

**LIST OF MEMBERS OF THE
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

SPEAKER

Dr T-B Gurirab (Mr)

**DEPUTY SPEAKER AND CHAIRPERSON OF THE
WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE**

Ms D Sioka

THE CABINET

MINISTERS

(21 March 2005 – Elected in terms of Article 133 of the Constitution)

Mr N Angula	<i>(Prime Minister)</i>
Dr L Amathila (Ms)	<i>(Deputy Prime Minister)</i>
Dr G H Geingob (Mr)	<i>(Trade and Industry)</i>
Dr N Tjiriange (Mr)	<i>(Minister of Veterans Affairs)</i>
Dr A Kawana (Mr)	<i>(Presidential and Interim Attorney- General)</i>
Dr N Iyambo (Mr)	<i>(Safety and Security)</i>
Rev W Konjore (Mr)	<i>(Youth, National Service, Sport and Culture)</i>
Mr J Mutorwa	<i>(Agriculture, Water and Forestry)</i>
Mr H Angula	<i>(Works, Transport and Communication)</i>
Ms N Nandi-Ndaitwah	<i>(Environment and Tourism)</i>
Ms S Kuugongelwa-Amadhila	<i>(Finance)</i>
Dr A Iyambo (Mr)	<i>(Fisheries and Marine Resources)</i>
Mr M Hausiku	<i>(Foreign Affairs)</i>
Dr R Kamwi (Mr)	<i>(Health and Social Services)</i>
Ms R Nghidinwa	<i>(Home Affairs and Immigration)</i>
Mr N Mbumba	<i>(Education)</i>
Mr C Namoloh	<i>(Defence)</i>
Mr J Kaapanda	<i>(Information and Broadcasting)</i>
Ms P Iivula-Ithana	<i>(Justice)</i>
Mr I Ngatjizeko	<i>(Labour and Social Welfare)</i>
Mr A !Naruseb	<i>(Lands and Resettlement)</i>

Mr E Nghimtina *(Mines and Energy)*
Mr J Ekandjo *(Regional and Local Government,
Housing and Rural Development)*
Ms M Mungunda *(Gender Equality and Child Welfare)*

DEPUTY MINISTERS

(21 March 2005 – Elected in terms of Article 133 of the Constitution)

Mr G Shihepo *(Safety and Security)*
Mr P Shifeta *(Youth, National Service and Culture)*
Mr P Smit *(Works, Transport & Communication)*
Mr I Katali *(Agriculture, Water and Forestry)*
Mr L Jooste *(Environment and Tourism)*
Mr T Tweya *(Finance)*
Ms L Lucas *(Foreign Affairs)*
Ms P Haingura *(Health and Social Services)*
Dr R Ndjoze-Ojo (Ms) *(Education)*
Mr V Simunja *(Defence)*
Mr R Dinyando *(Information and Broadcasting)*
Mr U Nujoma *(Justice)*
Mr P Iilonga *(Labour and Social Welfare)*
Mr B Esau *(Mines & Energy)*
Mr I Katali *(Lands and Resettlement)*
Mr K Kazenambo *(Regional and Local Government,
Housing and Rural Development)*
Ms T Mushelenga *(Trade and Industry)*
Ms Muharukua *(Gender Equality and Child Welfare)*

SECRETARY

Mr N Goabab

DEPUTY SECRETARY

Mr F S Harker

LIST OF MEMBERS AND PARTIES WHICH THEY REPRESENT

CONGRESS OF DEMOCRATS (COD)

Ms E Dienda

Mr T Gurirab *(Deputy Whip)*
Ms N Schimming-Chase *(Chief Whip)*
Mr B Ulenga *(Party Leader)*
Ms L Kaveri

DTA OF NAMIBIA

Mr J De Waal *(Chief Whip)*
Mr K Kaura *(Party Leader)*
Mr P Moongo
Mr M Venaani *(Deputy Whip)*

MONITOR ACTION GROUP

Mr J Viljoen *(Chief Whip)*

**NATIONAL UNITY DEMOCRATIC ORGANISATION OF
NAMIBIA (NUDO)**

Mr A Mbai
Mr K Riruako *(Party Leader)*
Mr A Tjihuike *(Chief Whip)*

REPUBLICAN PARTY

Mr H Mudge *(Chief Whip and Party Leader)*

SWAPO OF NAMIBIA

Dr L Amathila (Ms) *(Deputy Prime Minister)*
Dr M Amweelo (Mr)
Mr N Angula *(Prime Minister)*
Mr H Angula
Dr S C Ankama (Mr)
Ms L Basson
Ms A Bayer
Ms C Bohitile
Mr H Boosy *(Deputy Chairperson of the Whole
House Committee)*
Ms H Christian

Mr Dinyando	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Mr J Ekandjo	<i>(Minister)</i>
Mr B Esau	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Dr G H Geingob (Mr)	<i>(Minister)</i>
Dr T-B Gurirab (Mr)	<i>(Speaker)</i>
Ms P Haingura	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Mr M Hausiku	<i>(Minister)</i>
Mr P Iilonga	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Ms E Ipinge	
Ms P Iivula-Ithana	<i>(Minister)</i>
Dr A Iyambo (Mr)	<i>(Minister)</i>
Dr N Iyambo (Mr)	<i>(Minister)</i>
Mr L Jooste	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Mr J Kaapanda	<i>(Minister)</i>
Mr E Kaiyamo	
Dr R Kamwi (Mr)	<i>(Minister)</i>
Ms L Kasingo	
Mr I Katali	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Ms J Kavetuna	
Dr A Kawana (Mr)	<i>(Minister)</i>
Mr K Kazenambo	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Rev W Konjore (Mr)	<i>(Minister)</i>
Ms S Kuugongelwa – Amadhila	<i>(Minister)</i>
Ms L Lucas	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Mr N Mbumba	<i>(Minister)</i>
Ms A Muharukua	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Ms M Mungunda	<i>(Minister)</i>
Mr P Mushelenga	<i>(Assistant Whip)</i>
Ms T Mushelenga	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Mr J Mutorwa	<i>(Minister)</i>
Mr N Nashandi	
Mr T Nambahu	
Mr A !Naruseb	<i>(Minister)</i>
Ms E !Nawases-Taeyele	
Mr I Ngatjizeko	<i>(Minister)</i>
Ms N Nandi-Ndaitwah	<i>(Minister)</i>
Ms R Nghidinwa	<i>(Minister)</i>
Mr E Nghimtina	<i>(Minister)</i>
Mr U Nujoma	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>
Mr P Shifeta	<i>(Deputy Minister)</i>

Mr V Simunja *(Deputy Minister)*
Ms D Sioka *(Deputy Speaker)*
Dr N Tjiriange (Mr) *(Minister)*
Mr T Tweya *(Deputy Minister)*
Mr R /Ui/o/oo

UNITED DEMOCRATIC FRONT (UDF)

Mr J //Garoëb *(Party Leader)*
Mr M Goreseb
Ms G Tjombe *(Chief Whip)*

**APPOINTED BY THE PRESIDENT IN TERMS OF ARTICLE
32(5)(c) OF THE CONSTITUTION**

Mr R Diergaardt
Ms I Hoffmann
Ms A Manombe-Ncube
Mr C Namoloh *(Minister)*
Dr R Ndjoze-Ojo (Ms) *(Deputy Minister)*
Mr P Smit *(Deputy Minister)*

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
ASSEMBLY CHAMBER
12 NOVEMBER 2008
WINDHOEK**

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

HON SPEAKER: Any Petitions? Any Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers?

**TABLING: PRELIMINARY STATEMENT OF SADC
OBSERVER MISSION ON PRESIDENTIAL ELECTION
HELD IN ZAMBIA**

HON BASSON: Comrade Speaker, I lay upon the Table, Preliminary Statement of the SADC Observer Mission on the Presidential Election held in Zambia on the 30th of October 2008 for note-taking.

HON SPEAKER: Any other Reports and Papers? Any Notice of Questions?

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS

QUESTION 100:

HON MOONGO: Honourable Speaker, I give Notice that on Thursday, 20 November 2008, I shall ask the Right Honourable Prime Minister the following:

12 November 2008

**NOTICE OF QUESTIONS
HON VILJOEN**

Can the Prime Minister inform the House and agree or deny that there is tension and disagreement between the former President and the President as to whether, when and how... (Intervention)

HON SPEAKER: I am not going to entertain that. I will allow that at some other time, but I want you to consult me on that. I am not going to allow you to put that question, come and consult me. Honourable Viljoen.

QUESTION 101:

HON VILJOEN: Honourable Speaker, I give Notice that on Thursday, 20 November 2008, I shall ask the Honourable Minister of Finance the following questions:

What is the rationale behind the decision to give the pension money for November and December each year in one sum instead of separate amounts for each month? A large majority of people spend all their money during December and have to survive during January of the New Year.

Is it not possible to give pensioners a choice whether they want their money for the mentioned months in one sum or separate amounts for the 2 months?

HON SPEAKER: Any further Notice of Questions? Any Notice of Motions? Honourable Moongo.

NOTICE OF MOTION

12 November 2008

**NOTICES OF MOTIONS
HON MOONGO**

HON MOONGO: I give Notice that on the 20th of November 2008, I shall Move –

That this august House pass a domestic law to incorporate or to give effect to the wrong Statute on the International Criminal Court of 1998. It was a good move that Namibia ratified this Treaty on the 25th of June 2002.

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Member table the Motion? Any further Notice of Motions? Any Ministerial Statements? The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

**COMMITTEE STAGE:
NATIONAL YOUTH COUNCIL BILL**

SECRETARY: Committee Stage – *National Youth Council Bill.*

HON SPEAKER: Does the Honourable Minister of Youth, National Service, Sport and Culture Move that the Assembly now goes into Committee?

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: I do, Comrade Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: Any objection? Secondment? The Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee will take the Chair.

12 November 2008

**NATIONAL YOUTH COUNCIL BILL
COMMITTEE STAGE
HON REV KONJORE**

ASSEMBLY IN COMMITTEE:

DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: The Committee has to consider the *National Youth Council Bill*.

Clause 1 put.

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: In Clause 1 –

Substitute the following definition for the definition of “youth”:

“*Youth*” means a young person aged from 16 to 35 years of age.”

Amendment put and agreed to.

Clause 1, as amended, agreed to.

Clauses 2 to 10 put and agreed to.

Clause 11 put.

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: In Clause 11 –

Substitute the following sub-clause for Sub-clause (i):

“*The majority of all the members of the Representative Council form a quorum at any meeting of the Representative Council.*”

12 November 2008

**NATIONAL YOUTH COUNCIL BILL
COMMITTEE STAGE
HON REV KONJORE**

Amendment put and agreed to.

e

Clause 11, as amended, agreed to.

Clause 12 put and agreed to.

Clause 13 put.

**HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT
AND CULTURE:** Comrade Chairperson, in Clause 13(a) –

- (a) Substitute the following Paragraph for Paragraph (e) of Sub-clause (1):

“With the approval of the Minister made an agreement with the Minister responsible for Finance to pay such remuneration and allowances as it may determine.”

- (b) Insert the following Paragraph after Paragraph (e) of Sub-clause (1) and renumber the rest of the Paragraphs:

“(f) To grant such leave of absence to the employees of the Council” and

- (c) Substitute the following Paragraph for Paragraph (h) of Sub-clause (1):

“To invest in accordance with the investment policy approved by the Minister in agreement with the Minister responsible for Finance, money or any other asset which is not required for immediate use.”

Amendment put and agreed to.

12 November 2008

**NATIONAL YOUTH COUNCIL BILL
COMMITTEE STAGE
HON REV KONJORE**

Clause 13, as amended, agreed to.

Clause 14 put.

**HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT
AND CULTURE:** In Clause 14 –

- (a) Delete Paragraph (b) of Sub-clause (1); and
- (b) Substitute the following Paragraph for Paragraph (d) of Sub-clause (1):

“Two persons nominated by the Ministry.”

Amendment put and agreed to.

Clause 14, as amended, agreed to.

Clauses 15 to 24 put and agreed to.

Clause 25 put.

**HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT
AND CULTURE:** Comrade Chairperson, in Clause 35 –

Substitute the following Sub-clause for Sub-clause (1):

“(1) The Board, with the approval of the Minister, must appoint a person who has the necessary training, skills and expertise relevant to the functions of the Council as Director of the Council.”

12 November 2008

**NATIONAL YOUTH COUNCIL BILL
COMMITTEE STAGE
HON REV KONJORE**

Amendment put and agreed to.

Clause 35, as amended, agreed to.

Remaining clauses and the Title put and agreed to.

ASSEMBLY RESUMED:

Bill Reported with amendments.

**NATIONAL YOUTH COUNCIL BILL:
THIRD READING**

HON SPEAKER: Does the Honourable Minister of Youth, National Service, Sport and Culture Move that the Bill be now read a Third Time?

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: I do Honourable Speaker

HON SPEAKER: Any objection? Who seconds? Agreed to. Any further discussion? None. Does the Minister wish to reply?

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: Comrade Speaker, thank you very much. Mine will at this juncture be to you, Comrade Speaker and your Clerks as well as to the Honourable Members a big thank you for the kind support, assistance and contributions made and it is my hope that this Bill will now enhance

12 November 2008

**NATIONAL YOUTH COUNCIL BILL
COMMITTEE STAGE
HON REV KONJORE**

the work of the youth and we look forward to delivering accordingly.
Thank you, Comrade Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: I now Put the Question that the Bill be now read a Third Time. Objection? Who seconds? Agreed to. The Secretary will now read the Bill a Third Time.

SECRETARY: *National Youth Council Bill.*

COMMITTEE STAGE: SECTIONAL TITLE BILL

HON SPEAKER: Does the Honourable Minister of Lands and Resettlement Move that the Assembly now goes into Committee?

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: Comrade Speaker, may I pray for your kind indulgence to Move that the Committee Stage stands over until Tuesday, next week.

HON SPEAKER: Any objection? None. The Committee Stage of this Motion stands adjourned until Tuesday, next week. The Secretary will read the Third Order of the Day.

**RESUMPTION OF SECOND READING: MINERALS
PROSPECTING AND MINING AMENDMENT BILL**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on Second Reading –
Minerals Prospecting and Mining Amendment Bill.

HON SPEAKER: When this Debate was adjourned on Wednesday, 5
November 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by the
Honourable Minister of Mines and Energy, that the Bill be now read a
Second Time. Honourable Viljoen adjourned the Debate and the
Honourable Member has the Floor.

HON VILJOEN: Honourable Speaker, before I make a contribution, I
wish to make it clear that I am not opposing the Amendment on the Table.
We are busy planning the future of our country and, therefore, such issues
should be dealt with very carefully. I postponed the Debate on this
Motion for two reasons: I realised that I needed time to prepare myself,
because some of the terminologies in the mining industry are not familiar
to me and I believe that some other Members have the same problem, but
despite this intellectual limitation on this topic, they discussed this issue as
if they are experts on mining issues.

Secondly, I wish to appeal to the Honourable Lawmakers to differentiate
between companies because, as the Honourable Minister explained, “*some
companies are relatively new and should be treated slightly differently but
fairly in relation to their investment, employment and other factors.*”

Some of the Members who participated in the Debate after the motivation
of the Minister created the impression that the companies which are
presently involved in the mining industry in Namibia are always the same

12 November 2008 **MINERALS PROSPECTING & MINING BILL**
HON VILJOEN

companies and I got the impression that they are the enemy of the Namibian people who are illegally taking the Namibian minerals and exporting it to other countries.

The purpose of my contribution is to change this perception and to approach the situation from another angle. Most of the mining companies spend millions of dollars in community development, in the health sector, in education and in any other areas where funds are needed. I cannot remember that any ministerial statement or word of thanks and appreciation was spoken to thank these companies. Mining licences were allocated to a number of companies, for example in the South, diamonds to NAMDEB, a local company and De Beers South Africa; Skorpion with its zinc metal to Anglo American South Africa; Rosh Pinah with its zinc concentrate to Exxaro South Africa. The rest of Namibia, Rössing Uranium, Rio Tinto – Europe; Okorusu Fluospar – Europe; Langer Heinrich Uranium, Paladin Australia; Nawachab Gold, Ashanti South Africa; Weatherly Copper, Europe. There are also a number of smaller companies involved.

We must bear in mind that Namibia in most cases has medium to low grade quality minerals with a very expensive way of getting access to it. You cannot allocate the EPL to any company because it is sometimes too expensive even to start the mine due to many factors. Companies wishing to get involved in mining should have very deep pockets, otherwise they will not make profit. Especially the newcomers to the Namibian mining scene do not have pockets deep enough to play with money.

The intention of the Amendment is to put a levy, a royalty on the different licence holders. Fortunately the Ministry is going to keep crucial factors in mind, so the message is good but I wish to appeal to the Honourable Members not to try to kill the goose which lays the golden egg by imposing penalties and very high taxation on the export of raw materials or to suggest that companies should build their own tar roads or care for damage to the existing roads.

Other countries have a different approach. In Angola the Government built tar roads and railway lines to the mining areas to make it attractive

for companies. They also built electricity lines to the mines and upgraded harbours. In South Africa, for instance, there are no royalties. In South Africa there is a company tax of 28%, in Namibia there is already a royalty of between 3 and 10%. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable Viljoen, you cited Angola in terms of infrastructure construction to the mining sites. Are you aware that as a matter of policy and law in Angola, no foreigner may get a licence without the participation of Angolans or the Angolan Government, and that the minimum participation of the Angolan citizens or Angolan Government in any venture is 51%? Are you aware of that?

HON VILJOEN: Thank you very much Honourable Minister. I noticed that the Honourable Minister was not in the House when I started, I left this out: *“I also wish to congratulate Honourable Minister Helmut Angula with his contribution to this Amendment.”* Honourable Minister, I will come to what you have just said because it is part of my contribution.

In Namibia there is already a royalty of between 3 and 10% on turnover for various minerals. Above that, there is a company tax of 37% on profit. This is amongst the highest tax regimes in the world. Exploration Prospecting Licences should be given to existing companies to explore in the area of their existing mines to increase the lifespan of the mines.

Coming back to the Amendment, there is an agreement between Anglo America and the Namibian Government concerning Skorpion. According to the agreement, Skorpion does not pay royalties or tax because they made a value-added investment by erecting a smelter to the value of N\$4 billion to enable them to put the final product, zinc metal, on the table. I agree that the Government should liaise with Anglo America that when they have repaid the smelter and their profits are good, they should start paying tax. This is a fair and attractive approach to any foreign investor.

A mine like Rosh Pinah, however, does not have a smelter and consequently has to export their raw materials. If Rosh Pinah should embark on a value-added investment, which is a smelter, it will cost the company approximately N\$4 million and will take 25 years or more to repay. The mine will close and the workers will camp on the steps of the Parliament Building. How can we penalise Rosh Pinah Mine for exporting the zinc concentrate? I agree that they were supported excellently by the Government who built a tar road of N\$400 million between Rosh Pinah and Aus.

Weatherly Tsumeb has invested N\$80 million to refurbish the existing smelter at Tsumeb. Two months ago the price of copper was N\$8,000 per ton, but it dropped to approximately N\$4,000 per ton. The Deputy Prime Minister referred to the companies which are mining north east of Okahandja at the Otjozundu area. These are small companies mining for manganese metal. These companies are too small to build a tar road or to build a smelter of N\$6 billion.

A Russian Company is currently investigating the possibility of erecting a manganese smelter. They can do it because they have the market for manganese metal and most probably the money to build it, but I am convinced that if this Russian Company realises that its investment will become more risky due to additional local taxes on top of the normal manganese price fluctuations, they would look for other areas to invest.

If we do not create an investor-friendly climate, the mentioned company may be interested in Angola in the Casala- Etumbo area which is very rich in manganese and where the Angolan Government is looking for investors.

I believe that the Honourable Minister will do what he promised, keeping in mind the process required to extract the minerals from the ore as well as the concentration of such mineral. My recommendation is that legislation for existing companies should be done, bearing in mind the low prices for minerals. The consequences for Namibia are not favourable. Some uranium projects at Rössing are under pressure due to the low price of

12 November 2008 **MINERALS PROSPECTING & MINING BILL**
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

uranium. The price of uranium is not that low, but it is now less than US\$50 per pound.

Kombat Mine has already closed down due to flooding. The Mining Director at Weatherly has indicated that the Tsumeb-West Mine is closed and there are strong rumours about a third mine of Weatherly which will close its production in December 2008. I think it has already been confirmed.

The land-based mining activities of NAMDEB have nearly come to an end because there are no more diamonds. The marine-based diamonds are the lifeline of NAMDEB. Because we export our diamonds to the United States, we can in the next few months expect a drop in price due to their own financial situation.

My recommendation on new mining companies is that we must create an investor-friendly legislation, do as Angola does, give a licence to a company which is willing to accept national co-investors who has the necessary funds to invest. I support the Amendment.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member for his very patriotic research. Any further discussion? Does the Minister of Mines and Energy wish to reply?

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: I Move that the Debate be adjourned until tomorrow.

HON SPEAKER: Any objection? The Debate on this Motion stands adjourned until tomorrow afternoon. The Secretary will read the Fourth Order of the Day.

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON DR A IYAMBO**

**CONSIDERATION: REPORT ON
PEOPLE OF THE SOUTH**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Consideration of Report published by the National Planning Commission with regard to the People of the South.

HON SPEAKER: When the House adjourned on Tuesday, 11 November 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by Honourable Schimming-Chase. The Honourable Minister of Fisheries and Marine Resources has the Floor.

HON MINISTER OF FISHERIES AND MARINE RESOURCES: Honourable Speaker, yesterday I was beaten by the time and I would like to summarise what I said yesterday and continue with what I want to say today.

Yesterday, I started by saying that I have appreciation for what is really happening in the Karas Region. I mentioned that I had a chance, together with my Colleagues, to closely interact and internalise socio-economic dynamics of the inhabitants of the Karas Region. That is why I said I have an understanding of what is happening there.

I mentioned that during our visit we had audience with ordinary people, people in need, people looking for help and we listened to them. I mentioned that we listened to the Traditional Leaders who articulated the cry of their subjects. We listened to business houses in Lüderitz, Oranjemund, Aussenkehr, Skorpion Zinc and Rosh Pinah to add that economic dimension and to look at the issue of non-participation of the inhabitants of the Region in economic development. We wanted to get first-hand information. We also met with the political leaders irrespective of their standing, irrespective of their known or unknown political inclinations.

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON DR A IYAMBO**

The Report on the Karas Region should not be singled out and discussed in isolation. I am saying that because there is a thick Report and this one is simply of the Karas Region. There is a thick Report that encapsulates all the Regions. Therefore, this Report should not be singled out, but we should take into account that all the other Regions were looked at.

The Report, like the other Reports, deals with societal issues, deals with every-day activities, including accelerated development, economic emancipation and empowerment and this is for all the Regions. The investigators endeavoured to look at the unemployment rate in each Region, they looked at the scourge of diseases, they looked at the inclusion or exclusion and the beneficiation from natural resources where they are. The Report looks at ownership of natural resources, education, housing, water, service delivery and procurement. That is what the Report was looking at.

Then the communities were given a chance to make representations and it seems that it is from that angle that misunderstandings came up, that what people said was quoted verbatim in the Report without being refined and that seems to have infused or inflamed anger in the communities. Some of the statements look highly repulsive... (Intervention)

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:40

HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:15 PURSUANT TO ADJOURNMENT

HON MINISTER OF FISHERIES AND MARINE RESOURCES:

Honourable Speaker, this theory of "*once bitten, twice shy*" does not apply to me because I know I can proceed without being bitten further.

Honourable Speaker, I was saying that in the Report there are issues of concern, generated by the style, that when the people were asked to express themselves on the issue of poverty in the Region, the raw information was presented verbatim. If somebody said "*good*", they just wrote "*good*"; if they said "*bad*", they wrote "*bad*". Now some of those

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON DR A IYAMBO**

sentences are causing anger as they appear repulsive.

However, maybe we as leaders should look carefully at what is being said. On Page 25 of this document there are a few things which can be seen as quite repulsive. Somebody was asked a question and said, "*first we were under the Boers, now we are under the Owambos.*" I think such a statement is quite repugnant if it is presented in a public Report without being put into context. It is assumed that that is what an individual said. It was supposed to be contextualised.

The same on Page 16 where people mentioned laziness amongst the Nama people to make an effort to get into those posts. Some people were asking why people are not taking up specific posts and somebody made that statement. It was supposed to be contextualised, and this is the same for each and every Region, that the weakness is that it was not contextualised.

I feel that we as leaders have a duty to put ourselves above the shortcomings and consider how to unite the Nation and not to polarise and divide communities. If we as leaders were now to start encouraging communities... (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: May I ask a question? Honourable Iyambo, I recall that you were assigned to the South. What is your advice to those people to benefit like the other people of Namibia? What is your advice?

HON MINISTER OF FISHERIES AND MARINE RESOURCES: Thank you very much, I will come to that and spend a bit of time explaining what might be done.

I was saying we are leaders and our responsibility is to unite the Nation. It is not our responsibility to add fire and polarise the communities. We know that election fever is quite high at the moment, but we should contain ourselves despite the coming elections. It is a pity to mention this,

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON DR A IYAMBO**

but the statements made by Honourable Kaura of recent are quite repugnant, to say the least, where he tried to put the people from the North against our nationals in the South. That is to polarise the Nation and it is quite repulsive and I hope he will regret one day for having said so.

We as leaders should not try to isolate our colleagues in the South as not being welcome in their country. When you sit with the Traditional Leaders in the South, reading on their faces the anguish that they feel isolated, then we as leaders should not dare to isolate the people of the South. They are part of the country, freedom fighters of the country and this is their country.

There is so much stereotyping, you find a person from Oshakati stereotyping somebody from Gobabis; somebody from Gobabis stereotyping somebody from the Kunene Region. That is a sin on its own, as stereotyping is division and it is better that we as leaders try to unite the Nation rather than add oil to the fire. This labelling of a community is becoming quite divisive and belittling the dignity of communities and that should really be discouraged. Some people are saying others are lazy, but if you look at the Honourable Members, there are even some lazy people. If you go to my village, you should tell those people why you are saying they are lazy and what can you do to improve that situation, not just to pronounce yourself.

