscal expansion undertaken in recent years was meant to be targeted and time-bound to prop up the economy under difficult external environment and avert a recession. We have succeeded to achieve this objective. Realising this objective did not only require that we expand the Budget, but also adjust the debt threshold. As recovery gathers pace, Government is now commencing with a gradual fiscal consolidation process. It is not a panic reaction as some would like to have it.

Fiscal consolidation does not mean scaling down on service delivery, it means maintaining expenditure in real terms and strengthening the fiscal position to be able to fund emerging needs in the future. In terms of the MTEF outlook, we intend to smooth out significant expenditure expansion. By the end of the MTEF we intend to move towards a balanced Budget, with the deficit projected to reduce to only 0.4% of GDP and debt falling to 28% of GDP during the last year of the MTEF.

These adjustments mirror prospects in the global and regional economic outlook and take into consideration downward adjustments in projections for the world economy and the economies of our major trading partners. Without doubt, the performance of the global economy will have an impact on our economy.

03 April 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA**

As a country we have recently been accorded a BAA3 positive investment grade by Moody's Investor Service, which is the second sovereign credit rating that confirms our credit-worthiness and stable investment environment.

With regard to the sourcing of the US\$500 million from the international market, this serves the purpose of diversifying our funding sources and establishing an international benchmark, also for our corporates should they wish to go into the international market in the future; not because we are not able to source these funds in the country and this was definitely not done in secret because it was indicated in the MTEF that we would raise this amount from the international market. This debut foreign currency bond was over-subscribed and attracted investors not only from Europe but from a diverse market base, such as Asia, North America, Africa and the Middle East. We have achieved this at the best coupon rate and the composition of public debt remains predominantly domestic in line with our Government's debt management strategy. Therefore it is not correct that we went there to look for European money, we just went to the centres of the financial markets and we found everyone there, including the Africans. We have also not changed our debt management strategy, we are still predominantly borrowing from the local market.

In respect of the 2012/2013 revenue outlook, the projected 31.9% increase in revenue for 2012/2013 is mainly due to a surplus of N\$9 billion realised in the SACU Common Revenue Pool for 2010/2011, for which Namibia will receive N\$2.4 billion this year. For clarity purposes, the N\$13.8 billion SACU received for 2012/2013 is not just a revenue expectation but an amount which has been decided upon by the SACU Council and like for other SACU Member States will be remitted to Namibia during the year, in accordance with the SACU Agreement. But I share the concern about the preponderance of SACU revenue as a share of total revenue. We should nevertheless note that our domestic revenue sources, particularly Pay-As-You-Earn and Value-Added Tax have also demonstrated outstanding performance, which anchored our revenue growth in recent years.

03 April 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA**

As a ratio of GDP, domestic revenue outturn grew from 16.4% in 2006/2007 to 19.8% in 2011/2012. As a proportion of total tax revenue, domestic revenue increased from 52% in 2006/2007 to an estimated 68% by 2011/2012. In nominal terms, domestic revenue increased by an average of 15% annually, effectively more than doubling from N\$9.1 billion in 2006/2007 to an estimated N\$18.2 billion in 2011/2012. The buoyancy in domestic revenue sources is in part attributable to the strengthening of domestic tax policy, introduction of alternative forms of revenue and improvement in tax administration and revenue collection.

For instance, personal income tax grew by 40% from N\$4.6 billion in 2008/2009 to reach an estimated N\$6.4 billion in 2011/2012. Similarly, value-added tax was buoyant, increasing by about 70.4% from N\$4.3 billion in 2008/2009 to an estimated N\$7.3 billion in 2011/2012. In essence the annual percent increase in domestic tax revenue is more than the annual percentage increase in Gross Domestic Product, which renders our domestic tax system highly elastic.

The first set of alternative sources of revenue proposals were tabled already last year in this House and I am indebted to all Honourable Members for your support in this regard. These measures came into force as of 1 April this year. Additional measures will be introduced in the coming days. The proposals would include measures to optimise the contribution of the Mining Sector to public revenue. On the administration side, we will establish a specialised unit to deal with the mining taxation within the Receiver of Revenue Office.

With regard to expenditure allocation and Budget reforms, extensive comments were made in this regard. In particular a concern was raised regarding the composition of expenditure. Indeed, personnel expenditure has experienced a steep increase of 43% from N\$7.5 billion in 2008/2009 to N\$10.8 billion by 2010/2011. As a share of GDP, the Public Sector wage bill grew from 10% in 2008/2009 to 14% in 2011/2012. Public Service wages now absorb virtually half of Government revenue, which was only 33% four years ago. This sharp rise highlights the need for stakeholders to ensure a proper balance between having a well remunerated and well-resourced Public Service and maintaining fiscal sustainability.

03 April 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA**

I also concur with those Members who called for improved efforts to ensure that budgeted vacancies are filled timeously and expenditure for subsistence and travelling allowance is contained entirely to critical activities.

I should, however, point out that there has indeed been a clear shift in the composition of expenditure towards capital expenditure. Total development expenditure allocation stood at N\$2 billion in 2007/2008, which was equivalent to 11.6% of total expenditure. This rose to 17.3% of total expenditure in 2011/2012 and reached about 22% by 2011/2012. Therefore, in a space of four years we have been able to more than double the Development Budget.

Further, the total operational expenditure as a ratio of GDP is projected to decline from 30% in 2011/2012 to about 23% by 2014/2015. That is now the overall operational expenditure, except of course the personnel component that is still showing an increasing trend. Thus the real concern here is not whether Development Budget Allocation is given due attention, rather the concern is how we can marshal effective implementation capacity to translate increases in the Development Budget into optimum development outcome.

I wish to address the misconception that there is cross Vote virement practice in Government. The State Finance Act and its Treasury Instructions provide for internal virement within Budget votes with the approval of Treasury. This provision allows for Votes to realise internal efficiency. Virement across Votes is, however, not allowed and is not practised. Every Vote as it stands only virement with Treasury approval and only within that Vote.

Does contingency expenditure constitute cross Vote virement and, therefore, unlawful and requiring regularisation through addition appropriation? The answer is an emphatic no. The contingency provision is especially created in terms of the State Finance Act to cater for emergency expenditures related to activities under any Office, Ministry or Agency and it is appropriated under the Budget. The Budget expenditures are directly paid from the Vote of the Ministry of Finance to which the

03 April 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA**

contingency Budget is appropriated. The expenditure requests for contingency funding are evaluated against a set of criteria for national emergency or urgency. The law does not require that allocation from the contingency provision should be appropriated again by Parliament to various Offices, Ministries and Agencies under which the funded activities resort, but only that the Minister of Finance should report to Parliament on the use of the contingency provision and this does happen.

Let me now turn to the aspersions that the Budget is cut in stone by the Executive and Parliament is only expected to rubberstamp it, contrary to the constitutional provision which vests the power to approve the Budget in Parliament.

There is no argument that Parliament has the approval authority for the Budget. This is not only so in terms of the Constitution, but it is the practice. It is for this reason that the Executive undertakes extensive Budget preparations to ensure that Parliament is presented with detailed information on the activities to be funded under Budget and the results to be achieved from such funding. This information is subjected to thorough scrutiny by Parliament before Budget approval, which makes our Budget approval process probably the longest in the region, if not in the world.

The Executive has gone an extra mile to facilitate for public input into the Budget by introducing multi-annual expenditure plans in the form of MTEF. MTEF introduces more flexibility for public input into the Budget as it allows for up to two years for the public to engage Government on expenditure proposals before an *Appropriation Bill* is formulated. This arrangement provides ample opportunity for new proposals to be analysed and incorporated into the programme so that they form part of the *Appropriation Bill*. The argument that Parliament is expected to rubberstamp the Budget is, therefore, incorrect and at best misleading.

It is also important to emphasise that Members of Parliament who wish to have amendments introduced to the Bills that are tabled in this House need to convince other Members of Parliament to accept their proposals. This does not only apply to the Budget but to any other Bill presented in this House. The constitutional provision that empowers Parliament to approve

03 April 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA**

the Budget cannot be understood to bestow veto powers to Opposition Parties, so that whenever they have a contrary view to that which is contained in the Budget, then that justifies an amendment to the Appropriation Bill. That will be contrary to the democratic principles that our State is founded upon.

Some questions were raised about measuring the quality of service delivery. Let me state here that the introduction of programme budgeting is for the purpose of measuring the impact of expenditure and service-delivery on a programme basis. We have successfully piloted adjustments to the Chart of Account to allow for tracking of expenditure on activities and reporting on expenditure outcomes on the basis of activities and programmes.

The Performance and Effective Management Programme, which forms the basis of public financial management in MTEF, provides indices in regard to progress made on targets. In addition, the Government and ministerial accountability reports give an account of the activities of Government and progress made in respect to Offices, Ministries, Agencies' mandate and deliverables.

With regard to the outcome of the TIPEEG Programme, monitoring, valuation and reporting of TIPEEG outcome vests in the National Planning Commission. According to the information provided by the National Planning Commission, the total number of jobs created under TIPEEG dispensation during the last year amounted to 9,362 jobs. Altogether, the total jobs created under the Development Budget are reported to stand at 26,960. As of March 31, 2012, the total spending, including expenditure commitments for the Development Budget, inclusive of TIPEEG, amounted to N\$7,26 billion out of the total of N\$7.76 billion Development Budget allocated for 2011/2012.

This reflects an overall preliminary Budget execution rate of 93.6%. Further details on the TIPEEG outcome will be elaborated by the implementing line Ministries. I know that some Honourable Members are disappointed, because they were hoping to ride on this one.

03 April 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA**

As to the relationship between the TIPEEG projects and the Capital Budget, these aspects have been articulated on several occasions by the Director-General of the National Planning Commission. The TIPEEG projects are not additional to the Development Budget, they are part of the Capital Budget. The projects were identified on the basis of their growth enhancement and job creation potential. In fact, there is a booklet that lists all the TIPEEG projects and that was launched by His Excellency, the President some time last year. I thought the Members of Parliament attended and that they would have copies of the document, but it is available at the National Planning Commission for those who may not have copies.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, I have also already highlighted the implementation challenges which were encountered during the first year of TIPEEG implementation. I agree with the observation that implementation of TIPEEG needs to be reviewed. The lessons learned so far should help to ensure optimal success of the programme. In particular, we have to strengthen the engineering and technical capacity in project assessment as well as monitoring and evaluation. Measures are also being taken to improve measurement of employment and unemployment in terms of quality and frequency.

There is also scope for improving participation of regional and municipal authorities in project execution within the context of public procurement rules. In this regard the Regional Planning Boards will play a crucial role.

Further, we need to remain focused on the goal of maximising the creation of long-term jobs mostly in the Private Sector. This will include strengthening efforts that will foster higher Private Sector investment and growth.

Does the Budget leave the Private Sector on the periphery? I wanted Honourable Lucks to be here. I will say no. Our national tax regime provides for targeted incentives to the industries, including a tax haven – not even a tax holiday – in the form of an EPZ status for export-oriented manufacturers. Other incentives under our tax system include the provision for capital write-offs and accelerated depreciation for fixed

03 April 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA**

assets. There are also significance allowances in terms of which enterprises deduct expenses against their taxable income. Together these incentives render Namibia's effective taxes much more competitive and highly supportive of private investment.

The amended Tender Board Rules, which have now been submitted for gazetting, also provide for local sourcing, preferential treatment for Namibian enterprises, SMEs, youth, women and the previously disadvantaged in public procurement. In addition to the provisions of the Tender Board Rules, as amended, the envisaged SME Bank under the ambit of the Ministry of Trade and Industry as well as funding under the Development Bank of Namibia provides for affordable funding and SME development. The coming into force of the Financial Sector Strategy this year would facilitate for private commercial banks to meet their commitments on SME development contemplated in the Financial Sector Charter.

The Youth Credit Scheme as well as funding under the Vocational Graduate Fund facility at the Development Bank of Namibia are aimed at empowering our youth. During 2011/2012, a total of N\$472 million was allocated to the public finance institutions in addition to their current capital base to fund private sector undertaking.

In closing, Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, I want to express my appreciation once more for the support expressed by the Honourable Members and the public at large for the Budget. I also appreciate the valuable proposals made which, no doubt, will help us to improve the Budget further.

I may not have answered each and every question individually, but I have attempted to cover all the main topics that were raised during the Debate and I am confident that my Colleagues from Colleagues will clarify in detail issues concerning their Sectors during the Committee Stage.

With these few words, I appeal for your support for the *Appropriation Bill*.

