LIST OF MEMBERS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

SPEAKER

Dr T-B Gurirab (Mr)

DEPUTY SPEAKER AND CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE

Ms Loide Kasingo

THE CABINET

MINISTERS

(21 March 2010 – Elected in terms of Article 133 of the Constitution)

Mr N Angula (Prime Minister)

Mr M Hausiku (Deputy Prime Minister)
Dr G H Geingob (Mr) (Trade and Industry)

Ms P Iivula-Ithana (Justice)

Mr N Mbumba (Safety and Security)

Dr A Kawana (Mr) (Presidential Affairs & Attorney-

General)

Ms S Kuugongelwa-Amadhila (Finance)

Mr J Ekandjo (Regional and Local Government,

Housing and Rural Development)

Mr U Nujoma (Foreign Affairs)

Mr E Nghimtina (Works and Transport)

Dr A Iyambo (Mr) (Education)

Ms D Sioka (Gender Equality and Child Welfare)
Mr J Mutorwa (Agriculture, Water & Forestry)
Mr J Kaapanda (Information & Communication

Technology)

Ms N Nandi-Ndaitwah (Environment and Tourism)

Dr N Iyambo (Mr) (Veterans Affairs)

Mr I Ngatjizeko (Labour & Social Welfare)
Mr A !Naruseb (Lands & Resettlement)
Dr R Kamwi (Mr) (Health and Social Services)
Ms R Nghidinwa (Home Affairs and Immigration)

Mr C Namoloh (Defence)

Mr B Esau (Fisheries and Marine Resources)

Mr I Katali (Mines and Energy)

Mr K Kazenambo (Youth, National Service, Sport and

Culture)

DEPUTY MINISTERS

(21 March 2010 – Elected in terms of Article 133 of the Constitution)

Ms P Haingura (Health and Social Services)

Ms A Muharukua (Gender Equality and Child Welfare)

Mr A Muheua (Labour and Social Welfare)

Ms L Lucas (Defence)

Mr P Iilonga (Agriculture, Water & Forestry)

Mr E Uutoni (Safety and Security)

Mr T Nambahu (Justice)

Mr T Tweya (Trade and Industry)
Dr S C Ankama Mr (Works and Transport)

Mr P Mushelenga (Foreign Affairs)

Mr P Shifeta (Youth, National Service, Sport &

Culture)

Mr W Isaacks (Mines and Energy)

Mr S Simataa (Information and Communication

Technology)

Mr E Kaiyamo (Home Affairs and Immigration)
Ms P Beukes (Regional and Local Government,

Housing and Rural Development)

Mr U Herunga (Environment and Tourism)

Mr C Schlettwein (Finance)
Dr. D Namwandi (Mr) (Education)

SECRETARY

Mr. J Jacobs

DEPUTY SECRETARY

Mr F S Harker

LIST OF MEMBERS AND PARTIES WHICH THEY REPRESENT

ALL PEOPLE'S PARTY (APP)

Mr I Shixwameni (Chief Whip and Party Leader)

CONGRESS OF DEMOCRATS (COD)

Mr B Ulenga (Chief Whip and Party Leader)

DTA OF NAMIBIA

Mr K Kaura (Party Leader) Mr P Moongo (Chief Whip)

NATIONAL UNITY DEMOCRATIC ORGANISATION OF NAMIBIA (NUDO)

Mr K Riruako (Party Leader) Mr A Tjihuiko (Chief Whip)

RALLY FOR DEMOCRACY AND PROGRESS (RDP)

Mr S Bezuidenhoudt

Mr Hidipo Hamutenya (Party Leader)

Ms A Limbo Mr H Lucks Mr P Naholo Mr K Nehova

Mr J Nyamu

Mr A von Wietersheim

REPUBLICAN PARTY

Ms C Gowases

SWANU

Mr U Maamberua (Chief Whip and Party Leader)

SWAPO OF NAMIBIA

Mr J Mutorwa

Mr B Mwaningange Mr T Nambahu

Mr B Amathila Dr M Amweelo (Mr) (Chief Whip) Mr N Angula (Prime Minister) Dr S C Ankama (Mr) (Deputy Minister) Ms P Beukes (Deputy Minister) Mr E Dingara Mr J Ekandjo (Minister) Mr B Esau (Minister) Dr H Geingob (Mr) (Minister) Dr T-B Gurirab (Mr) (Speaker) Ms P Haingura (Deputy Minister) Mr M Hausiku (Deputy Prime Minister) Mr U Herunga Mr P Iilonga (Deputy Minister) Mr W Isaacks Ms P Iivula-Ithana (Minister) Dr A Iyambo (Mr) (Minister) Dr N Iyambo (Mr) (Minister) Mr J Kaapanda (Minister) Mr E Kaiyamo (Deputy Minister) Dr R Kamwi (Mr) (Minister) Mr P I Kapia Ms L Kasingo (Deputy Speaker) Mr I Katali (Minister) Ms J Kavetuna Dr A Kawana (Mr) (Minister) Mr K Kazenambo (Minister) Ms S Kuugongelwa – Amadhila (Minister) Ms L Lucas (Deputy Minister) Ms S Makgone Ms A Manombe-Ncube Mr N Mbumba (Minister) Ms A Muharukua (Deputy Minister) Mr A Muheaua (Deputy Minister) Mr P Mushelenga (Deputy Minister)

(Minister)

(Deputy Minister)

Mr C Namoloh (Minister)

Dr D Namwandi (Mr) (Deputy Minister)

Mr A !Naruseb (Minister)

Ms E !Nawases-Taeyele (Assistant Whip)

Mr I Ngatjizeko (Minister)
Ms N Nandi-Ndaitwah (Minister)
Ms R Nghidinwa (Minister)
Mr E Nghimtina (Minister)
Mr U Nujoma (Minister)

Mr P Shifeta (Deputy Minister)

Ms D Sioka (Minister)

Mr T Tweya (Deputy Minister)

Mr F Ueitele

Mr E Uutoni (Deputy Minister)

Mr Piet van der Walt

Ms L Witbooi

UNITED DEMOCRATIC FRONT (UDF)

Mr J //Garoëb (Party Leader)
Mr S Tjongarero (Chief Whip)

<u>APPOINTED BY THE PRESIDENT IN TERMS OF ARTICLE</u> 32(5)(c) OF THE CONSTITUTION

Ms M Jankowski

Prof. P Katjavivi (Mr) (Deputy Chairperson of the Whole

House Committee)

Mr C Schleittwein (Deputy Minister)
Mr S Simataa (Deputy Minister)

Ms S Swartz Ms A Tjongarero NATIONAL ASSEMBLY ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS WINDHOEK 14 JUNE 2011

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

HON SPEAKER: On your desks you will find an invitation from His Excellency President Hifikepunye Pohamba for a reception on Friday, 17 June 2011 at 10:00 at the State House. All Honourable Members and their spouses are invited to this function.

<u>HON SPEAKER:</u> Any Petitions? Any Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers?

TABLING: NATIONAL POLICY ON CLIMATE CHANGE FOR NAMIBIA

HON MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM: Comrade Speaker, I lay upon the Table, National Policy on Climate Change for Namibia.

HON SPEAKER: Please table the Policy. Any other Reports and Papers? Minister of Transport.

6

11 TABLING OF REPORTS HON NGHIMTINA / HON !NARUSEB / HON HERUNGA

TABLING: 2009 ANNUAL REPORT: NAMIBIA PORT AUTHORITY

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Honourable Speaker, I lay upon the Table, Annual Report of Namibia Port Authority for the year 2009.

HON SPEAKER: Any further Reports and Papers? Minister of Lands and Resettlement

TABLING: MINISTRY OF LANDS AND RESETTLEMENT

HON MINISTER OF LANDS AND RESETTLEMENT: Honourable Speaker, I lay upon the Table, Annual Report of the Ministry of Lands and Resettlement for the year 2009/2010.

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Minister table the Report? Honourable Deputy Minister.

TABLING: ANNUAL REPORT OF MINISTRY OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM:

Honourable Speaker, I lay upon the Table, Annual Report of the Ministry of Environment and Tourism for the year 2009/2010.

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS HON MAAMBERUA

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please table the Report. Any further Reports and Papers? Any Notice of Questions?

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS

QUESTION 17:

HON MAAMBERUA: Honourable Speaker, I give Notice that on Thursday, the 23rd of June 2011, I shall ask the Minister of Health and Social Services the following questions:

- 1. I gather that many patients who visit State Hospitals have difficulties in communicating their illnesses to doctors in English or even in Afrikaans because they do not know these languages. What mechanisms or facilities are there to assist with the translations at State Hospitals?
- 2. In Courts translations are provided for. Can similar services also be provided in State Hospitals and if so, how soon?
- 3. Are there general standards in the hospitals in terms of levels of service provision and hygiene? If so, are these standards monitored regularly and by whom?
- 4. How are hospitals rated in the light the foregoing, that is the standards of service delivery and how is the Grootfontein Hospital rated?
- 5. Is there a customer care charter at the Grootfontein Hospital and if so, is it translated into indigenous languages? Accordingly, how long does a patient have to wait for a doctor who is on call?

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS HON MAAMBERUA / HON TJIHUIKO

QUESTION 18:

<u>HON MAAMBERUA</u>: I give Notice that on Thursday, the 23rd of June 2011, I shall ask the Minister of Youth, National Service, Sport and Culture the following questions:

- 1. Is the Minister aware that in the past few years there has been an exodus of Namibian youths to other countries, including the United Kingdom, the United States of America, Canada and some other countries?
- 2. Would the Minister agree with me that since there is no youth unemployment benefit fund, many unemployed youth become poor and hopeless, resulting in them having to risk leaving Namibia for other countries.
- 3. If the Minister is aware of this desperate situation, can you give a breakdown of many youths have left Namibia under these conditions and precisely in which countries do they find themselves? In what type of conditions do they live there? Are they better off there than they were in Namibia?
- 4. Would your Ministry consider introducing a Basic Income Grant for the unemployed youths as a matter of priority?

HON SPEAKER: Can the Honourable Member table the questions? Thank you. Honourable Tjihuiko.

QUESTION 19:

<u>HON TJIHUIKO</u>: Honourable Speaker, I give Notice that on the 23rd of June 2011, I shall ask the Honourable Minister of Trade and Industry the following questions:

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS HON TJIHUIKO

- 1. Being at the helm of the team that is negotiating various international agreements, among others, EPAS, Doha Round of Trade Negotiations, the implementation of AGOA and many others, can the Honourable Minister update this Honourable House on the state of negotiations and implementation of these international organisation?
- 2. How many Namibian businesses have benefited from AGOA to date? If none, why not?
- 3. In the event Namibia lost the EU market, what are the other available alternative markets for our beef, grapes and fish?

HON SPEAKER: Any Notice of Motions? Minister of Veteran Affairs.

NOTICE OF MOTIONS

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: Honourable Speaker, I give Notice that tomorrow, Wednesday, the 15th of June, I shall Move –

That leave be given to introduce a Bill to establish a National Honours Advisory Committee and Regional Honours Advisory Committees to advise the President of the Republic of Namibia, when exercising his or her discretion, to confirm honours; to provide for the establishment of a National Heroes Acre and Regional Heroes Acre and to provide for incidental matters.

<u>HON SPEAKER:</u> Can the Honourable Minister table the Motion? Honourable Kaura.

NOTICE OF MOTIONS HON KAURA / HON MAAMBERUA

HON KAURA: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. I give Notice that on June 16th, 2011, I shall Move -

That this Assembly –

Debates the levy on livestock sold at auctions south of the Veterinary Cordon Fence (redline) deducted from rich and poor farmers to assist rich and poor farmers north of the Veterinary Cordon Fence with a view to abolish it immediately.

<u>HON SPEAKER:</u> Will the Honourable Member please table the Motion? Honourable Maamberua.

<u>HON MAAMBERUA</u>: Honourable Speaker, I give Notice that on Tuesday, the 28th of June 2011, I shall Move –

Considering the genocide historical facts of the place where the Independence Memorial Museum is currently being constructed;

Knowing that the place where the Independence Memorial Museum is being constructed was used as a concentration camp in the aftermath of the 1904 war and taking into account that as a result of the inhumane treatment of the inmates of this concentration camp many people have perished at that place;

Being aware that it is costly to erect another building of similar magnitude for genocide remembrance;

Further cognisant of the fact that the construction is taking place at one of the most horrific places where past genocidal activities were committed and that is why it is called *Orumbo rua Katjombondi*;

That this Assembly, considers, discusses and debates the proposal to rename that Independence Memorial Museum currently under

MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON DR KAMWI

construction near the Alte Feste, Windhoek National Museum;

Passes a resolution to rename the Independence Memorial Museum to a name that reflects the description that will at all times remind Namibia and the world about the genocide that took place in Namibia, the name being proposed being Genocide Remembrance Centre.

I so Move, Honourable Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Member please table the Motion? Any further Notice of Motions? Ministerial Statements? Ministry of Health and Social Services.

MINISTERIAL STATEMENT

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Thank you for giving me the Floor Honourable Speaker. Honourable Speaker, Sir, Honourable Members, today, the 14th of June, is World Blood Donor Day. Namibia is joining the rest of the world in celebrating this day under the theme, "*More Blood, More Life.*" The day is celebrated to raise awareness of the need for safe blood and blood products and to thank voluntary unpaid blood donors for their lifesaving gifts.

This year's theme is selected to reinforce the urgent need for more people all over the world to become lifesavers by volunteering to donate blood regularly. The World Health Organisation estimates that approximately 92 million blood donations are collected annually. About 48% of these blood donations are collected in developed countries where only 15 percent of the world population lives. Forty-three countries in the African Region reported collected 4 million units of blood, which accounts for 4.3% of global donations although these countries are home to 12% of the global population.

12

MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON DR KAMWI

The World Health Organisation's goal is for all countries to obtain all blood supplies from voluntary and paid donors by 2020. In 62 countries worldwide, national blood supplies are based on 100% voluntary and paid blood donations and I am pleased this afternoon to inform Honourable Members and the Nation that Namibia is one of those rather few countries who are making a contribution to blood donations. We should all be proud as Namibians for this achievement. The remaining countries, that is over a hundred, complement their blood supply through payment for blood provided. This is no more blood donation but blood purchase.

Honourable Speaker, Sir, the provision of safe and adequate blood is a Government responsibility and should be an integral part of each country's national health care policy and health care infrastructure. The WHO recommends that every country should put in place policies, systems and infrastructure to ensure the safety, quality, accessibility and timely availability of blood and blood products to meet the need of all patients who require transfusion of blood and blood products. Indeed, Namibia had done so. We have put in place all the required policies, systems and infrastructure and the blood used for donation in Namibia is safe.

To commemorate this day, I was at a function early this morning at Jan Möhr Senior Secondary School and I was pleased to receive praises from the World Health Organisation who commended the Namibian Government for her continuous quest to provide safe blood and blood products to all patients who need it most.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I am informed that learners in Namibia are donating blood and that 365 units of blood were donated by the management, staff and learners of Jan Möhr Senior Secondary School during last year. This is a commendable achievement for a school as it demonstrates an elevated sense of social responsibility from the youth. They are contributing to save the lives of those who need it most.

Permit me to use this opportunity to commend Jan Möhr Senior Secondary School management, staff and learners for participating in this noble task of donating blood to save precious lives. I extend my gratitude

MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON DR KAMWI

to all other schools around the country where our learners are also donating blood to save lives. It is encouraging to see young people freely donating blood by breaking the myth, rumours and false assumptions around blood donation. Blood is a free gift and there is more blessing in giving than receiving. In this respect I would like to encourage this august House, the Honourable Members, to emulate this good example of the learners and start donating blood.

As you may know, blood and its products may be required whenever an accident occurs or a mother is having a complicated delivery or someone is suffering from anaemia or other diseases. It could be me and you; it could be our own children, our loved ones, our mothers or fathers. We all may need blood at any given time in one's life, thus we should donate blood. I am a regular blood donor. Thank you very much, indeed.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Honourable Minister, as I was listening to you, I was also looking at the Attorney-General, wondering whether the Speaker would be in order to gently coerce the Honourable Members to indicate their blood types for record-keeping by the House. It is a voluntary exercise. I want to relate my own experience when I was Prime Minister. The Director of Education in the Region invited me to talk to Civil Servants in the Region, but he told me that I did not have to have a prepared speech, that I could just talk to them. I was a new Prime Minister and even though everybody knew me, they thought that it would be a good thing if we came together. So, as I was called upon to say a few things, on my way a thought cropped up in my mind as I was trying to figure out what to say to these people and when I got on the podium I said, since the Director said it is an informal gathering, I want to start with "My blood type is B-plus, would all the B-plus in the group myself: please rise." I do not know all the blood types, but I know what my wife's blood type is and I continued down and I was saying to myself that is really scientific and after I went around the exercise, I discovered a person sitting on one side to be the mother of somebody and I could detect that they have different blood types and I continued the exercise until finally I said maybe I should write a book, I made a great invention here.

14 June 2011

MOTION ON STIFF TRAFFIC FINES HON MOONGO

I am asking that, if one of the Honourable Members were to collapse here and we want to call the people who are saving lives that way, we would at least know the person who fell down, hit something and is bleeding profusely, the person is B-minus. Would that not help? Is it illegal that we have a database of all the possible blood types so that we contribute to the lifesaving that the Minister is talking about?

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Thank you very much for what you raised, it is very important for one to know one's blood group. In a situation where one does not know one's group, the O-group caters for all.

<u>HON SPEAKER</u>: Any further Ministerial Statements? The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

MOTION ON STIFF TRAFFIC FINES

HON SPEAKER: When this Debate was adjourned on Tuesday, 7th June 2011, the Question before the Assembly was Motion by the Honourable Moongo. Honourable Ulenga adjourned the Debate and he now has the Floor. Any further discussion in his absence? None. Does the Honourable Moongo wish to reply?

HON MOONGO: Honourable Speaker, I would like to adjourn the response until Thursday.

<u>HON SPEAKER</u>: The reply will be given on Thursday. The Secretary will read the Second Order of the Day.

14 June 2011 REPORT: PARLIAMENTARY HEARING AT UN HON DR AMWEELO

CONSIDERATION: REPORT OF ANNUAL PARLIAMENTARY HEARING HELD AT UNITED NATIONS

HON SPEAKER: Does the Honourable Dr Amweelo move that the Report be considered?

<u>HON DR AMWEELO</u>: I so Move. Thank you very much, Comrade Speaker.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, it is indeed an honour to briefly motivate the Report of the Annual Parliamentary Hearing at the United Nations from 2 to 3 December 2010. The Annual Hearing was presided by our Honourable Speaker in his capacity as the President of the Inter-Parliamentary Union and the President of the UN General Assembly. It should be noted that the Report provides Parliamentary dimensions to some challenging issues facing the world. The purpose of tabling the Report for discussions instead of note-taking, Honourable Speaker, is to stimulate discussions on the issues around the world.

Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members, I will start with a few interesting quotes. A viewer of the documentary film "Inside Job" by Charles Ferguson made the following observations: "As this dense, elaborate house of cards gradually built itself up, the rich got richer and the poor got set up. And when it all finally imploded in 2008, the reverberations were felt globally." "Inside Job" is a documentary theme, providing an analysis of the financial and economic meltdown that started in the USA.

Another interesting quote by a Chilean Member of Parliament is as follows: "Banks are capitalists when they make a profit and become socialists when they sustain a loss."

A female Member of Parliament from Sweden stated: "If that bank had been called the Lehman sisters, things would have been very different."

14 June 2011 REPORT: PARLIAMENTARY HEARING AT UN HON DR AMWEELO

Another Senator from Mexico stated that: "It is not realistic to expect people to have environmental sustainability in their heads while they have nothing but hunger in their stomachs."

Another Member of Parliament from Benin said: "We can only look on the ecological damage and weep while polluters shed crocodile tears at the disappearance of the tropical forests."

The annual gathering between the United Nations and the IPU provides a platform where the two world organisations discuss and craft solutions to issues affecting the world, issues affecting our countries, issues affecting our communities and issues affecting our households. In accordance with the provisions of the General Assembly Resolution on the cooperation between the UN and the IPU, Resolution A/61/6, the annual Hearing is, "a joint event of the two organisations heralding a greater political commitment on the part of the United Nations to hear the views of parliamentarians on some of the most urgent issues of our times". Among other things, the Hearing provides an opportunity for Members of Parliament to meet and hear from the United Nations Management Team. The conclusions of the Hearing are usually circulated on the wider UN community as well as to all national Parliaments. The theme of the 2010 Annual Parliamentary Hearing at the United Nations was: Economic Recovery. Rethinking Development, retooling Global Governance."

The Parliamentary hearing covered four sessions. I will not go into detail as the Report outlines the conclusions and the recommendations that emerged from each session. I trust that the Honourable Members had opportunity to read the Report. The sessions covered the following items:

Session 1: Current risks to economic recovery and the continuing structural imbalances in the global economy.

Session 2: Reforming the international financial systems: A critical look at key issues on the UN agenda.

Session 3: Rethinking sustainable development within the current global

14 June 2011 REPORT: PARLIAMENTARY HEARING AT UN HON NUJOMA

economic and environmental framework.

Session 4: Providing leadership in global economic governance, empowering the UN, the role of the G20 and the need for transparency and accountability in decision-making.

When closing the Hearing at the UN, our Honourable Speaker stated that: "Parliamentarians should continue to hold true their duty as representatives of their electorate and as citizens of their countries, observing best governed countries are those where the Legislatures and the Executives share with the people the same sense of common purpose for the future."

With these few words, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I humbly request that this House adopts the Report. I thank you.

<u>HON SPEAKER</u>: I thank the Honourable Member. Any further discussion? Minister of Foreign Affairs.

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Comrade Speaker, first of all, let me express my sincere thanks for this Report presented by Honourable Amweelo. I think it is a good report. I think it is good that the UN provides a forum like this joint parliamentary hearing between the Parliaments and the General Assembly, because I recall receiving a request from the Parliamentarians that they wanted to visit the United Nations to observe the debates at the General Assembly. I do not understand now, if there is a platform provided for the Joint Sessions between Parliaments and the General Assembly, why was there a need for the Parliamentarians to request to attend the General Assembly meeting in New York, which normally starts in September? That is the question I wanted to ask, because according to the request they wanted to observe the deliberations at the General Assembly, which in my view was not really necessary because normally States are provided four or five

14 June 2011 REPORT: PARLIAMENTARY HEARING AT UN HON DR AMWEELO / HON DR GURIRAB

delegates only and the number of Parliamentarians who requested to attend the General Assembly were six or eight. However, the Report is welcomed. Thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Any further comments, observations? Honourable Amweelo, you have the Floor.

HON DR AMWEELO: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. I think this meeting is different from the IPU and the UN. If there was such a request, I am not aware of that.

HON SPEAKER: If I am allowed, I want to say one or two things. This is a much later development that came in being during the time of my

presidency of the IPU before we adopted such a platform where the IPU and the General Assembly organise interaction and invited speakers, guests and orators to speak on issues of their expertise. When I started as Foreign Minister, given my experiences at the UN before I became Foreign Minister, I used to include, as a matter of course, Members of the National Assembly in my delegation and my leaders, the President and the Prime Minister, Cabinet generally, felt it was a good idea. The IPU urges Parliaments to see to it, as part of the responsibility of accountability oversight and the resolutions that have come before the National Assembly, that when it is possible and the request to Governments of Member countries of the IPU through their Parliaments, it is a good practice to include Members of Parliament in the delegations of the Governments led by the Foreign Minister to allow them an opportunity, not as members of the Government delegation, to continue doing their oversight responsibility that they do also at home. I used to include also the Members of the Opposition and it served us well.

The Permanent Representative at the UN deputises the Foreign Minister. When I left, when we had both the Ambassador and the Permanent Representative to the UN in Washington, I asked one of the Members of

my delegation, in this case a Member of the Opposition to lead the delegation when I left. It worked well, so I just want to clarify it can be done and equally IPU is urging Government delegations, be they delegations to the UN, trade delegation or any other delegation, to see to it that Members of Parliament are included.

HON DR AMWEELO: I just want to thank all the Honourable Members for their support. Thank you very much.

HON SPEAKER: The Report is adopted. Thank you. The second Notice of Motion is the one of Honourable Shixwameni. Does the Honourable Member move the Motion?

MOTION ON NEED FOR THE CREATION OF A NATIONAL RESERVE FUND FOR FUTURE GENERATIONS, AND ADOPTS A RESOLUTION FOR THE STATE TO DO RESEARCH ON AND CREATE A FUND

HON SHIXWAMENI: Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I am standing here as a person who loves this country, a person who has this country's future and interest at heart, like all of us that are here. However, I also think that thinking, planning and providing for future generations and for future stability of resource flow is indeed great importance for all nations. This even becomes of greater importance and meaning for a Nation which depends on raw material which can be depleted or whose pricing fluctuates regularly and is volatile, such as diamonds, copper, uranium and marine resources.

As a natural resources dependent country we must be every cognisant of

the fact that these resources can and will one day be depleted. We need to provide for those days when no significant income shall come from these resources which we now depend on today.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, for me a vision is a picture of tomorrow seen today. There is only nineteen years left to Vision 2030, which means and calls upon all of us together to work hand-in-hand to make Vision 2030 a reality one day. Can we just pause for a moment and imagine a situation where our SACU income would have dwindled to the point where what we get from the SACU pool is insignificant that it will not make an impact on future Budgets, as is the case currently. Thus, my contribution today is about making that a reality. Can we imagine a future without aid from donor countries or so-called soft loans or grants because of our classification as an upper-middle income country and would have to depend mostly on our own resources? Can we imagine years of global crisis where the prices of uranium, copper, diamonds and our marine resources are down and close to nothing? Can we even dare to imagine a situation where we have five or ten years of consistent drought or floods? Surely you will agree with me that that will be a nightmare scenario for our country, particularly for future generations. Imagine the current awkward situation of the PIGs, that is Portugal, Ireland and Greece, who are currently caught up between a rock and a hard place.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I do not wish any of these ills to befall our Nation, but as visionary leaders we need to plan ahead and act. A plan without an action is the slowest route to victory.

Whilst acknowledging Government's plausible efforts to invest heavily in education and other physical infrastructure of our country, such as roads, rails and hospitals, etcetera, there is a great need to plan and provide for the future still. I, therefore, propose that a national taskforce, comprising of the National Planning Commission, the Ministry of Finance and the Bank of Namibia be set up and tasked to investigate, research and come up with a Bill for such a reserve fund or trust fund for our Nation and future generations. This would be the insurance policy to protect our children, grandchildren and great-grandchildren from possible hard times

that might visit them when most of us are no longer around. (Intervention)

HON SPEAKER: The House shall rise for refreshments.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:40 HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:20 PURSUANT TO ADJOURNMENT

HON SHIXWAMENI: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. I ended up at the point where I was saying that the reserve fund or trust fund for future generations would be the insurance policy to protect our children, their grandchildren and great-children from possible hard times that might visit them when most of us are no longer around. Indeed, it is not an invention by me. Other countries, such as Algeria, are debating the same creation of a future fund, Kuwait and Alaska already have them, Ghana, with the discovery of oil, is also in the process of creating one and many others have created such fund.

I thus humbly call upon all of us as leaders of our Nation to think outside the box in a futuristic visionary way, without proposing doom or an apocalyptic future scenario, but merely thinking and concerned about the future and the need to make sure that we as leaders provide guaranteed security for future generations now. I thus humbly request this august House to seriously consider and approve the need for the establishment of a national reserve fund or trust fund for future generations whose primary objectives should be to guarantee future socio-economic prosperity and continuous political stability for our grandchildren and their grandchildren. Patriotism must be beyond political affiliation and ideological orientation. We all, as I said at the beginning, love our country as proud Namibians and want future generations of Namibians to still walk tall and proud of being Namibians in a country which is both economically and financially sustaining, enjoying continuous prosperity.

To this fund the State can contribute a certain percentage of the proceeds derived from mining, fishing, tourism and tourism activities annually. Alternatively, Political Parties represented in Parliament, set aside a certain amount in the annual Budget for this reserve fund or trust fund.

Other companies that are exploiting our natural resources and those companies that are receiving Government tenders must also contribute a certain percentage to this fund on an annual basis or whenever a company wins a tender from the State exceeding a certain amount.

The fund would then invest in assets, both nationally and globally, to make sure that it accumulates more money. I believe this is something that we must have done from day one during the first years of our Independence, but nevertheless, as the saying goes, better late than never.

I proceed from the belief of asking the basic question of: what will happen to our children, their grandchildren and great-grandchildren when these resources are depleted? Do we want them to inherit a country drowning in debt instead of a country continuing to be sovereign and that is financially and economically sound, secure and stable? Other details of such fund can be part of the debate in this House. The shape and the structure of such trust fund could be the subject of even a broader investigation by the taskforce out there. Our grandchildren have a birthright and should be able to enjoy the mineral, marine and other resources and should not blame us of having thought of ourselves alone and having been greedy without thinking and planning for their future. Let us thus have a debate and consider the proposal maturely and patriotically and eventually that this Honourable House shall approve this Motion and that we in our collective capacity in this House, first as national leaders and representatives and servants of our people who elected us to this House, shall request the Executive arm of our government to see to it that such reserve fund or trust fund will be created during the lifetime of this Fifth Parliament in the best interest of our nation and future generations.

In conclusion, I would like to thank you for listening to me and now move that this august House carefully considers, debate and eventually adopt

14 June 2011 MOTION ON A NATIONAL RESERVE FUND HON SCHLETTWEIN / HON DR GEINGOB

this noble Motion for action by the Executive arm of our State before the end of this Parliament and Government, which is 2015. I thank you and so move.

<u>HON SPEAKER:</u> I thank the Honourable Member. Any further discussion? Deputy Minister of Finance.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: Honourable Speaker, it is my understanding that this Motion would entail a number of issues that directly impact on our way we Budget and how we approve expenditure, how we collect revenue, how we deal with risks, how we deal with investments and how we deal with access to natural resources, to mention but a few, and therefore I think there is a need to properly coordinate our response and I, therefore, request this House to postpone the Debate until next week, the 22nd.

HON SPEAKER: Minister of Trade and Industry.

.____

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: Thank you, Comrade Speaker. I was just wondering, because sometimes the Opposition Colleagues hear things are being done and they come here and act as if they have invented the wheel. It may be recalled that the former Permanent Secretary Hoebeb came here a few months ago to several Committees with a group of people, including my Cabinet Committee. We interrogated the issue, we asked questions and that issue is being discussed, debate and studied. I just want the House to know that the issue is being discussed to look at the modalities and whether it is viable. So, it will not be the Honourable Member's invention, it is being discussed already. Thank you very much.

14 June 2011 MOTION ON SITUATION IN NORTH AFRICA AND THE MIDDLE EAST HON HAMUTENYA

HON SPEAKER: The further consideration of the Motion stands adjourned until Wednesday, next week. The third Notice of Motion is the one of Honourable Hamutenya. Does the Honourable Member move the Motion?

MOTION ON ISSUES RELATED TO THE RECENT REVOLUTIONARY UPRISING IN THE ARAB MAGHREB AND THE MIDDLE EAST AND TO FORMULATE A POLICY STAND FOR NAMIBIA

HON HAMUTENYA: I move the Motion. Honourable Speaker, I rise to speak on the historic uprising that has been rocking the countries of North Africa and the Middle East in recent months, indeed for the first half of this year.

These uprisings have been events of unprecedented magnitude that should have aroused alarming concern in this continent. Very obviously a climate of revolutionary proportion, such as the ones that so suddenly and sweepingly toppled some of the decades-long and seemingly firmly entrenched regimes in Egypt, Tunisia, Yemen and now, predictably and ominously, threatening to topple the Government of Gaddafi in Libya. This overwhelming problem is an African problem whose root cause we need to discuss and understand.

The North African countries have not been your lawless territories that were perpetually embroiled in civil wars in the past, nor have their citizens live appeared to be miserable as those of many of African countries in the sub-Sahara area. Therefore, not many people around the world and here in Africa had expected that a revolutionary uprising would topple the regimes of Ben Ali in Tunisia, of Mubarak in Egypt and, predictably, that of Mohammar Gaddafi in Libya. (Interjection). We may like to hide our faces in the sand in the hope that things will not happen, but they will happen and it looks like they will happen.

14 June 2011 MOTION ON SITUATION IN NORTH AFRICA AND THE MIDDLE EAST HON HAMUTENYA

Many of the countries of North Africa and Middle East are well-endowed with natural resources, that are abundant oil revenues, but while the revenues from the natural oil could have been used as the Region's best vehicles for economic development, they have turned out to be the Region's "curse". This is to say, as oil revenue built up, affording the countries of the Region a middle-income status, those countries began to pay or little or no attention to other economic activities, like agriculture, manufacturing and services. Thus protection of other areas of the economy that are non-oil economic activities either stagnated or collapsed altogether. In other words the phenomenon which economists refer to as "Dutch Disease" set in. Dutch disease refers in economics to a situation where a country discovers valuable natural resources and the export of those resources causes the country's currency to rise in value against the currency of other countries. This makes the activities of other sectors of the economy to become uncompetitive, but as noted earlier, these are the activities that may possibly have been the best vehicle for the country's technological progress, but because of "Dutch Disease" they get compromised and forgotten.

By the middle of the year 2009 the world price of oil crashed and the lot of the masses became extremely dire, that is, poverty began to worsen.

An equally important point to bring out here is that resource-rich societies have a very strong tendency towards the politics of patronage and autocracy, which in turn attracts crooks and cronies into politics and the Middle East and North Africa being the area where oil supplies are concentrated have been un-universally autocratic. In other words, autocracy tends to attract cronies who are largely crooks that embezzle public money to supply private patronage instead of using revenues to supply public services. This is yet another natural resource rich trap which helps the regime to be unaccountable and thus corrupt, so much so that corruption gets out of bounds. Thus, most of the countries of the Middle East and North Africa were hit by global economic meltdown and they were unable to use their resources to counter the effect of the meltdown of the economy.

14 June 2011 MOTION ON SITUATION IN NORTH AFRICA AND THE MIDDLE EAST HON HAMUTENYA

It would be tragic if we would not learn any lesson from the uprisings in North Africa and Middle East. We should never underestimate the intelligence of the masses and their ability to shake off undemocratic and irresponsible regimes, nor should we have any doubt about the ability of the masses to bring about fundamental change when they so decide. We should resist the temptation to insult the intelligence of the people by implying that they are being used by some external forces.

The masses have recognised the fact that unemployment rates were high in the Middle East and the fact that the unemployment rates are unacceptable, the high prices of food also became unacceptable and other basic commodities were equally unaffordable and these things are a result of bad governance. It was in this context that the masses of the Region revolted against their Governments.

What lessons then can Namibia and Southern Africa as a whole draw from these events in North Africa and the Middle East? Our Region is also endowed with significant natural resources, such as diamonds, uranium, gas, oil, plutonium and gold. With such natural resource riches we are able to escape the paradox of poverty amidst plenty as well as to scrupulously guard against the practice of bad governance, such as autocracy, corruption and lack of accountability and the tendency to cling to power. Having realised that the volatility of resource prices are volatile, they are important but they should not be misled. We should not believe that the wealth we are getting is forever and therefore, we need to understand that we live in the 21st century and not in the stone age.

The brutalities against the Jewish people by Hitler's Germany and the genocide of Rwanda have been heinous and shameful enough. It is indeed, a shame to humanity's conscience. Our moral consciousness should thus not allow us to ever again turn a blind eye with impunity to the needs of the people. The people have an extensive network of communication in today's world; they can learn the methods of putting away the unwanted Government in a very short time. The inviolability of sovereignty should also not come before the rights of the people to live in security and freedom. As the revolutionaries that we claim to be, we

14 June 2011 MOTION ON SITUATION IN NORTH AFRICA AND THE MIDDLE EAST RT HON N ANGULA

should never accept the practice of impunity and we should not try to befriend the impunity where it is being practised. If the people in a given country decide to deal with their regime, they should be allowed to decide. I thank you, Mr Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Any further discussion? Prime Minister.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Thank you, Mr Speaker. I know this Motion is about the presidential aspirant trying to launch his campaign, but for the sake of the public information we need to put this Motion into context.

Honourable Hamutenya is attempting to promote the idea of regime change by all means. This regime change by all means will create chaos and it will create civil wars. If we are promoting political change in a country, we must focus on two things: Democratisation and consensus-building. Yes, people have rights and one of the fundamental rights of the people is to choose their Government. That is laudable, but you should not choose your Government through violent means, neither should the Government use violence to suppress the aspirations of the people. That is actually the central issue here.

As a democratic state we should promote democratic solutions to political competition. We should also promote consensus-building in a contested environment. Anything else would create chaos and violence as we see it in some countries in the Middle East.

The Middle East in what is now called the Arab Spring, has a contextual element on a number of issues. Central to these issues is generational differences. These societies have been ruled over centuries by kings and even those who call themselves presidents behave as if they are kings. New generations are demanding democratisation and rightly so.

14 June 2011 MOTION ON SITUATION IN NORTH AFRICA AND THE MIDDLE EAST RT HON N ANGULA

The second issue is religious factionalism within the Islamic movement, the Shiite's against the Sunnis. In some countries minority factions rule over the majority and, obviously, in the environment of democratisation this is not acceptable.

Then you have the issue of stagnation in the Arab world, economic stagnation for the reason Honourable Hamutenya talked about, "Dutch Disease" oil wealth which is not equitably shared and opportunities which are closed off for the majority of the people. So, you can understand that these demands are legitimate.

You also have the question of humiliation of the Arab people by Israel and their supporters, the Americans, and it is that humiliation which gave birth to Al Qaeda and others. No people will allow themselves to be humiliated forever by other people, they will resist, just as we resisted apartheid here. That is also somehow legitimate, though of course sometimes they use extreme means of expressing themselves in the form of terrorism. Nobody will support terrorism. Again we come back to the question of democratising the world order so that people should move away from this concept of "might makes right", which is still prevailing.

There is a dangerous tendency which we must guard against: Foreign powers trying to change leadership in weaker countries. Namibia is a small country; morally we should not support a thing like that. If change has to happen, it must be brought about by our own people, not a foreign power, abusing the United Nations or other international instruments. We cannot morally support a position like that one. If you allow the world to be ruled by those who are powerful, we are all victims or likely to be potential victims. What prevents a Big Brother across the border, if you have a difference, to fly in to come and fix it? Therefore, we should promote international relations which are based on moral principles, not on force.

Therefore, the Arab Spring, as much as some demands are legitimate, should not be used to try to justify domestic uprisings under the pretext that it is happening somewhere else. That is a prescription for disaster and

14 June 2011 MOTION ON SITUATION IN NORTH AFRICA AND THE MIDDLE EAST HON KAURA

I hope that Honourable Hamutenya at his very seasoned age wants to live in peace and stability as an investment for his children and grandchildren. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Honourable Kaura.

HON KAURA: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. To discuss the issues that unfolded in the Middle East is extremely difficult, because we are students of History; we know how revolutions took place all over the world, beginning with the French Revolution. We know that there was a conspiratorial group of people, like Robespierre, Danton and Lafayette. There was a group of leaders that brought about the revolution, that they were architects of that particular revolution and the same the world over, whether in the United States of America where a group of people in Boston said "taxation without representation is tyranny" and on the basis of that, a great man like George Washington led this group and fought against British colonialism. Not to mention what happened in the Soviet Union, not to mention what happened in China, not to mention what happened in our own country, Namibia.

However, what happened in the Middle East is a new chapter in history, it is unprecedented. It was an implosion that came from the people and I think it is unprecedented. I want a student of History to tell me where something like that has happened in history, where an implosion took place from the masses themselves and toppled a regime and after they have done it, they start looking for leaders. Other revolutions we know of had leaders that led the people and guided them to the final conclusion of the revolution, as you did under the leadership of the Father of the Nation, President Nujoma. You know that as revolutionaries. There were people who led that revolution. It was not the same in the Middle East and, therefore, we shall have to examine and interrogate our minds on what brought about the implosion in the Middle East. It is not comparable to any other situation anywhere because it is unprecedented.

14 June 2011 MOTION ON SITUATION IN NORTH AFRICA AND THE MIDDLE EAST HON KATALI

Of course, there is a question of "monkey see, monkey do". Just by virtue of the fact that something like this has happened in the Middle East, people in Angola wanted to imitate that, but of course, it did not take off but it was a question of "monkey see, monkey do." Just by virtue of the fact that it has happened there, we must do it somewhere else. Therefore, it is imperative that we have to be conscious of it; we have to look at it very carefully and see what we can do in Namibia.

At our Economics Committee today Honourable Van Der Walt was telling us that when he was at a meeting in Hungary, Namibia is rated as a high mid-income country and it should not qualify to get any foreign aid from somewhere. I say congratulations to Namibia and to all of us that have made it possible for Namibia to be rated at that level, but then we must look at the disparities that exist within our own communities, so that at least we can sit down and address those disparities that exist, because there are people who earn a lot and they are the ones who qualify Namibia to be rated that highly, but there are those people who are struggling to have bread and butter on the table every day and there are those people who are freezing to death in the backyards of our country. Those are the issues we must address and if we do not address them, they will address us.

I feel we must critically look at the Motion; we must do a lot of introspection on what we must do to address these disparities so that this type of situation of implosion cannot happen in our own country. Thank you, Honourable Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Honourable Katali.

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. Maybe I will start where Honourable Kaura left off, that we need to examine this issue critically.

31

14 June 2011 MOTION ON SITUATION IN NORTH AFRICA AND THE MIDDLE EAST HON KATALI

I listened to Honourable Hamutenya when he was motivating the Motion and I concluded, wrongly or rightly, that the central advocacy of this Motion is the change of Government through the people. I know of only two methods where the people can change the Government through an uprising. Of course, we want democracy to prevail and, therefore, we cherish Government change through elections without violence. One of the methods I know of is that the people can rise up, as Honourable Kaura indicated without a leader, just maybe one person shouting and then everybody starts marching and it becomes an uprising. Then after the Government has been toppled, there is no leader and they are now looking around themselves for a leader. That is a dangerous situation, because what is happening in the country while they are looking for a leader? It is chaos.

Another method is that the people can rise up under a leader. Then you have two leaders, the one in power and the other one who is using the people to topple the other leader. I do not think that any of these two could be a solution for people who are not in the Middle East, to think that either of the methods is good. Because if you dare to instigate the people and the Government is toppled, what goes around comes around. This means that you are actually growing the seeds for the Government to be toppled again and that is not desirable.

When it happens that a leader instigates the people in order for the people to rise against the Government, the unfortunate situation is that the Government will also take action which will result in civil war, because these are people of the same country and the person leading the government will also have supporters behind him. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: May I ask Honourable Katali a question? Honourable Katali, are you aware that some of the undertones in the motivation of this Motion is the usual culture of plotting and typical of the Honourable Nyamu's notes?

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: Comrade Speaker, it is very, very dangerous for us to advocate change of Government through an uprising, because there are people out there who only heard what happened in the Middle East and they are not well-informed as to how it happened. Therefore, it is dangerous for us in Namibia to think that if we are not able to win elections through the ballot box, there is the other method our colleagues of the Middle East have used in order for them to come to power.

I was advancing that if you have a leader here and a leader there, they will both have followers and then they will clash. In some instances even the leaders will go with the uprising and it is not automatic that you will survive the uprising. There is no guarantee. Therefore, we really need to be careful in some of these Motions as they might be misunderstood. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND

FORESTRY: May I put a question to Honourable Katali? Comrade Katali, those who spoke used words like "Arab, autocratic" and many others. Are you aware that in the case of Egypt, the West, who is behind this thing, said "peaceful transition?" In Tunisia it was a peaceful transition, in Yemen, a peaceful transition but people were dying in their hundreds. When it came to Libya they rushed to the UN to come up with a no-fly zone to defend the people of Libya who are killed by Gaddafi and then in the case of Syria they again rushed to the UN. This is selective morality. Are you aware that it is not really because the people are tired of that particular leader, but it is because that leader is not liked by the West.

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: Yes, I am aware of that. I was just concluding, that if the motive is to bring about change through chaos, it becomes very, very dangerous and I do not think this is a message we must spread to our people, that we need to change the Government through what is happening in North Africa, because the catastrophe could be too much for us to handle.

14 June 2011 MOTION ON SITUATION IN NORTH AFRICA AND THE MIDDLE EAST HON NUJOMA

As I was saying, nobody can guarantee that "I will survive to the regime change" and therefore, we must critically look at this and not advocate this. This not only goes for Namibia, but everywhere and I do not want to dwell on the selective morality as the whole thing is just not right. Let us campaign, let us vote and when you lose, you try again and if you win, you win and then you lead the people who voted you to power. Thank you, Comrade Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Honourable Nujoma.

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Thank you, Comrade Speaker. I would also like to make a contribution to this Motion which sounds a bit too sinister and it is not a genuine Motion. I am saying it is not genuine because it links the events in North Africa to the countries in SADC, Namibia for example, and that in itself is an attempt to incite the masses to do wrong things and I agree with Honourable Katali that these are wrong things.

If one looks at the Middle East, the Middle East has been economically, historically, culturally, religiously different from the Sub-Region here. I agree a hundred percent with the Prime Minister that these people have been humiliated throughout history. They have been humiliated because of the Palestinian issue and the Palestinian issue remains central to the resolution of the crisis in the Middle East. The humiliation of the Palestinians and the defeat of these big Arab regimes by Israel throughout the wars in the Middle East have made the people of that Region very unpredictable and the events in the Middle East have come at a time when the Palestinian issue has not even been solved. There have been attempts to resolve the Palestinian issue but only by paying lip-service. Many meetings have been organised at Camp David, every American President has tried, but has failed because this was not genuine. The only demand by the Palestinian people is their legitimate demand for their land which has been taken by force. As a result, these people have been humiliated.

14 June 2011 MOTION ON SITUATION IN NORTH AFRICA AND THE MIDDLE EAST HON NUJOMA

All the Arab countries which attempted to support the Palestinian people have been blackmailed, to such an extent that they had to give up and even to the extent that some of them have been effectively used by the big Western countries to support their interests there, because of Israel. That is the problem of the Middle East.

When one compares the Middle East to countries in southern Africa, here we have regular democratic elections and people like Honourable Hidipo have been defeated, yet he is now trying to incite the very masses which have rejected him. They have rejected you and the RDP and that is why you are resorting to the Courts, trying to find some solace in the Courts. The truth is that the RDP has been rejected, the DTA has been rejected and the people of Namibia will continue to reject you. (Intervention)

HON KAURA: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? In 1990 when SWAPO won the election, Honourable Hidipo was a member of SWAPO. In 1994 when SWAPO won the election, Honourable Hidipo Hamutenya was a member of SWAPO. In 1998 when SWAPO won the election, Honourable Hidipo Hamutenya was a member of SWAPO. The only time that Honourable Hidipo was not a member of SWAPO was in 2009. Do you mean he lost all those elections up to 2009?

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: No, I am referring to the DTA and others. This one was just recently defeated, but he will taste the same medicine. Do not worry; he is going to follow the same route. He got a few seats and next time they will be reduced like those of Honourable Ben Ulenga.

As I was saying, we have credible institutions, the Parliament, the Executive, the Judiciary, we have a balance of power in this country and no institution has more powers than the other and that is why the Budget comes to Parliament to be debated and to distribute the resources derived

14 June 2011 MOTION ON SITUATION IN NORTH AFRICA AND THE MIDDLE EAST HON NUJOMA

from taxes. One cannot link this to those Arab countries which have all along been in the pocket of the United States and the other Western countries. You know very well how they have been manipulated, to the extent that they even deny the Palestinians to buy basic foodstuffs in Egypt. It is only now recently with the change of regime that the Palestinians are able to come and buy medicine. The truth of the matter is that these Arab countries have been manipulated to serve the interest of the big masters and that is why those leaders have amassed fortunes, to the extent that they have even forgotten their own people.

Some of us who have lived in Islamic countries know that those are different people because of their religion and Al Qaeda will send people with bombs strapped to their bodies to explode those devices, believing that they will go straight to Heaven. Therefore, there is no comparison. Here we have regular elections and we advise our people that they must take part in democratic elections to choose their own leaders.

In Tunisia, for example, they could up to now not identify a leader and they are in limbo. As a result the country continues to suffer. It was one of the most prosperous countries on the African continent, second to Mauritius, South Africa and Namibia. Today people are fleeing that country, drowning in the Mediterranean Sea and nobody comes to their rescue. (Intervention)

HON NYAMU: May I ask the Honourable Minister a question? Honourable Minister, you have repeatedly mentioned that Arab countries are different from SADC, different from Namibia. If that is the case, why do you show fear on your face when you are saying this?