Answering the question by Honourable Muharukua, what each and every corner of the country is going through, issues of socio-economic development and the cry to participate in economic development, the cry to get better education and health, the cry to get better service delivery and to be part of the procurement system, is the exact cry of the people in the South and that was the struggle and the struggle should continue for a better service delivery for economic development, for all of us to be included and empowered. That is the outcry of the Nation and we should respond to that cry and let each and every Namibian participate in economic development. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: May I ask Dr

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON DR A IYAMBO**

Iyambo a question? Comrade Iyambo, are you aware that there are certain Parties and leaders who will never even get a quarter of a vote from certain Constituencies precisely because of these utterances which are publicly recorded, which are so racist in nature and racist in its foundation. Are you further aware of the fact that the same leaders have resigned themselves to the possibility of ever winning elections? Thus the attitude of not caring and insensitive and irresponsible public utterances.

HON MINISTER OF FISHERIES AND MARINE RESOURCES:

On the question by Honourable Angula, I am painfully aware of that disaster, the insensitivity of some of our political leaders. It is climbing a tree and you cut off the branch of that tree and they fall flat, but they have some good young Members who have not made very bad pronouncements so far. With respect to Honourable Kaura, some of us were trying to question what he has been saying. (Intervention)

HON MOONGO: On a Point of Order. Is it allowed to mention Members who are not present here?

HON SPEAKER: That one is allowed because they are Members of the House. They will have the opportunity when they return to respond. The people who are outside the House are protected.

HON MINISTER OF FISHERIES AND MARINE RESOURCES:

Honourable Speaker, if the mentioning of the Honourable Member's name is disturbing some Colleagues, I will replace it with Honourable Moongo. Honourable Moongo, would you convey this message to the Honourable Member I was talking about, exactly what I said?

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON NUJOMA**

If there are problems with some members of our society where we think they need assistance, it should be our task to look at their strengths. The strengths are not the same across the country, there are people who have a strength in artistry, there are people who have strength in issues of music. We should just strengthen what they have and not ridicule them, not to laugh at them and insult them. I encourage that we respect the people of the South, help them and encourage them and to see what we can do for all of us to grow this country in harmony.

These Reports have some weaknesses in terms of being presented verbatim, but as for the Government there are no people getting close to such pronouncements and the people in the South remain part of the bigger Namibia. Thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Minister. Honourable Members, in future we should ensure that before such Reports or before any other communications are submitted to the House, that due care be taken by the Ministry tabling them that there is either a disclaimer of the kind that I hear now or a rejoinder, a disclaimer which says that this does not reflect the position of the Ministry and a rejoinder is more to add a kind of explanation, for example that the Minister of Fisheries and Marine Resources added which clarifies the situation. However, if the Report assumes unintended legitimacy because it was introduced by a Ministry, Office or Agency and then it is going to generate this kind of discussion, quite clearly this is not the position of the Government. We should ensure that Reports outside of the Government Offices and Agencies, do not by their sheer introduction be perceived as if they are coming from the Government. A rejoinder or a disclaimer should be attached to such Reports in future. Any further discussion? Honourable Nujoma.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Thank you, Comrade Speaker, I would also like to join this Debate. Honourable Iyambo has taken most of the words I wanted to say, but I think the issue of poverty in

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON NUJOMA**

Namibia should be taken holistically.

I am of the view that the poverty levels in our country are all over the thirteen Regions of this country and I think Government has introduced some measure to try and alleviate the problem of poverty. When I look at the South, I think the only reason why some people perceive the other Regions to be well-off is because the other Regions normally do subsistence farming unless there is a serious drought situation. In most cases when there are good rains, the people try very hard to make sure that there is some millet, that they plough.

When you go to the extreme South, the harshness of the climate and the land do not allow for that type of activity to take place. The people make sure that the Caprivians at least have some basic food, but it does not mean that there is no poverty there, it is only because they work a little bit harder and because of the circumstances prevailing in that particular Region – better rainfall, better climate, etcetera. However, conditions in the South are extremely harsh. Therefore, we need to make a distinction between the two.

When it comes to poverty levels in all thirteen Regions and you look at the Reports by the Regional Councils and Village Councils, the problems pertaining to the South are the same problems experienced in the Caprivi, Omusati, Ohangwena and Oshikoto.

That is why I said that the Government has tried its best and Honourable Helmut Angula mentioned that it is a problem recognised by the United Nations and that we try to introduce the Millennium Development Goals so that we try to halve poverty by the year 2015. That is why it is a recognised problem, it is not only in Namibia, it is everywhere. Go to Soweto today, people are living in shanties, there is no food. Go to Zambia, go to Angola, we have inherited these problems.

I agree sincerely with the previous speakers who said we should stay away from tribal animosities, stirring up tribal animosities because of the glaring shortcomings and trying to exploit those for cheap political purposes. We have to take the problems of our people seriously. It is true

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON NUJOMA**

that there is poverty, but we must all join hands to try and solve this problem and not try to target and profile some other groups and say the money is being taken to the North. This is not true! Other people are working very hard in the South and the Honourable Member knows it very well.

When I was a small boy, working in Walvis Bay during holidays to earn some money for my school, I was earning more because I was classified as a so-called southerner. I was earning 25 cents per hour and the guys from the North... (Intervention)

HON T GURIRAB: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? I am following with great interest the contribution of my cousin, but on the classification which he brought up, was he classified as Coloured or Baster or what? (Laughter).

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Yes, Honourable Tsudao, people were classified according to groups. All the Damaras, Owambos, Hereros, Kavangos and Caprivians were classified as people coming from outside the Police Zone, as they used to call it. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: On a Point of Order. Son of the Nation, are you aware that when we took over the children's grants for orphans and vulnerable children, we realised we had with the 2001 census 156,000 orphans and vulnerable children in need, but in 2004 when the Ministry of Gender Equality and Child Welfare took over the services, there were only 7,000 children. Then they discovered these 7,000 were only from the South. Therefore, the people from the North were excluded from everything.

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON NUJOMA**

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: I agree with you, Honourable Mungunda, it is true that people were just concentrating on the cities because that is where the poverty is very glaring, because that is where you see the divide between the extremely rich and the poor. That is where you see Katutura and Klein Windhoek. I am not referring here to Mr Katjuongua's box houses which he built there and Honourable Kaura during that time.

What I want to say is that the poverty levels in the towns are more glaring because there is the media, the newspapers and poverty levels are daily exposed, but in the North the people are extremely poor. It is only because they try a little bit harder. We should take that important distinction in consideration. (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Speaker, on a Point of Information. I just wanted to advise that when we are making statements in this House on a topic like this one, we should be very careful. If we are saying that the people in the North are working a little bit harder, what does it mean? I think that the Minister of Fisheries said we should try to refrain from that, because the moment you start making references to the people of this and the people of that, we will come down to the point that we are discussing now. I just wanted to make that small appeal.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Just recently Honourable Libertine Amathila, for example, discovered that there were people Ovatie in that area. Why just recently? These people have been there for years. It is because there is no communication there, no radio, no television and we were not aware that there were people living in the mountains who were just surviving from berries and who were even enslaved by the Ovahimbas to look after the cattle and then they are just told to go. These are some of the problems that I am trying to mention. (Intervention)

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON NUJOMA**

HON KAURA: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable Member, are you aware of the fact that the Ovahimba, Ovatjimba, Ovatua, Ovaherero, Ovazemba all belong to the same clan? There is no difference between Ovahimba, Omutwa and Ovatjimba. It is only the degree of wealth, one is richer than the other and then he is referred to as Omutwa, but it is not a different tribe or a different ethnic group and they are not slaves of anybody as such. They are not slaves of anybody, it is just a different lifestyle they have adopted. They are all Ovahimbas.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: I am not trying to classify, I am trying to explain why... (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: On a Point of Information. Comrades and Colleagues, we are old, we have to speak the truth. Can we go to Okaoko today, the area I know? The Ovatjimba and Ovatue are not staying in the Ovahimba's house, they are not eating together, they are different. They are calling them a name, the Ovatjimba or Ovatue. I know today in 2008 we are talking about the coming election and I know that some people went there to talk to Ovatue to go to the mountain again. It is different people, it is not the same.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: The problem is that we are trying to discriminate against our own people. That is the problem! Honourable Kaura, what did you do for the Ovatue? You have been lobbying them to vote for DTA, what did you do for them? It is only recently that the SWAPO Party Government has recognised the problem and is trying its best to alleviate the plight of those people. I will not allow anymore questions.

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON NUJOMA**

HON VENAANI: On a Point of Information and it is on a very serious score. When the Government is saying that 18 years after Independence is the time that they have realised that we have people living in the mountains, that is not true, because myself, Honourable Muharukua, Honourable Kaura, Chief Riruako and many of us who have travelled through those mountains know that there were poor people in the mountains. We have known for years that there are people in that area who have never seen a vehicle. You have been a Minister for 18 years, how can you argue that you do not know the citizens of your own country? The argument should be the development that we are extending to those people. You cannot be given the responsibility as a Government for 18 years and after 18 years you say you are realising there are poor people in this country. That is unacceptable. Let us argue and say that the Government has done a commendable thing to try to extend development to those people, but if you say you only found them now, then you have been a reckless Government for 18 years, not knowing the citizens of this country.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: The Regional Councils have the responsibility. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: On a Point of Information. Comrade Speaker, we can go to the farm behind us here and ask the Founding President what he did for those people in the mountains. He drove to those mountains to those people. Do you want to tell us the Government did not know those people were there? It is not the first time that the SWAPO Government gives them animals.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Let me come back to my point so that I make it clear. What I was saying is, all over Namibia

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON NUJOMA**

there are high poverty levels, irrespective of any Region. This is the point I want to make, in all 13 Regions there are high levels of poverty and we

need to join hands in order to address this poverty. We cannot say it is only the people in the South or in Kavango who are suffering. (Intervention)

HON SPEAKER: Unless we listen to one another the situation will get out of hand and I will not allow that. Honourable Nujoma has the Floor at the moment and I only have one other person on the list. Those who want to take the Floor to make a contribution to clarify the situation, inscribe and I will give you the Floor.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: I will come back to my days when I was a worker in Walvis Bay. I was earning 25 cents and elderly people from the North, hardworking, were earning 7 cents an hour. That money would come to R3,50 at the end of the week. (Interjections). I have the Floor and that is what I have experienced, it is not you. I know that you were high profile. You were better treated than the rest of us. Those people from the North were earning R1. However, I can tell you that come Monday, I was broke, I must go and borrow from those people and they would keep that money and send that money to their families in the North to provide for the schooling of their children. That is the distinction we need to make. Even though the money was so little... (Intervention)

HON KAURA: Honourable Speaker, I think the Honourable Member is mistaking the period of the Founding Father's time for himself.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: I think the time of the Founding Father was even worse. I do not want to go into that. It is not

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON NUJOMA**

worth mentioning here because it is scandalous. The salaries they were earning were just enough to buy a loaf of bread.

I want us to make this distinction to understand. The people from the North will save that money and keep that money. He will only take water mixed with sugar. I do not know whether my brother there has ever tasted water with brown bread and that money continued to sustain a big family in the North and that is why you will see those differences, people who are inclined to hard work, people who are inclined to saving and this is the truth, we should not hide from the truth. Because we were better treated in the South, we became complacent, we became reckless and the people from the North learned the hard way to save the little they had and to sustain their families. That is why the families are looking much better today and it continues up to the present moment. That is the truth and you do not want people to tell the truth. (Intervention)

HON KAURA: On a Point of Information. The Honourable Member is just stereotyping and that is very dangerous, because he is referring to a people, the Honourable Prime Minister was referring to the dispossessed, who lost everything, land, livestock and everything. The people of the South lost everything. These are the people he is referring to that they do not save, they are complacent, they do not work hard. Brother, those are the people that started right from scratch to get one goat, two goats, one cow and today they are competing with the commercial farmers south of the red line. They own enough livestock to compete with the commercial farmers, those people you are saying are complacent. They were dispossessed of land, do not make those comparisons.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: What I wanted to say here is that the truth is we are living here, we were born in Namibia, we grew up here, we went into exile, we came back and that is the reality of the situation and we must distinguish that in order for you to say that this notion of profiling, that all Government assistance is going to the North is

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON TJIHUIKO**

not true and you know it as well as I do. It is not true, everybody is trying hard to make a living and in that spirit we must encourage our people to try the best they can, even in the South, the North or East or West.

That is the point I wanted to make that we do not stereotype the situation that the people of the North are the beneficiaries of Government assistance. It is not true! We allocate the Budget in this House and you know where the Budget goes. Is it not us who approve the Budget? Why are we saying that we give more money to the North and the people of the South are not getting anything. It is not true! When we allocate the Budget here, it is allocated according to the needs of the whole country. I thank you. I do not want to go further.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Speaker, thank you very much for the five minutes, I am going to be very brief. I am one of the fortunate people who have been able to get copies of all the Reports and I have made it my business to read them.

If one looks at the content and the methodology that was used in the Reports it is the same and I believe that it is very unfortunate in the case of Karas that certain utterances were made that led us to be discussing this Report. I was hoping that we were going to discuss the Report in its right context, looking at the recommendations from our communities, looking at what needs to be done, what type of interventions Government would look at to meet the community halfway Region by Region, because the conditions differ. I wanted us to take the Debate in that line, not trying to bring it at the level that we are now trying to push it.

It is very important, Honourable Speaker, that some of the issues that are mentioned in the Reports cannot be ignored, it is facts. If somebody has used the wrong language, obviously we are grownups and we should understand it from that point of view and I want to recommend that we be more proactive, more practical and take the things that we believe we can do something about and advise those who are in a position to do something and then all of us put our shoulders to the wheel. That is the

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON TJIHUIKO**

only way we can address the problems that have been raised by the communities themselves, we cannot ignore them. This is not what he said, that is exactly what the people have said. The people have spoken and we as leaders need to look at what they have said, what they have recommended and try to tailor-make it in such a way that it fits into the various Ministries' programmes. They cannot be ignored and they should not be ignored. That is the first point that I wanted to make.

The second point and the last point I wanted to make is that yes, indeed, as politicians we may be tempted to use some of these unfortunate statements that have been made in the Reports and if we do that, it shows the level of our political understanding, the level of political leadership if you come down to that level. There are so many things that we as politicians can make use of, but the issue of trying to encourage tribalism in order for us to reach our objectives is wrong. It is not only wrong because I am today in the Opposition, if I am serious about my Party, if I am serious about being the Government tomorrow, I cannot create conditions that are going to be a problem to me when I am in Government, unless I have given up. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: May I ask the Honourable Member a very small question? Honourable Member, you are doing extremely well, but from the statement you have just made of us making some of these for political gain, would you agree with me that your neighbours there have just experienced what you said, that after making those tribal accusations, NUDO came and swept all its members to NUDO?

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Speaker, I was saying that as politicians I would rather prefer to see when we take over next year, as we almost did in Tobias Hainyeko, I want to see a good economic situation. You need to have proper structures, you need to have a sound system because in Namibia today it is not that we do not have good structures, but perhaps

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON KAIYAMO / HON !NARUSEB**

we do not have the right driver. We need to have the right people in the right positions to drive the economy of this country into the Promised Land.

The point that I am making is that we should be more focused, we should be very sensitive about what we are saying, because whatever I am saying here is going to be heard by people out there and some people are going to take it seriously that this is exactly what Tjihuiko was saying, it should be true. We must be careful. I am not advising only some of the Colleagues, but everybody. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Kaiyamo.

HON KAIYAMO: Comrade Speaker, this book we are talking about was never tabled in this House, meaning that the National Planning Commission never thought to bring it here, but it took it to the Show for the public. Now we are discussing a Report which is not here and maybe in the future the National Planning Commission must be careful in terms of appointing these consultants who do the research, because they have somehow set us against each other. I feel this is a non-document and maybe the National Planning Commission must look into its own mess. Thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable !Naruseb.

HON MINISTER OF LANDS AND RESETTLEMENT: Thank you, Honourable Speaker, Sir.

The position taken by Honourable Kaiyamo in terms of the status of the

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON !NARUSEB**

said document would probably prevent me from saying things that I wanted to say. Be that as it may, I will still continue to refer to some issues that I think are probably relevant.

Namibia has its legacies, we do not need to lecture one another with regard to the realities of the past that we come from. That is a given. You might find yourself in an area close to Usakos, not necessarily Usakos but close to Usakos, when you observe things in terms of the living standards of those Namibian citizens who find themselves in those areas of our country and when you go to the South, go to Okamatapati, go to Omungwelume, the conditions definitely do not differ. However, when people start making certain pronouncements, the very people who find themselves in those areas, we probably do not need to ignore it, because when they feel excluded, whatever the consideration, from whatever angle they might look at it, but as long as there are people in our country who are bold enough to pronounce themselves in terms of their state of economic well-being, we as a Nation must be able to listen. It would not help us to categorise and say we have similar experiences elsewhere and because we have similar experiences elsewhere, we are not going to listen to what you are saying.

It is incumbent upon us as leaders of this great Nation, the Land of the Brave, to be able to, with a degree of tolerance, absorb what the next person is saying. We must be able to take lessons from what we are told, even if we, after having listened, would decide to ignore it and go on with what we initially intended to do. We must be able to listen and take lessons from whatever is said and so by doing, probably shape our direction.

Some of us were commissioned some time ago to undertake certain studies in some parts of our country. We went about our assignments quietly, the press was probing us to explain to them why we are finding ourselves in a particular part of the country at that given point in time, but we avoided them. We filed our Report, it was presented to the authorities that had tasked us to do that. The findings of that Report are more or less singing the same tune as the Reports with no status, but we must be able to contextualise it.

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON !NARUSEB**

The pronouncements we make in this House, from whatever angle of the political divide, are taken up very seriously by the people out there. They are listening to us, they are looking up to us, believe you me or not. Children are watching us for better or worse and I would just caution that the pronouncements we make must have been well considered, not be short-sighted, not for short-term gain, but in the best interests of the Nation that we have been elected to lead.

The fact remains that there is poverty in our country. Whether I was able to amass wealth through my perseverance by putting away cents or thousands of dollars, the fact remains that our country is seized with poverty. That is a reality. Maybe there is a higher degree of poverty in some parts of our country because of historical reasons, historical deprivation of our people, landlessness, no access to land which is such a crucial resource and if you do not have access to land, a place that you can call home, where do you make a living?

I can only speak from experience of the areas that I hail from. Before the construction of these water dams upstream of Swakoppoort, places like Otjimbingwe used to be self-reliant on food production. People were able to sustain themselves, they were not *Outere's* as Honourable Libertine Amathila likes to refer to it. Places like Karibib and Usakos used to rely on vegetables, you name it from Otjimbingwe, Okombahe, but nowadays those people are left to be dependent on the Government Drought Relief Food Supplies. Probably it was by design by those who were in power then.

The people of the South are so good at small stock farming that even the commercial farmers there rely on the Nama-speaking citizens of this country, but do they have land to farm on?

I am pleading, Honourable Speaker, that we contextualise our pronouncements, let us look into the historical reality of where the masses of our people are coming from, what led them to that state of being that some quarters regard them as lazy drunkards and so many names. What led to that state of situation and what can we do to redress the situation from perpetuating itself?

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON NGHINDINWA**

I am getting a bit excited, Comrade Speaker, and I want to conclude here. Thank you.

HON SPEAKER: As a person from Usakos, inasmuch as we were beneficiaries of the railway industry in Usakos, we were being fed by people from Otjimbingwe and Okombahe with fruit, vegetables and the rest. It is true that dams were built during the apartheid dispensation that cut off the water flow and the same is also true for the Swakop River and the same is true for the Omaruru River and my Government has perpetuated that.

A small country of recent birth in the Middle East was created in the desert, it is exporting fruits and vegetables and is entirely self-sufficient. I do not care about the resources that maybe have become what it is, but you can turn a desert into a forest through human efforts. Minister of Home Affairs and Immigration.

HON MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Thank you, Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members. I just want to add some information on what Comrade !Naruseb has said. As a person who also visited most of the 13 Regions up to the most remote areas, I have also experienced that since 2003 when I was the Deputy Minister of Labour and always visited the farms in the South or wherever, we learnt that the greatest problem in some of the Regions is when the people moved from the farming industry to the hospitality industry. In that year we learned that most of the people were evicted from the farms, unfairly dismissed and then they went back to the streets. That also contributed to high unemployment in most parts of our country.

Therefore, when we address the issue of unemployment and poverty, we also need to look into how we are going to balance the issue of this hospitality industry which does not want the middle-aged blood and just

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON NANDI-NDAITWAH**

want the new blood to work in the hospitality industry. That will help those people to come back to their jobs that they used to do.

Comrade Speaker, as Honourable !Naruseb said, poverty is a reality in the whole country. It is there in the remote areas. You see children who are not going to school, who do not have any shoes whatsoever, parents who are not earning anything, not just in the Karas Region but also in Regions. Maybe other people are just going to the main towns such as Oshakati, Ondangwa, Rundu and only see the people in the towns and they say this area is better than that area, but really, we need to work together. Let us work together with the Honourable Members on that side and not misdirect the boat. The Government of the Republic of Namibia really wants to look at this matter, but it looks like our Colleagues there want to misdirect the boat from where we want to go.

With these few words, Honourable Speaker, thank you very much.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member. Any further discussion? Honourable Ndaitwah.

HON MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM: Honourable Speaker, I will be brief. I had no intention to contribute, but after having read a letter which was addressed to me and other members from the National Planning Commission, reacting on the matter and also having listened carefully to Comrade Abraham Iyambo and Comrade !Naruseb and others who contributed in the same line, it would not help us as national leaders to be divisive we need to be a uniting factor. When one adopts a selective morality, you may end up falling in that situation of dividing the people. The letter I am referring to, Comrade Speaker, specifically on Page 2 refers the reader to all the Regional Poverty Profiles and specifically to Page 54 of the Omaheke Region Poverty Profile, Page 45 of Hardap Regional Poverty Profile, Page 30 of Oshana Regional Poverty Profile, Page 57 of Oshikoto Regional

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON NANDI-NDAITWAH**

Poverty Profile ... (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY PRIME MINISTER: On a Point of Order. We are referred to these documents, but as it was mentioned, these documents were never distributed in this House. We do not know where these documents are and the National Planning Commission cannot today refer us to these pages. I do not know who sent them to make this study, I do not think the study was coming from this House. Now they are referring us to these pages and I do not know what we are discussing, I do not know what is going on here.

HON MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM: Comrade Speaker, I take it I have the right to make use of every document being distributed on my table. We are being referred to these pages, Oshikoto, Khomas... (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY PRIME MINISTER: On a Point of Order. I am not referring to this letter. I am referring to the whole document. Where is it? I am not blaming you.

HON SPEAKER: I want us to be on the same page. The point the Honourable Minister of Environment and Tourism is valid, that any document which comes through my office and is circulated here assumes what I was charging somewhere else to be responsible. The blame lies with the Office of the Speaker. The Speaker was under the impression that this document had been sent to us and I still have to find out how it got to my office and that we, therefore, circulated it. We have been debating documents that most of you, all of us have not seen. I can thus

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON NANDI-NDAITWAH**

not deny the Honourable Minister of Environment and Tourism to have a say since all of us are in the wrong. She will join us also to be in the wrong. Do not belabour the point, just make your contribution.

HON MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM: Comrade Speaker, I was now referring to the page... (Intervention)

HON BOOYS: On a Point of Order. I think if this House is not careful it is going to lose its credibility. (Intervention)

HON SPEAKER: Do not start that way. Just make the point that you want to make. The House can never be Out of Order.

HON BOOYS: The Point of Order is on that letter which was distributed. It was not distributed to all of us, that letter came half an hour ago with names of Ministers written from the National Planning Commission and this is why it has only be given to Ministers. This is my feeling, if we start dealing with documents, whether it is that Report or whether it is that letter, which are not known to others, this House will lose its credibility. We should know what we are discussing. I was wondering about that document, I think Honourable Kaiyamo said the document was found at the Windhoek Show. We are not all aware of those documents.

HON SPEAKER: There is apparently a Report somewhere in existence that nobody has seen and that is what the Deputy Prime Minister is making a point about. The circulated document to certain Members and

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON NANDI-NDAITWAH**

not to everybody is just an additional document. Please continue and at the end of your contribution I will give a Ruling.

HON MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM: I was saying that following the discussions... (Intervention)

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: Honourable Speaker, since I have the right to reply I did not want to get up, but this document that is being referred to as a non-document comes from the Office of the President of the Republic of Namibia. It is in the public domain. It has been used by donor agencies outside the country. This House has the right to discuss a document which is in the public domain. It is not the fault of the Mover of the Motion if people do not read documents that emanate from the Office of His Excellency the President. I do not believe a document that comes from State House can be looked at as something that has been picked up on the dirt heap.

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS: Honourable Speaker, I want to put the record straight. There is a difference between the Office of the President and State House. The document I saw with my neighbour here is from the National Planning Commission. In terms of the Public Service Act of 1995, Schedule 3, National Planning Commission is an Agency. In our Republic we have Offices, Ministries and Agencies and National Planning Commission is not an Office, it is an Agency with its own accounting officer, with its own separate Budget and to say this document came from State House is wrong. I just want to correct that.

HON MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM: Comrade Speaker, I want to repeat that after having listened to Comrades Abraham

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON NANDI-NDAITWAH**

Iyambo and !Naruseb and other Comrades, especially those who are saying we have to look at this issue from a historical context, at the same time we as national leaders should try not to be divisive, but to be a uniting factor.

It has been said by many Members in this Chamber that this is not the only Report which the National Planning Commission has produced, but it has produced Reports of the same nature on Poverty Reduction Assessment in all 13 Regions. If we could go through all the Reports, we will find that in the Reports of Omaheke, Hardap, Oshana, Oshikoto, Khomas, Kavango, Caprivi and Erongo Regions the issue of laziness has been identified by the community as one of the contributing factors to unemployment and poverty. That is why it is questionable that the discussion is focusing on one Report with specific reference to laziness and then identify one community when the same issues are mentioned in other Reports. If you look at the Regions mentioned, I do not know how many Namas are in those Regions. The impression we are creating is that those who responded only referred to the Namas.