03 April 2012

**SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA**

Honourable Deputy Speaker, I just wanted to announce that I have circulated an Errata, one on the Accountability Report and on the Estimates of Income and Expenditure, providing corrections on the documents. I think the main one is on the chapter of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare in the Accountability Report that was omitted. The second amendment is on the Estimates of Revenue and Expenditure. The following were omitted and are hereby inserted: In respect of the National Assembly on Pages 43 and 44, the estimate columns for the Financial Year 2014/2015 were omitted and we just inserted the estimates for that year and for Vote 12 – Ministry of Gender Equality and Child Welfare, on Pages 136, 137, 139, 140 and 141, the estimate columns for the Financial Year 2014/2015 were omitted and they are hereby being inserted.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now put the Question, that the Bill be read a Second Time. Any objections? Agreed to. The Secretary will read the Bill a Second Time.

SECRETARY: *Appropriation Bill.*

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the Second Order of the Day.

**RESUMPTION OF SECOND READING: CONFERMENT OF
NATIONAL HONOURS BILL**

03 April 2012

**CONFERMENT OF NATIONAL HONOURS BILL
HON NEHOVA**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on Second Reading – *Conferment of National Honours Bill.*

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When this Debate was adjourned on Wednesday, the 29th of February 2012, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Minister of Veteran Affairs, that the Bill be read a Second Time. Honourable Nehova adjourned the Debate and he now has the Floor.

HON NEHOVA: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. Honourable Deputy Speaker, in principle I have no problem with this Bill, however I have a small concern. (Interjections) I have lived in Britain for five years, some of you have never been to Britain, so you cannot teach me English.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, I have a question on the composition of the Honours Advisory Committee. As it stands here, the members to compose this body are drawn from Government Ministries, the Office of the President and from associations, whether religious or workers associations. My problem is that according to our Constitution the Government Ministries are established by the President of the country at his own leisure and in fact, the President may decide to govern with only two or three Ministries and he is not obliged by any law to establish certain Ministries. Now what will happen if we accept this composition and by 2014 there is a new President, either from this side or that side (laughter), and the new President may not confirm the existing Ministries? What would happen if the President dissolves some of the Ministries mentioned here or if, for example, some of these institutions mentioned here, such as the Council of Churches or organisations of workers, are dissolved? Shall we come back and amend the law or what will we do?

I can give an example of the first President of this country who established the Ministry of Correctional Services and the Ministry of Higher Education and Technology, Higher Education and Job Creation, Science

03 April 2012

**CONFERMENT OF NATIONAL HONOURS BILL
HON NEHOVA**

and Technology and eventually all those were abolished and are no longer in existence. The same can happen in future. A President may say there will be no Ministry of Veterans Affairs or Ministry of Safety and Security.

I want to propose to the Minister that instead of using Government departments and Ministries and associations, it should be people from certain fields of expertise as that would be safer. If we want a person from the Economic Sector, then we have a person from the economic sector, from the academic field, from the Traditional Authorities, from security, but it should be individuals with that expertise, not Government institutions as these are not permanent bodies. (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: May I ask the Honourable Member a question, please? Honourable Member, I appreciate your approach, but do you agree with me that your approach is more based on national interest of the country while the other side is looking at the protection and control of the Party?

HON NEHOVA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I am simply saying that we are guided by our laws and the Constitution and the President too is guided by the laws and Constitution and he has powers that he needs to use and he will use those powers. We have examples and that is that. Therefore, if that happens, will we come back here all the time to amend? I feel the way it is stated here is not viable. I rest my case, Honourable Deputy Speaker. Thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any further discussion? Professor Katjavivi.

03 April 2012

**CONFERMENT OF NATIONAL HONOURS BILL
HON PROF KATJAVIVI**

HON PROFF KATJAVIVI: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, I wish to make the following remarks in relation to the Conferment of National Honours Bill. The Bill has been crafted in a very well thought trough manner and the various sections have taken into consideration all the significant aspects. I do thank the Honourable Minister of Veteran Affairs and his team for the excellent work done.

Judging from the Bill before us, it is clear the Minister has taken on board all the suggestions and amendments that were presented to him and I simply wish to thank him for having done that.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, let what is on paper translate into practicality and let the terminology, “*national hero, national heroine,*” be upheld in its true sense so as to give true meaning to this law. With that I support the Bill and I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any further discussion? Does the Honourable Minister of Veteran Affairs wish to reply? The Honourable Minister is not here and the Debate is adjourned until tomorrow. The Secretary will read the Third Order of the Day.

**RESUMPTION OF SECOND READING: DISASTER RISK
MANAGEMENT BILL**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on Second Reading – *Disaster Risk Management Bill*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When the House adjourned on Thursday, 1 March 2012, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by Honourable Deputy Prime Minister. Any further discussion? Does the

03 April 2012

**PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON KAZENAMBO**

Honourable Deputy Prime Minister wish to reply?

HON DEPUTY PRIME MINISTER: Thank you, Comrade Deputy Speaker. I beg to Move that my response be next week, Tuesday.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Debate is adjourned until next week, Tuesday. The Secretary will read the Fourth Order of the Day.

**RESUMPTION OF SECOND READING:
PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on Second Reading – *Property Valuers Profession Bill*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When this Debate was adjourned on Wednesday, 22 February 2012, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Minister of Lands and Resettlement, that the Bill be read a Second Time. The Honourable Minister of Youth, National Service, Sport and Culture adjourned the Debate and he now has the Floor.

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: Thank you very much, Honourable Deputy Speaker. I was saying that the *Property Valuers Profession Bill* is most welcome as it is long overdue. Property is a core asset of any Nation, property is a core

03 April 2012

**PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON KAZENAMBO**

asset of any individual. Property contributes to capital formation, be it of an individual citizen or that of a Nation and, therefore, it is very important that you have professionals in the field who are guided by a tool and instrument of law like this one.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:40

HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:20

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: Property is an important asset to own, be it by an individual citizen or by a country and if the people who value these assets, such as houses, land, etcetera, are as professional and ethical as this Bill intends them to be, it will go a long way to change the current situation which is really worrisome.

The other day I was saying that the value of a property in Pioneers Park, Katutura or Ludwigsdorf or wherever in the country is not determined by the property, but in many cases the value of the property depends on the colour of the owner of the property and this I will say without shame or fear as I have experienced it many times. The colleagues from the banks collude with some so-called professional valuers because of your colour or your language. We are denying these things, but we are still at that stage, whether we like it or not and it is for us to graduate from this stage. Your property is devalued automatically, which is painful, and if you want to object, your property will be sold at N\$200,000 and if the new owner happens to be of a different colour, will immediately sell the house at a higher price. One does not know where to report this in this country. How are these people guided? That is why this important instrument should not be a Bill that gathers dust in our offices, it should be monitored. (Interjection)

03 April 2012

**PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON KAZENAMBO**

HON TJIHUIKO: Like others.

**HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT
AND CULTURE:** No, not like others, not like the NUDO constitution.
(Intervention)

HON RIRUAKO: On a Point of Order. I am the person who happened to let you know what is wrong and what is good, although you deny the fact even before God. You said NUDO is doing what? I have been telling you about these properties and now you are talking as if you have engineered it. You must apologise.

**HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT
AND CULTURE:** I agree that the Chief told me how his farm was invaded and it lost value. People now are saying that he did not take care of the farm and he lost the farm. However, on a serious note, we are in need of professional valuers, because how can the house of a poor lady in Mariental be sold for N\$100? It is not only in Mariental, you would also find that a person living in Katutura with a municipal debt of N\$5,000 and then the lawyers come and sell the house to the highest bidder and the highest bidder offers N\$6,000. This house must be valued to determine the value of the property and you know that the person owed the municipality N\$5,000 and the value of this property that has gone to the highest bidder for N\$6,000 was sold on the basis of the value. Maybe the lawyers look at it from another perspective, but honestly, what is happening in this country with regard to properties is heartbreaking.

This whole tendency is applied in other fields. We breed cattle in the communal areas with difficulty. Your cow in the communal area is bought for peanuts and immediately it is loaded on a truck, the price has already changed. Now it is the value of the new owner. (Intervention)

03 April 2012

PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON KAZENAMBO

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: May I ask a question? Do you think it would be possible for us to rectify that situation if, for example, we as Government say we want one Namibia, one Nation and by 2030 we want our society to be like this, but these professionals do not have a vision in place as to how they have to contribute to the bigger picture for us to attain that kind of society? The Government and other people have a vision as to how the country should look like, but they themselves actually have no vision as to how that society is going to look like. Do you think they are ever going to be part and parcel of that society if all of us do not have a vision of what we want to attain, more so when they are branches of companies based somewhere else? Will they ever have a patriotic Namibian vision?

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: Your question is philosophical, it is technical, it is loaded. The reason why Cuba is a beast in the stomach of the beast is because sanctions by the most imperialist country of the world, America, has not made Cuba to collapse. It is because it is guided by vision. The Cubans have graduated from colour and they live it. (Intervention)

HON NEHOVA: Does the Honourable Kazenambo know that the vision he mentioned is contained in this book we call the Namibian Constitution? Do you know that everything is here in the Constitution and if we follow that Constitution, we will be able to get everything?

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: Yes, I agree with the Honourable Member that everything is in the Constitution and even this Bill is written within the spirit of the Constitution, but the practitioners, the human-beings dealing with this issue sometimes ignore the provisions of the Constitution when it does not satisfy their personal interests.

03 April 2012

PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON KAZENAMBO

What sustained us during the liberation struggle, we had people called *kommissars* and that is why Cuba survived, but if you have *kommissars*, people who are promoting your values as a society, you can do everything within those values and cultures and principles, but in a capitalist system they value money and profiteering. (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, may I ask the Honourable Minister a small question? Honourable Minister, I appreciate the fact that now you at least have admitted some of the remarks that were made some time back in answering the question of the Honourable Deputy Minister of Justice. The Honourable Minister was saying Cuba has a vision and that is why they have survived the pressure by the Big Brother. 22 years after Independence we are struggling with these things and it is obvious that you admit that SWAPO does not have that vision which Cuba has. I think it is very important for somebody like you to admit that, it is crucially important, Minister. I appreciate your honesty in that respect. It is very good, you have done extremely well.

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: It is not surprising that it is coming from you, a professional twister. It is good that publicly you are putting words in my mouth, twisting what I am saying I have been subjected to that, you are not the first one. People put words in my mouth to suit their own agenda and I am used to that, but it is good that it is being done even in this House so that people can know how people put words in Kazenambo's mouth. Twist it like your brothers and sisters already did. (Intervention)

HON RIRUAKO: On a Point of Information. We have protection of the State against individual property and you have all agreed. It is not a matter of which Political Party you belong to, all of you agreed to this, the so-called *verskansing* in Afrikaans. Is it God or Jesus who said you cannot change your own Constitution? That I have to hear from you, what

03 April 2012

**PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON KAZENAMBO**

is your intention, what is your understanding on this matter?

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: I think I must move towards my conclusion. Thank you, Honourable Riruako, and it is a pity that your two fellow Members of Parliament have run away from that good advice. This should be a non-partisan issue. (Intervention)

HON SHIXWAMENI: May I ask the Honourable Minister a question? In fact, you are doing quite well and my question is whether you would agree that it is time for the State, through its institutions, to put a moratorium on the auctioning of people's houses and other properties for petty debts? Would you further agree with me that indeed it is nobody else, but the Ministry of Justice that needs to act in this particular regard to put a stop to this barbaric practice?

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: I agree wholeheartedly with you that it is about time that the State does this through its mechanisms and I do not know whether the Ministry of Justice should be singled out. The other day I said this is the house for lawmaking and if it is through Ministries, it should be initiated from here. Can we not initiate something and then the secretaries take it from there? Is it taboo? I do not know. However, the point remains that it is about time that they do something about that issue, because it is uncalled for that people's houses are auctioned. It is broad-day robbery as far as I am concerned by professional thieves who use the law and the banks and the Constitution to rob our poor people. I do not know which is the relevant State machinery to do it, but we need to do it.

On the question of the vision, it is not a question of SWAPO having lost its vision, it is a question of us as lawmakers, it is a question of us as collective Namibian leadership and collective as we are leading our Ministries, collective as we are leading our Political Parties to attend to

03 April 2012

PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON KAZENAMBO

those issues that are affecting our people. Our people are not haunted by tribalism and racism, the people are using this because there is a vacuum, there is no protection by those who are supposed to lead, being all of us collectively. They are using this situation to practise racism and racism is being practised on property values. Tribalism is being used to do other things, whether we like it or not. Kazenambo is not a problem, the problem is the issues and we are not addressing. The issue is property value and I have been wondering why on earth, 22 years down the road, the value of a property in the beautiful towns of Ongwediva, Oshakati, Katima Mulilo, Aminuis, remain so low? Why should the value of these properties in the so-called communal areas remain so low? How long is it going to remain communal? These are the questions that we need to answer. How long is it going to remain communal? Is it only the situation here or also in Britain that land in upcoming towns should be sold for peanuts?

When is the value of these properties going to increase?