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: I think you have a fundamental problem, when looking at me, you fear me. That is the problem and I cannot help you. That is your problem.

As a result there is no leader in Tunisia today, there is chaos, and people are fleeing. They try to appoint this leader. He is rejected; they try to appoint another one and it is a recipe for chaos. We should not encourage those types of things to happen in this Sub-Region. In Egypt it was an Arab youth who started the uprising, they did not know what they wanted and up to today the country is in limbo. The State institutions are not performing very well, they are just looking at Mubarak and Mubarak is long gone, why can they not elect new leaders? This is a recipe for chaos.

With regard to Libya, everybody wants to have a stake in the oil riches of Libya and as a result, they rushed to the UN to pass Resolutions 1970 and 1973 and as a result a sister country is being attacked today. Namibia has made its position clear, that we do not support foreign aggression on the African continent and we will continue to condemn it. (Intervention)

<u>HON KAURA:</u> May I ask the Honourable Minister a question? Honourable Minister is it healthy, acceptable and normal for a leader to refer to his own people as "rats and cockroaches?"

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: I have not studied the Islamic law; I do not know what it means. Maybe the intention was to refer to "*imperialist dogs*" or "*imperialist cockroaches*." However, that is not defensible; you cannot refer to your people as cockroaches.

What I am trying to say is that the events in the Middle East must be taken in context; they must not be abused by unscrupulous elements for their own political benefits. They have been participants in free and fair elections and when the masses reject them, they rush to the Courts, trying to find solace through the Courts. If the masses have rejected you, they will continue to reject you. Let us not link the events in the Middle East to the events in Namibia.

It is true and I agree that there is a need for resource allocation, as we do here in Namibia through Parliament, that the available resources are distributed evenly throughout Namibia. With those few remarks, I think this Motion has no base, it must be reject with the contempt it deserves. Thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Dr Geingob.

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: Comrade Speaker, I raised my hand because I did not know that there will be so many good contributions made by my Colleagues, starting with the Prime Minister who really set the stage straight, then followed by the other Colleagues who clarified the issue.

At one point while Honourable Hamutenya was motivating his Motion I agreed with him that you cannot oppress people forever and then I just went back down memory lane when the South Africans, Portuguese, French and the British were oppressing us in Africa and later on us in southern Africa. I also remembered when the very powerful apartheid regime was oppressing us, denying us all our basic human rights, when we, the Honourable Hidipo Hamutenya's, the Gurirab's and all of us here, led by our leader, Sam Nujoma, and others, decided to resist and to fight so that we can restore our human dignity and democracy from tyranny of South Africa, like he was referring to tyranny in North Africa. This was exactly because we would not like to have that kind of situation in this country we fought. I must say, I am always moderate, people were so revolutionary, talking about "imperialist running dogs" and I miss those days when we were condemning imperialism. I know if Honourable Nyamu and Honourable Hidipo Hamutenya and many were young today, we would have demonstrated at the American and other Western Embassies, condemning them. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: May I ask you a tiny question? Honourable Geingob, do you know the combat name of Honourable Hamutenya?

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: Ho Chi Minh that is what he was. After we came through that struggle, through those efforts to gain our freedom together, we established a democratic system where there will be regular elections. Honourable Kaura was right, how many free and fair elections were there? He mentioned about four of them when Honourable Hidipo was this side. Now you admit there were free and fair elections in this country because you named them. (Interjection). Your President has spoken and he said they were free elections which SWAPO won when Honourable Hidipo was here. Only with one he was not this side. We won those elections through the democratic process, we are a democratic country, and you cannot deny it. This exercise itself shows that, that you are that side to oppose peacefully, democratically.

Honourable Hidipo Hamutenya decided he wants to be that side, he moved over there. He was never arrested, never beaten up by anybody. He stood for elections; about eight of them were elected and not denied their right to exercise their freedom. That is the difference. That is why we are sitting here and debating this Motion. Did they have similar privileges in those countries? Do you not see the difference? Why are we wishing that evil must befall Namibia? Why? You see SMSs, hear telephone calls; they are praying that something bad must happen to Namibia. Maybe they are hoping that when that happens they will pick up the pieces. There will be no pieces to pick up. No, do not wish doom to come to our beautiful country, do not wish people must copy from there. Situations are different, we are a democracy whether you like it or not. Did they have a chance in those countries to come and move a Motion that we can peacefully debate in a Parliament, the Opposition there, the Ruling Party this side. That is what we have achieved. Why do you want to destroy it, Honourable Hamutenya, after we have sacrificed and got this right to agree to disagree? Why do you wish chaos to come to Namibia? (Intervention)

<u>HON KAURA:</u> On a Point of Order, Honourable Speaker, to my age mate, Honourable Geingob. I just want to say that the SWAPO Party won the elections, they were free, but I did not say they were fair.

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: Firstly, I am glad to know that Honourable Kaura is now saying "age mate" when he was just outside saying he is older than me. Well, you can play around, when you have peace you have the right to say anything and get away with it. That is the difference. You can say the elections were free and fair, you can say, to suit your own dreams, that they were not fair, it is allowed, but we cannot deny, my dear countrymen and women, that we have democracy here because all of us fought in our different ways to free this country from oppression, for having denied us our democratic right to express ourselves and you cannot deny that this country is free – free press, people write what they want. Could they do that in those countries? (Intervention)

HON NYAMU: May I ask the Minister of Trade and Industry a small question? According to your argument you see another version which we have not seen in Honourable Hidipo's Motion. You have created another Motion. Can you give us a copy of the one you have created yourself, because what you are saying is not contained anywhere in this Motion, these things you are referring to as incitement and all these things. Where is it contained in Hamutenya's Motion? If it is true that we are democratic – and I do not dispute that – why are we then defending the undemocratic regimes? Is that not a contradiction?

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: I am debating the Motion and I cannot be told how to present my case by Honourable Nyamu. I am talking on the Motion, saying that we can learn from what is happening there. That is why I am talking about our situation, to contrast

40

it with that situation. It is different here, we have democracy. Do you see the link now or do you refuse? That is your right.

Coming to the people's uprising; it is not the first time it is happening. It is true, there must have been Khomeini, but this thing happened in Iran and the Shah had to run. This happened because people are denied other means to express themselves. They did not have the means how to vote, how to complain, how to protest, how to write and complain and then they did that. Honourable Nyamu, I am telling you, you are free; you are sitting there opposite me, talking, even asking me questions. I sit down, listen to you and then I answer you. That is the difference. Do not wish that to happen to your dear country. Where will you go to? Do you think you will survive? Why are you wishing evil on your own country? I am saying that, because your SMSs and speeches are all negative, dreaming about evil befalling this country. Why do you wish that on your beautiful country? (Intervention)

<u>HON MOONGO</u>: May I ask the Vice-President a tiny question? I am happy that you asked Mr Nyamu that question, but I also want you to know whether you yourself will be able to run if we have chaos here.

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: You can see the difference between you and me health-wise and being physically fit. That means, instead of running I will stand and fight, you cannot come close to me. You should not have put that question, I am physically fit, and you cannot compare us. Please, let us not go there.

The Honourable Member talked about Libya, he asked why we are protecting undemocratic countries. How can fifteen, twenty years make such a difference since Honourable Nyamu used to talk as a revolutionary? Very soon I will quote what they were saying and you will be shocked by people who are today condemning all progressive forces, supporting the Americans and British, sounding like them today. When I

bring those quotes you young people will be surprised. You will ask, "Whom are you quoting" and I will say, "Honourable Hidipo Hamutenya, Honourable Nyamu" and you young people will be shocked, but apparently they have changed. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: May I ask you a tiny question? Do you think that things have to change because they have caught bees at the tail?

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: I do not know about that, but why are the Government and SWAPO saying that foreigners should not come and bomb Libyans? If it is really about protecting people who are oppressed, why could NATO not go to Palestine, to Israel? Why could they not go and bomb Israel?

Therefore, for the Secretary of State of the United States to go to Addis Ababa and tell Africans, ordering Africans to close their embassies in Libya and to withdraw, I wish I had the chance to ask her:

"Madam Secretary, do you know while we were refugees and recognised by you, that Libya had an embassy for us, a SWAPO presence there?" How do we close that? And you will support me, Honourable Nyamu and Hamutenya. (Intervention)

HON KAURA: May I ask my Colleague, a little bit younger by a few months, a question? Honourable Colleague, are you aware of the fact that this Palestinian-Israeli issue started with Abraham when he fathered two children, one from the married wife, Sarah, and the other one from the slave and he fathered Isak and Ishmael and then Ishmael was chased away and the Palestinians are descendants of Ishmael and the Israeli's are the descendants of Isak. This issue has lasted now for the last five thousand years. Even when Jacob went to Egypt and came back to the Promised

Land, he found the Palestinians there. When they talk of Jericho and all these things, these were Palestinians. Even when the Israelis were taken to Babylon by Nebuchadnezzar and they came back, the very same people they found there were Palestinians. Are you aware that his issue has lasted for five thousand years?

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: Whether I am aware or not is irrelevant because I am talking about Palestine today and people who are suffering today in the age of democracy and freedom. I am saying if NATO is there to protect people, are they not suffering, why can they not go there and also protect them?

You talked about EPAS, you always learn from outside only, when it is home-grown you do not listen. I was here, I fought, and I did not sign the Interim EPAS. Why? I gave reasons that you just cited here in this Assembly. Like on Thursday people sat down and just took the gross domestic product, take our population of two million, divided that and got the "per capita" which is so unrealistically high and not related to reality. I was saying that here and told my colleagues I met from those Western countries. We were also saying it is not fair to grade Namibia as a middle-income country when we know the apartheid legacy, that we were divided, people were left out. There is inequality here; therefore it is not fair to say that. I said that here and now Honourable Kaura only learned it from somebody who quoted.

I am very impressed by this spontaneous Debate, I am very impressed that Parliament is now living up to its real name, that you can just jump up and have a decent discussion. That is democracy, different from what is happening in North Africa and the Middle East and, therefore, that situation cannot happen here, because we have democracy that all of us fought for and are trying to maintain through this Parliamentary exercise. Thank you very much.

HON SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned until tomorrow at 17:45.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:45 UNTIL 2011.06.15 AT 14:30

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS WINDHOEK 15 JUNE 2011

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

BILLS CONSIDERED BY NATIONAL COUNCIL

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Members, I have been informed by the Chairman of the National Council that the Council, in terms of Article 75(2) of the Constitution, considered and confirmed the following Bills without amendments:

- Appropriation Bill [B.6-2011]
- Inspection of Financial Institutions Amendment Bill [B.4-2011].

I shall now, in terms of Article 75(3) refer these Bills to the President to deal with them under Article 56 and 64 of our Constitution.

I have further been informed by the Chairman of the National Council that the Council, in terms of Article 75(2) of the Constitution, considered and confirmed the following Bills with amendments:

- Unit Trust Control Amendment Bill [B.1-2011];
- Statistics Bill [B.26-2011].

These Bills will be placed on the Order Paper for reconsideration by this Assembly as soon as possible.

<u>HON DEPUTY SPEAKER:</u> Any Petitions? Any Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Notice of Questions?

15 June 2011

CONFERMENT OF HONOURS BILL HON DR N IYAMBO

Notice of Motions? Ministerial Statements? The First item on the Order Paper is the Notice of Motion by the Honourable Minister of Veteran's Affairs. Does the Honourable Minister move that the Bill be now introduced?

INTRODUCTION AND FIRST READING CONFERMENT OF HONOURS BILL

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: I so Move, Honourable Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection? Agreed to. Will the Honourable Minister please table the Bill? The Secretary will read the Bill a First Time.

SECOND READING CONFERMENT OF HONOURS BILL

<u>HON DEPUTY SPEAKER</u>: Does the Honourable Minister of Veteran Affairs move that the Bill be now read a Second Time?

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: I so Move, Honourable Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Who seconds? Any objection? Agreed to.

CONFERMENT OF HONOURS BILL HON DR N IYAMBO

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, I rise to motivate the Conferment of National Honours Bill, which is tabled in this august House.

Conferment of honours, orders, awards, medals and decorations has its historical origin with the security forces, especially the military and the police. Today this universal trend has developed beyond the security sectors. The Republic of Namibia achieved its Independence on the 21st of March 1990, closing the dark chapter of foreign occupation and colonial rule which stretched for over one hundred years. The Independence of Namibia ushered in a time of independence, freedom, democracy and human dignity.

It is common cause that the Independence of Namibia was brought about by the prolonged armed liberation struggle which was fought at different fronts by PLAN fighters, men and women in uniform under the banners of the SWAPO Party, diplomatic and political fronts. These are the sons and daughters of our country who are revered. They may be recognised and honoured as veterans, heroes and heroines of our struggle for freedom and Independence.

In addition, there are many men and women who made and who will make outstanding contributions in the defence in the security sector, diplomatic services, in education, health, agriculture, sport, and politics and in many other fields of human endeavours whose deeds and achievements may deserve national acknowledgement, recognition and honours.

Since Independence the President of the Republic of Namibia had conferred national status, honours and awards on heroes and heroines, on veterans and great achievers under the provision of Article 32(3)(h) of the Namibian Constitution, which empowers the President to confer such honours as the President considers appropriate on Namibian citizens, people resident in Namibia and friends of Namibia in consultation with the interested and relevant persons and institutions.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, on the 21st of March 1995, the formalisation of the Namibian Honours System was instituted and inaugurated in

CONFERMENT OF HONOURS BILL HON DR N IYAMBO

Windhoek by the Grand Master of the Order of the Most Ancient Welwitschia Mirabilis, His Excellency Dr Sam Nujoma, the then President of the Republic of Namibia. This was done in accordance with the provisions of Article 42(3)(h) of the Namibian Constitution which I have referred to earlier.

Although the provisions of the Namibian Constitution on the conferment of honours, awards and decorations have been amply implemented during the past 21 years of our Independence, there is a need to amplify and elaborate the procedure through an Act of Parliament.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Conferment of National Honours Bill before Honourable Members of this House contains policies and principles aimed at establishing an all-embracing Namibian honours system. There are four basic policies which are included in this Bill:

First, that the President of the Republic of Namibia consults and is advised on the conferment of national honours by a National Advisory Committee or Regional Advisory Commission composed of persons drawn from State organs or institutions and the communities.

Secondly, Heroes Acres should be established at Regional level for the internment of national heroes.

Thirdly, that the President consults and is advised by the National or Regional Advisory Committees on the conferment of the national honour of a State funeral and fourthly, that notwithstanding consultations and advice, the conferment of national honours is the prerogative and the responsibility of the President. Therefore, it is at his or her sole discretion.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, there are also several objectives which are contained in the Bill. Those that are worth mentioning are as follows:

1. To serve as a guide to the President of the Republic when exercising the power to confer honours, as contemplated by the Namibian Constitution.

15 June 2011

CONFERMENT OF HONOURS BILL HON DR N IYAMBO

- 2. To serve as a guide on the conferment of the national honour of a State funeral.
- 3. To provide for the establishment of a National Advisory Committee on national honour awards and decorations.
- 4. To provide for the establishment of Regional Advisory Committees to advise the President on the conferment of national honours and awards at Regional levels.
- 5. To provide for the functions of the National and Regional Advisory Committees; and
- 6. To provide for the utilisation of the National Heroes Acre as well as Regional Heroes Acres as a place of internment of heroes and heroines in diverse fields.

I also wish to point out that in addition to this Bill; there are other Acts of Parliament, such as the Defence Act and the Police Act, which prescribe procedures for honouring our men and women in uniform.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, with these few remarks, I invite Honourable Members of this august House to debate the Bill so that it can be passed at the earliest opportunity in order to serve as a guide to the President of our Republic in the exercise of his or her powers under the Namibian Constitution. I thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any discussion? Honourable Tjihuiko.

<u>HON TJIHUIKO</u>: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. Let me at the onset congratulate the Minister for bringing in this Bill, but since it is a

CONFERMENT OF HONOURS BILL HON T.IIHUIKO

Bill which we really need to look at critically, I would like to adjourn the Debate until Wednesday, next week.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The discussion of this Bill is adjourned until next week, Wednesday. The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

CONSIDERATION: WHITE PAPER ON LOCAL AND REGIONAL ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When this Debate was adjourned Tuesday, the 7th of June 2011, the Question before the Assembly was Motion by the Honourable Minister of Regional and Local Government, Housing and Rural Development. Any further discussion? Honourable Tjihuiko.

HON TJIHUIKO: Thank you very much. I need one or two clarifications on issues highlighted in this White Paper. Honourable Deputy Speaker, this White Paper is much-needed. It is something that has been awaited for some time now. I believe that it has been introduced at the right time when we are looking at addressing the question of unemployment, especially through TIPEEG, the programme that we have approved in this august House.

I believe that without strong regional structures the whole effort of pushing through the developmental assistance to the Regions will be futile. I, therefore, wish to congratulate the Minister for trying to create a conducive environment for the process of development to address the question of unemployment

There is one of two things that I want to know from the Honourable

Minister, but he is not there and I am talking to myself. In that case there is no point and maybe we need to revert back to the Minister who wanted to adjourn the Debate.

HON MINISTER OF LANDS AND RESETTLEMENT: I Move that the Debate be adjourned until Tuesday, the 21st of June.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Debate is adjourned until the 21st of June 2011. The Secretary will read the Second Order of the Day.

MOTION ON STRUGGLE FOR NAMIBIA'S LIBERATION

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When this Debate was adjourned on Tuesday, 7th of June, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by Honourable Moongo. The Honourable Minister of Presidential Affairs and Attorney General adjourned the Debate and he now has the Floor.

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND ATTORNEY-GENERAL: Thank you Honourable Deputy Speaker. I rise to contribute to the Motion of Honourable Moongo. I, however, admit that I do so with a heavy heart given the sad colonial history of our country. Allow me to state upfront that as a Member of this august House and as a person who took an Oath to protect and defend the Namibian Constitution and other laws of our Republic, I subscribe to the principle of freedom of speech and expression as provided for under Article 21(a) of our Supreme Law. At the same time, I believe that what we as national leaders do should at all times promote peace and stability in our country as

well as national unity. It is in this context that I contribute to the Debate on the Motion.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the short title of the Motion is: "*The Struggle for Namibia's Liberation*." It is, therefore, important to briefly say something on the struggle for Namibia's liberation.

Like other liberation struggles for freedoms of nations, the struggle for Namibia's liberation had perpetrators, on the one hand, and victims, on the other. Perpetrators can only be those who left their land in Europe with one aim in mind: To come to Namibia and enslave her indigenous population and loot the land and its natural resources. I compare this situation with an intruder who wants not only somebody's house, but who also makes the original inhabitants of the house as his or her slaves after unlawfully claiming ownership of the house and all the property in it. In this context, the intruder is the perpetrator and the original occupants of the house are the victims.

Equally, I regard all indigenous Namibians as victims and those who came from Europe to unlawfully occupy our land and acquire all its wealth as thieves and perpetrators. That is why we always pay tribute to our heroes and heroines of our country, such as Hendrik Witbooi, Samuel Maharero, Nehale lya Mpingana, Mandume ya Ndemufayo, Ipumbu ya Shilongo and many of our heroes and heroines of the earlier years. Our forefathers and mothers died in defence of our land so that we, the then future generation, from their point of view, could inherit it. For this reason they were prepared to face genocide, as was the case in 1904 to 1907 German War against our forbearers.

We know that our heroes and heroines of modern times, such as our Founding President, Dr Sam Nujoma, Dr Andimba Toivo Ya Toivo, Dr Hifikepunye Pohamba and others who led us during the difficult years of the struggle, including the armed struggle which spanned about 23 years, drew inspiration from our forefathers. As Dr Toivo Ya Toivo said, "the struggle was long and bitter." Honourable Moongo should know that a war cannot be compared to a Sunday picnic. The war he is talking about took about 23 years. In any war, especially a war that took so long, there

is bound to be innocent victims. Indeed, this fact was acknowledged by our senior SWAPO Party leaders. They put it in no uncertain terms, including our Vice-President that a mistake was made on the side of the SWAPO Party and an apology was made. We also accept the fact that two wrongs cannot make a right. I am, however, happy that our people have reconciled. Our people died and some were injured under war conditions. Every war has an innocent victim. This fact has been acknowledged. We were fighting a brutal system which was declared a crime against humanity by the United Nations.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, having said that, apart from the apartheid colonial regime, the DTA must carry the largest share of the blame. The DTA never opposed the conscription of Namibians who were used to fight their brothers and sisters who were fighting on the side of the liberation under the banner of SWAPO when the DTA was a so-called Government in Namibia. Remember, the so-called internal Government exercised its powers, among others, under AG 26 to detain those who were on the side of liberation. The DTA opposed the implementation of the United Nations Security Council Resolution 435, which called for UN supervised elections. The DTA's attitude is well-known at the Geneva meeting which brought together all the parties to the conference table. Our own Speaker, Dr Theo-Ben Gurirab, was one of the leading figures at that conference and he can testify to this fact.

Failure to implement Resolution 435, which was accepted by SWAPO, partly because of DTA's opposition, led to the Cassinga massacre, Oshikuku massacre and many other massacres which were perpetrated by the apartheid army of occupation. The DTA should take part of the blame; the DTA encouraged innocent Namibians to join the apartheid army to fight their brothers and sisters who were fighting on the side of liberation. It must take part of the blame. The DTA was on the side of the apartheid army of occupation as a so-called Government at the time when many PLAN freedom fighters were injected with poison and thrown into the Atlantic Ocean. It must take part of the blame. The DTA partly delayed the Independence in Namibia. In the process countless Namibians lost their lives in the war. It must take part of the blame.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, it seems Honourable Moongo is not in a position to make a distinction between victims of the colonial war and perpetrators of that war. Those who were oppressed are the victims and those who colonised us are the perpetrators. Most perpetrators have left Namibia. Where is Honourable Moongo going to find them to sit around the table with their victims? Why is the Honourable Member not embracing our cherished policy of national reconciliation as per the Namibian Constitution, which calls upon the Namibian Nation to strive to achieve national reconciliation and to foster peace and unity in our country? Opening old wounds 21 years after Independence is not helpful. Our people need bread on their tables, not wounds. They need employment, better education, better health care, rural development, better housing, potable water and other amenities. This is the second struggle, the struggle for economic empowerment especially among the youth and women. We need foot soldiers in this battle, not those who want to open old wounds.

The colonialists have physically left our motherland; we are now in charge of our own destiny. We committed ourselves through the policy of national reconciliation to bury the dark chapter of colonial oppression. With or without Honourable Moongo, we will march on to the next phase of our struggle, the economic struggle.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, allow me, while at this point, to use this opportunity to express my alarm on the ugly face of tribalism that appears to be emerging in our country. This trend must be rejected by all patriotic Namibians with the contempt it deserves. Colonial oppressors used it under the banner of divide and rule. As a result, our nation paid a heavy price. We were able to dislodge colonialism after we became united and fought under the banner of the SWAPO Party led by Dr Sam Nujoma.

Therefore, disunity and tribalism are the most dangerous developments that can face Namibia, our peaceful country.

I, therefore, appeal to my fellow citizens to reject these tendencies with the contempt they deserve. At the same time, I call upon all Honourable Members of this august House to reject the divisive Motion of Honourable

Moongo whose end-result is to divide our Nation. Honourable Moongo should not be allowed to touch a raw nerve of our Nation. Had it not been for the fact that apartheid South Africa is no longer in existence, I would have advised the Honourable Member to move a Motion to demand reparation for the colonial and apartheid damage caused to our Nation.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, for the reasons stated above, I move that this Motion be rejected. I so move and I thank you.

<u>HON DEPUTY SPEAKER</u>: Does Honourable Kazenambo still want to take the Floor after the intervention of your Colleague?

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND ATTORNEY-GENERAL: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I do not know whether there are other Honourable Members who want to take part, but I moved that this Motion be rejected and, therefore, the Honourable Deputy Speaker may see her way clear to declare that the House is divided and I use the rules of the House to say I move that this Motion be rejected.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Minister of Foreign Affairs.

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Thank you, Comrade Deputy Speaker. I Move, in terms of Rule 70 and demand for the division of the House.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: There was a proposal for the rejection of the Motion. Who seconds that Motion? Any objection?

55

15 June 2011 MOTION: STRUGGLE FOR INDEPENDENCE HON TJIHUIKO

HON MOONGO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, let us allow other people to speak their minds. We reject the move. No division now, division at the end. Why do you deprive people to speak, what kind of democracy is that?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: In terms of Rule 79, read with Rule 70, it is indicated that when a Member asks for the division, then it should be adhered to, unless somebody says the contrary and you have to quote the Rule on which you base your argument.

HON KAURA: To deny a Member the right to speak on a Motion this democratic Parliament of ours, referring to the Rules, will be totally undemocratic. Give us the right to speak on this Motion, listen to other views and then you can use your own rule.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is moved that the House be divided. Anyone who is against that, stand up and state your case. Honourable Tjihuiko.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I think there is a problem here. The Rule that you are referring to is normally applied when the Motion is moved and before the Debate has started. With due respect, Honourable Deputy Speaker, you have allowed the Debate to start. The Honourable Minister has contributed to the Debate, so what he is saying, that could have happened after the Debate, after we have exhausted the Debate and not at this particular moment.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I take note of the conventions and democratic practices elsewhere, but unfortunately we are being guided by

15 June 2011 MOTION: STRUGGLE FOR INDEPENDENCE

these Rules. Rules 69 and 72 impose on me to divide the House, unless you go and amend the Rules.

HON SHIXWAMENI: Rule 69 reads: "Whenever a question is put by the Presiding Member, any Member may, instead of demanding a division... (Interjections). Read your book and we will interpret that at the end of the reading. "Any Member may, instead of demanding a division, inform the Presiding Member that he/she wishes his/her opposition or that of the Party to which he/she belongs to be formally recorded in the Minutes of Proceedings, provided that the Presiding Member may order that a division shall take place in the event of three or more Members wishing to record their individual opposition." Rule 70: "After the Presiding Member has declared the result of the question put, any Member who has voiced his/her opposition with those who are according to such declaration in minority, may subject to Rule 69 demand a division of the Assembly upon that question and a division without Debate shall take place." Neither Honourable Moongo, neither the Presiding Officer has put that question. The question for division had come from the Attorney-General.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Shixwameni, can you proceed to Sub-Rule (b)?

HON SHIXWAMENI: "Whenever a division is demanded, the Presiding Member, before instructing the division bells to be rung, shall satisfy him/herself that at least two Members support the demand for such a division."

The Deputy Speaker has not asked for a division, the person who asked for the division is the Attorney-General. You can rule me Out of Order, but let me say this last word: What Honourable Moongo said hurt me also, I want everybody to speak on this Motion so that when the Motion is adopted or rejected (Interjections).

57

15 June 2011 MOTION: STRUGGLE FOR INDEPENDENCE

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please sit down! The House is divided.

HON KAURA: Based on Rule 69, Honourable Deputy Speaker, the House is not divided, because whenever a Motion is proposed, then you ask whether there is any objection. If there is any objection, before it is discussed, then it goes to the vote. This is what the Rule provides, nothing more, nothing less.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Kawana has asked for the rejection of the Motion, he was properly seconded. Can I give a chance to those people who oppose the proposal by Honourable Kawana to register their views, before I divide the House?

<u>HON TJIHUIKO</u>: Given the fact that here we have a different interpretation of the Rule; can we perhaps adjourn the Debate and seek legal advice on this issue? I think that will do justice to the issue.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: This Debate is adjourned until after teabreak. The House is adjourned.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:45 HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:20 PURSUANT TO ADJOURNMENT

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am still consulting on the interpretation of the two Rules and I would like this item to stand over until next Wednesday. The Secretary will read the Third Order of the Day.

58

MOTION ON SITUATION IN NORTH AFRICA AND THE MIDDLE EAST HON DINGARA

RECONSIDERATION: EMPLOYMENT SERVICE BILL

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Since both the Minister and the Deputy Minister are absent, the item is deferred until next week. The Secretary will read the Fourth Order of the Day.

MOTION ON ISSUES RELATED TO RECENT REVOLUTIONARY UPRISING IN THE ARAB MAGHREB AND MIDDLE EAST

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When this Debate was adjourned on Tuesday, the 14th of June 2011, the Question before the Assembly was Motion by Honourable Hamutenya. Honourable Dingara.

HON DINGARA: Thank you very much, Honourable Deputy Speaker. Yesterday I was listening to the Honourable Member who introduced the Motion and then to the Prime Minister. After that I realised there were two sides. Then when the next speaker, Honourable Kaura, spoke, he was speaking in favour of the Prime Minister, but then at the end he said he is in support of the Motion. Therefore, I do not understand why, if he supported the Prime Minister, he could at the end say, "I support the Motion" and I was wondering what was happening.

The uprising referred to is not an issue that happened before people like me were born, it only happened recently. I was following what was happening and it was open for interpretation by any person and I would have a problem if one person's interpretation of what is happening here is brought here as a Motion of this Parliament, because each one here has a

point of view. It is not something that others have seen and we did not see, we are all witnessing what is happening there.

What causes me to ask a very serious question is that what is happening there is an action which is regarded as undemocratic and unwanted, because we do not wish Namibia to follow that example. We do not wish things like that to happen in Namibia.

Surprisingly, the mover of the Motion is a leader of a Party which is called Rally for Democracy and Progress and that is not a democratic way of doing things. The democratic way of doing things is the way we are doing things in Namibia. The way the Honourable Member spoke was that he was very close to believing that that is the best action rather than democracy. That became clear and that is why we have to be given the freedom to make our comments because it is like when the police arrests a person when something happens and the person who committed the offence runs away and then you are arrested because you are around there and that is exactly what I have seen yesterday. We are not in support of what is happening there, but someone is saying it may happen here, clearly indicating that he is condoning that it may happen to this country.

I was asking myself, since the mover of the Motion is the leader of the Rally for Democracy and Progress; maybe the position of the Party is not to support democracy. It is just unfortunate that my leaders have spoken yesterday, including the Vice-President of the SWAPO Party and Minister Katali, and have put everything I wanted to say into proper perspective and thus I do not want to repeat it. However, I only want to say that since the Motion is stressing the undemocratic way of doing things, it should be rejected on that basis. Thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Nambahu.

60

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Comrade Deputy Speaker I thank you very much, for giving me the opportunity to make my humble contribution to this Motion.

I think it is very important that the issues which have been raised here are given prominence in our society so that the educative aspect of it is taken care of, but now I do not know how that will be done because the Parliamentary Debate is only screened on television around ten in the evening while our kids or ourselves go to bed earlier. Maybe this is something other democrats can look into, because I really feel that it is topical.

Be that as it may, Comrade Deputy Speaker, it is very important for us to put into context what is happening in the Middle East. First and foremost, we must understand the rationale. The Prime Minister, the Vice-President and other speakers yesterday actually gave reasons for what is happening. I have never seen the presence of a woman in the Parliaments of those areas, e.g. women are not eligible to vote, people have been suppressed and that is in contrast to what we have around here, therefore there can be no drawing of parallels because we are worlds apart in terms of how we are governing and what is taking place around there.

We must also understand what is really happening in Libya. The President of the United States made a very interesting observation when that war started when he said the future of the United States is very much associated with the Middle East. What does that mean? It is the oil that is in the Middle East and if the United States does not control that oil, they will experience problems with their own economic recovery, hence the need for them to have control over that area.

It is very important for our scholars and the new generation to know that the conditions which existed in Europe at the time of the colonial enterprises are actually repeating themselves and, therefore, they have to find new areas of economic exploitation in order to sustain themselves. We should also understand that when the Spanish Empire was broken and countries like Cuba and others got Independence, the scholars wrote that

this was a national disaster for those colonial powers. Portugal is now one which needs to be bailed out. Spain will be next. Who has the money in the fight against China and the East? What are they going to do? It is certainly to come over to us and colonise us and that is what we should be bracing ourselves for. Mark my words; if they do not have access to our resources, some of these things will happen in our lifetime, the collapse of the system that we see around there.

Most of you have also listened to the speech of the Secretary of State in Addis Ababa – very embarrassing, terrible. It reminds you of a white master talking to black boys sitting around, telling them what to do. It was not a request, it was a dictation and I could not understand that a person at this stage of development could come and lecture our Heads of State on what to do, not even persuading and that is supposed to be a diplomat. We have watched it and I think action speaks louder than words.

The Americans usually have this tendency that whenever you say something against them, then they say you are against America. I think this time they are against themselves. In America there is what is called the War Powers Resolution and Mr John Boehner, the Speaker of Congress has requested the President of the United States to explain where he stands as far as the War Powers Act is concerned. He is expected to explain within sixty days to Congress as to why they have committed the US Army to a cause like that and that has not happened. He has until Sunday to explain to the people of the United States as to why things are happening like that. Yes, the legal team must be hard at work to find good reasons to justify that action. Who is more democratic? Is it us or is it the President who is violating his own country laws that he swore to defend? It is very important for us to understand these issues.

Coming to NATO; NATO was formed to defend Europe against what was perceived as the Warsaw Pact countries, the Soviet Union, Czechoslovakia and all those. It has no business to bomb Africa, a Third World country to be bombed by a united front of so-called civilised countries and here we are; we are supposed to keep quiet. Keep quiet for

what? Gaddafi is the one who stood with us when these people or their Governments were not with us and we must clear about that.

When it comes to Israel, civilians are being bombed left and right and those are just Arabs. It is like those days of apartheid when somebody would ask, "How many people are in the car?" "No, there is just one person and three Ovambos." So, these are not people, these are just Arabs and why is it that in Bahrain people are doing the same things and the same rules do not apply? Then you are told that Iran is the one to blame because it is taking advantage of the situation in Bahrain. Since when is the United States and its allies not taking advantage of the problems that others have? During the Cold War you were told the Russians are the problem and I am sure the Afrikaners can really come to my aid here – "Beware of the Russians, China and others." But who is now killing more than anyone? (Interjection)

HON MEMBER: Rooi Gevaar.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Yes, yellow, red or black. The "gevaar" had colours those days, Red, black and yellow. It is very important for us to understand these things and to say NATO has no business in Africa. The US themselves are talking about the period after Gaddafi. What is going to happen to the relations between the United States and progressive Africans? I am not talking about some of them that I saw organising the rebels. You are going to leave behind a resentful generation, a humiliated generation because this is a violation of Africa for many of us sacrificed so much and we are now looking at Gaddafi being kicked around by super powers. Many of the PLAN soldiers were trained by Libya, there is no secret about it, and while others were just giving us beef and other things, others were giving us weapons to come and confront the enemy here. Who is actually not making mistakes?

As a person Gaddafi had his ups and downs, but who does not have them? Who of the presidents is so crystal clear? Today Obama is African, tomorrow he is Irish. When the elections are coming and he wants the African vote, here it comes, otherwise he runs to Ireland to go and rekindle the relations because he wants the Irish vote in the US population. We know these things.

Therefore, it is very important for us to articulate these things to our people for them to understand and to brace themselves for the neo-colonial agenda which is on its way in fear of China, because it is just matter of time before China becomes the economy number one in the world. No question about that. We must even encourage our kids to start studying Chinese, because almost everybody in Europe is doing that and when you go to the Great Wall in China, you will find more Europeans than they are in Europe. It is very important for us to put these things in context and as Africans to understand that we have to be progressive.

Yesterday we witnessed the killing of Morris Bishop, the killing of Thomas Sankara and all those other progressive people and I am telling you, they have now made an icon out of Gaddafi. They may kill him but the spirit will remain. They killed Che Guevara, they thought that was the end but Che Guevara is more revolutionary, more commanding and more inspiring after his death than when he was alive and that is what is going to happen. The United States must think carefully about what is going to happen after this. It is going to have a resentful generation, Africa is going to feel more humiliated and that is the basis for radicalism and the things they hate. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: May I ask a question? Honourable Nambahu, you said that the Parliament Debate has been moved to ten at night? What is the rationale for that? By nine Namibians are sleeping, so who watches this Debate? There is something sinister here and we have to ask the NBC why they have moved it from seven. It does not make sense if we want to educate our people.

15 June 2011

MOTION ON SITUATION IN NORTH AFRICA AND THE MIDDLE EAST HON SHIXWAMENI

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: With corruption we say it is the politicians, but sometimes it is the people who do not stand up to scrutiny that take their decisions and are not subjected to any accountability to anyone and as a result, someone will phone you at eleven and say your speech was very good. Then you are already sleeping and what about your kids who were supposed to look at these things. Officials are in a democratic country they equally have to account and they equally have to be democratic and considerate in taking the decision they take. I thank you.

HON SHIXWAMENI: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker, for according me the opportunity to speak on the Motion by the Honourable Hidipo Hamutenya on the situation in the Arab Maghreb and the Middle East.

I would like to start off on a very controversial note and I call it philosophically the moral hypocrisy of democracy around the globe, because we all talk about democracy, but we fail to say whose standards of democracy we use. I say this in the light of what is happening. Who determines whose democratic standards must be met in the first instance? (Interjection)

HON MEMBER: It is Obama!

HON SHIXWAMENI: No, we allow ourselves to be bulldozed because we are to keen to accept the billions that come from the United States of America handsomely but then with the other hand condemn them. We should be able to look them in the eyes and tell them that what you are doing is wrong and if need be, we must refuse to accept blood money. That would be a principle standard that we can sustain, but we cannot take somebody's money in front of the cameras and then at the backdoor

condemn them. That to me is the hypocrisy of democracy around the world.

Talking about the situation in the Middle East and the Arab Maghreb let me start with the Israeli-Palestinian conflict. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable Member, you are talking about us receiving blood money. That is a very serious statement. You have to explain that "blood money" and at the same time you have to know that Namibia, as part of the global village, has the right to benefit from the natural resources of this globe as long as we know it is done correctly and more particularly, approved by our national Parliament.

HON SHIXWAMENI: I do not know whether that is a question or a statement, but I take it as a statement of fact. You see, people are so nervous. Learn to listen, please. Even in the classroom you listen until the professor has concluded and then you ask questions. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: I am rising to seek clarification from the Honourable Member on the statement that he made that I consider to be a very serious statement, where he said that it is hypocrisy for us to accept somebody's money through the front door and then we condemn them through the backdoor. I want the Honourable Member to explain what he means by that. Is he saying that we should sell our souls to whoever makes a donation to our country? If somebody gives us development aid, then we can never disagree with any position that they take? If that is what he is saying, I disagree.

66

HON SHIXWAMENI: Everybody in this House and surely in Namibia has the right to disagree. I said the moral hypocrisy of democracy, whose standards define what is a democratic regime? I hope as a good student from somewhere in New York you will get it properly.

If you give me a chance to answer the question posed by Honourable Ndaitwah, all of us, including those ones who used to be revolutionary, have all condemned imperialism. We used to condemn imperialism as the blood suckers. Was that not the word that was used? The Vice-President of SWAPO used that. I am talking about this blood-sucking imperialism because imperialism has not stopped. The United States has continued to be what it was for the past more than two hundred years. Britain has not stopped; it has continued to be what it was for the past two hundred years or more. All the Western powers have continued to be what they are today, so we cannot come to this House and say sometimes they are good, sometimes they are bad. We must be consistent, persistent and forthright.

I was talking about the Israeli-Palestinian issue and the issue of Palestinian statehood. I must say I join those ones who call for an independent Palestinian State, without any conditions, without any reservations and we must all support that independent Palestinian State, but we must support it without hypocrisy, because right in this country we have accredited the Jewish Ambassador. We attracted the Israelis to come and invest in our most precious natural resources, the diamonds, uranium and all these kinds of things. They use the money they get from Namibia to buy bombs to destroy our Palestinian brothers, the women and children of Palestine. We should be able to act and say we do not need Israeli investment in this country, we do not need the Israeli Ambassador to this country, and they can pack up, take their money and go because we want to stand firmly by the Palestinians. Otherwise it will be nothing else but condoning hypocrisy to allow the Israelis to take money out of this country in the form of profits to go and buy bombs to kill our brothers and sisters in Palestine. (Intervention)

67

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: May I ask a tiny question? Are you aware that Israel is a member of the United Nations? Secondly, in diplomacy there are two ways to kill a cat. You have to engage the enemy in dialogue and that is the only reason why we have established diplomatic relations, to be able to communicate to them that what you are doing is wrong. That is the only way. Secondly, we are going to continue to support the Palestinian people, we have never shied away from expressing ourselves at the various international forums. There are many ways to engage your opponent to achieve the same objective, through dialogue and through other means. That is our position and we do not shy away and we condemn them. At the UN we are known for our position, even to the annoyance of the Israelis who do not like it, but we are a principled Nation and that is why we are condemning the aggressors on the African continent. We have principles, we are not sellouts – today you are like this, tomorrow you are DTA.

HON SHIXWAMENI: I am aware of our position at the United Nations, but I am today challenging our Government, my Government, that we should not allow the Israelis to take money out of this country to buy bombs and bomb the Palestinians. (Interjection)

<u>HON KAURA</u>: It is your Government; it is the SWAPO Party Government.

HON SHIXWAMENI: That is all I am saying and as long as we allow Israeli companies to operate unhindered in this country, take out money from our diamonds, from our uranium, money that they repatriate to Israeli, money that the Israeli State uses to buy bombs to bomb our Palestinian brothers and sister, I am saying that position is wrong. We might be diplomatic, but we must tell Israel straightforward that we shall not longer tolerate these kinds of things. Either they set the Palestinian

people free for us to establish cordial diplomatic relations, but we cannot move on a two-track resolution where we take money from the Israelis and condemn them, but tell them to invest, your money is so good and sweet that you can provide us with the little that you are paying in taxes but go back there and buy bombs and bomb our Palestinian brothers.

HON NAHOLO: I want to ask Comrade Shixwameni a big question; I do not ask small questions. Do you know that when those people take the podium in public, they condemn the so-called imperialists, but when they go to the hotels where they meet their colleagues, they wine and dine with the same people and dance with the same people they condemn in public? This is outrageous, these are masters of hypocrisy. If you ask me who the masters of hypocrisy are, these are the people with the double standards.

<u>HON SHIXWAMENI</u>: I guess that is a statement, I do not need to respond. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: May I ask Honourable Shixwameni a question? Honourable Shixwameni, when you are talking about the diamonds being given to the Israelis, I see Honourable Naholo nodding and at times he does this. He is a member of the RDP; the Secretary-General of the RDP is Honourable Nyamu who used to be the Minister of Mines and Energy. The Israelis did not start with me, it actually started with him. Why was it good when it was Honourable Nyamu doing it, but not when others are doing it?

HON SHIXWAMENI: All I am saying – and I keep on going back to that – is the moral hypocrisy of universal democracy, because democracy must be contextual, time-specific and it must also be embedded in the

culture of a Nation. If we subscribe to the so-called universalistic democracy, then there is one policeman for universalistic democracy and that, unfortunately, remains the United States of America. They are ready to police and enforce that kind of democracy.

We as a Nation should stand out amongst nations and say we want to practise our democracy the way that we as Namibians wish to practise it and that is important. We should not fear the consequences for practising that, but we should be able to stand up for what we believe is truly Namibian and truly African.

That is why I have problems with formal democracy as laid out in our Constitution and practical democracy as practised on the ground. As a Nation we need to live democracy every day in all that we do and say. It is sad that only a few minutes ago we were trying to shoot down a Motion, but it is good, Honourable Deputy Speaker, that in your wisdom you allowed for time for people to reflect on this.

However, speaking about democracy, both Honourable Kaura and the real author of the Constitution, Honourable Hage Geingob yesterday said that democracy is good, we are happy to practise democracy in this country and we are happy to engage one another. I am happy to be a Namibian, but we should not have this nasty belief that everything is there to stay forever, because that is what the leaders in the Arab Maghreb and the leaders in the Middle East, the Sheiks, have come to believe, that they are there to rule. Comrade Tommy Nambahu would say it in Spanish, "El es stado soy yo", the State is me. (Interjection)

HON MEMBER: That was not said in Spanish.

HON SHIXWAMENI: Yes, but I am saying it in Spanish because Spanish is the language that I learned it in. These leaders had believed

that all these years. They might have been our friends, it is true, they were our friends, and many of them were supporting the liberation struggle, but if they did something wrong, we should also be able to stand up and say what you were doing is simply wrong. They say there is nothing wrong to tell a friend that what you are doing is wrong, it basically strengthens and builds that particular friendship. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? I understand your position and I agree with some of the points you are making, but why is it that those who take the State to be them and them to be the State are not being treated equally? If the mere reason for what is happening there is on account of the fact that they have been ruling the way they have been ruling, there are demonstrations in Yemen and in Bahrain, (Interjection)

HON MEMBER: Syria.

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Syria yes, but I am talking about the untouchables, Saudi-Arabia. You cannot touch these countries. The masses are demonstrating day and night in their millions and they are being killed, but why is it only Libya and, to a lesser extent, Syria?

HON SHIXWAMENI: The Honourable Minister of Justice asked a good question and in fact, I provided the answer right from the beginning. I said, and I quote myself, the moral hypocrisy of universal democracy. I hope when you sleep you will reflect on that, because it is exactly that moral hypocrisy of democracy that has brought us to this point of quandary, where people are able to select whom to support and whom to punish and that should not be in the international community. All of us

should reject it and say if we prescribe to the so-called Universalist democracy, then Saudi-Arabia, Bahrain, Syria and Libya should be accorded the same treatment by the international community. We should not be able to speak with a two-forked tongue like a snake, we should be able to demand that *what is good for the goose is good for the gander* and whether it is Syria, whether it is Bahrain, whether it is the other states of Kuwait or whatever, as members who subscribe to the Universal Declaration on Human Rights, we should be able to say the same standard should be applied to everyone.

There is no point in the Bahrain Monarchy being allowed to shoot at unarmed peaceful demonstrators, but when Gaddafi shoots at his people, we apply double standards. That is the point I want to make and I want to say that our position in the APP regarding what is happening in the Arab Maghreb and the Middle East – and this is the position of the National Bureau of our Party – is that of protecting, defending democracy and all human rights of all citizens. No Government in the world, be it a monarchy or a so-called democracy, must abuse State power to deny its citizens their fundamental human rights. No Government, in our view, has the authority to arbitrarily detain peaceful demonstrators or shoot with live ammunition on unarmed peaceful demonstrators and worse so, to fire on its own citizens with bombs, helicopters and jet fighters and any longrange missiles and weapons of mass destruction in urban or rural centres. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Another question: Inasmuch as the APP National Bureau has taken such a resolution, has the same body also considered and analysed the new phenomenon of what is called "armed demonstrators" and what is the position of the APP?

HON SHIXWAMENI: Honourable Minister, to arrive at this resolution we have looked at all the factors. All that we are defending is that each Nation and all citizens must have their human rights respected and we are

ready to defend those human rights come sunshine, come darkness, come rain. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY: May I ask Honourable Shixwameni a question? You said that no Government may take action. Let us say we are out there and while you are just talking peacefully, I just come and attack you, what would you do?

HON SHIXWAMENI: That is a difficult question to answer and I shall not attempt to answer it. We cannot say that the so-called States that are now faced with this crisis have not had formal democracies; they had formal democracies. In fact, when we look at Ben Ali, the former Tunisian President, now called a reject in his society after discovering what has happened, just won the last election in 2008. (Intervention)

HON MWANINGANGE: May I ask Honourable Shixwameni a question in relation to Africa? With the history of NATO, the Northern Atlantic Alliance Aggression Pact is by International Law. The struggle of the liberation of Africa was fought from the sixties to the eighties. Mention Mozambique, Zimbabwe, Angola, Guinea Bissau, Namibia, South Africa, have you ever heard and seen NATO dispatched to defend the lives of African people who were massacred by those colonial occupations who were here, the Portuguese, British, Mr Smith, racist South Africa? Where did you hear about that except now in another territory of Africa where this NATO Alliance there, is the powerful voice in this world? Let me take the story back, if the Warsaw Pact was in existence, then especially the Africans who fought liberation struggles, were supported by those countries who were members of the Warsaw Pact, including the Soviet Union, if they were in existence and we asked them to defend us, who would be right? Is it the one who are supporting

those who are fighting the legitimate country or is it the people who were under colonial occupation?

HON SHIXWAMENI: Well, the Cold War was declared over. That is why we have this ideological bankruptcy that is reigning around here, because if we were debating from a class position, we would not be making these jokes we are making, because it is the lives of ordinary workers, the lives of ordinary women, men and children which are at stake. I think the Honourable Minister said that war is not a picnic. When you invite it and start it, it might end up in mutual destruction.