I agree we have a historical context, that brought our people where they are today and that is what we need to address. That is why I fully agree with Comrade !Naruseb. If we make our people believe that those who responded only referred to the Report on Karas and not to other Reports, then we are dividing the Nation. If we want to discuss these Reports, Comrade Speaker, maybe the best is to ask the Government to present all the Reports so that we can discuss them in the context in which they are, instead of us being selective and creating the impression that we are focusing negatively on one community. If one reads some of these SMS's in The Namibian newspaper, one already finds that tension is created, while the same word is used in other Reports where the Nama-speaking Namibians are not dominant.

Let us unite our people, let us not divide them and let us not apply this selective morality. It will not get us anywhere, we will all fail. Let us look at the Reports in their totality and discuss them and bring them into context. I thank you, Honourable Speaker.

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON H ANGULA**

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: Honourable Speaker, my appeal is to postpone the Debate until Tuesday because I would like to make a contribution, but I am not prepared at this point in time and mine is not necessarily to talk about tribes, but to speak to the Motion that was tabled in this House. It is true that the Motion is based on the Report, but I want to speak on the Motion on Tuesday.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Angula. The Speaker will give some sensible direction.

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Comrade Speaker, let me make my humble contribution to this Motion. The Motion refers to one specific Report on Poverty Assessment in the Karas Region. Generally speaking, this Poverty Assessment Profile emanates from part of the agenda of the Millennium Development Goals. As you all know, the most important goal, Goal 1, is to halve the world poverty by 2015 and in 2004 we have carried out what is called the First Mid-Term Review to assess the achievements so far attained during the first quarter of the Millennium Development Goal. Subsequently we are supposed to prepare others, but it is required that, amongst others, this assessment must involve the people themselves. The people mean the people and not necessarily their representatives.

We have, therefore, been conducting a National Planning Commission Poverty Assessment based on interviews and sessions with the people in the Regions, based on specific selection criteria arrived at between the National Planning Commission and the leaders at Regional level as well as the leaders at traditional level. They agreed in terms of the villages that could be participating in that assessment and they assembled under trees and they gave their views and opinions how their development should be

12 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON H ANGULA**

conducted in respect of their respective Regions.

As you are aware, many of these assessments have been carried in most of the Regions. By the time I left I think there were only Karas, Khomas and Erongo which were outstanding, the rest were done.

Normally these Poverty Assessment results are tabled at the National Planning Commission and the Commission must then decide what kind of information they will use from those assessments and how they would transfer and transmit it to the overall National Report on Poverty and table it with the African Union and subsequently with the United Nations at the next review.

I think at no point it perhaps occurred to the National Planning Commission to table these Reports to the National Assembly. However, the National Assembly has the right to demand the tabling of these Reports before this House for any consideration.

I however only want to say that the aspects that we are discussing now are maybe unilateral and divorced from the entire process of poverty assessment. They raised emotion and this emotion was very unnecessary because it really selectively picked up one aspect of that Report.

HON SPEAKER: As the former Director General of the National Planning Commission I would like to accord you an opportunity to educate us a bit more. That notwithstanding, we have a Motion on the Floor and we have to address that Motion as it stands. Before I adjourn the House, I have now discovered there is a mother Report in existence from the National Planning Commission which is circulating freely outside. The Motion lifted what the Mover of the Motion found to be relevant to her and that is the Motion that you agreed to discuss. Therefore, we limit ourselves to the Motion and the consideration of this Motion will continue tomorrow afternoon and I will revert the Floor back to you, Minister, to shed more light on the situation.

12 November 2008

ADJOURNMENT

With that the House stands adjourned until tomorrow afternoon, 14:30.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:45 UNTIL 2008.11.13 AT 14:30

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
ASSEMBLY CHAMBER
13 NOVEMBER 2008
WINDHOEK**

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Members, this is the day for Questions, but I pray for the indulgence of the House to rearrange the Order Paper and that after the routine we shall start the business of the House, Order Number I and move to Order VI and then we will see how we will proceed from there.

Any Petitions? Any Reports of Standing or Select Committees?

**TABLING: REPORTS OF INTERNATIONAL
PARLIAMETARY UNION**

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: Honourable Speaker, I lay upon the Table for note-taking and information the following Reports of the International Parliamentary Union:

1. The Report of the IPU 118th Assembly and related meetings which were held in South Africa in April this year, under the theme, *“Pushing Back the Frontiers of Poverty.”* Copies of this Report were forwarded to the relevant Line Ministries for their comments and advice on relevant resolutions passed at the 118th IPU Assembly.
2. The Report of the 119th Assembly and related meetings of the IPU held in Geneva in Switzerland from the 10th to 15th of October for information and careful reading, since those will be the issues which will be dealt with under the presidency of the

13 November 2008

**TABLING OF REPORTS
HON SCHIMMING-CHASE**

IPU, Honourable Theo-Ben Gurirab.

HON SPEAKER: Any further Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Honourable Minister Mutorwa.

**ANNUAL REPORT 2007/2008 OF
MEAT CORPORATION OF NAMIBIA**

HON MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY:
Thank you, Honourable Speaker. I lay upon the Table the Annual Report, 2007/2008 of the Meat Corporation of Namibia (MeatCo) for information and reference by the Honourable Members.

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Minister please table the Report? Other Reports and Papers? Any Notice of Questions?

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS

QUESTION 102:

HON MOONGO: I give Notice that on Thursday, the 20th of November 2008, I shall ask the Minister of Defence the following:

1. Is the Minister aware that high-ranking members of the Navy victimise the lower ranking members and give the bad insinuation that in the Navy and Marine there is no democracy or human rights?

13 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON H ANGULA**

2. When are they going to be educated as capacity-building that democracy and human rights are part of the Namibian Constitution?
3. Is it true that when healthy relations are deteriorating, discipline will be in danger?
4. Is it true that seamen are resigning due to being underpaid? How many resigned since then?
5. Is it true that the cleaners are also worse underpaid in the Navy and Marine?

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Member please table the Questions? Any Notice of Motions? Any Ministerial Statements? The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

**CONSIDERATION: REPORT ON
PEOPLE OF THE SOUTH**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on the Report published by the National Planning Commission with regard to the people of the South.

HON SPEAKER: When the House adjourned on Wednesday, 12 November 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by Honourable Schimming-Chase. The Honourable Minister of Works and Transport, the former Director General of the National Planning Commission, had the Floor.

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Comrade Speaker, as I was saying just before the clock ended the Debate, that this Motion brought about by Honourable Schimming-Chase was addressing a

13 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON H ANGULA**

Report, picking out just one specific feature of the entire Report, which unfortunately has not been tabled in this House, but which Report is based on Poverty Assessment, a programme under the National Planning Commission which carried out poverty assessments throughout the 13 Regions of this beautiful country in line with our international commitment to the Millennium Development Goals, which aims to halve the people under poverty by 2015 and that all member countries of the United Nations Report periodically on progress being made in addressing the issue of poverty reduction and that in an effort to prepare ourselves to Report to the African Union and to the United Nations, the Government of Namibia decided, through its National Planning Commission, to involve the grassroots in assessing their own poverty and how this poverty can be addressed in terms of the priority development of the community as perceived from their own perspective and from their own surroundings.

In this connection, the National Planning Commission organised through the Regional and Traditional Authorities Sessions with the communities, of which target areas were identified by themselves and those who participated were identified by the communities to speak during those Sessions.

During those Sessions there were questionnaires, how they perceive Government development efforts, in which way they want to be participating, in which way they are involved in the areas that the Government is already involved and the communities came up with recommendations. During those discussions the communities were able to express their view on the biggest obstacles in their own communities that are constraining or obstructing their development. Therefore, the communities actually had several Sessions to come up and identify those areas in which they think Government should pay more attention and how they themselves are going to participate. In this regard there was real freedom of speech granted to the people and communities to speak their minds.

From my own observation of this Debate, I see that although we speak so much about the rights of people and freedom of expression, we are now trying to suffocate the very same freedom that the people have been

13 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON H ANGULA**

exercising, because what is being quoted must not be attributed to the interviewers. It cannot be attributed to the officials of the National Planning Commission and those who were involved these people were just messengers, carrying out the message to the Government as to what they perceived to be the problems constraining development in their own areas.

Of course, the issues raised as constraining development are many. They range from Government not consulting the people in terms of priorities to issues of environmental non-sustainability of certain projects that have been carried out. They also range from people who are not happy because they think that there are areas that have been neglected and they also include self-criticism and it seems that the people who raised these questions only picked up the self-criticism from the communities themselves, but it is not only the community of Karas Region that criticise themselves.

As the Honourable Director General tried to point out in this communication to specific people – although this has also not been acceptable to quote from pages of Reports which are not available and I will agree with those who say that all those Reports must now be tabled in this Honourable House, but the fact remains that when the time comes and we read these Reports, you will then observe that these were not the only people who exercised this self-criticism.

The self-criticism is not unusual, many of us who travel to the Regions hear the people themselves saying, for example, that the youth do not want to respect the elders, that they intimidate the elderly people, that the Government is doing little in the form of training of these young people, that the Government is too liberal with the trade in alcohol and other substances, that the Government is not controlling access to liquor outlets in terms of provision of liquor to children and all sorts of criticism to the extent that they say some of their members abuse alcohol. For example, they criticise that many of the men folk spend their salaries on alcohol and forget about the families and, therefore, priority must be given to the women folk in terms of empowerment and job provision because they say if you pay a woman, then you have made food available to the entire family.

13 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON H ANGULA**

All these were contained in those Reports, including the South which among themselves said that their people are drunkards, that they are lazy, they do not want to work and when they were asked to validate their statement, they said that when they are taken up by companies, whether in mining or agriculture, they do not return to duty after being paid and, therefore, the companies are left with no alternative than to hire migrant labourers. These words should not be attributed to the Government officials and that Report should not be said to be a Report for this House, it was for the planners to come up with modalities, which modalities should advise the Government how to proceed with the issue of development within the Regions, based on the observations of the people themselves.

I personally only attended one or two of these sessions, one in Omaheke and one in Caprivi or Kavango and these were free discussions. Now we are making capital out of this, we are sending the wrong message out of here as if the Government has a policy of insulting some of its citizens, as if it was the policy of the Government to call people lazy or drunkards. I think it is totally wrong to attribute this to Government or to the National Planning Commission.

Therefore, I do not think that this Motion should go any further than this or that it should be referred to any other committee. This Motion should be rejected and if there is any serious desire on the part of the House to balance it off, let us call for all the assessments that have hitherto been finalised to be tabled in this Honourable House for a balanced view of what the communities have said or not said. The idea that there are some stereotypes from the point of view of the officials is rejected and we should not play on the motions of the people to try to win sympathy and votes because in so doing we are creating hostility instead of trying to convince our population to do away with hostility and to reconcile with one another.

There are people talking about certain people living in other Regions while we are talking of one country, while we are talking of one unitary state. Our Budget does not point out where the most taxes are coming from. (Intervention)

13 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON H ANGULA**

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: On a Point of Information, Honourable Speaker, before the Motion is rejected. I want to ask Honourable Angula whether he read my Motion because the accusations that he is making are not in my Motion at all. He may be reacting to a letter that was written by the National Planning Commission, he may be reacting to the Report, but he is not reacting to my Motion because at no point did I say it is the position of the Government, at no point did I say it is the only Region. I would suggest that before he throws it out, he reads it.

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Indeed, this is maybe the sixth day of discussion, but the Honourable Member who Moved this Motion never corrected those who had been implying that the Report is belittling the people of the South, to the extent that those who wanted to back up your Motion were telling us about the exploitation of the Nama people, as if there are Members of this House who do not know about the exploitation of the Witboois or the Marengas. We all know the history of our country. Whether your Motion was not about that, you allowed it to happen without correcting it, Honourable Member. (Intervention)

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: I am not expected to reply until the end and that is what he is trying to avoid.

HON SPEAKER: You will have the last word, Honourable Member, it is your Motion and Honourable Minister, do not ask the Member to reply now.

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: No, peace be

13 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON H ANGULA**

with us. All I am trying to say is that, if you look at the newspapers, this Motion and the way it was presented created the impression that we are debating and condemning a certain Report by a Government department which characterises the Nama people as being lazy and drunkards. That is the message we sent and this is what I am driving at, that we should refrain from these emotions which are actually infantile kind of Debate, and message that we are sending. (Interjection)

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: Speak for yourself!

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: I must speak for myself because I am also trying to respond to not maybe you, but other people who came on board, who even made allegations that the South is not getting what they are entitled to get and using this emotion as a platform to launch that attack.

I want to say the people of Namibia are intelligent enough to follow any kind of emotional Debate which is either character assassination or just blame for the sake of blaming or trying to win the vote by pretending to say that you people there, be aware of the *gevaar*. They sometimes call it the "*Ovambo-gevaar*." The other gentleman was literally saying so, but that was never the objective of the Report that was not officially tabled in this Honourable House.

Therefore, let us be more logical, we must all be sensitive but above all, let us avoid these divisive Motions that do not contribute to unity of the people of this country. The Motion is condemned, rejected and should not have been allowed to stand. Thank you very much, Comrade Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Minister for his contribution. Honourable Members, this red line where the Speaker sits is not intended

13 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON DR T-B GURIRAB**

to divide the Rule of the Speaker between those that he loves and those he hates. I do not know what it is for other Parliaments, red means we are united by blood, and thus the role of the Speaker is that this House is one House.

We have all heard the words from the former Director General of the National Planning Commission, but as it is, the words require understanding of its meaning. There are similar Reports, like the one relating to Karas Region and here they are. They relate to my Region, Erongo, Kunene, Khomas, Oshikoto, Oshana, Omusati, Omaheke and Otjozondjupa. I discovered yesterday that most of us have not read these Reports. Honourable Tjihuiko said that he has read all of them. The Motion on the Order Paper by Honourable Nora Schimming-Chase, on the basis of research, design and methodology used, is according to Honourable Tjihuiko who has read them all the same. Honourable Angula, the Minister of Works and Transport, is the best source, he has explained the background to how this came about and why the National Planning Commission undertook the initiative.

The ongoing Debate, unfortunately, has distorted the intention of the National Planning Commission for the reasons explained by the former Director General which commissioned researchers to do the work. That is the crux of the matter. I wonder, frankly speaking, if instead of the Karas Report being the first of these Reports before the House, if a Motion had been moved on the other Reports here, whether the reaction would have been the same. The Government side is accused for failures of policy and corruption, without verification, by implication, the opposition for divisive politicking and un-patriotism ahead of elections. Both of them are wrong. I suggested yesterday to the National Planning Commission that once the Reports are out there as commissioned by the National Planning Commission which sits in Cabinet, then they assume a status that is official. They are discussed outside, no Honourable Member is wrong in bringing any of these Reports here to debate them. If I am wrong I would like to be told why it would be wrong to do so.

I advised yesterday and I am going to repeat it, if in the future Offices, Ministries and Agencies of Government were to commission this kind of

13 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON REV KONJORE**

undertaking, they must see to it that there are disclaimers that it does not reflect Government policy or rejoinders, an elaborate explanation of why the undertaking was made that would clarify and all the implications should be removed by that. Honourable Konjore.

**HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT
AND CULTURE:**

Thank you very much, Comrade Speaker. Comrade Speaker, allow me just to put a preamble to my brief prepared contribution and I want to say that maybe some of us, fortunately or maybe unfortunately, I do not know, are not by any means in a position that we could become tribal, that we could talk about one tribe or one Region belittling or judging the other one. If I can speak for myself, my family which I hail from and also belong to, I call as a “*united nations*”, meaning that if you come to my house and my family’s household, you will find people who could be called Namas and you will find people who may be called Owambos, they are there, they are Konjores, but they are Owambos, Hereros, Damaras, you name it. Therefore, my contribution would not necessarily like to concentrate on Namas or Owambos, I would like to speak about the Namibian people, the Namibian Nation and where necessary, talk about a Region.

It was mentioned yesterday and many a times the Government is accused of taking development to the North only and I was saying I would have loved if I could afford to take some people in lorries or in buses to the North to see some of the realities on the ground. I would just like to amplify here, I stand to be corrected, but if I take the Region that is under discussion right now, Karas, there will be very, very few places in the Karas Region where people still have to walk up to 10 kilometres to get water for the household. In my view the situation is quite different up North. I am just trying to say that some of the notions sometimes can miss points, sometimes we are also making remarks because we are ill-informed or wrongly informed.

I fully agree with the Colleagues who took the Floor yesterday and even before yesterday, starting from the Right Honourable Prime Minister, the

13 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON REV KONJORE**

Deputy Prime Minister, Minister !Naruseb and Minister Iyambo – and I have a little Iyambo in my family, of course carrying a different surname. Comrade Speaker, I agree that we have to be very much cautious whenever we debate issues and as leaders we need to be seen and heard, as was rightly put by the two Colleagues yesterday, that we contextualise.

Having said that, Comrade Speaker, I rise to make my small contribution on the Motion tabled by Honourable Schimming-Chase for this House to discuss the recent Report on a research published by the National Planning Commission with regard to the people of the South. Of course, I do not want to dwell on that any longer as a reason was given and the Honourable Speaker, without making a Ruling, makes it very clear as far as these different Reports are concerned of the different Regions. I share the same sentiments echoed by the Right Honourable Prime Minister, the Deputy Prime Minister as well as by other Honourable Members, like Comrade !Naruseb and Comrade Iyambo.

It is true, Comrade Speaker, that poverty is real in our country and especially in most of the rural areas and Hardap and Karas are no exceptions. However, we do not do justice to the problem facing our people by discussing this Report in this Assembly with the purpose of just debating it and it disappears from the roll of the Assembly once the Debate is concluded. Whether the Motion is rejected or not is not the most important part, but what attention are we going to pay, what responses are we going to provide to the problems in all those Reports uttered by our people who are very much concerned and whom we are representing here?

As the Deputy Prime Minister said in her contribution, we must move away from speech-making to action. That is what the people out there want from us as their leaders.

Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members, the people of Hardap and Karas Regions who are today referred to – and as they referred to themselves in this Report – as lazy, as being drunkards are none other than the same people that have contributed, like many other Namibians, to the liberation of our country and saying that, I am not trying to put the blame either on

13 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON REV KONJORE**

the officials or even on this Report, it was clearly said these were utterances of the people how they see themselves. However, in my view the question remains, what brings somebody to that extent that you will label yourselves as being lazy, for example?

The people from Hardap and Karas, referred to as Namas, have a long history of war between, firstly, the Germans and the Namibians and history can prove that fact. They have suffered immensely under the hands of the Imperial German forces until they have lost most of their belongings and even their cultural identity. They lost the greatest and the best parts of the land they inhabited and on which they could make a living.

If I could be allowed to quote from this very controversial Report, as it is labelled, there is a Paragraph saying:

“In terms of land ownership almost 60% of the surveyed area of the Karas Region is freehold land, owned by private individuals, many of whom use the land for farming, mostly small livestock and a few irrigated crop farms or tourism ventures.”

For that matter, a great part of this freehold land belongs to absentee landlords, some living in South Africa and elsewhere. Of course, the same applies to the rest of Namibia, but now that we are talking about that specific Region, I am referring to that.

“The second-largest land owner is the Government. They own almost 40% of the land. Most of this land is designated to the Naukluft Park in the extreme west, the Ais-Ais hot springs conservation area and the Sperrgebiet, soon to be amalgamated in one large conservation area.”

This is what the Report saying, not me.

“About 10% of the State land is designated as communal farmland over which Traditional Authorities and small-scale farmers hold control. Smaller parcels of Government land scattered through the Region comprise resettlement farms, an additional protected area and irrigation

13 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON REV KONJORE**

scheme around Naute Dam and a few other Government or parastatal farms. There are twelve designated local authorities scattered throughout the area with the largest being Keetmanshoop, the Regional capital.”

Comrade Speaker, in my view this is telling us one of the most and serious problems and skewed situations in that very Region. Whether you call them Namas, because from what I know, there is no household in Namibia today who can claim to be pure Nama or pure Owambo or pure Herero, we have all the races in our households. Even in Karas there are Oshiwambo-speaking people who cannot be regarded as Owambos, they forgot about Owamboland, they are Namas, just dark in colour. Therefore, I am talking about those people crammed into that 10%.

The question is, how can one expect from these people to really make a living on that piece of land and the most fertile and profitable land in that Region is in the hands of some other people, other than the original people, other than the communal farmers who are suffering. In my view, this is one of the root causes of poverty.

Unfortunately, Comrade Speaker, we took a resolution in the Land Conference in 1991 that ancestral lands are not to be mentioned, which I respect.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:40

HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:18 PURSUANT TO ADJOURNMENT

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: Thank you, Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members. I was saying that we can still recall the decision by the Land Conference in 1991 concerning ancestral land claims which we all have to respect, but in my view, Comrade Speaker, when the Namibian people participated in the liberation struggle they did so with the hope that they will one day enjoy the peace and freedom of this country and they will be part of the economic mainstream and at least partly get back their land and

13 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON REV KONJORE**

this never happened. One would have hoped that the Government schemes and programmes would have at least partly addressed this, not in the sense of ancestral land claims but in the sense of affirmative action and redistribution of land. Seemingly this is also not happening.

Just to mention one example, if we talk about Horingkranz in the Hardap Region which was one of the main centres of Hendrik Witbooi, which has so much historical value and sentiments for the descendants of that Nation and tribe, if we talk about ||Khauxa!nas in the Karas Mountains where Jacob Marenga was operating from, having such sentiment and historical value, all these pieces of land are in the hands of others who do not necessarily have the same sentiments and not even the need for a living space on that piece of land. These are realities we sometimes have to face so that at least in polite and civilised ways this hunger for land, this hunger for property of the majority of our people need to be addressed.

These Nama people referred to in the Report were hardworking Namibians. The people from Hardap and Karas Regions were people that wholly depended on their subsistence farming and their nomadic ways of living. The hardworking, self-reliant and independent people today are no more. The question again is, what is the root cause for that? Why are they today depending on others?

The other day the Right Honourable Prime Minister was referring to the different wars that these people fought, one of them about the dog tax, which is true, in 1922 that was the reason why the people were fighting, refusing to pay dog tax and other taxes on their own land. These are the very people who today are no more. What are the reasons and the causes?

The views and opinions expressed in this Report from the community members themselves can be true, as I previously said, but one needs to go deeper and find out what had happened to people to regard themselves as such and labelling themselves as such? We as leaders must take remarks and opinions very seriously if it comes from one of the sectors of our society. This only means one thing and that is that somewhere, somehow something is very wrong. We as leaders must read Reports of this nature and, as was already put, contextualise the issues raised in Reports of this

13 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON REV KONJORE**

nature and try to find solutions to these concerns and in my view, solutions for the whole of Namibia and solutions when a particular problem is of a particular nature and to a particular group of people or Region need to be found. Otherwise we will fail in our duty as lawmakers to unite our people.

Already we see in the newspapers what uneasy feelings this Report is causing amongst our Nama people as well as others and as rightly put, others may get up and say, "*if that was said about Karas, that was also said about Kavango or Omusati*" and they may again be up in arms. Therefore, we need to be sensitive on that.

Questions like, what can we as leaders do, how do we balance the situation? Based on that we have to make our pronouncements.

Another issue that we as leaders need to address is, do we really empower our people? Do we provide land and resources for them to make ends meet? How do we assist our people to be a part of the economic mainstream? All these issues need to be addressed.

Comrade Speaker, if I am allowed to spend a moment there, if I look at the present programme of resettlement, I am many a times asking myself, is it really pointing to a success? And now I am not necessarily talking about Karas or the Namas, but the resettlement programme as such and once again, I cannot run away from the fact that the Regions and the ecological system and rainfall differ from Region to Region. If you take a farm in Karas which is to be used for livestock farming and subdivide this farm today and allocate it to two to three farmers, what success do you really expect from these farmers while in the past the owner of that very farm was one person? He could survive because of rotation and how do you want to address some of these questions? Some of us are really waiting for a time to come that we face these issues and address them properly.

Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members, the Hardap and Karas Regions have produced outstanding academic results for Grade 10 and Grade 12 for the past academic year. However, the question remains, how many of

13 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON REV KONJORE**

these learners who have passed their Grade 12 did get bursaries to make it to the universities or institutions of higher learning? Which opportunities did we offer others who could not make it to the universities and these same questions could, of course, apply to the other Regions. Karas Region is considered to be one of the richest Regions in this country. There are diamonds, the fishing industry and much more. What benefits do all these bring to the inhabitants of the Region?

Perhaps this Report is an eye-opener for us as national leaders to start facing the reality and start to address the issues and concerns of our people as leaders and not as short-sighted politicians.

As mentioned by Comrade !Naruseb and Comrade Iyambo yesterday, we have to contextualise issues of this nature and look at the historical background that has led to these concerns raised in the Report. The people of the South have gone through wars that have in one or the other way affected them both economically and psychologically.

Comrade Speaker, whilst there, I am of the opinion if one would take the very last war that was waged in Namibia by the South Africans against the Namibians, the military war took place in the North and heavy losses of life and property were caused to our people in the North. Nobody can deny that fact, but in my view the then apartheid South African Government was waging a psychological war in the South which indeed damaged our people in the South to such an extent that the self-esteem of the people have been destroyed in many instances. Therefore, in my view, we as national leaders and a Nation need to look into the possibility of giving these people a psychological rehabilitation, as I would like to call it, for them again to come to that stage that they will be able to say, "*I am also a somebody*", for them to say, "*I am also ready and prepared to make a contribution before I demand what I want you to do for me*", because one has to sow before you can reap.

Comrade Speaker, mention was made of alcohol and drunkenness. I fully agree that alcohol is a national problem, not only a problem to the Karas Region. The other day somebody mentioned the mushrooming of shebeens all over Namibia. When are we as leaders and as a

13 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON REV KONJORE**

Government and as a people going to address this mushrooming of shebeens? (Interjections). Yes, the opposition leaders who have shebeens in their own villages also have to be addressed. Before I am derailed, Comrade Speaker, not only shebeens but the availability of liquor today even in the supermarkets and the cafès and wherever you go. Liquor is available 24 hours a-day. How do we want this Nation to remain sober and remain people that can plan? Therefore, alcohol is a national problem.