The other day I saw a mansion in Rundu belonging to a property baron, but that property has no value and one uses property to get access to financing to expand your wealth. That is why I talked about capital formation, which is an economic issue. You find mansions in Oshakati and Ondangwa which those people could have used to take loans to also expand.

Those who are building lodges in the rural areas are doing so because they have houses in Hochland Park, Pioneers Park and Olympia and that is perhaps where the question by Honourable Nambahu comes in, that we need to be educated on this issue of property, because calling a spade a spade, when some of us moved into these properties, we started making fires in those houses. (Interjections) Yes, one should be balanced, it is typical of me, I will not leave any stone unturned. (Intervention)

HON MOONGO: May I put a question? Is the Honourable Member aware that those who buy the houses of poor people are the rich people,

03 April 2012

PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON KAZENAMBO

the elite and nobody can challenge them as the poor people do not have money to face them in the courts?

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: In conclusion, Honourable Deputy Speaker, because it will go on and on... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: May I ask the Honourable Member just a small question? Honourable Member, is it not now time for us to amend the Commercial Land Act so that commercial land becomes State land?

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: The issues that are mentioned cannot be addressed here and the time allocated to me will not allow me to go into that. However, we must look at the pros and cons, the benefits, because to own commercial land is not the evil of the whole thing. You may own commercial land, but the value should not be based on colour. If it is communal land or State land, it must remain State land and what prevents State land in the communal area to be valued on the same basis as commercial land? We live in the same country and I do not know what is the logic that land in Omuthiya, in Gam, in Okakarara or everywhere in the 13 Regions cannot be equal to that in the so-called Police Zone.

To be honest, if today you go to Hochfeldt, the owner will decide it is N\$4,000.00 per hectare, take it or leave it. One does not know whether this N\$4,000.00 per hectare is sacrosanct, because the bank will just say the owner says so. If the owner says so, you just need to accept it. These things are contrary to the principle of one Namibia, one Nation because it is annoying.

The very same person who sold at N\$4,000.00 per hectare will offer N\$1,200.00 per hectare for a farm in the same area. It seems there are

03 April 2012

PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON SCHLETTWEIN

some people who determine the prices here and you do not know what the role of the State is. The State must re-value all land in Namibia, whether commercial or communal, and then determine that this is the value of communal land.

What we have now is capitalism at it ugliest and it is going to war. It is the arrogance of a person telling you that it is N\$3,000.00 per hectare, take it or leave it and he moves to the next farm and buys it for peanuts.

Therefore this Bill is overdue, we welcome it. Train the people, but let us not only have trained people, also bodies of arbitration. I support the Bill.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Deputy Minister of Finance.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. I also rise to support the Bill insofar as it addresses the regulation of professional valuers. However, I do have some comments on the way the Bill suggests to go about it and I would like to make some general comments on issues that have been raised so far.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, I think the Debate has more concentrated on an underlying problem and that is the price escalation of rural and urban land prices and in a way there is an expectation that this Bill will address that problem. I will come to that later, but I think that would be a bit ambitious. If the assumption is that the valuations of property are in fact predetermined price and, therefore, the profession of valuers should be controlled to get a handle on price, I think we are touching on only one issue of many factors that influence land price and I will talk to that.

I do not dispute that prices of land, be it urban, rural or agricultural, are too high and that that makes it an unaffordable asset for many of our people and I think that is the cardinal problem. There is, however, also an economic argument and that is that land or property is an asset class in

03 April 2012

PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON SCHLETTWEIN

itself that is used as an investment instrument and that there are significant risks involved if that asset class moves in a bubble or moves along unsustainable trends and I think that argument was also made, that especially the real estate is moving towards a bubble, is at risk of collapsing and, therefore, poses a risk to the whole economy. (Intervention)

HON RIRUAKO: May I ask a tiny question? Are you aware that the estate agencies created this havoc? Secondly, they charge N\$60,000.00, N\$70,000.00 commission and we see this. As I said in the Observer newspaper, there is no price control, we have to control the price. What happened to that? What makes us not to control the price not to get out of hand? You are the man who is supposed to do that.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Honourable Riruako, yes, I am aware of estate agents that have an impact on the price, but Honourable Member, it is not only agents, it is also the financiers and it is also the sellers that have an impact on the price. I will come to it later, but I think your concern is shared.

Before I go to the price issue, let me look at the principal intent of the Act and that is to regulate the profession of valuers and I think that intent is praiseworthy and I definitely support it. The question I, however, still have with that one is also one that talks to price. I see that as an elaborate way in which these professional councils and structures that we are creating are to be funded and all of that is actually loaded on the transaction cost of the very price that we want to lower. I do see that there is a risk that our intent is to lower the price, but in real terms we increase the transaction costs when we buy real estate or land, because I do see in the Act that all the fees would be in addition to existing taxes like transfer duties, stamp duty tax or whatever fees that there are and I think we could achieve the same if we do not create elaborate councils that are there in a permanent way, but that these organs are created as sections of your Ministries and you bring in professionals in an ad hoc way as and when

03 April 2012

PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON SCHLETTWEIN

you need them to support your regulatory ability if that is needed. I think we must somehow be cautious about creating new institutions and I am taking the leaf from our Budget theme and that is “*to do more with less*”.

I think we must start by curbing back creating institutions and try to achieve the goals with what we have in our institutions.

Let me turn to the fear of a bubble. We did look into that problem, but the information that we have received is that investments in real estate are still good investments and the value increase in that asset class is still a good one. There is no evidence that there would be a collapse of the real estate market or there is no indication that there is an immediate bubble that we have to fear and that our economy is, therefore, at risk. I can from the information available to us allay those fears, there is no real evidence for that.

However, to come back to the question that the Honourable Riruko asked... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: May I ask a question? You are saying that from a real estate point of view there is no indication of a bubble, which I somehow agree with although not entirely. However, within a bubble there can be other influencing factors. How do you describe our existing situation where the majority of the citizens have no access to land, be it urban or commercial agricultural land, because within this bubble the prices are so prohibitive that the citizens cannot afford this land. Farms are now being bought by South Africans in big numbers and I am putting this within the class of real estate and also within the bubble. Urban land is being bought by developers especially from Angola. Windhoek is being bought up and how do we address this within the bubble? Has this not collapsed for the citizens, that we can no longer afford land? When will the bubble really become a bubble and how does it manifest itself?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: Honourable Minister,

03 April 2012

**PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON SCHLETTWEIN**

when I talk about a bubble, I mean a bubble in the economic sense where you have unsustainable price increases that run the risk to collapse and that is the bubble. The bubble bursts and then the prices fall through the floor. The problem that you are indicating, I agree with you, but that is not what we call a bubble, it is unsustainable price increases that move out of the affordability range of your citizens and that is a problem what we have. However, that is not what I meant when I talked about the phenomenon of an economic bubble.

I do want to reach the issue of developers, financiers and agents and their influence on land or real estate prices. I think what we are seeing is that all those actors in that market show tendencies of behaviour that would be comparable to cartel behaviour. They talk to each other and there is a drive that leaves the buyer unprotected. I think that is a problem that needs to be addressed and I am not so sure whether valuers can address that. They can introduce some stability in prices, but I do not think they can necessarily have a handle on the whole range of problems or the inter-linkages that we see.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, what we have is, on the one hand, the demand for land as productive means, but we do not with our citizens have the ability to pay for that land at prices that others are able to pay and there the argument of the Honourable Minister of Youth comes in. I believe that there is significant interest from foreign investors in our land, be it real estate or farmland and on farmland specifically the price structure has moved far beyond the production potential of that land. If you want to farm a piece of land and produce livestock or crop or a mixture of those, that land has a certain production potential and that should be close to the price you pay for that piece of land. What we are seeing now is that that price we are paying now is far beyond that, it is much higher than that, so it is bought by people that do not necessarily want to farm, but they want to invest in that asset class because of its value increase. (Interjection) That is my problem, that I am sure those valuers that we have both in the public and private sector are professionals, but the fact that they are valuing has not curbed price escalation. Therefore, I am back to my argument to say we should not expect this Act to regulate prices through regulating the profession of

03 April 2012

PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON SCHLETTWEIN

valuers. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: May I ask a question? That is actually the issue, that there is a value on what the land can produce so that at least when you buy a piece of land and produce on it, it must actually produce comparable to that value. Now you are saying the value of the farms we are buying is not comparable to what can be produced on the land and here we are busy debating in order to approve the *Professional Valuers Bill*. If these people are professionals, how come they value the land above the production value of the land? Why are they doing that?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: Honourable Minister, that is a very relevant question and there are a number of reasons for that. I tried to inform myself how valuations are done on farmland. We see that some of these commercial farms are very seriously over-capitalised and all the capital structures that you see on a farm form part of the price of that land, but it does not form part of the production potential of that very farm. If you have livestock farm which is converted into a livestock-cum-tourist potential farm, you have lodges, swimming pools, all sorts of infrastructure developed on that farm which is not talking to the agricultural production potential of that piece of land, it talks to something else and if you value that piece of land, those structures are part and parcel of the value. That is one aspect.

The other aspect is a demand and supply issue. If you have a buyer that offers you a better price, in a capitalist society you fetch what the market can bear instead of linking it to a production potential or another realistic kind of issue and I think that is what we are seeing in some sectors of the market.

We are aware that a number of farms are put on auction as if the farmer went insolvent. (Intervention)

03 April 2012

PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON SCHLETTWEIN

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Comrade Deputy Speaker, may I ask Honourable Schlettwein a question? I am following in the footsteps of Honourable Katali's question. I do not own a commercial farm, but I have learned that if one buys a commercial farm through AgriBank, the bank has its own valuers who are sent to that specific farm on offer to value objectively as to what that farm could cost. However, then they tell the potential buyer that the value is this much and we can only pay you this much, the rest is your own. If that is true, whom do we blame when the price is escalating? Is it the valuers, is it the Government or the buyers?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: Comrade Secretary General, I do not know whether I want to go into the blaming game, but I think you are probably looking for the underlying reasons why there is a discrepancy between the two systems of valuations. What you have said is correct, the AgriBank, as far as I know, pegs the total loan amount for a farm against the production potential of that farm. That is because they are a bank that makes its profitability out of getting the loans paid back from farmers that farm the land. They are not in the business of selling and marketing real estate. Therefore, I believe the AgriBank is correct in pegging the loan amount for a farm against the production potential of that land. Of course, they cannot dictate to the seller that that must be the price for the farm. If the seller wants to fetch a higher price, then the buyer must look for the difference between what the loan amount would be and the actual price.

However, I think you put your finger in the wrong place because that is the problem. The reasons why we have land prices escalating cannot be an increase in production potential, there are other reasons and I think the most obvious reason is that land worldwide is becoming a very scarce commodity and a piece of land becomes a very sought-after asset whose value is determined by other things over and above its agricultural potential. The fact that you can buy a farm of three thousand or ten thousand hectare in Namibia is so attractive to many people that they are prepared to pay a much higher price than the agricultural production value of that land is and that becomes a problem for ourselves if we want to

03 April 2012

PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON SCHLETTWEIN

satisfy the land hunger of our people, which I believe is a pivotal point in our economic development agenda, that we use the land available to us as means of production and that we use land as that natural asset to empower our people. (Intervention)

HON KAURA: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? In view of the fact that many commercial farms are registered as close corporations and, therefore, you no longer buy land but shares, do you not think that has escalated the competition because that has opened up to anybody and the idea that foreigners must not buy land in Namibia is bypassed because the foreigner is buying shares, he is not buying land and therefore, it has increased the competition and the seller knows that he is going to sell to somebody with a lot of money from London or South Africa. Do you not think that has contributed to the escalation of the price of land because farms are registered as close corporations and they sell shares, no longer land? (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: Honourable Member, I take your point, I think you are right. Land, real estate and even farmland has become a very sought-after asset class that can be traded with as shares to close corporations and companies, but also as pieces of land, property of individuals. However, I think you are right and I understand your argument being that land is much more than an agricultural means of production, it has become an asset class that is traded in many ways and, therefore, price fluctuations are determined by not only agricultural potential and food prices, it is determined by many other issues.

The other aspect, of course, which talks to your point is that we are living in very interesting economic times and land has traditionally been that asset that becomes very sought after if other asset classes become less attractive. If equity markets collapse, people go to gold and land and I think we see some of that in our economy. (Intervention)

03 April 2012

PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON SCHLETTWEIN

HON RIRUAKO: I am sorry to interrupt you, but the land issue has gone too far, there is no point of return unless the Government puts its foot down. All the land has become close corporations and as such cannot be returned to us and it is not the Government who created this situation, it is certain individuals from somewhere who has the intention to take over the land behind our backs, we cannot be blamed for that because it was done before the country became independent. For that matter, all of us have to be aware that the land is being taken through the backdoor without the Parliament or the Government's decision. I cannot blame the Government for that. Those who bought land that way must be responsible for the outcome of whatever decisions the Government or the people or Namibia have taken.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you. That was a comment.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: This land issue is a very important issue. While you are elaborating on the dilemma on which we find ourselves, could you touch on other alternatives which the Government can embark upon to solve the mess in which we find ourselves?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: I wanted to do that in my concluding remarks. I do not think it is an insurmountable problem. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Minister of Lands, I ask this question, taking into consideration the way he deliberates on issues and I do not think I am wrong. Please proceed Honourable Deputy Minister.