I want to say and I have to come back to the Motion of Honourable Hamutenya, I did not hear him saying that we want what happened in the Arab Maghreb to automatically apply here. He is academically arguing, you can draw parallels and nobody is stopped from drawing those parallels.

We must stop playing the ostrich dance game. No one and, I believe, Honourable Hamutenya and any Member of this Parliament who swears every day to the pledge that we make in this Parliament, want to bring anarchy and disorganisation to this country. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Honourable Shixwameni, you are talking about democracy, hypocrisy and all these things and my first question is: We were accused here of being hypocrites, dining with the Western countries, but do you know the longest-serving Foreign Minister of Namibia was Hidipo Hamutenya and he was a master diner with many of these countries? Your chief was the master diner, not us.

HON HAMUTENYA: The longest-serving Foreign Minister was Theo-Ben Gurirab.

74

15 June 2011

MOTION ON SITUATION IN NORTH AFRICA AND THE MIDDLE EAST HON SHIXWAMENI

HON SHIXWAMENI: I am saying, let us be analytical of the situations as they unfold and let us make sure that we are able to learn lessons from what is happening there and then introspectively say what it is that we must avoid which these regimes that are in a crisis had done.

Yesterday when I left here I said we were subjected to a lecture on democracy, but when I got home, I got a letter from the Minister of Presidential Affairs. I basically decided that I am not going to respond to it, but I am going to talk to it. The democracy that we preach in this House, I am suddenly requested – I can avail a copy of the letter – for a copy of my speech. I am apparently under investigation and I must provide these answers urgently to State House. I asked myself, since when do leaders of this Nation report to the Minister of Presidential Affairs and why am I suddenly being urgently investigated? (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: How do you link it to the current Debate?

HON SHIXWAMENI: Because the question that was put in the letter is exactly that I have said something regarding the revolution in the Arab Maghreb and I must explain to State House whether that statement is true. If we are saying that we are a democratic Nation, I have my free right to speak and this is nothing else than being tantamount to victimisation. That is what has gone on in African countries and this should stop. I ask it publicly because there are people who are alleged to have been killed in mysterious circumstances, I do not want Lubango to be repeated here and I am not going to provide a response in writing to the Minister of Presidential Affairs. This letter belongs in the dustbin and we must do serious introspection to ensure that people are not intimidated, to make sure that we are free to speak out because we fought for the freedoms and nobody should be intimidated in this country. I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Kazenambo, you have the Floor.

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. December 1997 I was attending a summer school at the University of East Anglia in the United Kingdom. I was doing studies in Global Politics and one of my professors from Scotland told the class that, "I will give the participants in this class less than twenty years, then the Middle East and the Arab world will explode." That was his statement in 1997. When this so-called revolution started, I immediately remembered that class in East Anglia in December 1997 and I said this professor was correct and I did not believe that professor that day, typical of my culture. A few years after Independence, a few years after I emerged from the bush, radical as I am, I took him to task and the experienced professor advanced three thoughts on which he based his analysis. He brought this issue because he was analysing the risk areas be it in terms of social, political or economic security. He plotted the globe into three areas and in those three areas Africa did not feature anywhere and that is what drove me mad because Africa could not feature anywhere. I am bringing this example in drawing lessons, I am interested in the lessons and that is why I stood up to make an intervention.

I asked him why he is saying the Middle East will explode and I will come to that. He plotted the world into three parts. One of the triads included the United States of America, Canada, Britain, France and others and it included Japan in Asia and then it included the emerging economies, the Tigers, Singapore, Taiwan and others. Then out of Asia he took China and plotted it in another plot and then he took the Middle East as a bloc.

Now I will not go to the Western world, I will speak a bit to the Tigers. When I asked him why he omitted Africa and if he could elaborate on the explosion of the Middle East, he again put his analysis in three boxes. He spoke about social cohesion, economic exploitation and dictatorship. That was his analysis. Then, because Africa was not plotted there, he also used

the words "hypocrisy of the West", he was really unfriendly, because professors are professors. He did not spare the West. He said even though in terms of security the West is secure, there are no risk areas in terms of investment, Europe and America will be beset by financial crisis, but because the risk is not linked to politics, he will not plot them into the Middle East, but he said the West is equally guilty when it comes to the Middle East because the sponsor dictatorial regimes dine and wine with unpredictable regimes at the expense of the ordinary citizens. It is from that perspective of social and economic analysis that he could not spare the West.

However, he said the West has built institutions, they can sponsor their corruption, their crisis, operate in a manner that you will not dictate it and because they control institutions and in the United Nations they have corrupted, they can do whatever they please.

Then he said the Middle East is beset with dictatorial regimes. Whether you call them monarchs, whether you call them something else, these regimes share common characters, that one of being dictatorial and autocratic and the West is the sponsor of this situation for their economic interest.

Then he went into Asia, the Tigers, Singapore, Malaysia and Taiwan. He said some of these countries are not democracies, but because of the hypocrisy of the West they do not care about the political democracy in those countries. Why - because these are the cheaper markets. They are the cheaper hubs for the manufacturing of Western goods and they could not care less about what is happening when it comes to the rights of the citizens in those countries, because the regimes there, although dictators, protect the economic interests of the West.

He said here in Britain the situation is not like in the Scandinavian countries of Sweden, Norway and Denmark because they have social cohesion. In the UK the problems of the inner cities, the racism and so on, is hidden, you cannot spot it and in America it is even worse, but it is hidden by institutions that tolerate it and manoeuvre it. Then he said the

situation is not like that in the Middle East. The issue of social cohesion, tribal differences, and religious differences are obvious and pronounced in the Middle East. Therefore, it means we have lost a foundation on which we can rely in maintaining stability because there is no social cohesion, because religious people are so pronounced and you have the extremists.

Then he went into the economic reasons. He said economically only the top class of the society are benefiting. Political connections to the kings and queens are controlling the economy and they are not building the economy. He was saying that the Middle East is one of the primitive, backwards areas of the world, even worse than Africa in terms of development because the oil is developing the West and only a few capitals. Dubai is a shining example, but in reality these people still ride on camels in the bush and the religious and economic oppression is worse. It is not only a question of the Palestinians, which is based on religion and tribe, but even those who are supposed to benefit are oppressed because of dictatorial hypocrisy. There is no freedom of expression, any human rights, etcetera. With all these dynamics put together there is no way you can prevent an explosion and that was one of the lessons.

When I asked why he left out Africa, he said Africa is the hope of the world. At that time Rice was the Secretary of State and after that course I felt like crying when that lady used to talk, because she would refer to their Europeans partners in Asia and France even while they were talking about problems in Africa. It was like we did not exist, but this man gave me hope although he set Africa aside. He said the world is a cycle in global politics. First it was Europe, it went to America and now it is shifting to Asia and the next is Africa and he said the problem that manifested in Africa, the civil wars and so on, we have gone through that cycle. When we would have emerged, we would already have gone through the cycle that would beset the Middle East, provided the Africans will open their eyes and not allow them to be manipulated. That was his statement, provided that Africans will open their eyes.

Sometimes we condemn ourselves but economically Africa and SADC are emerging, there is no doubt about it and we must congratulate ourselves

because we are building institutions, our voice is being heard and the financial crisis came and went, we were spared. When this happened the Rand was nearly manipulated and South Africa had to come in and protect that something be cooked. That was somewhere in the nineties, not in this financial crisis. In the earlier one, the Rand became worthless and South Africa protested. That is recorded in history.

Let me dwell on Africa, the continent that is emerging and the situation in the Middle East and why we are being ordered like kids to either support this or that one. The message is that the crisis is not our crisis, but we must learn from this crisis and assert ourselves. We must learn how the dynamics are unfolding at the global level, both economically, socially and politically because those who are caught up in the crisis will definitely look for a place to fall back on and if we are not awake, we may find ourselves becoming a landing place and we may not be prepared for that.

Therefore, it is for us to wake up and say that the crisis is not our crisis, "Madam America, please, the crisis is not our crisis, deal with your problem, you cannot order us. If you are rearranging your desk, please spare us from it." We have not chopped oil from the Middle East, we are not dining and wining with anybody, we were freedom fighters. Yesterday we had our problem here and I congratulate the founding President of this Republic because when the situation was becoming complex in the DRC and a scenario similar to that one in the Middle East was unfolding. Men with guts and with vision stood their ground at the condemnation of everybody. That was President Nujoma of Namibia, President Dos Santos of Angola, President Mugabe of Zimbabwe who said SADC cannot be a paper tiger, it has to prove itself and protect the citizens of the world and they moved into the DRC. Those were visionary leaders who could see what is behind the curtains. They moved and peace was restored and the lesson is still permeating. (Intervention)

HON SHIXWAMENI: May I ask a question? One is whether he watched the film which was broadcast on the NBC, called "*Murder in*"

79

Kinshasa" and whether he buys the theory that is explained in that film that was screened on our national broadcaster, which basically implicated our own self.

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: Unfortunately I missed that one, but the point still remains, these men and women with guts from southern Africa have sent a strong message. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Comrade Deputy Speaker, Comrade Kazenambo is saying it as it was, as it is and as it will be. The history that you are just rehearsing to some of us who were there is deliberately being hidden. I watched the film that the Honourable Shixwameni is talking about, it tells of the assassination of President Kabila. President Kabila was assassinated long after the intervention. In fact, the three leaders of southern Africa installed Kabila; therefore I do not want anybody to leave this august House believing that that film is implicating our leaders. I watched it but I am saying there are serious efforts to hide what has made the DRC what it is today. We should just take that into consideration. Other faces are now being shown to the world as if they are the ones who rescued the DRC.

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: Since we talk about hypocrisy, something just happened here, that Honourable Shixwameni was talking and he stood up, he took the letter from State House and he tore it up in public for people to see. He tore it up and then he gave a copy to Kaura there. Is that not hypocrisy?

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: In conclusion, a lesson is being learned from the

situation in the Middle East. I am saying Africa should remain vigilant and to the Honourable Madam Hilary Clinton, Africa is not going to be kicked. Africa is vigilant and Africa is learning lessons and will follow the trend set by President Nujoma, President Dos Santos and President Mugabe, because what is happening is the that Middle East is being tested. Should Presidents Nujoma, Mugabe and Dos Santos not have taken that step to protect the DRC, I am telling you this southern Africa was going to be in chaos because at they would have moved into Zimbabwe. They have already started with Egypt and the next place was going to be Namibia and the next place was going to be South Africa and the crime was going to be economic interest because of dire need of seeking land. (Interjection)

HON MEMBER: That is your imagination.

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: Imagination - those who made these telephones are people with imagination, those who do not have imagination, are crying at the Courts after they lost elections because they lack imagination to strategise. Imaginations are the fathers and mothers of ideas.

We must remain vigilant, protect our interest, our economic and social interests and we must build institutions of democracy, institutions that promote human rights. (Interjection)

HON MEMBER: You were concluding.

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: You are hurting because I am hitting at the belly of

the hypocritical (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can you now conclude, Honourable Minister?

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: The conclusion is that let us promote social cohesion as the situation there lacks social cohesion in building our society. Let us build strong a foundation of economic development, of political stability, peace and security and this will be based on fundamental human rights. I rest my case.

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Allow me to postpone the discussion of this Motion until tomorrow.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The discussion of this Motion is adjourned until tomorrow, 14:30. The House is adjourned until tomorrow 14:30.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:45 UNTIL 2011.06.16 AT 14:30

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS WINDHOEK 16 JUNE 2011

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Members, I are reminded of the invitation by the President of the Republic of Namibia and the First Lady on Friday, 10:00, but we are requested to be there by 09:00 and kindly bring along your invitation cards and your spouse, where

applicable.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any Petitions? Reports of Standing Committees? Honourable !Nawases-Taeyele.

TABLING: REPORT OF STANDING COMMITTEE ON ACCESSIBILITY TO LEGAL AND JUSTICE SYSTEM

HON !NAWASES-TAEYELE: I lay upon the Table for consideration by this august House, the Report of the Standing Committee on Constitutional and Legal Affairs on the Regional Consultations on the Accessibility to the Legal and Justice System in Namibia. The consultations were conducted in Caprivi, Kavango, and Otjozondjupa Regions from the 28th of July to the 13th of August 2010.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please table the Report. Any other Reports of Standing Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Notice of Questions? Notice of Motions? Ministerial Statements.

16 June 2011 RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS BY HON MOONGO RT HON N ANGULA

Question 16 was put by Honourable Moongo of the DTA to the Prime Minister. Does Honourable Moongo put the Question?

RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS

QUESTION 16:

HON MOONGO: I put the Question.

.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. I would like to thank Honourable Moongo for his question and I would like to remind him, as perhaps his memory is failing him, that in 2008 this very Parliament he has been sitting in for a number of years, passed an Act called the Veterans Act (Act 2 of 2008). He was here when that Act was passed. That Act defines a veteran and the definition of a veteran is as follows: "A veteran means a person who: (a) was a member of the liberation forces; (b) consistently and persistently participated or engaged in any political, diplomatic or underground activity in furtherance of the liberation struggle; (c) owing to his or her participation in the liberation struggle was convicted, whether in Namibia or elsewhere, of any offence closely connected to the struggle and sentenced to imprisonment." That does not include a person who during the war deserted the liberation struggle, unless that person subsequently rejoined the struggle.

The liberation struggle is defined as follows: "Liberation struggle means the political, diplomatic, military or underground struggle waged against colonialism, racism and apartheid, which struggle was waged in Namibia and other countries and resulted in the attainment of the Independence of Namibia on the 21st of March 1990."

16 June 2011 RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS BY HON MOONGO RT HON N ANGULA

Honourable Moongo knows very well that SWATF cannot fit in this definition. Thank you.

HON MOONGO: Thank you very much for the answer, but it is not complete because I wanted to know what prompted the Cabinet to decide to accept the money from South Africa which was meant for SWATF and now they are discriminating against those who served in SWATF. What prompted Cabinet to make that decision?

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Cabinet does receive gifts from foreign organisations. When the President declared a State of Emergency, many Governments volunteered to donate. I suppose the money you are referring to was a donation from South Africa. Recently South Africa donated one million and it was accepted. Therefore, it is the prerogative of the Government to accept or not to accept a donation. I have no other way of explaining. The donation was accepted.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

MOTION ON REVOLUTIONARY UPRISING IN ARAB MAGHREB AND MIDDLE EAST

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When this Debate was adjourned yesterday, the 15th of June 2011, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Hidipo Hamutenya. The Honourable Minister of Safety and Security adjourned the Debate and he now has the Floor.

85

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Thank you Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members of the National Assembly. The Motion in front of us is the recent revolutionary uprising in the Maghreb and Middle East. It appears what is happening in the Middle East has many names, many descriptions. Some are even calling it the Arab Spring and in my view, only a person born in the upper northern hemisphere will come up with such a description. "Spring" means coming out of the winter, a dark, deep and cold winter. The Western countries consider that the Arab world has been frozen in time and that is why they are calling this a spring. They do not understand that the Middle East in most parts is made up of a sandy desert and sometimes a very windy desert and what is happening now is a hot spring full of sand in everybody's faces.

Some Colleagues think we now have a chance for what is happening there to happen here, so that we can move into power. Let me tell you one thing, what happened in Tunisia is that the first highest running person to lose his job was the Minister for Interior and I am sure some other Ministers and Members of Parliament are now happy, the hated Minister responsible for Police is gone, we can now save our necks. What followed was that not only the Minister of Interior left the Government and country, the President followed, the Cabinet followed and I do not think Parliament is now sitting in Tunisia. Anyone of us wishing that something must now happen so that we can easily get into power is making a terrible mistake of the first order.

Just imagine if there are floods in the north of Namibia and those who live to the south of Oshakati are saying, "Now those fools north of Oshakati are going to suffer because the floods are coming." My good friend, by the time the water reaches south of Oshakati, it is not only water but it is full of all the dirt from Oshakati. Therefore, those Members of Parliament who think that they want the people in Cabinet to mess up, is like somebody who is in a train, those in the first class and others in the second class and when the engine has an accident, they are all stranded.

A revolution is like a flood, no revolution has ever gone to pick up the discarded politicians to be their leaders, none. In Egypt the former Foreign Minister of Mubarak, now the Secretary-General of the Arab League, Amr Moussa, thought now is his time to come back. The man who was responsible for International Atomic Energy Agency also thought now is the time to go back home and become the President. What happened? The revolution will produce its own leaders.

Some of you are in the winters of your lives, how do you expect to be leaders of a revolution created by itself and how do you think that you can now create a revolution at your age? That is not possible.

A lot of things have been said and yesterday somebody even spoke about democracy and its contradictions, somebody who in twenty years was able to belong to three Parties. It is true that democracy, like culture, like anything else is interpreted by people in their own way. Democracy and the system of governance in Canada is not the same as in the US and neither is the US the same as Brazil, nor is Brazil the same as South Africa. Everyone has to accept the conditions prevailing in their own country. For the English the Kings and the Queens are acceptable, for an American that is totally out of the question, but everyone is preaching democracy.

Somebody on the other side stood up and said all these people are wining and dining. You are accusing that 75% of your Parliament goes around wining and dining with foreigners and there is no food in your country. We have already forgotten the solidarity we had, if there is a national day of Cuba and I am going to wherever it is taking place, I am not going there because of food and drinks, but in the name of solidarity of the Cuban people that helped us to liberate our country.

I remember in the late sixties, early seventies it was the first time that people could bottle water. Bottled water was very expensive those days and some of the revolutionaries used to laugh, "These West African French-speaking people drink bottled water." Now you can go into any supermarket in Windhoek, Oshakati or Otjiwarongo and buy bottled

water. Bottled water is no longer strange, it is a question of development, it is a question of technology, and it is a question of science. You can bottle your own water from your borehole, but now people are saying you are dining and wining.

Is there a difference in salaries between ordinary Members of Parliament that belong to different Parties? How can one Member of Parliament accuse others of having more money and dining and wining with foreigners? What type of statement is that?

I want to say that we in the SWAPO Party are not here because we are scared of any change; we are the ones who brought change in this country. We brought Independence, we brought the Constitution, we brought elections and jointly we can share that. You can also claim that, but nobody can say that every morning we wake up we are scared of change, but that change must be constitutional, that change must be agreed to by the majority of the people of this country. That is democracy. For people to say somehow we must now go and learn from what is happening in the Middle East, we have been students of current events all our lives. Some of you are even students of Political Science in schools, in life and everywhere. Now you are saying we should go to Tunisia to learn something. Lessons in Political Science are many. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: May I ask a question? Do you know that some students of Political Science concentrated too much on studying Machiavelli and for that reason they were not even able to complete their PhDs.

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: My dear brother, I know that some of my senior students of Political Science there are asking, "What are you saying Mbumba, if you were talking about mathematics or something we will understand you, but we do not care, we know you never studied these things." (Intervention)

88

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY: I just want to ask my senior a small question.

Comrade Deputy Secretary-General of the SWAPO Party, are you aware that some of the students of Political Science you are referring to have been trotting the world attending workshops?

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Let me first answer the question by the Right Honourable Prime Minister. The issue here is that many African students of Political Science only read the autobiographies of great men and women. If you ask them about Nkrumah, they will know, Jomo Kenyatta they will know, Emperor Haile Selassi they know, but they never studied the conditions prevailing that produce a revolution or make a revolutionary. What they are aiming at is only one position, that of being the president of a country. Whether they will fail does not matter to them, as long as they are the ones who are the president. That is why they can never fit into a particular organisation, they split and split and split, because their aim is not the people, is not their Nation but they themselves and if the only way you can make a name is by being a president, you can be a president one day and your history will even be worse than it is now.

One of the other, hopefully, better students of Political Science talked about monkey-see, monkey-do. I must say that monkeys will always do what they can see, but no monkey will ever lead a revolution – never. One has to be made of better stuff and better material and be fully committed to give up your life in order to succeed, not only because you can see and do as another monkey. (Intervention)

HON KAURA: May I ask the Honourable Minister a question? Honourable Minister, if a monkey cannot lead a revolution, why do we talk of guerrilla warfare? (Laughter).

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Honourable Kaura, it is quite possible that you are a better student of Political Science than others. Yes, guerrilla warfare is not carried out by gorillas, but by human guerrilla fighters.

We also know for sure that when you are climbing a ladder behind others, it is always easy to see the mistakes of those who are higher up, to the extent that people will always advise you that when you are climbing a ladder, do not look up, watch where you are stepping. Some people become so interested in the torn shoes and clothing of other people, that they forget below them are also people who are looking at their torn clothes. That is the issue of history. That is the issue of revolutions.

Somebody also once said that a piglet looked at an adult pig and asked, "Why is your snout so long?" The wise pig said, "Just wait, by the time you reach my age your snout will be as long." (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF EDUCATION: May I ask a question? Comrade Minister is it true that a revolution cannot be imported, nor be exported, but that it is a spontaneous process. If that is true, why are Members of this august House trying to say that we must learn from a revolution in Libya and Egypt?

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Comrade Deputy Minister of Education, I have already indicated clearly that we are in the politics of getting into positions and we ignore the conditions. We even forget that twenty-one years ago we gained our Independence. When we were fighting in Southern Africa as a whole, I do not think there were people in the Middle East who said, "let us look at people in Southern Africa fighting against apartheid colonialism, let us imitate them and create a fight against apartheid." There was no apartheid to be fought there.

Whatever we are trying to do, we must truly look at the conditions of our people, the history of our country, the stage of development where we are and see what we can do for our people, not what we can do for ourselves.

It is true, change is the only permanent thing, things will always change, but it cannot be created simply because somebody wants a position, somebody is dying to be a president. History will prove that it is not what we want; history will prove that it is not what we would like to engineer. We live in Southern Africa, for the first time Southern Africa is much calmer than some other parts of the world. There was a time when to be in West Africa was to be where peace was because they gained their independence much earlier. East Africa was peaceful, but for the first time in a long, long time we can say we live in a good neighbourhood.

There was a time in Latin America where one colonel was overthrowing another colonel every second year in the name of the revolution. Now here we have one Member of one Party, thinking that they can overthrow the Member of the other Party in the name of democracy. Go to the people, present your programmes, get elected and lead the people. That is what we did. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: On a Point of Order, I just want to ask a question. You are really doing very well, telling those who want power by all means to listen and to know that power does not come through machinations. Comrade Mbumba, yesterday I was watching television and I saw the people in Greece being beaten and teargassed by the Police. There have been so many demonstrations in Europe, people being beaten and even students were beaten terribly in London. Why is it that when people are demonstrating in those capitals, the Police are sent in to quell those demonstrations, but when in other countries you send in your Police and the demonstrators are beaten, and the demonstrators turn to weapons and start burning Police Stations and Government buildings, what should the State do? Should it keep quiet and say in the name of protection of civilians it must not do anything? If the civilians have resorted to arms, what should the State do?

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Yes, that is the million dollar question. The Police are the instrument of the State and their responsibility is to protect the lives and property of the citizens and anybody else who may find himself within the borders of that country.

Things naturally do happen and sometimes the blame is put on the Police, but if we look among ourselves as political leaders, as people with ambition to lead our countries, the way we behave leads to those conditions that the Police Officers will end up doing certain things on our instructions and, of course, anyone would think that only the Minister of Interior will be forced to retreat and leave Government. Everybody may end up leaving Parliament too.

If you look at the Mediterranean Sea, you know where Tunisia, Libya, Egypt, Israel, Turkey are and then you come to Greece. The Greeks are the parents of democracy; they even coined the word democracy. When people talk about democracy, they think democratic people must just be passive people. You also have to struggle for democracy and that is why some people do not know the difference between those who fought for Independence and those who fought against Independence; those who compromised and those who did not waver.

The issue is how we organise ourselves economically, socially, educationally, health-wise, how we defend our environment. This will determine whether we will have peace or friction. (Intervention)

HON MAAMBERUA: May I ask the Honourable Minister a small question? Honourable Minister, since we are talking about the situation in the Arab world in general and also since we are aware of what NATO is doing in Libya, do you agree with me that what they are doing cannot be condoned and therefore Africa must mobilise resources and forces to stop it?

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: I agree with you that what is happening in Libya is the total destruction of all the development that has been taking place in Libya for the past thirty years.

It is being totally destroyed. Libya is being bombed to the Stone Age. There is no doubt about that, everybody is seeing that.

About the second part of your question, whether the solution is the mobilisation and raising of funds to go and fight in Libya, I have to think twice about that because the people who are bombing in the name of defending a certain portion of the citizens, went there on the basis that they have a mandate of the United Nations. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I would like to ask the Honourable Minister a question. Honourable Minister, Libya is being bombed by NATO. Do you think it is possible for NATO to be taken to the International Court of Justice? If so, is it the right time for us to do so and will they not be found guilty if they are taken there?

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Honourable Minister of Education, as to whether they will be found guilty, that is for the Judges to decide, but it is not a question of taking NATO to the International Court of Justice or the International Criminal Court, NATO is an organisation, they have their own command structure. We should trace the command structure of NATO to its highest level, because orders are not given by soldiers, orders are given to commanders and the bigger the commanders, the more responsibility. Those who gave NATO the mandate, the power and the weapons to bomb Libya must be the ones to answer, not the ordinary soldiers.

I already said history is history. Conniving for a position is a different thing. We must not only look at what is happening right now. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY:

Comrade Minister, being the Deputy Secretary-General of SWAPO Party, you are talking about some other people who want power and become president. Being the Deputy Secretary-General of SWAPO Party who knows the political situation in Namibia and what is happening here very well and what the Government of SWAPO Party is doing in Namibia, are you perhaps convinced that those who want power can take power by 2015?

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: The answer is very easy. When His Excellency Hifikepunye Pohamba was answering questions here in Parliament, he gave one Party fifty years, if ever; another one a hundred years, if ever. Do not talk about 2015. That is tomorrow.

All of us must keep what we have now, must maintain what we have now, must cherish what we have now – democracy and Independence. (Intervention)

HON NYAMU: May I ask the Honourable Minister a question? Honourable Minister, you have set the stage for a very serious Debate. On several occasions in your contribution you have suggested that anybody who is involved in politics is looking for presidency or to be a Head of State of a Nation. If this argument were scientific, would you agree that many of your own Colleagues there who joined the struggle even before you, as I did, did so because they wanted to be president, one of them your Vice-President there. Did he join SWAPO because he wanted to be president or does it only apply to other Parties and not to SWAPO?

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Honourable Jesaya Nyamu is my elder brother and elder schoolmate and he said I have set the stage for Debate, so let us debate. I remember when we were in high school at Oshigambo in the sixties when my senior brother gave me advice which I have adhered to and I am sure he does not even remember that anymore. We used to talk politics even then at Oshigambo. We also had a friend, his name was Kennedy and Comrade Nyamu was Khrushchev. Do you remember that? Kennedy was Benjamin Shipanga and Jesaya Nyamu was Khrushchev. He was always the most militant man we ever had in the class, physically and otherwise. However, he gave me one piece of advice and he said: "Mbumba, whatever happens when we gain Independence, please, you should never be a Foreign Minister" and the reason why I should not be Foreign Minister is that I am not black enough. Nyamu thought being a Foreign minister is to be big and strong and dark, so that when you sit together with other Foreign Ministers, you frighten them. Honourable Nyamu never thought he would meet the lion, Theo-Ben Gurirab, and lost his job to him forever.

The other day he asked Comrade Nujoma a question and Comrade Utoni Nujoma said, "Nyamu, you are always scared of me." Now I have stuck to education, you have stuck to your Khrushchev style of politics and I am sure the only reason why you now want to deny that you want to be president is because you cannot be president. It is not because you do not want it.

In conclusion, Comrade Deputy Speaker, let us truly cherish what we have, a large country with a small population, with natural resources, with an environment where you can breathe and jump and do things and be healthy. Let us not talk about these cheap things of wining and dining. I can eat better food in *kapana* than I can eat in an Ambassador's house. Here we have meat, we have water and as long as Sven Thieme is there, he will continue to produce the beer and *omahere*. Those are better food that made us to be strong and to be true Africans, not to imitate people from other places.

Comrade Deputy Speaker, if our aim is to serve the country, we can serve

our Nation in whatever position our people put us and not always fight for things that we cannot reach. This spring of the Arabs is not a spring; this is a hot summer for the Arab world. This is a terrible time when young people are risking their lives and some people think that is good and some people are taking positions this way or that way, favouring some countries, destroying others, just wanting the oil and they do not care about others. Really, no country should be destroyed on the basis that its leaders are too stubborn to obey instructions from abroad. I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Kawana.

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND ATTORNEY-GENERAL: I rise to join my senior Colleagues who contributed to this Motion. As I do not know the basis of this Motion, I have observed a bandage on the right hand of Honourable Von Wietersheim with keen interest and I do not know whether there was infighting within the RDP. (Intervention)

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:40 HOUSE RESUMED AT 16:15 PURSUANT TO ADJOURNMENT

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND ATTORNEY-GENERAL: Thank you very much, Honourable Deputy Speaker. I read the Motion of Honourable Hidipo Hamutenya, the President of the RDP with keen interest. We are represented by nine Political Parties in this House, five of which have the word "democracy" in their names – RDP, DTA, UDF, NUDO, CoD. Only four do not have the word "democracy" in their names. Democracy means that the

majority of the people must decide. The majority decision must be respected. Now we are requested by the President of the RDP to interrogate what is going on in the Arab world and to draw lessons from that.

The answer is very, very simple: Honourable Members, if you recall the economic downturn – as economists like to term it while others would like to say economic mismanagement – started in the United States of America. You even heard our Right Honourable Prime Minister and other Colleagues in this Parliament, some from the Opposition Parties, blaming the United States of America for this economic recession. It has spread and affected the world, including the Arab world. People became poor, became hungry, had no food and they had to resort to riots. Who is to blame? I leave that to the RDP to answer. Who messed up the world economy? I leave that to the RDP to answer.

However, for us it is the other way around, we cannot learn from what is happening in the Arab world. Wherever there is an injustice, people will not accept an injustice. The Namibian history is an example. We resisted colonialism, starting from the Witboois, the Mahareros, the Mandume Ndemufayos, Ipumbu Ya Shilongos, Nehale lya Npinganas and many others, followed by the Nujomas, the Toivos, Pohambas and many other leaders.

Maybe those people learned from us instead of the other way around because we resisted injustice. That is the answer, the Arab world learned from Southern African experience where most of these countries said no to injustice, no to colonialism, no to exploitation, no to slavery. A number of these countries took up arms to free themselves from the yoke of slavery and colonialism and the Arab world followed in our footsteps.

However, I want to say one thing to those who have been wishing throughout their lives to become presidents – and there is nothing wrong with that – that as democrats we should recognise that there is only one position at any given time. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: May I asked a question? Comrade Doctor, one Honourable Member who wrote the notes asked who wants the presidency, but are you aware that one Honourable Member, a president from the Party of the Honourable Member who wrote the notes, was quoted as saying, "for the past forty years my eyes were fixed on that position and now it is time." Are you aware of that?

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND ATTORNEY-GENERAL: Thank you very much, Honourable Kazenambo. Indeed, I am aware of that. For your information, that

information came from Africa Confidential and if I am not mistaken, that was in 2004. It was again reprinted in the *New Era* in 2004 and the title in the article was, "*Hamutenya Leads the Pack*." (Intervention)

HON NYAMU: May I ask a question? Since you have been pointing fingers at one or several of us for wanting the power of the President, you are drawing a picture of what happened to some of the SWAPO leaders, particularly one of them who was a representative in Europe and one of the British newspapers wrote that he was likely to be the first President of Namibia. You know what happened; SWAPO kicked him out of his position. Therefore, it is a SWAPO habit to target people, not only outside SWAPO but even within SWAPO itself. Therefore, some of you who are making these statements may find yourselves also targeted for wanting to be presidents. Be careful.

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND ATTORNEY-GENERAL: Thank you, Honourable Secretary-General of the RDP. Indeed, I am very concerned because I heard that everyone

within the ranks of the RDP would like to be president. I do not know where the Secretary-General of the RDP got that notion that everybody wants to be president, and if that is the case within the RDP, I give the RDP two minutes and after that it will disintegrate because there will be chaos in the RDP.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, I was saying and I repeat there is nothing wrong for any citizen of this country to aspire for the most senior office of this land. The Constitution of the Republic of Namibia guarantees any aspiring citizen to be president, provided of course you meet the conditions as set out in the Constitution. However, where I have a problem with some of our Colleagues is that I must reach that position by whatever means. Whoever is aspiring to be the President of this Republic must do so within the letter and spirit of the laws of our Republic. Anything outside the laws of our Republic will be rejected with the contempt it deserves. That is number one.

Secondly, I said in this House that there are five Political Parties whose names contain the word "democratic". (Intervention)

<u>HON DINGARA</u>: May I ask the Attorney-General a question? Since you are on the topic of democracy, when the problems in Libya started, we have heard those who claim to be leaders of democracy saying, "We ignore the world" and they jumped in. Just before yesterday they stood up and now called Africa, Africa. Is Africa not at a lower level than them, because now Gaddafi has defeated them? What is the relationship between that democracy that Madam Clinton was saying Africa must come in and the democracy of these five that you are referring to? Can you give us a comparable analysis on that one?

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND ATTORNEY-GENERAL: Thank you, Honourable Dingara. Maybe I

will answer your question in this context: Any citizen who calls himself or herself a democrat must comply with the underlying principle that the legitimacy of a political power should be anchored through the ballot box, through free, fair, transparent and democratic elections. Anything beyond this amounts to dictatorship. (Interjection)

HON MEMBER: Not rigged!

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND ATTORNEY-GENERAL: Whoever goes through this parameter will be accepted as a legitimate president of this Republic and the people will accept the legitimacy. Rigging or no rigging, that is a question that has to be determined by somebody else and we have institutions which must determine that, not Kawana.

That is why I am saying, whenever there are uprisings in any country, we need to learn a lesson. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: I just want to ask a small question. Honourable Dr Kawana, are you aware that since the inception of some Political Parties they have not held any congresses? They elect themselves through what they call Central Committee meetings, yet they are claiming to be the biggest democrats. They never held a congress where their legitimate Party Members could come and elect their legitimate representatives through free and fair elections, through the ballot box. One the other side of the aisle there, there is no one who can claim to have had a legitimate congress, they elect themselves. It is a false democracy, yet you come here and talk too much. You are the ones who are not democrats. Ask the DTA, they know they elect themselves.

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND ATTORNEY-GENERAL: Honourable Nujoma, I might differ slightly with you on this point, slightly in the sense that I detest a non-SWAPO Member to dictate what should happen within SWAPO and equally I do not want to interfere in the internal affairs of Political Parties. That is the principle I have taken. Non-SWAPO Members must take their hands off SWAPO. They were even criticising why SWAPO is saying no Debate, the succession was to be open. To whom? Even the non-members of SWAPO when it is a Party issue? No, that is the principle I take.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, we must also learn from history, not from the Arab world. Sometimes you may say you want democracy, you perceive a certain Government as being autocratic, as I heard some of those terminologies. What is happening in Somalia today after Siad Barre was kicked out of power? No Government, no country, the masses are the victims of that system. We should be aware of that. What happened in Liberia during the chaotic years? (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: May I ask the Honourable Dr Kawana a small question? Dr Kawana has mentioned something very historically interesting particularly for Africa and I do not want him to leave that point before he expands a little bit on what happened to Somalia. Many of the people listening to us out there, particularly the youth, may not know because it is nearly more than twenty years ago that Somalia was a country, but something happened. Can Dr Kawana just capture in two minutes what happened that there is no Somalia today, just as a lesson?

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND ATTORNEY-GENERAL: Thank you, Secretary-General. Indeed, this is really the lesson that the RDP must learn, not from the Arab world that are following our footsteps of resisting injustice. In Somalia there was a Government led by Siad Barre. They said Siad Barre is a dictator, they

kicked him out. The country disintegrated, the north declared their own Republic, within the south there were a number of warlords and today Somalia is ungovernable. The victims today are the youth, women and children who are dying on a daily basis. Those who were instigating it are somewhere outside Somalia because they were able to buy air tickets and fly out.

In Liberia we saw on television people eating raw human liver because of the vacuum of leadership. A vacuum of leadership is the most dangerous thing in a country, which the RDP wants to advocate here in Southern Africa as per their Motion here. You saw what happened in Liberia. People were eating raw human liver until the situation was stabilised through the ballot box. It is only through democracy that people will survive. What happened to those who instigated? They were able to buy air tickets and run away and they left those poor souls to die on a daily basis.

Did you see what happened in Sierra Leone? Babies' arms were cut off and that is the danger of the vacuum of leadership, the danger of instigating so-called revolution at the expense of democracy and elections.

I applaud the Namibian leadership who, through the United Nations, stabilised Liberia through the ballot box. Today Liberia is peaceful. The lesson is that people must follow democratic principles and democratic procedures. The legitimacy of any Government or any leader must be anchored in democratic elections. That is the bottom-line. If that chaos comes here most of the leaders will run away with air tickets. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: Honourable Member, are you aware that the very situation that you are describing happened recently? One leader who instigated a group in Outapi ran away and he was hiding.

102

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND ATTORNEY-GENERAL: Honourable Deputy Speaker, in the history of revolutions all instigators ran away. That is the habit of instigators and they leave the masses to their own devices. This is a problem and this is what the RDP wants to bring to Namibia. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: May I ask Honourable Kawana a question? Comrade Kawana, do you know the politics of convoy? They are attempting to do that, hoping that when they go to your place in a convoy, the masses in that area will chase them. It is exactly what they are trying to advocate here.

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND ATTORNEY-GENERAL: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I was amazed during the 2009 elections that the RDP decided to hold a rally in Keetmanshoop and the results were not very encouraging. The Mover of the Motion must learn from Keetmanshoop instead of the Arab world. As we understand, the leader was so ashamed to go and address the microphones as opposed to people, so he instructed the Secretary-General of the RDP to go and address the microphones. I do not know whether he complied or not, but you can see that instigators are never at the forefront. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: You are doing well, but I have a question. When it comes to the stateless countries, are you aware that as we are speaking now, the most lucrative business in those countries where there is chaos is actually security companies. When people are talking about the post-Gaddafi era, they are actually organising their own retired military personnel to form companies so that once the army is destroyed in this country, the problem now becomes your problem. It is no more their problem, it is internal. You have to take care of the internal problems. While we now have companies to guard our oil installations

and our embassies and exploitation of resources and it is now domestic, we have our own security companies that are taking care of the oil terminals and all those other things. Are you aware that this is taking place? Somalia is now the dumping ground of toxic waste from the West and this is the lesson we have to learn from these countries.

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND ATTORNEY-GENERAL: Comrade Deputy Minister, I am aware of that.

In conclusion I say to the masses of Namibia, to the youth of Namibia, never be instigated by those who, when tomorrow there is chaos in this country, will be interviewed in the comfort zones in New York, London and Paris,. They must learn from what happened in Caprivi. Those who instigated those poor masses to rise up against a democratically elected Government are today being interviewed in Copenhagen. This is the lesson that the youth of Namibia must learn, the masses and the Nation of Namibia must learn. Instigators will always run away and leave you in limbo to suffer. Namibia is a peaceful, democratic, secure country which is the envy of most countries in the world. Let us leave it that way. Let us live within the letter and spirit of our democratic culture. Whoever wins elections must be congratulated and that Party will have legitimacy. A vacuum is not a solution, it is a recipe for disaster, it is a recipe to return to the Stone Age and we should not allow that in our country. Amen.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Moongo.

HON MOONGO: Thank you very much, Honourable Deputy Speaker, I will make a brief intervention in support of our Colleague's Motion. We have much to learn from the crisis in the Arab world.

First, we have to investigate ourselves. As I know, SWAPO started with a marriage to UNITA and they divorced and then they married the MPLA, they married Abacha, they married Kabila and all other African dictators. We have a lot to learn from that. Dictators will never survive in this war to pave the way for true democracy. That is why we have to warn and investigate ourselves. I see the people are enjoying the problem of Outapi. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND ATTORNEY- GENERAL: I am sorry to interrupt the senior Member of Parliament and the Vice-President of the DTA, but may I ask him a question? We hear from the youth of the Party that they are tired of the current leadership and they want change. Can you confirm or deny that?

<u>HON MOONGO</u>: I will come to that, no problem. It is their right to say what they feel and that is why we do not panic as you did when Honourable Hidipo wanted to stand for the presidency.

Therefore, this is a good warning to us and we do not want a Party to have double standards. Today you are married to Abacha, the other day with Kabila and today they are saluting Gaddafi. Gaddafi ruled for forty years and it is time that he steps down so that democracy can flourish. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: May I ask Honourable Moongo a question? Honourable Moongo, it is really unfortunate and pathetic that twenty years after Independence you cannot distinguish between right and wrong, because you were a supporter of the apartheid system and you know very well that apartheid was declared a crime against humanity by the international community. The United Nations and SWAPO was fighting to eliminate the system of apartheid which has humiliated Africans, oppressed Africans, exploited them and up to today

you are supporting that system. It is really shameful to say the least. Why are you supporting the forces of evil?

HON MOONGO: This is a good college to teach SWAPO, to understand double standards. You have supported these dictators and up to today you are supporting Gaddafi. Dictatorship has no place in Africa. We want true democracy. That is why I warn SWAPO to behave well. We need a true democracy. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Honourable Headman, may I ask a question? The institution you represent, called Traditional Leadership, is it democratic?

HON MOONGO: The law is based on natural order. Give what belongs to the Kings and give what belongs to the masses and the King has to stay there until God gives him time to rest and not be removed undemocratically. The youth of the DTA are not supposed to do those things. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: I know he is talking about this concept of divine right to rule. The divine right to rule was rejected a long time ago by the American Revolution. Talking about Kings, do you know that Gaddafi is the King of the Kings of Africa?

<u>HON MOONGO</u>: Many things were said on this Motion, but what we want now is good suggestions as to what should be done from now. What proposal can we give as a democratic House? (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: On a Point of Information, I just want us to clearly follow what the Honourable Member wants to convey to the House. A few minutes ago, you said that the DTA youth have the right to say what they are saying, you are not afraid. A second ago, you said DTA youth are not supposed to have done that. Which is which?

HON MOONGO: We educated them to respect the Constitution of the Party and to know the structure and the terms of office. The majority of them know that and it is not like SWAPO Members only saluting one leader, one Party, one Africa, one Gaddafi. That is too much! (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable Moongo, the youth of your Party whom you have trained very well to understand your Constitution, can you tell us how many they are?

<u>HON MOONGO</u>: Since we are dealing with a serious issue concerning the lives of the Libyan people, I want us to come with good suggestions to rescue the lives of the Libyan people and not petty politics. Let us find a solution. As a democratic House, we must make suggestions to the SADC countries. (Intervention)

<u>HON NAHOLO</u>: May I ask my Comrade here a question? During the liberation struggle of Africa the message was very clear and that message was that the winds of change are sweeping across the African continent

from Cairo to Cape Town. Now that the upheavals are also coming from that side of the African continent, is history not maybe repeating itself?

•

HON MOONGO: Thank you for reminding me of the good slogans. Some of us were singing about Kaunda that time and we did not know much about one-party or participatory democracy, etcetera. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: On a Point of Correction. The statement quoted by the Honourable Member from the RDP was said by British Prime Minister McMillan in South Africa, not by Africans, conceding that the wind of change for liberty and freedom is sweeping across the African continent. What you are saying is plagiarism, the African people do not plagiarise.

HON MOONGO: I am proposing that we come up with something to save the lives of the Libyan people. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: On a Point of Information. Honourable Moongo, are you aware of the AU Africa Road Map on Libya? If you are not aware, go and Google the AU Africa Road Map on Libya and the position of Africa is clearly articulated there.

HON MOONGO: You keep on talking here while the blood of the Libyan people is shed. If we want to do something good, we must come up with a resolution and express sympathy with the lives lost and bloodshed by the Libyan people and try to come up with something to prevent further war and to let the NATO forces withdraw. Let us create a body which can supervise elections, whether from SADC or from the Arab bloc, because the UN already took their positions. What proposal can we make here not to allow the war to continue? With this I support

my Colleague, I think it is a good Motion. Let us come up with something to prevent further bloodshed in Libya.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The next is Professor Katjavivi.

HON PROF KATJAVIVI: Thank you very much, Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, I rise to make a brief intervention on this Motion. A great deal has already been covered by those who spoke before me, however permit me, Honourable Deputy Speaker, to add my voice to this Debate.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, as you will recall, some of us from this country who recently attended the Fourth Ordinary Session of the Pan-African Parliament at its Headquarters in South Africa participated in a similar Debate at that Parliament. Of course, our approach was slightly different from the Motion before this House. The Debate at the Pan-African Parliament focused on a detailed report that was presented by the Honourable Khumalo, the Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Cooperation, International Relations and Conflict Resolution on Peace and Security Situation in Africa.

Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, many of us, including the Deputy Speaker of our National Assembly, actively participated in that Debate. We were explicit in drawing a distinction between the events in Tunisia and Egypt, on the one hand, and the situation in Libya, on the other hand. Some of us could not but note the fact that the rebellion in Libya is actively being assisted by foreign forces in order to facilitate a regime change. It is possible that the initial uprising might have been prompted by genuine issues of concern to ordinary Libyan citizens; however it is becoming obvious to everybody that foreign interest has now taken over the situation in Libya. Therefore, there is an understandable deep concern over the developments that are now taking place in that country.

Questions have been asked regarding the role of our continental organisation in this particular crisis. References have been made to the United Nations Resolution 1973 that authorises the no-fly zone over Libya. It is clear from most of the accounts that were presented to us at the Pan-African Parliament and it is clear that the said Resolution represents a step backwards with regard to the whole idea of freeing the African continent from foreign interference. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: On a Point of Order, I am very sorry to interrupt my Comrade, but he has reached a point where I have been waiting for an opportunity to find out whether what had happened can be reversed. Resolution 1973 authorised a no-fly zone and from what we learned through the media is that some of those countries which supported this Resolution did not anticipate the level at which this Resolution would be implemented. Now that we all know that the Resolution has been hijacked, is it too late, is it too early, is it impossible for countries to negotiate through the AU with other Security Council Members for a new Resolution to be introduced that would facilitate the stoppage of this destruction of Libya? Is it possible, Comrade Chief Whip?

HON PROF KATJAVIVI: Thank you for that interesting question, I was going to touch on that in my presentation. Let me just simply say that we were told that there are loopholes in the UN Security Council Resolution 1973 and many of us who share your concern would like to know how these loopholes were not spotted earlier. Many of us who were at the United Nations at different levels were puzzled by this, how did it happen that nothing was done? (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: On a Point of Information. If Africa were united, we could at least have raised a point of some kind of moral high ground. Unfortunately, Africa is divided. There is a coalition of regime change in Libya. Since Africa, not having a Veto vote in the Security Council the only thing you can go for is a General Assembly

resolution. However, for that resolution to go through, you must have a two-thirds majority. That is the only thing Africa could have done if we were not divided and for now we are divided.

HON PROF KATJAVIVI: I thank the Prime Minister. I was going to deal with that to the end of my presentation. In fact, this is a very important issue. The question could be asked, where was the leadership of the African Union on this important and serious issue? These important questions are seeking answers and I admit that because of the disunity within our ranks as a continent, obviously these loopholes were not spotted on time.

It was against this background that the Pan-African Parliament adopted a resolution on Libya in May this year. The Pan-African Parliament resolution on Libya expresses deep concern over the ongoing crisis in that country. It further expresses concern over the foreign military intervention in Libya and calls for the immediate withdrawal.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, there is no doubt in our minds that the current foreign military intervention in that country is helping to exacerbate the situation in Libya to a major crisis with serious consequences for the African continent. Therefore, Namibia and most African countries welcome the position adopted by the African Union, by Africa for that matter, which the Prime Minister referred to as the African Road Map. That position of the African Union calls for an immediate end to foreign military intervention, a halt to current hostilities and ceasefire. These moves should ideally be followed by swift engagement in the form of dialogue by the Parties to the conflict.

Namibia and Africa should continue to call upon the African Union and the rest of the international community to intensify all efforts towards a peaceful solution and thereby protect Libya's sovereignty and territorial integrity, nothing short than that and that is the only way to save Africa and Libya from continuous military bombardment.

Honourable Members of this House, I thank you for your attention.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Tjihuiko.

HON TJIHUIKO: Thank you very much, Honourable Deputy Speaker. Before I start, I just wanted to ask the Right Prime Minister to withdraw that "Oh God."