Comrade Speaker, I hope you will agree with me that when you have a thousand sheep or goats or cattle and fifty of these cattle die, it will not be that easily visible, the owner will feel it but it will not be that much visible, but when you have a hundred goats or sheep and fifty will die, it is so much visible and although the effects of alcohol is affecting the whole Nation, because of the numbers in some instances it may not be that visible whilst in others, because of the small numbers it is so visible and it is so tragic. Therefore, this is one of the issues and evils we as a Namibian Nation needs to address if we really want to build a healthy Nation, *'one Nation, one Namibia, one people'*.

As mentioned earlier, the people of the South have gone through wars which in one or another way affected them psychologically. The apartheid system under which they suffered for many years has sidelined them in the economic mainstream and that certainly contributed to the issues raised in this Report. It is, therefore, incumbent upon us as leaders to face the reality and to do more for our people, not necessarily only the Nama people, but all those Namibians living in the impoverished and poverty-stricken areas, particularly our rural areas.

Comrade Speaker, with these very few remarks, I hope I made my point and I rest my case.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Minister. Any further discussion? Chief Ankama.

13 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON SCHIMMING-CHASE / HON ULENGA**

HON DR ANKAMA: Comrade Speaker, I rise on a Point of Order. I would like to invoke Rule 70 which calls for the division of this House in terms of Rule 69 so that we can bring this Debate to a closure.

HON SPEAKER: I will overrule that. As it has now been proven the case to be and I spoke to that after the former Director-General of the National Planning Commission has given us the background about these Reports, why they were commissioned and what the intention was and we now know the discussion started wrongly and in light what has already transpired, I would proceed the normal way and ask for any further discussion and if not, then I will ask the Mover of the Motion whether she wishes to reply. After that we will come back to what you intend to do, to terminate the Debate.

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: Honourable Speaker, I shall reply on Tuesday.

HON SPEAKER: That being the case, the reply will be on Tuesday. Any objection? None.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Speaker, with all due respect, first of all I have to submit my apology because I grabbed this thing to listen to what Honourable Ankama was trying to say. I thought he was trying to adjourn the Debate until another date. I misheard him and had I not misheard him, I would myself have asked for an adjournment until next Tuesday.

13 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
RT HON N ANGULA**

HON SPEAKER: You will speak before Honourable Schimming-Chase. The Secretary will read the Second Order of the Day.

RATIFICATION: MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on Ratification of the Millennium Challenge Compact between the Republic of Namibia and the United States of America, acting through the Millennium Challenge Corporation.

HON SPEAKER: When the Debate was adjourned on Thursday, 23 October 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Minister of Works and Transport. Honourable Booy's adjourned the Debate and I now give him the Floor.

HON BOOYS: Honourable Speaker, I adjourned the Debate on the Millennium Challenge Corporation for further consultations and I revert the Floor to the Honourable Prime Minister for further discussions.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Thank you, Comrade Speaker. The Millennium Challenge Account Compact should be understood within the context of development cooperation with cooperating partners. Development cooperation by its nature is a form of human solidarity. It is a form of human decency in terms of sharing with your neighbour if your neighbour is worse off. The attempt here of the American people is to share with the people of Namibia their own resources and this is being done in the context of Namibia's own situation.

13 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
RT HON N ANGULA**

Our history, as you all know, has created two nations in one. You have a Nation in which 20% of the population own 75% of the national assets and resources and 60% are described as living below the poverty line and 10 of that 60% are actually classified as very poor. This is the situation we have.

Because of this situation, Namibia has gone out to the rest of the world to solicit support in order to deal with the unequal distribution of wealth in our country, with poverty and overall, with the social deficit left behind by apartheid. That is the rationale why the Government of Namibia has gone out to the countries in the world to seek development cooperation and we do that in the true tradition of the SWAPO Party.

During the struggle we learned a lot. At the end of the day SWAPO Party supports... (Intervention)

HON ULENGA: Honourable Speaker, may I ask the Right Honourable Nahas Angula a question? Right Honourable Mr Angula, this solidarity with the American Government, with the Bush Administration, that your Government is talking about – I am talking about the SWAPO Government, not our Government.... (Interjections). That is right, the Namibian Government is ours. (Interjections). Keep cool guys, I have not yet hit, I am just about to. This solidarity that you are talking about between your Government and the Bush Administration, is it a solidarity that started in the struggle, yes as you are now referring to the struggle, or is it a new fangled solidarity that came about only now, because you are talking about doing this in a true SWAPO tradition? Can you clarify to me and, of course, to the Nation, because the Nation is up in arms, as you know, exactly when this solidarity started? Thank you.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: I expected Honourable Ulenga to act as the president of a particular Party, however confused that Party may be, I did not expect him as a person to be as confused as his own Party, but let

13 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
RT HON N ANGULA**

me say this: The money you are talking about, and I want you to listen very carefully, the money we are talking about is the taxpayers' money of the people of the United States, tax money from the people of the United States. When you are talking about solidarity, you are talking about the solidarity of the people of America with the people of Namibia. That is what you are talking about, you should understand that. The Government is representing the people of the United States of America. It is not money from the particular pocket of Mr Bush or something like that, it is tax money from the people of America.

I was talking about the tradition of SWAPO. SWAPO has been very pragmatic all the time and this pragmatism was forged through the crucible of the struggle and you know during our struggle we had to face a divided world, a world divided by Cold War. Even during the Cold War the socialist camp itself was also divided. The one was calling the other one a revisionist and things like that... (Interjection)

HON MEMBER: Reactionaries!

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: But as a mature Party, knowing what we wanted, we had to wade our way through these contentious issues and conflicts, so much so that we are probably the only Party which had good relations both with China and with the Soviet Union. (Intervention)

HON ULENGA: I appreciate the way the Prime Minister is coming out with an attempt to clarify the situation. May I ask the Prime Minister a small question? I think the Prime Minister is doing his best, therefore if the Right Honourable Nahas Angula would not mind, can you please explain in this context the accusations that you and ghost factions of your Party, the RDP and so forth or SWAPO-A and SWAPO-B, the allegations which you have always directed against other Parties such as the CoD, as

13 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
RT HON N ANGULA**

being the imperialist running dogs of the United States of America and its Government if it is indeed you who now claim that the money that you are getting from the American Government comes from the American people all of a sudden? Please explain the context of the accusations that you have made against other the Parties?

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: I do not mix up this discussion with the local Party-politics. The short answer to you, without mixing up this discussion with where you are trying to drive me, is that your Party... (Intervention)

HON ULENGA: The people are driving you, I am not driving you.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: The CoD was invented to roll back the liberation movement's gains. That is what the purpose of your Party was. If you have lost that purpose, I wonder, but your job was to roll back the gains of the liberation struggle. (Interjection)

HON ULENGA: Shame on you !

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: In the spirit of that pragmatism and having the historical social deficit we inherited... (Intervention)

**HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT,
HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:** On a Point of Order. Is

13 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
RT HON N ANGULA**

it allowed for a Member of the Opposition Party to call the Prime Minister, “*shame on you*”. He said it to the Prime Minister and he should withdraw it. That is what he said.

HON SPEAKER: Yes, Honourable Ulenga, if you have said that, I did not have my earphones on, you can do better than that. Withdraw that expression.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Speaker, rightly as you say you did not hear that, I did not say that.

HON SPEAKER: Everything you say is electronically recorded. Honourable Ulenga, I want you to listen to me, everything we say is electronically recorded. Today is 13 November 2008, I will check when the electronic version of what you have said comes out and I will do that. That is a promise. If you did not say it, the HANSARD will so indicate, but if you have said so and you are misleading the Speaker, I will consider it on that ground. Prime Minister, continue. You say you did not say that, Honourable Ulenga, sit down.

HON ULENGA: I want to explain.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: The crux of the matter is I heard it, I ignored it because I know the gentleman is not even fit to be a person of a soccer association. (Interjection)

13 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
RT HON N ANGULA**

HON SPEAKER: No, do not go there, Prime Minister. Everybody sit down, I will repeat myself. Honourable Ulenga, I am talking to you. I take all of you as Honourable Members. The Honourable Member said, the Minister said what he said. I asked you to withdraw and I said I did not have my earphones on. You as an Honourable Member, Leader of the Official Opposition, said *you did not say that*. I said, therefore, today is 13 November 2008, when the electronic print of what you have said comes out and you have misled the Speaker, then if the record says you did not say so, because you did not say so, well and good. If the contrary comes out, you will set an example. Let us leave it at that now, we do not have the printout now.

HON T GURIRAB: Honourable Speaker, I rise on a Point of Order. The Prime Minister has punched that the Party to which I belong was invented to roll back the gains of the revolution. I think the Prime Minister should withdraw that.

HON SPEAKER: Yes, I will ask the Prime Minister to withdraw that.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Yes, I withdraw that. I was saying, true to the tradition of the SWAPO Party, when the Millennium Account Corporation was established by the Government of the United States, the SWAPO Government decided to lobby for that development assistance. I do remember in 2003 I was invited to address a Congressional Committee dealing with the Millennium Challenge Corporation and I put the case for Namibia, why Namibia should qualify.

Since Namibia is classified as a low-middle income, we did not have a chance to qualify, because the Millennium Challenge Account was meant to focus specifically on poverty. But as time went on, our friends in the United States continued to lobby the Administration why Namibia and other countries should qualify, precisely of what I talked about, the two

13 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
RT HON N ANGULA**

Nations in one, the social deficit which we are facing, that in Namibia as a democracy we want to deepen this democracy, Namibia should be assisted to try to reduce inequity in income distribution, poverty, youth unemployment and all these social challenges we are faced with.

Eventually the Millennium Corporation Board decided that Namibia and El Salvador, both of which are classified as low-middle income, do qualify. On the strength of that, Namibia put forward its ideas as to how it should benefit. The initial proposals were more focused on infrastructure development, especially roads and other communication infrastructure in order to open up especially to the communities which were left out.

I know, for example, there was an idea to open up the Eiseb Block, there was an idea to link up Katwitwi with Tsumeb, there was an idea of a road to connect along Etosha fence Oshivelo and Omutambawaomawe so that we can open up the marketing possibilities of communities.

However, all the projects had to be judged according to the economic return, that the projects should demonstrate that there would be an economic return on the investment. Therefore, some of these things could not pass the test of economic return on the investment. At the end of the day we ended up with three sectors – education, agriculture and environment.

With education the idea was to strengthen the capacity of the national education system to enhance quality outcome of education. You know that with our national resources we have promoted access and participation and right now something like 95% of our 16 year olds are participating, but the problem is the outcomes which are a big challenge.

To improve quality, the Millennium Challenge Corporation said yes, we will assist you especially with textbook provision and you know that textbooks are key learning media. Right now what we have in our schools is that five children are sharing one textbook. Just imagine! It will just happen one child will have access to a textbook once in a week and it is a big challenge to learning and also to teaching. Therefore, textbook provisioning is very critical to improving learning outcomes.

13 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
RT HON N ANGULA**

The other purpose is that if you can improve learning outcomes, you are empowering these learners that they will not reproduce poverty when they grow up. They will learn for professions, they will get jobs and they would have been empowered in the process. It is a process of fighting poverty and creating equity in society and, therefore, getting rid of our social deficit.

When we come to agriculture, the idea there is to increase the market penetration of those who are on the other side of the red line by improving animal health and in so doing, the communities there will be able to get access to markets and when they get access to markets, they are able to sell their animals and therefore, fight poverty in the process and improve their assets in terms of income. That is the whole idea.

The other idea behind agriculture is to improve the traditional products which our own people have been using since time immemorial, to commercialise hoodia, the Kalahari melons and other things so that the communities themselves benefit directly from the commercialisation of these traditional intellectual properties they have, so that these traditional properties are not expropriated by other people who make millions out of them at the expense of the communities. That is economic empowerment.

Again the idea is to give the communities productive resources which can empower them.

When it comes to environment and tourism, the long story about Etosha, let me talk about Etosha a bit. How did Etosha come about? Let me tell you. Etosha used to be a resource traditionally benefiting Haikum people and the Ondonga people. Etosha is made up of three ecological Regions and these are reflected in our traditional oral culture. You have Okashana which is a grass expanse without trees and in our tradition you say, "*Okashana kuukongo wa Nehale.*" What used to happen is that every winter the people from Ondonga would go on annual hunting trips into Okashana and harvest meat for their own nutrition.

Then you have Etosha, the right word is Etotha. "*Etotha lya nkumbwamba lya toka lyafa ousila,ngo omutoko ta u tika*". This means

13 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
RT HON N ANGULA**

when you go hunting and you look at this salt pan, it is as white as flour. When the animal starts to run and the dust rises, it seems as if it is ashes rising. That is how we talk about it in our oral culture when we were having ownership and when the Germans in 1902 put up their fort there, it was a serious provocation against the Ondonga people, that the chief there had no alternative but to wage war against the Germans. The Germans put up that fort in order to control the movement of people between south and north. After the war they realised that the best way to contain the North is to put up a buffer. That is how Etosha came into being, it is a buffer between the north and the south, so they declared it as an animal sanctuary. However, when the area was fenced in, the Haikum were chased out, the Ondongas were chased out and they lost access to those resources.

There is one particular resource which was so dear... (Intervention)

HON MOONGO: May I ask the Honourable Prime Minister a tiny question? Since an injustice was done already by the colonial Government and we now have a Namibian Government, what percentage will be paid into the fund of the Traditional Authority because it was the only resources of that particular Traditional Authority.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: At Etosha there is a weed which was harvested annually in the winter, called *Onthokala*. This weed is used by women as a perfume. Now this perfume was fenced in. Also the salt pens were there, salt used to be harvested in the winter and that is why you were able to sell salt to the Ovaherero in exchange for cattle. All these things were fenced in and it was part of the dispossession to some of us.

What is the situation now? The situation now is that Etosha is a national heritage, it belongs to all of us, but look around, how do we benefit as a Nation from this national resource? Literally nothing right now, we are

13 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
RT HON N ANGULA**

just proud to have it there and the people who are enjoying the scenery there are the tourists. You and me cannot afford even the gate fees.

The question now is that there are people who were dispossessed, more particularly the Haikum, chased out of their homeland, their Okakarara, their Vaalgras. They were chased out and left to wander around Etosha. I am happy that Dr Libertine Amathila is now going to give them some farms around Etosha.

When they get those farms around Etosha, they must have access to their ancestral land. It is our national resource, but more so the people who traditionally made a living out of that and we are saying for them to have access, they must have a concession, an area they call their own. They can go there and pray to their gods and make a big fire. No, do not make a fire in Etosha. They will now have their Conservancy and I hope they will begin this conservancy so that they will have exclusive access to an area which traditionally belonged to them.

The story of Etosha being sold to somebody else is a fairy tale, imagined by somebody, it has nothing to do with the Compact. Let me tell you that, Honourable President-in-waiting, Honourable Benjamin, Crispus Ulenga. (Intervention)

HON ULENGA: May I put a small question to the Prime Minister? Indeed, my dear friend, Right Honourable Nahas Angula, it is not to me that you need to explain this. Do you not know that this is a small little insect that is eating SWAPO, it has nothing to do with Etosha, it is about the divisions within your Party and everybody is grabbing at each small little thing to try to create some kind of fire. Like you said, you cannot make fire in Etosha. You do not have to explain to me, explain to the SWAPO Youth League, explain to other factions in SWAPO. The question is, do you think it is to me that you need to explain or rather to the SWAPO Youth League who are trying to wage this internal war that is being fought within SWAPO, targeting for example my dear friend Angula there, the other Angula.

13 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
RT HON N ANGULA**

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: I know Honourable Ulenga is trying to divert me from what I am saying. Let me only tell you this, SWAPO is a democratic, dynamic organisation, we have freedom of speech. We do not go to Court to settle our differences. There will always be a synthesis, but generate it from within the family, not to be presided over by a magistrate.

I was saying that I think the Haikum people should have access to Etosha. Listen very carefully, you were listening when Honourable Konjore was talking about the South, I am talking about Etosha. Some of us want to have access to the graves of our forefathers who are buried in Etosha, the graves of our forefathers who fought against the Germans. Two brothers of my father died there, my father's father left wounded. (Interjection). These are special graves against colonial oppression. Therefore, we are entitled. Now it is shame on you, who said shame on you and you start again to deny. You start again to deny. I told the people of Namibia that this gentleman is not fit to be a president, even the CoD made a mistake, he is not fit to be president because he denies what he says. (Intervention).

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS: Honourable Speaker, this time around I am sure the Honourable Speaker has heard what the Honourable Member has said and I rise to request that he withdraws that "*shame on you*" to the Right Honourable Prime Minister.

HON SPEAKER: I heard that, yes. Honourable Members, I really think that the Right Honourable Prime Minister is doing his serious best as the Leader of Government Business in the House to not only address you Honourable Members but addressing the public out there who is confused by earlier Debates and what is going on outside. This time I heard you saying, "*shame on you*", Honourable Ulenga, can you withdraw that? This time I heard you.

13 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
RT HON N ANGULA**

HON ULENGA: Honourable Speaker, I did not say it because...
(Intervention)

HON SPEAKER: Sit down, Honourable Ulenga, sit down. I will check the records. Honourable Ulenga, can you sit down? Prime Minister continue.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: I was saying one way for the people who were deprived of their traditional means of livelihood to benefit from this natural resource is for them to have exclusive concession areas where they can go and also enjoy themselves and their visitors and that is the purpose and this is all what this Compact is saying.

Of course, the Compact encourages communities around Etosha to establish nature conservancies around there and establish accommodation facilities in their conservancies. The Compact also recognises that communities sometimes do not have the capacity to do that, nor the expertise and the Compact is saying that is not a big problem, we are going to provide you with start-up capital. First you have your land, here is your capital and on top of that we will give you start-up capital so that you can attract strategic partners to partner with you, so that you can utilise your traditional resource to your benefit in order to fight poverty. That is the rationale behind what is happening around Etosha. It is to make sure that those who benefited from this resource traditionally should not feel that they have been totally, perpetually and permanently deprived of this resource, but they have to share the resource with the whole of Namibia because this is now a national heritage. That is all what the Compact intends to do.

We know that language sometimes causes problems, the way you say things, the way you formulate them. If the formulation is not so precise to prevent different interpretations, people will always get confused and perhaps get different meanings of what you are trying to achieve and what

13 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
RT HON N ANGULA**

you are trying to do. However, the Compact is a programme which Namibia has campaigned for in order to address the social deficit and to empower those communities which have been dispossessed historically for them to have productive assets and in so doing, fight poverty and create employment.

To the youth the message is that the vocational training system is going to be expanded. When the vocational training system is expanded, we will provide more opportunities for skills development for the young people, so that those young people who stand around the street corners, waiting for someone to pick them up for piece work, should now go for formal training and get skills and to create small businesses for themselves. This is particularly my passion, to provide skills to the young people.

When I was the Minister of Education I found that the formal education training system was not reaching out to the young people, especially those who drop out of school very early and I created an organisation called Community Skills Development Foundation to create Community Skills Development Centres which give hands-on skills to the young people so that they can market themselves or they can acquire skills which help them to start businesses.

It is the intention of this Compact to provide resources to the communities so that the communities can reconstruct their economies and in the process empower themselves. However, we must have full understanding the Development Cooperation. Development Cooperation means taking tax money from other countries to come and help you. Those people who paid their taxes want returns from their taxes, so it cannot just be something free, that even if you do not show any progress, you just get it. In fact, many people are now very sceptical about development aid because it has been misused during the sixties. The Mobutus of this world did damage to the development. (Interjection)

HON MEMBER: He was your friend.

13 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
RT HON N ANGULA**

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: I told you we were pragmatic, if I want to come and fight my war here, why should I quarrel with Mobutu?

The point is that during the past couple of decades development aid was misused, so much that the other day people had a meeting in Paris and talked about aid effectiveness and put up criteria how aid should be made effective. One of those criteria is that there must be some things you must fulfil, that once you have done this and this, we give the next one; if you do not achieve it, you are not serious about your own development because this is money belonging to other people that they could have used for other things. If you get it, you must identify that you are going to use it properly. This is the idea of these conservancies and we must accept it as part of the development process if we want to benefit the Development Cooperation.

For me as a person whose background is education, I am used to this, that you give targets for schools to reach if you want to see that there is progress, if you are going to measure, otherwise you will not be able to measure whether they are making progress and I do not think there is anything wrong with it.

Colleagues, I want you to understand this Compact within the context of Development Cooperation. Namibia has a social deficit which must be addressed and I was happy to see a Report tabled here today, entitled, "*Pushing Back the Frontiers of Poverty.*" Yes, with our own resources we can push back the frontiers of poverty, but it can even be faster if we engage our development partners to forge with us a partnership to push the frontiers of poverty back or even to make sure that it is history.

Let us, therefore, use this money from the American taxpayers to push back the frontiers of poverty in our country. If we can do that, we have deepened democracy in Namibia. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Well done. Honourable Mudge.

13 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
HON MUDGE**

HON MUDGE: Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, this Parliament was briefed by the MCA and I got the impression that everybody in the Parliament was quite happy about the presentation that was done. There is a long list on what was done by MCA. I was also under the impression that the Namibian team negotiated on our behalf the Compact and that they were very able and capable. I was very happy to see that Namibia will get a very big amount of money for poverty reduction and all the programmes that were forwarded by our team.

One thing that worried me is the fact that it seems to me that some people in the country do not understand that this is a gift. It is not a loan, it is money given to Namibia to do certain things to improve. I would have thought that we would have accepted this without any complaints. I believe that the so-called unacceptable issues have been ironed out and I fully support the MCA-Namibia Compact. I must, however, mention that I was very surprised by statements made and here I want to refer to those by the SWAPO Youth League and also, if I am not mistaken, the Attorney-General or the Minister of Justice to whom this Compact was referred for ratification or for scrutiny and it was approved by her.

It is my submission that we should be very careful in future when it comes to this kind of thing, because I am sure that the commotion that erupted following these statements and others did not go down well with the donor. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND ATTORNEY - GENERAL: On a Point of Order, Comrade Speaker. I did not intend to interrupt the Honourable Gentleman, but he made reference to the Attorney-General and he went further to say “*she*” and I realised he was probably referring to me as the Attorney-General. I do not quite remember whether I had made a statement to the effect that the Honourable Member is quoting me. If he can just repeat himself and clarify to the House as to when, where and how I made that statement.

13 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
HON MUDGE**

HON MUDGE: Honourable Speaker, many people made statements and it is my recollection that also the Honourable Ithana made such a statement in a speech at a meeting or somewhere, but it was said. I will look for it and I will bring it to this Honourable House.

HON SPEAKER: Are you referring to a source, you read it in a newspaper, was it on television?

HON MUDGE: I have it somewhere, but I can provide it. Unfortunately I do not have it here. (Intervention)

**HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT,
HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:** May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Are you referring to the Report in the *Republikein* that said SWAPO had a caucus on this and Honourable Pendukeni Ithana and Jerry Ekandjo were making a lot of noise? Is that the one you are referring to, the story in the newspaper?

HON MUDGE: Honourable Speaker, it could be. I want to conclude by saying that it is my submission... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND ATTORNEY - GENERAL: Honourable Speaker, I would like the Honourable Member to publicly here retract his reference to a statement I have made or produce that statement.

13 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
HON MUDGE**

HON SPEAKER: I was trying to help Honourable Mudge. Is it something that you saw on television or something you read, something you were told? If you can verify that, otherwise you would be accused of hearsay.

HON MUDGE: Honourable Speaker, for now I withdraw it but I will bring the evidence. If I bring evidence then I will have time to show it to you.

I want to conclude by saying that it is my submission... (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: On a Point of Information. Honourable Speaker, after my Senior, the Prime Minister has spoken and has explained the whole background and the importance of this Compact and so on, it was not my intention to make any intervention, but taking from the unfortunate statements which Honourable Mudge is making on the SWAPO Youth League who are not here, as a member of the SWAPO Youth League I am obliged to set the record straight. Freedom of expression is provided within the Constitution of the Republic of Namibia, freedom of association and it was within those whereby the SWAPO Youth League was raising certain concerns of the SWAPO Youth League and its members and those matters have been addressed as is clearly stipulated by supporting documents. For the Honourable Mudge to try to create an impression that SWAPO Youth League is fighting donors needs to be condemned with the contempt it deserves. It is outside the spirit of consultation. I rest my case.

HON MUDGE: Honourable Speaker, the Honourable Member is quite right, but then one would have expected that as the SWAPO Youth League attacked us, that they then would have said that they agree. All I

13 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
HON TJIHUIKO**

know at this point is that they attacked this Compact. Whether they agreed internally, that is their problem. I say it is none of my business, but it is a Namibian business.

I want to conclude by saying that it is my submission that we should be very careful in future... (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: Comrade Speaker, before Honourable Mudge concludes, on a Point of Information. The Honourable Member started in supporting and then ends by insulting our youth and I just want to inform Honourable Mudge that yesterday in this House we presented these three documents, including the first Amendment. If you have read it, do so. If it were not for the SWAPO Youth League this Amendment would not have been here and it will also tell you there is no lodge going to be built in Etosha. Maybe you thought your company is going to build a lodge in Etosha, but you will never build a lodge there in Etosha. I want you to know that.

HON MUDGE: Comrade Speaker, it is my submission that we should be very careful in future when it comes to this kind of thing, because I am sure that the commotion that has erupted following the statements by the SWAPO Youth League and others did not go down well with the donor and I think the Namibian Nation owes them an apology. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Tjihuiko.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Speaker, I will be very brief. I am happy to listen to the statements made by the Right Honourable Prime

13 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
HON TJIHUIKO**

Minister on this very important agreement and not only what he has said, but the manner and the spirit in which he has presented it. Therefore, I believe it may not be a good idea to try to raise some issues that have already been raised some time back and I think these are the issues that have created the commotion that you are talking about, misunderstanding and confusion that would have led to this very generous grant going the other way. If we could do our things of this nature in a mature manner, it would be in the interest of the Nation.

There are one or two things that I want to say here. I have noticed that when we were consulted as Members of Parliament, people who are expected to ratify this agreement, we were consulted differently – one group on that side and one group on this side. That does not go down well. One is always getting the impression that one wonders why the Ruling Party is being consulted on its own and the Opposition Parties consulted on their own? What is it that has been said to the other group that has not been said to us on this specific issue? (Intervention)

HON P MUSHELENGA: On a Point of Information so that disinformation does not create wrong impressions outside. I know, for example, that the Standing Committee on Economics, Natural Resources and Public Administration, of which Honourable Tjihuiko is a member, was also consulted where members of the Ruling Party and Opposition Parties were sitting together.