03 April 2012

PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON SCHLETTWEIN

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I think what I would offer as a suggestion is, as I said in the beginning, our anticipation, our expectation appears to be that through this piece of legislation we will make major inroads on curbing land prices and real estate prices. I believe I made an argument that that is maybe one important component, but not the end of the story. I do believe that over and above proceeding with this piece of legislation, we have to engage in a more comprehensive review of all the different pieces of legislation that talks to the problem and there are a number of them. I can give you an example.

The insolvency legislation, for instance, makes it possible to put a farm on auction without going through the waiver procedures in the Commercial Land Act. I believe that that has introduced a possibility to sell land to bidders in an auction situation which we have very little control over. We do not know who the bidders are, we do not know what the price would be, it is a totally open process and we have in principle agreed that that is a loophole that must be plugged in a way that, obviously, property rights are still protected, but that it is made impossible to misuse that kind of loophole to drive up prices. That is an example where an unrelated piece of legislation, the Insolvency Act, makes it possible to anybody to bid for a farm in Namibia and we have very little legal recourse to prevent that or bring that into our economic development agenda.

Therefore, I think having used that as an example, there are many other loopholes that can be plugged, but it needs a comprehensive review of the legal framework through which land can be sold and bought.

To end with I must also say that from an investment point of view and from a means of production point of view, land remains a very crucial element in our economic development agenda, so there is some urgency in addressing this matter and bringing land and house prices, for that matter, closer to affordability ranges, closer than we are now. We have a serious problem at hand and I think I agree with Honourable Kazenambo that if not dealt with, we are running the risk that we will at the end of the day be unable to solve the problem.

03 April 2012

PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON UUTONI

With those few words I do support the Bill because it is one important step in a long chain of steps to be taken to have a transparent way of determining values of asset classes and a very important asset class for that. I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I am aware that anything related to land is very important to everybody, but I should think the Minister concerned is just reminding us that we must confine ourselves to the subject matter as per the proposed Bill. I hope we will do that although I cannot prevent you from touching on other issues related to the land.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Thank you, Deputy Speaker, I will try to confine myself to the Bill. This Bill has come at the right time when every citizen in this country has realised that the price of immovable property has serious effects on their livelihood.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the establishment of the Namibian Council for Property Valuers Profession is a welcome move because this body will take up the responsibility to protect the public in their dealings with registered persons as per Section 7(g)(i) at Page 7 of this Bill.

My past experience in the Local Authority fraternity has taught me a lot concerning property valuations. The valuation of immovable property in Local Authority areas does not only increase the property price, but it also has a serious effect on our water bills. I think when you look at your water bill you would ask yourself how it has come to that amount while you have only used so much water. The increase in your water bill is related to the value of your property. (Interjections) I do not think that is news. As your property value increases, the higher your water bill per month becomes. People in towns and cities complain about the high price of water and in most cases this is not the case, because your water consumption plus other charges can only be N\$400 per month, for

03 April 2012

PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON UUTONI

example, but if you add property tax of N\$550, your bill will go up to N\$1,000 per month. This is what I am trying to explain to you.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the other observation is that when valuers are appointed to evaluate properties in a given Local Authority, they seem not to have time for house owners. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I would like to ask Honourable Uutoni a question for clarity. Honourable Uutoni was saying property tax is included in the water bill and I do not understand that. I thought that in your municipal bill you are charged for water and then you have tax, waste and others, but the water bill remains the same for the area and not per individual property. I am not very clear on that.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: I am now learning that some of the Members do not properly check their water bills. There is an item called assessment rate. What is assessed? It is your property. That is the price of your property and it is for you to pay that one, because that is an income for the Council and they have to put it on your water bill. It is included in your water bill. (Intervention)

HON KAURA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, there is assessment and then the real value of what you have used. It is the same with electricity, the assessment and what you have consumed, the basic and they are put together and based on the value of your house the assessment is high and then you pay for the water and electricity.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: That is exactly what we are doing. My other observation is that when valuers are

03 April 2012

PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON UUTONI

appointed to evaluate properties in a given Local Authority, they seem not to have time for house owners. If the owner is not at home on that day of valuation, they just continue to value your property and off they go, not to return to the same property. At the end of the day you as the house owner are caught by surprise, asking yourself how the monthly bill increased so suddenly. (Intervention)

HON MOONGO: I want to ask the Honourable Member a small question. Why do the Councillors assess the water and electricity, is it not the duty of the municipality on their own?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: I do not know whether I got the question, but what I am trying to say is that the municipality has the responsibility to appoint valuers. These valuers sometimes do not have time and sometimes you find that your water bill has gone up. Upon enquiry at the municipality they will tell you it is because your property value appreciates. Now the valuers are no longer there, they have gone and you are in trouble.

What I am trying to say, Honourable Deputy Speaker, is that such situation of inconvenience causes many people to object to the whole process of valuation in our towns and that has a serious implication not only for the individual house owners but also for the Local Authorities. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: May I ask a question? When you started your intervention you mentioned that you support the *Valuers Profession Bill* and you welcome it and you also mentioned that you hope that they will take up their responsibilities and value the properties correctly. I just want to ask you, is there any guarantee that this body will live up to your expectations, knowing that we have the Law

03 April 2012

PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON UUTONI

Society for legal practitioners, a body for architects and engineers and that we have created monsters which normally prevent our people from getting access. It has become a club of an exclusive few. Therefore, I do not know what you are welcoming.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: It is a good question, Honourable Deputy Speaker. The intention of the Minister in tabling this Bill was to bring some changes to some of these problems and we hope that this Bill is going to bring a lot of changes. That is why I said I welcome it.

The objections in magistrate courts is mostly ruled in favour of the house owners, which will eventually reject the whole valuation process and council is required to cover the cost. These are some of the things that the new Namibian Council for Property Valuers Profession has to take into consideration. When the owner objects to the Valuation Court, then the Court has to rule in favour of that particular person and then who is supposed to pay the costs? It is the council and then the whole process of valuation has to be thrown away.

Honourable Kazenambo was talking about communal land. The Honourable Minister is busy demarcating our communal land, confining us to twenty hectares. I think it is a good move. Can we not think of valuating the twenty hectares, because some of the people have also put up mansions in the communal areas? (Intervention)

HON MWANINGANGE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, may I put a question to Honourable Uutoni for clarity and for justice to prevail in the valuation of immovable properties? How do you see justice prevailing when it comes to newly proclaimed land, whereby you are removed from your communal property for which you are compensated with N\$10,000 in 2012, but after that land has been services the cost will increase a hundred times that amount? How do you think the valuers get to a price

03 April 2012

PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON UUTONI

of N\$200,000, while the compensation was only N\$10,000 last year?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Thank you very much, Honourable Deputy Speaker. If I got the question clearly, this is what I am trying to say, that maybe we should also move a step ahead when looking at communal land. When people are being moved from communal land they receive peanuts. At least now that you are allocated your twenty hectares, that area should be valued and when somebody says you have to move away, then you know the value and that value should always increase. We know it is State land, but let us move a step ahead to help our people. We are just helping other people but our people are not being helped.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, I want to raise a concern about the two valuation categories, the valuation by the financial institutions, the banks, and the valuers appointed by the Local Authorities. If, for example, you want to buy a house here in Windhoek, you will always find two different prices for that house. The municipal valuation roll will, for instance, value the house at N\$500,000 and that of the bank will value the same property at N\$1 million. These levels of valuations and differences are raising concern on the valuation criteria used by both institutions as well as qualifications of those entrusted to carry out the valuation. (Intervention)

HON RIRUAKO: This money goes to the councillors. The chief gets N\$50 and again N\$25 and for your valuations it is N\$75 and this money is not coming to the Government, it goes to individual chiefs. I cannot tolerate nonsense. What happens is this, what kind of valuation are you talking about? It was ill-planned, it is unprofessional, it is corruption and you continue telling the people how good it is. That is unfair. You put N\$75 in an individual's pocket every day and nobody counts this money how it was put to use.

03 April 2012

PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON UUTONI

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: What I wanted to find out is, who is the more qualified, the valuer from the bank or the valuer from the Local Authority?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The House is adjourned until tomorrow, 14:30.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:45 UNTIL 2012.04.04 AT 14:30

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS
WINDHOEK
04 APRIL 2012**

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any Petitions? Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Notice of Questions? Notice of Motions? Honourable Professor Katjavivi

MOTION ON THE BUSINESS OF ASSEMBLY

HON PROFF KATJAVIVI: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I Move without Notice, that the proceedings on Votes 1, 2, 4 and 30 of the *Appropriation Bill* be, in terms of Rule 90(c) of the Standing Rules and Orders, not interrupted if still under consideration at 17:45.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please table the Motion. Any other Notice of Motions? Ministerial Statements? The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

COMMITTEE STAGE: APPROPRIATION BILL

SECRETARY: Committee Stage – *Appropriation Bill*.

04 April 2012

**COMMITTEE STAGE: APPROPRIATION BILL
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Does the Honourable Minister of Finance Move that the Assembly now goes into Committee?

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: I so Move, Honourable Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objections? Who seconds? Agreed to. I now call on the Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Professor Katjavivi, to take the Chair.

ASSEMBLY IN COMMITTEE:

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: The whole House Committee is called to Order, the Committee has to consider the *Appropriation Bill*.

Vote 01 – “**OFFICE OF THE PRESIDENT**”, **N\$379,759,400** put for Introduction.

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND ATTORNEY-GENERAL: Thank you very much, Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee. Honourable Deputy Chairperson, I rise to motivate Vote 01 – Office of the President.

The Budget Debate during the past weeks has centred on a wide range of issues in keeping with the spirit of the Second Reading Stage of the *Appropriation Bill*. We have now reached the Committee Stage where we

04 April 2012 **COMMITTEE STAGE: INTRODUCTION VOTE 01**
HON DR KAWANA

are required to discuss specific projects and programmes of different Votes to establish how public resources have been allocated to different Offices, Ministries and Agencies.

Today I am standing before you, Honourable Members, to present to this august House my motivation for the funds allocated to Vote 01, Office of the President, for the 2012/2013 Financial Year.

When Parliament opened in February, I laid on the Table of the National Assembly the 2010/2011 Annual Report of the Office of the President. The Report gives a detailed account of activities undertaken by the Office of the President during the period under review. In addition, Budget documents which the Honourable Members received contain what is termed Accountability Reports of Office, Ministries and Agencies regarding their activities during the period under review. The Report details the successes and challenges faced by such institutions during the Financial Year which ended last week. It was only yesterday when our capable Honourable Minister of Finance gave a comprehensive response to the Budget Debate during the Second Reading. In addition, His Excellency the President of the Republic of Namibia, Dr Hifikepunye Pohamba, will deliver a State of the Nation Address later this month, as required by Article 32(2) of the Namibian Constitution. I am recording all these steps to show that the Namibian Executive is one of the most transparent institutions on the African continent. This is in keeping with the principles of good governance and democracy.

Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, I was indeed asking myself what more can I say. Why not change the rules so that instead of motivating, we go straight to Debate the Vote as announced by the Deputy Chairperson. I believe that this procedure will cut the Budget Debate by more than a month. For the record, however, allow me to say something.

In order to carry out the responsibilities of the Office of the President, it is necessary to provide both financial and human resources. For this I would like to express my appreciation to my senior Colleague, the Honourable Minister of Finance and, indeed, the entire staff of that Ministry for their

04 April 2012 **COMMITTEE STAGE: INTRODUCTION VOTE 01**
HON DR KAWANA

understanding. They have been forthcoming at critical times to provide financial resources in order to enable our President to carry out constitutional functions. I can only say thank you my dear sister and dear colleagues.

The most critical functions of the President are contained in Article 32 of the Namibian Constitution. The President is entrusted with numerous functions under a number of Acts of Parliament. In addition, the common law as well as customary law impose certain functions on the President.

These responsibilities place additional demands and their implementation requires both human and financial resources. At the international level the President has continued to promote a positive image and esteem of our country. Namibia continues to enjoy respect and prestige globally. We take pride in the fact that we are rated as one of the highest performing nations on the African continent. Our President is among the top five best performing Heads of State and Government on the continent. Our citizens are able to walk tall among the free nations of the world. We continue to maintain friendship both at bilateral and multilateral levels.