The issue that we are talking about, the concerns that we have raised on the situation in Libya, Syria and that part of the world is a very serious one. I believe that if we were serious and concerned about what is taking place there, we would have shown that concern in our participation and not turn the situation in that part of the world into a joke. I believe that Honourable Professor Katjavivi just alluded to could have been the attitude while we were addressing this issue.

I am not very concerned by what is contained in the Motion tabled by Honourable Hamutenya, my concern is on what needs to be done in that part of the world and as Africans, as Namibians, having been part of the meeting in South Africa that Professor Katjavivi was referring to, I believe that the mechanism is already in place that Africa has adopted at various stages, whether at the AU, whether at the Pan-African Parliament and that we need to encourage, that is the road that we should follow.

I am however concerned that whenever we have an opportunity like this one where we need to emphasise and call upon the implementation of a road map, we deviate from the issue and start playing local politics while people are dying. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: May I ask Honourable Tjihuiko a small question? Are you aware that when the African Union met in an extraordinary session and adopted the African Road Map, the Americans countered by sending their Foreign Secretary to Africa to come and order the African countries to do something else which is not contained in the African Road Map?

HON TJIHUIKO: Had it not been because of the division existing in Africa, we could have been a force to be reckoned with. If a leader from the United States could come to Africa and dictate to the African leaders what to do and they do just that, then that is serious and for your information, Honourable Prime Minister, when we were discussing this resolution in Johannesburg,

South Africa, there were a number of African countries who were seriously opposing that Resolution. Therefore, the problem being dictated upon by outsiders should be a concern to all of us.

The point that I am trying to get at, Deputy Speaker, is that I believe as Africans we are moving in the right direction. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: On a Point of Information. Honourable Deputy Speaker, I would have liked somebody to shed more light in this House on the status of the visit of the Secretary of State of the United States of America to Addis Ababa. Was she invited, was she given the opportunity within the programme of activities taking place there or did she gate crash or what happened?

Our media is also not doing us a favour, they are not properly reporting for people to know the truth. I know that the Heads of State of SADC were meeting in South Africa and I do not know that there was a Summit of Heads of State of Africa in Addis Ababa at the time she was there. The media is telling us that she was addressing Heads of State of Africa. How

correct is this information? It is not true, our Heads of State were not there, this lady was not invited, she gate crashed and said what she said, but yet there was a response. Our media is also not telling us what Africa responded, they are just showing her face and what she said and that is it.

Africa said there was nothing new this lady has come to tell Africa, that Africa has a roadmap that is the position of Africa. Therefore, when somebody gate crashed at the door of your house, hurling insults at your family, can you say this person came to give you instructions? She said what she said, it is within her powers to say so and Africa said we have a roadmap, period.

HON TJIHUIKO: That is very good information, Minister of Justice. Sometimes when one listens to contributions, one starts wondering... (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: On a Point of Information. The Secretary of State of the United States came to Africa allegedly to attend AGOA in Zambia. Next week the First Lady is coming to South Africa and some other countries, allegedly to talk on women affairs. The truth of is that when the African leaders met in the Extraordinary Summit in Addis, I was there representing my Head of State. The Americans expected the group advocating for a regime change in Libya to prevail. A Motion was tabled there in the Summit for the African leaders to adopt a Motion for a regime change in Libya and it was defeated. That is what is prompting America now to send these emissaries to come and instruct. I think when the media was saying that the Secretary of State, Hillary Clinton, was addressing Heads of State of Africa, the actual word was "instructing" the African Heads of State to de-recognise the Government of Colonel Gaddafi and recognise the group in Benghazi. actually instructing the African leaders to do that. I think it is just the choice of word by the media, they did not mean literally that she was addressing African leaders face-to-face; she was addressing them to take a certain action.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, these are the kinds of Debates that we should engage ourselves in, being given information and sharing information. I think we have now reached a point where we are now looking at the actual issue. We should not be confused by some other comments.

I am not sure and maybe the Minister of Foreign Affairs will help me out here, whether a Secretary of State or Secretary of Foreign Affairs of a country can get into another country without having gone through diplomatic channels. Can a Foreign Minister from Zambia just land at Hosea Kutako International Airport without having gone through the Ministry of Foreign Affairs?

We are saying that because of the division in Africa we have created a situation where anybody could come in and cause more confusion, because we are blaming the American Secretary of State for having dictated to the Africans, but she was allowed into the country by an African Government. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: On a Point of Information. I think the Secretary of State as the Right Honourable Prime Minister said was on a mission to address AGOA. There was a conference on AGOA, the African Growth and Opportunity Act in Zambia and from Zambia she travelled to Tanzania, then to Addis Ababa. Maybe she also had engagements with the Ethiopian Government, particularly on issues such as South Sudan as well as Somalia. Maybe she took that opportunity to request the AU Commission to address the AU Commission and the African Ambassadors accredited to Addis. That is where she made that statement. These are the facts on the ground, that she made use of that opportunity to order the African leaders to sever diplomatic relations with Libya and to recognise the so-called Transitional National Council.

115

HON TJIHUIKO: Thank you, now you are talking like a Minister of Foreign Affairs. The point that I wanted to come to is that what happened in Libya, Sudan and Syria should be a learning curve for us. We should look at it from a positive point of view and see what has actually happened in that part of the world, what were the causes of the uprising in that area. Many has said it was a question of unemployment, lack of democracy, all these things, but once we look at that and know what the causes were, that is where we as a country should learn from other experiences. If the problem was a question of young unemployed people who took to the streets in Egypt, which led to the situation that had taken place at Egypt, then we must know that if our youngsters are unemployed and there is no future for them, then the Minister must be fired. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT

AND CULTURE: On a Point of Information. The Colleagues who desperately attempt to manipulate, twist and distort the facts out there to try to win elections, cannot again come here after they failed in the Courts and try and attempt it with Motions. The Honourable Member on the Floor is saying that this side of the House is addressing domestic politics, but the Mover of the Motion did the very same thing and thus we had to counter it with the truth. Now he is linking unemployment in Namibia and democracy to it. If we are talking about unemployment, the Government has put in place a programme, including TIPEEG to address the problem of unemployment of the youth. Why should we look at the recipe while we have a programme for that? If it is a question of revolution, why should we go to revolutions in Libya if we have a democratic process of elections, which we conduct here? There is no parallel link and you can keep wishing and dreaming for it, we have a system and you will be defeated, rejected and countered tooth-by-tooth, eye-to-eye, take it or leave it!

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I will not get into that kind of Debate. In my contribution I have not at one stage referred to that

part of the House, what I have been saying is that we as Africans and we as Namibians have a position through the Road Map and other things. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF EDUCATION: On a Point of Order, Deputy Speaker. I would like to appeal to the Honourable Colleague that the use of the finger is really too much.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I am saying that we should interrogate the excuses being used in that part of the world that have apparently led to the revolution in that area. This is not what I am saying; these are the reasons that have been reported as the causes for the events taking place there. One is democracy, the second is the unemployed youth in Egypt, and the third was poverty among the people. I am not referring to Namibia; I am referring to the causes that have been reported in that part of the world. Take it easy, I am not that type of politician that wants to mix things. If I want to take on Government for unemployment, I will do so. I do not mix things.

If those were the causes of the revolution in that part of the world, then it is not only confined to that area. We should also remember that those who encouraged people to take that action also tried it in Angola and it is only that the Angolan people were very smart to realise that that they do want to take this is not the route that. Therefore, we should not close our eyes to the reality and say that the moment you mention unemployment and we have unemployment in the country, we should not talk about it. Let us look at the practical issues and the practical issue is that if what happened in that part of the world was because of unemployment, we should be concerned. If that was because of poverty, we should be concerned and work out mechanisms to be proactive. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: May I ask a small question? What is common between you and Lady May?

HON TJIHUIKO: The common thing between the two of us is that both of us are blacks and both of us are Namibians.

Let us learn from the causes of the revolution in that part of the world, let us as a country compare ourselves with what we are doing and be proactive and accelerate what we want to do. Let us accelerate the implementation of TIPEEG, Honourable Kazenambo. It is not a Government programme. It is a Namibian programme. All of us, you and I, should be part of implementing that programme. The moment some of us mention TIPEEG being implemented or not implemented, it is not that it has to be implemented by you. You are the leading Party, but it is a national programme, so relax when we talk about our programme.

In conclusion, Honourable Deputy Speaker, I wanted to emphasise the point that we as a country should be proud of the little bit that we have contributed to the well-being of fellow Africans at all stages, including the action that we are trying to get implemented through the various African structures, but we should not sit back and think that now that we are part of the Roadmap, we forget about our own domestic issues. Let us learn from that experience and if the issue is unemployment, we are now at almost sixty percent. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT

AND CULTURE: On a Point of Information. While I respect Honourable Tjihuiko's intervention, while I respect the role of the Opposition Parties in the development of this country, I will agree with what Honourable Shixwameni yesterday said that we must avoid talking with a forked-tongue like a snake. A person is saying that we are part of the Government, we must be careful, we appreciate TIPEEG, but in a

twisted way – and I am a journalist by training –there is no chance of *denge to fudhile* here in politics. Here you say that unemployment is 60%, where did you get those statistics in Namibia. It does not exist. Be yourself, stop the hypocrisy, if you are part, appreciate the programme. On the one hand, you say we have programme and then you say it appears we have nothing, the revolution is on its way here.

HON TJIHUIKO: Before I conclude, let me try to answer the Minister. The Minister must understand that when we are talking about a programme that has been approved by this House, money that has been approved through this House, you are the implementer of those programmes. That is why we have Committees. (Intervention)

HON KAPIA: Honourable Deputy Speaker on a Point of Information, the Honourable Member must take note that the way this Motion was presented is not the way we are discussing it now. We are now discussing something else. That Motion is something different. We are now talking about the situation in Libya as Africans, as Namibians, but the Motion is instigating. It is something else and that is where I have a problem with the discussion today and the manner in which the Motion was tabled yesterday. Honourable Tjihuiko should just conclude, because he is not talking on the Motion, you are covering up something else. The Motion is a very serious one. I know that you came from PAP with a clear understanding of the situation, but here we have a Motion asking us what we are doing otherwise that situation will come here.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, it is always nice to take the Floor and say what you want to say. It is difficult for me to expect the Right Honourable Prime Minister to say the things that I want to hear. What I wanted to say to Honourable Kazenambo on the question of

ADJOURNMENT

Government programmes is that you must make a distinction between a Government programme and a Party programme. A Party programme will be decided by the Party's Central Committee and you will implement that programme according to the Party, you will not report to Parliament. A Parliamentary programme that has been budgeted for by this House is not your programme. You are the implementers. If you fail to implement, we will hold you accountable. Thank you very much and I rest my case.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Kaiyamo.

<u>HON KAIYAMO</u>: I move that the Debate be adjourned until Tuesday, the 21st of June.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Before we adjourn I would like to make a comment. I followed the Debate with keen interest, in particular the information requested by the Minister of Justice and the answer by the Right Honourable Prime Minister concerning the presence of the Secretary of State, Madam Clinton. I think you would agree with me that such information is important, because in Namibia it is not only us who have a keen interest in what is going on in Libya. Even at the grassroots this is the topic of the day in the clubs, in the taxis, in the hair salons.

I will request the Honourable Minister of Foreign Affairs that in future there must be a rule for the public to be informed, because I was even asking myself, where does this lady come from and who invited her? The House stands adjourned until Tuesday, the 21st of June.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:45 UNTIL 2011.06.21 AT 14:30

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS WINDHOEK 21 JUNE 2011

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

MOTION OF CONDOLENCE

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Honourable Speaker, on behalf of His Excellency Hifikepunye Pohamba, President of the Republic of Namibia, I would like to announce the passing on of the late Honourable Colonel John Otto Nankudhu. Colonel Nankudhu passed on at about 06:00 this morning. Namibia has lost a fearless, humble and fatherly freedom fighter. He was a beacon of inspiration to many Namibians who filled the ranks of the People's Liberation Army of Namibia, (PLAN), to fight for the liberation of their motherland. The modern history of Namibia's armed liberation struggle for freedom and independence will never be complete without the role played by this hero of the Namibian people.

On behalf of the President, the Government, the people of Namibia and, indeed, on my behalf, I wish to convey heartfelt condolences to the entire great family of Comrade Nankudhu. In this regard, further announcements will be made in due course. May his soul rest in eternal peace.

THE HOUSE OBSERVES A MINUTE OF SILENCE

HON SPEAKER: Any Petitions? Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers?

TABLING OF REPORTS HON SIOKA

TABLING: 2009 ANNUAL REPORT OF THE MINISTRY OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: I lay upon the Table, the Annual Report of the Ministry of Gender Equality and Child Welfare for the year 2009.

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Minister table the Report? Any further Reports and Papers? Any Notice of Questions?

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS

QUESTION 19:

<u>**HON MOONGO**</u>: I give Notice that on Thursday, the 30th of June 2011, I shall ask the Minister of Veteran Affairs:

- 1. It is a fact that special veterans will benefit N\$200 000 and others N\$50 000 from the Veterans Fund. Can the Minister explain and inform the House and the entire Nation what is the good reason that the victims of the Oshakati bank bomb-blast and other bomb blasts in Namibia are not benefiting from the Veterans Fund?
- 2. Is it true that the relatives of those who died and those who were injured and have bullets in their bodies did not benefit from the Bank, neither from the South African Government?
- 3. Is the Minister aware that the health of the victims is deteriorating and their treatment is very costly? When are they going to be

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS HON NAHOLO

registered?		

<u>HON SPEAKER:</u> Will the Honourable Member please table the Questions? Any further Notice of Questions? Honourable Naholo.

QUESTION 20:

<u>HON NAHOLO</u>: Thank you, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members. I give Notice that on Thursday, the 23rd of June 2011, I shall ask the Honourable Minister of Justice the following:

Namibia, being a member of the United Nations, is under the obligation to timely submit periodic reports on issues related to respect, protection and During the interactive dialogue of the realisation of human rights. Universal Periodic Review by the UN Human Rights Council regarding the general human rights situation in Namibia on 31 January 2011, a total of 120 problem areas were found. According to the outcome report of the UN Working Group, 27 out of the 120 human rights recommendations must be examined by Namibia and Namibia must provide answers to those recommendations not later than the regular session of the Human Rights Council scheduled for 30 May 2011 and 17 June 2011. During the said dialogue in Geneva, the Honourable Minister of Justice is reported to have said: "The delay in submitting those reports on time was due to insufficient human and material resources and inappropriate internal organisational framework for multi-sectoral coordination of human rights issues. The government is instituting measures to improve the situation."

Considering that the Ministry concerned has admittedly no adequate and competent staff members to draft and submit those reports, it is a fact that Namibia, being a State Party to the various international human rights instruments, is required to timely file and present periodic reports to the relevant monitoring organs of the United Nations.

- 1. Can the Honourable Minister inform this august House whether those recommendations have already been examined and what the responses were thereto. If so, by whom and when and secondly, were those recommendations ever presented before this august House which is the sovereign authority of this country solely charged with agreeing to or rejecting international human rights instruments.
- 2. Will the Honourable Minister inform this House when she will submit the outstanding Periodic Reports under the various human rights treaties?
- 3. There is also a question of involving NGOs and civil society in the reporting process. Can the Honourable Minister confirm to this august House whether the relevant civil society organisations have been consulted in that process and if so, which ones have been consulted?

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Member table the Questions? Any further Notice of Questions? Any Notice of Motions? Any Ministerial Statements? Attorney General.

MINISTERIAL STATEMENT

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND ATTORNEY-GENERAL: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. Honourable Speaker, I rise to make a Ministerial Statement in response to the alleged remarks made by the President of the All Peoples Party (APP), Honourable Ignatius Shixwameni and, subsequently, reported in one of the dailies of our country.

On 6 June 2011, one of the dailies, namely *The Namibian* newspaper, carried a headline, "*Shixwameni slams Government – Sets sight on 2014 election.*" For the sake of fairness, allow me to quote relevant parts of the alleged remarks and I am saying "*alleged*" for reasons that I will make known later on. I quote from the article:

"According to Shixwameni, Namibians are spending millions to pay for the greed of 27 individuals (Ministers), while many are suffering and living in squatter camps."

The Honourable Member is further alleged to have said and again I quote: "It is time that we get angry and kick them out like the former Egypt President, Hosni Mubarak, their friend."

In order to be fair to the Honourable Member, I wrote a letter to him on 14 June 2011 for the Honourable Member to verify whether what was reported reflects what he said. I further requested a copy of his statement if at all it was a written statement. A copy of my letter will be made available shortly.

Instead of responding through the usual courtesies, the Honourable Member chose to use the platform of this august House to state that the letter was some form of threat from State House and that he was not going to respond. He made a copy of the letter and tore it in front of the camera and left the original intact. As a Government we have a duty to be fair and reasonable. We have to live within the letter and spirit of Article 18 of the Namibian Constitution. Our citizens have every right to criticise Government. That is their democratic right. In the same vein, the Government has every right to respond to the criticisms levelled against it. However, the Government should verify the facts before responding, instead of responding to a newspaper article.

Honourable Members may recall that it is not the first time I have responded to remarks made by a public figure. Indeed, some time back I responded to the Honourable Ben Ulenga, President of the CoD. He was kind enough to admit the authenticity of a newspaper article before I responded and, indeed, for the information of Honourable Members, I

exercised my authority, my functions in terms of Article 87(c) of the Namibian Constitution, which states as follows: "The powers and functions of the Attorney-General shall be to take all action necessary for the protection and upholding of the Constitution."

Honourable Speaker, I believe that this is a healthy and democratic approach which should not only apply to the Government, but also to our citizens. They should have every right to seek confirmation from Government on issues said about them or their organisations in newspapers. I will continue with this approach within the letter and spirit of Article 87 of the Namibian Constitution.

The Honourable Member, inter alia, said the following during his outburst in this august House: "Just as I was not afraid of victimisation and harassment of the Boers and as I faced the Casspirs and the Buffels of the apartheid regime, so shall I be unshakeable, not afraid and not intimidated by my fellow blacks and former freedom fighters and Colleagues just because they now call themselves the Ruling Party."

Honourable Speaker, I have said it time and again that as the Government of the day we subscribe to the principles of fundamental freedoms as enshrined in Article 21(1)(b) of the Namibian Constitution which guarantees freedom of speech and expression. However, the enjoyment of such freedoms should be exercised responsibly. Article 21(2) of the Namibian Constitution states as follows and I quote only relevant parts:

"The fundamental freedoms referred to in Sub-article (1) hereof shall be exercised subject to the law of Namibia insofar as such law imposes reasonable restrictions on the exercise of the rights and freedoms conferred by the said Sub-article, which are necessary in a democratic society and are required in the interest of sovereignty and integrity of Namibia, National security, public order or incitement to an offence."

By referring to all Ministers as being greedy, the Honourable Member gives the impression that the President of this Republic did not exercise his mind by appointing greedy individuals as Ministers. He gives the impression that whatever is being spent on the Ministers is done outside

the laws of our Republic. It is most unfortunate that the Honourable Member did not cite the law that is being violated. It is a surprise that the very Honourable Member at one time in his political career was also a member of the Executive. He was never heard condemning the terms and conditions of employment of Ministers. Why is it today when he is no longer a member of the Executive that he refers to them as "greedy individuals?" Was the Honourable Member also a greedy individual when he was a member of the Executive? The terms and conditions of service of Ministers are determined by the President on the recommendation of the Public Office-Bearers Remuneration and Benefits Commission. This is a Commission which is established by law, the Public Office-Bearers Remuneration and Benefits Act (Act 3 of 2005). It is, therefore, most unfortunate that the Honourable Member wants to paint Ministers as greedy in the eyes of the public as if they are thieves. If they are thieves, this can only be proven in a Court of Law and not through irresponsible utterances.

Honourable Speaker, we should learn from history, incitement by public figures for a regime change by unconstitutional means is different from utterances of a common man or woman in the street. The Jews paid a heavy price because of irresponsible utterances from Adolf Hitler. The people of Rwanda paid a heavy price because of irresponsible utterances from leaders. It is totally unacceptable to compare democratic Namibia with events in Egypt. It is unacceptable to compare our Head of State with the Head of State of another country in a negative manner. I, therefore, caution the Honourable Member that in our Republic any call for a change of a Head of State or Government by unconstitutional means will never, never be tolerated.

Those who aspire for high office should do so through constitutional means, not through incitement. Incitement for regime change in a democracy such as ours can only be instigated by a politician who is gasping for political oxygen.

Honourable Speaker, our country is stable, peaceful and democratic. History is replete with examples of those who incite instability. They are the first to take off and settle in the comfort and relative safety of distant

capitals once their country descends into chaos and anarchy. Those who are at the receiving end are usually, and unfortunately so, the masses, defenceless women and children. Therefore, our people are mature enough not to fall in the same trap. I have no doubt that they will reject incitement with the contempt it deserves. Let us continue to keep Namibia, the Land of the Brave, peaceful, stable and democratic. Those who aspire for high office should do so through the ballot box, not through political incitement. Those politicians who belong to the dustbin of history, I can only say, may their political souls rest in eternal peace. I thank you. Amen.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Minister. Honourable Shixwameni.

HON SHIXWAMENI: I hope, according to the rules of natural justice which Dr Kawana must be well-acquainted with, I should be able to respond in this same House to what he has said. Otherwise the rules of natural justice shall be killed on the Floor of this House and we shall not be able to ask the Judiciary to be independent....(Intervention)

HON SPEAKER: I do not know where you are going. I was not here, but I caught up with what you did here, you had an opportunity. The Minister is giving his views on what you have said, but you are allowed to rise on some specific technical issues of dispute, "did not say that", those kinds of issues. If at some time you would want to come with a Motion or whatever to keep the matter alive, that is a different matter. However, if I give you the Floor that you want to say now on top of what you have already said, the Minister would come back to respond to what you have said a second time and do not think neither the Minister, nor you would want us to devote the work of the Assembly to this. You are free to rise on a technical point, but not for me to accord you a chance, under what you call natural justice, to make yet another statement on the same issue. The Floor is yours.

REPLY TO MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON SHIXWAMENI

HON SHIXWAMENI: Honourable Speaker, you were not here when the statement was read. What the Minister said here that I said in Parliament is all false, because what was quoted in the newspapers has been a different statement from what I was supposed to have presented here. Therefore, I do not know how to deal with the Honourable Minister of Presidential Affairs and Attorney-General, because what he has been quoting here is false, untrue and is not the real thing that I said here in Parliament.

HON SPEAKER: That is good enough, Honourable Shixwameni. You have all the opportunities open to you as a Member to come back on this issue but not on this occasion. You had your say, the Minister had his say, and you are telling us as the House that what you said is not what the Minister responded to. There are some other ways to seek advice; I can give you advice but not now on that one. For now that is settled.

HON SHIXWAMENI: May I just record something for the sake of the record? I want to state on record that the Minister, both in his letter and what he has responded to now, has lied. Thank you.

HON SPEAKER: You are really pressing the issue. I do not know whether it is an act of bravery on your part or an act of honesty. Honourable Shixwameni, I repeat what I have said, you spoke in the House, the Minister had an opportunity to speak on the same issue in the House. I accorded you an opportunity, as the rules allow, for you to respond on a technical issue. The matter of calling what the Minister has said is lies, goes far beyond that and I can really in all honestly ask you to withdraw that. However, you are free to come back under a Motion or any other form to keep this alive and I will rule on that at that time. I want you to withdraw, please. I would need to know what the lies and what the truth are.

129

HON SHIXWAMENI: With respect to your office, I withdraw the word "lie", but the Honourable Minister ... (Intervention)

HON SPEAKER: That is enough for me. Honourable Minister of Gender Equality and Child Welfare.

MINISTERIAL STATEMENT

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: Honourable Speaker, the 16th of June, the Day of African Child, cannot go unnoticed. Even though it was addressed that very day, our people need information.

It is my honour and pleasure to address you on this important and significant day in the lives of our African children. June 16 is dedicated to the commemoration of the Day of the African Child and the African Union sanctioned the calendar day in all African countries. The day traces its history in the Soweto incident of 16 June 1976. Hundreds of black school children were massacred in Soweto, South Africa, as they took to the streets to protest the inferior quality of education and to demand their right to be taught in their own language. To honour the memory of those who were killed and the courage of all those who marched, the Day of the African Child has been commemorated on the 16th of June every year since 1991.

The Day of the African Child seeks to draw the attention of all Governments, national institutions and communities to deal with the delicate condition of children by organising activities that promote the rights of the child. The theme of this year's Day of the African Child is: "All Together for Urgent Actions in favour of Street Children."

Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members, it is a well-known fact that many children all over the world turn to the streets in an attempt to resolve problems that arise out of the social structures and situations they find themselves in. These children share one common factor, "working in the streets" to make a living. There is, however, a world of difference between the runaways or homeless youth found in First World countries and the street children in the Third World countries.

In contrast, runaways mostly turn to the streets in search of adventure, excitement or independence. The street children of the Third World turn to the street as a result of neglect or abandonment. Both these children spend most of their time unsupervised. As such, a subculture develops of street children who depend on themselves and on each other and not on an adult for the provision of physical and emotional needs, such as food, clothing, direction and socialisation.

This year's theme challenges Governments and citizens of the African countries and civil society organisations to debate what the concept of the street child is, its manifestations, what causes children to stay on the street, the experience they endure and how can they be assisted.

Comrade Speaker, the objectives of this commemoration are to:

- Contribute to widespread awareness of dangers the street children face and to take urgent steps to protect them.
- Determine strategic guidelines to be taken into account that will enhance prospects for children living in families at risk to enjoy their rights in such a way that will keep them off the streets.
- Propose innovative strategies that are more effective in child protection and care;
- Take stock of the phenomenon of street children in African States;
- Sensitize African communities on the vital necessity of protecting street children:

- Undertake advocacy with African Governments and civil society for greater resource mobilization for the protection of children living on the street;
- Analyse current strategies which address children's needs in a bid to identify their strengths and weaknesses;
- Reflect on the problems related to data on street children; and
- Provide overall care for children living on the streets, including accommodation, psychosocial mentoring and reinsertion.

Honourable Speaker, studies conducted by the International Labour Organisation and UNICEF estimated that there are 120 million children who live on the street the world over and 30 million of these children are in Africa. The African street children's ages range from 2 to 18 years. Although they are mostly boys, street children are from both genders. These figures are alarmingly on the increase as social inequalities and poverty levels rise. Although it is not possible to accurately estimate the number of street children in any country, in Namibia it has been reported that the number of street children is as high as 2 300 with 800 of these children in Windhoek alone.

Most of these children are motivated to turn to the street by their need to survive, peer pressure, a need to get away from an intolerable home environment and often to contribute to the family income. These children mainly operate in small groups who bond together, share resources and take care of one another. Unfortunately, these children are often exploited in various ways, for example, as child labour, child trafficking, alcohol and drug abuse, criminal activities, sexual and physical abuse and begging.

It is with this in mind, that the 2011 AU themselves are trying to compel African Governments to commit themselves towards the welfare and protection of children. There is an urgent need to recognise and support the role of the family and the extended family, to prioritise community-based care as a form of alternative care, facilitate kinship care and provide

legal support where it is needed.

African States are urged to make a concerted effort to involve families and other stakeholders in a bid to capitalise on the positive African cultures that have a bearing on child care. This will consequently contribute to the realisation and advancement of the children's rights and hence, the ability to comply with international conventions, for example, the African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child and the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, the Namibian Constitution enshrines the rights of children to life, health, education and a decent standard of living. The Constitution ensures equality and freedom from discrimination and highlights the family as the natural and fundamental group unit of society and also makes provision for the protection of children's rights. All Namibian children are entitled to be protected from economic exploitation and shall not be employed in or required to perform work that is likely to be hazardous or to interfere with their health or physical, spiritual, moral or social responsibility. This, therefore, implies that Namibian street children are protected by law from all forms of exploitation, including commercial sexual exploitation. The situation, however, as I have mentioned earlier, remains far from ideal.

Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members it is worth mentioning that in our efforts to protect our children, the Ministry is drafting a new Child Care and Protection Bill to replace the Children's Act, Act 33 of 1960. This will, once passed, become the main legislation governing the Child Protection Bill and which we expect to be enacted this year. I need your support on that. This shows the seriousness of the Namibian Government on its efforts to safeguard and protect the rights and welfare of the Nation's future leaders and citizens.

Honourable Speaker, although the Government's response is primarily through the Ministry of Gender Equality and Child Welfare, this does not mean that other Ministries are not playing roles in children's development. The Ministry of Gender Equality and Child Welfare is responsible for attending to children in need of care or protection and for removing them

from toxic home environments and placing them in alternative care when necessary. It provides monthly subsidies to children's homes and places of safety. The recreational and after-school centres offer support for street children in form of help with homework, soup kitchens, sport activities and training in computer skills.

To ensure that the well-being of Namibian children is realised, the Government allocates 21% of its annual Budget to the Ministry of Education and 9.4% to the Ministry of Health and Social Services to address the issue of health care for children and the Ministry of Gender Equality and Child Welfare offers grants to 72% of orphaned children countrywide.

As citizens of this beautiful country, we in our collective or individual capacity have a moral duty to protect our children, especially the vulnerable ones so that one day they too will have an opportunity to be reintegrated into normal family life. We need to raise resilient children who will become good citizens, who care about others, who share our values and who will be excellent parents.

In conclusion, Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members, this theme of *All Together for Urgent Action in favour of Street Children* can only be realised in Namibia if the plight of street children can be addressed in a holistic manner whereby all stakeholders, the community, families, the parents and Government join hands and take on the responsibility for our children and respond positively to issues of children without parental care. With these few remarks, I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank you. All Honourable Members are invited by the Minister of Agriculture, Water and Forestry, in cooperation with the Namibia Development Corporation and the Agricultural Ministry to join the Minister and his company during tea-break to receive generous products from the Namibian soil in the form of dates produced in our country. I wholeheartedly encourage Honourable Members to kindly

accept the invitation to receive dates produced in Namibia. The House

stands adjourned.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:40 HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:10 PURSUANT TO ADJOURNMENT

MOTION ON CLIMATE CHANGE

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM:

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members of this august House, climate change induced disasters, I believe, to wreak havoc across many parts of the world and Namibia is no exception. There is sufficient scientific evidence that current changes in the climate are caused by human activities, such as burning of fossil fuels as well as from large-scale and land-use change, such as deforestation. These activities release greenhouse gas emissions, such as carbon dioxide, methane and nitro-oxide into the atmosphere and trap more heat, leading to global warming which in turn causes changes in most climate systems.

Although Namibia contributes very little, about 0.05% to the total global greenhouse gas omissions, we remain highly vulnerable to the adverse effects of climate change, mainly because of likely changes in rainfall patterns and our high dependence on climate sensitive sectors, coupled with low adaptive capacity due to lack of resources, skills and technology.

According to the Fourth Assessment of the Inter-Government Panel on Climate Change of 2007, between 75 to 250 million people in Africa are projected to experience water stress by 2020 and yields from rain-fed agriculture could be reduced by up to 50% in some African countries, plunging them into food insecurity and malnutrition.

Namibia's climate is predicted to become hotter and drier in the future, with more variability in rainfall. Many resources and sectors in Namibia which are essential to our economic development are vulnerable to the adverse impacts of climate change.

According to the multiple regression model used in study, substantial losses in farm income are predicted to result from climate change, with annual revenue per hectare projected to decrease up to 42% of its current value by 2050 and up to 59% by 2080. Weather related disasters, such as floods and droughts, have increased significantly in recent years in Namibia with devastating impacts on the lives of our people. Climate change related impacts have potential to reverse our hard-earned developmental gains.

In order for Namibia to be prepared against embedding climate change related risks, strategies to cope with changing climate need to be put in place. The Ministry of Environment and Tourism, which is the lead institution in coordinating climate change activities, has spearheaded a public consultation process throughout the country during the course of 2010, culminating into the National Policy on Climate Change which was approved by Cabinet last month. This Policy provides a legal framework through which we can effectively manage climate change risks in our country. The objectives of this Policy are:

- To develop and implement appropriate adaptation strategies and actions that will lower the vulnerability of Namibians in various sectors to the effects of climate change;
- To develop actions and strategies for climate change mitigation;
- To integrate climate change effectively into policies, institutional and development frameworks in recognition of the cross-cutting nature of climate change;
- To enhance capacities and synergies at local, regional and national levels and at individual, institutional and systematic levels to ensure successful implementation of climate change response activities; and

• To provide secure and adequate funding resources for effective adaptation and mitigation investments on climate change and associated activities.

Therefore, all stakeholders, ranging from regional levels, have roles to play in implementation of this important Policy.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, the Government of Namibia, through the Ministry of Environment and Tourism, as well as other stakeholders has implemented a number of programmes and projects geared towards climate change adaptation and mitigation measures. These include, among others, the African Adaptation Project which aims at building the foundation for a national approach to climate change adaptation through enhancing the capacity to respond and be prepared for climate change.

Another intervention is the Climate Change Adaptation Pilot Project under the Country Partnership Programme for Sustainable Land Management which is being implemented jointly with the Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry in the Omusati Region. This project aims at enhancing the adaptive capacity of communal farmers by piloting a range of coping mechanisms. Furthermore, the Namibian Renewable Energy Project that was implemented by the Ministry of Mines and Energy until 2010 aimed at encouraging the use of renewable energy sources among Namibians. The Small Grants Programme of the UNDP, a global environmental facility, provides direct financial assistance to community-led adaptation measures.

Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members, agriculture, which is the backbone of our country's food security, is particularly crucial for adaptation measures. To this end, substantial progress has been made as part of adopting adaptation package in the following areas:

- (a) Development of varieties of seeds that is tolerant of extreme weather conditions;
- (b) The use of livestock breeds that are well adapted to our harsh

conditions;

- (c) Appropriate land tillage practices;
- (d) Improve water-use efficiency in irrigation projects and rainwater harvesting techniques; and
- (e) Fish farming which gives communities an alternative livelihood option for both consumption and for income generation.

Through the community-based natural resources management under the Ministry of Environment and Tourism, communities have been empowered to manage their wildlife resources and conduct tourism activities in rural areas. As a result, 64 communal conservancies have been registered with 32 joint venture lodges and campsites. The income to people living in conservancies has risen from almost zero to over N\$42 million in fifteen years. The Ministry of Environment and Tourism believes that once the standard of living has improved, communities' vulnerability to the effects of climate change will be reduced.

Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members, I am also pleased to note that both the Public and Private Sector have started investing in renewable sources, such as the installation of the fourth turbine at the Ruacana Hydro-Power Station, the upcoming wind farm in the South, the use of bushy plants for energy for future projects around Otavi to power the Ohorongo Cement Plant's operations and numerous solar energy initiatives across the country.

In addition, a Cabinet directive of 2004 mandates that all public buildings be installed with solar water heaters. All these initiatives are clear testimonies that Namibians are indeed ready to pursue a path of clean and sustainable development that supports environmental protection, whilst ensuring that we build our resilience to the adverse impacts of climate change.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, a recent study on investment and financial flows assessment for climate change conducted by the

Ministry of Environment and Tourism reveals that Namibia needs about N\$31 billion to address the impact of climate change between now and the year 2030. This amount is indeed for both adaptation and mitigation measures in agriculture and energy sectors only.

Climate induced damages to infrastructure over the past few years have been enormous, costing Namibia billions of dollars in repairs and reconstruction of roads, houses, clinics and schools, to mention just a few. These disasters call for a collective approach by all Line Ministries and the Private Sector, ranging from agriculture, water, security, finance, Local and Regional Authorities and education, gender and industries, among others, to work together in finding long-term solutions to reduce the impact of climate induced disasters.

At the international level Namibia has ratified the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change in 1995 and acceded to the Kyoto Protocol in 2002. The aim of the UNFCCC is to stabilise considerations of greenhouse gas omissions in the atmosphere at a level that would prevent human interference with the climate system. The Kyoto Protocol sets targets for developed countries on emissions.

Namibia has been active in negotiations at the UNFCCC Conference of Parties and our position is similar to that of African Union and Southern African Development Community. We have been demanding that:

- The industrialised world cuts their emissions by at least 50% so that the global temperature remains below 20 degrees Celsius.
- To provide finance for adaptation;
- Technology transfer to undertake mitigation efforts; and
- To build our capacity to implement adaptation and mitigation measures.

This year the UNFCCC Conference of Parties, COP 17, will take place in Durban, South Africa, in November this year and I hope a global deal,

which eluded the previous COP 15 in Copenhagen and COP 16 in Cancun will be agreed upon in Durban, South Africa.

Going forward, the Ministry of Environment and Tourism will organise a national conference on the implementation of the National Policy on Climate Change during the course of 2011 where all stakeholders will be invited, ranging from national, regional to local levels. In addition, key policy elements will be translated into indigenous languages so that our rural communities, who will be hit hardest by climate change impact, could read and understand the content of this national Policy.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, climate change is no longer only an environmental issue but it is a developmental problem that cuts across various sectors. Its impacts are not only felt somewhere far away from us in the world, but we are feeling them right here at home as well. Therefore, we all must combine our efforts and collectively deal with this phenomenon. Government, Private Sector, civil society and NGOs all have a role to play in ensuring that we adapt to the adverse impacts of climate change and mitigate its causes.

Finally, as Members of Parliament we all have a responsibility to incorporate the implementation of the National Policy on Climate Change in all our activities. The Ministry of Environment and Tourism will be ready to work with you and I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Deputy Minister. Honourable Schlettwein.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: Honourable Speaker, thank you very for giving me the floor. I did ask for the Floor to talk on the National Policy on Climate Change. Just a few observations:

First of all, I think it is a very important document and a very important policy that we are to deliberate. There are, however, some issues that I

140

MOTION ON CLIMATE CHANGE HON SCHLETTWEIN

just wanted to allude to.

In the introduction the Honourable Deputy Minister alluded to the fact that we are participating in international fora when we formulate international best practices and policies and I am very much aware that our standpoint was very strongly that of "the polluter pays" when we talk about mitigating influences as a result of climate change. I am, therefore, a little bit disappointed that the national policy does not reiterate that principle and that is that we as Namibia, are de facto not contributing in any significant way to climate change through the emission of gases that would warm the globe. I think, therefore, it is very important and crucial that we drive home that policy point that we are at the receiving end of something that was caused by the developed world and I think we should in our own policy have reference to the fact that we would insist on that principle to be followed through and that that would be our policy stand in discussions at regional or international level. I would like to see that as a guiding principle of the policy.

Honourable Speaker, the other points are in reaction to the rather prescriptive way the policy is drafted and I want to specifically talk to the financial resources points that are raised in the policy. Of course, I do understand that a policy of this nature can only be implemented effectively if the necessary resources are availed to whoever is responsible for implementation, but I think we must realise that climate change is not the only problem we have in this country and the policy is drafted in a way that it appears to be a kind of a stand-alone policy that covers all affected sectors. I do not think that that is the intention. Honourable Speaker, I am saying that because we have equally or even more pressing priorities to fund, that of unemployment, that of poverty alleviation, that of efficient education for all our people, that of a health service provision that is adequate to cover all our people and I think to be just fair, climate change is in competition with those priorities and, therefore, I am a bit worried to prescribe in a policy that would be adopted by this House that resources shall be made available to this one policy without bringing it into context with other pressing priorities that we do have.

MOTION ON CLIMATE CHANGE HON SCHLETTWEIN

I specifically refer you to page 19 of the policy where it says in 4.14, "financial resource allocation, mobilisation and management" and it is very prescriptive what must be funded. I do not want to go into those details because I think the principal point is we are in an environment where there are many pressing needs and all of them must be covered. To adopt one policy prescribing that funds must be available at all times to this one policy without bringing it into context with others, I think is not the intention and I hope it is not the intention. I just want to reiterate that.

Honourable Speaker, if you go to page 31, paragraph 8, and the policy goes one step further and actually says for specifically what moneys will be made available. The point I want to make here is that the whole policy and this article specifically bases its resource allocation on an input base. It is a needs analysis, so it is asking to make money available if a need arises to make money available.

Honourable Speaker, when we debated the Budget for the last couple of years, I think we made a lot of effort to change our Budget to an outcome-based Budget, so that we allocate resources where outcomes are guaranteed or to facilitate wanted outcomes. This is turning around again and we are falling back into a situation where we budget on an input-basis. We say that is our need and, therefore, the money must be made available regardless of what the outcome is. I think again it is just maybe the wording how it is put, but I would suggest that we align the Policy so that it is synchronised with existing policies that we have adopted in this House.

Lastly, Honourable Speaker, the obligation or the wants in this Policy to have the international world cooperating with us is a laudable one and I think in a global village it is an absolute necessity that we are not working in isolation. Just to put it into perspective with my initial point, the developed world, in my opinion, should have the obligation to fund most of these activities because they are the principal cause of the climate change. If we look at what happens in our country, international funding is made available, in most of the cases outside the Budget, so it does not necessarily follow our policy. It is not a financial assistance that would be influenced by the Debate of this House and by other consultative process

MOTION ON CLIMATE CHANGE HON SCHLETTWEIN

in the realm of the Budget. It is not because it is an extra-budgetary source and we are limited in a way to influence the areas that need funding.

Overall our financial needs are only covered to, at best, 5% by international donor funds and 95% comes from own sources. I am saying that, Honourable Speaker, because I think we are, therefore, entitled to call the shots in policy development and we should not be hamstrung by those who only contribute 5 or 3% to our total funding needs. Again it is a word of caution that we must make sure that when it comes to these very important policies like this one, that it is really addressing our needs. We must be very careful that we are not driven by needs that are exported from areas where the social and economic setting is different. (Intervention)

HON SHIXWAMENI: Could I ask the Honourable Deputy Minister a small question? I agree with everything that he is saying, but should they not, since they are neighbours there, consult and inform each other? Should he not consult with his neighbour there on these European imported policies?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: I think he is correct and I can tell him that we did consult. Obviously there was a consultative process about this policy, but this is Parliament where we make our opinions public, talk about them and then we will see how we will influence them. I think I was legitimate in raising these points after having consulted.

In any case, I have said what I wanted to say, Honourable Speaker, thank you very much.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Riruako.

MOTION ON CLIMATE CHANGE HON RIRUAKO

HON RIRUAKO: Honourable Speaker, I have been listening to the Honourable Minister about climate change, but unfortunately he confined himself to where the vision can see, but not beyond the vision. Climate change has been happening for quite a considerable time, where we are supposed to be ready for the challenge, but unfortunately it came like a surprise, no one is prepared to face the challenge of the changes. There we are not yet prepared to face whatever happens, because this has become a routine of every day, every season. We do not know how many seasons we have because everything has been changed. We do not know how we are supposed to arrange our economy based on those seasons. Nothing is left over for us to depend on our normal way of life.

I can see it has become a joke; nobody is prepared to come up with something tangible in order to challenge whatever happens. It is just left aside. I do not know what kinds of experts we have who do not even prepare for these phenomena and we do not have anything on the table that can challenge that. It may be taking place now and then, but what is the answer to the problem? The people of this country are wondering how far we can go without adjusting to the conditions of the day. These are the kinds of things that we are expecting from the experts. We got them from other countries, they came here at our expense, they do their job as called for, but what is the result of this? We pay for it and the answer? We cannot keep on talking about climate change at meetings from Brazil and wherever. What kind of readjustments do we have?

It is not the joke of the day, as I see it now it is taken as a simple issue but it is not that simple, it creates confusion in the whole society and if you are not prepared, how are you going to manage climate change? People keep on talking without something at hand on how we are going to rescue ourselves.

I have a plea to those who have been recognised and accepted by society as the experts of the day, what do they have at hand? Nothing is at hand. Money is being spent on travelling from country to country and what do we have in return? That goes to you, Honourable Deputy Minister; we would like to have your Report on the Table on how we are going to approach it from now onwards.

MOTION ON CLIMATE CHANGE HON DR GURIRAB / HON KAZENAMBO

HON SPEAKER: I thank you for your contribution. I do not want what the Deputy Minister of Finance has said to be misunderstood in the sense that some might be interpreting him to be saying that climate change is not that important, there is other equally or more pressing challenges facing us than climate change. He is not saying that. What he is saying is that a good number of developed and developing countries are saying that the whole idea of climate change is a hoax being played on our minds by some people. Others are saying that it is not as serious as it is purported to be. Others are saying it is a make-or-break challenge for humanity, almost bordering on the beginning of Creation. Some of the instances of the kind that Chief Riruako is talking about, whether it is some of the tsunamis and other things we see in Asia, earthquakes and other challenges faced in Latin-America and elsewhere, all these things are near and present for us as policymakers. We should not misunderstand him as saying that we should concentrate more on employment creation, because there will be no Namibia for those that we are training in skills to benefit from. We look at it in balance as others do, but it is a very serious challenge. I am on the side of those who say it is a serious challenge and we need to orient our policy-making minds to weigh it into the priorities that we are facing. Any further discussion? Minister of Youth.

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: Initially I did not want to speak, but after the Speaker, Chief Riruako and the Deputy Minister of Finance have spoken, I think now I am triggered because I will not be here next week.

I rise to support the National Policy on Climate Change for Namibia. The issue of climate change is at the heart of the issue of sustainable development and on page 4, paragraph 10, they are talking about education, training, capacity building and institutional strengthening and in paragraph 4.11 they are talking about research and information needs. This is what prompted me to stand up.

I agree with the Deputy Minister of Finance and the Deputy Minister who introduced the policy that technology is advancing as we are living in a

MOTION ON CLIMATE CHANGE HON KAZENAMBO

global village. Cultural values and norms that go to the utilisation of resources is where there is a connection to this policy on education and training, especially capacity building and institutional strengthening.

Education is very important for the climate issue because if we are aware what effect our behaviour patterns will have on the climate, when we may address the issues of poverty, health and many others, because climate change cannot be treated and seen as an isolated issue from social, political and economic development. It is linked, it is at the heart of the social, political and economic setting because climate change has an effect on agricultural production, on the weather, while the weather affects our way of living, in our agricultural production and so forth.

Some policies which have originated elsewhere and prescribe that we should not behave in a certain manner as we will be damaging the environment should not be welcomed blindly, they need to be researched and challenged if need be or applied where there is a need.

The reason I have risen and why I am talking about education is that we have been told that climate change is caused by, amongst others, emission of smoke and others, but I hope when we talk about the emission of smoke into the atmosphere, we will keep in mind that in the rural parts of Africa many people are dependent on firewood for their survival and many people clear forests for agricultural production. In many cases the Western world will condemn this as pollution of the environment and we will follow blindly and say no more bush clearing. I am not saying it should be condoned, but I am saying the Ministry of Environment and Tourism is doing a great job by emphasising research and development, and the provision of information so that these young researchers will not just blindly condemn the way the people live in the villages without providing alternative means of survival. When we deal with these policies, we must contextualise and domesticate them because our situations are far different from the situations of other countries.

When one compares the smoke emissions being caused by a person in the village of Omuthiya or Kabbe to the emissions caused by an aeroplane or a manufacturing plant, it is not comparable. (Intervention)

MOTION ON CLIMATE CHANGE HON MUTORWA

HON RIRUAKO: On a Point of Order. We do not live as usual in climate change, we live in an era of tsunamis which is beyond our comprehension. You do not have to around our own world, it is beyond that and therefore, your expectations must be in line and then we can listen to you.

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT

AND CULTURE: I agree with the Chief, it is not business as usual, even in Aminuis there was a big political tsunami. On a serious note, I agree with the Chief and that is why I am saying we should understand the causes and the Ministry of Education is providing a framework for further research. My point is that this instrument should be linked to our daily lives. We experience floods which are caused by climate change and we should research the causes and come up with mitigating remedies. Thank you.

HON MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY:

Thank you, Comrade Speaker, Sir. I pray for the indulgence of this Honourable House and at the same time also seek your permission, Comrade Speaker, that I postpone the discussion of this very important item to tomorrow afternoon.

HON SPEAKER: The further consideration of this item is adjourned until tomorrow afternoon. The Secretary will read the second Order of the Day.

RECONSIDERATION: EMPLOYMENT SERVICE BILL

ASSEMBLY IN COMMITTEE:

21 June 2011 COMMITTEE STAGE-EMPLOYMENT SERVICE BILL HON NGATJIZEKO

<u>COMMITTEE</u>: The Committee has to reconsider the Employment Service Bill.

Clause 3 put.		

HON MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Thank you very much, In Clause 3 substitute the following Sub-Clause for Sub-Clause 3(1):

- "(1) The Board consists of the following fourteen individuals appointed by the Minister in accordance with this Section:
 - (a) the Chairperson;
 - (b) three members to represent the interest of the State of which at least one member is a female;
 - (c) two members to represent the interest of registered trade unions of which at least one member is female;
 - (d) two members to represent the interest of registered employers organisations of which at least one member is female;
 - (e) not more than four members who, in the opinion of the Minister, possess specialised knowledge in labour and employment, immigration and education;
 - (f) one member representing the interest of persons living with disabilities; and
 - (g) one member of the National Youth Council, established by Section 2 of the National Youth Council Act (Act 3 of 2009)."