HON TJIHUIKO: As I said, Honourable Speaker, I could have tried to answer that but I do not want to get into that. What I am saying is that there was consultation specifically for the leaders of the Opposition Parties, not with the committee that you are talking about, not at committee level but at Party level. What I am saying is that that could easily understand misunderstanding and if that is what we want, fine, but what I am saying is that when it is an issue of national interest, it should

13 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
HON DE WAAL**

not be regarded that this is the opposition and this is the Ruling Party. It will not auger well. That is all that I am trying to say.

In conclusion, Honourable Speaker, I would appeal to all of us that sometimes the statements that we are making, whether out there or in this House, are really creating problems for all of us. We should be very careful with our statements. Let me stop here, I do not want to go beyond that, but I just want to appeal to all of us, please, sometimes the statements that we are making can be wrongly interpreted and can cause problems for all of us. Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker.

HON DE WAAL: Honourable Speaker, I will be very brief. Honourable Speaker, I like this Millennium Challenge Agreement, I like it very much. I have supported it right from the beginning and the reason why I am saying this is that the whole world currently is going through the worst economic crises of maybe the last thirty years and the money that we are going to receive from the Millennium Challenge Fund might just be the thing that will pull Namibia through that economic crises. When funds dry up elsewhere and people start losing their jobs, the Millennium Challenge Fund might just be the thing that will create jobs in that timeframe where there will be less jobs than currently. Therefore, I think we should be very grateful for it.

I want to say only one more thing, Honourable Speaker, the proof of the pudding lies in the eating. We have done our work very well so far, we have followed the process right from the beginning until today – hiccups or no hiccups does not really matter, but we have succeeded and hopefully Parliament will ratify the Agreement.

What is now very important is that we implement the Agreement. Sometimes we are very good planners, but when it comes to implementation, we are not so good and I think the whole world is looking at Namibia to see whether we have the capacity and the will to implement this Agreement according to the goals that were set. As a Nation we should now work together to make sure that we show the world that we

13 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
HON DE WAAL**

can and will implement this Agreement on time as expected of us and I want to appeal to all Namibian people to support these projects. It is good projects, especially the ones in Etosha. I like tourism, I like game and I love those projects. Therefore, let us implement them, let us show the world that we can actually do it. I support the Agreement.

HON SPEAKER: This is a project of the outgoing Administration in the United States. The Administration which will be sworn in on 20th of January may not necessarily be committed to the same. The sooner we wrap it up, signed and sealed before the 20th, we stand a better chance. We stand adjourned until Tuesday, 14:30.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:45 UNTIL 2008.11.18 AT 14:30

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
ASSEMBLY CHAMBER
18 NOVEMBER 2008
WINDHOEK**

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Members, I would like to, on behalf of the National Assembly, congratulate Honourable Kaura for his re-election as President of DTA, Honourable P Moongo as Vice-President, Honourable J De Waal as Chairman and Honourable Venaani as Secretary General of the DTA Party, respectively. Congratulations.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any Petitions? Any Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Honourable Tweya.

TABLING: REPORTS OF AUDITOR-GENERAL

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: Comrade Speaker, I lay upon the Table, Reports of the Auditor-General on the Accounts of the following:

- (a) Ministry of Health and Social Services for the Financial Year ended 31 March 2007;
- (b) Ministry of Youth, National Service, Sports and Culture for the Financial Year ended 31 March 2007;

18 November 2008

**TABLING OF REPORTS
HON HOFFMANN**

- (c) Municipality of Keetmanshoop for the Financial Year ended 30 June 2007; and
- (d) Municipality of Henties Bay for the Financial Years ended 30 June 2006 and 2007.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Table the Reports, Honourable Member. Honourable Hoffmann.

TABLING: REPORT OF CPA NAMIBIA BRANCH

HON HOFFMANN: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I lay upon the Table, the Report of the Criminal Procedure Act Namibia Branch Committee on the 39th Commonwealth Parliamentarian Association (Africa Region) Conference held in Livingston, Zambia from the 11th to the 19th of July 2008.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Table the Report. Notice of Questions? Honourable Viljoen.

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS

QUESTION 103:

HON VILJOEN: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I give Notice that on Thursday, 27 November 2008, I shall ask the Right Honourable Prime

18 November 2008

**NOTICE OF QUESTIONS
HON VILJOEN**

Minister the following questions:

Right Honourable Prime Minister, you are the Leader of the Government of the Republic of Namibia. We on this small part of the House are in the first place loyal citizens of Namibia and according to the Namibian Constitution, in the second place the legally elected Members of the Opposition Parties.

1. Are the political affiliations of the Ruling Party more important than loyalty to the Namibian Nation?
2. Why is it that when we needed the support and protection of the SWAPO Party Government against the undisciplined and ill-mannered tongue of the Chairperson of the ANC Youth League of Gauteng, your Party refused to protect us as citizens?
3. Is it because it sounds like music on your political ears or do you see us as second-hand citizens because we are not members of the Ruling Party?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice of Motions? Ministerial Statements? The Secretary will read the First Order the Day.

**REPORT BY NATIONAL PLANNING COMMISSION
ON PEOPLE OF THE SOUTH**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on Report published by the National Planning Commission with regard to the people of the South.

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON ULENGA**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When the House adjourned on Thursday, 13 November 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by Honourable Schimming-Chase. Honourable Ulenka adjourned the Debate and he now has the Floor. Honourable Ulenka.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, my intervention in this Debate is going to be brief.

When the Motion was Moved in the House or when the motivation was presented, I happened to be out of the country and, therefore, not had the benefit of listening to some of the debates and arguments put forward in the House either for or against the issues raised in the Report, which is now for discussion.

However, listening to the Minister of Youth and Sports and also having had the benefit of going through the motivation as presented by Honourable Schimming-Chase, I decided I will make some brief comments both on the Report and on the approach of Government on such issues generally.

In the first place, Honourable Deputy Speaker, let us talk about why at all bringing this kind of Motion to this House. In the first place, we think that it is important that Government work and the sadness of Government work is exposed not only before Parliament, but of course, before the entire Nation. If it was not for the sadness of the whole situation, Honourable Deputy Speaker, I would define the whole Report on which this Motion is based as hilarious indeed.

I understand in the introduction of the Report it is explained and emphasised that the Report seeks to deepen the understanding of poverty. However, what comes out of the Report is an indication of the old ethnic and tribal prejudices which are, of course, the staple diet of SWAPO Party. (Intervention)

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON ULENGA**

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: On a Point of Order. It is unfortunate that Honourable Ulenga was not here when an explanation was given as to the origin of those sentiments he is attributing to SWAPO. This was explained very clearly that the Report was reflecting what the people themselves thought was the problem. If they happened to be members of SWAPO, nobody could establish that, but for him to attribute it to SWAPO is most unfortunate and I would like to suggest to him that he should read the explanatory statement from the National Planning Commission. Thank you.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, of course, as everybody knows, I am not a stranger to this House, nor am I a stranger in my own country. I think I understand enough the sentiments both overtly spoken and even those which are sometimes only covertly expressed with regard to these issues. Therefore, it will not help the Right Honourable Angula very much to try to offer me an explanation at this point in time. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: On a Point of Information. The Honourable Member knows very well that he is not telling the truth. For him to say that the prejudices highlighted in the Report are so-called purpose fitting of SWAPO, he knows very well that the principle of SWAPO, as contained in the SWAPO Constitution and political programme, the principle on which SWAPO has successfully led the liberation struggle is against racial, tribal and other prejudices. If there are individual tribalist, sexist chauvinists within SWAPO, they are just individuals just as there are perhaps in CoD and perhaps when Honourable Ulenga crossed over to CoD was one of them. Those are individuals, those are not SWAPO principles and he must take it back. Please de-link individual sentiments from Party principles and objectives.

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON ULENGA**

HON ULENGA: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker, I am well aware of the sensitivity of this issue, I am therefore not surprised by the jerkiness of some of the Members, but I agree with the Honourable Kazenambo Kazenambo that tribalists may be individuals also.

Let me go back to the reason why we brought this Motion before the House. Honourable Deputy Speaker, as I said before, we want to expose what is in essence the very travesties of research, a mockery of both researching and Reporting on research of socio-economic conditions and their causes. This is what comes to the fore when you look at the Report.

However, again as I said before, there are gigantic shortcomings in the way Government conducts and carries out its essential tasks, because without research, Honourable Deputy Speaker, Government and the Nation and those who are supposed to serve it will not be able to understand the causes and the nature of social problems. However, ludicrous approaches will produce ludicrous results or hilarious results. I am sure much has been said during this debate and I do not need to repeat some of the arguments put forward, suffice to say that we need to study such a research as objectively as possible. Only then will we be able to reach reasonable conclusions.

Why touch on the name of the mighty SWAPO and in the process risk provoking the mighty SWAPO today in this House? Simply because, contrary to what the SWAPO Constitution states, contrary to what some of the SWAPO gurus stand up and claim here in the House, the practice my dear friend, is that SWAPO has allowed for too long for these kinds of things to exist and, therefore, I am not surprised that today they have found a way...(Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: May I ask a question? Honourable Ulenga, are you sober today?

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON ULENGA**

HON ULENGA: Thank you. I have gone through worse and I am prepared for worse, my dear friend. Going back to the point that I was making, Honourable Deputy Speaker...(Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: On a Point of Information, Honourable Ulenga. You cannot say that it is the SWAPO Party which has tolerated this type of racial prejudices for a long time. You know very well, Honourable Ulenga, that SWAPO has always and will continue to strive to unite this Nation. That is the primary function of the SWAPO Party, to unite the Namibian Nation which has been fragmented by the apartheid policies. Therefore, Honourable Ulenga, you should not use this Report to come up with these uncalled for remarks in this House. You know that those sentiments were expressed by the people of the South themselves. If you are courageous enough, why do you not go to the South and ask them why they made those remarks? SWAPO will continue to unite this Nation. Maybe it was CoD people who were there, who were making those remarks. After all, Comrades, you think we do not know that some were even lobbying for this Congress where you elected old wine in new bottles.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, as those of you who are more cultured on wine will agree with me, old wine is definitely better than new wine and it comes in wooden barrels and not in bottles. The Honourable Deputy Prime Minister knows what I am talking about.

However, Honourable Deputy Speaker, I am not surprised really to find that finally this kind of language has found its way into official Government documents. This has been the parlance, it has been the talk of the decades. You may say that the Report is the result of the interviews with ordinary people of Namibia and to some extent I will agree, however I say these are also the very same sentiments that the very SWAPO leaders who some of them sit today in this House, express. I shall not give

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON ULENGA**

examples, I do not want to embarrass some of the Members.
(Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS: On a Point of Information. I think the Honourable Member might have picked up a different speech from what he intended to deliver. SWAPO speaks through action. If the Honourable Member looks at this side of the House and to his right, he will see the Namibian Nation reflected in the SWAPO Party representation, unlike some of the Parties that side. The representation in some Parties that side is exclusively one language, exclusively one race and that is your language, it is not the language of the SWAPO Party. The language of the SWAPO Party is reflected in the seats here.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, like I was saying, the stuff that finally now has found its way into official Government documents is not new language, it is stuff that the members of the Ruling Party, both leaders and Honourable Members, keep repeating. It reminds you of the happenings and the history of Lubango. (Intervention)

HON KAURA: May I ask a question? Honourable Ulenga, do you know anyone of that side of the Floor who was wounded in action like you during the liberation struggle?

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, to quote one of the icons of the Namibian liberation struggle...(Intervention)

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON ULENGA**

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL

WELFARE: On a Point of Information. Comrade Deputy Speaker, I want to inform Honourable Ulenga he should not distort and say he is still the CoD President. Secondly, the question by my father is a good one. This one is a coward, (Interjections) That Honourable Member, he was injured while he was supposed to be a freedom fighter. Those who were maimed are still here, you will never find that they deserted SWAPO, where they cannot tell their children. What am I going to tell my children if I am not longer SWAPO? (Interjection). One would have expected that he is still SWAPO, but he is a traitor. I withdraw the word “*traitor*”.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, it is no longer funny. However, if the Honourable Peter Ilonga wants to hear something from me, I will tell him that one of the very difficult tasks that I have nowadays is to explain not only to my own children, but to quite a number of young Namibians how on earth one could stand up and support SWAPO, especially in the guise that it presents itself today. Instead of explanation.....(Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF EDUCATION: On a Point of Information. I know Honourable Benjamin Ulenga has a lot to say about SWAPO, because his own existence as a Party leader and his whole mission is to fight SWAPO. That is his treaty and the duty of his Party and he can choose to fight SWAPO at any forum and at any occasion, but not through a Report written by a Planning Commission of a Government. This is not a SWAPO document, it was not written by SWAPO, it is not endorsed by SWAPO and, therefore, the Honourable Member cannot claim that all of us share exactly the same sentiment about people and about other people’s religions and languages. Therefore, you will get your fight but not on the basis of this document.

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON ULENGA**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Ulenga, discuss the Report, because I see you are going very far out of context. Let us just help the Honourable Member who introduced the Report and stick to the Report. Now you are going out of context of the Report. (Intervention)

HON GURIRAB: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I only rise because I want to ask my good friend, the Deputy Minister Iilonga...

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: You cannot ask Honourable Iilonga when he does not have the Floor.

HON GURIRAB: If you as the Presiding Officer listened, you would hear what I was going to say. I was going to say, Deputy Speaker, that I thought as Presiding Officer you were going to ask Honourable Iilonga to withdraw his reference to Honourable Ulenga as a coward. Is that allowed in this Honourable House?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I heard "*traitor*". I did not get it.

HON GURIRAB: What is the ruling?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I did not get it. Proceed.

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON ULENGA**

HON ULENGA: Like I was saying, this stuff that we find in this Report reminds one of the history of Lubango where 50%, if not more, of all the Nama-speaking people were arrested by SWAPO because they believed and the prejudice.... Let me complete my sentence. You were not in Lubango. (Intervention)

HON KAIYAMO: On a Point of Information. It is a pity Honourable Ulenga was not here last time. The Report he is talking about was never tabled in this House, it was never part of this House and what we are discussing now is the Motion tabled by Honourable Schimming-Chase. Now you are bringing other things which is not part of this. Let us discuss the Motion, not the Report of the National Planning Commission.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Speaker, I agree with those who say that it is a painful Report, it is a Report that probably one would want to disown today, however it is on our table. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: On a Point of Information. I listened to Honourable Ulenga repeatedly accusing SWAPO of having tortured the Nama-speaking people who joined SWAPO in exile. Without going to the debate of that issue, I just want to say the following to Honourable Ulenga: There is no person that you can find anywhere in this world, separate from the collective membership or the individual persons that make up the membership of the SWAPO Party that carries the identity of SWAPO. SWAPO is not only individual outside of its collective membership.

Secondly, until 1999, Honourable Benjamin Christmus Ulenga was a card-carrying member of SWAPO. If this Honourable Member is saying that SWAPO in exile tortured the Nama-speaking people that joined the Party,

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON ULENGA**

given the fact that SWAPO is not a separate, independent person from the individual persons that make its membership, which included himself, he is by implication saying he himself, Honourable Benjamin Chrismus Ulenga, participated in the torturing of Nama-speaking Namibians that joined SWAPO. Does the Honourable Member understand that? If he understands that, does he think he has the moral high ground to accuse others of all kinds of things on the basis of that argument?

HON ULENGA: Thank you Deputy Speaker. Like I was saying, it is such a shameful Report, it is so easy to disown...(Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: On a Point of Information. Honourable Ulenga is mixing up things that we need to clarify. As it was clearly stipulated by previous speakers, the prejudices mentioned in the Report Honourable Ulenga is referring to are also mentioned in the Reports on the other thirteen Regions. There is no truth whatsoever to try to use this Report as an exposé in this House, because these Reports were compiled at the Regional level and Poverty Profile Workshops were conducted in all thirteen Regions by the National Planning Commission. The public participated, I attended three of them, one in Keetmanshoop, one in Otjozondjupa and one in Opuwo where these Reports were being discussed. Therefore, it is not something that is being exposed.

On the issue of the Lubango drama or whatever saga that he is talking about, it is tragic and sad that a national leader of the calibre of Honourable Ulenga would try to single out the Nama community or members of SWAPO who were of Nama origin who were in exile. If we are true to the reality of the situation of Lubango, those Matale were in the majority in comparison to the Ovambos. Let us face the truth. To try to single out a tribe – and I was there – the majority of those Matales and the PLAN combatants were Ovambos. I know a Kwanyama-speaking lady

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON ULENGA**

who was not a Nama, she has never been to the South. But to try to single out tribes and to say 50 percent were Namas, it was not based on tribe, the struggle was not based on tribes. Some of the people who formed the SWAPO security network were Namas, some of them were Hereros. To try to single out a tribe is a divide-and-rule tactic and it is not that you are sympathising with the Namas, but you are playing on their emotions for cheap political scoring.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Members, let me advise you. Let us discuss this Motion in principle and avoid bringing in issues outside this Motion. But now we are again trying to open up wounds. Where are you taking us to? I am requesting you to leave the Lubango issues, I am not going to allow you. Proceed, Honourable Ulenga. Today that is not going to be allowed.

HON ULENGA: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. Since 1652 the people of southern Africa have faced 400 years...(Intervention)

**HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT,
HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:** May I ask a question? In 1999 the Honourable Member participated in a presidential election and was defeated. In 2004 he was again defeated. Come next year, are you for the third time going to be a presidential candidate?

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, as I was saying, since 1652, for a period of about 400 years, the people of southern Africa have faced an extended period of constant colonial authority and there has been not any community that has at the grunt of this assault than

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON ULENGA**

the Khoi-Khoi people. The so-called Nama people of today or the people referred to as the Nama people today are only a small....(Intervention)

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Namas are not so-called, they are people like us, the same as Ovambos, the same as the people from Caprivi.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: On a Point of Information. I am sorry to interrupt the Honourable Member, but I feel obliged to caution because I see this discussion degenerating into a divisive debate and we need to seek guidance from the Honourable Deputy Speaker, because what is contained in the Report of the National Planning Commission we are talking are just footnotes from independent researchers. If we now attribute it to a certain Party, particularly SWAPO, it is unfair. I think it is unfair because this point is very sensitive and we are trying to make political gains. I know we are having elections next year and some people think they can gain some points by using such sensitive matters. We need guidance from the Chair and if this debate is going to continue, we should discuss the points brought here and not deviate from the discussion.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is true, when somebody is misusing the powers there are rules, but I do not want to rule Members out of order, I want to encourage them to be in line with the Motion put by the Member. However, if a Member does not want to abide by that, another direction will be taken.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, from the great Fish River of Namibia in the north to the Khai River in the Eastern Cape, the

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON HOFFMANN**

Khoi-Khoi people, of which the great Namaqua are only a tiny portion, have existed since times immemorial. There have been more than 15 tribes or communities, going from the great Namaqua, to the little Namaqua, to the Ainigua, to the Korana, to the Gurikwa, to the Hesequa, right from here on the southern boundaries of the Khomas Region up to the boundaries of today's Transkei in South Africa. The fact that right now there are only small portions and remnants of these great people says in itself enough of the blow that these people have taken from colonialism.

Some of the issues that the Honourable Schimming-Chase mentioned in her motivation, namely the centuries of payment, salaries, in wine and other types of drink instead of paying with money are facts of history. However, you must understand me very well, Colleagues from SWAPO, SWAPO has not been responsible for many of the evils that we experience today in Namibia. The critique that I take against SWAPO is that SWAPO was essentially formed to address and eradicate these evils and SWAPO has dismally failed in carrying out that. A liberation movement that supervises a Report that calls people lazy people because they happen to be Nama, after this has been repeated for centuries by the colonialists themselves is just a shame. I rest my case, Honourable Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Members, let me make it clear, Honourable Nora Schimming-Chase never said that a certain Party is calling the Namas lazy. She did not mention it. No individual from this House mentioned that the Namas are lazy people. It was a statement by the people down there. I recognise Honourable Hoffmann.

HON HOFFMANN: Deputy Speaker, I rise to make a contribution to the debate on the plight of the Nama people or generally the prevailing situation of social and economic destitution of the people living in Namibia's two southern Regions, Hardap and Karas.

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON HOFFMANN**

Let me also take the opportunity to thank the Right Honourable Prime Minister and his Deputy and also the other Members for their valuable contributions during this debate.

Deputy Speaker and Members of this august House, this is not the first time that this issue has surfaced in the National Assembly. If the Honourable Members remember correctly, this issue was discussed after the publication of the Regional Poverty Project of 2005, which was conducted under the auspices of the National Planning Commission. The objectives of the study and outcomes are known to this House and it is also a matter of public discourse by now. However, allow me to share the most touching of these results with you.

Karas Region had an estimated population of 61,300 people in 2004, Afrikaans was Reported as the most widely spoken of the languages at 40%, followed by Nama at 26% and Oshivambo at 23%.

Hardap Region had an estimated population of 68 249 people in 2004, Nama is Reported as the most widely spoken of the languages at 44,3%, followed by Afrikaans at 43,9% and Oshivambo at 7,4%.

Human Poverty Index is recorded at 25% of total Regional population. The finding of this study is that the major cause of poverty in the Region can be attributed to the drinking and laziness of the Nama people. This is said under the section of Social and Political root causes.

Deputy Speaker, I do not wish to repeat myself or prior speakers regarding the outcome of the Poverty Profile, however it is worth noting that despite the population distribution, only the Namas are being singled out for the sorry state of destitute which the Region faces. It has also struck my attention that this finding of the Poverty Profile is acceptable to some Members of the august House. My questions to the Honourable Members are the following:

What has happened to our pre-Independence march and cry of “*an injury to one is an injury to all?*” What has happened with that and I underline

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON HOFFMANN**

it. How has it become convenient to make the Nama people the laughing stock of Namibia or have we forgotten the pre-Independence national unity and unity of purpose? What are we in this House prepared to do as collective if it is true that the Namas are the so-called lazy drunks, to restore the dignity of these people and when will we rise to this task? And I thank our Prime Minister who said that we must help the people to get their human dignity back.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, it is my sentiment that the continued debate without an envisioned outcome and solution for those in this precarious situation will only add to the already prevalent hopelessness and at worst, resentment against the leadership which they now view as incapable to bring about the much-needed social and economic ... (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: We have agreed that the Honourable Member could proceed. No questions, proceed.

HON HOFFMANN: Honourable Members, it is equally my concern that such research exercises and Reports are often not being supported by seeking funds to implement the most prioritised intervention the people in the Regions are crying for. It is my experience that such results are channelled to the line ministries for their possible consideration and prioritisation, whereas planners in the different Ministries may not have the sensitivity of having participated in the Poverty Profiles. Instead, we as collective need the foresight to plan direct implementation, using the most streamlined institutions.

I want to remind this House that I do not disregard the tremendous efforts and successes of the Ministries in the eighteen years of Independence. I, however, realise that a desperate situation calls for desperate measures and we are in one such situation. I am noting the direct implementation route

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON HOFFMANN**

and respect for this august House, also to gauge the impact of Government supported interventions, such as the EU, National Planning Commission Rural Poverty Reduction Programme. Whose poverty does it reduce? Is it the poverty of the poor or that of the implementing agencies?

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Namas of the South: Let us use this debate to guide the implementation process regarding the outcomes of these Poverty Profiles and the needs of those whom we represent here. Let us rise beyond our tribal security zones and remember what we fought for originally as a united front of people and also remember that we got Independence and self-reliance through respect for each other.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, let me conclude by stating that alcohol abuse and social decay is not only a southern problem or a Nama problem, but a national problem. Let us also be cognisant that the shebeen culture that we have adopted as a Nation is really the social disease and disorder. It is not only the Nama people that are destitute and poor, so let us find collective solutions to these national problems. But still, only to speak of Regional delivery and development projects and economic empowerment, let the Black Economic Empowerment Projects also reach those who are living in the Regions albeit it through a quota system. Let us keep and protect this united front and do not slumber and drift away into our security zones for that can cause us to lose our hard-earned freedom – one Namibia, one Nation. I thank you.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:45

HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:15 PURSUANT TO ADJOURNMENT

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I call on Honourable Schimming-Chase to respond.

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON SCHIMMING-CHASE**

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. Honourable Deputy Speaker, I rise to make my reply to the debate that ensued from the Motion on the Report of the Karas Region. Before I go into the details of my reply, let me refer to the background of this matter in order to put it in its proper perspective.

Firstly, having had serious reservations regarding the sensitivity of the issue, I sought and obtained the support of the Standing Committee on Standing Rules and Orders to refer the matter to the appropriate Standing Committee for discussion. Some Members of this august House, notably the Honourable Minister of Justice, the Acting Attorney-General and the Deputy Minister of Justice raised objections, forcing me to table the Motion from the Floor.

Secondly, Honourable Deputy Speaker, I made it very clear in my motivation that my reason for concentrating on the Karas Region was because the matter had reached the public domain through comments in the newspapers. It had resulted in reactions by the affected groups, including the Traditional Leaders, and mostly importantly, it resulted in actions taken by the donor community. I even went as far as to state repeatedly that the problem of drinking and poverty was mentioned in some of the other Regions, but – and this is a big but – the Karas Report was the only one that solicited the public reaction that it did. So, for all those Honourable Members who want to make it look as if I am threatening peace or being tribalist, I have nothing but pity and reject their attempts with the contempt they deserve.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, I wish to thank most sincerely all those Members who took the Floor and spoke with dignity and honesty, keeping the seriousness and commitment expected of leaders who wish to solve problems. Thank you, ***Right Honourable Prime Minister***, for setting the right tone in your contribution. Your reference to some of the root causes of the problem should be taken with the seriousness it deserves. I totally agree with your sentiments that our main challenge now is how to restore the dignity of the dispossessed, to provide the means of production and to raise their skills. I also agree that alcohol abuse in the South and the rest

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON SCHIMMING-CHASE**

of the country should be addressed as a matter of urgency. The idea of a Karas marshal plan, as proposed by you, Right Honourable Prime Minister, is worth looking at as a blueprint for a poverty reduction plan for the whole country.