As was the case in the past, the President made time available to interact with various stakeholders around the country as well as foreign visitors. He invited important economic sectors and policy-makers from the Government, private sector, organised labour and the youth to State House in order to engage them and solicit their views regarding the performance of our economy and other challenges that we face as a Nation. The President also engaged our citizens from the business community to political leaders, from church leaders to Traditional Leaders and from Regional and Local Authority Councillors to individual citizens on many issues of national interest.

During the missions undertaken outside the country at the bilateral level, the President's main objective was to promote the economic interest of our country, such as promoting foreign investment.

Against that background I am happy to outline some of the specific activities that the President will be involved in as part of his day-to-day

04 April 2012 **COMMITTEE STAGE: INTRODUCTION VOTE 01**
HON DR KAWANA

functions and duties during the 2012/2013 Financial Year.

Just as has been the case in the past, this Financial Year will be a very busy year for our President both domestically and internationally. It will involve constant engagements with communities from all backgrounds; interact with our citizens in different regions to familiarise himself with the prevailing socio-economic conditions in our country. During these visits a number of capital projects will be visited to assess their progress, while others will be inaugurated by the President.

In addition, the President has standing invitations to a number of foreign countries around the world. These visits will enable Namibia to once again cement diplomatic relations with such countries and provide an opportunity to promote trade relations between our business community and their counterparts. It is, therefore, given that the President will host a number of official as well as state visits to Namibia by Heads of State and Governments of other countries. In addition, our Head of State has already received a number of invitations from counterparts to undertake official and state visits. This will provide an opportunity to our Head of State to promote economic relations between such countries and Namibia.

In addition, since Namibia is a member of the United Nations, Non-Aligned Movement, the Commonwealth, the African Union, SADC and many other international organisations, the President is expected to attend summits of these bodies.

Honourable Deputy Chairperson, I now turn to discuss the specific programmes. There are five main programmes covered under Vote 01. The first programme involves the protection and defence of the Namibian Constitution. This includes measures to, among others, uphold, protect and defend the Namibian Constitution, ensure that the organs of State deliver on Government's overall objectives and ensure that as Commander-in-Chief of the Namibian Defence Force, threats to Namibia's national security, territorial integrity, political stability, military threats and economic sabotage are checked. Therefore, the main aim of this programme is to comply with Chapter 5 of the Namibian Constitution which deals with the duties and functions of the President. The main

04 April 2012 **COMMITTEE STAGE: INTRODUCTION VOTE 01**
HON DR KAWANA

objective of Chapter 5 is to ensure the maintenance of peace and stability and good governance in our country.

The activities involved under this programme include:

- Hosting of ceremonial functions;
- Official opening of statutory bodies;
- Receiving and commissioning of Ambassadors and High Commissioners;
- Undertaking of State and official visits to other countries in order to promote bilateral relations, commercial trade and investment as well as to sign treaties, agreements and conventions with other countries or international organisations.

The programme will also enable the President to carry out functions vested in him and the Cabinet under Chapter 6 of the Namibian Constitution. It is aimed at strengthening and consolidating diplomatic relations with the international community, improve governance, enhance democracy and attract foreign investors to Namibia.

Honourable Deputy Chairperson, a total amount of N\$56,910,000.00 is requested under this programme.

The second programme involves delivery of services. As Honourable Members are aware, the President is the Chairperson of the Cabinet as well as Cabinet Committee on Overall Policy and Priorities. Against this background, the President directs, monitors and evaluates the activities of Offices, Ministries and Agencies in the implementation of Government policies, promotion and maintenance of a conducive environment and contribution to the promotion of international peace and security. The activities of the programme will include assisting the President with executive policy matters through research, policy analysis, speech-writing and technical briefs in corroboration with various office, ministries and agencies.

04 April 2012 **COMMITTEE STAGE: INTRODUCTION VOTE 01**
HON DR KAWANA

As Honourable Members are aware and, indeed, as I have pointed out, this month our President will deliver the State of the Nation Address. Contribution to the State of the Nation Address from Offices, Ministries and Agencies and, indeed, other institutions is highly appreciated.

The overall objective of this programme is to improve public service delivery, regular review of policies and promotion of national unity and harmony in our country.

Honourable Deputy Chairperson, a total amount of N\$28,481,000.00 is requested.

The third programme is intelligence. Consistent with our democratic culture, the Intelligence Agency carries out its functions in terms of the Namibia Central Intelligence Service Act (Act 10 of 1997). The main function of the Service is to contribute to the defence of the territorial integrity and independence of Namibia. To this end, effective gathering of intelligence is vital in order to thwart threats to Namibia's constitutional and democratic order. I would like to use this opportunity to thank our Intelligence Service Agency for the excellent work they are doing, especially in fighting crime in our country and I believe one Member of this House by the name of Honourable Moongo, the Deputy President of DTA, will agree with me on this point. The Intelligence Service shares the accumulated intelligence with law enforcement agencies in order to prevent and combat criminal activities and thereby contributing to the enjoyment of life by the Namibian people in a safe, secure and harmonious environment where they can pursue their activities without the threat of violence and crime.

Honourable Members, we witness virtually on a daily basis the effects of terrorism on innocent civilians. Namibia is part of the globalised world, therefore, events which affect peace and stability in one corner of the globe can easily have a spill-over effect in our country. We should, therefore, monitor terrorist activities for the sake of peace and stability in our peaceful country. It is for this reason that we need to render financial and material support to our Intelligence.

04 April 2012 **COMMITTEE STAGE: INTRODUCTION VOTE 01**
HON DR KAWANA

Honourable Members will agree with me that the nature of the work of this institution does not allow me to elaborate any further than I have done. I am sure Honourable Members of the Defence and the Security Committee who are in this Chamber fully agree with me.

Under this programme, an amount of N\$275,385,000.00 is requested.

The fourth programme involves the Office of the Founding President. The main purpose of this programme is to ensure that the Office of the Founding President is properly maintained and that efficient services are provided to our Founding President. As Honourable Members are aware, the Founding President performs ceremonial functions as per invitations from the public and the private sector. He also attends official functions inside and outside Namibia. The Founding President carries out functions provided for under the Former Presidents Pension and Other Benefits Act (Act 18 of 2004).

Honourable Deputy Chairperson, allow me to state that this programme mirrors our democratic culture. I have stated time and again that we must continue to nourish our democratic institutions so that our democracy can be durable. We witness with frequent regularity how some countries treat their former Heads of State. It is a given fact that most of such countries are not stable and peaceful. Because of instability, the business community prefers to put their money in stable countries, thereby depriving such countries an opportunity for economic growth. Every person is preoccupied with looting the resources of the nation and speedy evacuation to stable countries. The poor masses become poorer and helpless. Peace and stability are master keys to economic development and prosperity of a nation, therefore Namibia should never fall in such a trap.

It is against this background that I appreciate a new culture in some SADC countries, including Namibia, where a former Head of State is well-protected, well-treated and well-respected. They voluntarily surrender power through democratic means, therefore the new culture promotes peace, stability and security not only of a country but also of the Region.

04 April 2012 **COMMITTEE STAGE: INTRODUCTION VOTE 02**
HON HAUSIKU

Under this programme an amount of N\$6,886,000.00 is requested.

The fifth and last programme is the Cabinet Secretariat. This programme carries out activities provided for under Chapter 6 of the Namibian Constitution, namely the Cabinet. The Cabinet Secretariat performs constitutional functions assigned to it by the President and the Cabinet. Against this background, Cabinet Secretariat serves as the repository of the records, minutes and related documents of the Cabinet. Allow me, therefore, Honourable Members to appreciate an excellent service Cabinet Secretariat is rendering to the President, the Cabinet and, indeed, Cabinet Committees.

Under this programme an amount of N\$12,097,000.00 is requested.

In summary, an amount of N\$187,409,000.00 is requested for the Operational Budget, while N\$192,350,000.00 is requested for the Development Budget.

Honourable Deputy Chairperson, with these remarks, I therefore respectfully urge all the Honourable Members of this august House to support and approve the total allocation of N\$379,759,000.00 in respect of Vote 01. I so Move and I thank you for your cooperation.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you, Honourable Minister.

Vote 02 – **“OFFICE OF THE PRIME MINISTER”, N\$251,658,000.00** put for introduction.

HON DEPUTY PRIME MINISTER: Comrade Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members of the National Assembly, it is my distinct honour and privilege to present to this august

04 April 2012 **COMMITTEE STAGE: INTRODUCTION VOTE 02**
HON HAUSIKU

House the motivation for the budgetary request for Vote 02: Office of the Prime Minister for the 2012/2013 Financial Year.

The total Budget request is N\$251,658,000.00 for 2012/2013 Financial Year. This amount will cater for the implementation of the four core programmes under the Office of the Prime Minister.

Resources availed to the Office the previous Financial Year, enabled the Office of the Prime Minister to provide guidance and advice on the implementation of policies of the Government. Therefore, the allocation of the new Financial Year will be utilised to fund the continuation of previous and implementation of new projects.

The activities of the Office continue to expand and are becoming more challenging, necessitating the need for continuous interactions with stakeholders and various communities across the country. As a result, the needs as expressed by our people continue to inform our process of policy-formulation and the implementation thereof.

The programmes which the Office of the Prime Minister will continue to implement during the 2012/2013 Financial Year are as follows:

NATIONAL ALLIANCE FOR IMPROVED NUTRITION (NAFIN):

Comrade Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members of National Assembly, the Honourable Prime Minister in his contribution to the *Appropriation Bill* 2012/2013 on 27 March 2012 informed this august House, about the National Alliance for Improved Nutrition which was officially launched in 2010 under his chairmanship. The objectives of NAFIN were highlighted by the Prime Minister on that day.

This is an important initiative that will contribute to the acceleration of the attainment of the Millennium Development Goals, especially those that deal with maternal health and child mortality, where reviews show, that we are not doing very well. I am sure that this august House is aware that we are only left with three years before 2015, when we will be required to

04 April 2012 **COMMITTEE STAGE: INTRODUCTION VOTE 02**
HON HAUSIKU

account for the attainment of the Millennium Development Goals.

For the Prime Minister to effectively coordinate the implementation of NAFIN activities, an allocation of N\$30,000,000.00 is requested.

Comrade Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members of the National Assembly, our nationals continue to live in two economic worlds - a world of those who have the capacity to access economic opportunities and those who lack capacity to fully participate in the economy of our country. Unfortunately, though the latter are in majority and main contributors to wealth creation, they do not as yet share fully in what Namibia offers.

We all agree, that this situation continues to exist due to our historical past. However, we believe, that time to part with this unfortunate situation is now. It is our considered opinion that (NEEEF), the New Economic Empowerment programme could serve as a vehicle for economic empowerment and wealth creation for the majority of our people. It is for this reason that an allocation of N\$1,200,000.00 is proposed to finalise the programme for implementation including the formulation for NEEEF legislation.

There is no doubt, Comrade Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, that the implementation of this programme will give hope to the hitherto, excluded majority.

Similarly, the Office of the Prime Minister will continue with the implementation of the programme on disaster and emergency mitigation, including the enactment of the *Disaster Management Bill* which is serving in this Honourable House. The purpose of the Bill is to provide legal framework and procedures, which will ensure proper and effective management of disasters. The Office of the Prime Minister will make sure that regulations are in place for successful implementation soon after enactment.

Comrade Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members of the National Assembly, the Medium Term

04 April 2012 **COMMITTEE STAGE: INTRODUCTION VOTE 02**
HON HAUSIKU

Expenditure Framework requires the Office of the Prime Minister to execute its Budget according to four main programmes.

The request for 2012/2013 Financial Year, for the Office of the Prime Minister amounts to N\$251,658,000.00, a decrease of N\$16,124,000.00 compared to the allocation of the previous Financial Year.

The total amount of N\$251,658,000.00 includes:

N\$40,927,000.00 for the Capital Budget and
N\$210,731,000.00 for the Operational Budget.

Comrade Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members of the National Assembly, let me proceed to highlight the individual programmes budgeted for as follows:

PROGRAMMES 1- CONSTITUTIONAL OBLIGATIONS OF THE PRIME MINISTER AND THE DEPUTY PRIME MINISTER:

The allocation to this programme will enable the Prime Minister and Deputy Prime Minister to continue with activities to properly assist and provide support to His Excellency the President, coordinate Cabinet-related business and to enable the Prime Minister to execute tasks related to his role as Leader of Government Business in Parliament.

An amount of N\$38,387,000.00 is proposed for the Programme 1. This includes the allocation of N\$8,167,000.00 for the work of the State-owned Enterprises Governance Council (SOEGC) to continue with the implementation of the State-Owned Enterprise Governing Act.

Furthermore, an amount of N\$950,000.00 is proposed for the operational cost of the Public Office-Bearers Remuneration Commission.