21 June 2011 COMMITTEE STAGE-EMPLOYMENT SERVICE BILL HON SIOKA

Substitute the following Sub-Clause for Sub-Clause (3):

- "(3) Before appointing a member to the Board in terms of subsection (1)(c), (c), (f) or (g), the Minister must, by notice in writing, invite nominations from:
 - (a) registered trade unions if a member is to represent their interest;
 - (b) registered employers organisations if a member is to represent their interest;
 - (c) an organisation which, in the opinion of the Minister, represents the interest of disabled persons; and
 - (d) the Board of the National Youth Council established by Section 2 of the National Youth Council Act (Act 3 of 2009).

I thank you.		

<u>DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE</u> <u>COMMITTEE</u>: Any further discussion? Honourable Sioka.

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: Thank you, Comrade Deputy Chair. I only want to advise that in future we need to look into the issue of Clause 3(b) which reads, "three members to represent the interest of the State of which at least one member is a female." I feel this should be left open, we should not say at least one should be female. There might be two women, but here we are putting a restriction. I am not happy with this, because there could be at least two women.

21 June 2011 COMMITTEE STAGE-EMPLOYMENT SERVICE BILL HON MOONGO

DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: I think we are all in agreement that it does not restrict. The wording is actually conveying the same sentiment that you are expressing.

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: But why can we not say at least one man? Thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: When it is stated "at least one", it is implied that it could be more. Can I conclude that we are together.

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: I am just requesting that we should not put a figure on women, we should leave it open.

<u>HON MOONGO</u>: Honourable Deputy Chairperson, I see provision is made for representation for the disabled, but what about the albinos? They are being left out.

DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Before we move into that topic that Honourable Moongo is raising, I want to make sure that the Honourable Minister is comfortable. Your point of view is actually well covered in the wording but I hope you are not going to insist. The Minister has taken note and I will conclude that we are almost together.

21 June 2011 COMMITTEE STAGE-EMPLOYMENT SERVICE BILL HON NGATJIZEKO

HON MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Thank you, Deputy Chair. I hear what the Honourable Moongo is requesting, but this Bill was discussed extensively in this House and it was referred to the National Council. The Amendments I am tabling now are Amendments suggested by the National Council. I do not know whether we are reopening discussions. Proposals such as those were supposed to have been provided already here.

I also want to explain to the Honourable Minister of Gender Equality and Child Welfare that what is provided for is to ensure that female representatives are nominated because it is not up to the Minister to appoint all those people. Some of them are representatives from employer's organisations; some are from the trade unions. Those institutions have the right to appoint people whom they think are going to represent their interests the best, but we have made sure in the law that among those people there should be at least one, but it could be more.

<u>DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE</u> <u>COMMITTEE</u>: Clause 3 agreed to.

Clause 16 put.

Sub-Clause (8):

HON MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Thank you, Deputy Chair. In Clause 16, substitute the following Sub-Clause for

"(8) Any person who contravenes or fails to comply with sub-sections (1), (2), (3), (5) or (7) commits an offence and on conviction is liable to a find not exceeding N\$20 000 or to imprisonment not exceeding two years or both such fine and imprisonment; and

(b) Delete sub-clause (9)."

Thank you very much.

DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Clause 16 agreed to.

I shall report the Bill with Amendment.

ASSEMBLY RESUMED

Bill reported with Amendment.

HON SPEAKER: Having considered the Amendment, the Assembly has now finally passed the Bill and, therefore, concluded the business on this item. I shall now, in terms of Article 75(3), refer the Bill to the President to deal with it under Articles 56 and 65 of the Constitution. The Secretary will read the Second Order of the Day.

RECENT REVOLUTIONARY UPRISING IN THE ARAB MAGHREB AND MIDDLE EAST

HON SPEAKER: When this Debate was adjourned on Thursday, 16 June 2011, the Question before the Assembly was Motion by the Honourable Hamutenya. The Honourable Deputy Minister of Home Affairs and Immigration adjourned the Debate.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: The speakers who spoke before me, especially on this side, were correct by saying there is nothing we can learn from the uprising in the north. The Prime Minister put it clearly that these stories of regime change by all means will not work for us in Namibia. The founding Prime Minister, Comrade Geingob, was talking about "us and"

them." That time when some of the Colleagues were part of the big SWAPO team, they spoke the same language and now today we are speaking about "us and them."

I always want to wear my two hats, the one as the Chairman of the Library Council and the one as a Member of Parliament. The Government of Namibia from the word go in the nineties put a democratic process in place and then the Namibia Institute of Democracy stated in its booklet, "Building democracy perception and performance of Government and Opposition in Namibia" and I quote: "The blame must be put to the Opposition who have run out of steam and are too concerned about debating non-issues in the Assembly."

Some of the Colleagues spoke about Gaddafi and to us in Government and for us as a Party Gaddafi is second to none. We will always defend Gaddafi especially when he is being attacked by the imperialists and their allies. Some of the Colleagues who went to Libya brought along the Green Book in which Gaddafi explains what he has been doing. In this book there is also the Great Green Charter. (Intervention)

HON KAURA: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable Deputy Minister, are you supporting Gaddafi when he slaughters ten thousand of his own people?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Senior Member of Parliament, Honourable Kaura, you know what you are saying is not true; Gaddafi is just defending the revolution.

Democratic principles in northern Africa differ from ours. (Intervention)

HON RIRUAKO: May I ask a tiny question? Who handed over the power after twenty years? We are Members of Parliament, who handed over the power to a second person? We are supposed to be an example. The second question is, if there is a king or queen, how many years to the king or queen? How many years? Sixty years? If the person performs well and his citizens are happy, no school fees paid, no hospitals, everything is free.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: We in Namibia are quite fortunate that we chose from the word go to travel on the democratic road and we cannot be compared to any democratic road up there. As Namibians from all walks of life we agreed to travel on this road and we accept each other as part and parcel of this democratic road. From the beginning, the Government in its mature mind started to educate the people of Namibia how to vote. When the Government called the Opposition for voter education they boycotted it, they said it is a SWAPO thing. These booklets are available in the library for those who are interested in good faith in the democratic process. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: On a Point of Information. I want to agree with my Honourable Chief that those who are talking about regime change have for the past twenty years been leaders of their Parties for life – the RDP President for life, the DTA President for life, the UDF President for life and the list goes on. How can they talk about change?

HON KAURA: On the question that was raised on presidents for life, those living in glass houses should not throw stones. The founding President of this country was President of SWAPO for forty years.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: I am sorry to mention this but some of us keep on talking about our proud history as a Party, the Party that was led by Sam Nujoma who put us on that foundation that cannot be shaken by any anti-revolutionary spirit. (Intervention)

HON MOONGO: On a Point of Information. I would like to inform the House when they say that the UDF and the DTA have Presidents for life, that it is not true as we started from the Central Government to the other Central Government. Do you now want to overthrow it again and do what is happening in the Arab world?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: I want to remind those who have forgotten where we came from that on the 21st of November 1989 the first meeting of the Constituent Assembly elected Comrade Geingob as Chairperson. Comrade Sam Nujoma was chairing that meeting. My point is that we cannot learn anything from the north and I just want to underline the democratic culture of Namibia that we learned from Sam Nujoma. He said: "Namibia is a huge country with a small population. Therefore, all Namibians, regardless of colour, creed or place of origin, have a place in this beautiful country. It is for us only to reach out to one another and mould a Nation out of this culture." It means from the word go we were

HON KAPIA: May I ask the Honourable Deputy Minister a question? Honourable Kaiyamo, do you know the word "*counter-revolutionaries*" and can you explain the meaning?

on this democratic road. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Counter-revolutionaries are those people who sold out the revolution.

I will still continue to state that there is nothing to learn from those people. In 2007 when Comrade Sam Nujoma was stepping down, he said: "I am stepping down as President of the SWAPO Party with a full sense of fulfilment. I am proud to have worked with the SWAPO Party collectively. There were internal contradictions, most of them driven by tribalist, power hungry, unpatriotic and selfish individuals." (Intervention)

HON MOONGO: What you mean is that SWAPO is instigating the youth of DTA to overthrow their legitimate leadership or what?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: I want the young people to follow the history and to understand the historical mission SWAPO had. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: May I ask the Honourable Member just a small question? Comrade Kaiyamo, does it mean that this Motion is meant for the DTA because the DTA is afraid of what is happening there and now they bring it here because they want us to protect them? The youth realised that they are sell-outs and now the youth want to do away with them, therefore they bring it here under cover for us to protect them.

<u>HON KAURA</u>: Honourable Speaker, on a Point of Order. We have youth all over, we have the Kaaronda's and the Ngurare's, so now you

want to shoot and kill Karonda. This is the allegation which is in the newspapers. We have youth on both sides.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Honourable Kaura, you have read in the paper that the President said that the newspaper must report correctly. This information is not true.

Comrade Sam Nujoma went into retirement with pride and the President who took over from him said: "I have come to know his vision, his hopes and aspirations in this country. I am, therefore, committed to ensure that his legacy and vision of Namibia is maintained."

What I am saying is that we have been travelling on this democratic road and our leadership of the Party changed smoothly, which did not happen up in the north. Therefore, they can learn something from Namibia, not us from them.

The democratic process in Namibia is good. Comrade Pohamba maintained the vision of Sam Nujoma. We were at State House on Friday and in Monday's paper I saw those three candidates sitting together. Where in the world do you see this? Namibia has a democratic culture of cooperation.

To come back to the vocabulary of yesterday, the vocabulary in this book is different, it talks about combratos, imperialists and so on and that vocabulary has changed. The vocabulary we were taught as revolutionaries has changed. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND ATTORNEY-GENERAL: I am terribly sorry to interrupt the Honourable Member, but may I ask him a question? Honourable Deputy

Minister, you are talking combrato, bourgeoisie and all those things. At that particular point in time, who was the SWAPO Party Secretary for Information?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Everybody knows that this was Comrade Hidipo Hamutenya's initiative when he was in the Party and we learned from him all this vocabulary.

What is now happening in Libya is really a crime against humanity by NATO. When you were in Libya there were no bars and no bottle stores. Comrade Gaddafi used the money to feed his own people. In 1976 SWAPO went to Libya and we were given all we needed for the revolution. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: I am rising on a Point of Information. People should be talking about the suffering of the people of Libya, especially women and children who are dying. I feel the women of Africa should rise and start crying for their fellow women who are dying there and we should tell the truth, Comrade Speaker, the people of Libya are dying because of their oil and nothing else. It is not democracy, it is oil.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: If we look at the political programme of SWAPO, the SWAPO Members are committed to empower our people in that programme, to keep them focused. Political empowerment is in that programme, economic empowerment is in that programme, social empowerment, educational empowerment, health empowerment, housing empowerment, environmental empowerment and gender awareness. (Intervention)

21 June 2011 MOTION: SITUATION IN NORTH AFRICA AND THE MIDDLE EAST HON!NAWASES-TAYELE

HON MOONGO: On a Point of Information. In the sixties and seventies the policy of SWAPO was that when they take over, they will make sure that the bourgeoisie and the rich people are buried, but now you are the bourgeoisie.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Comrade Speaker, I fully agree with an earlier speaker that we cannot learn anything from this Motion; this Motion must be rejected because it only incites people. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable !Nawases-Tayele.

HON !NAWASES-TAYELE: Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I followed with interest and sadness the security situation and the ongoing military operation in Libya which caused death and injuries among the Libyan citizens and the massive destruction of infrastructure in the country is an atrocity of great proportions.

Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members, I am of the opinion that this situation is totally unacceptable. Africans and the rest of the international community should speak out loudly and clearly that the bombing of the countries are not the desired option. There is no question that Libya has been a reliable and consistent member of the African Union. It is also true that Libya has been successful in the development of infrastructure. Libya is one of the countries that are sponsoring the majority of the funds to the AU. Today those that are calling for regime change in Libya are the ones who were assisted by Libya even yesterday. The world is now witnessing the total destruction of all that has been achieved. It should also be noted that this level of destruction is directly and indirectly weakening Libya and the potential role which that country could play in the advancement and development on the continent. This is specifically referring to the oil.

21 June 2011 MOTION: SITUATION IN NORTH AFRICA AND THE MIDDLE EAST HON!NAWASES-TAYELE

Comrade Speaker, I come back to the International Criminal Court. The International Criminal Court needs to act responsibly before calling for a warrant of arrest for the Libyan leader. Who is responsible for casualties in the whole of Libya? Here we have been told that people are being killed every day. Is it only Libyan military forces that are killing people or where are the casualties also taking place? These are external forces who are involved there, who came in the name of protecting the civilians. Who are now protecting the civilians? Are the civilians not the ones dying every day under the hands of the external forces in the name of NATO? This already shows that the approach is one-sided, leaving out those responsible for the civilians' death in other parts of the country. This approach makes us to question the impartiality of the ICC in this matter and in general where it relates to Africa as a whole. This is like having a neighbour's house on fire and the rest of us are being passive and silent and we pretend as if nothing is happening. Honourable Speaker as Africans we need to speak out clearly.

Honourable Speaker, here I will refer back to the Pan-African Parliament resolution where Pan-African Parliamentarians expressed deep concern on the part of African Parliamentarians. What we are saying here is that we cannot remain indifferent to the situation in Libya. Comrade Speaker, I therefore quote the relevant paragraphs of the resolution on Libya adopted by the Pan-African Parliament, additional to what the Professor has already done:

"The Pan-African Parliament condemns the military aggression of NATO forces in the bombing of public facilities and infrastructure and residential areas and the targeted assassination of the leader of the country.

The Pan-African Parliament calls upon the international community to put an immediate end to this aggression to allow the Libyan people to settle its differences through dialogue, not through conflict.

The Pan-African Parliament calls for solidarity with Libya against the excessive violation by NATO forces in defiance of the resolution of the

Security Council UN 1970 and 1973 of 2011 by the imposition of economic embargoes and airstrikes against Libya.

The Pan-African Parliament welcomes the African initiative in seeking a peaceful solution to the crisis in Libya instead of procrastination."

Honourable Speaker, with these few remarks, I thank you for your attention.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Maamberua.

HON MAAMBERUA: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. I am going to do my statement in three parts. I will be looking at the parallels between the so-called Arab Spring and the situation in Namibia and I shall also look at the African response and finally, I will be looking at the question of oil discovery in Namibia, oil that is going to be regarded as a curse or as an opportunity.

First of all, I also have to register and note that in terms of the response from Namibia regarding the situation in Libya, the SWANU Women League was actually one of the first to condemn the aggression of NATO against the women and children of Libya and we are on record. I hope other Political Parties and other institutions will join us in that (Intervention)

HON SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned under automatic adjournment until tomorrow.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:45 UNTIL 2011.06.22 AT 14:30.

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS WINDHOEK 22 JUNE 2011

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

HON SPEAKER: Any Petitions? Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers?

TABLING: REPORTS OF THE AUDITOR-GENERAL

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: I lay upon the Table the Reports of the Auditor-General on the Accounts of –

- Village Council of Ruacana for the Financial Year ended 30 June 2010;
- Village Council of Leonardville for the Financial Year ended 30 June 2009;
- Village Council of Leonardville for the Financial Year ended 30 June 2007/2008.

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Member please table the Reports? Any Notice of Questions? Any Notice of Motions?

UNOPPOSED MOTION ON LIBYA

UNOPPOSED MOTION ON LIBYA HON KATJAVIVI

HON PROF KATJAVIVI: Honourable Speaker, I Move an unopposed Motion, that this Assembly, on behalf of the Parliament of the Republic of Namibia:

Recalls the United Nations Security Council Resolution 1973 of 26th of February 2011;

Reaffirms the African Union's Roadmap for a peaceful resolution of the Libyan crisis and the Motion of the Pan-African Parliament of May 2011;

Expresses its strongest disapproval of the military aggression of NATO forces in the bombing of public facilities, infrastructure and residential sites and the targeted assassination of the national leaders of Libya;

Expresses grave concern at the deteriorating security situation and ongoing military operations by NATO in Libya which is causing death and injuries to innocent civilians in Libya;

Urges the General Assembly and the Security Council of the United Nations to immediately stop their aggression to allow the people of Libya the opportunity for mutual acceptance and opening of dialogue to settle their differences peacefully;

Calls for the immediate and unconditional secession of the aggression and the withdrawal of NATO forces from the Libyan territory and to give full support to the United Nations and the African Union in their efforts to ensure peace and security;

Encourages the Libyan parties to the conflict to fully cooperate with the African Union to bring about lasting peace and stability in that African country;

Calls upon the African Union to mobilise humanitarian resources to aid the victims.

I so Move, Honourable Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: I take it that that enjoys the consensus of the House. Any further Notice of Motions? Any Ministerial Statements? The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

CONSIDERATION: NATIONAL POLICY ON CLIMATE CHANGE FOR NAMIBIA

HON SPEAKER: When this Debate was adjourned yesterday, 21 June 2011, the Question before the Assembly was a Policy by the Minister of Environment and Tourism. The Honourable Minister of Agriculture, Water and Forestry adjourned the Debate and I give him the Floor.

HON MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY:

Thank you, Comrade Speaker, for giving me the Floor to make a humble contribution to this very important subject matter of climate change.

The Honourable Netumbo Nandi-Ndaitwah, Minister of Environment and Tourism, the Deputy Minister, Honourable Herunga, the Permanent Secretary, Dr Kalumbi Shangala and other staff members of the Ministry are commended for finalising Namibia's National Policy on Climate Change and for eventually tabling it in this people's House for discussion and adoption. By definition a policy statement is nothing else but a course of action or a principle adopted by an individual or organisation that guides, directs or influences a person, an organisation, inclusive of a country's behaviour or course of action and direction. A policy is thus a guide, a guideline; it is a kind of a compass to direct an individual or an organisation.

Comrade Speaker, the objectives and intentions of Namibia's National Policy on Climate Change are clearly articulated in the Minister's Foreword and also in the Permanent Secretary's Preface in that document

that we are discussing.

I, for once, fully agree with the statement that "climate change is complex and its impact will affect (is already affecting) many sectors in Namibia. Impacts of climate change will also vary widely in different parts of the country." This is from pages 11 and 12 of the Policy Document.

I have taken note of the proposed strategies to address the impact of climate change on the water, food security, forestry and agriculture sectors on pages 12 and 13 of the document. We in the Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry have absolutely no reason at all not to embrace and endorse virtually all of those proposed strategies in the document.

Mr Scott T Firsing, an American in his book entitled "Disturbing Times" on page 48 has the following to say: "Our climate is changing. It has been changing for many decades, but it has only been in the last few years when events like Hurricane Katrina have taken place, that people have opened their eyes to see the extent of the damage we have done to the planet. Today it feels as if the future is unfolding right in front of us. Climatologists reporting for the United Nations Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change say we are seeing global warming caused by human activities and there are growing fears of feedbacks that will accelerate this warming."

Honourable Members of Namibia's National Assembly, in our own country, Namibia, extensive damaging floods were once again experienced during this year, 2011. This phenomenon was quite visible in some parts of the Karas Region where the Orange River was in flood, causing damage to crops. Even our roads and railways in that Region were washed away. Even if you go to our North-Central and North-Eastern Regions of country the water is still all over, although it is subsiding. Comrade Speaker, even in your Region and also mine, Erongo, the military base in Walvis Bay at one point was affected by floods – right there in the Namib Desert.

Agricultural activities and agricultural production are synonymous with and, indeed, inseparable from land, light, air and water. Undoubtedly,

these factors constitute the sustenance and prolongation of life on earth as we know it. Regrettably, both land and water can easily become victims of climate change and environmental degradation. This is particularly true of both livestock rearing and crop production. It goes without saying, therefore, that inadequate and/or insecure access to water for consumption and land for productive uses is a serious constraint to poverty reduction in many areas, both urban and rural. On the other hand, excessive water or rain is also not good for agricultural production. Proper land use or land management is absolutely important to ensure quality agricultural production, particularly that and when agriculture is understood to include the raising of every kind of plant and animal that is useful to human beings and all the people and services that help bring agricultural products to the world's markets and to the tables in our kitchens.

As farmers we must always remember that plants grow in the earth's thin skin of top soil. Surely, because only such a small portion of the earth's surface can be used to produce crops, but it is absolutely important that farmers do a good job of managing the soil. It simply means that we must take care of the soil so that it does not become exhausted and is not eroded by rain and wind.

Obviously, I cannot claim to be a specialist on the subject of climate change, but climate change, as it is manifesting itself today, has many ramifications and consequences – political consequences, consequences in terms of food production and, obviously there are also consequences for life itself as we know it. It is also an undeniable, visible truth that the effects of climate change are felt at individual, household, village, country, sub-regional, continental and global levels. It is, therefore, not an imaginary illusionary, academic, intellectual proposition to talk about climate change, but it is a fact of life today.

The 21st century, in which we live, as is the case with the 20th century, is centuries of complex, complicated and unpredictable geo-politics. We must accept the fact that we no longer live in a world which is exclusively dominated by territorial struggles between powerful competing power blocks only, but in a world which is essentially driven by many other things, good and bad, things like emerging transnational problems,

globalisation of economic activities, globalisation of politics where the power and sovereignty of some nations and States are constantly threatened. We have the phenomenon of regime change, where those who are powerful can decide on the basis of what the country has, can determine the agenda how that specific country should be ruled and by whom, with those sovereign States having very little power at its disposal. We are living in a world where global flows of trade and investments are obvious, the world of environmental degradation. We are living in a world where the natural resources, as we know them, as was created, are also being threatened by depletion. That is serious because once the natural resources are depleted the competition by human beings for whatever available resource becomes more fierce and aggressive. It is a world of transnational pollution, because if justly reflected, it is a world of immense technological advances, but have we reflected on all the effects of these technological advances on poorer nations?

Comrade Speaker, last month there was a programme on the BBC dealing with the dumping of television sets once they become useless. I watched that programme carefully and some of these things are secretly dumped on some parts of the continent of Africa and Ghana was mentioned. Sometimes it is done under the pretext that they are usable while the effects of these things on the health and the people are enormous. That is the world in which we live today and these are the things that we must look at when we deal with climate change and its effects.

Climate change, as a result of human activities, in changing the global atmosphere may lead to weather changes and we are seeing it already. Once you have these changes in the weather that you cannot predict, as Honourable Riruako was saying yesterday, whether it is winter or summer, all these things can upset global agricultural activity. Once that is upset is will also in a way induce political strives, because when the agricultural productivity of nations is affected and nations become food insecure, surely even us who are supposed to sit in the National Assembly will definitely not come here. We will be rioting and, therefore, I am arguing that once that happens, it upsets many things, including the political stability of a particular Nation. I am not wishing that it will happen, but neither should we close our eyes to these things that are

happening.

Resource shortage, mainly as a result of environmental degradation, may lead to serious conflicts in some places of the world. Scarcity of critical environmental resources, for example, minerals, fuel, crop land, fresh water, forests, fish stocks are powerfully and visibly contributing to incitements, mass violence, conflicts and wars in many parts of the world. It is not a theoretical proposition because if you analyse the major conflicts in the world today, including some of the conflicts in Africa, the conflicts in Iraq, Libya and many others, there is something called a natural resource. They can tell you they want democracy, human rights, but that is just at the surface. Deep down must be something more valuable that those who are powerful are looking for and that is the issue of the natural resources, because some of those who are powerful may not have these types of resources at home and will go out of their way to get the resource wherever it is available and when that resource is available in a State which is conceived to be weak, of course they will find ways to get to the resource.

Honourable Speaker I, therefore agree with those who argue and believe that in today's global globalising village where we are witnessing increasing stresses on the earth's life support system and renewable natural resources as a result of many causes and factors, but including environmental degradation and climate change, profound implications for human health and welfare are the inevitable negative consequences. If not properly managed and controlled, our common heritage, the earth and all its contents will not be destroyed by wars, but by human activities through climate change.

The health of the world economy itself depends on avoiding the depletion of renewable natural resources. Developing countries, including our own, have already suffered significant reductions in productivity because of soil loss, deforestation and other forms of environmental degradation.

Last week at Onankali in the Oshikoto Region I was interacting with the Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry staff in that Region and they were briefing me on their various activities. One scientist working at the

Okashana Research Station there said they have a problem to explain to the farmers. At Okashana they produce these drought resistant seeds. We know Namibia is an arid country and, therefore, the research programme in this particular area was geared towards producing drought resistant seeds, but now we have floods and, therefore, when you plant that seed which is meant for an area with little rain, it is ineffective and the farmers are saying they are selling seed that are not good enough. Obviously my answer to the researcher was that it is a question of us adapting. Instead of just concentrating on producing drought resistant seeds, we must be ready to research what type of seed is suitable for too much water. These are the things that we must take into account and be ready to adapt. Whatever the climate brings, we must be able to survive.

As a result of too much water in those areas, obviously there are too many insects, including mosquitoes which are causing serious problems. Honourable Kamwi can talk about the effects of the mosquitoes on human beings, but the livestock die because they cause Rift Valley Fever which is a serious disease. These are all caused by the climate and we as human beings must work out strategies to adapt and live.

Finally, Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members, yes, under these challenging circumstances I agree that mitigation and adaptation are important strategies, but for many of us it is even more important that terminologies such as mitigation and adaptation must be further explained to the ordinary people and the farmers to understand what it means in the specific localities where they find themselves. Unless we do that to empower the farmers to work out mitigating and adaptive strategies, we are not doing much. The researchers at our institutions of higher learning have a challenge because the researchers must be up front in studying natural phenomena, the effects of climate change and pre-warn all of us about what is coming our way. They must do experiments in the laboratories and I would like to urge that the results of those experiments must find practical application in the real world, the real situation.

Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members, I do support this very important policy document, the National Policy on Climate Change for Namibia, 2011. I thank you.

<u>HON SPEAKER</u>: Thank you for the very comprehensive contribution, Honourable Minister. Minister of Health.

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Thank you, Honourable Speaker, Sir, for giving me the floor to make a humble contribution to this important policy, the National Policy on Climate Change for Namibia, 2011. Indeed, I rise to support this Policy.

First, I join Comrade John Mutorwa in commending the efforts of the Honourable Minister Netumbo Nandi-Ndaitwah, her Deputy Minister and the Permanent Secretary, Dr Kalumbi Shangula, for addressing the challenges of the effects of climate change we are faced with, as a developing country through this Policy.

One cannot agree more that, given the reliance of the majority of our population on climate sensitive sectors, such as that of agriculture and in terms of what my senior Colleague elaborated on, addressing agronomy and animal husbandry, the potential impacts of these changes can be disastrous.

Climate change adversely affects some of the most fundamental determinants of health, whether we talk of food, the air we breathe and, above all, water as a vehicle for most of the waterborne related ailments or diseases. The warming of the planet appears to be gradual, but the increasing frequency and severity of extreme weather events, such as the intense storms, heat waves, droughts and, in our own situation in Namibia we are talking of the worst floods to be recorded in well over eighty years as we are informed by the climatologists in this country. The consequences can already be acutely felt in our own situation.

The sum total of these negative events is bouncing negatively in the health and agricultural sectors. In this regard, the earliest and most severe threat in Namibia is the negative implementation for us in the health sector to achieve the related Millennium Development Goals, especially when you talk of MDG 4, 5 and 6.

Comrade Mutorwa spoke of the mosquitoes. We were already informed of an outbreak of mosquitoes in the Oshikoto Region, which we came to identify as *Culex quinque fasciatus*. Fortunately in our own situation this is not a disease vector, but in the northern parts of Africa and Asia it is a vector of many diseases, including Rift Valley Fever. Fortunately this is not the case in Namibia but a vector for other diseases, including *elephantiasis filariasis* in countries such as Tanzania, Kenya and other West African states on the continent are adversely affected by these mosquitoes.

Yes, indeed, in our own situation we are almost on the verge of eliminating malaria. According to the WHO already two years ago Namibia was one of those countries which was earmarked to eliminate malaria, because we had managed to almost eradicate the malaria vectors, including *Anopheles* mosquitoes, *Anopheles funestus*, *Anopheles Gambiae* remain a challenge. (Intervention)

HON NEHOVA: May I put a question to the Minister, please? The Honourable Minister is using strange names and maybe it would be beneficial to us if he could in short explain those terminologies as we do not understand.

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Thank you very much, I will do just that. Anopheles arabiensis and Anopheles funestus are the vectors of malaria in the whole southern Africa. Indeed, these are the vectors in our own republic. We have managed since Independence to date to fight against these mosquitoes. We have managed to eliminate *Anopheles Gambiae* and *Anopheles funestus* because they are all indoor-resting mosquitoes with the persistent use of DDT 75% wettable powder, spraying the malariaous areas, we were able to do so. However, we are now left with the *Anopheles arabiensis*, which is a mosquito that rests both indoors and outdoors and it is very difficult to control. However, we are getting there.

Again, with this climate change that we are experiencing floods from the northern part of our common border with Angola and Zambia, they still have all these vectors and as the water flows, the eggs are using water as a vehicle, meaning we remain at risk. Similarly, we have managed to bring down the impact of HIV/AIDS in this country. In terms of AIDS as a disease the death rate has declined tremendously, but again, with the flood situation that we experienced in this country, certainly it has had some side-effects in terms of our clients getting their medical supplies timeously. Similarly, it goes without saying that in terms of the maternal mortality we had brought it down from 449 per 100 000 to 18 per 100 000. Yes, deaths are still being experienced, but that was a significant reduction. However, what did we experience for the past four, five months as a result of the effects of climate change? We experienced some negative effects in this area.

The emergence and re-emergence of infectious diseases, the heat stress and respiratory illnesses are all indications of how climate change directly facilitates the illness both for acute and chronic diseases in this country.

Honourable Speaker, Sir, it is, therefore, essential to formulate a clear response in order to protect the human health and to ensure that it is placed at the centre of the climate Debate.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, commenting on the insight of the Policy, I am glad that the Policy addresses some of these concerns. For example, the objectives cited from page 7 to 9 are, in my view, all smart in terms of the definition of an objective. However, I want to agree with my Colleague, the Honourable Deputy Minister of Finance, when he made some comments in addressing Objective 5. Surely the industrialised countries, especially those whose skies are at all times smoky, are making a contribution to pollution and climate change.

The other focus area is the climate change predictions for Namibia as a developing country.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:40 HOUSE RESUMED AT 16:20 PURSUANT TO ADJOURNMENT

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Thank you, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members. The other focus area is related to climate change predictions for Namibia as a developing country and that there is a need for an early warning system to be put in place. By so doing we will be ready and prepared to respond.

The National Policy on Climate Change on page 5 addresses areas such as climate models, predicting annual temperatures ahead of time. These are useful, as was with the case of what is cited here in one of the reports for the GRN during 2002. These would assist in terms of awareness, informing those who should do that to get themselves prepared to respond timeously, as cited on page 14, in the case of human health and well-being of fellow Namibians.

My final contribution relates to the importance of research and information. *Forewarned is fore-armed*. Little is known regarding the manner in which the climate system, its components and its interactions will respond to climate change in our own environment or in the entire country, for that matter. In this regard, the proposals that are made in 4.1.1 regarding research and information needs is most welcome. We look forward to its implementation.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I support the National Policy on Climate Change for Namibia, 2011. Thank you very much.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Dr Abraham Iyambo.

HON MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. I also fully support this timely policy, our National

Policy on Climate Change.

Honourable Speaker, nature is reacting to what we have done to it. Humanity has abused nature, therefore nature is now disturbed, it feels threatened and it is reacting to human actions. (Intervention)

HON KAURA: May I ask the Honourable Minister a question? Honourable Minister, human civilisation as we know it emerged ten thousand years ago along the Nile, the Ganges, the Yellow River, Euphrates, Tigress and the Amazon and by that time when human civilisation started emerging, when they started settling along the big rivers, the earth has gone through many changes – the Jurassic Age when we had dinosaurs that have disappeared, the Ice Age when the ice of Antarctica came up as far as Keetmanshoop and then it receded to where it is now in the Antarctica Circle. Climate change is not a new phenomenon; it has changed through millions of years. Why do we talk as if it is a new a new phenomenon that the climate is changing. It has been changing over the last three billion years? Why are we talking about it now as if the human being is changing it, because it has changed even before the human being arrived on Planet Earth and started settling along the big rivers?

HON MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Yes, you are correct, there is something called evolution and this evolution is according to different times and different circumstances. Before ten thousand years ago, as you just mentioned, the changes were for different reasons. At the moment, because of the avalanche of sciences and development, we can accurately measure what exactly is causing the changes. With respect, little was really documented on what exactly was happening during the time you referred to, for example, to the temperature as well as to the carbon emissions that is now there because of industrialisation. That was not accurately measured, but yes, I agree with Honourable Kaura that we are living in an unpredictable type of world.

Today we think we know what is happening, but the reality is that we do not know what is happening. The scientists will say that they know what is happening, but the reality is that we do not know. What we have is more prediction what is going to happen. Yes, what happened we know is true, what is going to happen are more predictions and I agree with Honourable Kaura that we cannot say things with certainties; things have been changing with time.

I am saying humanity has abused nature and we are reaping what we have sown. The question is, is the world, is Africa, is Namibia prepared to adapt? There is nothing we can do. All we can do, as the Right Honourable Prime Minister was saying during the floods, is to adapt. We do not have any cure to stop the changes happening at the moment, but to adapt.

The other question is who is responsible for what is happening? Are the poor people responsible for climate change? Are those with heavy industries responsible for climate change? All the scientific information demonstrates that yes, heavy industries have contributed significantly to climate change, not the poor African person. However, who has benefited from climate change in terms of industrialisation, the development of industries? The poor person or industrialised nations? Maybe the industrialised nations. The question is, should Africans together with developed countries flow in terms of industrialisation or should it be allowed or stopped? Who has caused the damage to our environment? The truth is it is the industrialised nations. If we have to pay, one would say they should pay more than the developing countries.

When I look at page 3 of the policy document, there is a point that we as a country must look at and this is the paragraph that reads that with respect to water resources, even in the absence of significant climate change, Namibia is predicted to suffer complete water scarcity by the year 2020. That one is really directed to us as lawmakers; that by the year 2020 Namibia are predicted to suffer complete water scarcity. Maybe it is too extreme to say "complete water scarcity" as that would mean there will not be water. It is a prediction, looking at the different models of the weather patterns, of what is happening at the sea, but if it is what is

predicted, then we should also ask what will happen to some of our own plans and what options do we have. For example, with respect to Vision 2030 we need to produce food, we need to have a sea that is productive and what will be the impact. Therefore, as leaders we should continue to develop more policies, looking at what is going to happen.

The other point I want to mention before I proceed is the issue raised on page 5 of the policy document that reads that rainfall reductions of 10 to 30% of the present are predicted for the entire country by 2050 and 2080. It means that as from now we as a country have to continue preparing how we are going to mitigate and adapt to these environmental changes.

Honourable Speaker, Namibia benefits from both agriculture as well as from the Fisheries Sector. Surely the productivity of the Benguela will be negatively affected because the predictions are that the temperatures will increase, which will mean the survival of the eggs and small animals at sea will be affected. Oxygen is likely to decrease as a result of the higher temperature. That would be both at sea as well as territorial.

Weather changes, whether it is going to be too cold or too warm, are a reality. Wildfires will affect the farmers and many of us are upcoming farmers. It is predicted that heat waves and storms will be quite severe and now that earthquakes are linked to environmental perturbations, one can ask what will happen to our Regions and the different plants. Many of the floods many of the plants were submerged and what would happen if we are going to have voluminous waters?

The prediction in this document is that Namibia will be much hotter and an arid country. The question is what is going to happen with respect to the droughts? The farmers will be affected, crop production will be affected and what are the options in terms of terminology if the country is affected by droughts? Are there other options of growing plants for us to survive and to ensure that there is also vegetation for livestock?

The questions are many and we as leaders are on the right track as we debate this issue of climate change in the world.

The Honourable Minister of Health spoke about diseases and that is likely with more floods and more inflow of different animals and birds from other parts of the world the more they are threatened where they are. Of course, birds are the ones who carry all the different bacteria and many of the diseases are caused by cross-fertilisation of mainly these diseases from different countries. Nobody knows where the Ebola came from; maybe the Minister of Health can tell us.

Honourable Speaker, we are saying we have unemployment because there is no employment, but if the key industries, such as agriculture, will be affected, we must bear in mind that our population is communal-based people. We should think differently, should we concentrate on greenhouse, should we concentrate on other areas to produce vegetables and not necessarily from the field.

The prediction is that storms will increase and should the top soil be lost because of these floods and storms, it means the soil will be much more infertile, hence the agricultural sector will be affected.

The migration to the cities by our people are likely to increase as they are flooded, the *oshanas* are full, infrastructure is destroyed. They are likely to say the towns will be much safer, which is not the reality as these days even Walvis Bay is flooded, not because of the sea. If that sea was to rise, as predicted, what would happen to Walvis Bay? If it is raining inland, considering that the town is so flat and we do not know how to control the water, how will those people survive? We are asking all these questions because nature is very angry.

The question should be who is responsible for all these? The temperature is likely to rise, the wind patterns are likely to change, the heat waves will change and food production will be affected. The question remains, who is responsible and I do believe that the industrialised world should not leave the developing world without assistance. They should assist the developing world.

What is our possible response as a country with respect to climate change? The environment has been disturbed and there is little that one can do.

Only the omnipotent is likely to say "up to here", but in our case there is little we can do. We can predict. We can have remote sensing units to predict what is happening with the temperature. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: I am sorry to interrupt the high quality input, but you are talking about the industrialised countries helping the developing countries and before you conclude I want to hear your views on the issue of the dumping of toxic waste in the developing countries.

HON MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Honourable Colleague, we have been following events in the world and that is the fear. When you are exporting fishery products, the first thing you are looking at is those contaminants, whether your sea has been contaminated. One has to look carefully at the contamination of the sea. If you dump contaminants at sea, you should know that you are at risk as it will not remain static where it is dumped. If you dump it somewhere in the north of the country, the same contaminant will catch up with you. Those contaminants are in the water and this gigantic sea is not dead, it is transporting all these toxins. In terms of the currents and the earth movements and all the cycles that the sea makes, there have been theories that if you dump it here it will go in a certain direction, therefore people are quite careful.

Not much has been done intentionally because people are worried. For example, oil spillage can contribute to death of animals at sea. When the oil is being burnt, the ashes will be falling somewhere, either on our fields or in our seas and this is changing because now the carbon is increasing in the air.

Honourable Speaker, the question is that if Namibia is hit by starvation, for example, what are the options for us as leaders if there is going to be famine and malnutrition. It is for us to continue thinking about the way forward.

With respect to the area of education, it is very important that as a country we continue thinking of introducing in our school curriculum some subjects to deal with the environment. The environment has already been insulted and offended and it is angry. We will put that in the curriculum to see how our young people and the future generation will be able to look more at the environment and use different mechanisms in terms of adaptation. There is a need for us to continue looking at the introduction of environmental subjects in our curriculum.

Another issue is the building of research and analytical capacity for Namibia. Yes, we can build the capacity, but now we are saying this is going to be unpredictable and even though it is predictable, there is nothing we can do. If you hear there is going to be an earthquake somewhere outside Namibia, what will you do? Will you remove the people or what will you do? If we are predicting an environmental disturbance, it is for the public to be able to say we should move or not move. The tsunami was predicted, but many people said it is not possible and what was the sensitisation?

The scientists of the world should not frighten the public too much. I recall ten years ago somebody in Swakopmund came to see us as we were responsible for fisheries and whatever was happening at sea, that the sea is going to rise up to Usakos. I do not know whether the Speaker heard Then I was told that I should announce that all those in about it. Swakopmund and Walvis Bay should move immediately and the person who was saying so is a scientist by profession and he said he was going to move very quickly to the Caprivi Region. After we met with him, we asked to see his predictions. He was talking about what was happening with NASA, with the other remote sensor unit where you can tell from here what is happening in other parts of the world and then he could not convince. I kept quiet, I did not even tell the Founding President that time, I did not tell my Colleagues, but I could not sleep, I was worried about what would happen if Usakos would be submerged. Therefore, the scientists or those with knowledge also sometimes frighten us with what is going to happen. (Intervention)

HON MAAMBERUA: May I ask a small question? Since you are talking about scientists who do not seem to be predicting the environmental impacts and the consequences and seem to be misleading us, do we have a science and technology commission in Namibia that would help us to understand and guide our research in these areas of the environment, etcetera, for better future planning in Namibia?

HON MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Let me correct the President of SWANU. I am not saying that the scientists are just going around saying so, I am saying there are specific individuals who have scientific knowledge who are sometimes being sensational and this can frighten the general public. Imagine if I gave that recommendation to the nation, what disaster just simply because somebody was making a mockery of all these things. I am just appealing to the scientists worldwide to be more responsible, but I am also telling the leaders that whenever we have scientific advice from the scientists, we should not ignore it, either to do with agriculture or fisheries. We must listen to the scientists and plan with them. Those individuals are people who are irresponsible and we are saying - let those who do that not do it here in Namibia.

When I was dealing with fisheries there were times when I was really under a lot of pressure. Are you protecting the fish or should you protect human beings? Then you say - I want to protect fish for now so that I protect the survival of the country in the future. So, the whole issue for the world globally to listen to the scientists is very important and the same with agricultural issues, we need to listen to the scientists.

There is a need to develop green technologies particularly for agriculture seeing that our environment has been disturbed, but we should also develop capacity to monitor what is happening, starting with our institutions of higher learning.

In terms of the instruments that deal with this issue of climate change, the Kyoto Protocol in particular, we know that many of the bigger countries... (Intervention)

22 June 2011 NATIONAL POLICY ON CLIMATE CHANGE HON DR A IYAMBO

<u>HON KAURA</u>: May I ask a question? Honourable Minister, who disturbed the environment that led to the existence of the Sahara and the Namib Deserts? The industrial revolution started barely three hundred years ago with the discovery of the Spinning Ginny. The internal combustion engine started in 1883 or so and the Model T Ford was manufactured in 1915 with the internal combustion engine, barely a hundred years ago. The world has been changing every since. We found the Namib and the Sahara Desert there, now you are saying the environment has been disturbed. Who disturbed it before all these things have come into being?

HON MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Nobody can tell you why we have all these continents, why Africa was separated from the other parts of the earth. Nobody can tell you, everybody will just theorise, but with more incisive, scientific knowledge one will be able to tell what has happened below the surface in terms of the earth turning and those forces. Nobody will be able to say it was because of A and B. We live in this world where all is prediction, where all is guessing, but the good thing is that we can predict and they are really happening. We are predicting, for example, that by the year 2020 Namibia is going to have a scarcity of water. It is not very far, it is before 2030. The question is, come the year 2030 and we still have some water, the question Honourable Kaura will be asking will be, "what happened there?" We are living in a world of predictions and with nature you cannot be quite accurate.

Honourable Speaker, I would like to support this very important document but we as leaders should continue planning and thinking what we will do when there is going to be a famine. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: On a Point of Information. I think for the interest of the public and the youth I am representing, there are two parallel theories here. Listening to Honourable Kaura and Honourable Iyambo, I think may from an academic theoretical point of view be accurate. The two

22 June 2011 NATIONAL POLICY ON CLIMATE CHANGE HON DR A IYAMBO

schools of thought are very accurate. Honourable Kaura can advance that line of thought, it is correct when he is talking about evolution, but Dr Iyambo is also correct on how the human behaviour, our technological innovations are causing environment changes, especially to the ozone. (Intervention)

HON SPEAKER: I do not know whether you are posing a question.

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: No, I am rising a Point of Information to reconcile the two theories, because a young listener will be confused, it will appear as if the two theories are in conflict with each other.

HON MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Honourable Speaker, yes, we are being forewarned, we are being prepared as a Nation to think of climate change. The only truth is that the world is not coming to an end; it is very, very far from coming to an end. However, let us as leaders prepare ourselves in terms of research and technology and where we can do things differently and adapt, let us do so. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: May I ask a question? Yesterday when I was reading through some of these effects predicted when we continue with the global warming and climate change, things like the rise in sea levels and the rise in disease levels, also things like the vegetation will change apparently and the whole ecosystem will too; that tells us a lot. What do you think theoretically we should do as Governments, as continents, as Ministries responsible and as individuals to prepare, because indeed the globe is warming and recently we read in the news that the sun has cracked. What do you expect?

22 June 2011 NATIONAL POLICY ON CLIMATE CHANGE HON DR A IYAMBO

HON SPEAKER: What we are debating is the policy document and at the end we will arrive at consensus at what we should do. We are not quite there yet, so just make your contribution.

HON MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I would like to thank Honourable Ankama. I think on the way forward we should just say that climate change is real, but the proposition from the Right Honourable Prime Minister is that we should just learn to adapt. There is very little we can do but to adapt and to continue our planning.

The issue whether the sun has cracked, I have to find out from the scientists as I do not know how big that crack is and it worries me. I just want to thank you, Honourable Speaker, and to say that the world is not coming to an end. (Intervention)

<u>HON MAAMBERUA</u>: I have a small question. Having been a senior Minister in a science related Ministry, would you be able to enlighten us whether we in Namibia have an institutional framework that would guide this country in science research, so that when we come up with these policies on climate change and many other related policies, they are actually guided by some policy framework, generally speaking, an umbrella policy framework. If there is none, would you recommend such to be established?

HON MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The Ministers who were at the helm of the Ministry of Education did an exceptionally good job, a wise approach indeed, starting with the Right Honourable Prime Minister, Minister Mutorwa and Minister Mbumba. At the moment we have in the country a Research, Science and Technology Act to deal with issues of research. We are in the process of establishing what you asked earlier on, a Research Commission just to deal with all these issues of research to ensure that research is well-coordinated. At the moment we are not that

well-coordinated in terms of talking to each other. You find that the Ministry of Agriculture do their research, the Ministry dealing with Fisheries will do their own research, the Ministry of Environment and Tourism will do their research, the Ministry of Health and Social Services will do their research, very good research, but the coordination is needed so that when we are funding research and technology we know that we are doing this centrally. To answer your question, we are very soon going to establish a Research Commission which is already under the law that this House has already passed.

Honourable Speaker, I want to thank you very much and, indeed, no fear, only to prepared and to plan ahead. Thank you very much.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Honourable Bezuidenhoudt.

HON BEZUIDENHOUDT: Honourable Speaker Thank you for the opportunity to participate in this debate. My sincere congratulations go to the Minister and staff for producing the National Policy on Climate Change for Namibia, 2011. It is a document that, from my analysis, is comprehensive, detailed and it addresses issues of our anticipated exposure to the devastating effects of climate change in Namibia and also our collective responses to this challenge.

My focus would not be on whether it is real or true, but I would focus on what is happening to Mother Earth, which is angry at times — the tsunamis, earthquakes, severe drought, flooding. When I look at the evidence, I conclude that climate change is real and has affected our existence in one way or the other and will continue doing so unless we learn to adapt and adapt fast.

Climate change is possibly the greatest environmental challenge facing the world this century and Namibia is no exception. Climate change is sometimes referred to as global warming, which is more about the serious

disruptions of the entire world's weather and climatic patterns, including rainfall, extreme weather events, the rising of sea levels and all that was enumerated so far. We, as part of the developing world, face greater challenges than the developed world when it comes to the impact of climate change and also the capacity to respond to it. However, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, this is not a doomsday subject, as the Honourable Minister of Education said, this is not doomsday, it is just forewarning that we must adapt and take certain responses to certain inputs that we have made over a long period of time.

The actual policy is a home-grown policy and I have deduced that when I looked at the bibliography at the back. It is all based on papers, surveys, research, academic studies on Namibia prior to the development of this policy. As I previously said, the policy also covers a wide range of areas that we have to deal with and which are relevant to Namibia and it proposes very effectively how it wants to deal with the cross-cutting nature of climate change, that is to say that Government, Ministries, Agencies, all Political Office-Bearers in this House, all citizens, all social partners in communities and economic groupings, in short, all Namibians, have a very decisive role to play in living and executing this policy on a daily basis.

In the foreword of this document, the Honourable Minister in (ii) stresses that "the importance of alternative energy sources, such as solar, wind, biomass, of which Namibia is particularly well-endowed with must be looked at" and when I read that, I went to our most important document as a nation and I read Chapter 11, with the heading, "Principles of State Policy" and particularly when it comes to subsection (l), we will be compelled to look, revisit and re-decide on some of our plans we envisage for the future based on this policy. The Minister has thus indicated that there are some areas that need adaptation or changes.