Honourable Venaani, thank you for your contribution, especially the fact that you raised the importance of how we as a country or people view and treat each other. I agree with the Honourable Member that we must have empathy for others and refrain from selfish attitudes. It is true that the example of what is happening in the Oil rich areas of Nigeria can easily happen here if we are not careful. As you warned, Honourable Member, it is clear that the South has started to react. Already a new Political Party has been formed and the Traditional Leaders have taken up the clarion call for their people. As you say, Honourable Venaani, the civil servants have started to react, especially with regard to the GIPF loans to business and private people and to raise the fears that if those people fail, it is the taxes of those who paid to GIPF that are used to bail them out. One cannot ignore perceptions, especially when they are so close to the truth. We must, as you suggest, invest in our own development.

I do not have to repeat most of what you said, because the Right Honourable Prime Minister said the very same, but I do support your proposal that the quota system be adopted not only for Education, but in all economic and development areas.

Thank you, *Honourable Deputy Prime Minister*, for your support and your elaboration of the negative effects alcohol abuse has in all Regions of the country. I cannot agree with you more, I totally support your proposal that we should not only discuss the issues here, but that we should use this opportunity to come up with solutions. I will move at the end that a Parliamentary Select Committee be established to deal with the issue.

Honourable Kaura, thank you for the support, especially for strengthening the call of the Right Honourable Prime Minister with regard to those who have been dispossessed of their land. Your mention of South Africa's policy of restriction of land rights is an example worthy of further

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON SCHIMMING-CHASE**

investigation.

Honourable Member, you raised a very important point when you talked about the expensive water and compared it to what happened with regard to the availability of water for the poor during the colonial period. I believe that a select committee of this Parliament will of necessity have to look at these issues.

I thank the Honourable *Chief Riruako* for his contribution.

Honourable Kazenambo, I thank you for having changed your mind and deciding to make a contribution to the Debate of this Motion. I totally agree with you regarding the sensitivity of the matter and refer you to my initial proposal that it be discussed in the relevant Standing Committee. My Motion intended exactly what you are referring to, namely an issue of Nation-building and the question as to what type of Nation we want to build. As you rightfully state, the concept of one Nation will not work if some are excluded from economic development. I agree that we should not live in denial, nor should we have taboos. It is only in open and honest debate that we will be able to look at the issues.

I am glad that the Honourable Deputy Minister mentioned the vast areas of great economic potential in the South, but having identified this potential which, by the way, has been there all the time, the question arises as to why poverty is still so rife in the Region. This is not the time to accord blame and that is why I agree with the Honourable Deputy Minister when he states that now that we have identified the potential, we have to put the right developmental policies in place so that we can ensure that jobs are created and the inhabitants be employed, not only by Government but also in the private sector.

Honourable Katali, since you agree with the tone set by the Right Honourable Prime Minister and his Deputy, I can only thank you for your contribution. However, I must disagree with your assessment of the importance or lack thereof in research. Let me remind Honourable Katali that Adolf Hitler used researchers to prove his theory of an Arian race,

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON SCHIMMING-CHASE**

thereby wanting to prove the rationale for exterminating the Jews.

Closer home, the apartheid regime used researchers to demonstrate the inferiority of all non-whites. In fact, a Professor Smal at the University of the Western Cape advised the theory that since the brain of blacks is smoother than that of whites, there is scientific proof that they are of inferior intellect. So much for research.

It seems that the Honourable Member wants to trivialise the Motion as he says that maybe these statements are not stigma, but perhaps the truth. Raising the question regarding what was said about other Regions, I may remind the Honourable Deputy Minister that I made it clear in my motivation that the same was said for other Regions.

Honourable Ilonga, thank you for your contribution. Although you admit not to have read the document, you do raise issues that are very basic to the debate. The Honourable Deputy Minister makes a plea for a review of the basic issue of land and many will agree that this is cardinal to the matter of poverty reduction. Whilst I agree that Government should own some of the land, I would like to propose that not only should Government take 20% of the income as proposed and put it in development, but rather that a certain percentage of the income be given to the owners or residents of the land in order to reduce their poverty.

Honourable Deputy Minister Ndjoze-Ojo, thank you for your valuable contribution. Since you state that you have been to the South, it is good to see that you agree that the situation is not exaggerated and that poverty and landlessness is indeed the problem.

Honourable Minister Abraham Iyambo – and I regret that he is not here – it is a pity that the Honourable Minister did not read my Motion. Had he done so, I am sure he would not have attempted to derail the debate. No, Honourable Minister, it is not a question of the verbatim, I made it clear once again that the matter is much more serious than that. In fact, as Honourable Hoffmann stated, in the summary of the researchers this was used as the root cause of the poverty in the Region, so it is not just a

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON SCHIMMING-CHASE**

question of the verbatim. The Minister, to my mind, did not really intend to debate the Motion or he would have read it. I think the Honourable Minister chose to highlight the visit statements, but more than that, to attack Honourable Kaura in his absence. Surely the honourable head of the SWAPO think-tank would be courageous enough to take issue with Honourable Kaura himself and provide statistical evidence to prove that those statements are wrong. In any case, I prefer not to refer to extraneous matters in my reply.

I stated that other Regions were also mentioned, but I emphasised that only the Karas Region became part of the public debate and was used by donors to rationalise their unwillingness to support projects in the Region.

Honourable Deputy Minister Nujoma, I only realise now why the Honourable Deputy Minister was so adamant that the Motion be discussed in the House. Unfortunately, he obviously also did not read my Motion, but wanted to use this opportunity to tell the House and the Nation what his views were. Allow me, therefore, to quote verbatim from his contribution:

“It is simply because they work harder, the people of the North.” I quote: “People in the North they work harder.” “People in the North they save their money, that is why you see the difference.” “The South became complacent and reckless.” (Interjections). These were the statements that were made and they are in the HANSARD. I will not lower myself, Honourable Deputy Speaker, to the level of answering to these statements, they speak for themselves. The Honourable Deputy Minister should only repeat these statements during the election campaign next year.

Thank you, ***Honourable Tjihuiko***, for your contribution. I agree with you that as leaders we need to look at what the people said. After all, perception is often 80 percent of the truth.

Honourable Kaiyamo, thank you for your contribution. It is true that the Report was not tabled in the House, but where we have a misunderstanding is that a document which is a public document and was made available to

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON SCHIMMING-CHASE**

the public should not be discussed in this House. I regret that I cannot support that notion. There is nothing that is taboo for this House of elected people. However, I cannot agree with you more with regard to your views on the choices of researchers.

Honourable Minister !Naruseb, thank you for your valuable contribution, but more for bringing the dignity of the debate back on track. It is true that it is incumbent on us as leaders not to ignore what the people say but to absorb it with a degree of tolerance. Yes, it is very necessary to have a Committee, as you suggest, to take a closer look at these Reports so as to contextualise them and act on them.

Honourable Minister Nghidinwa, thank you for your contribution. The balance between hospitality and the industrial sector is indeed worthy of further investigation for the purposes of poverty alleviation in the Region under discussion.

Honourable Minister Nandi-Ndaitwah, unfortunately I cannot say anything regarding your contribution since you are making reference to a letter from the National Planning Commission which was smuggled into the House for a certain group of people. However, let me sound a word of warning: We must be very careful with letters like these, because not only do they violate the rules of the House, but can easily lead to the impression that the Executive is remote-controlled.

Honourable Angula, thank you for your elaborate explanation of how the Reports came about. Indeed if, as you say, the National Planning Commission will decide how to translate these Poverty Reports, then it is surely a pity that they have reached the public domain without the said translation. Since the Reports and research were done during your time, I am surprised that not only are you of the opinion that the Reports were not meant for this House, although it was distributed at the Ongwediva Trade Fair, hence making it a public document, but that the Honourable Minister goes so far as to suggest that the Motion be thrown out. One has to ask what the Honourable Minister wants to hide. Surely the Minister should be proud of the work that was done under his stewardship and to expose it

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON SCHIMMING-CHASE**

to public scrutiny. If we must not suffocate freedom, as the Honourable Minister suggests, why does the Honourable Minister try to suffocate the freedom of debate in this House?

Honourable Minister Konjore, thank you very much for your contribution. There is not much I can add except to agree totally with you when you asked the cardinal question: What makes the people say the things they did during the interviews? The Honourable Minister also supports Honourable !Naruseb in his plea that as leaders we must listen to what the people say. The time has come, indeed, to look at the resettlement programme, as you proposed, to look at education post-grade 12, the psychological effects that the war has had on the people of the South and how their self-esteem has been destroyed. I would have expected the researchers to look at this and provide some academic or practical solutions if rehabilitation is indeed what we want. We all agree that the abuse of alcohol is a national problem and, therefore, necessitates a national solution.

Honourable Ulenga, I thank you for your contribution and your attempts to expose the travesty of research, because so many of the people who took the Floor wanted to make the excuse that the research is something strange and foreign, forgetting that the National Planning Commission is an Agency which resorts in State House. I agree with you that some of the language has found its way into ordinary parlance and especially in official documents, especially also the importance of the history of the Khoi-Khoi since time immemorial.

Honourable Hoffmann, I agree totally with your statement, especially the fact that at least you went as far as to read the Report, to see that the conclusions with regard to the Karas Region were mentioned under the socio-political root causes by the researchers and not just the verbatim. It is also important that you noted the population distribution in the Region and the fact that the Nama-speaking people who make 40% are the only ones. It is good that we are reminded from time to time what the slogans were during the struggle, “*an injury to one being an injury to all*” being one of the most notable.

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON MUTORWA / HON SCHIMMING-CHASE**

One needs to look at whether seed funds do support such research and if it does, whether it should continue. We must ask the question, as you rightfully do, which poverty is reduced? Is it the poor or the implementing agencies? Thank you once again for reminding us what we fought for and what we seem to forget. There is a collective solution to these problems.

Finally, Madam Deputy Speaker, I am encouraged by the fact that despite inter and intra-party emotions, some of which were introduced here, the Debate on the whole was serious and as leaders we have shown that we understand the problem and we know the solution.

In view of this, Honourable Deputy Speaker, I Move that we appoint a Parliamentary Select Committee to study all the Reports and come up with solutions to the dire state of poverty in our country. I so Move and I thank you.

HON MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY:

Thank you Comrade Deputy Speaker. I just want to clearly understand the Amendment. Did I hear correctly that the House needs to appoint a Committee which would then further investigate this? If that is the case, I thought we have standing Committees of Parliament. Is the idea to appoint a Committee that is not in existence or is the idea to refer the matter to an existing Standing Committee of Parliament?

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: The Honourable Minister may recall that initially when I motivated, I said I would wish it to be referred to the relevant Standing Committee. However, in the discussion I was moved to accept contributions of a serious nature, including that by the Honourable Deputy Prime Minister who said we should solve the problem here in the House and the Honourable Minister who talked about a marshal plan for the South. That is why I have changed the Motion to read that we have a

18 November 2008

MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON DR KAWANA

Parliamentary Select Committee to deal specifically with that task, as was suggested by most of the contributors.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Not most, I think I heard only one, you mentioned only the Deputy Prime Minister. Colleagues, we have existing structures, the Committees, and to create yet another Committee... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I am at a loss. I thought the former Director-General explained to this House that this is only the first phase of the research. After this phase the National Planning Commission will process this information, publish an official Government Report, which Report will eventually find its way to this House. Now I am at a loss, because the Report that is to be referred to the committee was never officially tabled in this House and it has been explained that, indeed, this is raw material as far as the National Planning Commission is concerned, the official Report is coming and this is part of the exercise as per the General Assembly's research on MDGs. This was explained. I thought the Mover of the Motion would just ask this House to take note and then we wait for the official Report from Government, which Report will be tabled officially here and if there is a Member of this august House who feels that Report should be referred to the Committee to be debated, that would really be the appropriate opportunity in my view. Thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Schimming-Chase, I understand the sentiments of Honourable Dr Kawana, but I thought he was going to help us on the question of the two Committees. The question by Honourable Mutorwa was on the two Committees. It is true what Honourable Kawana is saying, but I wanted a solution on the issue of the

18 November 2008 **MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE**
HON NUJOMA / HON KAIYAMO / HON EKANDJO

two Committees.

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I may inform Honourable Dr Kawana that the last Report of 2005 is still supposed to come to this House for discussion. I do not know how many of us will be alive if in three years it comes back.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Now we are opening up a new Debate. Honourable Nujoma.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: I support the proposal of Honourable Kaiyamo. We must wait for the Report until it is finalised, because this Report was not official, it is just from outside there. We want an official version from Government which can be discussed here. Therefore, I reject this Motion with the contempt it deserves.

HON KAIYAMO: As a Chairperson of a Committee I also have the same problem and I support Comrade Kawana because of the legality of a document which was never tabled here.

HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: I am of the same opinion because I do not know that Report, I have not seen it and I cannot debate something I have not even read. Let us wait for the official Report to be tabled in this House. I Move that we take note of the Motion and wait for the official tabling of the Report.

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
RT HON N ANGULA / HON REV KONJORE**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now Put the Question, that the Motion be adopted. Any objection? (Interjections).

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: I am asking for division under Rule 70. Divide the House, do not change the Motion.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Motion is dealing with a very serious matter, the question of poverty and deprivation. It would be unfortunate if Honourable Nora Schimming-Chase is asking us to divide the House. I think it is just reasonable to note the Motion and we wait for the official Report to come and then we conclude the Debate on the official document. This is my plea to the Honourable Member, let us be united against poverty in this matter.

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: I do not want us to wait for three years. Let us just divide the House, there is no problem. The Motion is on the Floor, divide the House. I am not withdrawing it. Thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is nothing I can do, I have to follow the procedure. I now Put the Question that the Motion be adopted. Any objection?

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: Comrade Deputy Speaker, I am really a bit worried and would like to support the idea of the Right Honourable Prime Minister, because *albeit* we have our Rules, we have our procedures, we also have the freedom to exercise our rights as Parliamentarians and as

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON SCHIMMING-CHASE**

Members of this House. It is not all the time that all exercises really contribute to the best outcome and also send out the right message out there. Therefore, whenever there is a possibility for us to reach consensus, why can we not seek that? I do respect the sentiments of the Mover when she says that the Report may take years to come, but still I would have thought, since we all agree that the question of poverty is a national problem, we all agree it is not our intention and call to debate this very serious issue necessarily along tribal or Regional lines, that we could seek a consensus and agree accordingly without dividing the House. This is my humble submission and I am joining the Right Honourable Prime Minister in that appeal.

We as politicians may know and understand what we are doing, but we do not all the time really send out the correct and beneficial message out there through our utterances and remarks and whatever we do. I rest my case, thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Honourable Minister, but you have been the Deputy Speaker and you know the rules very well. If the Mover of the Motion herself is demanding a division, what would you say? Could you assist me? She is insisting, what can we do?

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: Honourable Konjore, I believe there is wisdom in what you say, but I would like us to meet halfway. That is what I understand by consensus. My fear is that it will die like the previous ones. Therefore, if we can reach consensus on referring this to the relevant Standing Committee of Parliament, I will agree, failing which, let us divide the House. I will not compromise further than that.

18 November 2008

**MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE
HON EKANDJO / HON SCHIMMING-CHASE**

**HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT,
HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:** Comrade Deputy Speaker, I am appealing to my sister Suli. Suli, in the name of unity and in the fight against poverty, let us take note and wait for the official document, because I did not read anything and I want to participate. Suli, my sister, it is our secret name, I am appealing to Suli to heed the appeal by the Right Honourable Prime Minister and Reverend Konjore. Thank you.

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I have put my maximum position, I have taken the advice of Senior Members and I have moved from my position to what I regard as a compromise. If my Suli insists that I accept his position and not the compromise, we can settle that otherwise outside, but here it stands.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I Put the Question that the Motion be adopted. Any objections? Honourable Nora, you are a Senior Member of this House, you cannot play cat-and-mouse games.

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: No, just a minute! The Right Honourable Prime Minister and Honourable Konjore appealed to me to change my position, which I did. Now you are putting the previous position, it is not cat-and-mouse.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: You said you are at your maximum?

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: My maximum demand and I said I

18 November 2008 **MOTION: REGIONAL POVERTY PROFILE**
HON SCHIMMING-CHASE / HON NANDI-NDAITWAH

Move from my maximum demand to a compromise position.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: You did not finish your question. Repeat that compromise and give us direction.

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: I shall do so. Honourable Deputy Speaker, I will therefore Move that this issue be referred to the relevant Standing Committee. That the Motion on Poverty Reduction be referred to the relevant Standing Committee on Human Resources. That is what I was asking, that is what I am doing.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Prime Minister was requesting note-taking, it was not for the referral to a Committee.

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: That is why it is called a compromise, Honourable Deputy Speaker. (Interjections).

HON MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM: Comrade Deputy Speaker, I think we need to read the original Motion, because the original Motion also seems to refer to the Report and the issue here is that we do not want a discussion on poverty reduction, but we cannot discuss a Report which is not formally presented here. That is why we take note of the discussion and then the Report can be submitted and then discussed and if the Honourable Member is insisting, the only way for us to proceed is to call for a division and everybody understands. Nobody is rejecting a discussion of poverty, but this Honourable House cannot discuss

18 November 2008

**REPORT ON PEOPLE OF THE SOUTH
HON NANDI-NDAITWAH**

a document that has never been presented formally. We can be divided and then we can proceed.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I Put the Question for the last time, that the Motion be adopted. Any objection? There is objection. The House is divided. Will those Members in favour of the Motion please rise? Will those Members against please rise? Will those Members abstaining please rise?

In favour	-	10
Against	-	32
Abstentions	-	0

The Motion is rejected. The Secretary will read the Second Order of the Day.

**RATIFICATION: MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT:
RESUMPTION OF DEBATE**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on the Ratification of the Millennium Challenge Compact between the Republic of Namibia and the United States of America, acting through the Millennium Challenge Corporation.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When this Debate was adjourned on Thursday, 13 November 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Minister of Works and Transport. Any further discussion?

18 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
RT HON N ANGULA**

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: I regret to inform you that the Minister of Works and Transport, Honourable Helmut Kangulohi Angula, is on an official mission to Europe and he asked me to read his statement in reply.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, I thank all those who participated in the Debate, whether from the confines of the House or from outside. The Debate helped to create further awareness among our population about this Agreement. It helped to strengthen further our democracy especially the checks and balances provided for by our Constitution.

In response to the 23rd October 2008 statement on the Compact by *Honourable Venaani*, the balanced and thoughtful argumentation of which I applaud, I wish to submit to this Honourable House as follows:

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Namibia became eligible for MCC (Millennium Challenge Account) funding in November 2005 and the negotiations took almost three years to conclude. As the Members will appreciate valuable resources - both human and financial - were expended by Government and its private sector and civil society partners to arrive at this milestone.

The Debate was in public in the past few weeks; some of the issues raised were indeed rational, but much of it were of emotional nature. Notwithstanding, we welcome the Debate on this unique development package and view the questions posed by Honourable Venaani and others as an opportunity to explain to the public through this Honourable House what the MCA Namibia Compact *contains*, equally, what it *does not contain*.

We thank Honourable Venaani for his words of overall support for the MCA Namibia Compact. After all the commotion of the past weeks, Honourable Deputy Speaker and Members of this House, I have to confirm that the Government and the people of Namibia welcome the MCA Compact of US\$304,5 million grant and look forward to its successful implementation and to the anticipated impacts the projects will

18 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
RT HON N ANGULA**

have on rural economic growth and poverty reduction.

The MCA Namibia Compact is a complex, multi-layered agreement that naturally would attract interest from many stakeholders in society, and from many angles. Honourable Members of this august House, Honourable Venaani and many outside this House raised the following issues:

1. The MCA Namibia Compact in relation to Namibian Law, that is (Section 7.1(c) of the Compact).
2. Liability in the event of the termination of the MCA Namibia Compact, (Section 6.8 of the Compact).
3. Procurement Rules for the MCA Namibia Programme, that is (Annex VI of the Compact).
4. Taxation under the MCA Namibia Compact, (Taxation Agreement).
5. Etosha National Park Development Investment Programmes.
6. Programme Implementation Agreement (PIA).
7. Legal Counsel.

I will respond to these questions and concerns and I will do so in the order they were presented.

1) The MCA Namibia Compact in relation to Namibian law (Section 7.1(c) of the Compact):

Honourable Deputy Speaker, allow me to start with the concern raised on the application of Namibian law. The relevant Clause in the Compact is Section 7.1(c). We agree with those members of the public who have expressed a similar concern that this Section does not read well. From a legal perspective the wording is not incorrect *per se*, but for those of us

18 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
RT HON N ANGULA**

without legal background, Section 7.1(c) is confusing and open to interpretation at the least. The GNT discussed with our American Partners to change this Section and bring the text in line with the Vienna Convention and International Treaties to which Namibia has been a party since Independence, so it has the following or similar meaning: *“Namibia may not invoke the provisions of its internal law, (other than the Constitution), as justification for its failure to perform the Compact.”*

Since this text is already used in the Compact in Section 3.4, the MCC agreed to remove Section 7.1(c) from the Compact by means of an exchange of letters.

2) **Liability in the event termination of the MCA Namibia Compact, (Section 6.8 of the Compact).** The next issue brought before this House by Honourable Venaani concerns the possible suspension/termination of the MCA Namibia Compact and MCC’s non-liability in such an event. It is true that the US Government/MCC may suspend/terminate the Compact without cause. It is also true that the language in Section 6 of the Compact is not uncommon to bilateral development funding agreements. We find the language in most of our bilateral cooperation agreements. More importantly we are confident that the safeguards provided for in and outside of the Compact offers sufficient mitigation in the eventuality of suspension or termination. These safeguards are:

- 1) Authorised work performed under the Compact up to date of suspension/termination will be paid.
- 2) While the Government takes liability for the contracts with suppliers entered into by MCA Namibia, the Compact provides for 120 days (4 Months) for wrap-up of the activities and related financial commitments allowing for reasonable expenditures for both project related work and programme administration, as per Section 5.1(c) of the Compact.

- 3) In addition, at the contract level, MCA Namibia will build certain safeguards into the contracts with suppliers, e.g. the right to terminate a supply contract if Compact funding is suspended or terminated. This is a standard Clause in many of Government's agreements with suppliers.
 - 4) Finally, the MCA Namibia Compact reflects our own development priorities in education, tourism and agriculture as per the National Development Programme 3 (NDP3). To give a concrete example, the 47 schools selected for renovation and upgrading were identified using the ETSIP pyramid. In fact, all educational activities in MCA Namibia Compact are derived from ETSIP.
- 3) Procurement Rules for MCA Namibia Programme (Annex VI of the Compact)**

Honourable Venaani's next question takes us to the issue of procurement under the MCA Namibia Compact. The Compact needs to be elevated to an International Treaty, due to specific procurement requirements of MCC for all its MCA Programmes, which are similar to the procurement requirements of the World Bank.

Procurements for MCA Namibia will be governed by the Procurement Rules as per Annex VI the Compact. Upon notification, the Procurement Rules will as a Treaty obligation take precedence over the Tender Board of Namibia Act.

Motivated by the same arguments as put forward by Honourable Venaani - after all the motto of MCC is "*Poverty Reduction through Economic Growth*" and our local companies should benefit from the billions of Namibian Dollars made available through the Compact - the Government Negotiating Team (GNT) did make the case during the Washington negotiation for the application of local preferences. The team was then informed that the US Congress had initially also requested similar preferences for the *US companies* since US taxpayers' money would be used for the Compacts worldwide. The US Government resisted such preferential treatment of US companies and in exchange agreed that there

18 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
RT HON N ANGULA**

would be no preferences at all, not for US companies and not for recipient-country companies. Instead, international competitive bidding would apply to all procurements funded by MCC.

Despite this, the GNT succeeded in succeeded in negotiating a number of important safeguards to ensure maximum Namibian business participation in the Compact implementation. These are:

- 1) A threshold of US\$200,000 (or N\$2 million at the current exchange rates) for “shopping”, which is a procurement method whereby only three quotations are required.
- 2) A threshold for local advertising are set at:
 - a. US\$200,000 (or N\$2 million) for goods and non-consulting services; and
 - b. US\$1 million (or N\$10 million) for works.
- 3) Furthermore, MCA Namibia will “Namibianise” tender requirements within certain limitations, as follows:
 - a. Creating smaller packages, sized to be manageable for Namibian companies;
 - b. Ensuring local materials are utilised to reduce maintenance cost;
 - c. Demand adherence to Namibian standards and
 - d. Requiring a certain level of local knowledge and prior experience.
- 4) Another safeguard is the direct involvement of MCA Namibia and the beneficiary Line-Ministries in the drafting of Terms of Reference and tender specifications for all contracts.

- 5) Also, the Tender Evaluation Panel will include:
- a) Beneficiary Line-Ministries;
 - b) Namibian technical experts; and
 - c) MCA Namibia.
- 6) And finally, MCA Namibia plans an extensive outreach campaign, informing Namibian private sector through the Namibian Chamber of Commerce and Industry (NCCI) on the procurement rules and plans and encouraging a proactive approach by the Namibian companies to take advantage of the contracts emanating from the MCA Namibia Compact.
- 4) **Taxation under the MCA Namibia Compact.**

Honourable Deputy Speaker, so far I have dealt with three of the Honourable Venaani's concerns and I now move on to the issue of taxation under the MCA Namibia Compact. Despite the many worries expressed by the public and political groups and also highlighted by Honourable Venaani, the answer is straightforward: The initial Tax Agreement provides for full compliance with Namibia's tax law.

The Ministry of Finance will treat the MCA Namibia Compact as a Technical Agreement which allows under the VAT Act exemption from VAT and under the Customs and Excise Act of 1998 (rebate item 412.11) and the New SACU Agreement of 2002 (Section 20.3(b)), exemption from customs and excise for all transactions by MCA Namibia. All other indirect taxes are payable and all individuals and companies, local and foreign, deriving income from the Compact are liable for Income Tax (direct taxes).

It has further been agreed with MCC that the Government of Namibia will refund the taxes collected on the MCC funding to the MCA

18 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
RT HON N ANGULA**

Namibia Programme according to (1) an agreed formula, (2) an agreed estimated tax amount and (3) a pre-determined payment schedule.

The Government has presented the agreed and initialled Tax Agreement to this Honourable House before today's Debate on the Ratification of the MCA Namibia Compact.