Comrade Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members of the National Assembly, Namibia is home to many communities who have been socially, culturally and economically marginalised for years. In June 2005 the Cabinet instructed the Office of

04 April 2012 **COMMITTEE STAGE: INTRODUCTION VOTE 02**
HON HAUSIKU

the Prime Minister to introduce Special Targeted Programmes to redress their situation.

The Office has made progress in the implementation of the original programme that is called the San Development Project. To allow us to continue with the resettlement of San communities and, indeed, other marginalised communities identified thereafter, their education and inclusion in economic activities, an amount of N\$5,633,000.00 is proposed for this project. This project continues to receive annual funding of N\$100,000.00 from Standard Bank of Namibia, N\$47,000.00, from First National Bank of Namibia for three years to support the Back to School Campaign Programme.

Last year the Office continued with the implementation of livelihood support projects, in education, infrastructure improvement and job creation amongst the marginalised communities.

In addition, the Ministry of Lands and Resettlement has made available seven farms in Kunene Region where approximately 879 households of San communities have been resettled since the inception of this programme.

Comrade Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members of the National Assembly, in line with the policy of Promoting Job Creation and income generating project activities for marginalised communities, the Office of the Prime Minister, in collaboration with the Ministry of Environment and Tourism, developed a game farm facility at Farm Uitkoms last year. This excellent facility, which will create jobs and serve as a source of income for the community was commissioned by the Honourable Prime Minister last year.

We would like to thank and appreciate the excellent contribution to the San Development programme by various Ministries, agencies and private sector institutions. I urge them to continue with this cooperation and assistance.

PROGRAMME 2: PUBLIC SERVICE MANAGEMENT AND IMPROVEMENT.

For this programme we are proposing N\$118,497,000.00 for approval. The funds allocated to this programme will be utilised to carry out a number of ongoing interventions indicated below to ensure that efficiency, effectiveness and accountability in the Public Service is achieved.

Current service delivery improvement initiatives are as follows:-

IMPLEMENTATION OF A PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT SYSTEM:

Under this initiative, I am glad to report that all Offices, Ministries, Agencies and Regional Councils have finalised their strategic plans, which are already translated into actions through the development of annual plans and entering into performance agreements. An amount of N\$3,137,000.00 is proposed for approval.

CAPACITY BUILDING:

With the launching of the Namibia Institute of Public Administration and Management (NIPAM), we are able to deliver training programmes to all job categories in order to build a professional public service. An allocation to NIPAM for the current Financial Year amounts to N\$20,897,000.00, for operational expenses.

We appreciate technical assistance provided by the Governments of India, France and Finland in developing NIPAM training programmes.

JOB EVALUATION AND GRADING PROJECT:

The project is initiated to evaluate and re-grade all job categories to ensure appropriate just payments. The project has been completed and stakeholders are currently being consulted.

BUSINESS PROCESS RE-ENGINEERING:

Progress has been made by the majority of Ministries, Offices and Agencies to streamline processes to ensure improvement in service delivery to the public. The assistance provided by the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) for the implementation of this project is appreciated.

E- GOVERNMENT INITIATIVES:

The Office of the Prime Minister is busy developing an E-government Action Plan in line with the E-Government Policy of the Public Service. The ultimate goal of these projects is to provide support and increase access to Government services, enhance the professionalism of the public service and improve service delivery.

This project is implemented by the Department of Public Service Information Technology Management (DPSITM) in the Office of the Prime Minister. An amount of N\$19,404,000.00 is proposed for the activities of this project to cover the expansion of internet to the regions, ICT infrastructure system, ICT training and software maintenance agreement.

Furthermore with the assistance of Office of the Prime Minister, Offices, Ministries and Agencies have made progress in the implementation of the electronic documents and records management project. An amount of N\$7,125,000.00 is proposed for this project.

PROGRAMME 3 - REDUCE THE IMPACT OF DISASTER ON NAMIBIA AND ITS PEOPLE:

Comrade Deputy Chairperson of Whole House Committee, Honourable Members of National Assembly, you are aware, that Namibia experience heavy rainfalls and floods affecting various Regions of our country regularly. Over one hundred people were affected and above fifty thousand moved to relocation centres in the previous Financial Year. The flood impacted about 60% of the total population, destroying some critical

04 April 2012 **COMMITTEE STAGE: INTRODUCTION VOTE 02**
HON HAUSIKU

infrastructures, submerged and washed away crops and homestead and caused widespread destruction.

We intend to table the flood report 2010/2011 in this Honourable House within the next two weeks after it has served in Cabinet. The 2010/2011 Financial Year kept the Office busy with the relief operations. During this period N\$30,000,000.00 was allocated for flood operation and over N\$55 million for purchasing relief food.

For this Financial Year an amount of N\$65,583,000.00 is being requested for approval. The above mentioned allocation includes:

- N\$7,756,000.00 for the operation of the Disaster Risk Management Directorate,
- N\$20,000,000.00 for the capitalisation of National Emergency and Disaster Fund,
- N\$3,900,000.00 to the Namibia Red Cross Society for operational costs.
- N\$33,927,000.00 to construct warehouses in Oshana and Hardap Regions.

The fund for the Disaster Risk Management is supplemented by the technical assistance from the SADC Secretariat under its Regional Vulnerability Assessment and Analysis Programme.

Comrade Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members of National Assembly, I would like to call upon Offices, Ministries and Agencies as well as other stakeholders, to mainstream disaster in their planning activities, to reduce the impact of disasters on people and properties.

PROGRAMME 4: COORDINATION AND SUPPORT SERVICES:

This programme provides financial and human resources as well as

04 April 2012 **COMMITTEE STAGE: INTRODUCTION VOTE 04**
HON DR KAWANA

logistical support for the operation of the Office of the Prime Minister. An amount of N\$29,191,000.00 is proposed for approval. Included in this amount is N\$1,500,000.00 for the preparation of tender documentation for the construction of additional offices for the Office of the Prime Minister and N\$250,000.00, for Office of the Prime Minister staff HIV/AIDS sensitisation programme.

Comrade Deputy Chairperson of Whole House Committee, Honourable Members of National Assembly, may I now Move that this Honourable House considers and approves an amount of N\$251,658,000.00 for the Financial Year 2012/2013 for the Office of the Prime Minister. I thank you in anticipation.

DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you, Deputy Prime Minister.

Vote 04 – “**AUDITOR-GENERAL**”, **N\$80,670,000.00** put for Introduction.

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND ATTORNEY-GENERAL: Thank you very much, Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee. I rise once again to motivate Vote 04 – Auditor-General. This is one of those technical Votes which do not attract any surprises.

As is commonly known, the Auditor-General performs important constitutional functions as provided for under Article 127(2) of the Namibian Constitution and the State Finance Act (Act 31 of 1991).

Every democratic country which subscribes to the values of accountability has legislation in place which entitles the Nation to know how the taxpayers’ money is used by the Government of the day. In our situation that vehicle is the Office of the Auditor-General. It is tasked with the

04 April 2012 **COMMITTEE STAGE: INTRODUCTION VOTE 04**
HON DR KAWANA

auditing of the State Revenue Funds and report thereon to the National Assembly. In this regard, the Office of the Auditor-General promotes transparency and accountability. Against this background, it is therefore imperative that the Office of the Auditor-General is adequately resourced by both financial and human resources in order to carry out its constitutional and statutory mandate.

In order to achieve the abovementioned objectives, the Office of the Auditor-General has set itself a number of targets during the 2012/2013 Financial Year. The provided resources to be used to compile three Performance Audit Reports and two follow-up reports annually. In addition, the Office will carry out 120 asset inspections throughout the country each year in order to safeguard State assets. The Office has set itself a target of 166 financial audits during the course of this Financial Year.

Honourable Deputy Chairperson, in order to achieve these objectives, the Office will also make use of private consultants, as it has been the case in the past. This will assist with the auditing of Municipalities, Boards, Corporations and Parastatal bodies in order to address the problem of backlog.

Two main programmes have been set in the current Financial Year. The first programme involves Safeguarding Public Resources. The following goals are intended to be achieved:

- To finalise inspections, financial audits, performance audits and follow-up reports on the implementation of previous recommendations.
- To assist the Public Accounts Committee to oversee the use of public resources; and
- To arrange training events to improve professionalism, competence and audit quality.

04 April 2012 **COMMITTEE STAGE: INTRODUCTION VOTE 04**
HON DR KAWANA

An amount of N\$33,382,000.00 is required.

The second programme involves Supervision, Coordination, Investments and support services. The following goals are intended to be achieved:

- Improve internal and external communication through needs assessment and policy development;
- Provide logistical and technical support;
- Complete 75% of the building structure of the new office headquarters;
- Implement strategic objectives and comply with regional and international obligations.

An amount of N\$47,288,000.00 is requested.

Honourable Deputy Chairperson, allow me, to take this opportunity to inform Honourable Members of this august House that work is underway to draft a separate Bill which will regulate the functions of the Auditor-General. This is aimed at strengthening the recommendations of the Auditor-General during auditing, so that those who ignore such recommendations are held accountable.

With these few remarks, I humbly request this august House to approve the requested amount of N\$80,670,000.00 in respect of the Office of the Auditor-General. I so Move and I thank you, Honourable Members.

DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE
COMMITTEE: Thank you, Honourable Minister.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:40

04 April 2012 **COMMITTEE STAGE: INTRODUCTION VOTE 30**
HON HAUSIKU

HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:00

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: The Committee is called to Order.

Vote 30 – “**ANTI-CORRUPTION COMMISSION**” N\$50,303,000.00
put for Introduction.

HON DEPUTY PRIME MINISTER: Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members of the National Assembly, thank you for granting me this opportunity to introduce the Budget of the Anti-Corruption Commission for the 2012/2013 Financial Year to this august House.

As the Honourable Members would recall, the Anti-Corruption Commission has a separate Vote which is in line with statutory requirements that its operations should be independent.

Being a statutory institution, the Anti-Corruption Commission’s functions are set out in its empowering statute, the Anti-Corruption Act, 2003 (Act 8 of 2003). For purposes of reminding the Honourable Members of these important functions, allow me to go through them. Section 3 of the Anti-Corruption Act stipulates that;

- (a) To receive or initiate and investigate allegations of corrupt practices;
- (b) To consider whether investigation is needed in relation to an allegation and, if so, whether the investigation must be carried out by the Commission or whether the matter should be referred to any other appropriate authority for investigation or action;
- (c) To consult, cooperate and exchange information with appropriate

bodies or authorities, including authorities or bodies of other countries that are authorised to conduct inquiries or investigations in relation to corrupt practices; to assemble evidence obtained in the course of its functions and to furnish –

- to any other appropriate authority; or
 - the prosecuting authority or other suitable authority of another country, upon a formal request. evidence which may be admissible in the prosecution of a person for a criminal offence or which may otherwise be relevant to the functions of that authority;
- (d) to investigate any conduct of a person employed by a public body or private body which, in the opinion of the Commission, may be connected with or conducive to corrupt practices, and to report thereon to an appropriate authority with the public body or private body;
- (e) to take measures for the prevention of corruption in public bodies and private bodies, including measures for –
- (i) examining the practices, systems and procedures of public bodies and private bodies to facilitate the discovery of corrupt practices and securing the revision of practices, systems or procedures which may be prone or conducive to corrupt practices;
 - (ii) advising public bodies and private bodies on ways of preventing corrupt practices and on changes of practices, systems and procedures compatible with the effective performance of their duties and which are necessary to reduce the likelihood of the occurrence of corrupt practices;
 - (iii) educating the public and disseminating information on the evil and dangers of corruption, including through the publication and distribution of brochures, and pamphlets, or

the holding of public conferences;

- (iv) enlisting and fostering public confidence and support in combating corruption;
- (g) to disseminate information to the public about the functions of the Commission; and
- (h) to do anything else that the Commission is required or authorised to do under the Anti-Corruption Act or any other law or which is necessary or expedient to do for achieving the purpose of the said Act.”

The functions are then also encapsulated in the three main objectives listed in the Medium Term Plan of Vote 30 which read as follows:

- Ensure the effective management of human and other resources;
- Ensure that allegations of corrupt practices are properly investigated; and
- Prevention of corruption.

In respect of the previous Financial Year the Medium Term Plan of Vote 30 reflected two programmes, namely —

- Investigation of allegations of corruption;
- Establish and implement measures to prevent corruption.

The previous Financial Year, the two programmes were allocated N\$25,808,000.00 and N\$37,598,000.00, respectively. Thus a total Budget Allocation of N\$63,406,000.00 was made.

Acting within the last Financial Year’s allocation, the Commission managed to effectively investigate a substantial number of the 297 reports of alleged corrupt practices received by the Commission. During this

period the Commission also referred 55 cases to the Prosecutor-General with a recommendation for prosecution under Chapter 4 of the Anti-Corruption Act, 2003. In addition, numerous matters were referred to other relevant authorities for appropriate action. In all instances the matters were only referred after preliminary inquiries had been conducted to establish whether the allegations of corruption could be substantiated or not.