I will specifically highlight one – not in order of importance – which is nuclear power generation. We probably need to rethink on that one, not to abandon but to look at safer and improved technologies. The unpredictability of nature, as influenced by climate change, must caution us in the light of the after-effects of the earthquake in Japan earlier this

year. We need to revisit this specific way generating power while we have abundance of sun and other natural means. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT:

Honourable Speaker, may I ask my Colleague a question? You are saying we need to rethink and relook. Some astronauts went to the moon and even to Mars and research life on the other side. They say the moon is rocky, but these days they are saying it is habitable although they are not too sure whether the water is drinkable. Are you contemplating that we perhaps go along those lines and see whether we can also join them on the moon or Mars?

HON BEZUIDENHOUDT: I would urge us to first concentrate on this world before we start believing what is on the outside, because man has messed up this planet and without solving the problem he has created he wants to run to other places.

The Strategy on pages 15 and 16 calls for the promotion of renewable energy at all levels and I hope all levels will include what Honourable Kazenambo yesterday indicated, the household use of trees.

The nineteen strategies, as detailed in the Policy on pages 11 to 23, are addressing the areas where we as a Nation must focus. There is a saying that what one cannot measure ever gets done. I want to change it positively, that what gets measured also gets done and with that I would like to recommend to the Ministry to look into a comprehensive plan by the designated national authority to measure the outputs of the various sectors involved, so that the outputs of all relevant stakeholder can be fed into a national model, so that we know whether all our plans and actions do yield the desired results. That would be something like an integrated assessment model.

The world is talking about US\$100 billion for the Adaptation Fund but they are only talking about it, nobody has opened a wallet, because they

play this chicken and egg game, that the countries which must be helped to adapt must first do a, b, c, before they give money and the countries are saying they must first give the money so that we can tell you what is the a b, and c. These are the countries which have the biggest role in this whole challenge that we face.

The Minister has also made it clear in the Policy that there will be strategies how to access these funds and we as a country must just be ready, that when the call for proposals realises, we submit our proposals. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: I would like to find out from the Honourable Member, the concerns that we have in this Honourable House as policymakers, compared to the negative effects that Namibia contributes to climate change and the contribution to negativity of climate change by industrial countries who have all the knowledge and technology, no more than ourselves, even our scientists, small in number as they are, do you not agree that it seems there is no seriousness from the side of the politicians of industrialised countries? The example is what happened in Copenhagen, in Cancun and now we are waiting to see what will happen in Durban. Are we likely to see a change of heart in Durban *vis-á-vis* this climate change or is it only because we will be the ones to be more affected by climate change than developed countries and, therefore, they worry less?

HON BEZUIDENHOUDT: I totally agree with you. It is the developed countries who have through the years contributed massively to this challenge. The contribution by the developing world to this situation all the inhabitants of this earth is facing is minimal.

On the question of the seriousness of the developed world, I would put it in this instance as hypocrisy, because they know very well what they did and what their moral responsibility should be, but because they do not want to acknowledge that, they keep on playing the game of Copenhagen, Cancun and, I suspect, even Durban may come to an end without any

agreement signed.

Although it is an international challenge, some of these developed countries treat it as a domestic problem, because if they do agree on certain measures, their own economies may suffer in one way or the other and I used the word hypocrisy and that goes together with selfishness because they do not want to abandon their own toxic ways of living to improve the rest of the world, but to stay put with their policies so that they can survive and then play this game of hide and seek.

As I said, when we want to access the funds, I do not want us to be beggars, that "please give us", but I think these nations have an obligation to contribute proportionally to the challenge and that the United Nations Framework on Climate Change must be firm and fair in the handling of that Fund, to give all nations affected, big and small, equal access for the adaptation of technologies to address this issue.

In addition to that recommendation, I would also like to recommend to the designated authority that will manage this programme, to see its way clear to update this House annually through a Report, so that we can be kept abreast on how we are improving or not improving in our own situation in trying to address these various issues. That will be in addition to the diligent oversight function that will be played by the Standing Committee of this Parliament as envisaged in the document and that is the Committee on Economics, Natural Resources and Public Administration.

In summary, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I want to state about five issues:

Firstly, let us recognise the reality and the gravity of the challenge and by that I mean, let us not play with which signs are correct, whether it is hoax or a reality. Let us look around us at what is happening in nature, what is happening in our environment in our own lifetime and recognise the reality and the severity of the challenge.

As a country we should subscribe to the principle of "polluter must pay", as suggested by Honourable Schlettwein yesterday and I have elaborated

on that one. That should be a policy position of our country.

The third is that the impact of climate change must not be underestimated. It is rather the impact and the implications that at this point in time remain uncertain, because we are not in a position to say x-number degrees will definitely be added onto this and that and Namibia will be swamped with rain or Namibia will be severely dry. Those are uncertain elements but the impact of it all must not be underestimated at all.

The fourth recommendation would be to encourage us to decide on the right technology going forward in many of the plans still to be implemented. The example I used was nuclear power generation. Let us also recognise that the solution to all this will be international. We have a role to play but it will mostly come from the international community, but we must formulate our own arguments and positions along the lines that I have described earlier, namely our contribution, our rights, our entitlements, that polluters must pay and that we must clearly articulate our position in international forums. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: May I ask a question? I did not want to interrupt you at the beginning, but there is something I wanted to ask you when you talked about the responsibility of the international community. I am particularly going to ask you this question because you are from a corporate background. When people talk about the principle of "polluter must pay", which I totally agree with, exactly who in the West is it that is supposed to pay? Is it the Government, the private sector, the NGOs? Is it not an illusion to expect the West to pay while we know how their society is structured? Also, the problems we experience in the world today are because of corporate Governments that have taken over power in those countries and they are advancing the interests of the corporate world. The wars in countries are because of the interests of the oil magnets. I want you to address the issue from this perspective to give clarity to Africans and others who are under the illusion that the West will ever undermine the interest of the corporate world which the faithfully advocate.

HON BEZUIDENHOUDT: Thank you very much for the question. I would answer it in this way: First of all, we are all members of the United Nations and we have all signed the various protocols and we must honour those. The polluters – and I will dare to mention them by name – are the United States, the European Union, Britain, Russia, Japan, China, India, all those countries that have made massive advances in terms of development. They must, through their own tax structures, raise funds from the corporate to pay the contributions to the United Nations Framework for Climate Change. That is where I see the polluter must pay.

When it comes to who owns the Governments of those various countries, obviously – and you will again see it next year – the presidential campaign in the United States is massively funded by the corporate world and it is a whole lifestyle in US politics to have lobbyists and people to do presentations, just to buy influence within either the White House, the Senate or the House of Representatives, to ensure that policies like this are tailor-made to their liking.

With regard to Africa having illusions, I would say it is the duty of this Namibian National Assembly, as per this document and the oath that we took, to educate our own people regarding these issues and it is the collective responsibility of all Governments in Africa to ensure that our people understand that when somebody makes a contribution, it is not alms or because they feel sorry for us, but a moral obligation for what they did in the past, specifically when it comes to the climate change issue.

We must just keep on educating, keep on spreading the word through the Ministry of Education, through science research, through NGOs and civil society, educate our people on what are their roles and responsibilities but also on their rights and if we do it collectively as a continent, then yes, we can assist in eradicating that belief that we are somehow inferior to the others. We have a right to the adaptation funds.

Finally, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, it is Government's responsibility, it is the Executive's responsibility to execute, but to live and to execute this document is also the collective responsibility of all

22 June 2011 NATIONAL POLICY ON CLIMATE CHANGE HON MOONGO

Namibians – Parliament, the corporate world, NGOs, and the Private and Public Sector. Everybody must live, must contribute, must think and act in responsible ways to enhance this document and to reduce the effects of climate change.

In conclusion, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I really support this document and I thank you very much for the opportunity.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Honourable Moongo.

HON MOONGO: Honourable Speaker, this policy document is very educative and I want to make a short contribution. I would only like to say that I am in line with others, but I only want to appeal to the Minister to domesticate the Policy, because sometimes we import things and we get a document from outside and make well-polished statements to impressed the nation, while the implementation is a mockery. I, therefore, appeal to the Minister to domesticate it, find solutions for floods, namely that we want earth dams in every Region in order to capture the water. Then you come up with recommendations that after the floods we need to do certain things.

Coming to the people whose mahangu fields are always flooded, there are many areas in Namibia which are not flooded and we want the Ministry of Agriculture and the Traditional Authorities to do research on which crops can be produced during the floods and which ones during drought. Therefore, I want this Policy to be domesticated and well-planned and not to be an imported policy. I support the Policy.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Prime Minister.

22 June 2011 NATIONAL POLICY ON CLIMATE CHANGE RT HON N ANGULA

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. I am afraid to say that this Policy leaves a lot to be desired. It is too academic and, in my view, needs to be reviewed for the following reasons:

Firstly, climate change is a political issue because there are different interests in climate change and it is these different interests which are making it impossible to renew the Kyoto Protocol and I think that must be addressed. Climate change is a developmental issue because development depends upon the use of energy and by way of mitigation you have to have a clear statement as a country as to what is it Namibia is going to do to limit carbon emissions in relation to others. There is no statement here telling us that.

Climate change is also a technological issue, because if you are going to have mitigating measures, those measures must be backed up by technology. You are supposed to indicate what kind of technologies you need when it comes to mitigation and when it comes to adaptation. This Policy falls short of that.

Climate change is also an issue of resources. (Intervention)

HON BEZUIDENHOUDT: Honourable Speaker, may I ask the Honourable Prime Minister a question? Honourable Prime Minister, as this is a policy statement and some of the issues you raised are sub-policy, but more in the area of operations, would you distinguish between those or do you also want the operational issues, such as the decision on technology also to be included? The difference between a policy and the actual details?

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Let me elaborate so that the Honourable Member can understand. When we say climate change is a political issue and there are different political interests, we are supposed to state it. There is a polluter somewhere who wants to continue to pollute. What is the policy of Namibia on that?

22 June 2011 NATIONAL POLICY ON CLIMATE CHANGE RT HON N ANGULA

When we say it is a developmental issue, Namibia has to use energy, what kind of level of pollution are we going to be allowed? You need to say for Namibia to develop, we definitely have to emit a certain carbon into the air. How much carbon are we prepared to emit? That is a policy issue because that is what is going to guide people who are generating energy. It must be part of the policy in terms of your own development.

The big argument now in the climate change Debate is whether there must be a voluntary regime for carbon emission. The developing countries are saying there must be a regime which is measurable, verifiable and can be monitored. There are different responsibilities in this regime. The developed countries are saying it must be a voluntary regime, a goodwill kind of thing because they want to continue to pollute. This is the issue and what is Namibia's position on that one? (Intervention)

HON NEHOVA: I want to put a question to the Right Honourable Prime Minister. I may say that I do follow many of the statements that he from time to time makes and the question is this: The polluters that are mentioned here pollute because of certain reasons. They pollute because they want to produce in order to achieve super profits. That is capitalism. Does the Honourable Prime Minister believe that people who are in pursuit of super profits will agree to evolutionary regime to mitigate the pollution on our planet?

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: The voluntary regime is their regime. It is not our regime. Our regime is to have a binding Kyoto 2 which is measurable, reportable and verifiable. We have differentiated responsibilities, the responsibilities of the traditional polluters and the responsibilities of those who are coming up, like Namibia. Somehow we have to pollute a bit but not too much. Therefore, it is their regime, it is not our regime because they want to have loopholes, they do not want to be monitored, they do not want to be measured, and they do not want to report. This is the problem.

22 June 2011 NATIONAL POLICY ON CLIMATE CHANGE RT HON N ANGULA

I am only saying that climate change is a global issue and your policy framework should be coached in such a way that it responds to the global arguments and contestations. Then you come to specific issues of whether you are talking about adaptation, you are talking about early warning systems, etcetera. That should be secondary, but you have to cast your policy in a broader context because it is a policy. That is what I am advising the Minister, to review this policy and to put the political angle to the policy, the developmental angle to the policy, technology and resources. (Interjection)

HON MEMBER: An ideology.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: The political angle is an ideological angle, obviously. I know there are all these funds they want to establish, the Green Climate Fund, Technological Mechanism, Adaptation Committee, I know those things are there, but the policy is in fact committing the Namibian Government to fund these things which are created by other people. They should fund it, the polluters, that should be our demand and the policy should be clear on that one. We should not let them off the hook.

My argument is really for the Honourable Minister to recast the policy and put it in those contexts I have mentioned – political, developmental, technological and resource. (Interjection)

HON MEMBER: And capacity.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Resource is part of capacity. Capacity is a subsector of resource. Then the policy will have meaning, so that when our people go to Durban and talk to Kyoto 2, they know the

22 June 2011

Namibian policy and that is what they are going to articulate. I appeal to the Minister to review the policy. Thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I do not know who is embarrassed by what the Prime Minister has just said, whether it is National Assembly or Cabinet. I would have assumed that the Minister came before this House, having been cleared by Cabinet in terms of the policy that she placed before the House. It would, therefore, be rather awkward for the House to continue considering this policy if it does not enjoy the concurrence of the Cabinet. The Prime Minister being here as the Leader of Government Business creates an awkward situation and I do not know how we propose to proceed in the light of what you have said. If it were any other Cabinet Member, Minister or Deputy Minister, I would have let it pass, but you are speaking with the authority of the Cabinet and Head of State as the Leader of Government Business in the House and I do not know how to proceed from here.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: The Prime Minister is a Member of Parliament and when a policy is tabled here and we see some weaknesses, we must discuss those weaknesses even if it passed through Cabinet.

Perhaps it missed our eyes there and there is nothing wrong for this House to suggest to the Minister to revise the policy.

HON SPEAKER: The message I am going to read out applies to the following Cabinet Ministers: Honourable Kawana, Honourable Sioka, Honourable Nghidinwa, Honourable Kamwi, Honourable Abraham Iyambo, Honourable Kuugongelwa-Amadhila, Honourable Ngatjizeko, Honourable !Naruseb, Honourable Geingob, Honourable Kaapanda, Honourable N Iyambo. This is a reminder, to put it stronger, an instruction from the Honourable Minister of Justice and Chairperson of the Cabinet Committee on Legislation that this weekend on 24 to 26 June there will be a meeting of that Cabinet Committee on Legislation at

22 June 2011 ADJOURNMENT

Midgard. You are expected to be there. There is a long list of legislation that you must dispose of before it comes here.

With that the House stands adjourned until tomorrow, 14:30.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:45 UNTIL 2011.06.23 AT 14:30

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS WINDHOEK 23 JUNE 2011

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

MOTION OF CONDOLENCE

HON SPEAKER: Could death ever give the reason for its solecism or pride, with shattered minds and excruciating hearts that we must have courage to accept what we cannot undo. We are born and yet to die. A consummate public intellectual, versatile jurist and eminent authority on knowledge, Kadel Asmal is dead. At the right time and chosen place we shall honour him with arousing and sinking standing ovation, reserved for saints and liberators of the people.

Asmal was a member of SWAPO's negotiating team as regards Resolution 435 of 1978. Last year Kadel joined the drafters of our Constitution here in Windhoek and the founders of our Republic to remind us of the real meaning of 9 February and 21 March 1990. Once I went on a special mission as Foreign Minister, sent by President Sam Nujoma, to report on an urgent matter to President Nelson Mandela in Cape Town. Kadel Asmal was hurriedly on his way out of the President's office as I was entering it. We shook hands and off he went to attend an international conference in Tunisia on water, etcetera. He was Cabinet Minister on those things. President Mandela said to me there that Asmal was not only an authority on his own Ministerial portfolios, but also equally more authoritative on other Ministers' portfolios than they try to be. A boundless loyalist, but courageous to differ on ideals and principles. To South Africa and to the ANC, in particular, our heartfelt sympathy and condolences. May his soul rest in eternal peace.

THE HOUSE OBSERVES A MINUTE OF SILENCE.

197

TABLING OF REPORTS HON VAN DER WALT

HON SPEAKER: Any Petitions? Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers?

TABLING: REPORT ON ANNUAL 2011 SESSION OF PARLIAMENTARY CONFERENCE ON WTO

HON VAN DER WALT: I lay upon the Table, the Report of the Annual 2011 Session of the Parliamentary Conference on WTO held in Geneva, Switzerland from 21 – 22 March 2011.

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Member table the Report? Any other Reports and Papers?

TABLING: REPORTS OF THE AUDITOR-GENERAL

TADEMO. REPORTS OF THE AUDITOR-GENER

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: I lay upon the Table, Reports of the Auditor-General on the Accounts of:

- Municipality of Mariental for the Financial Year ended 30 June 2011;
- Municipality of Karasburg for the Financial Year ended 30 June 2010;
- Municipality of Katima Mulilo for the Financial Year ended 30 June 2007 and 2008 respectively.

NOTICE OF MOTIONS HON NYAMU

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Minister please table the Reports? Any further Reports and Papers? Any Notice of Questions? Notice of Motions? Honourable Nyamu.

NOTICE OF MOTION

<u>HON NYAMU</u>: Honourable Speaker, I give Notice that on the 28th of June 2011, I shall Move –

Given our collective resolve to foster and consolidate democracy and national unity:

That this Assembly:

Debates the occasional introduction and wearing of Political Party colours in the House as well as the display and the indiscriminate hoisting or display of Party flags throughout the country in order to agree to a common and amicable policy practice for general observance by all concerned. I move.

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Member table the Motion? Any further Notice of Motions? Question 16 is by Honourable Moongo addressed to the Prime Minister. Does the Honourable Member put the Question?

RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS

199

23 June 2011 RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS HON MOONGO RT HON N ANGULA

QUESTION 16:

HON MOONGO: I put the Question.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Honourable Speaker, I do not know how many times I am going to answer this question, but let me answer it again. Honourable Moongo cites Article 10 of the Namibian Constitution and claims that Koevoet are discriminated against that they are not receiving veterans' pensions. This article does not cite anywhere anything related to unpatriotic activities of aiding an enemy to keep occupying a country against the wishes of the people seeking freedom and Independence. That is exactly what Koevoet did and that is exactly what the Veterans Act of 2008 cross cried by defining a veteran as follows: "A veteran means a person who was a member of the liberation forces..." Koevoet was not a member of the liberation forces. "...consistently and persistently participated or engaged in any political, diplomatic or underground activity in furtherance of the liberation struggle..." Koevoet, as we know them, were not engaged in these activities. "... owing to his or her participation in the liberation struggle was convicted, whether in Namibia or elsewhere, of any offence closely connected to the struggle and sentenced to imprisonment." Koevoets were not in any way part of what is described here.

Therefore, Honourable Moongo who is a Member of this House and was sitting there when this Act was passed could have moved an Amendment when the Act was being debated here if he wanted Koevoet to be included in this Act. Now after the law is in place, he is trying to rewrite the law. The only good thing you can do, Honourable Moongo, is to move an Amendment to the definition of a veteran. Thank you.

HON MOONGO: Thank you for the answer, but I would only like to say that the money given by South Africa was only aimed at the internal forces, but it was shared with the so-called veterans. How could they share in the N\$24 million? (Intervention)

_

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND ATTORNEY-GENERAL: I am very sorry to interrupt the senior Colleague. I heard the Honourable Vice-President of DTA referring to our veterans of the liberation struggle as "so-called veterans." Can he withdraw the word "so-called?"

HON MOONGO: I withdraw "so-called" but the point is: why did they share in the money meant for the internal forces? Why did they get those millions, why do they not vomit it out?

HON SPEAKER: I think the Prime Minister has a point, I have heard this question put very much the same way and to same effect so many times. Next time you want to put the same question, be creative about how you want to put it, because you are going to get the same answer and both you and the Prime Minister would be wasting the time of the House. Find some other way in which you want to ask the question.

Question 17 is by Honourable Maamberua, put to the Minister of Health and Social Services. Does the Honourable Member put the Question?

QUESTION 17:

<u>HON MAAMBERUA</u>: I put the Question.

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Honourable Speaker thank you for giving me the Floor to respond to these questions.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, first I wish to thank Honourable Maamberua for the questions put to me for the information of the general public.

On question 1 he gathers that many patients who visit hospitals have difficulties in communicating their diseases to doctors in English or even Afrikaans because they do not know these languages and asked what mechanisms and facilities are there to assist translations at State Hospitals.

The patients are screened by nurses before they see a doctor. The history of illness, the signs and symptoms are written down during the course of screening. English is the official language for communication in this country, thus during the training for both enrolled nurses and registered nurses one of the requirements is English. A doctor is always with a nurse when examining patients so that the nurse can help translate for the doctor and the patient. In addition, most of the expatriate doctors who have been in the country for a while learn the local language, at least the basics that are required in order to understand and communicate with patients.

Question 2 is almost similar to this one, that in Courts translations are provided for and can similar services also be provided in State Hospitals and if so, how soon?

I agree with him that this is a necessary service. However, one may not compare in terms of numerical the clients attending Courts and the clients that we attend to in hospitals or clinics. The numbers are certainly not the same. One wonders whether we would be in a position to accommodate this, taking into consideration the vernacular we have in this country. The Ministry, however, is currently undergoing restructuring and this question will be one of those that will be addressed during the process by either increasing the posts of nursing staff or creating a cadre to perform this task, but I have my own doubts whether the Public Service Commission will agree to this. The Public Service is already bulged.

Question 3 is whether there are general standards in hospitals in terms of level of service provision and hygiene and if so, are these standards monitored regularly and by whom?

My answer is that there is a policy on infection control that deals with hygiene and waste disposal. Each hospital, including the Grootfontein District Hospital, has a staff member who is responsible for infection

control. This staff member should be working together with cleaning services and provide training to cleaners.

Question 4: "How are hospitals rated in the light of the foregoing", meaning the standards of service delivery, "and how is the Grootfontein Hospital rated?"

I would say that currently we do not have a rating system for hospitals, but the hospital hygiene is monitored by the nurses in charge of these hospitals and have the same standards all over. The national and regional level do support visits to district hospitals and assist in all areas, such as patient care and general support including the related hygiene. We acknowledge that Grootfontein District Hospital has some challenges related to leadership. Fortunately, the current Head of the hospital is retiring soon. We trust we may get someone with strong leadership skills once the post will be advertised during the course of July this year.

Question 5: "Is there a customer care charter at Grootfontein Hospital and if so, is it translated into indigenous languages?" My answer is yes, we have the Patient Charter of Namibia which was produced in 1998 and the Grootfontein District Hospital has copies of this booklet. Furthermore, the booklet was translated into five local languages, namely Oshivambo, Herero, Rukwangali, Silozi and Afrikaans. This Charter is now being reviewed and a first draft is already in circulation for comments by whomever. I have some copies for the information of Honourable Maamberua and, indeed, the Nation. I have one here for "Orutuu rovavere va Namibia", which you will understand better and then we have one here, "Liswanelo za mukuli mwa Namibia".

Honourable Speaker, many of our doctors, including those at the Grootfontein District Hospital, are living within the hospital premises and patients are not supposed to wait that long for a doctor on call, except in situations where a doctor may be attending to another patient or there is an emergency, be it in a theatre or elsewhere. Thank you very much.

HON MAAMBERUA: Honourable Speaker, I thank the Minister for the attempt to answer the questions. However, I should stress that I am not satisfied. The Minister did not address the questions satisfactorily and I should be able to point that out. The situation is very serious. In the first question where the answer is that a nurse will first screen the patient before the patient sees the doctor, the concern is the language. If, for example, an Oshivambo-speaking person who does not understand either English or Afrikaans or any other language in Namibia goes to a clinic or hospital and the nurse is Damara-speaking, how is that person going to be able to relate his or her illness to the nurse. Irrespective whether it is a nurse or a doctor attending to this particular person, if there is no translation, there is no translation.

The fact that English is the official language in Namibia does not justify that people have to struggle on their own to express themselves. Hence, the Government of the Republic of Namibia has considered it as important that the indigenous people should actually be assisted where they do not understand the English language and hence, in the courts of law provision is made for that. Of course, one would not expect that all hospitals and all clinics in Namibia would provide that service, but there should be some critical attempts to do so in clinics and hospitals and I think it is affordable and it can be done.

Question 4 was on service provision standards. I did not talk about hygiene. I am not talking about the cleanliness in hospitals, I am talking about the attendance and provision of service to patients in hospitals and at the clinics and that the Minister did not address.

I am well acquainted with the Charter that the Minister is referring to, it is a general Charter of the Public Service, but every Ministry is expected to have its own charter according to its own unique mandate. The charter is not just a booklet; it is actually a poster that is placed at the entry point of every service delivery. That is a contract between, in the case of the Ministry of Health, the patient and the management of the Ministry, not a booklet that is in the office of an official somewhere in the Ministry.

On the last question, the fact that the current Head of the Grootfontein

23 June 2011 ON RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS-HON DR KAMWI HON MAAMBERUA

Hospital is about to retire and another one will be appointed may not necessarily change the situation because we have to view the situation holistically. It is not just the person who may be the problem, but let us look at the entire ethnical environment at that hospital and address that. We cannot address a multi-faceted problem at a hospital by looking at one particular individual.

Still on the same question, the Minister is not sure as to how long a doctor on call takes to attend to a patient at the Grootfontein Hospital, hence the Minister says such a doctor "is not supposed" to take that long. It means this is a guess by the Minister because it is not emphatic, it is not precise, and it is a supposition. I am not making a speech; I am now giving information with request to the questions.

Today, very early in the morning before 06:00, I went to several clinics in Windhoek. The first clinic that I visited was the Khomasdal Clinic where I already found fifty people in a queue, hoping to be attended to by either the nurses or a doctor during the day. I also looked at whether there was a Customer Care Charter; there was none where I entered the building. The very small one is the Mission Statement in an A4-size paper somewhere in an obscure corner at that clinic. I talked to the people in the queue, asking them how long would it take for them to be attended to, particularly the last person in that queue. Of course, the answers vary, it will take them four, five, six, seven hours.

I went on to the Katutura Clinic where I found about two hundred people in a queue at that very early hour in the morning. At the Katutura TB Clinic in the same compound I found about one hundred patients already queuing that time. Again no customer care charter, so a patient coming to the clinic will not know what is the contractual obligation between me as a patient and the Ministry in terms of what time it should take for me to be attended to. The charter is a social contract.

I went on to the Okuryangava Clinic where at the ARV section of that clinic I found about a 120 patients who, I suppose because of the humane nature of the nurse there, could actually be seated, but there are no seating arrangements within the yard for those patients who will come long before

the opening hours at the clinic.

At the other section of the Okuryangava Clinic I found about sixty patients, not seated because they had to queue outside and again no customer care charter. This is very serious and this is only Windhoek we are talking about. I know the situation because since I have asked this question I have received several calls, some from the Walvis Bay TB Clinic with the same complaints. Therefore, I think we have to address the service delivery, the quality, and the standards in a different manner. Therefore, I have no other choice than to move a Motion that we debate the health situation and service delivery in various clinics and hospitals in Namibia next week. Thank you very much.

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker, Sir. I appreciate the concerns of Honourable Maamberua. I stated what we are doing with regard to the issue of language; I did not say outright that we do not need that service, absolutely not. However, it is very unrealistic for Honourable Maamberua to suggest that we provide translation services to the health facilities in this country as it is not possible under the circumstances. I said we are working on restructuring and it will be up to the Public Service Commission to decide whether it is possible, but I do know that since I came to this Ministry it is something that has been coming in and out, it is just not possible. Do we have such resources? The answer is that it is not possible; we do not have such resources.

Concerning standards, we are doing our best to address the service in terms of the standards. We may not do more than we can at the present moment for the simple reason that we do not have the necessary resources to carry out what we want to do.

As for the Charter that you seem to have a problem with, you yourself admitted having found these documents wherever you went. You did not say that they were not there, but do not expect me to go out there and put them where you want them to be. There are Directors, we have put in

place some supervisors and we are talking to them, we are addressing the matter.

On the retirement of the Principal Medical Officer, you did not give me an alternative as to what we should do other than what we are addressing. This man is leaving and once he leaves, we think we may get the best candidate. However, can I share with you how many Namibian Principal Medical Officers we have out there? We are relying heavily on expatriates. We recently commissioned a School of Medicine, let us wait and see. It is only then when you have sufficient from our own resources that you would be talking loud, but as for now we are doing our best. When we received this man he had certified copies of all the documents and we accommodated him. He went through the normal channels but in the end we were not satisfied and as a result he is leaving. All I can say is what I shared with you, let us wait and see.

I am glad you went around visiting the clinics, but you know I have a mobile phone, you know there is a Director for Khomas Regional Health Director and at no stage did you deem it fit to invite a Director to be with you to confirm whether indeed you went to Katutura Clinic, which I do not know anyway. I know of Katutura Health Centre, but I do not know the clinic you referred to. Similarly for Khomasdal you should have invited a Director. My Deputy Minister is around, I am around, we are in the city, but you did not bother to invite us to be there. Again I am saying I do not know the Katutura TB Clinic, this must be a new clinic as I only know the Katutura Intermediate Hospital TB Ward. You should at least have invited me to come and see the new clinic as I do not know of that clinic.

At Okuryangava ARV you found a 120 patients queuing. I do not know what time it was. You should have invited any of the seniors. I have on many occasions listened to some complaints, I read the SMSs and we usually respond to those who invite us. If it is in a ward, invite the Principal Medical Officer, invite the Superintendent, invite the Matron to come and share your experience instead of coming here. What is the whole hullabaloo about? It is only you who were there, we were not there.

I did not say we are not experiencing challenges, there are challenges in the health sector in this country, but those challenges are not insurmountable. I want to invite you to look at what is happening outside Namibia in other countries. I am telling you, we are receiving patients from some of the neighbouring countries because we are delivering. The challenges are there but not insurmountable.

Provision for seating arrangements, what seating arrangements? You want us to come up with what? What we have there is what we can afford, Sir, with the means that we have at our disposal. You are talking about no customer care outside the clinic, there is customer care and customer care is only provided in district hospitals and intermediate hospitals and not in clinics. We are doing our best. That is all I can say, Honourable Speaker, Sir. Thank you.

HON MAAMBERUA: I have already said that I will table a Motion next week, but I just want to clarify. Obviously, the situation of health in Namibia in terms of service delivery and standards of service provision is not going to allow us to wait for the graduates from UNAM ten years from now. As a citizen of this country, concerned with the situation on the ground, I do not have to ask the Minister, the Permanent Secretary or a Director to be able to visit any clinic and to count for myself the people standing in the queue. I know how to count; I know how to assess the environment outside. I am not talking about whether patients are treated, medically speaking, correctly or not, I am talking about the environment and that is where I stopped.

Allow me to go again to many other clinics and talk about the same things here without the Minister, the Permanent Secretary or a Director and I am not going to stop there, I shall go to the Ministry of Labour and many other institutions where we have to go to experience for ourselves. If I undertake missions in an official capacity, that is a different matter, but as a citizen I shall do that and together, collectively, comradely and mutually we shall improve the welfare of our people in this country. The Motion shall come next week.

23 June 2011

RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS TJIHUIKO HON TWEYA

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Question 19 is by Honourable Tjihuiko addressed to the Minister of Trade and Industry. Does the Honourable Member put the Question?

QUESTION 18:

HON TJIHUIKO: I put the Question.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: Honourable Speaker, may I ask the indulgence of Honourable Tjihuiko to defer this question since we are still compiling proper answers to the questions. I thank you.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:40 HOUSE RESUMED AT 16:25 PURSUANT TO ADJOURNMENT

HON SPEAKER: The Secretary will read the first Order of the Day.

CONSIDERATION: NATIONAL POLICY ON CLIMATE CHANGE FOR NAMIBIA

HON SPEAKER: When the House was adjourned yesterday, the 22nd of June 2011, the Question before the Assembly was a Policy by the Honourable Minister of Environment and Tourism. Any further discussion?

HON DR AMWEELO: I thank you very much, Comrade Speaker. Yesterday and the day before, a number of Honourable Members took part

23 June 2011 NATIONAL POLICY ON CLIMATE CHANGE HON DR AMWEELO

in the discussion of this very important policy, the National Policy on Climate Change for Namibia, 2011.

Comrade Speaker, we are all aware that these changes have been taking place for millions of years since the creation of Earth. It is a natural phenomenon and since two hundred years ago the changes were taking place very fast because of the anthropogenic activities, in other words, man-made activities. The last two hundred years the changes took place very rapidly because people were burning fossil fuels, such as oil, coal and gas. Industrial activities released CO² into the atmosphere and people started cutting and burning trees and grass. All these caused accelerated climate change.

We are all aware that two hundred million years ago Africa and South America was one continent. This continent was called Gondwana and after this change the two continents separated. Today it requires a fifteen hours flight to reach South America. These changes are now taking place and are causing a rise in temperature. The temperature causes a rise in sea levels and it is anticipated that if this trend continues, it will rise 130 centimetres.

Comrade Speaker, this trend started a long time ago and will continue for many years to come. In order to reduce this change and the high temperatures, we need to reduce the release of CO² into the atmosphere. However, Comrade Speaker, the major problem facing Namibia today is the degradation of its bio-physical environment resulting from the impacts of climate change and climatic variability that brings about environmental hazards that include droughts, floods, loss of biodiversity, etcetera.

In order to be able to effectively address the challenge brought about by the impacts of climate change, climatic variability and the anthropogenic causes, we need to draw up national sustainable development strategies, but I am happy that we have strategies in our policy here and we only need to strengthen them. These national sustainable development strategies aim to build up upon, harmonise and comprehensively integrate the various sectoral economies in an environmental policy that exists in a country to ensure a social responsible, coordinated and coherent economy

23 June 2011 NATIONAL POLICY ON CLIMATE CHANGE HON DR AMWEELO

development while protecting the environment, which is the natural resources base for the benefit of the present and future generation.

If we look at the Policy Framework on page 7, I would like to focus on two issues mentioned here in paragraph 2.1, the aim of this Policy. There are two issues which are very important and which I think are at the heart of this Policy. It is adaptation and mitigation and I want to talk about those two issues.

As I said, we cannot stop this change, it will continue, but Africa, including Namibia, is left amidst the CO² into the atmosphere, but these greenhouse gases come from the developed countries. There is no boundary in the atmosphere, we are also affected.

If one looks at the international instruments addressing this problem whereby Namibia also ratified the UNFCCC instrument under the Kyoto Protocol, there are three mechanisms and I only want to mention one. In order to solve this problem of adaptation and mitigation, we need to do research and as the Prime Minister mentioned yesterday that we need financial resources, capacity-building and technology transfer, but under CDM we can apply to this fund, but we need to identify the projects which can be funded through the CDM Kyoto Protocol. My fear is that the this Protocol will come to an end in 2012 and I do not know which instrument will be replaced by the Kyoto Protocol after 2012. (Intervention)

<u>HON ULENGA</u>: Honourable Speaker, on a Point of Order. I fear that we do not have a quorum.

HON SPEAKER: You may proceed.

HON DR AMWEELO: Comrade Speaker, I was saying that through the Kyoto Protocol our Government can apply for funds because there is a

23 June 2011 NATIONAL POLICY ON CLIMATE CHANGE HON DR AMWEELO

mechanism called CDM, but I was saying that the Kyoto Protocol comes to an end in 2012 and I do not know which one is going to replace it.

Comrade Speaker, when you are looking at adaptation, since we are all aware that climate change is unavoidable, unexpected, and unwanted, we must improve our capacity and adapt to the impacts by for example, upgrading infrastructure to cope with droughts and floods. We need a group of technicians and experts to form a Committee to think about what can be done to remove water from the flood-prone areas to the desert where we could maybe have a very big earth dam, however we first need to come up with a feasibility study.

We also need to address the impacts to protect the coastal areas because as the temperature is increasing the sea level will rise and the people along the coastline will be affected.

We need to monitor the changing weather patterns for planning and adaptation. In other words, we need to increase our early warning and information systems. We have two types, EWIS which is under the Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry and we have EMU which is under the Office of the Prime Minister. We need to strengthen and increase these early warning systems. We also need to do research on suitable adaptive crop variants and animal breeds.

Adaptation goes parallel with mitigation. Namibia can contribute to the global effects to reduce the greenhouse gases by providing renewable energy, energy efficiency and energy conservation. Last week we went to Ghana and we visited one of the hydro-power plants. They developed this hydro-power plant and they have six turbines which are generating power and they are supply energy to Ghana and neighbouring Togo. I heard at Ruacana there is a new technology which has never been used in many countries and maybe the Committee of Honourable Ben Amathila needs to go to Ruacana to see that new technology. However, we need energy and energy efficiency and energy conservation. We also need wind power, 220 kilowatts according to the standard of this country.

23 June 2011 NATIONAL POLICY ON CLIMATE CHANGE HON DR AMWEELO

It is mentioned in Objective 2 of the Policy on page 7 that we need to use compact fluorescent bulbs and the Cabinet directive of 2007 says that all the Government buildings should be provided with solar heaters.

Woody biomass could be converted to ethanol fuel so that we can reduce fossil fuel. Those are strategies for mitigation with which we can start According to this Policy we just need to come up with a programme to translate the adaptation and mitigation strategies it into implementation.

Comrade Speaker, I said that in Namibia we are not emitting much CO² into the atmosphere, but our problem is the chopping of trees and fires. We really need to come up with an awareness programme. When we go to our constituencies, we should speak on issues related to this problem. Of course, I understand that firewood is very important for our people in the rural areas, but we need to come up with technology to replace firewood in order to reduce the greenhouse gases.

In (vii) of the Policy mention is made of ODA and I think it should be ODS, Ozone Depleting Substances. (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Speaker, I have noticed that the Honourable Minister and Honourable Deputy Minister are not in the Is there anybody taking notes or are we just talking to ourselves?

HON SPEAKER: It is recorded.

HON DR AMWEELO: Lastly, Comrade Speaker, we already started to address this problem, we have national instruments to address this problem and they only need to be strengthened. Environmental Management Act of 2007, the Cabinet Directive which I

23 June 2011 NATIONAL POLICY ON CLIMATE CHANGE HON SPEAKER

already mentioned and we have NDP3. Those three instruments together with this national policy on Climate change will help us to address the impacts of climate change in Namibia. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank you. Honourable Members, there is a Draft Policy Document that was introduced by the Line Ministry and the intention is to encourage the Honourable Members to have a look at that Draft Policy Document, to enrich and strengthen it, to propose to delete, to rephrase, enrich it and so on. What I sense is that we are sharing our own impressions, information that we gathered from publications and we are not really addressing the Draft Policy Statement. That was the purpose of bringing it to the House. We are sharing ideas on what we think about it, whether climate change is on, it is a hoax and so on. It is a working document so to speak and I understand it was brought for the House to appreciate that this is the effort on the part of the line Ministry and you as lawmakers are invited to answer the question: Is that the kind of policy document that we need to have in order to combat climate change? I think that is what I understand. The climate change issue is so general and people are talking about it. There is evidence that it is on, some are saying this is something that has been happening at different epochs since Creation. Honourable Kaura is the leader of that school of thought and there are others who are bringing it closer and blaming our best behaviour and that we do something about it. I was going to interact with Honourable Amweelo, but at the end he at least got hold of the document and made some technical corrections. That is what I understand the purpose to be.

The Right Honourable Prime Minister was not necessarily wrong in what he said yesterday that I reacted to, that some things, particularly those that come from Cabinet members, should have been taken care of by Cabinet before you brought it here, but you are still Cabinet Members, Members of this House. Some Honourable Members yesterday did quite remarkably well in pointing out areas. Honourable Mushelenga.

214

23 June 2011 NATIONAL POLICY ON CLIMATE CHANGE HON MUSHELENGA

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Thank you, very much, Honourable Speaker. I rise to express my support to the National Policy on Climate Change for Namibia, 2011. This Policy comes at the right time when climate change has actually become a daily discussion in our homes, at our workplaces and various fora. The effects of climate change in Namibia are so obvious and I agree with this document that we need to address these effects. Climate change cuts across a number of Ministries. For example, this document talks about how it also affects the human health and well-being of the people. As a country we need to develop strategies, first to look at what type of diseases are most prevalent as a result of the effects of climate change, especially as a result of floods, etcetera, and then we perhaps need to develop a rapid response system, both in terms of prevention as well as in terms of fighting such diseases.

In terms of awareness, it is true that our public need to be educated about climate change. Once they are educated about climate change dynamics our society will appreciate issues such as Aforestation. People will start appreciating the importance of carefully managing the ecosystem. In most areas you find people are deforesting as if there is no further need for the forests.

At school we were taught the importance of trees and plants, the system of evaporation, how important and relevant are they to rain and so on, but not only that trees are important for rain patterns but they are also important for a number of reasons in respect of nature and wildlife. As I was growing up as a child there were small animals, like rabbits, that one could see at my village. Now all these things are extinct. My neighbour here is saying too many dogs, but these dogs do what they do on the instructions of human beings. These animals have nowhere to live now because of deforestation.

This document mentions human right-based effect of climate change, that it is mostly people in the rural areas who are affected by the patterns of climate change. You can see it during dry seasons. Our people live on crops which during the dry seasons will not grow and as a result there is famine. During rainy seasons our people in the rural areas are the hardest

23 June 2011 NATIONAL POLICY ON CLIMATE CHANGE HON MUSHELENGA

hit in terms of diseases such as cholera, polio, etcetera. Their infrastructures are easily destroyed by floodwaters and most of the plains in the north the houses are surrounded by water, people have nowhere to live and people have nowhere to gather food and graze their livestock. All these are effects of climate change patterns.

It is not necessarily always manmade patterns, it has been noticed that there are new plant species in southern Africa, new birds, not perhaps new on the earth but maybe they migrated from somewhere, that are threatening the existing ecosystem and as a result the existing plants and birds are becoming extinct because of this encroachment by alien species. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT:

Honourable Speaker, I just stood up to ask a tiny question to my Honourable Colleague. During the flood situation in the North this year I witnessed a situation that I have never seen before, heads of cattle which could not graze and they could not even move to cross over to the grass because the place where they usually cross during the rainy season was flooded. They could not graze because the grass was under water and they were just standing there. What do you think these cattle might have said to themselves?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: They were wondering what has happened, they have never lived in an environment where there is no grass.

Honourable Speaker, I would want to support the mitigating measure of renewable energy and Honourable Amweelo also alluded to that. We keep on talking about solar power, but it appears our people do not really appreciate the importance of using this renewable energy. In most cases where people are using solar power are where they are far from the national grid system.

23 June 2011 NATIONAL POLICY ON CLIMATE CHANGE HON MUSHELENGA

There were talks of a wind power plant of 10 megawatts. I do not know what happened to that, maybe the Minister of Mines and Energy will share with us one day. These are some of the mitigating factors for climate change.

This document also talks about the monitoring system for the infrastructure and we all know our infrastructure has been destroyed by the floods and heavy rainfall more than any other year before. Everywhere you go on the roads you see potholes. The reporting mechanism is what I do not understand. For example, for public roads, does the Roads Authority have a mechanism to inspect how are roads are badly damaged, because at some places you see a pothole for quite a while. (Intervention)

<u>HON KAURA</u>: May I ask a question? Honourable Speaker, we are informed by scientists that millions of years ago the Kunene River was emptying in the Etosha and Etosha was an inland lake, but due to earth movement it changed direction and started moving westward. These floods are a recapitulation of what happened millions of years ago and the floods have always been there, moving into the Etosha. When our ancestors migrated from Lake Chad and reached these beautiful green plains, some of them decided to settle there and our ancestors proceeded to Kaokoland. The flooding was always there, but with the creation of towns and roads the flow of water was blocked, thus human action has created this problem of water no longer flowing freely into Etosha and now spreading all over the place. Are we together on that one, Honourable Deputy Minister?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: I am aware and that is why I spoke about manmade effects on climate change and I also spoke about the natural effects that are not necessarily as a result of human causes.

For now, let me go back to the monitoring system. I said I do not know

23 June 2011 CONFERMENT OF NATIONAL HONOURS BILL HON AMATHILA

what monitoring system is in place, to look at our infrastructure that had been damaged because some are repaired within a reasonable short time while others take long to be prepared. Perhaps we need to put some emphasis on this monitoring system of our infrastructure so that they do not become dilapidated as in other countries which do not refurbish their infrastructure.

Otherwise, Honourable Speaker, it is a very good working document that we can improve on in order to address climate change and its effects in the country. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Any further discussion?

HON AMATHILA: I move that the Debate be adjourned until Wednesday, next week.

-

HON SPEAKER: Any objection? Agreed to. The Debate on this Motion stands adjourned until Wednesday next week. The Secretary will read the second Order of the Day.

RESUMPTION OF SECOND READING CONFERMENT OF NATIONAL HONOURS BILL

HON SPEAKER: When this Debate was adjourned on Wednesday, 15 June, the Question before the Assembly was Motion by the Honourable Minister of Veteran Affairs, that the Bill be read a Second Time. Honourable Tjihuiko adjourned the Debate.

23 June 2011 CONFERMENT OF NATIONAL HONOURS BILL HON T.IIHUIKO

HON TJIHUIKO: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. Honourable Speaker, when I was going through this Bill which I believe is a draft Bill, a number of things were going through my mind. The first thing that I thought about is that we in this House have been calling upon the responsible Ministry to come up with a legal framework that would guide the conferment of these honours on our people, because we were doing it haphazardly. I believe that those who were not happy with the way things were being done, should be happy now because we will now have an opportunity to make recommendations to improve on what has earlier been put on the table and that is exactly what I am trying to do, Honourable Speaker.

Let me start on page 4, Establishment of National Honours Advisory Committee. Looking at the people who are going to serve on this committee, I have seen that there is going to be somebody responsible for Veterans Affairs, somebody from Defence, Office of the President, Safety and Security, Ministry of Justice, Regional and Local Government, Council of Churches and also two Members appointed from nominations received from the Association of Veterans. My question is, Honourable Minister, the honours we are looking at is not only looking at the military establishment, I believe that we are looking at people who have contributed immensely to all sectors of our community, be it churches, sport or science. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: Honourable Speaker, I know I will have the opportunity to respond, but I would like to alert the House to some terminology used by the Honourable Member which I may not be comfortable to let it go. The Honourable Member alleged a few seconds ago that up to now these awards and honours were given haphazardly, meaning there was no format guiding the process. However, during my motivation I said the following: "Since Independence the President of the Republic of Namibia had conferred national status, honours and awards on heroes and heroines or veterans and great achievers under the provision of Article 32(3)(h) of the Namibian Constitution." Therefore, it is my understanding that it was not done

23 June 2011 CONFERMENT OF NATIONAL HONOURS BILL HON TJIHUIKO

haphazardly.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Minister thank you very much for the correction. Let me continue. I was saying that the bulk of the people who are to serve on the Regional Honours Advisory Committee are loaded with the security set-up. My understanding of these honours is that we will not only be looking at the military alone, we will be looking at all the sectors, be it churches, be it people who contributed to science or sport and, therefore, I do not believe for a moment that the army staff would be able to know the people who have performed to a certain level in sport or science, for instance. Therefore, we need to reconsider the set-up of these Advisory Committees at both regional and national level, because the same people from the same establishments will serve on both Committees. Honourable Minister maybe we need to look at that, so that we can have a balance of views and expertise that will fit into what you actually want to achieve. This would avoid a situation where we would name a rugby field after a politician while we had rugby players. That will not go well with our people because everybody's contribution must be recognised in such a way that the people in that sector will be happy with what has happened. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: May I ask Honourable Tjihuiko a question? It is with reference to institutions or places being named after individuals, whether politicians or national heroes or whatever. Suppose a football club or rugby club or whatever asks Honourable Tjihuiko to name their club after him, what is his response going to be?

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Minister, I was a footballer. If African Stars asks me that their soccer field to be named after me, being a footballer I would say yes, but if a rugby club comes to me and say they want my name to be used for rugby, I would recommend Honourable Kaura's name who was a good rugby player.

23 June 2011 CONFERMENT OF NATIONAL HONOURS BILL HON T.IIHUIKO

What I am trying to say that if, for instance, a school wants their school to be renamed after a certain personality because of what that person has contributed as a good sports person, a good politician or whatever, it is a different ballgame altogether. That is my concern, Honourable Minister, and I think you need to look at that and try to balance the representation on this Committee.

While I am on the Committees, I am a bit worried about the arrangement. I know the last person who is going to either confer or not confer this honour will be His Excellency the President and all the blame, from whatever community, will be directed towards the President. Honourable Minister, we have a situation where there are certain communities who have been conferring these honours on certain sections of the community or tribal groups. To name but only two, from 26 August 1923, on the return of the remains of Samuel Maharero, the Herero people have been remembering and conferring honours on that specific group for the last 88 years. The same happened with the Mbanderu-speaking people and that led to a situation where a body cannot be buried for three, four weeks. It is because of that sentiment that specific community attaches to that specific area or place or tree, for that matter.