5) Etosha National Park

Next is the issue of the lodges in Etosha or should I say, the absence of lodges inside Etosha? In the MCA Namibia Tourism Project, we wish to further the implementation of 2007 Concession Policy. In this policy, improving access to national parks and other State Land for conservancies aimed at their economic empowerment takes centre stage.

The Government has a desire to implement the MCA Namibia projects. If the MCC funding is withdrawn, the Government of Namibia would want to complete the affected projects with own resources, possibly phased over a longer period and with some reductions or Amendments given resource constraints.

At present the conservancies around Etosha National Park - #Khoadi //Hoas with 3,200 residents, Ehirovipuka with 2,500 residents, Sheeya Uushona with 35,360 residents and King Nehale with 20,000 residents - derive no material benefits from Etosha. They pay for Human-Wildlife Conflict, yet do not benefit from being located next to the park.

The conservancies around Etosha and around other National Parks in the Northern Communal Areas will benefit from the Tourism Projects in the following ways:

1. Exclusive access concession into Etosha. These concessions are exclusive user rights for a fixed period of time and for an agreed set of tourism activities, excluding tourism accommodation.

18 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
RT HON N ANGULA**

2. Access concessions or lodge concession into other National Parks.
3. Support from the Ministry of Environment and Tourism in the form of:
 - (a) Tourism track development in the conservancies, using the road maintenance equipment acquired by the Ministry of Environment and Tourism with MCC funding; and
 - (b) The relocation of game species from Etosha to the adjacent conservancies, using game capture equipment acquired by the Ministry of Environment and Tourism with MCC funding.
4. A large technical support programme targeting 31 conservancies with approximately 100,000 residents, rolling out the best practices for Community-Based Tourism, acquired by Namibia in the past 10 to 15 years.
5. Access to a joint venture support facility for approximately 15 of these 31 conservancies to strengthen their negotiating position for these conservancies when negotiating Joint Venture Partnerships for tourism with the private sector.

The Etosha National Park will serve as a model for increased participation in tourist activities by conservancies adjacent to the National Parks. We believe that the planned interventions under the MCA Namibia Tourism Project will go a long way in drawing conservancies into the mainstream of tourism in Namibia.

6. Programme Implementation Agreement

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, the agreed and initialled Programme Implementation Agreement (PIA), which is an Executive Agreement that defines the operational framework for MCA

18 November 2008

**MILLENNIUM CHALLENGE COMPACT
RT HON N ANGULA**

Namibia and the Conditions Precedents and related Performance Targets was made available to you, together with the Tax Agreement before we resumed Debate on the Ratification of the MCA Namibia Compact.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, allow me to note that both the Tax Agreement and the Programme Implementation Agreement are Executive Agreements and as such – similar to the regulations of an Act - do not require approval by Parliament. In case of a dispute between these Supplementary Agreements and the Compact, the Compact takes precedence.

7. Legal Counsel

Lastly, I wish to assure this Honourable House that the Government Negotiating Team followed established protocol in the negotiations and relied on the Office of the Attorney-General for Legal Counsel. No foreign counsel was used by the Government Negotiating Team.

Equally, MCA Namibia made use of the services of the lawyers of the Attorney-General's Office throughout the process.

Honourable Members, in conclusion, I trust that my explanation meets the approval of Honourable Venaani, confirming that his questions and concerns have been adequately responded to.

In conclusion, I submit to this Honourable House that the Compact funding will complement Government and other development partners' efforts in alleviating poverty in our country. It is therefore, important for the Honourable Members to take note that our individual decision and our collective vote will affect the poor communities in conservancies, communal farmers north of the Veterinary Cordon Fence and most importantly our children.

I therefore call upon you, Honourable Members, to agree to the Ratification of the Millennium Challenge Compact in the form as tabled with the Amendment on Page 14 of the Compact for the benefit of a large cross-section of our communities.

18 November 2008

**SECTIONAL TITLE BILL
HON EKANDJO**

Honourable Speaker, I so submit. I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now Put the Question that the Agreement be ratified. Any objection? Agreed to. The Secretary will read the Third Order of the Day.

COMMITTEE STAGE: SECTIONAL TITLE BILL

SECRETARY: Committee Stage – *Sectional Title Bill*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Does the Honourable Minister of Lands and Resettlement Move that the Assembly now goes into Committee Stage?

**HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT,
HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:** I Move that this item be postponed until Thursday when the Honourable Minister will be here.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Bill stands adjourned until Thursday this week. The Secretary will read the Fourth Order of the Day.

**MOTION ON UNEMPLOYED NAMIBIANS WITH
PROFESSIONAL TRAINING AND QUALIFICATIONS**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on unemployed Namibians with professional training and qualifications obtained from recognised

18 November 2008

**MOTION ON UNEMPLOYED NAMIBIANS
HON KAIYAMO**

educational institutions as well as the plight of other unemployed Namibians.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When the House adjourned on Tuesday, 21 October 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by Honourable Dr Ankama. Honourable Dr Ankama adjourned the Debate for his reply and he now has the Floor.

HON KAIYAMO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Ankama is on an official mission and he asked me to read his response.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, it is the first time I stand up to respond to contributions made in this House by fellow Members on the Motion I tabled on unemployed Namibians with professional qualifications. I am not going to go name by name as in total 30 Members made their contributions.

A grave concern was raised by many with regard to the manner in which vacancies are advertised and filled in both private and public service. Some Members went further to give examples of the people they know who are highly qualified or trained but who are still roaming the streets of our country without employment.

Comrade Deputy Speaker, Members who contributed also spoke about how disturbed they are by the fact that the private sector has not fully opened up to recruit Namibians with qualifications obtained from foreign institutions other than South Africa.

Others mentioned the growing concern over many able-bodied Namibians who are joining the streets every year without practical skills. It is in this relation that I would like to concentrate before I thank you all for your support to this Motion, to draw your attention to the following:

18 November 2008

**MOTION ON UNEMPLOYED NAMIBIANS
HON KAIYAMO**

1. During our contributions we take over issues that are negatively contributing to the state of unemployment of our people.
2. We also talked about how disappointed we are by the haphazard manner in which skills training is provided by our local institutions.

Having said that, we have not made any attempt to bring the above to solutions. We also did not propose how further the State of unemployment I have raised in this Motion should be solved. We are a House of Parliamentarians and we should direct Motions to conclusion.

Next year we are expecting more unemployed people in the country, many of them with degrees. Last week I met this brilliant and highly educated young woman by the name of Constanca Banda, an experienced academician, a Namibian who is doing research on unemployment in Namibia as part of her studies. Her interest was more in respect of this topic and she wanted to offer her findings to Members of Parliament.

I equally met a number of people who have vast experiences that are attempting to get advertised jobs. Most of them are highly trained, but jobs were given to lower qualified people. Such people could have been given a chance to present their thesis as reference.

Out of these we could have made a practical and probably a strong directive in addressing unemployment in Parliament. It is still my conviction that the need to establish a national research centre and decentralise unit in the Regions will help direct data-based planning in all sectors of our socio-economic development.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, I want to thank all the Members who contributed to this Motion and those who supported in silence. Debate is a culture which should be nurtured and I hope we are all just doing that. I therefore thank you all.

18 November 2008

**MOTION ON UNEMPLOYED NAMIBIANS
HON KAURA**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. It is only for note-taking, it is not referred to anyone. I now Put the Question that the Motion be adopted for note-taking. Any objection? The Motion is adopted.

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: Comrade Deputy Speaker, I am a bit worried about the recording, particularly on the Ruling that the Honourable Deputy Speaker was making, because the Motion was not put for adoption, it was put for note taking. That should be the Ruling, that the Motion has been noted, not adopted.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I Put the Question that the Motion be adopted, any objection? (Interjections). That the Motion be noted. Any objection?

HON KAURA: Is there anywhere in the Rule book that a Motion can be noted? It is accepted or rejected. Abide by the Rules, we cannot invent something which does not exist in the Rule book.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: It depends on the demand of the Mover of the Motion. If it is referred to the Committee, it goes to the Committee. If the demand is for note-taking, we have to follow whatever information the Honourable Member has given.

HON KAURA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, we cannot be guided by the ignorance of the Honourable Member, not knowing that in the Rule book there is no such thing as noting. That is ignorance and we cannot be

18 November 2008 **MINERALS PROSPECTING & MINING BILL**
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

guided by ignorance, let us go by the Rule book. (Interjections).

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, in terms of common law, when you are used to doing something, even if it is not written, it becomes part of the Rules and since I joined this House in 2000 there were Motions which were merely noted and we have been following this practice. The President of the DTA has been a Member of this House since 1990 and I do not know why after 18 years he now raises this issue. This is part of common law, although there is nothing in writing, we have adopted this as the practice and it has become a convention which is acceptable.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Motion reads that it is for note-taking and I cannot change it. The Secretary will read the Fifth Order of the Day.

RESUMPTION OF SECOND READING:
MINERALS PROSPECTING AND MINING AMENDMENT BILL

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on Second Reading – Minerals Prospecting and Mining Amendment Bill.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When this Debate was adjourned on Wednesday, 5 November 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Minister of Mines and Energy, that the Bill be now read a Second Time. The Honourable Minister of Finance adjourned the Debate and she now has the Floor.

18 November 2008 **MINERALS PROSPECTING & MINING BILL**
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. I will make an attempt to make my contribution during the remaining time, because I do not want to delay the adoption of this Bill beyond today.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, I am grateful to the Minister of Mines and Energy and to the House, indeed, for their flexibility in allowing me to also make my contribution to this Debate.

The amendments sought to the Minerals Act through this Bill are of critical importance. I, therefore, share the views of the preceding Honourable Speakers who called for the support of the Amendment Bill. I wish to share my views on a few issues concerning charges on our mineral resources.

The Honourable Minister underlined in his motivating statement that royalty payment by minerals licence holders who are extracting our non-renewable resources are intended to ensure that all Namibians benefit from their mineral resources. This is a profound statement about the management of our resources. I cannot agree more with this. Minerals are a commonly owned resource for all Namibians. However for practical reasons the State cannot award a mineral licence to each Namibian, so that they can each exploit their share, nor can the State itself directly undertake the exploitation of all our resources on behalf of our communities.

To ensure that there are equitable benefits to all citizens from these commonly owned resources, the State imposes, in this specific case royalties on the exploitation of the resources by those with licences as a charge for their taking individual and permanent ownership of the resource that was until then commonly owned by all citizens. Because of this, and that is the fact that royalty is a charge for taking ownership of the hitherto collectively owned resources, that royalty payments are to be made whether or not there is profit recorded by the mining entity and in addition to any taxation of any such profit. The idea is of course that the State would then use the proceeds from the royalty payments to provide public services and in that way everyone benefits from our resources. I think it is immensely significant that this principle is upheld at all times.

18 November 2008 **MINERALS PROSPECTING & MINING BILL**
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

The Amendment Bill on the Table seeks to introduce a windfall royalty payable on additional profits. That is very good and I am in full support of that. The Bill further removes the limit on the royalty rate that may be imposed by the Minister. That too is wonderful in that the Minister may not be constrained in optimising the benefits to the citizenship from the royalty payments. However, while the absence of the limit on the rate of royalty may bring this benefit, it also comes with a risk that reduced rates of royalty may also be sought and considered if there is no lower limit either and the Minister is given full flexibility in the law in that regard. In the case of reduced royalty, the full potential from this revenue source may not be realised. Further, this can introduce an element of uncertainty with regard to expected revenue from this source. It is important, therefore, that this aspect is properly contextualised during implementation so that it yields the intended benefit of optimising revenue and thus benefits to the community, rather than being used as a means of minimising royalty payments by companies. In fact, it would be more appropriate that the law stipulates the lower limit, in my view.

The other aspect of this issue that I wish to touch on is one that is dealt with under section 5, being the differentiation of royalty rates for different holders on consideration of a range of issues, including value of minerals, nature of deposits, extent of investment cost recovery, jobs created, sourcing of local supplies and impact on environment. Naturally, every business will seek to minimise ...(Intervention)

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: You may continue tomorrow. In terms of Rule 90 the House stands adjourned under automatic adjournment until tomorrow 14:30.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:45 UNTIL 2008.11.19 AT 14:30

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
ASSEMBLY CHAMBER
19 NOVEMBER 2008
WINDHOEK**

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

NOMINATION OF MEMBER TO IPU

HON SPEAKER: First announcement, Honourable Members. I have been informed that NUDO has nominated Honourable Chief K Riruako to serve on the International Parliamentary Union (IPU). I now announce Honourable Riruako as duly appointed to the said Committee.

Any Petitions? Any Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Honourable Minister of Finance.

TABLING: REPORTS OF AUDITOR GENERAL

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I lay upon the Table, Reports of the Auditor General on the Accounts of the following offices:

1. Agronomic Board for the Financial Year ended 31 March 2008;
2. National Assembly for the Financial Year ended 31 March 2007;
3. National Planning Commission for the Financial Year ended 31 March 2007;

19 November 2008

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT: ICT WEEK
HON KAAPANDA**

4. Ministry of Justice for the Financial Year ended 31 March 2007.

**TABLING: ANNUAL REPORT OF THE
OFFICE OF THE OMBUDSMAN**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Table the Reports, Honourable Minister. Any further Reports and Papers? In terms of Section 6(3) of the Ombudsman Act 7 of 1990, I lay upon the Table the Annual Report 2007 of the Office of the Ombudsman.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice of Questions? Notice of Motions? Message from the Head of State? Ministerial Statements? Minister of Information.

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
AFRICA ICT WEEK**

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members of this august House, on the 17th of November 2008 the African Continent is observing Africa ICT Week to promote and highlight the importance of ICT for the African Continent.

The culmination of ICT Week resulted from the request by the African Union Commission to member states to observe ICT Week with the aim to sensitise African leaders and citizens alike on the importance of ICT in everyday life.

19 November 2008

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT: ICT WEEK
HON KAAPANDA**

In Namibia, the Ministry of Information and Communication Technology decided to embrace Africa ICT Week in order to encourage Government and the private sector to invest in ICT projects to address the north-south and urban-rural digital divide. Creating ICT awareness during this week dedication to ICT may also serve to encourage and motivate the Namibian youth to consider a career in ICT fields.

Africa ICT Week also created the opportunity for me to address this august House on the challenges and opportunities for Namibia by embracing the ICT revolution and becoming part of the information society. Information and Communication Technology has shrunk the world into a global village through the information highway. Africa and more especially Namibia has not yet assumed its rightful place in the global village due to high illiteracy rate, poverty and high cost of ICT equipment and services and lack of human resources in this highly specialised field.

For the using of Information and Communication Technology, Africa ICT week also came at a very opportune time. As the Honourable Members are aware, His Excellency President Hifikepunye Pohamba created an ICT ministry on 8th of April 2008 with the mandate to ensure the expansion of ICT to fight poverty, create employment and ultimately, to attain our Vision 2030 and consequently, to make Namibia a knowledge-based society with Information and Communication Technology being one of the main pillars of our economy.

Currently Namibia is rated very low in terms of ICT use and growth on the African Continent and further afield. A number of issues contributed to this undesirable state of affairs. Among these was the fragmentation of the ICT sector in the country, the absence of information and communication legislation and clear policy guidelines on implementation plans to serve as a blueprint for the growth and functioning of the sector.

The visionary leadership of President Pohamba in creating an ICT Ministry with the mandate to take the ICT sector forward in line with Vision 2030 did away with one of the biggest obstacles that was hindering ICT growth in Namibia, namely fragmented Government structures that

19 November 2008

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT: ICT WEEK
HON KAAPANDA**

often resulted in the duplication of functions because of lack of coordination and consultation. With all ICT functions now under one roof and with the cooperation and the goodwill of all stakeholders in the sector, Namibia is set to make remarkable strides in the next couple of years to assume its rightful place among the top ICT performers on the African Continent and beyond.

To ensure that as a Nation we move ahead in the same direction, my Ministry is currently contemplating strategy measures to create a National ICT Coordinating Body to enhance sector coordination and evolution of ICT policies. The consultation process with all stakeholders is ongoing.

The further challenge that is still hampering the growth of the ICT sector in Namibia is the absence of an information and communication law that provides for the more efficient ICT regulatory body, ICT procedures, improve foreign investment and the creation of a universal service fund that would allow the roll-out of services to previously neglected and other service areas.

I am glad to announce that the Information and Communication Bill is now in an advanced stage and it would be ready for tabling in this august House during its first Session in 2009. Other challenges facing the Ministry and the Nation as a whole is the Human Resource constraints in the ICT sector, the cost of services and equipment that exclude many Namibians from participating in the sector and the lack of bandwidth that results in frustrating the slow delivery of services.

Since the creation of the Ministry of Information and Communication Technology in April this year, we have been hard at work to revise and update a number of policies that will shape the direction of information and communication technology in Namibia. These policies include an Information Technology Policy, a Telecommunication Policy, a Postal Policy, a Broadcasting Policy, new liberalised licensing formula and an overarching ICT Policy for the Republic of Namibia. By embracing these policies and most importantly, working as a Nation to ensure its implementation, Namibia will benefit through access and affordability of information that will assist our citizens in their daily lives, increased

19 November 2008

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT: ICT WEEK
HON KAAPANDA**

competitiveness of business and prominence in the global marketplace; the ability to exploit the great potential of electronic communications, the establishment of an environment conducive for the development of Namibian based content and service providers that are competitive players on continental markets and in so doing, create opportunities for employment and economic diversification and Universal Coastal services, providing access to affordable, efficient and higher quality services.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members of this august House, changing the face of the Namibian society to become a knowledge-based society requires a paradigm shift. To propel Namibia into an information society requires from us as leaders and every citizen of this country to embrace ICT and use it properly. To address the national ICT shortage, we have to collectively ensure that our children receive world-class ICT education from an early age. The Ministry of Education is hard at work to make this vision a reality with the ETSIP programme.

To address access and affordability, we must move swiftly to adopt and implement the Information and Communication Bill to level the playing field for all communication operators to enhance competition that will take ICT infrastructure and services to the remote corners of our country and give our rural citizens the opportunity to fully participate and benefit from the information society.

We are busy addressing the lack of bandwidth through various initiatives to access the global connectivity networks. We are cooperating with the Republics of Angola, Botswana and South Africa on submarine cable development projects with the aim of ensuring a Submarine Cable Landing Station at our coast that would give Namibia a direct and cost effective access to the international submarine cable systems.

To further address the cost and access aspect of ICT, my Ministry plans to engage the Ministry of Finance to consider giving import duty and tax credits for acquisition of ICT equipment to make it more affordable and to allow the use of ICT to rapidly increase in Namibia. To stimulate the ICT in Namibia, the introduction and implementation of e-Government services to benefit the Namibian society is imperative. E-Government

19 November 2008

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT: ICT WEEK
HON KAAPANDA**

services will ensure that our population can access Government services such as applying for national documents and obtaining relevant information about Government services.

The potential of e-Government to improve ICT usage about Namibians should serve as a motivation for us as policy-makers to drive the implementation and use ICT in our respective constituencies. Our private sector partners should strengthen Government's hand in the drive to make ICT accessible over the length and breadth of Namibia, because they also stand to benefit economically once our people have accessed and are ICT literate. For this reason we are encouraging the private sector to invest in ICT centres throughout the country, but to do so in cooperation and consultation with my Ministry to prevent the duplication of services and exclusion of communities because of lack of consultation.

Despite generation differences the intimidating effort that the use of ICT might have on the older generation makes life easier. It allows you to do research and provides entertainment, it makes banking and accounting management less painful and it facilitates contact with friends and families in other parts of Namibia, the Region, the continent or the world at the press of a button and at a fraction of the cost of traditional means of communication. In this regard, my Ministry will endeavour to emulate the example of other African countries that have made great strides in ICT penetration and usage, such as Uganda. The Ministry of ICT of Uganda embarked on a programme to avail computer training and internet connectivity to Parliamentarians in that country. The knowledge and benefits gained through this investment empowered their Members of Parliament to become proponents for ICT expansion that is now reaching the grassroots communities in that country, making Uganda an ICT success story on the African continent.

I want to conclude my contribution by calling on this august House to consider creating an ICT oversight steering committee in the Namibian Parliament. Such a committee can play a very important role to sensitise Parliamentarians and the citizens at large on the importance of information and communication technologies, while it can also assume responsibility for the promotion of ICT in the Namibian society, interact with ICT

19 November 2008

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT: ICT WEEK
HON KAAPANDA**

Ministry around the Budget time to assist in defending the Minister's Budget in Parliament, act as a watchdog for society to ensure that community and environmental aspects are taken into consideration in the roll-out of infrastructure, influence infrastructure roll-out to ensure accessibility and affordability, ensure that community consultations take place on all aspects related to ICT and ensure a balanced Regional approach to ICT roll-out throughout the country and addresses public perception on ICT. I am of opinion that such a Parliamentary Committee can serve as a driving force in Namibia to grow the ICT sector to assume its place as the most important sector of our economy as per the goals articulated in our NDP 3 and Vision 2030.

As we commemorate African ICT Week, I wish to wholeheartedly thank the industry role players for their active contributions and activities organised during this week. These activities include TV talk shows, Africa TV Week Supplements that were put by the *New Era*, gifts and gift vouchers.

Finally, if we can achieve the formation of the Parliamentary Standing Committee on ICT during Africa ICT Week 2008, it will be a move in the right direction and lead Namibia into the new information society and I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I thank you very much. The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

**RESUMPTION OF SECOND READING:
MINERALS PROSPECTING AND MINING AMENDMENT BILL**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on Second Reading – *Minerals Prospecting and Mining Amendment Bill.*

19 November 2008 **MINERALS PROSPECTING & MINING BILL**
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When the House adjourned on Tuesday, 18 November 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Minister of Mines and Energy, that the Bill be now read a Second Time. The Honourable Minister of Finance had the Floor and she may continue.

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. I started with my statement yesterday and I would start from the point that I wanted to emphasise and move on to the part that I did not get to yesterday.

I was saying the Amendment Bill on the table seeks to introduce a windfall royalty payable on additional profit. That is very good and I am in full support of that. The Bill further removes the limit on the royalty rate that may be imposed by the Minister of Mines. That too I consider wonderful in that the Minister may not be constrained in optimising the benefits to the citizenship from the royalty payments. However, while the absence of a limit on the rate of royalty may bring this benefit, it also comes with a risk that reduced rates of royalty may also be sought and considered if there is no lower limit either and the Minister is given full flexibility in law in that regard. In the case of reduced or waived royalty, the full potential from the royalty revenue source may not be realised. Further, this can introduce an element of uncertainty with regard to expected revenue from this source. It is important, therefore, that this aspect is properly contextualised during implementation so that it is used for the intended benefit of optimising revenue and thus benefits to the community, rather than being used as a means of minimising royalty payments by companies. It would be more appropriate, in my view, that the law stipulates a lower limit.

The other aspect of this issue that I wish to touch on is one that is dealt with under section 5, being the differentiation of royalty rates for different licence holders on consideration of a range of issues, including value of minerals, nature of deposits, extent of investment cost recovery, jobs created, sourcing of local supply and impact on environment.

Naturally, every business will seek to minimise its cost and this includes reducing any payment that it will have to make in the form of taxes or other statutory charges. It is to be expected, therefore, that all companies that would be liable for royalty payment under this Act will seek to optimise the provision under this section, not necessarily to optimise job creation or local beneficiation to our resources, but rather to access the optimal reduction in royalty payments on the basis of the considerations under this section.

Surely we must do everything possible to encourage local beneficiation to our resources in order to create employment opportunities locally and to optimise our earnings from our resources. This is the essence of the multiple incentives, including tax incentives, that we offer in terms of our laws. In terms of our tax incentives, companies are provided with benefits ranging from tax deduction of cost and reduced tax rates to a permanent as tax haven where no taxation is payable in perpetuity.

I have no quarrel with the use of tax incentives to promote certain policy objectives, provided that the effectiveness of such incentives are established and there is a mechanism to monitor and evaluate their impact. A waiver or a reduction of mineral royalties as an incentive to promote local beneficiation or job creation, however presents an insurmountable problem for me. This is for the reason that mineral royalties, unlike taxation, is a charge on ownership, which changes hands from the collective Namibian society to an individual upon the exploitation of the resource by the individual. That change of ownership is permanent and irreversible, except with the consent of the new owner and with full compensation to him or her.

Waiving of a mineral royalty to me means divesting the ownership of a commonly owned resource from the community to an individual, which individual's life can be significantly transformed for the better as a result of this process, free of charge; that is with the collective owners not tangibly and collectively compensated for the loss of this ownership. In the case of a reduced royalty or partial waiver, it would mean compensating the collective owner only partially for full and permanent transfer of ownership of a valuable resource from them.

19 November 2008

**MINERALS PROSPECTING & MINING BILL
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA**

One may argue that society gets jobs in return for this divestiture, but I would like to use this example to demonstrate why I consider this problematic: X and Y are siblings born to common parents - I would have liked Honourable Tjihuiko to hear this – who upon their birth bequeathed a collective asset, let me say a farm, to these two siblings equally. Sibling X then offers the following to sibling Y: *“Because I am an expert in farming and I have some capital to put this farm to the most optimal productive use, I want you to surrender your share of the farm to me, but in order for me to optimise the use of this farm, I need all the resources that I can get, which only become less if I pay a market price for your share of the farm. So, instead, why do you not give up your right to payment at the market rate for this share, so that I can use that money instead to develop the farm, invest in research so that I can have the top-of-range products from the farm and then market these products to optimise profitability. I will then give you a job on this farm for your whole productive life so that you will not want for anything and remember, the jobs created on this farm also offer possibility for jobs for your children.”* I do not know how many of us will accept that offer if we were in the position of sibling Y, because we would all want to sell our assets for the highest value that we can get.

The same should be the case with regard to mineral royalty. Our people should not have to give up ownership of their valuable resources to individuals in exchange for only jobs, most of which are for meagre remuneration in any case. I do not agree with Honourable Viljoen in this regard.

Those who acquire individual ownership of assets that are collectively owned should pay the commensurate price for that. Besides, the State needs to provide public services, including social safety nets, to the vulnerable and this is the young children, the sick and the old who cannot benefit from employment by these mining companies. The revenue from corporate and individual taxes will not be enough to enable Government to do so.