In compliance with the requirement in its empowering legislation, that it should educate the public on corruption and on its functions, and provide for measures to prevent or curb corruption, the Commission during the 2011/2012 Financial Year:

- continued to increase its anti-corruption sensitization and media campaign activities. As part of these outreach programme and activities, the Commission, amongst others –
 - disseminated Anti-Corruption adverts in various indigenous languages through the local radio stations;
 - developed and distributed anti-corruption publications, including publications in Braille;
- held Anti-Corruption seminars for a variety of stakeholders, amongst others, church leaders to enlist the support of the church in the fight against corruption and in instilling the necessary moral and ethical values in the communities;

Likewise the Commission conducted an Anti-Corruption Debating Competition at Secondary Schools in the Khomas Regional to raise awareness on corruption amongst the youth.

It made known the outcome of its urban corruption perception survey, on corruption related matters. The data so collected will be used to better plan the Commission's Anti-Corruption strategies and programmes.

It was represented at the Ongwediva and Okakarara Trade Fairs, the

04 April 2012 **COMMITTEE STAGE: INTRODUCTION VOTE 30**
HON HAUSIKU

Eenhana Expo and the Windhoek Show. The ACC managed to have questionnaires completed at these events to determine the effectiveness of its sensitisation and educational campaigns.

The Anti-Corruption Commission also continues to enjoy national and international support. On the international front, the Commission on invitation attended and participated in a number of conferences.

These International forums provided a platform to exchange experiences and best practices with regard to the investigation and prevention of corruption. The Anti-Corruption Commission's representation at these international conferences is a clear testimony, that the international community recognises Namibia's efforts in the fight against corruption.

Comrade Deputy Chairperson of the whole house committee, Honourable Members of the National Assembly, although the Anti-Corruption Commission is recognised both nationally and internationally as the leading authority in the fight against corruption in Namibia, it is faced with numerous challenges amongst which are the insufficient number of offices at strategic places countrywide; and the insufficient human resources capacity. These factors seriously hamper productivity and optimal service delivery to the public.

In addition, the delays in the finalisation of corruption cases caused by unnecessary postponements in our courts of law are tarnishing the image of the Commission. Such delays also cause the public to lose faith in the criminal justice system.

The Anti-Corruption Commission needs the necessary support both from all members of the public and the Government to effectively and efficiently fight the scourge of corruption. Adequate funding is indeed at the core of the needed support to enable the Commission to effectively and efficiently combat corruption.

Comrade Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members of National Assembly, the proposed request for 2012/2013 Financial Year is N\$50,303,000.00. This amount is proposed

to be allocated to three programmes as follows:

PROGRAMME 1: COORDINATION AND SUPPORT FUNCTIONS. THIS PROGRAMME ENABLES THE COMMISSION:

- to provide for optimal management and deployment of its human and other resources that will ensure adequate administrative support for the Commission's programmes;
- to provide for adequate human resources capacity and capacity building to ensure improved accountability, integrity, productivity and service delivery;
- to provide for conducive working environment for its staff members.

An allocation of N\$48,853,000.00 is proposed for this programme.

PROGRAMME 2: INVESTIGATION OF ALLEGATIONS OF CORRUPTION. THIS PROGRAMME ENABLES THE COMMISSION:

- To improve the Capacity and Integrated Case Management Systems, as well as Intelligence Analysis Systems, designed for investigative and law enforcement agencies.
- To continue with the skills development of its investigators so as to ensure proper discharge of the Commission's statutory investigative and other functions.
- To continue conducting specialised investigations that require the expertise of forensic auditors or other experts. These investigations are very costly and require sufficient funding.
- To provide for further regional offices to ensure adequate service delivery at strategic places countrywide; an amount of N\$700,000 is proposed to be allocated to this programme.

**PROGRAMME 3: TO ESTABLISH AND IMPLEMENT MEASURE
TO PREVENT CORRUPTION:**

The purpose of this programme is to do research and appropriately advise on the revision of systems, policies and practices that are prone or conducive to corruption; to conduct stakeholder workshops countrywide and develop a National Anti-Corruption Plan; to continue engaging the public at large, as well as public and private institutions, to ensure the effective implementation of corruption inhibiting measures, and the facilitation of good governance and an economically stable environment for Namibia; to provide for an annual corruption perception survey, the outcome of which will assist the Commission to improve its future service delivery to the Nation. An amount of N\$750,000.00 is requested to perform and fulfil these functions. Comrade Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members of the National Assembly, the funds requested for the Commission's activities for the Financial Year 2012/2013, will go a long way, towards the implementation of activities and programmes to achieve the objectives stated above in order to combat corruption and corrupt practices.

Likewise, the approval of this proposed allocation will clearly underline the National Assembly's political will to fight corruption.

Having said that, Comrade Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members of the National Assembly, may I now request this august House to consider and approve the total amount of N\$50,303,000.00 for the Financial Year 2012/2013 under Vote 30 - Anti Corruption Commission? I thank you for your attention.

**HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE
COMMITTEE:** Thank you, Honourable Deputy Prime Minister. I shall report progress and ask leave to sit again.

04 April 2012

**CONFERMENT OF NATIONAL HONOURS BILL
HON DR N IYAMBO**

ASSEMBLY RESUMED:

Progress reported and leave given to sit again.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the Second Order of the Day.

**RESUMPTION OF SECOND READING:
CONFERMENT OF NATIONAL HONOURS BILL**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on Second Reading – *Conferment of National Honours Bill*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When this Debate was adjourned yesterday, 3 April 2012, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Minister of Veteran Affairs, that the Bill be read a Second Time. I now call on the Honourable Minister of Veteran Affairs of Veteran Affairs to take the Floor to reply.

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, having been caught unaware, could I request the indulgence of the House to reply tomorrow?

04 April 2012

**PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON UUTONI**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Debate is adjourned until tomorrow. The Secretary will read the Third Order of the Day.

**RESUMPTION OF SECOND READING:
PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on Second Reading – *Property Valuers Profession Bill*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When this Debate was adjourned yesterday, 3 April 2012, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Minister of Lands and Resettlement, that the Bill be read a Second Time. The Honourable Deputy Minister of Safety and Security had the Floor and he may continue.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Honourable Deputy Speaker, yesterday in my contribution I ended up with a question concerning the valuers of the financial institutions, particularly the banks, and the ones appointed by Local Authorities. I wanted to find which of the two is more qualified than the other one. I am putting that question because one finds that the valuer of the bank values a property at a higher price than the valuer appointed by the Local Authority. For example, a property valued by a Local Authority can be N\$300,000.00, but when the bank values the property, the price shoots up to a million. The question is; what criteria do the valuer of the bank use to value the property higher than the one by the Local Authority? That was the question that I was trying to pose.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, I also want clarity on the appeal against

04 April 2012

**PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON UUTONI**

decisions of Council in Section 32(1) of this Bill, which reads as follows:

“Appeal against certain decisions of Council.

1. Any member of the public whose interest or rights are affected by a decision made by Council may –
 - (a) Within 30 days from the member becomes aware of the decision, request the Council in writing to furnish him or her in writing with its reasons of the decision;
 - (b) Within 30 days from the date the member receives those reasons for the decision from the Council and after giving notice of appeal to the Council, appeal in writing to the Minister against the decision, setting out grounds of appeal.
2. The Council must furnish its reasons for its decision, as contemplated in subsection (1)(a) within 30 days of receipt of the request of the member.
3. The Minister may –
 - (a) Dismiss the appeal and confirm the decision; or
 - (b) Uphold the appeal wholly or in part and set aside or amend the decision.”

In comparison with Section 71(1) in the Local Authorities Act (Act 23 of 1992), as amended, the appeal here is against the decision of the Valuation Court.

“Appeal against decision of Valuation Court

71(1) Any owner of rateable property in the area of the local authority who has lodged an objection in terms of Section 690 who feels aggrieved by a decision of a valuation court made in relation to that objection, shall

04 April 2012

**PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON NAMBAHU**

have the right to appeal against such decision to the High Court of Namibia.”

The question is: Which one of the two appeals or decision will be considered as the correct one? The one by the Valuation Court or the High Court of Namibia or the one by the council? Is the Bill on the Table going to do away with the one by the Local Authorities?

Section 34(2) on regulations reads:

“34(2) Before the Minister makes any regulation under this section, the Minister must publish a draft of the proposed regulation in the Gazette, together with a notice calling on interested persons to comment in writing on the regulation within a period in the notice, which period may not be less than 30 days from the date of publication of Notice.”

My question is: Can a regulation be discussed and the public give their opinion? I thought a regulation is just a regulation to regulate the whole process. To my understanding it cannot be taken to the public for their opinions.

With this, I support the Bill.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Deputy Minister of Justice.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Thank you very much, Honourable Deputy Speaker. I also want to air some view regarding the Property Valuers Profession Bill. I feel this is a first step in the right direction, but as Honourable Nujoma pointed out, it is a very delicate direction the Bill is pointing us into. I looked at the issues which have been identified in the introduction, one of being that the present situation is that property valuation functions are discharged by anyone who believes they are competent to provide valuation services as Namibia does not have

04 April 2012

**PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON NAMBAHU**

any legal framework in place to regulate the practice of property valuation, resulting in no professional accountability by the valuer.

This being the case, it is not going to be sufficient to put in place a body of professionals to solve this problem. They must be provided with a vision and in what direction to go. I was talking to some of the colleagues and it is like saying, *“I have a case at hand, how would you as a lawyer handle this case?”* Then the first year law student would say, *“this is how I will go about it”*, but an experienced lawyer would probably say, *“it depends on which side I am, if it is for the defence, this is how I would go about it and if it is for the other side, this is how I would argue.”*

Therefore, we cannot just agree that people are going to be guided by their professional standards, ethics or qualifications to steer us in a certain direction. These people need to be provided with a vision according which they have to steer us.

It is very clear that property is an area of utmost importance in any social development, because if you talk of property to classes, it is actually in that area where the problem lies. If you do not provide a proper vision, you are going to have a situation that the property class that you are creating now is actually going to usher us to the haves and the have-nots. The prices are prohibitive for certain people to enter into the domain of property possession and I am not lecturing anyone here, because we know very well what the have-nots do to the haves. Visualise this society forty or fifty years from now, see how what you are creating now is going to evolve and how those who are excluded are going to react.

It is critical that we come up with a vision for these people to know this is the kind of society we want and, therefore, you should steer us in this direction. (Intervention)

HON RIRUAKO: May I ask Honourable Nambahu a tiny question? It is not a big question because I appreciate the way you express yourself and the motive behind it. Are you so grown up and mature (Interjections). If you did not hear me, I said I hope everybody understood what you said

04 April 2012

**PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON NAMBAHU**

and where you are heading to and I thank you for your stand. I hope that you are going to hear what he is going to say. He is not from Cuba, he is a thorough Namibian, a very good one and I thank you for your sentiments.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: I do not need to elaborate, I think that is the way I see it and Honourable Nehova was saying that the vision is already contained in the Constitution. It is true, it is in the Constitution, but only in broad terms. There are no specific visions and, therefore, the technocrats should compartmentalise these visions, that food sufficiency is the vision for agriculture, etcetera. The Constitution does not tell you how it should be done and by when. (Intervention)

HON NEHOVA: On a Point of Information. Honourable Deputy Speaker, it is the present Government which has the responsibility to articulate and compartmentalise those things he is mentioning now, nobody else. However, at present they are not doing that.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Yes, scholars and knowledge generators should see this as their responsibility. When you go to UNAM or our teaching institutions, you will see that certain areas are neglected, such as the area of philosophy. You have to philosophically understand and conceptualise what has to happen and that is the work of the intelligentsia. You need to have that capacity, because what you say is what others know. Generate that kind of in-house research capacity to understand the issues so that you are on the same wavelength as others.

In that context, if there is property in the area of land, property in the area of housing, these must be harmonised to see what kind of society you are envisioning to have in place, so that your academia can push you into that direction. (Intervention)

04 April 2012

**PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON NAMBAHU**

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: May I ask Honourable Nambahu a question? Honourable Nambahu, in terms of dialectal materialism or scientific socialism, what you are advocating there is the struggle of the opposites, the dictatorship of the proletariat. Dictatorship is acceptable, but it must be of the proletariat. In terms of all those that you have advocated here, how do you view the Arab Spring? I remember the leader of the RDP was enthusiastic about the Arab Spring and I also want to ask him what is now happening in Libya. Chaos and civil war has started. When the others are in power you tend to advocate that you are part of the proletariat, sometimes even going further and associating yourself and trying to get favours from what they call the lumpenproletariat. Honourable Nambahu, I have been following these events very carefully and I noticed that the so-called Arab Spring was praised by the western press and all these western supported Opposition Parties, that a new era has dawned and dictators are going to be removed and the people will take power, but now it appears that what is taking place is anarchy and religious fundamentalism is taking over.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: I am aware of many things plus that one. I am just going to answer it this way, my thesis that I am advancing is that we cherish stability and peace, all these for ourselves and the future generation. For that to be maintained and be sustainable, things such as this have to be attended to. That is what I am trying to bring to the fore.