We are saying that a recommendation will be coming from a Committee where we have so many Traditional Authorities. Let me give you an example, for instance we have more than seven recognised Traditional Authorities, but we will have one person to advise on this Committee. Will a Herero-speaking person be able to correctly advise whether this person was really a hero, has contributed to that point where this recommendation is made? I am a bit worried, I want you to look at that specific area, so that when there is a dispute, the blame should not be on the President, but there must be a structure that would sort out these problems before it is recommended to the President for conferment. I am very worried about that, because what I have also seen on page 9 of the draft Bill is an application for objection against conferment of honour. Somebody can even object after the burial has taken place and obviously, in the same Bill it says the body will not be removed from that place, which means that even if the honour would be withdrawn, it remains the same. The family will erect a tombstone at the very same place and those

CONFERMENT OF NATIONAL HONOURS BILL 23 June 2011 HON MUSHELENGA

who are going to pay their respects, will not say, "I am not going to respect this one because the honour has been taken away." It will create a problem where one would start accusing the President that he has conferred an honour on this person and now we cannot remove it. That needs to be looked at because if we do not critically look at this now, we may find ourselves in a situation where, instead of uniting people, the Bill will divide people and not only the specific community, the responsible Minister will be involved because you have to make recommendations. It will be expected from that specific authority to be the one to take the lead in this process.

In conclusion, Honourable Speaker, I believe that before we pass this Bill we need to consult widely. I believe if we refer this Bill to the Committee on Legal and Constitutional Affairs to consult the communities and bring it back to this House with recommendations and a well-informed document, it will do justice to this Bill. With those comments, Honourable Speaker, I support the principle of the Bill.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Honourable Mushelenga.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. I rise to express my support to the Conferment of the National Honours Bill that was introduced by the Honourable Minister of Veteran Affairs.

One thing I like about the Bill is that it is very representative as it seeks to recognise people that have made valuable contributions in various spheres of life. Looking at Section 3(b)(ii), it is people who made tremendous contributions in social, economic, scientific and other fields. This will obviously solve the problem Honourable Tjihuiko was talking about. Someone who has excelled in sport is covered under social and that is something I like.

23 June 2011 CONFERMENT OF NATIONAL HONOURS BILL HON WITBOOI

I also like the composition of the Regional Honours Advisory Committee, but I do not know why in some Regions provisions have not been made for people representing Local Authorities, since these are the basic structures that reach the people. Perhaps the Honourable Minister would wish to give such nature of representation a thought, because in the end one would want to ensure that the ordinary people feel that they are able to make inputs in this Committee, because we have a number of unsung heroes and heroines, some alive, some dead, for whom recognition is not a matter of public knowledge.

I have always been asking myself why some individuals have not been honoured and why some are honoured, especially in cases which are unique. I know of someone who has been the youngest political prisoner in this country and he has not been honoured, given any medal, but I am happy for the introduction of this Bill. When you have structures that are going to advise the President on the conferment of national hero status or the conferment of national and regional honours, at least some of these problems are going to be solved. I can only take off my hat to the Honourable Minister for introducing this Bill, it has come at the right time and it needs to be supported by each and everyone. It is a non-political Bill, but it is a Bill that wants to recognise everyone that has made a contribution to the well-being of this country in various fields. Thank you very much and I support the Bill.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Honourable Witbooi.

HON WITBOOI: Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, let me thank and congratulate the Honourable Minister of Veteran Affairs for tabling the Bill. Comrade Minister, it is my earnest opinion that these Committees will play a very important role to address the misconception that existed in the past when honouring heroes and heroines that only those who were in exile or former prisoners are automatically considered for these honours. Comrade Speaker, the history of our country is not

23 June 2011 CONFERMENT OF NATIONAL HONOURS BILL HON WITBOOI

entirely documents; therefore these committees have an overwhelming task to identify outstanding contributions made by individuals to be honoured as heroes and heroines in order to advise the President correctly.

Comrade Minister, young people might recall happenings of the past twenty years, it will be a daunting task for them to provide their opinions on who should be considered a hero or heroine, hence it will be difficult for them to talk about matters that happened fifty to a hundred years ago. They can only be well-informed through documented history, which I have earlier alluded to as not yet sufficient. While people within the age of seventy years will confidently express themselves about the happenings fifty to a hundred years ago, my suggestion, therefore, is the Committees' membership should include both old and young people.

Comrade Minister, I also embrace the establishment of the Regional Honours Advisory Committee to be appointed by the President, as provided for in Section 6(1) and in particular sub-paragraph (e) and I quote: "One member appointed from nominations received from the Council of Traditional Leaders." I am, however, of the view that Section 7(1), which reads that the Minister may invite those Ministries, Offices, Councils or Associations referred to in Sections 5 and 6 of this Bill, may dilute the contribution of the Council of Traditional Leaders as custodians of the history because the Minister may invite them or not invite them.

That paragraph should read as follows: "The Minister should invite those Ministries, Offices, Councils or Associations referred to in Section 5 and 6 of the Bill."

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I view this Conferment of National Honours Bill as a strong tool at our disposal to build our Nation. We should, therefore, ensure that all ingredients are available to us to succeed in this endeavour. I once again congratulate the Minister for his initiative and I support the Bill. Thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Honourable Moongo.

224

23 June 2011 CONFERMENT OF NATIONAL HONOURS BILL HON MOONGO / HON SIOKA / HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

HON MOONGO: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. Many of my very good proposals were mentioned by Honourable Tjihuiko and the last speaker, but I just want to stress the point that national honours should be determined by a Committee which is also national. It should not be political or from a certain section of the community and we must not be in a hurry to pass the Bill, it should be referred to a Committee which should be composed on national level so that the interests and the will of the Namibian people are represented. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Honourable Sioka.

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: Comrade Speaker thank you for the Floor. My intervention will be very brief and it is on the same section which others referred to, namely on the establishment of the Advisory Committee. I only wish to remind the Minister that women also need to be included as demanded by the youth and the disabled. We need women to also be involved in these Committees, especially those heroines whom we know. I support the Bill.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Minister. Honourable Amadhila.

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. I stand to commend the Minister for tabling this important Bill in Parliament and to support the Bill. I have a few comments to make and I start with a comment related to the point made by the Minister of Gender Equality and Child Welfare with regard to the gender balance when these Advisory Committees are constituted.

Gender balance does not mean that it should be fifty-fifty, but I think it is

23 June 2011 CONFERMENT OF NATIONAL HONOURS BILL HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

important that there is a requirement that gender equity should be a consideration in nominating persons to be appointed to these Committees.

Secondly, it is indicated under provision 11(1), remuneration, that Members of the Committees who are in the Public Service will not be entitled to receive travelling allowances on missions that are related to their duties and functions as Members of the Committee. I believe that this may be problematic and I want to believe that what we wanted to say is that they may not receive sitting allowances. However, if it is transport allowances, they may then be left to actually finance their trips from their own pockets because I do not think that their employing offices would agree to finance their trips related to their work as Members of the Committees. Therefore, we probably need to reconsider this.

Paragraph 11(2) deals with the remuneration of the Members of the Committee, but the type of remuneration granted is not indicated. No specific reference is made to fees and sitting allowances and I think it is important that that specification is made, because here we are only talking about remuneration from moneys appropriated by Parliament. It needs to be clarified that these persons are going to be salaried or paid fees and allowances.

Secondly, it also needs to be stipulated who would determine these payments to be made to the Members, because it is only indicated that these payments will be made from moneys appropriated by Parliament and in respect of services rendered as Members of the Committees. It is not indicated who is to determine these amounts.

With regard to the award of the status of a hero or heroine in Section 4(1), it is indicated that where that person on whom this honour has been bestowed dies or is deceased, the Head of State may further confer the honour of a State funeral. I want to specifically talk to the phrase "dies or is deceased." I do not know whether is intended to say before they are dead and posthumously or what is meant here, because I think it is important for that clarification to be given as to whether this honour can be granted posthumously, which I believe would be appropriate to do.

23 June 2011 CONFERMENT OF NATIONAL HONOURS BILL HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

Lastly, I think that the conferment of these honours to recognise the sacrifices and contributions of these citizens to the liberation struggle of Namibia would also require that the general public is made aware of these persons who are deserving of this honour so that in their everyday life they can also accord them the respect that they deserve, so that we do not wait until they die and then they are given State funerals so that we know who they are. This may require that appropriate information is compiled and put at the disposal of the public at regular intervals, so that people are aware who are the persons within their Regions who have been conferred this status and what are the specific deeds that have qualified them for this conferment, so that they are recognised at whatever platforms are to be made to feel special. Even those of us who are in public offices sometimes hear this person is given an official funeral and even as a Minister I would ask, "Who is that and what has the person done?" If I, at this level would not know, what of the people out there? It is important that this information is available.

I have seen that our media has now instituted a programme where they try to educate the public about those amongst us that have made these contributions and sacrifices through articles that are published in the newspapers and also through broadcasts by the NBC-TV. I hope that we would also have similar programmes on radio and also this databank that I have referred to. With these remarks, I support the Bill.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you very much. The House stands adjourned until Tuesday, 14:30.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:45 UNTIL 2011.06.28 AT 14:30



QUESTION 1:

Hon Riruako asked the Minister of Foreign Affairs-

What practical steps has our Government taken to give effect to the Motion that we have adopted on the Genocide and reparation that I have tabled in this august House, which was adopted on the 9th of September 2008, and I believe that four years were enough for the two Governments to have done something to give effect to this Motion. I would like to know what kind of submission was made to the German Government by our own Government in this regard.

Only last year on the 26th of August 2010 the Government organised a huge commemoration and burial of the remains of what it guessed were of our people who died in the war of 1904-1908.

It is against this background that I ask the Minister of Foreign Affairs to tell the august House what steps our Government has taken to give effect to the Motion that we have adopted.

ANSWER:

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. I rise to answer the question by Honourable Chief Riruako, whether steps were taken by the Government on the Motion on Genocide that was introduced by the Honourable Chief in 2006.

Honourable Speaker, the German colonial policy towards the people of Namibia during the early days of occupation, the German Ministry of Foreign Affairs has since Namibia's Independence in 1990 always opposed and shied away from discussing the issue of Genocide and reparations.

During the fourth Session of Parliament on Thursday the 26th of October 2006, this House adopted a Motion on Genocide and Reparations

introduced by Honourable Chief Riruako. During the Debate in his contribution, the Right Honourable Prime Minister suggested that the future bilateral relations between Namibia and Germany should contain principles of restorative justice. Restorative justice should attempt to repair the harm caused by past behaviour and is best accomplished through cooperative process that include all stakeholders. Stakeholders in this case include all people of this country who suffered the brunt of atrocities committed by the German colonial forces at the time.

In June 2007, just for the Record, Honourable Riruako visited Germany to give impetus to the reparation Motion, which was introduced by the Left Party in the German Bundestag. During that period, the Federal Parliament expressed the view that the German and Namibian Parliaments should work together and find a lasting solution.

However, many politicians and German Government officials believed that with the introduction of the Special Initiative Programme in Namibia the topic had been adequately addressed.

In July 2007, the Honourable Speaker of the National Assembly undertook an official visit to Germany at the invitation of the Bundestag President, Dr Norbert Lammert and during that particular visit, the Reparation Motion was discussed and the Namibian Parliamentary delegation emphasised that channels of communication be left open and that more regular dialogue on the Reparations Motion should take place. Dr Lammert, however, cautioned and emphasised the importance of an all-inclusive approach in order to benefit all Namibians. He stated that such an approach by the Namibian Government would be necessary to move the reparations issue forward in the German Parliament.

At the conclusion of that particular visit, several parties proposed that a dialogue forum between the two Parliaments be created to continue debating this matter.

In November 2007 the then Minister of Foreign Affairs, Honourable Marco Hausiku, informed the German Government in writing on what transpired in Namibia regarding the Motion tabled and what was subsequently adopted in the Namibian Parliament in October 2006. The

Minister made it clear that at the time of the letter dated 15 November 2007, his mandate was merely to inform the German Government and not to negotiate on anything. Several meetings took place after that. Namibian Ambassadors accredited to Germany also had meetings with German Parliamentarians from different Political Parties over the years to discuss the issue. The Motion had subsequently resulted in an ongoing Debate in the Bundestag and the German Government regarding the payment of reparations for the atrocities of the period between 1904 and 1908 against the Ovaherero and Namas.

In June 2008, the Bundestag rejected the Motion by the Linker Party in cooperation with Chief Riruako for the recognition and reparation of German colonial atrocities.

It is against this background that I wish to inform the Honourable Chief Riruako that because of our continued consultations with our German partners, the Motion on reparations has been introduced at various fora and steps are being taken, *albeit* small, to address the imbalances of the past. I thank you, Honourable Speaker.

QUESTION 2:

Hon Kaura asked the Right Honourable Prime Minister-

- 1. What is the reason why the electricity is shut down at Government offices at Rundu for three weeks due to non-payment of electricity bills? Is the Government bankrupt or completely irresponsible?
- 2. Are you aware of the two lives that were lost at the Windhoek Central Hospital Intensive Care Unit when there was an electricity blackout due to the inefficiency of emergency generators?
- 3. Is there any consideration to improve the efficiency of the generators to prevent any loss of life if there is another blackout?

ANSWER:

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. Honourable Kaura, thank you for asking this very pertinent question on the power failure at the Windhoek Central Hospital which took place on the 12th to the 15th of February 2011.

It is acknowledged that there were eight patients in the Intensive Care Unit when the power failure struck the area in which the Windhoek Central Hospital is located. The power failure was in that area, it was not just about the Windhoek Central Hospital.

The hospital's backup power generator was activated, as it was meant to do, but unfortunately, a power fluctuation spike occurred, which affected the gas-generated system, in short called GGS. Patients who were on ventilators were resuscitated with what is called Ambo bags. The hospital management and staff, including the Medical Superintendent, assessed the magnitude of the problem and arranged for the transfer of patients to Rhino Park Hospital.

However, two patients could not be transferred to Rhino Park Hospital. The first was Ms Magreth Somaes, 19 years of age, who had been in the intensive care for sixty-six days due to post-partum cardiomyopathy and acute renal failure. The report of the nurses confirms that before the fateful event, the deceased was very restless and she was sweating a lot. The report further confirmed that she was anxious and she had high blood pressure and pulse and saturation levels dropped. The patient, therefore, was pronounced dead by a doctor at 21:00 that day. May her soul rest in peace.

Similarly, Mr Godwin Jones, 40 years old, was admitted to Windhoek Central Hospital on the 5th of February 2011. He underwent above-knee amputation of the left leg, post a previous bi-femoral bypass because of acute myocardial infarction in gangrenous right leg. It is reported that since admission the late Mr Jones' condition remained critical, unstable with poor blood circulation to the lower limbs, that is to the extremities. The patient had dry gangrene on the right foot and right lower leg. The late patient, Mr Godwin Jones, had a very poor prognoses and he could

not be resuscitated on that fateful night of 22 February 2011. May his soul also rest in peace.

On November the 11th, the World Health Organisation submitted its final report on the assessment of the medical gas system in State hospitals in Namibia. The Ministry of Health and Social Services has studied the report and its findings and recommendations. A task team appointed by the Permanent Secretary of the Ministry has come up with draft measures, immediate, short term and long term, to address and rehabilitate the shortcomings in the system. Once finally put in place, there will be comprehensive plans that will short-circuit the current challenges.

It must be acknowledged that the Windhoek Central Hospital is a very old hospital. The system that it carries is equally old, that is the water pipe system, the electrical cabling system, etcetera. All need a complete overhaul. This cannot be overhauled in one go, as the hospital houses patients, some critically ill. Thus, improving efficiency will have to be done in phases, which may lead to a very long time to complete. I hope this information satisfies Honourable Kaura and the public at large. Thank you.

QUESTION 3:

Hon Ulenga asked the Minister of Health and Social Services-

- 1. Honourable Minister, are community counsellors working amongst the community, counselling people living with HIV/AIDS, registered Government employees or not?
- 2. The money they are paid at the end of every month, is it a wage, a salary, an allowance or a tip?
- 3. Mr Minister, why have those people, who sit with a heavy social burden of looking after our patients physically and spiritually been neglected by Government and your Ministry?
- 4. When can the community counsellors and the field promoters who

do TB counselling and follow-ups expect a better salary and better conditions of employment, including a bonus every Christmas or year end?

ANSWER:

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. For most of the time that I took the Floor to respond questions, I always thanked those who put questions to me for reasons that I do find that opportunity in order for me to share information with the public out there. Unfortunately, this would not be the case now. The Honourable Member put the following questions to me:

"Are community counsellors who work against the community, counselling people living with HIV/AIDS registered Government employees or not?"

Honourable Ben Ulenga had been a SWAPO Party freedom fighter, a trade unionist, a Deputy Minister and at one point in time, the High Commissioner to the UK. I am saying all this, Comrade Speaker, to say Honourable Ben Ulenga has answers to the questions he has put to me, but for the sake of the public, I have the following:

Community counsellors are not Government employees. However, they are employed on an annual contractual agreement. For the information of Honourable Members, Namibia started putting people on ARV treatment during 2004. Even then, the focus was on HIV prevention of mother-to-child transmission. However, during 2006, we started a programme on voluntary counselling and testing and those who were HIV positive and met the criteria for treatment were put on Anti-Retroviral Therapy services. As a result, we have since observed a remarkable improvement in the quality of life of people living with HIV as well as a significant reduction in deaths due to AIDS.

I am sure the Honourable Member will agree with me that before the introduction of ARV, the hospitals in the country were over-crowded with the sick, in both in-patient and outpatient departments. Many of the sick

were also being cared for at households. Because of a sense of national responsibility and duty, many people volunteered their services free of charge in order to give emotional and psychological support to both people living with HIV and those affected. As a result, today community Counsellors are also doing voluntary counselling and testing in order to support Government efforts.

Recognising their important contribution to health, the Ministry successfully sourced funds from the Global Fund and the American President's Emergency Plan for AIDS Relief to give a monthly incentive to community counsellors, which is currently at a sum of N\$2,220.99. At first, they were receiving a sum of N\$500 per month, but not from the State coffers. Other indirect benefits from which community counsellors are benefiting include skills training. As a result, we have seen a number of community counsellors taking up employment elsewhere with better remuneration and some have gone on to further their studies in various fields.

Furthermore, the Ministry of Health and Social Services is currently undergoing restructuring with a view of having an additional extension cadre to link health services to the community. Once approved by the Office of the Prime Minister, hopefully, the priority in training and employment will be given to those who are at hand and absorbed in.

Question 2: "The money they are paid at the end of every month, is it a wage, a salary, an allowance or a tip?"

Comrade Speaker, Sir, in the first place, I thought I should define three words just to give him what is meant by what he asked, in case he did not know.

I will not talk of a tip, because by so doing I do not want to compromise my intelligence. According to the Oxford Dictionary, "wage: means a fixed regular payment for work, typically paid on a daily or weekly basis. On the other hand, salary is a fixed regular payment, made usually on a monthly basis by an employer to an employee, especially a professional or white-collar worker, whereas an allowance would mean the amount of something allowed. In other words, this can mean an amount of money

that can be earned or received free of tax and I consulted here by the way. Even before I went to the dictionary I checked with the Minister of Presidential Affairs and Attorney-General and he concurred with this definition and so did the Minister of Finance.

Given these definitions, my next move would be on the question of counsellors concerning their services, be it in reference to a call of duty related to HIV/AIDS or TB or both at the Ministry of Health and Social Services or to the public outside the Ministry, they are doing so as volunteers. Thus, they are not Public Servants. In this regard they are only given, in terms of the definitions, incentives and not salaries or allowances, by definition.

Question 3: "Why were these people, who sit with a heavy burden of looking after our patients physically and spiritually, neglected by Government and your Ministry?"

This is hogwash. Comrade Speaker, this is a very unfortunate statement, to say the least. It can only be said by a desperate mind. In a way, it is inciting to those who are doing a commendable job voluntarily.

HON NYAMU: On a Point of Order. Honourable Speaker, a word was used which, in my view, is not Parliamentary and it should be withdraw. "*Hogwash*" is the word.

HON SPEAKER: I do not see anything unparliamentary about it. You and I know the English language. Continue, Minister.

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES:

Comrade Speaker, I said this is a very unfortunate statement, to say the least and that it can only be said by a desperate mind. In a way, it is inciting to those who are doing a commendable job voluntarily.

Honourable Members will agree with me on this score, but someone with a hidden agenda, in this case cheap politicking, would make such a wild statement. It is not correct to say that community counsellors are neglected by Government. Indeed, they are considered as part of the Health team at health facilities.

I informed the Honourable Members that these counsellors are now receiving a sum of N\$2,220.99 per month plus other related benefits. Clearly, this has a positive impact on the welfare of the community counsellors. Under normal circumstances, one would have expected Honourable Ulenga to give credit to Government for the efforts being made in this regard, but for obvious reasons, to find him where he is today does not come as a surprise to me.

Question 4: "When can the community counsellors and the field promoters who do TB counselling and follow-ups expect a better salary and better conditions of employment, including a bonus every Christmas or year-end?"

Honourable Speaker, Sir, the policy for health care delivery services in Namibia is a pro-primary health care approach, which was launched at Independence by my mentor, Honourable Dr Nicky Iyambo in Oshakati. This calls for, amongst others, community involvement or participation. For example, Namibia has a challenge of multi-drug TB and/or XDR TB. One of the contributing factors for the above is because of failure for one to complete TB treatment course. We are fortunate in our country that TB is still curable.

In order to address the challenges related to defaulters we have put in place what is termed, direct observed treatment or DOT strategy in short. This is in line with the World Health Organisation that is in terms of the primary health care approach. What does this mean, Honourable Ulenga? For your information, it simply means the patients have to be observed by loved ones or any volunteer, a Good Samaritan who may come by to assist the one who is undergoing TB treatment in order for this patient to complete the treatment course. These people are playing this role. I thank you for your kind attention.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Speaker, I must say in the light of the answers provided by the Minister of Health and Social Services that it is unfortunate that that kind of language comes from the Honourable Richard Kamwi. However, I must say that the questions I put were put for the benefit of the people involved and for the public and, indeed, not for my own benefit. I want to urge the Minister to ensure that the people involved understand their relationship to Government exactly. It is not necessarily for me to understand it but the people involved and I put the questions as if I were a community counsellor and not a former Government Minister or a Deputy Minister or a member of SWAPO or a foreign diplomat. Those were not the shoes that I was putting on. I thank you, Honourable Speaker.

QUESTION 4:

Hon Ulenga asked the Minister of Mines and Energy-

- 1. Is it true that petroleum exploration Companies drilling near Maltahöhe, in recent years found evidence of the presence of petroleum in that area of Namibia?
- 2. If it is true, can the Minister reveal the identity of Companies involved and how much petroleum have they found?
- 3. What are the implications of these findings in terms of employment creation and the economy?
- 4. Can the Honourable Minister summarise to this House the results of petroleum exploration in Namibia so far?

ANSWER:

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. I rise to respond to the question asked by Honourable Ulenga of the CoD. I would like to thank the Honourable

Member for putting this question to our Ministry. I hope the Honourable Members have the questions before them and in responding I am not going to read the questions as put.

The answer to Question 1 is: Yes, it is true that there was a company that held a four-year exploration licence to search for oil and gas in and around that area. They have carried out preliminary work, including 500 kilometres of 2-dimension seismic surveys to give them a better understanding of the sub-surface. The next step was to look for partners to help them to fund the drilling of the well, which would have cost around N\$20 million. Unfortunately, they were unable to find partners and could not continue with the drilling of the well, which would have confirmed the presence of hydrocarbons. They gave up their licence on the 15th of November last year. It is, therefore, Honourable Speaker, not true that they have found evidence of petroleum in the area.

Question 2: The company that used to have the licence was called INA Industrija a Croatian company and they did not find any petroleum.

Question 3: The implications are that we missed employment and economic growth and all other benefits that would have come with the discovery of petroleum.

Question 4: Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, after Independence there was a huge interest in oil and gas exploration in Namibia with major international oil Companies taking up exploration licences in Namibia. From 1990 to 1999, we had three licensing rounds, one in 1991, another one in 1995 and the last one in 1999. The licensing rounds were conducted to invite foreign companies to come and invest in the prolific offshore basins of Namibia. In the first two licensing rounds, seven licences were awarded to Norsk Hydro, Ranger, Sasol, Chevron and Shell/Texacon. As a result of these licence awards, over 28,000 kilometres of 2-dimension seismic and 1,000 square kilometres were acquired in addition to the 60,000 kilometres of multi-planned data that was already available. Unfortunately, the results of drilling were not encouraging and most of them left by the end of decade.

The third licensing round in 1999 resulted in no applications being

received at all, partly because of the low oil price at the time as well as the numerous international company mergers that were going at that time.

From 1999 to date the licensing process has been carried out through the open licensing system and in 2000, Vanco was awarded the licence and in 2005 three more licences were awarded to Neptune Petroleum, Hunt Oil and to BHP Billiton.

Interest in the exploration for oil and gas in Namibia has continued to date, resulting in many other licences being awarded for exploration both onshore and offshore Namibia. Today several thousands of 2-dimension and 3-dimension seismic surveys have been carried out in Namibia and fourteen, exploration appraisal wells have been drilled offshore Namibia. However, of these fourteen wells, eight are in the Kudu Gas Field. Today we have companies such as Petrobras, Chariot Oil and Gas, HRT Oil and Gas, Arcadia Petroleum, Energulf Resources and many other companies that are exploring oil and gas in Namibia.

We expect international merger companies to come back to Namibia this year because of the initial work done by these smaller companies I have just mentioned. We also expect several wells to be drilled in the next two to three years and hope this time we will strike the elusive black gold in Namibia. I thank you very much, Comrade Speaker.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Speaker, firstly, I thank the Minister for the information. Again, it is not for my own benefit, it is for the benefit of those who want to know. Honourable Speaker, I wonder whether I heard the Minister right. He mentioned at the beginning of his answer something about 500 kilometres. I could not understand. It does not seem to be fitting into the concept. Did he mean 500 square metres or square kilometres? Can the Honourable Minister just say again, what he meant by these 500 kilometres?

Secondly, is the Minister actually saying that these explorers were unable to continue with the exploration and, therefore, could not confirm the presence of petroleum or is he saying that they did not complete their

exploration and confirmed the absence of petroleum? Can the Minister be more explicit in that regard?

Perhaps in summarising the history of petroleum exploration in Namibia, the Minister could also explain the recent front-page caption in one of thelocal newspapers where it said, "You've Got Oil". That was what was on the front page of one of the local newspapers recently and then the article went on discussing the possibility or the obviousness or the fact of oil being there in Namibia. Perhaps you can also make a comment on that one.

Lastly, Honourable Speaker, the fact that Minister Katali sits on that side and I do sit on this side and the fact that he is the Minister today and I am not a Minister, does not give him or anybody else the right to be dismissive, condescending or just directly disrespectful towards my person. It does not give you any credit or any right to do any of those things. Ministers are obliged to answer questions put to them in Parliament. Thank you very much.

HON SPEAKER: Yes, I reminded us that it is an obligation of the Ministers to answer faithfully, correctly, factually, where facts are available to questions put by the Opposition bench, but it goes both ways. Questions should not appear to insinuate or suggest things when they are put. That opens the envelope for the Ministers to respond in kind. We should clear that. There are so many ways to say things. If we could free our minds of putting questions that are likely to invite the kind of responses, that Ministers are equally obliged to not answer the questioner, but to answer the general public outside, otherwise both the questioner and the Ministers end up in the same pot, judged by the public out there.

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: Honourable Speaker, I am puzzled by the statement made by Honourable Ulenga, simply because in my response I did not invite him to say what he said. I thanked him for asking the question because I know it is not for his own information but

for the public and then I responded to the best of my knowledge.

Regarding the second set of questions that he asked, I said 500 kilometres of 2-dimension seismic survey and it is correct. Whether in the area of Maltahohe there was no oil found or the company did not drill enough to find oil, I said the second stage was for the company to get funding, so that after their preliminary studies they could now drill to find whether there is oil or not and they did not get that N\$20 million and, therefore, if you want to go and drill and find something, you can come and get a licence.

The third question is a very different question, it does not relate to the Maltahohe question and, therefore, I did not read that newspaper, neither did I write the article and I distance myself from the newspaper caption. Thank you, Honourable Speaker.

QUESTION 5:

Hon Moongo asked the Minister of Defence-

- 1. Is the Minister aware that it is now more than ten years that many Committees of Parliament informed the Minister of the health hazards in all military camps in Namibia?
- 2. How many new modern military camps were built so far in Namibia after Independence?
- 3. How many old South African military camps were demolished and if not, when are they going to be demolished?
- 4. What is the good reason that Sector 10 and other old South African military installations in Oshakati are still not demolished? Explain as to why there are stinky smells of sewerage water and strange smells throughout the camps to the public street, causing a health hazard in the whole of Oshakati? What action is the Minister going to take and if so, when?

ANSWER:

HON MINISTER OF DEFENCE: Thank you very much, Comrade Speaker. I would like to thank Honourable Moongo for asking these very pertinent questions on issues of national concern, but I do not know which calendar the Honourable Member is using to say that I have been here for more than ten years, which is not the case. Maybe he is using the Buddhist or Muslim calendar, but I will nevertheless give information.

Honourable Moongo mentioned risk and health hazards in all military camps in Namibia. It is not true that there are health hazards in all military camps in Namibia. There are those camps and bases, which are very old, and, therefore, those constructed during the colonial time are very old. Those bases were not constructed as permanent structures but with prefabricated materials. Therefore, the Ministry is already addressing this challenge because we cannot afford to expose our soldiers to health risks permanently. We are already on the right track to address these issues.

In the second question, he is asking how many modern military camps were built in Namibia after Independence. Honourable Member, construction of military bases is a very expensive undertaking and is entirely dependent on the construction procedures and the availability of financial resources, which should be shared with other competing national priorities.

The Ministry is ensuring that our soldiers should be housed decently and so far we have constructed new military bases at Osona, which is the Military School, Otjiwarongo, Naval Base, Walvis Bay, Keetmanshoop and Karibib and we are starting this year with construction at Eluno and Gobabis Military Bases. Where the facilities are becoming uninhabitable, efforts are being made to put up prefabricated accommodation facilities at various old bases. We will continue to renovate other barracks where possible through a rehabilitation programme, which we have adopted in the Ministry of Defence.

As I have earlier said, we have what we call the Engineer Regiment, which is situated at Otavi and we use their expertise to renovate some of

our ageing military basis.

The third question by Honourable Moongo is whether old military bases were demolished and if not, when they will be demolished.

Honourable Moongo, we were demolishing these military bases when we were fighting, now we have to maintain and rehabilitate them. We do not need to demolish them anymore.

Honourable Moongo, as I said earlier on, we are constructing new bases and, therefore, some of the old bases will then be demolished. You will remember that one or two years ago, we mentioned in this House that we want to demolish one of the former schools in Okahandja. We are demolishing that one to put up a new Defence Academy. It is being demolished now.

It is not easy with the financial constraints we have to build all accommodation simultaneously. We have a three-year rolling Budget and we have to budget for three years. We have to budget for the demolishing and the feasibility study and construction, but we are on the right track.

In his last question, Honourable Moongo wanted to know the good reason for keeping the former Sector 10 at Oshakati. The Honourable Member also asked about the smelly sewerage water in the base, running in public streets and causing a health hazard in the whole of Oshakati. We are going to leave Oshakati and these soldiers will be deployed at Eluno. As soon as Eluno has been constructed, Oshakati is done as far as we are concerned. It is very difficult to maintain the base at Oshakati and we are accelerating the construction of Eluno base so that those who are in Oshakati move to Eluno.

The sewerage system is not the responsibility of Defence, but that of the municipality. Of course, many of our members are already in Eluno, only some are still in Oshakati. Of course, the head office accommodation is in Oshakati, but the majority of them are already in Eluno.

I trust that when our Budget is presented before this august House, the Honourable Member will be one of those who support it wholeheartedly

so that we can solve these problems. We are not denying that we experience problems with the old bases at Oshakati and Otavi, which were built with prefabricated materials.

Honourable Member, I think I have done justice to your questions. I thank you.

QUESTION 6:

Hon Tjihuiko asked the Minister of Finance-

- 1. It has been reported in the print media that apparently, the Chinese business people in Namibia do not pay tax; neither do they bank their money in Namibian banks. Would you positively confirm that statement?
- 2. If the answer is negative, Chinese retailers in Namibia do not issue valid receipts, how do you assess income or what special method do you use to determine their income tax?

ANSWER:

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. No, it is not correct that the Chinese businesses do not pay taxes in Namibia, because the Namibian tax laws require of all those who are liable to pay tax in terms of the law to do so and there are no exceptions given to any businesses because of their nationalities and if there are incidences where businesses owned by Chinese nationals are not paying taxes, they are, like any other business, upon being audited and found not to be paying taxes, required to pay and appropriate penalties are imposed on them. If there are those who are known to any citizen of Namibia not to be complying, that have not been found out by the Inland Revenue office. I therefore wish to invite those Namibians to approach any official at the Inland Revenue office or myself with such information so that we can ensure that those individuals are brought into compliance with the law.

The second question was "If the answer is negative, the Chinese retailers in Namibia do not issue valid receipts, how do you assess income or what special method do you use to determine their income?"

In terms of the tax laws, businesses are required to keep financial records, of which of course receipts are an important part. If a business is found not to have kept records in accordance to the law, there are provisions in the law that empower the tax authorities to impose penalties, for the main part financial penalties against such businesses. I have however been made aware that certain people seem to prefer these penalties to complying. We are therefore contemplating to strengthen our laws, to ensure that we achieved better compliance in this regard. However, to the extent that a person has been found not to keep records, as is required for a period of five years, they are penalised.

The challenge is that an audit is not done every year on every taxpayer. You may therefore have a situation where one year or another a person who has not complied has managed to get away with it, but eventually when they are audited and they are found not to be in compliance, they are penalised appropriately. Thank you.

QUESTION 7:

Hon Tjihuiko asked the Minister of Lands and Resettlement-

Honourable Minister, you know as much as I do that there is serious confusion on the registration for the 20 hectares in communal areas.

- 1. What is the real benefit for a person in communal areas to register for 20 hectares of land?
- 2. What will happen to the people who may not be able to be registered at that specific village due to scarcity of land?
- 3. In the event where a person successfully applies and registers for 20 hectares in his or her name, will this person still qualify to apply

and benefit from the Government resettlement programme?

ANSWER:

HON MINISTER OF LANDS AND RESETTLEMENT: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. I want to thank the Honourable Member for the question he asked and I, right from the onset, want to mention that there is absolutely no confusion from the Ministry of Lands and Resettlement as far as it concerns the administering of this particular Act of Parliament. If there is confusion, then it is probably created somewhere else, but we are very clear in terms of what we want to do in terms of the Act of Parliament.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members of this august House, I rise to address the question raised under the administration of communal land by Honourable Tjihuiko on the 22nd of February 2011. The questions raised pertain to the administration of communal land under the ambit of the Communal Land Reform Act 5 of 2002. Therefore, Honourable Members, if you allow me I will clarify the issues raised by referring to the provisions of the abovementioned enabling legislation.

Section 28 of the said legislation stipulates that any person who before the commencement of the Act had a right in respect of the occupation or use of communal land, which was granted or acquired by such person in terms of any law or otherwise, shall continue to hold such rights. The rights under Section 28 may be a right to a residential unit and/or a right to a farming unit. However, the legal occupation or use of that land is subject to lodging an application with the relevant Communal Land Board for recognition and registration of the claim to the land by such person.

The Communal Land Board, in considering an application for an existing customary land right will take the following into consideration:

- (a) the date and manner in which the applicant acquired the right;
- (b) whether any other person claims a right to the same land;
- (c) whether the area conforms to the prescribed prices; and
- (d) the position of the boundaries of the land.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, the concerned Communal Land Board, once satisfied with the validity of the applicant's claim to the right, that board must recognise and register the applicant's right to the land and subsequently issue a certificate of registration of the right in the applicant's name. The certificate of registration issued ensures the applicant's legal right over the land for the natural life of the person and provides security of land tenure.

If you allow me, Honourable Speaker, let me now answer the specific questions asked by Honourable Tjihuiko.

Once someone's land right is properly registered and a certificate of registration is issued, this certificate of registration gives security of tenure to the occupier of land. Grazing rights and/or farming practices are properly regulated by the chiefs or traditional authorities, which may result in sustainable utilisation of natural resources, such as water.

Widows will have a preferential right of inheriting land rights when their spouses pass on. Equally, no widow will be evicted or asked to pay for the land when the husband dies and I assume, vice versa. Orphans will also not be easily evicted or asked to pay for the land where they lived with their deceased parents.

In a nutshell, Honourable Members, the benefit of registration of customary land rights is to give security of tenure over a piece of land in a given community. Namibia now has a database called the Namibia Communal Land Administration System, which records all land rights registered. The database keeps all land records for future references and for easy retrieval by both the traditional authorities and Communal Land Boards.

The database further provides updated information for future planning on land management and administration. The Ministry is currently busy with a project called Registration of Existing Communal Land Rights in which all those who claim to have land rights on communal land are expected by law passed by this Parliament to apply to relevant Communal Land Boards for recognition and registration thereof. Under the Act the registration process has a deadline of up to February 2012, unless

extended, in which all the existing land rights by then should be registered and issued with certificates of registration.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, on the issue of 20 hectares size, which seems to be the bone of contention of Honourable Tjihuiko, the 20 hectares are the maximum prescribed size that the traditional authority may allocate to an individual under the Act. However, the law does not dictate that every person must be allocated 20 hectares of land. The availability of land must direct concerned authorities on how much land to be allocated in that given area. What the law says is that the traditional authorities must not allocate portions of land exceeding 20 hectares without consulting the concerned Communal Land Board and the line Minister.

Taking the above into account, the law does not imply that individuals must be allocated 20 hectares. Individuals and communities shall be allocated the size of land they have at the time of application, depending on the use and availability of land in that specific area of traditional community.

Question 2: I assume that the Honourable Member wants to ask and I beg your indulgence if I am assuming wrongly, what will happen if someone cannot find land in his or her community. Assuming I am right, on what the Member's question is, I would like to inform Honourable Tjihuiko and this august House that every Namibian citizen is free to live in any part of Namibia, thus those who could not be allocated land in their traditional communities can approach any other traditional authority and apply for land rights in that particular traditional community area.

Honourable Members, the traditional authorities, Communal Land Boards and the Ministry shall ensure, in line with the provisions of the law, to regulate the allocation of land rights in order for every individual to have a portion of land to reside on, despite the likely scarcity of land in our communities.

Question 3: Honourable Speaker, people who are farming in overcrowded communal areas can still apply for resettlement under our Government's resettlement programmes. However, should they become successful under

the resettlement programme; they will be requested and would be expected to relinquish their grazing rights in the communal areas. However, they may still keep their residential rights on communal land, but not grazing rights. I thank you.

QUESTION 8:

Hon Moongo Asked the Minister of Regional and Local Government, Housing and Rural Development-

- 1. Is the Minister aware that the road from Ongwediva to Oshakati is so narrow that there are no differences between pedestrians and those driving, because they arrive at the same time?
- 2. Is the Minister aware that the road is twenty years downgraded?
- 3. When will the Minister allocate more money in order for the Municipalities to construct modern three-lane roads from Ondangwa, Ongwediva and Oshakati?
- 5. When is the Minister going to allocate money so that towns such as Opuwo and Ruacana can be provided with proper roads?

ANSWER:

HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members. Honourable Moongo asked the following question:

1. Is the Minister aware that the road from Ongwediva to Oshakati is too narrow that there is no more difference between people who are footing or the ones who are driving because they arrive at the same time?

Comrade Speaker, can the Honourable Member clarify so that I can understand about the people who arrive the same time. It is just for clarity. I have the answer here, but can he just tell me what is meant with that.

HON SPEAKER: I would have the same problem.

HON MOONGO: It is a pity that the Minister has not visited that area since December. It takes three hours to travel the 35 five kilometres from Ongwediva to Oshakati as the road is too narrow. We need another road and that is why I suggest that another road be constructed from Ongwediva to Oshakati if the Minister would provide some funds.

HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: It is clear. Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members, the question is misdirected. The B.1 highway from here to Ruacana is the responsibility of the Roads Contractor Company and not the Ministry of Local Government. The Honourable Member must just find out under which Ministry that company resorts.

HON MOONGO: According to my understanding, from Ongwediva to Oshakati falls under the municipality. Those towns are linked and, therefore, it is under the Ministry of Local Government and Housing. It is not a highway.

HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: The B.1 up to Ruacana falls under the Roads Contractor Company, not under the Local Authorities.

251

HON SPEAKER: The Minister is saying this is the wrong Ministry, direct it to the right Ministry and the answer will be provided.

HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: Question 2: "Is the Minister aware that the road is twenty years downgraded". Who downgraded the road? I do not know what the Honourable Member means with "downgraded".

Question 3: "When will the Minister allocate more money in order for the Municipalities to construct modern three-lane roads from Ondangwa, Ongwediva to Oshakati?" Even if the Municipality gets enough money, you have seen the Budget yesterday; they are not going to improve this road. It is not our responsibility.

"When is the Ministry going to allocate money so that towns such as Opuwo and Ruacana can construct proper roads?" Just support the Budget that was tabled yesterday. Once you support it, we will be able to construct better roads within the Local Authorities, but not highways.

QUESTION 9:

Hon Moongo asked the Minister of Health and Social Services-

- 1. Can the Minister confirm or deny that State doctors are deliberately denied their right to treat their private patients after official duty?
- 2. If it is true that there are harsh and biased regulations preventing State doctors to treat their private patients after duty and during the weekends, when is the Minister going to amend or revoke those draconian regulations which is against the Labour Act and the Bill of Rights which promotes uniformity in labour law?

ANSWER:

<u>HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES:</u> Honourable Speaker, Sir I thank you, for giving me the Floor.

Question 1: "Can the Minister confirm or deny that State doctors are deliberately denied their right to treat their private patients after official duties?"

I think, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Moongo has a problem. The way he puts his questions becomes a problem to some of us. Here I can only imagine that the Honourable Member was perhaps trying to find out whether the State doctors are denied their right to treat their private patients after official duties.

Be it what it may, Comrade Speaker, the State doctors are Civil Servants in the first place who are employed in terms of the Public Service Act, Act 13 of 1995. The Public Service Staff Rules stipulate that, "nobody appointed under this legislation may perform private remunerative work unless permission has been obtained from the Public Service Commission" and not the Minister of Health and Social Services. All staff members in the Ministry who apply for permission to do additional private remunerative work on top of their full time State employment must also complete a standard Public Service declaration on conflict of interest.

Honourable Moongo must, therefore first find out from his own sources or informants whether they have gone through this process. It is not, as I said, the duty of the Minister but rather the Public Service Commission. You got it wrong, Sir.

Question 2: "Is it true that there are harsh and biased regulations preventing State doctors to treat their private patients after duty and during weekends?"

I do not know, but again be it what it may, as I said above Honourable Moongo it is not true. To date the practice has been that various health professionals in the Ministry have permission from the Public Service Commission. Medical specialists have, since before Independence been

allowed to do limited private practice. They must, however, be fully registered with the Health Professional Council of Namibia in order to operate legally in the private sector.

State medical officers, these are doctors and pharmacists: It is the position of the Ministry of Health and Social Services that they can do stand-in, what is termed locum at existing practices but with the permission from the Public Service Commission.

Question 3: "When is the Minister going to amend or revoke those draconian regulations which are against the Labour Act and the Bill of Rights to promote uniformity in the Labour law?"

Through the Honourable Speaker, Honourable Moongo, the Public Service Act falls within the jurisdiction of the Office of the Right Honourable Prime Minister and certainly not the Minister of Health and Social Services, but I must add here that there is nothing against the Labour Act and the so-called Bill of Rights that the Honourable Moongo is trying to address. Do your homework, we are prepared to give information but not the way you are asking. Thank you, Honourable Speaker.

QUESTION 10:

Hon Moongo asked the Minister of Agriculture, Water and Forestry-

- 1. Is the Minister aware that the Oshakati water dam is full due to heavy rains?
- 2. Can the Minister confirm or deny that water of the said dam is overflowing and destroying houses, businesses and is about to kill people in Oneshila Township?
- 3. Is it also true that this dam is outdated to the extent that it has no sluices to release the water?

4. When will the Minister take drastic action and compensate the victims? It is high time that water dams be constructed a few kilometres from the cities or towns.

ANSWER:

HON MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY:

Thank you, Comrade Speaker. I am rising to respond to the questions posed by Honourable Philemon Moongo.

Comrade Speaker, in order to answer the questions posed; let me provide a brief summary of the background that is closely related to the water supply in Oshakati and surrounding areas.

The water that is supplied to a large part of the northern areas of our country is pumped from the Calueque Dam situated in the territory of the Republic of Angola through the Calueque-Oshakati National Canal. To the best of our knowledge, there is no dam, which is specifically put there to capture or to harvest rainwater, which belongs to the Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry or to NamWater, near Oshakati. The only reservoir or dam that belongs to NamWater, which is geographically situated near Oneshila Location, is the settling dam where water from the Calueque-Oshakati National Canal is collected for treatment. Such a dam does not overflow because the water is treated as it comes in. It has never been a threat to the Oshakati residents.

NamWater obviously has a responsibility to continue to ensure that the settling dam does not become a threat to the lives and properties of the people. Obviously, water that creates problems in Oshakati is rainwater and floods in the oshanas that flows from southern Angola on its way to the Etosha Pans. Such water, as Honourable Moongo has stated, is indeed a problem because the Oshakati town does not have a proper storm water drainage system. I am very sure that the Oshakati Town Council is seized with the matter, hopefully with the assistance of Central Government through the Line Ministry of Regional and Local Government, Housing and Rural Development, to deal with the issue of a proper water drainage system.

The issue of compensation is thus not an issue to be demanded from the Minister of Agriculture, Water and Forestry, neither the Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry as an institution, because no harm or damage was ever caused by the actions of the Ministry and/or NamWater staff or infrastructures of NamWater and/or the Ministry itself.

Lastly, Comrade Speaker, my explanations so far have also adequately covered question 5 and there is no need for repetition. I thank you, Comrade Speaker.

<u>HON SPEAKER</u>: I thank the Minister for his reply. Honourable Moongo.

HON MOONGO: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. I think the Minister was misinformed because Oshakati was already flooded two weeks ago and it is water from the dam. It has destroyed houses and people have to vacate houses. You also read it in the *Namibian* newspaper. The people wanted to kill each other because there was too much water from the dam and it is not floodwater. I think the Minister has

HON MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY:

Comrade Speaker, the Honourable Member does not need to become emotional. Of course, we are ready and if you could rephrase the question and give us more facts, we will investigate and deal with the matter. You do not need to become emotional about it, but I have provided the facts to respond to the questions as posed.

QUESTION 11:

to investigate.

Hon Von Wietersheim asked the Right Honourable Prime Minister-

With regard to the filling of the existing posts of Permanent Secretaries in each Ministry:

- 1. Where and when were they advertised?
- 2. Who applied?
- 3. Were interviews carried out in each instance?
- 4. Who were the candidates shortlisted and forwarded to the Public Service Commission?
- 5. Who were the successful candidates?

ANSWER:

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. I thank Honourable Von Wietersheim for his question and I would like to respond as follows:

- 1. The appointment of any person to, or the promotion or transfer of any staff member in or to the post of Permanent Secretary is indeed made by the Prime Minister in accordance with the provisions of Section 19(a) of the Public Service Act (Act 13 of 1995), subject to the provisions of Section 5(1).
- 2. Section 19(a) makes provision for the appointment, promotion and transfer of Permanent Secretaries to be made from the list of candidates submitted to the Prime Minister by the Secretary to Cabinet, subject to the provisions of Section 5(1) which makes provision that the appointment of any person to, or the promotion, transfer or discharge of any staff member in or to or from the Public Service shall be made by the Prime Minister on the recommendation of the Public Service Commission in accordance with the provisions of that Act.
 - 3. In the same vein, Section 20 of the Public Service Act makes provision for appointments on special condition, subject to the provisions of Section 5(1). Any person employed elsewhere in the Public Service may be appointed as a staff member on such special conditions as may be approved by the Prime Minister on the recommendation of the Public Service Commission, having regard

to the seniority of such a person.

- 4. The Government uses a blind approach that includes advertisements, robust selection and nomination processes as well as promotions of the existing management cadre who meet the minimum requirement of five years experience at a strategic senior management level and an appropriate Master's Degree, good references and a record of accomplishment of outstanding performances.
- 5. The appointment, promotion and transfer of all existing Permanent Secretaries have been recommended by the Public Service Commission as required by the law.
- 6. Currently there are twenty-nine Permanent Secretaries of which twenty-four are permanent employees of the Public Service and five are on renewable contracts, based on satisfactory performance. In the event of a vacancy, advertisements are placed in the internal Public Service Vacancy Circular and in local newspapers.

I hope the Honourable Member will be satisfied with that answer. I thank you.

HON VON WIETERSHEIM: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. I was hoping for more detailed information, so I am not quite satisfied. I would like to follow up with a question to the Right Honourable Prime Minister: How would the Right Honourable Prime Minister respond to the media report quoting the Public Service Commission Chairperson: "The Public Service Commission's inability to act independently is a great challenge, with the Office of the Prime Minister being the major influence on the Commission's operations and decision-making" and in the light of this, who are the Permanent Secretaries accountable to?

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: The Permanent Secretaries are accountable to the Ministers and to the Secretary to the Cabinet. What you have quoted which has been said by the Chairman of the Public

Service Commission, he is entitled to his views, if that is what he said and to the best of my knowledge, nobody interfered with the actions of the Public Service Commission. Everything is done according to law, as I have informed you. If you want information, you can go to the Public Service Commission and talk to the Chairman there, I cannot talk on his behalf. Thank you.

QUESTION 12:

Hon Nyamu asked the Right Honourable Prime Minister-

During the period between 2003 and 2004, the father of the family of the former Deputy Minister of Environment and Tourism, Honourable Leon Jooste, offered to donate six farms to the Namibian Government for distribution to the landless. This offer was briefly discussed in Cabinet, but the discussion was deferred or postponed to a later date for resolution.

- 1. What actually happened to this offer? Was it accepted or rejected?
- 2. Assuming that the offer was accepted, who benefited from the distribution of these farms?
- 3. If the farms in question were distributed as per Government policy of resettlement, can the Right Honourable Prime Minister kindly provide this House with proof thereof?
- 4. If, on the other hand, the offer was rejected, can the Right Honourable Prime Minister provide the House with the reasons for its rejection?

ANSWER:

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: First of all, I thank Honourable Nyamu of the RDP for this question and I would like to answer as follows:

Cabinet, during its 29th meeting held on the 12th of October 2004, noted:

- 1. "In view of the reported news that a certain Mr Jooste, who lives in Cape Town, South Africa, owns a large tract of land around Grootfontein, primarily to keep game for hunting, Cabinet expressed its amazement at how such land continues to remain the ownership of just one individual while the majority of citizens are craving for land.
- 2. The Ministry of Lands, Resettlement and Rehabilitation undertook to get more information on the extent of the land in question and to see if any action is warranted in this regard.
- 3. Cabinet found the above in order."

The late Mr Jooste never, and I want to stress, never made an offer of land to the Government of the Republic of Namibia. I can only suspect that Honourable Nyamu's memory is probably failing and I do not blame him. Age and confusion seem to be catching up with him. That is why he left while his Vice-President was reading a statement. I would suggest that it is time for the Honourable Member to retire. I thank you.

QUESTION 13

Hon Moongo asked Minister of Health and Social Services-

- 1. Is the Minister aware about the plight and the challenge faced by patients who used to go and fetch the antiretroviral tablets from very far distances, like at regional hospitals?
- 2. Is the Minister aware that these patients are struggling to find transport money to collect their tablets?
- 3. When will the Anti-Retro-Viral tablets be distributed to all clinics in all Regions?
- 4. When will the Ministry start training nurses to also give out Anti-

Retro-Viral tablets?

5. Is the Minister also aware that lack of food, money and long distances demoralise the patients? What can the Ministry do to iron out these problems?

ANSWER:

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Thank you, Honourable Speaker, for giving me the Floor to respond to the questions put to me by Honourable Moongo.

"Is the Minister aware about the plight and the challenge faced by patients who used to go and fetch the antiretroviral tablets from very far distances, like at regional hospitals?"

Yes, I am aware of this. If that is the question that he is asking, I am aware.

"Is the Minister aware that these patients are struggling to find transport money to collect their tablets?"

Yes, I am aware, and what have we done? Just last week I was on air, informing the Nation what we are doing there. Mindful of the floods, we were informed by our colleagues in the Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry and we reorganised our logistics and put everything in place. We have stocks up to two months supply and that includes supplies related to people living with HIV/AIDS. Yes, indeed, we remain grateful to the Ministry of Safety and Security and the Ministry of Defence who supplied air transport and once we are out of stocks, they are always available to assist these fellow Namibians. Therefore, everything is in place.

"When will the Anti-Retro-Viral tablets be distributed to all clinics in all Regions?" I said the stocks are in place and I do not know which clinics you are referring to.

"When will the Ministry start training nurses to also give out Anti-Retro-Viral tablets?"

Honourable Speaker, Sir, the mere fact that we have Anti-Retro-Viral drugs in place at these clinics suggests clearly to anybody that these nurses are qualified to do what they do professionally. They are trained to do that. For those who were not trained, training is an ongoing exercise and we are working on that.

"Is the Minister also aware that lack of food, money and long distances demoralise the patients?" I am not aware of that.

"What can the Ministry do to iron out these problems?" I cannot because it does not fall within the jurisdiction of my mandate. Thank you very much, indeed.

QUESTION 14:

Hon Moongo asked the Minister of Works and Transport-

- 1. It is an untenable fact that rain brings fortune and destruction. When will the Ministry employ road workers to repair dislocated bridges, potholes and cut tall grasses alongside the roads for safety reasons?
- 2. Is the Minister informed about the terrible situation on the road between Okahandja and Okondjatu? Will the Minister alleviate this problem?
- 3. Is it not time now that hundreds of unemployed Namibians be employed, to initiate projects country wide that will repair roads and to cut grasses?

ANSWER:

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members of Parliament, first I would like to thank Honourable Moongo for the questions that he raised. In answering these questions, I will also take advantage of explaining some programmes that the Ministry is engaged in. I agree with Honourable Moongo when he says that it is a fact that the rain brings fortune and destruction. It is a fact

that no one can dispute. He furthermore asks when the Ministry of Works and Transport will employ thousands of road workers to repair dislocated roads, bridges and potholes, as well as to cut grass alongside the Namibian roads for safety purposes. In addressing this question, I would like to deal with it in two ways.

First, I will deal with the substantive matter dealing with the repair of roads, bridges and potholes. Secondly, I will then deal with the matters that relate to job creation by our Ministry and finally, I will deal with the matter relating to safety on our roads.

I want to give the statistics of the roads which we investigated. Damaged road infrastructure that needs urgent restoration are found in the following Regions:

Hardap Region: MR 31 gravel road: Helmeringhausen – Maltahöhe and Maltahöhe-Sesriem-Solitaire (tourist passes and river drifts washed away.

Erongo Region: Walvis Bay-Swakopmund (washed away by the flooding of the Swakop River). This road was restored by Langer Heinrich Mine.

Khomas Region: Windhoek-Midgard and Solitaire-Kuiseb Pass (Damage at Gaub Pass over Gaub River).

Omaheke Region: MR 39 gravel road Leonardville-Gobabis; MR 70 Omitara-Steinhausen; Gobabis-Trans-Kalahari border post (Buitepos).

Otjozondjupa Region: MR 59 Okahandja-Otjozondu;

Oshikoto Region: DR 3629 gravel road Omuthindi-Olukonda.

Omusati Region: DR 3616 gravel road Epalela-Onesi; DR 3633 gravel road Tsandi-Ongulumbashe; DR 3626 gravel road Okahao-Etilyasa; DR 3641 gravel road Olupaka-Onesi; DR3655 gravel road Etaka-Oshaala.

Oshana Region: DR 3636 gravel road Eheke-Onakanwandi; DR3615 gravel road Oshikuku-Elim; DR 3619 gravel road Onaanda-Omapopo.

Ohangwena Region: DR3637 gravel road Okapya-Ohalushu; DR 3608 gravel road Ongenga-Okombebe; DR 3639 gravel road Oshokango-Okahenge; DR 3633 gravel road Okanwa-Onheleiwa; MR 120 gravel road Okatana-Endola; DR 3609 gravel road Oshakati-Omungwelume; DR 3625 gravel road Oshigambo-Eenhana.

Karasburg-Ariamsvlei road: On 4 February 2011, heavy rains caused extensive damage to TR3/1 between Karasburg and Ariamsvlei. Government availed N\$25 million for the restoration of the damaged section of the road. The repair work is in progress and the work is expected to be completed in May this year.

Resealing work: Gobabis-Trans-Kalahari border post (Buitepos) road: In addition to the above, the condition of the tarred road has deteriorated into potholes due to the heavy rains. The most severe affected road being the road between Gobabis and Trans-Kalahari border post (Buitepos). The Namibia Roads Products has been appointed for the potholes patching work and a rejuvenation seal will be applied as soon as the rains have ceased, as this work can only be executed in dry conditions. This will be effected under the normal road maintenance programme for the Financial Year 2011/2012.

Actions being taken to repair the affected road infrastructure:

On all the affected roads the Roads Authority has contractors on site through their Annual Road Maintenance programme to restore accessibility.

Let me start with the matter dealing with the repair of roads, bridges and potholes. My Ministry, through the Roads Authority, has commenced with the potholes patching and repairs to the roads washed away, which includes the drainage system and the road reserve grass mowing. The SME contractors are involved in these road maintenance works. This process, however, is commencing at a slow pace due to continuous rainfall especially in the northern parts of the country.

I must also mention here that my Ministry is faced with a financial backlog on the periodic maintenance of our road network. According to

our assessment for this financial year, the Roads Authority requires a lot of money for the road maintenance projects.

I now turn to the issue of job creation from our Ministry. As you may know, the Government of the Republic of Namibia is seriously concerned about the persistent unemployment rate, especially amongst the youth. As a result of this, the Ministry of Works and Transport will be engaged in job creation efforts in all two sectors of transport. In particular, job creation in the Road Sector will top the priority. In this regard, I have in mind labour-based projects planned for 2011/2012 and 2012/2013. These roads that will be constructed, using labour-based methods, have a potential of creating over 5,600 jobs in the next two Financial Years. Many of them are at the moment in several different phases, from feasibility study, design and tender process. Actual construction to many of these roads will start in June 2011. Upgrading of Omafo-Ogenga-Outapi and Omakange-Ruacana roads are planned to start by 1st November 2011. These two roads have a potential of creating over 240 jobs over the next two years.

On the rail sector, as you might know, we have taken delivery of over 6,000 metric tons of rails. Over 900 metric tons of these rails are already delivered in Ondangwa. These are the rails to be used on the Northern Railway Extension between Ondangwa and Oshikango. Already several job opportunities have been created with the loading and off-loading of these rails. The tender for the construction of the railway line between Ondangwa-Oshikango closed on the 28th March 2011. Adjudication is underway and actual construction is expected to start soon. This project has the potential of creating over 100 jobs over two years. Similarly, the upgrading and rehabilitation of Aus-Lüderitz Railway Line, which is a continuing project, has the potential of creating another 100 jobs. Equally, the Sleeper Manufacturing Factory which we have established in Tsumeb recently to support the upgrading of the entire railway net work will be in full production by June this year. This project has a potential of bringing over 50 permanent jobs.

With regard to the issue that relates to safety on our roadsides, I agree fully with Honourable Moongo as safety is our Ministry's prime focus.

We will soon start clearing long grass along the rail reserves of most of our railway network as well as the road reserves. These processes are at tendering stage. The combined efforts of both roadside clearance as well as rail reserve clearance have the potential of creating several jobs.

I would like now to deal with Honourable Moongo's question that relates to the terrible situation on the road between Okahandja and Otjosondu. The question asks if the Minister will alleviate this problem. Honourable Speaker, the responsibility to manage the entire road network of this country rests with the Ministry of Works and Transport. It is also the responsibility of the Minister of Transport to ensure that construction standards on our national roads do not compromise safety. In this regard, I must explain to the Honourable Member that the road between Okahandja and Otjosondu settlement has deteriorated significantly on account of trucks that move heavy loads to and from the mines. Over the past few years the growth of the mines in that area has increased significantly, resulting in increased export commodities. Because of this, the frequency of the movement of the trucks on this road has also increased unexpectedly. As a short-term measure and to alleviate the dangerous situation that prevails on these roads and to allow maintenance work to be done undisrupted, a section of this road has been closed to traffic. The alternative route via MR0057 is being repaired to allow the traffic flow. On the long term, discussions are underway with the Private Sector operating on that road to see how the road can be upgraded to bitumen standard, using private-public partnership.

Finally, I concur with Honourable Moongo's question which he posed in the form of a statement and support him that it is time for us to employ hundreds of unemployed Namibians on various projects in this country. I have dealt significantly with such projects in my attempt to answer Honourable Moongo's first question, which I believe is similar to this one. I thank you.

QUESTION 15:

Hon Moongo asked the Minister of Health and Social Services:

- 1. It's a fact that the Minister gets a second lion share in the 2011-2012 National Budget. Are there still other excuses not to consider the community health counsellors?
- 2. Is it true that the role played by the community health counsellors is vital and effective? If yes, is this not the right time to improve the working conditions with benefits such as salaries, pension, medical aid, social security and bonus?
- 3. What is the good reason that community health counsellors are working full time, full month while regarded as temporary volunteers?
- 4. Can the Minister explain as to why the community counsellors are underpaid with N\$2,220.00 while they have big family to maintain?
- 5. Is the Minister aware that it's risky to serve people affected by communicable diseases such as TB, people living with HIV/AIDS?
- 6. When is experienced health counsellors going to be permanently employed?

ANSWER:

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Thank you, Comrade Speaker, for once again giving me the Floor. Indeed, I wish to thank Honourable Moongo for asking me these questions, some of which were earlier put to me by one of his senior Colleagues and I will be referring to my earlier response.

Question 1: "It is a fact that the Minister gets the second lion's share in the 2011/2012 national Budget."

Indeed, I agree and I already thanked the Honourable Minister of Finance for returning our status of being the SWAPO Party Government's second

priority. However, on the question of, "are there still other excuses not to consider the community health counsellors", I wish to state that this Budget is addressing the salaries of Civil Servants and you would recall that when I responded to Honourable Ben Ulenga on 3rd March 2011, I said Community Counsellors are not Government employees. Indeed, Honourable Speaker, I wish to state that Honourable Member Moongo is in possession of the Medium Term Expenditure Framework for 2011/2012 and I do know that he has the speech of the Honourable Minister of Finance. May be the Honourable Member should assist me and show me where there is a provision meant for salaries for Community Counsellors. I perused the documents and I could not come across any.

On question 2, "is it true that the role played by the Community health counsellors is vital and effective", yes indeed, I responded to Honourable Ben Ulenga by saying: "Yes, indeed, I am aware of the efforts being made by community counsellors and we acknowledge they are part of the team, but the underlying factor is, they are not Civil Servants."

Question 3: "What is the good reason that Community Health Counsellors are working full-time, full month while regarded as temporary volunteers?" As far as I am concerned, Honourable Speaker, Sir, they are not temporary volunteers, but they are simply volunteers and they are not Civil Servants.

"Can the Minister explain as to why the community counsellors are underpaid with N\$2,220 while they have big families?" I responded to this on the 3rd of March 2011, and I quote myself by saying: "Recognising their important contribution to the health sector, the Ministry of Health and Social Services successfully sourced funds from the Global Fund and the American President's Emergency Plan for AIDS Relief to give monthly incentives to community counsellors, which currently stands at a sum of N\$2,220,99 and at first they were only receiving a sum of N\$500 per month." That remains my answer to Honourable Moongo as well.

"Is the Minister aware that it is risky to serve people affected by communicable diseases, such as TB, living with HIV/AIDS." By definition, yes, indeed I agree with the Honourable Member that these are communicable diseases and, therefore, they are at risk. All health workers are at risk when they attend to clients.

"When are experienced health counsellors going to be permanently employed?" I cannot give a definite response to this, because there is no such a provision in the Public Service, unless we would be advised by the Public Service Commission, but otherwise as it stands for now, we do not have such a provision in the Public Service, they remain volunteers.

When I responded to Honourable Ulenga on 3rd March, I stated that the Ministry of Health and Social Services is undergoing a restructuring exercise. We made provision during this exercise and some of them, should it be approved by the Public Service Commission, would be enlisted as public servants and they will be taken on board. However, as it stands, they remain volunteers. Thank you very much indeed.

HON MOONGO: Honourable Speaker, I would like to thank the Minister for the answer, although I wanted to know whether the Ministry of Health and Social Services allocated some money this year in order to create jobs, because we have to start with those volunteers. Have you started employing in order to fight against unemployment in Namibia or do you still have to wait for the Public Service Commission?

HON MINISTED OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SEL

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Honourable Speaker, Sir, the Honourable Members in this Chamber received this book. Please, I want to plead with the Honourable Member to go through this book. (Interjection)

HON MOONGO: I am asking you.

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: I cannot read for you. You are one of the senior Members of this Chamber. Please let us do the homework given to us by the Honourable Minister of Finance. Thank you very much.

QUESTION 16:

Hon Moongo asked the Prime Minister:

It is a fact that members of PLAN, SWAFT and koevoet were integrated at Independence and were made to share 36 million Rand from South Africa.

- 1. What prompted the Namibian Cabinet to decide discriminatory against Article 10 and Article 30 of the Namibian Constitution; not to consider members of SWAFT and koevoet also to be assisted by receiving veterans' money? Can the Prime Minister explain what type of justice is used?
- 2. When will the Cabinet decide to pay back 24 million Rand to the rightful owners, the ex SWAFT and koevoet since they are not considered to receive the veterans money?

ANSWER:

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. I would like to thank Honourable Moongo for his question and I would like to remind him, as perhaps his memory is failing him, that in 2008 this very Parliament he has been sitting in for a number of years, passed an Act called the Veterans Act (Act 2 of 2008). He was here when that Act was passed. That Act defines a veteran and the definition of a veteran is as follows: "A veteran means a person who: (a) was a

member of the liberation forces; (b) consistently and persistently participated or engaged in any political, diplomatic or underground activity in furtherance of the liberation struggle; (c) owing to his or her participation in the liberation struggle was convicted, whether in Namibia or elsewhere, of any offence closely connected to the struggle and sentenced to imprisonment." That does not include a person who during the war deserted the liberation struggle, unless that person subsequently rejoined the struggle.

The liberation struggle is defined as follows: "Liberation struggle means the political, diplomatic, military or underground struggle waged against colonialism, racism and apartheid, which struggle was waged in Namibia and other countries and resulted in the attainment of the Independence of Namibia on the 21st of March 1990."

Honourable Moongo knows very well that SWATF cannot fit in this definition. Thank you.

HON MOONGO: Thank you very much for the answer, but it is not complete because I wanted to know what prompted the Cabinet to decide to accept the money from South Africa which was meant for SWATF and now they are discriminating against those who served in SWATF. What prompted Cabinet to make that decision?

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Cabinet does receive gifts from foreign organisations. When the President declared a State of Emergency, many Governments volunteered to donate. I suppose the money you are referring to was a donation from South Africa. Recently South Africa donated one million and it was accepted. Therefore, it is the prerogative of the Government to accept or not to accept a donation. I have no other way of explaining. The donation was accepted.

271

QUESTION 17:

HON MAAMBERUA: Honourable Speaker, I give Notice that on Thursday, the 23rd of June 2011, I shall ask the Minister of Health and Social Services the following questions:

- 1. I gather that many patients who visit State Hospitals have difficulties in communicating their illnesses to doctors in English or even in Afrikaans because they do not know these languages. What mechanisms or facilities are there to assist with the translations at State Hospitals?
- 2. In Courts translations are provided for. Can similar services also be provided in State Hospitals and if so, how soon?
- 3. Are there general standards in the hospitals in terms of levels of service provision and hygiene? If so, are these standards monitored regularly and by whom?
- 4. How are hospitals rated in the light the foregoing, that is the standards of service delivery and how is the Grootfontein Hospital rated?
- 5. Is there a customer care charter at the Grootfontein Hospital and if so, is it translated into indigenous languages? Accordingly, how long does a patient have to wait for a doctor who is on call?

ANSWER:

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Honourable Speaker thank you for giving me the Floor to respond to these questions.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, first I wish to thank Honourable Maamberua for the questions put to me for the information of the general public.

On question 1 he gathers that many patients who visit hospitals have

difficulties in communicating their diseases to doctors in English or even Afrikaans because they do not know these languages and asked what mechanisms and facilities are there to assist translations at State Hospitals.

The patients are screened by nurses before they see a doctor. The history of illness, the signs and symptoms are written down during the course of screening. English is the official language for communication in this country, thus during the training for both enrolled nurses and registered nurses one of the requirements is English. A doctor is always with a nurse when examining patients so that the nurse can help translate for the doctor and the patient. In addition, most of the expatriate doctors who have been in the country for a while learn the local language, at least the basics that are required in order to understand and communicate with patients.

Question 2 is almost similar to this one, that in Courts translations are provided for and can similar services also be provided in State Hospitals and if so, how soon?

I agree with him that this is a necessary service. However, one may not compare in terms of numerical the clients attending Courts and the clients that we attend to in hospitals or clinics. The numbers are certainly not the same. One wonders whether we would be in a position to accommodate this, taking into consideration the vernacular we have in this country. The Ministry, however, is currently undergoing restructuring and this question will be one of those that will be addressed during the process by either increasing the posts of nursing staff or creating a cadre to perform this task, but I have my own doubts whether the Public Service Commission will agree to this. The Public Service is already bulged.

Question 3 is whether there are general standards in hospitals in terms of level of service provision and hygiene and if so, are these standards monitored regularly and by whom?

My answer is that there is a policy on infection control that deals with hygiene and waste disposal. Each hospital, including the Grootfontein District Hospital, has a staff member who is responsible for infection control. This staff member should be working together with cleaning services and provide training to cleaners.

Question 4: "How are hospitals rated in the light of the foregoing", meaning the standards of service delivery, "and how is the Grootfontein Hospital rated?"

I would say that currently we do not have a rating system for hospitals, but the hospital hygiene is monitored by the nurses in charge of these hospitals and have the same standards all over. The national and regional level do support visits to district hospitals and assist in all areas, such as patient care and general support including the related hygiene. We acknowledge that Grootfontein District Hospital has some challenges related to leadership. Fortunately, the current Head of the hospital is retiring soon. We trust we may get someone with strong leadership skills once the post will be advertised during the course of July this year.

Question 5: "Is there a customer care charter at Grootfontein Hospital and if so, is it translated into indigenous languages?" My answer is yes, we have the Patient Charter of Namibia which was produced in 1998 and the Grootfontein District Hospital has copies of this booklet. Furthermore, the booklet was translated into five local languages, namely Oshivambo, Herero, Rukwangali, Silozi and Afrikaans. This Charter is now being reviewed and a first draft is already in circulation for comments by whomever. I have some copies for the information of Honourable Maamberua and, indeed, the Nation. I have one here for "Orutuu rovavere va Namibia", which you will understand better and then we have one here, "Liswanelo za mukuli mwa Namibia".

Honourable Speaker, many of our doctors, including those at the Grootfontein District Hospital, are living within the hospital premises and patients are not supposed to wait that long for a doctor on call, except in situations where a doctor may be attending to another patient or there is an emergency, be it in a theatre or elsewhere. Thank you very much.

HON MAAMBERUA: Honourable Speaker, I thank the Minister for the attempt to answer the questions. However, I should stress that I am not satisfied. The Minister did not address the questions satisfactorily and I should be able to point that out. The situation is very serious. In the first

question where the answer is that a nurse will first screen the patient before the patient sees the doctor, the concern is the language. If, for example, an Oshivambo-speaking person who does not understand either English or Afrikaans or any other language in Namibia goes to a clinic or hospital and the nurse is Damara-speaking, how is that person going to be able to relate his or her illness to the nurse. Irrespective whether it is a nurse or a doctor attending to this particular person, if there is no translation, there is no translation.

The fact that English is the official language in Namibia does not justify that people have to struggle on their own to express themselves. Hence, the Government of the Republic of Namibia has considered it as important that the indigenous people should actually be assisted where they do not understand the English language and hence, in the courts of law provision is made for that. Of course, one would not expect that all hospitals and all clinics in Namibia would provide that service, but there should be some critical attempts to do so in clinics and hospitals and I think it is affordable and it can be done.

Question 4 was on service provision standards. I did not talk about hygiene. I am not talking about the cleanliness in hospitals, I am talking about the attendance and provision of service to patients in hospitals and at the clinics and that the Minister did not address.

I am well acquainted with the Charter that the Minister is referring to, it is a general Charter of the Public Service, but every Ministry is expected to have its own charter according to its own unique mandate. The charter is not just a booklet; it is actually a poster that is placed at the entry point of every service delivery. That is a contract between, in the case of the Ministry of Health, the patient and the management of the Ministry, not a booklet that is in the office of an official somewhere in the Ministry.

On the last question, the fact that the current Head of the Grootfontein Hospital is about to retire and another one will be appointed may not necessarily change the situation because we have to view the situation holistically. It is not just the person who may be the problem, but let us look at the entire ethnical environment at that hospital and address that.

We cannot address a multi-faceted problem at a hospital by looking at one particular individual.

Still on the same question, the Minister is not sure as to how long a doctor on call takes to attend to a patient at the Grootfontein Hospital, hence the Minister says such a doctor "is not supposed" to take that long. It means this is a guess by the Minister because it is not emphatic, it is not precise, and it is a supposition. I am not making a speech; I am now giving information with request to the questions.

Today, very early in the morning before 06:00, I went to several clinics in Windhoek. The first clinic that I visited was the Khomasdal Clinic where I already found fifty people in a queue, hoping to be attended to by either the nurses or a doctor during the day. I also looked at whether there was a Customer Care Charter; there was none where I entered the building. The very small one is the Mission Statement in an A4-size paper somewhere in an obscure corner at that clinic. I talked to the people in the queue, asking them how long would it take for them to be attended to, particularly the last person in that queue. Of course, the answers vary, it will take them four, five, six, seven hours.

I went on to the Katutura Clinic where I found about two hundred people in a queue at that very early hour in the morning. At the Katutura TB Clinic in the same compound I found about one hundred patients already queuing that time. Again no customer care charter, so a patient coming to the clinic will not know what is the contractual obligation between me as a patient and the Ministry in terms of what time it should take for me to be attended to. The charter is a social contract.

I went on to the Okuryangava Clinic where at the ARV section of that clinic I found about a 120 patients who, I suppose because of the humane nature of the nurse there, could actually be seated, but there are no seating arrangements within the yard for those patients who will come long before the opening hours at the clinic.

At the other section of the Okuryangava Clinic I found about sixty patients, not seated because they had to queue outside and again no customer care charter. This is very serious and this is only Windhoek we

are talking about. I know the situation because since I have asked this question I have received several calls, some from the Walvis Bay TB Clinic with the same complaints. Therefore, I think we have to address the service delivery, the quality, and the standards in a different manner. Therefore, I have no other choice than to move a Motion that we debate the health situation and service delivery in various clinics and hospitals in Namibia next week. Thank you very much.

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker, Sir. I appreciate the concerns of Honourable Maamberua. I stated what we are doing with regard to the issue of language; I did not say outright that we do not need that service, absolutely not. However, it is very unrealistic for Honourable Maamberua to suggest that we provide translation services to the health facilities in this country as it is not possible under the circumstances. I said we are working on restructuring and it will be up to the Public Service Commission to decide whether it is possible, but I do know that since I came to this Ministry it is something that has been coming in and out, it is just not possible. Do we have such resources? The answer is that it is not possible; we do not have such resources.

Concerning standards, we are doing our best to address the service in terms of the standards. We may not do more than we can at the present moment for the simple reason that we do not have the necessary resources to carry out what we want to do.

As for the Charter that you seem to have a problem with, you yourself admitted having found these documents wherever you went. You did not say that they were not there, but do not expect me to go out there and put them where you want them to be. There are Directors, we have put in place some supervisors and we are talking to them, we are addressing the matter.

On the retirement of the Principal Medical Officer, you did not give me an alternative as to what we should do other than what we are addressing. This man is leaving and once he leaves, we think we may get the best

candidate. However, can I share with you how many Namibian Principal Medical Officers we have out there? We are relying heavily on expatriates. We recently commissioned a School of Medicine, let us wait and see. It is only then when you have sufficient from our own resources that you would be talking loud, but as for now we are doing our best. When we received this man he had certified copies of all the documents and we accommodated him. He went through the normal channels but in the end we were not satisfied and as a result he is leaving. All I can say is what I shared with you, let us wait and see.

I am glad you went around visiting the clinics, but you know I have a mobile phone, you know there is a Director for Khomas Regional Health Director and at no stage did you deem it fit to invite a Director to be with you to confirm whether indeed you went to Katutura Clinic, which I do not know anyway. I know of Katutura Health Centre, but I do not know the clinic you referred to. Similarly for Khomasdal you should have invited a Director. My Deputy Minister is around, I am around, we are in the city, but you did not bother to invite us to be there. Again I am saying I do not know the Katutura TB Clinic, this must be a new clinic as I only know the Katutura Intermediate Hospital TB Ward. You should at least have invited me to come and see the new clinic as I do not know of that clinic.

At Okuryangava ARV you found a 120 patients queuing. I do not know what time it was. You should have invited any of the seniors. I have on many occasions listened to some complaints, I read the SMSs and we usually respond to those who invite us. If it is in a ward, invite the Principal Medical Officer, invite the Superintendent, invite the Matron to come and share your experience instead of coming here. What is the whole hullabaloo about? It is only you who were there, we were not there.

I did not say we are not experiencing challenges, there are challenges in the health sector in this country, but those challenges are not insurmountable. I want to invite you to look at what is happening outside Namibia in other countries. I am telling you, we are receiving patients from some of the neighbouring countries because we are delivering. The challenges are there but not insurmountable.

Provision for seating arrangements, what seating arrangements? You want us to come up with what? What we have there is what we can afford, Sir, with the means that we have at our disposal. You are talking about no customer care outside the clinic, there is customer care and customer care is only provided in district hospitals and intermediate hospitals and not in clinics. We are doing our best. That is all I can say, Honourable Speaker, Sir. Thank you.

HON MAAMBERUA: I have already said that I will table a Motion next week, but I just want to clarify. Obviously, the situation of health in Namibia in terms of service delivery and standards of service provision is not going to allow us to wait for the graduates from UNAM ten years from now. As a citizen of this country, concerned with the situation on the ground, I do not have to ask the Minister, the Permanent Secretary or a Director to be able to visit any clinic and to count for myself the people standing in the queue. I know how to count; I know how to assess the environment outside. I am not talking about whether patients are treated, medically speaking, correctly or not, I am talking about the environment and that is where I stopped.

Allow me to go again to many other clinics and talk about the same things here without the Minister, the Permanent Secretary or a Director and I am not going to stop there, I shall go to the Ministry of Labour and many other institutions where we have to go to experience for ourselves. If I undertake missions in an official capacity, that is a different matter, but as a citizen I shall do that and together, collectively, comradely and mutually we shall improve the welfare of our people in this country. The Motion shall come next week.

QUESTION 18:

<u>HON MAAMBERUA</u>: I give Notice that on Thursday, the 23rd of June 2011, I shall ask the Minister of Youth, National Service, Sport and Culture the following questions:

- 1. Is the Minister aware that in the past few years there has been an exodus of Namibian youths to other countries, including the United Kingdom, the United States of America, Canada and some other countries?
- 2. Would the Minister agree with me that since there is no youth unemployment benefit fund, many unemployed youth become poor and hopeless, resulting in them having to risk leaving Namibia for other countries.
- 3. If the Minister is aware of this desperate situation, can you give a breakdown of many youths have left Namibia under these conditions and precisely in which countries do they find themselves? In what type of conditions do they live there? Are they better off there than they were in Namibia?
- 4. Would your Ministry consider introducing a Basic Income Grant for the unemployed youths as a matter of priority?

ANSWER:

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: Thank you very much. Firstly, let me say that the Ministry of Youth, National Service, Sport and Culture does not preside on the issue of migration, visas, etcetera. This falls within the jurisdiction of the Ministry of Home Affairs and Immigration, therefore our Ministry will not be in a position to give an answer on the issue of youth migration and how they are treated in the countries of final destination. Therefore, this question was misdirected.

On the question of economic situation and greener pastures, the issue of unemployment and poverty is a global issue. Again I am not in a position to talk about issues that prompt some of these people to seek greener pastures and the issue of poverty and greener pastures. We normally say that we live in a global village and a global village allows citizens of the globe to move from one destination to another for a number of reasons, amongst others economic migration. I am sure Honourable Maamberua as a citizen of the globe has firsthand experience of that because he used to

work for the Africa Development Bank, which is testimony of global migration. As to what prompted this youth, there is nothing that can stop them from searching for greener pastures across the globe, provided that they are doing that within the parameters of the law, be it from the country of origin or the countries were they are migrating. Migration is a global trend and it should be done within the spirit of international and global instruments.

Again, our Ministry is not responsible for that issue of migration. We are doing everything within our power to curb unemployment and to contribute to economic development, but still we cannot stop these youth from migrating wherever they want to migrate to.

The Ministry of Youth, National Service, Sport and Culture does not in any way encourage unemployment, be it at home or anywhere else. Therefore, we are not responsible for encouraging unemployment as was purported. With this I have attempted to answer Honourable Maamberua's questions.

HON MAAMBERUA: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. I think when we pose questions in Parliament we would have looked at the situation on the ground, taking the concerns of our communities very seriously.

Therefore, I also expect that when the Executive answer questions they have to take our questions very seriously. They have to answer our questions as we have posed them so that we can demonstrate our seriousness in addressing the plight of our people.

In the first question I did not talk about Home Affairs issues, the question is clear: Is the Minister aware of the recent exodus of Namibian youth to other countries, yes or no?

The next question which was not answered satisfactorily is whether the Minister is aware of the hopeless situation in which the Namibian youth find themselves. As we all know, the unemployment rate is about 52% and about 75% of that is youth. It is as serious as that and now the

Minister informs us it is a global issue. It is not a global issue, it is a Namibian issue and I am not saying we have to stop the youth from going to other countries for whatever purposes, we are just asking what are the causes for the youth having to leave the country en masse as they are doing. What are the underlying circumstances? It is in the sphere and the responsibility of the Ministry to have the necessary information as far as the welfare and the well-being of the youth are concerned in this country.

The last question was: "Would your Ministry consider introducing a basic income grant for unemployed youth as a matter of priority, given the abovementioned circumstances?" That question was not answered at all. That is the seriousness with which I would want to face these problems facing our youth and I just hope that next time around the Executive will take our questions seriously and preferably prepare them in writing so that we also have them documented and can use that as reference.

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT

AND CULTURE: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. I have answered the questions as they appear on the Question Paper; it is only that I do not have that document here. However, that is no defence, I apologise for not having it here, but if I said yes, I am aware that the people are migrating or I am not aware, it would also not be helpful to the youth out there.

Migration is a global trend and I am aware that they are migrating, if the Honourable Member wants me to say yes or no, but I am aware of the global trend.

On the issue of the Basic Income Grant for the youth, the Honourable Member should introduce a Motion here so that the merits and demerits can be debated, but as of now the Ministry of Youth is attending to the plight of the youth in many ways. Amongst them we have the Youth Credit Scheme which is funding applications for loans by the youth. This is encouraging and helping the youth to address the plight of unemployment. Instead of having the Basic Income Grant where we will be dishing out money, we have the loan scheme and we also administer some loans for the youth through the National Youth Council.

However, as for the general overloaded 52%, which is questionable, of unemployment, that is a national issue that is being addressed. There is the TIPEEG programme which is addressing youth unemployment through programmes such as de-bushing and many others. On the issue of the basic income grant the answer is that we are not considering it. If there is somebody out there considering it, the idea should be brought here as we are open for all ideas, but we have other programmes which are addressing youth unemployment. We have not yet considered it because we do not think that is the only panacea or mechanism to address youth unemployment. Thank you.

QUESTION 19:

<u>HON TJIHUIKO</u>: Honourable Speaker, I give Notice that on the 23rd of June 2011, I shall ask the Honourable Minister of Trade and Industry the following questions:

- 1. Being at the helm of the team that is negotiating various international agreements, among others, EPAS, Doha Round of Trade Negotiations, the implementation of AGOA and many others, can the Honourable Minister update this Honourable House on the state of negotiations and implementation of these international organisation?
- 2. How many Namibian businesses have benefited from AGOA to date? If none, why not?
- 3. In the event Namibia lost the EU market, what are the other available alternative markets for our beef, grapes and fish?

ANSWER:

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I thank the Honourable Member for posing these questions and for his patience. Let me underscore the importance of information-sharing by saying the following:

Information withheld is knowledge denied, intentionally or unintentionally so. We at the Ministry of Trade and Industry, therefore, remain at liberty and are pleased to share with this august House and the Nation the status of the negotiations regarding international agreements, such as EPAS, Doha Round of Negotiations and the implementation of AGOA. Honourable Speaker, it is, therefore, my pleasure to respond to Honourable Tjihuiko's specific questions.

The SADC-EPA negotiations are ongoing. Efforts are at an advanced stage to consolidate and harmonise market access arrangements for SACU into the EU market since South Africa has not been offered the same duty-free quota as the other SACU members. At stake here is also an interest by the EU to improve their terms of trade with South Africa, which could directly or indirectly affect us since we are part of a Customs Union with South Africa. The EC has also made new proposals on trade related areas which were not considered to us to have been within the scope of the negotiations. One of these includes the commitments on geographical indications demanded by the EU, which we are still consulting on and will engage on when the process resumes. In other words, the negotiations are still ongoing despite these new issues being brought into the negotiations by EU.

The Doha Round of Negotiations in the World Trade Organisation: There is a widespread view that the window of opportunity to finalise the Doha Round of Negotiations in 2011 has been closed. The process at present consists of review of the results of negotiations thus far across the full spectrum of negotiations. Efforts are also underway to construct a package for least developed countries on duty free, quota free market access alongside simplified rules of origin. In addition, the package will include a waver in services commitments and aim to address cotton subsidies. Those are the areas where anomalies currently exist in the WTO and where developing countries are unfairly expected to make proportionally greater concessions in reducing import tariffs than other trading blocs.

Honourable Speaker, on the question of how many Namibian businesses have benefited from AGOA to date and if not, why not, allow me to point out the following:

Since the coming into force of the African Growth and Opportunity Act (AGOA), which is a USA Congressional Act, only one Namibian company, namely Ramatex, benefited by exporting to the US market. Ramatex has since closed shop, as all Honourable Members of this House would know. I do not wish to dwell on the history of Ramatex, which is a painful history indeed. No other Namibian company has made use of the AGOA except the recent ongoing efforts by the Omba Arts Trust, which is a mud hut trading to export handicrafts, have started yielding some positive results.

Honourable Members, the AGOA is, therefore, expected to come to its end in 2013. The US Trade Representative, in partnership with sub-Saharan-African Ministers of Trade are therefore working towards measures to extend AGOA beyond its current lifespan. This extension would include an important instrument in the Textile Industry, the Third Country Fabric Concession, which is a very critical factor for African countries to develop and sustain a meaningful Textile Industry that could export textile, apparels and garments to the US market under AGOA. The extension of AGOA and the Third Country Fabric Concession hold promise for the revival of a textile industry in Namibia. We need to embark upon an aggressive investment promotion strategy to land investments for garments and apparel production, using the existing unemployed with skills in the Industry once the AGOA is extended, hopefully until 2025, with the support of the US Congress. The Ministry is constructing a huge building in the Northern Industrial Area for the Textile Industry in the hope that AGOA is extended.

The Ministry, in joint efforts with the Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry, has been working on a market penetration strategy into the US market for Namibian beef bone-in, mutton and lamb as well as table grapes and a lot of progress has been made to date. We are anticipating a breakthrough hopefully in the next six months to a year to enter that market with our mentioned products.

The extension of AGOA may also present numerous other opportunities for various Namibian products into the US market. However, this would require an appropriate strategy of export promotions and market access negotiations to remove the non-tariff barriers and technical barriers to

trade in order to secure the entry of Namibian products into that market.

In the event Namibia may lose the EU market access, allow me to share the following with the Honourable Members: It is not our intention to lose market access in the EU but, to the contrary, to secure it. It is, nevertheless, of importance for any country to diversify markets, even concerning the EU market due to the threat of preference erosion. The Honourable Members will know I hope, that this refers to the threat of our exports losing their competitiveness in the EU market if better terms of trade are offered to other competitors. Despite high tariffs, South American beef is already dominant in the EU market, thus we need to be aware that we are trying to maintain a niche position at best.

We have secure access, like the SACU market, still our largest market by volume if not by value for the three specific products mentioned by the Honourable Member. EFTA, which a European Free Trade Area comprising of Norway, Switzerland, Iceland and Lichtenstein for Namibian beef into Norway, in particular.

Preferential Free Trade Agreements are being negotiated; in fact they have already been concluded with MERCOSUR, which comprises of Brazil, Argentina, Uruguay, Paraguay and India. I am not saying, however, that all our products would necessarily immediately be competitive or in high demand in these specific markets due to competition and other factors. Nonetheless, we consider that the greatest potential in the short term for our products is:

- Within Africa, namely through SADC Free Trade Area and the Tripartite COMESA EAC SADC Free Trade Area negotiations which have just recently been launched in Pretoria, South Africa. We should not forget about our own continent.
- China where the Government of China has signalled its readiness to conclude a key agreement on sanitary and phyto-sanitary measures which would facilitate export of agricultural products to China, which is good news.

Both these markets are large and expanding and reflect the current global economic dynamics.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, it is our fervent hope that the information we have just shared with you empowers us even further. We are and remain at your service at all times and I thank you for your attention.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Deputy Minister. Honourable Tjihuiko.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Speaker, allow me to thank the Deputy Minister for a very comprehensive answer, not only that he has answered the questions, but that he has provided very useful information and he answered the question in such professional manner without any politics. That is commendable. Thank you very much.

QUESTION 20:

HON NAHOLO: Thank you, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members. I give Notice that on Thursday, the 23rd of June 2011, I shall ask the Honourable Minister of Justice the following:

Namibia, being a member of the United Nations, is under the obligation to timely submit periodic reports on issues related to respect, protection and realisation of human rights. During the interactive dialogue of the Universal Periodic Review by the UN Human Rights Council regarding the general human rights situation in Namibia on 31 January 2011, a total of 120 problem areas were found. According to the outcome report of the UN Working Group, 27 out of the 120 human rights recommendations must be examined by Namibia and Namibia must provide answers to those recommendations not later than the regular session of the Human Rights Council scheduled for 30 May 2011 and 17 June 2011. During the said dialogue in Geneva, the Honourable Minister of Justice is reported to

have said: "The delay in submitting those reports on time was due to insufficient human and material resources and inappropriate internal organisational framework for multi-sectoral coordination of human rights issues. The government is instituting measures to improve the situation."

Considering that the Ministry concerned has admittedly no adequate and competent staff members to draft and submit those reports, it is a fact that Namibia, being a State Party to the various international human rights instruments, is required to timely file and present periodic reports to the relevant monitoring organs of the United Nations.

- 1. Can the Honourable Minister inform this august House whether those recommendations have already been examined and what the responses were thereto. If so, by whom and when and secondly, were those recommendations ever presented before this august House which is the sovereign authority of this country solely charged with agreeing to or rejecting international human rights instruments.
- 2. Will the Honourable Minister inform this House when she will submit the outstanding Periodic Reports under the various human rights treaties?

There is also a question of involving NGOs and civil society in the reporting process. Can the Honourable Minister confirm to this august House whether the relevant civil society organisations have been consulted in that process and if so, which ones have been consulted?

ANSWER:

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Comrade Speaker thank you very much for affording me the opportunity to provide answers to the question put by Honourable Naholo of the Rally for Democracy and Progress.

Let me thank the Honourable Member for posing the question and for the interest shown in the work that we are doing with regard to the issues raised in this question. Our response thereto is as follows:

It is true that Namibia is a State party to various international instruments and in terms of Article 32(1)(e) of the Namibian Constitution, the Head of State, Head of Government or Minister of Foreign Affairs have the powers to sign international agreements and treaties on behalf of the State. In other words, the power to negotiate, delegate and sign international agreements is vested in the President and Cabinet, as provided in Chapters 5 and 6 of the Constitution.

Namibia has a reporting obligation on seven major international human rights instruments. The instruments are as follows:

- International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination:
- International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights;
- International Convention Against Torture and other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment;
- African Charter on Human and People's Rights;
- International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights;
- The Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women;
- The Convention on the Rights of the Child.

Our Ministry, the Ministry of Justice, is responsible to report on six of them, which are:

- International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination;
- International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights;
- International Convention Against Torture and other Cruel,

Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment;

- African Charter on Human and People's Rights;
- International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; including Universal Period Review, (UPR).

The Ministry of Gender Equality and Child Welfare is responsible to report on the other two Conventions, namely:

- Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women; and
- The Convention on the Rights of the Child.

On the question which was asked by the Honourable Member that there are no adequate and competent staff members to draft and submit these reports: This is not correct and I want to inform the Honourable Member that it is not the staff members who are incompetent, but rather the delay in submitting these reports on time. That is due to insufficient human and material resources and an appropriate internal organisational framework for multi-sectoral coordination of human rights issues. The Ministry has already instituted measures to improve upon this situation. Our responsibility is to compile what is coming from other Offices, Ministries and Agencies and it is acknowledged that we have a problem in Government as far as coordination is concerned and we are seized with that situation to see how best we can address it.

I want to inform the Honourable Member that Namibia has submitted reports on the following treaties:

- Universal Periodic Review (UPR): Periodic Reports should be submitted every four years in this connection. The last report was submitted in 2011, the next periodic report is due in 2015.
- International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination: Periodic reports regarding this Convention should be submitted every two years. The last periodic report which was combined was submitted in 2007 and the next periodic report is due this year and the next report will be due in 2013.

- The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights: Periodic reports should be submitted every four years. The last periodic report was submitted in 2006, the next periodic report was due last year in 2010. This report will be finalised and submitted to the relevant treaty body by the end of June 2011. The next report will be due in 2015.
- International Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment: Periodic reports should be submitted every four years. The initial report was submitted in 1997, the combined report will be submitted in 2011. The next periodic report will be due in 2015.
- The African Charter on Human and People's Rights: Periodic reports should be submitted every two years. The last periodic report was submitted in 2010, the next periodic report is due in 2012.
- International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: Periodic reports should be submitted every five years. The initial report should have been submitted in 1998 but no report has ever been submitted. The initial first and second report will be submitted to the relevant Treaty body by the end of July 2011. The next report will be due in 2015.

On the question of Namibia's final response to the UPR recommendations which came out during the initial review on the 31st of January 2011 during the Interactive Dialogue Session, I want to inform the Honourable Member and the public that a total of 120 recommendations were made during the Interactive Dialogue by the Member States. The Namibian delegation, which was led by the Honourable Minister of Justice, Comrade Pendukeni Ithana, accepted 90 of the recommendations which the delegation considered that they are already implemented or in the process of being implemented and we should also point out that we have to be advised by our own national reality and interest and as Africans we do not necessarily have

to adopt conventions because it is trendy to do so, because examples all over are showing that we must be more cautious in acceding to these kinds of conventions.

A total of three recommendations did not enjoy the support of the delegation, therefore they were rejected. The delegation decided to reserve their response to the twenty-seven recommendations and decided that they would provide a response at a later stage as they wanted to examine them in detail and consult with the other relevant authorities at home. A Cabinet Memo which contained Namibia's response to the recommendations, including the responses to those recommendations which were reserved, was prepared for Cabinet approval.

On the question of reporting process and consultations, the UPR Report was prepared and compiled by the Ministry of Justice based on the information received from all relevant Government Ministries, Offices and Agencies, research information and reports from relevant Non-Governmental Organisations. A consultative meeting was held with the representatives of civil society and NGOs to discuss the first draft of the report. The consultation meeting took place at Safari Hotel and it was attended by the Legal Assistance Centre, the Media Institute of Southern Africa and Namrights, to mention but a few. Some of the information contained in the report was provided by the NGOs themselves. I thank you for your attention.