When it comes to the Arab Spring, when you listen to those who even initiated these kinds of upheavals, for the most part there is regret, because it spiralled out of control and other people hijacked it and it is steered in a direction that those who conceived it did not think that it is going to end up that way. Therefore, sometimes when things spiral out of control, you are going to admire them like a kid admiring a lost balloon in the air, without having any control over it. When you advocate for people to admire things that you do not even understand, beware of what they really are and whether other forces cannot take over and you will never control over them.

04 April 2012

**PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON NAMBAHU**

The point I am trying to make is that one of the vision in terms of property and all that, obviously, the issue of knowledge generation is very critical in my view. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE:

On a Point of Information. Honourable Kandy Nehova was asking what is the Government doing, but now the irony is that this Legislature is part of the Government. When we say it is a SWAPO-Government, that side is complaining that it is not a SWAPO-Government, but it is done selectively. When certain issues arise, then they are not part of the Government. When is the Opposition part of the Government and when are they not part of the Government? Can they please be consistent?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE:

Thank you for the information, but the point I am trying to advance is that yes, we can play the blame game, but TIPEEG has exposed the weaknesses in terms of capacity. Sometimes you hear that maybe Stalin rounded up scientists and killed them somewhere in Siberia. When TIPEEG came on board, we realised we have no engineers in the country and some people pull long faces when you criticise Apartheid, that it did not produce the professionals. Where is that camp where SWAPO rounded up the professionals and killed them? Those people are not here and we have to create that capacity and all of us have to agree on that. Do not put up your long face, I did not mention that much. (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: May I ask the Honourable Deputy Minister a question? Before I ask the question, can I ask the Honourable Deputy Minister to withdraw that I have a long face? Honourable Deputy Speaker, I think the Deputy Minister is doing well. I really appreciate what he is saying. Honourable Deputy Minister, when one is planning to

04 April 2012

**PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON NAMBAHU**

something, if you are planning to play football, you will look at your football boots, the socks, the shorts and everything. It is only when you are satisfied that you have everything in place that you go to the soccer field and play. Government has somewhere decided to come up with TIPEEG, came with a budget to this august House and we approved, but when it came to implementation, somebody was saying we did not know that we did not have engineers and accountants. If we knew that, we could have sourced them from Zimbabwe, South Africa or Cuba. Then you have a package where you say I do not have the capacity here, I will get it from my neighbours, I do not have doctors, I will get them from the DRC, I have a package called TIPEEG. What you are now telling us is that you have decided to come up with TIPEEG and once you were into it you realised that you have forgotten to put petrol in my car, but I want to go to Okakarara. How do you operate by doing these haphazard things?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: That is the typical difference between the SWAPO style and the SWANU style. I think the struggle has shown how differently SWAPO and SWANU have planned and arrived at things. Some people have planned the whole time of the liberation struggle, others took the fight and started training along the march. That is the difference between the two of us. I hope the Honourable Member has graduated from there and left that way of doing things and did not take them to NUDO.

There is nothing that prevents us from getting doctors and engineers from other countries as we go ahead and identify the problems that we have. We will continue perfecting, we were fighting and training and that is what we intend to do. Only those who do not do, do not err. If you want to be mistake free, be activity free. In law we say, on the basis and strength of the information there and then available we did what we did. On the strength of the information now at hand, we are going to do it this way.

What I am trying to say, when we say know what others know, it is actually for us also to have in-house research capacity in order for us to be

04 April 2012

**PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON NAMBAHU**

able to research those *lacunas*, those areas where we lack knowledge. If we do not have the knowledge, we go the American way and hire it, buy it. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: May I ask Honourable Nambahu a pointed question? We are talking about valuation of land and property, are you aware that valuation is value-loading in the sense that valuation actually depends upon demand and supply, which is an economic concept, not necessarily what you can do with that particular property. If the property is in high demand and many people want it, that is the value a person is going to put on it and that is exactly where the poor people get short-changed. Are you aware of that?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Yes, very much. That is why I am trying to advocate for that dichotomy to be looked into, to know that when we leave it to the market as it is and when we leave it to professionals like it is without actually getting a vision and assisting in what direction we should steer, it is not going to change the way things are. That is why I say this is a step in the right direction, but it is not a complete one. There are more issues left and if the market is left as is, we know what they have done to other societies and we would not want to go that way.

One Honourable Member was talking about the different valuers. Are these people even talking to each other? Is there a forum where you get all these professionals together to indicate the direction we want to go and say that inasmuch as we respect their professionalism, this is what we are trying to create and provide them with a vision in order for them to also do their part, because in this kind of Nation-building every bit helps. With those remarks, I support the Bill and I rest my case.

04 April 2012

**PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON RIRUAKO**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Chief Riruako.

HON RIRUAKO: This is the time for us to pull up our socks. Why am I saying this? Presently we have confusion and we were taken for a ride and that is not fair to ourselves. If you allow yourself to be ruined by your counterpart and you are observing it now and then, that is the time for you to react.

I appreciate what Honourable Nambahu said. He talked about materialism, capitalism. There is no such thing as capitalism, there is no such thing as an individual company anymore. He was talking about creating a proletariat, there is nothing like that, the dictatorship of entrepreneurs. There is no individual at all, that is a fact. We have to live in the global social approach, you do not have a choice. (Interjections) You do not have an ideology, I pity you, a person who has such kind of knowledge but you cannot even apply it or go back and reinstitute yourselves. I want to hear what you are saying in this kind of direction. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: May I ask the Honourable Riruako a question? Was it really fair for the people to ruin a farm of a chief and how will this law help a chief?

HON RIRUAKO: You are just coming back from abroad, from exile, and you are still playing jokes with your own death. I am sorry about that, I am not here to be at your funeral.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, we really suffered a lot and now he is the one who is playing jokes about his own death. You must equip yourself to that extent if you are the kind of person who you are and if you are not, I

04 April 2012

**PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON RIRUAKO**

am sorry, I cannot push you where you do not belong. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Honourable Riruako, you are talking about funerals, death and we want to know, since we are all going that direction eventually, knowing that you are the most senior in this House, representing the spirit of Tjamuaha, Maharero and others, are you cursing the young man?

HON RIRUAKO: I am not cursing the young man. I disciplined the young man not to touch on something that is not really acceptable to the norms of this Nation.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, this is the time for us to take care of what we are supposed to take care of, not to play jokes about our own lot. You do not want me to mention death, but it is a death in itself. If someone rips you off until you are empty and you are not yourself, what is that? It is death itself, but in order to avoid that, we are not going to mistreat other people, we are going to correct our institutions to be the kind of institutions we would want for this country, not to somebody's liking abroad.

Here we are not going to divide according to Political Parties. This is a national issue that we are supposed to fight for. That must be the habit and if someone here wants to politicise this issue, I am sorry, this is not a political issue, it is in the interest of the Nation that we are supposed to defend. We can accommodate other people within our interests, but within their own interests that they want. I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Honourable Minister of Mines and Energy.

04 April 2012

**PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON KATALI**

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: Thank you very much, Honourable Deputy Speaker. Honourable Deputy Speaker, I have been listening to many of the Honourable Members who contributed to the Property Valuers Profession Bill and I came to realise that we as a Nation have a problem with properties and when we saw the word “*property*” and “*valuers*”, we thought our problem is going to be solved. I must go along with Comrade Schlettwein when he said this Bill is not going to solve our problems. That is true because the *Property Valuers Profession Bill* is just like you have an association for doctors, an association for lawyers, an association for teachers and the purpose is not to address the hardships endured by the poor people who are not able to buy land. This is an association to register those who are practising valuation, so that they ascribe to the same ethics. That is the purpose of this Bill.

However, I realised that our problem is access to property or land and what Comrade Nambahu has said is true, these valuers must be directed in the valuation of properties by us as a Nation through this Parliament. We always say we are elected by the people and the people must, through the Parliament, direct the valuers how they should do their work, how should they steer their profession in favour of the people that we want to mould so that at least we make it a point that land must not continue being sold the way it is being sold. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: May I ask a question? Honourable Katali, are you aware that when Honourable Nyamu wants to sell his farm because it is about to be repossessed by AgriBank, he would go to the neighbouring farmers and ask for how much they sold theirs and then he will decide that the price of his farm is this because the neighbour sold his farm at that price. Are you aware of that?

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: Yes, I am very much aware and that is why I am saying this Bill will not solve that problem as it is not meant to prevent Honourable Nyamu from increasing the price of

04 April 2012

**PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON KATALI**

his farm when he wants to sell it. (Intervention)

HON NYAMU: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Firstly, I want to submit that I support your suggestion that this Bill is not intended to reduce prices of properties. I do not think that is the intention of this Bill, but do you not think you are contradicting yourself when you say that the valuers are going to be set up as an association and you compare it with the other professional associations, like education and legal? You compare them with other associations and at the same time you are proposing that it be dictated in its work by people who are not professionals. Where has such a situation existed where professionals are dictated to?

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: This is exactly what Honourable Nambahu was saying, that if you leave the Nation at the mercy of the professionals, their fees will just be above the affordability of the people. Therefore, as the Legislature we have to legislate and see how we want our Nation to be treated by the professionals. They practise within their profession, but they follow the vision that we give them. You cannot say because they are doctors they can do what they want, they can charge the poor people as much as they want. That will not work and that is why I am saying we are responsible to make laws that will govern the professionals how to help the poor people in Namibia, where to take Namibia. We are not training them to be masters on their own. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I would like to ask my Colleague a question. Honourable Katali, you are making a good point, but then I think some Colleagues do not understand you. Doctors are professionals, but are you aware that there are some doctors who prescribe medicines to their

04 April 2012

**PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON KATALI**

patients on a trial-and-error basis, hoping you would get well, but if you die that is your own problem? Would you not think that there might be valuers who just value properties at exorbitant prices just to check whether the Nation will react or not?

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: This is what I want us to avoid, to think that when the valuers are doing their work they do not have guidelines. They have guidelines and these are the guidelines that we as the Legislature have set for them. If we want to change what they are doing, we must change the legislation here. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: On a Point of Information. There was mention of doctors prescribing medicine through trial-and-error. I think doctors of that type can only be referred to as *sangomas*, not properly trained, ethical doctors who are qualified.

HON NEHOVA: May I ask the Honourable Minister a small question? Honourable Minister, I always like to refer to the Constitution, the Constitution provides and this is one of the most important principles that the land, down and above is the property of the State. The State is represented that side and this side. Can the State or the Government come up with a Bill, proposing a subsidy on land because the land is very expensive? Then we solve the problem of land.

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: As I mentioned in the beginning, we have a problem and we are trying to tackle this problem within this Bill. If we want the valuers to help us, we must legislate and say when they are doing valuation of a farm, they must not look at the market behaviour in that area, but look at the productive value of the farm.

04 April 2012

**PROPERTY VALUERS PROFESSION BILL
HON KATALI**

If we can legislate that here, then it would mean we have them toeing the line of our vision. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: On the topic of leaving issues to professionals and that professionals are professionals, they are ethical, they have standards in place and they are properly trained, are you aware that Dr Basson, "*Dr Death*", was a professional doctor?

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: Yes, even professionals must be subjected to the vision. We must say how they should operate and not just leave it to them.

HON RIRUAKO: This kind of confusion was created by so-called professionals, those colonialists who were professionals by then. They influenced the whole matter and changed it in their own way. How are we going to change it while they have the right to change it themselves? No subsidy to be given, the word is "*no*".

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: In conclusion, the point I really want to make... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: On a Point of Information. Honourable Katali, you are correct when you are talking about the profession and councils, etcetera, but these professions are not administering anything in a vacuum, they are administering their respective sectors that are affecting us and the people here are talking about experiences. Yesterday Comrade Uutoni

04 April 2012

**ADJOURNMENT
HON KATALI**

spoke about the Law Society and others and these are professionals.

Even *Dr Death* was a professional. However, Colleagues, we are saying that the valuers that are going to be appointed are going to value property and the situation of property in Namibia, as we are talking, is characterised by this situation. Therefore, it is that situation of which they should have an understanding and benchmark and guide the process so that the affected people are not adduced through the cover of professionalism. That is why we are talking on generic terms. Thank you.

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: In conclusion, the point is that if we want things to be changed, let us not hijack the *Property Valuers Profession Bill*. Let this Bill be passed and let us look at where our problem lies and then we change those laws so that our vision is put in our laws and then the valuers will follow suit. Thank you very much.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The House is adjourned until tomorrow, 09:00.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:45 UNTIL 2012.04.05 AT 09:00