On the other hand, employment income of those employed at these mines

would hardly be enough to sustain themselves, let alone allowing them to take care of their vulnerable family members. In the end the State will be left to care for these vulnerable members and mineral royalties constitute, in my view, the most viable source of income for Government to discharge of this basic responsibility and we should, therefore, safeguard it at all times.

We should not allow, in my view, any leakages from this source through waivers and partial waivers of mineral royalties. We should instead utilise this revenue on schemes that will make a profound impact on our people's lives and that we leave a positive legacy beyond the availability of these finite resources. I know that individual access by our citizens to the ownership of this resource is also very important, but as indicated earlier, only so many people can become licence holders. The rest must rely on benefiting through redistribution.

It will also be important for us to ensure that the validity of the royalty prescription by the Minister of Mines should not be preconditioned on the Minister's prior notification of any licence holder about his intention to prescribe such royalty payment or on his giving any such holder an opportunity to be heard. In other words, while I see no problem that the Minister should consult the industry or give consideration to any situation affecting some or all industry members in determining the royalty payable by them, it would not be appropriate, in my view, that the Minister's statutory power to levy such royalty to mineral licence holders is conditioned to such prior consultation, so that somebody can say "*I cannot pay because you never notified me prior to the prescription of this royalty.*" I believe, therefore, that the provision under Section 4(b) as well as 4(c) will be improved significantly if this aspect is addressed.

Section 4(c) further raises concern about the predictability of royalty revenue if royalty rates can be renegotiated after being determined on account of changed circumstances after determination by the Minister. In addition, this factor of changed circumstances can be quite subjective.

Everybody can come up with a justification why they think circumstances have changed and why they should be excused from the prescribed rate or

19 November 2008 **MINERALS PROSPECTING & MINING BILL**
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

should be allowed to pay a lower rate. These circumstances are also quite variable. I would, therefore, be quite pleased if we can also re-look at the formulation of this provision.

I also glanced at the contribution of Honourable Viljoen and my strong statement with regard to the partial or full waiver of royalties was mainly provoked by what the Honourable Member had to say, because he was really trying to argue that new companies should not be asked to pay royalties, which in my view just means that we should allow foreigners to work here, get their hands on our diamonds, which is of the best quality around the world, free of charge, under pretexts of all kinds of circumstances. I feel that royalty payment is the only sure way that we can get a contribution from these resources because taxation is on profitability and these companies would mobilise the top-of-range tax consultants in order to help them to under-Report their profit so that they do not pay corporate tax. If we allow a source where we can charge these guys without them trying to play around with us in the form of this royalty, I think we will give up an opportunity that we may never come under again in the future.

Honourable Viljoen tried to argue that many Mining Companies made contributions towards the social development of our communities in any case, but apparently their contribution are never acknowledged, and never appreciated, and that instead we perceive them like thieves who come here and steal our minerals. Nobody said that. We appreciate the contribution that everyone makes towards the development of our country, but in respect of mineral resources that are amongst the most valuable of the resources that this Nation is endowed with, contribution cannot be done in such an arbitrary manner, so that they can decide, "*I have access to diamonds, I give one computer to this community.*" I do not think that is correct, contributions should be defined in the way that it is also comparable. If the two of us are given licences to exploit diamonds, we should all be expected to contribute in an equitable manner, not that I can give a computer, you can give a bag of maize-meal, the other one can give a nice Parker pen and that should do. I do not agree. That contribution should be mandatory measurable and enforceable.

19 November 2008 **MINERALS PROSPECTING & MINING BILL**
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

I think that a royalty rate that would be prescribed in law and is, therefore, mandatory and binding to everyone, cannot be replaced with voluntary contributions that can be discontinued at any time by this owner in any case, because they are voluntary and is made in the form that is preferred by the contributor, not necessarily in the form that best responds to the need of the communities who are the recipients of such contribution.

Secondly, Honourable Viljoen proceeds to say – and I think this was one of the most stunning things that he had to say – we must bear in mind that Namibia in most cases has medium to low-grade quality minerals with a very expensive way of getting access to it. As far as I know and as much as I am not an expert in mining, Namibia's diamonds, for example, are amongst the best in the world. It is of gem quality. For somebody to come and say our minerals are of medium and low grade quality that probably do not justify the form of charges that we are seeking to impose on them is selling his country short and I am stunned that something like that can come from a Member of Parliament.

Our coal deposits which are said to exist in some parts of our country are considered to be containing resources of top quality which, in spite of the fact that coal is considered not to be environmentally friendly, are considered to be green energy on account of its environmental friendliness and because of that, they fetch amongst the highest prices in the international market. Therefore, no one can come and tell us they are of low quality and therefore, we should not charge for them.

The Honourable Member went on to say that some of our neighbouring countries, including South Africa for example, do not impose any royalty on their resources. This is far-fetched, how can a country not charge royalty on the exploitation of its natural resources? It is not correct and in addition to that, it is important to state that South Africa has some of the most strict requirements related to access by local South Africans to the diamonds that are mined from that country. They have the most stringent requirements with regard to how those that mine these diamonds can market them. They cannot just ship them out of the country so that South Africans do not have the opportunity to buy them. Therefore, it is not correct to imply that South Africa is very lax when it comes to

19 November 2008 **MINERALS PROSPECTING & MINING BILL**
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

safeguarding the interests of its citizens in regard to benefiting from the resources that their country is endowed with.

The Honourable Member went on to say that, in South Africa the corporate tax rate is 28%, in Namibia there is already a royalty of between 3 and 20 and our tax rates are amongst the highest. I think that the Honourable Member is also not correct in this, because Namibia's tax structure is about the simplest that you can get. What you see is what you pay.

In a number of countries, in addition to a corporate tax that can be 28%, they would also have a windfall tax, like the one we are trying to introduce in regard to mineral royalty, but we do not have that here. You only pay a flat corporate tax rate of 35% or of 37% or of 55%, depending on the nature of your business. In the end, with the additional windfall tax, some of the tax rates that appear to be lower when compared to ours, are effectively higher and ours are effectively lower than most of the other countries' taxes.

Another point which I think is important to note is the fact that in Namibia dividends are not taxable at all, but in many of the countries, including our neighbouring countries, dividends are only tax exempted if it is reinvested. If you put it in your private bank account it becomes taxable like any other income. Therefore, our tax system has a lot of advantages and we should not try to sell ourselves short and say that we do not offer any concessions.

The Honourable Member is trying to justify that the royalty rates must be variable considering the extent to which the company has already recovered its costs and here I disagree for reasons that I have shared already. If you tell these colleagues that they only pay royalties once they have paid off their investment costs, they will never recover their investment costs and they will come up with all kinds of investments in which to hide this income. Therefore, I think this argument should be thrown out completely as a consideration.

In addition to that, we already give corporates a package of the most

19 November 2008

**MINERALS PROSPECTING & MINING BILL
HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA**

incredible

tax incentives, including a permanent tax haven that is being abused by some of the Companies, who establish more than one Company, so that the one looks like the value-adding one, the one looks like the Mining one and then with transfer pricing the goods shift from this one to the other one and apparently, because they are both local, they cannot pay royalties and on the other hand they will also not pay corporate taxes because they have a tax haven and in the end our people will get very little or nothing at all.

Therefore, instead of conceding to these schemes, we should rather close the loopholes in the law, for example by saying that when it comes to tax haven, it should not even apply to the processing of natural resources. This is the most valuable resource that we have. In thirty years these diamonds may be depleted and the communities where these diamonds are now being exploited by foreigners, may continue to languish in poverty. In thirty years somebody will come here and say, *“is this where the gem diamonds which are known around the world used to come from, look at them, they are uneducated, they cannot afford to go to school, they cannot afford even to access the health services, while somebody is swimming in wealth somewhere in Europe and America”*; from our resources. We should get them to contribute so that we can make investments that would enable us tomorrow to say, *“this used to be the mining area and look at the legacy of the wealth that used to be there.”* I think we should rather do that.

To counter his argument that for example; how can we penalise Rosh Pinah Mine for exporting zinc concentrate, in the most developed Nations around the world, Government encourage their corporate citizens to maximise local value in addition to the products that they import, by applying a levy on the imports of finished goods from abroad. This charge is aimed to discourage them from importing tinned fish, for example instead of importing unprocessed fish and can it at home. We, on the other hand, want to take money from the Budget and pay these people to get them to add value. I do not agree, we should rather make it a condition of the licence that you will process this mineral and they cannot

19 November 2008 **MINERALS PROSPECTING & MINING BILL**
HON DIENDA / HON NGHIMTINA

we say goodbye to them and move on to the next person who can add value to our resources here. There should be no subsidy payments to these Companies to encourage them to add value.

Honourable Speaker, I may be seen to be very harsh by members of the corporate family, but when you are tasked to balance the accounts of Government books, when you are the one facing the Minister of Health who is telling you that people do not have access to malaria medication and our children die of a disease that can be treated and you know that under your feet there are vast resources that are exploited by foreigners and shipped out, you cannot sleep and you cannot let things continue that way. Therefore, I thank my Colleague for introducing that windfall rate and for introducing the flexibility that he can charge more where it is necessary. But I plead with him not to allow those colleagues to abuse this legislation and to consider that we introduce a minimum royalty rates and to address some of the other concerns that I have raised here.

With these remarks, I support wholeheartedly the Amendment Bill.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. The House will rise for refreshments.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:40
HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:23 PURSUANT TO ADJOURNMENT

HON DIENDA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I would like to postpone the Debate on behalf of Honourable Henk Mudge until Tuesday, next week.

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: Honourable Deputy Speaker, when I introduced this Bill in the House, I said an urgent

19 November 2008

**WILDLIFE PRODUCTS & TRADE BILL
HON ULENGA**

Amendment is required, we have issues which need to be attended to immediately and we cannot allow this one to be postponed unless it is until tomorrow.

HON DIENDA: I will postpone it until tomorrow on behalf of Honourable Henk Mudge.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Debate is adjourned until tomorrow. The Secretary will read the Second Order of the Day.

**RESUMPTION OF SECOND READING:
CONTROLLED WILDLIFE PRODUCTS AND TRADE BILL _____**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on Second Reading – *Controlled Wildlife Products and Trade Bill.*

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When this Debate was adjourned on Tuesday, 11 November 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by Honourable Minister of Environment and Tourism that the Bill be now read a Second Time. Honourable Ulenga adjourned the Debate and he now has the Floor.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I would like, first of all, to express my support for the important piece of draft legislation that has been tabled by Minister Ndaitwah in the House. With that I must express my concern, Honourable Deputy Speaker, that this seems like a

19 November 2008

**WILDLIFE PRODUCTS & TRADE BILL
HON ULENGA**

case of perhaps too little, too late. CITES, as an important International Convention, was entered into in 1973, which is about 35 years ago, and two years thereafter there was a piece of legislation in this country, the ordinance that regulated conservation then, but of course the country did not have the political status to enter into this kind of convention.

However, it is to be appreciated that the Namibian Government within a year of attaining Independence acceded to CITES and there was quite a lot of enthusiasm at that time to accede and, therefore, support this very important international conservation effort.

What I cannot understand is that despite the fact that Namibia as a country acceded thereto in 1991, it only now, about 18 years thereafter, ratify it. (Interjections). You do not seem to understand, I am not talking about the Ministry and about the Government. I am talking about our country. I am expressing a concern that we have taken quite long. Can you imagine, we have taken action in 1991 and in 2008, 18 years thereafter, we are finally putting a law in place in order to facilitate the implementation of CITES here. To me that is a little too long and I think we should go back to the enthusiasm of earlier days.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the second point I want to make is that though CITES is an important international instrument, it is not the answer to everything. You find actually that the status perspective or approach is a little bit centred within the industrialised countries of the West and tends to look down and victimise developing countries, which in this case happen to be the countries with the resources that we are talking about in CITES.

Be that as it may, it is important that we as a country look beyond CITES and establish our own conservation standards. The fact that CITES tries to enforce the conservation of important species by prohibiting trade in endangered flora and fauna does not mean that all the endangered flora and fauna are therefore protected.

For example, Honourable Deputy Speaker, we as a country do not seem to have our instrument in terms of a Committee that does research and

19 November 2008

WILDLIFE PRODUCTS & TRADE BILL
HON ULENGA

determine all the plants and animals which exist in Namibia, secondly plants and animals which exist only in Namibia and nowhere else, the status of these plants and animals with regard to their level of being endangered. Unless an animal or plant is sometimes involved in international trade, if we do not have any other instrument to look after the status of these plants and animals, we may not even be aware of what animals and plants are at the brink of extinction.

Therefore, I would like to propose to the Honourable Minister that a Committee be set up to look into the status of the various plants and animals within the country, animals and plants which are not necessarily some of the products which are referred to in the CITES Agreement, because these people are only worried about the elephants and the rhino horns which sometimes find their way into international trade. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: On a Point of Order. Honourable Ulenga, you are proposing a Committee. Is that a Committee different from what is provided for in Clause 3? Is that something different?

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I think CITES is a good instrument, but the problem is that CITES and all its schedules and Committees are dealing with products which become the subjects of international trade. Now, you as well as I know that *Endjindanguliko*, *Okangwangwa*, *Eengeshu*, these articles do not become subject to international trade. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can you translate?

19 November 2008

WILDLIFE PRODUCTS & TRADE BILL
HON ULENGA

HON ULENGA: I will not translate and this is the matter I was going to come to. If you look at the schedule that is provided in the Bill, there is a whole list of plants and animals and you know the cheek of the so-called international scientists bodies is that they put everything in Latin, so much so that with your own animals and plants which are known by indigenous names in your own country, you will not be able to recognise these very items which are listed in the schedules in the Bill. What I mentioned just now are just the indigenous names of some of the endemic plants and animals which exist only in Namibia. I will not be able to provide their Latin names, therefore I cannot translate them into Latin. They do not exist in England, there is no English name for them.

Honourable Speaker, the Committee that I am proposing is a Committee that should be a national Committee... (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: May I ask a question? Honourable Ulenga, are you aware that Kenya and Zambia were promised a lot of money if they burn their own Ivory and in the end they did not get anything. Are you aware of that and Zambia came to join with Namibia, Botswana, South Africa and Zimbabwe? Are you aware of that?

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, yes, I am indeed aware, that is why I am saying it is important that before we get into the importance of international treaties and conventions, it is important that we as a Nation are highly conscious of the need to conserve our own endemic and even non-endemic species of flora and fauna. Our conservation efforts must not be based on some kind of benefits that may be offered or promised by the international community, because they may be driven by other political agendas or considerations, or even other considerations may not be political, it may be economic, but which may consider first of all the interest of other nations and states rather than our own. (Intervention)

19 November 2008

WILDLIFE PRODUCTS & TRADE BILL
HON ULENGA

HON MINISTER OF EDUCATION: I want to provide some information on what he said about English names and Latin names. All plants and animals are classified according to general groupings called families and we cannot say in this Honourable House that certain plants somehow do not fit anywhere and there are no English or Latin names. Everybody knows about water lilies, that they have flowers and a bulb underneath which you can eat and all these things belong to that family that has edible bulbs, so that other people can also understand what we are talking about. It is not something strange, it may be in Namibia, it may also be in East or West Africa or North Africa, but the main thing is that they belong to certain families which we all can identify.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, it is not my aim to even take up the challenge coming from such a big gun in science, I am just talking as a layman. I know they call something which is an endemic Namibian plant something called *blue bell gordani*. It is the blue bell of Gordon.

When plants are named after, first of all, false discoverers, coming here to say that no, it is Nangolo Mbumba who discovered it, but the forefathers before Nangolo Mbumba already knew about this thing, it is a little inaccurate, to say the least. However, I definitely do not want to get into a debate with the Minister on the issue of classification, because I think that is in a separate class altogether.

However, Honourable Deputy Speaker, let me get to the need of establishing a national committee that can take on conservation issues and especially study and classify Namibian plants and animals on its own, funded by the Namibian Government, if not by anybody else, and be able to inform the Nation in totality how many plants and animals we have within the boundaries of Namibia, secondly, how many of them are on the verge of extinction, how many are recovering, how many are declining and what can be done to make sure that conservation is effectively promoted and that those plants and animals do not disappear.

19 November 2008

**WILDLIFE PRODUCTS & TRADE BILL
HON ULENGA**

Honourable Deputy Speaker, you know that it is not only the international trade in elephant tusks, ivory, or rhino horn that endangers species or the sale of other species, there is also such a thing as the loss of habitat. Of course, in Namibia we are a sparsely populated Nation, so there are not too many of us, therefore the danger of encroaching onto some habitat of endangered species is limited, but there are areas where have proved that... (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: May I ask Honourable Ulenga a question? Honourable Ulenga, is it not perhaps appropriate that during your forthcoming holiday you volunteer to start preparing that classification of plants and other things?

HON ULENGA: As I was saying Honourable Deputy Speaker, we as humans have encroached on quite a number of areas which used to belong exclusively to wildlife and that also needs closer study and monitoring in Namibia.

I have come to notice over the years that some of the indigenous and endemic plants and animals, like I was citing to the Prime Minister here, *Endjikanjuliko*, are disappearing completely from Namibia. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable Ulenga, I just want to find out the rationale. I remember President Daniël Arap-Moi was on television burning thousands and thousands of tons of ivory. What was the rationale for burning a commodity which has value? Was it to deter would-be poachers or what was the rationale? That is the first question. Secondly, Honourable Ulenga, do you not think that it is also now time to

19 November 2008

WILDLIFE PRODUCTS & TRADE BILL
HON ULENGA

start encouraging our visitors to the coast not to drive on the dunes because there is a threat to the Damara dik-dik. (Interjection). Honourable Tjihuiiko, the problem is that you do not read.

HON ULENGA: Yes, I would be happy to attempt to answer my nephew's questions. Number one, on the issue of Mr Arap-Moi burning the ivory in a bonfire, that just proves the danger of being completely empty when it comes to conservation. There must be some values within the Nation. If there are no values, it is so easy to replace that emptiness with some kind of foreign begotten ideas. I think what we witnessed there is that the local people did not have their own understanding and plan and programme how to deal with their own resources. Therefore, somebody comes in a poor community and says, "if you burn this, I am going to pay you so much" and there is no alternative locally. Therefore, they ended up burning their ivory. It also shows to me the development and evolution of conservation ideas. The Kenyans somehow deplore or are not quite happy that they acted like that, but of course, they are one of the first nations that had to deal with the issue of the extinction of elephants. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: I am sorry to disturb the Honourable Member, but I was interested in the question of Kenya. May I ask a small question?

HON ULENGA: The Prime Minister should allow me to finish answering the question before he asks the next question.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, therefore, I would like the Minister to seriously consider the setting up of a Committee or to urge national scientific bodies to set up a committee that will make our conservation efforts more internally grounded. I thank you and I rest my case.

19 November 2008

WILDLIFE PRODUCTS & TRADE BILL
HON KAIYAMO

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Honourable Kaiyamo.

HON KAIYAMO: Comrade Deputy Speaker, from the onset I would like to congratulate the Minister for bringing this Amendment to this House. I am sure Namibia has been learning in these 18 years how to deal with these products.

I realised from the beginning that it is a very technical Bill and Comrade Minister, your Ministry is one of the Ministries in this republic who has a well-organised library, but we need more journals in this library so that we can understand some of the issues raised here and also to have your staff understand some of these Bills. That is why we need to support that Vote so that you can get more money for the library to subscribe to the journals which are only online. That is why I was very impressed when the Honourable Minister of Information was speaking about the new technology.

Furthermore, the Bill speaks about inspectors and anybody in the Ministry can be an inspector. My question is whether everybody in the Ministry is trained to be inspectors at this level?

Some Bills passed by this House say “*must*”, some say “*may*”, regarding regulations and in this Bill it says “*may*”, but in my view it should be “*must*” because there is a need for these regulations to be real.

On the delegation of powers the Bill states it can be delegated to anybody in the Ministry. My question is, did it not bring a kind of class contradiction in the Ministry if we have structures? I think the one mentioned by the Secretariat on Page 21 is the one Honourable Ulenga is talking about. I am sure this Secretariat would be able to do the things the Honourable Member was talking about. My question is; who is going to pay this Secretariat and if it is donor-driven... (Intervention)

19 November 2008

WILDLIFE PRODUCTS & TRADE BILL
HON TJIHUIKO

HON ULENGA: On a Point of Information. Everything that is mentioned in terms of Committees or Secretariat in this Bill has to do with international trade in certain species. What I proposed has nothing to do with trade.

HON KAIYAMO: Honourable Minister, my question is: If this Secretariat is donor-driven, can it be sustained in the long run? Also if I look at the Budget of the Ministry, the vote on training is not quite a reasonable one. Maybe we need to look at that training so that all the people mentioned in this Bill can be on the same page at all times.

In the Schedule there is something about Namibia, Botswana, annual export quote for specific hunting trophies, Botswana 5, Namibia 150. Is this what we can export per annum?

Another is on Page 69 the youth quotas are not in line with the reality on the ground. Page 69 is talking about trade in hairs; I want to know whether this, 1.69 number 5 mentions the population of Botswana, Namibia, South Africa, Zimbabwe for exclusive purpose of allowing the trade in hair. I want to know whether this trade in hair will not affect our upcoming trade in hair, especially our colleagues who are running salons. What does it mean in practical terms?

I support the Bill and I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Honourable Tjihuiko.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, there are two questions that I want to be clear on. The first one is on Page 3. It states that the Minister must appoint members of the Technical Committee on the

19 November 2008

**WILDLIFE PRODUCTS & TRADE BILL
HON TJIHUIKO**

recommendation of the Minister responsible for the Ministry, Office or Agency where the relevant staff member is employed. I am not clear what you want to do here. When you want to establish a Committee or a board, you are looking for experts who are going to make a difference, people with knowledge. If we are now saying that this Committee will consist of staff members of Ministries and will be recommended by another Ministry, it means that anybody can be recommended. If we do not have the expertise, what will you do? It sounds as if anybody is earmarked to be appointed in this Committee. I need to be clear on that.

On point 6, the Minister may remove a member of a Committee. The Minister will remove somebody that has been recommended by another Minister and there is no indication as to whether there will be consultations or now the power is vested in that Minister. Which Minister between the two Ministers is more powerful and why, when it comes to the stage of getting rid of the person, there is no consultation? Minister, I would appreciate if you could just highlight to us.

On point 7, if a position on a Committee becomes vacant, as contemplated in Sub-section (5) and (6), the Minister may appoint a member to fill the vacant position and the new member holds the position for the unexpired portion of the term of office of the member. I need you to elaborate on that, Honourable Minister. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: On a Point of Information. Starting with the question under point 6, if the Honourable Member reads Clause (a) it is indicated clearly that the person appointed is either given another post and it is standard. You can take any Bill and see that it reads that way. Do not waste the time of the Honourable Minister.

HON TJIHUIKO: I have a problem with this issue of it being standard, we have been doing it that way and even if it is wrong, it is done that way.

19 November 2008

**WILDLIFE PRODUCTS & TRADE BILL
HON TJIHUIKO**

We need to look at it and what is wrong should be put right. Yesterday, you have been told the same story that yes, we have been making mistakes, we did not even notice that we were making mistakes, it is in order, it is common law. That is what the legal advisor of this Government is saying.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, on Page 4, point 16: No decision of the committee is invalid only because there was a vacancy on a committee or because a person who participated in the deliberations of the committee or voted while such a person was not entitled to participate or vote, provided that there was a quorum at the meeting. Deputy Speaker, the point that bothered me is that apparently we are saying that in these Committees where we are talking critical decisions, anybody can sit in that meeting, can participate, can even vote and that decision will not be invalid. Is that what we are saying? If I pass by there and see people sitting in a meeting, I can sneak in and be part of the meeting and the decision that will be taken is valid. Honourable Minister of Environment, if you could just explain, I am not going to talk to these advisors who lost Kasikili and others.

Point 17: *“Subject to the provisions of this Act, the committee may determine its own procedures.”* I want to know, when would the Minister be aware of these procedures, would he or she be able to say, *“I was not aware of your procedures?”* I do not know whether we are doing things where the Minister would be ignorant of the things that are happening in her Ministry, because there is a committee consisting of people who have been appointed by other Ministries into a committee where the Minister will not have control over it. Where are we going now? (Interjection). The problem is that we have people like the Deputy Minister of Justice who is doing an injustice to the system. How will the Minister control if everything the Committee is doing is wrong?

Honourable Deputy Speaker, to be a good advisor, the Honourable Member should learn from the wisdom of the Minister of Justice. If you sit back and listen ... (Interjections).

On the same page, point 6.1: *“The Minister may appoint any staff*

19 November 2008

**WILDLIFE PRODUCTS & TRADE BILL
HON NANDI-NDAITWAH**

member in the Ministry to be an inspector.” Any staff member, even a cleaner and the Minister can even get rid of those personal assistants who are not performing by appointing them. Then the Personal Assistant will stand up and say the Minister must be fired because he is not performing. Is that what the Minister really wants to see or are you trying to get rid of your personal assistant?

Honourable Deputy Speaker, let me stop there, I will come back later, but I would love the Minister to explain some of these things because these are very serious and unless we address them, we are making room for a certain situation to happen and she will be in trouble. If the law was made to undermine you, be careful. Thank you very much.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Any further discussion? I now revert the Floor to the Minister to respond.

HON MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Comrade Deputy Speaker. I thank the Honourable Members for supporting this Bill, those who participated and those who did not participate.

The first to participate was *Honourable Ulenga* who mentioned the lateness of bringing this law, but I have to tell you, as it was said by another contributor, this is one of the technical issues and it took time to make sure that we are putting in place legislations to assist us on this whole issue. We are talking about CITES which is an international instrument and we have to understand it, after having ratified it, to make sure that we are able to implement what is required by that particular instrument, a national law is required.

The only issue the Honourable Member raised is the establishment of a national committee in order to do research on Namibian flora and fauna and to give early warnings when some of those species not listed in

19 November 2008

**WILDLIFE PRODUCTS & TRADE BILL
HON NANDI-NDAITWAH**

CITES become endangered. I have to inform you that in addition to the committee that is established here, which is basically to oversee the implementation of the Convention, we also have what is called the Management Authority and the Bill is very clear that the Management Authority is the Ministry of Environment and Tourism, and having served in that Ministry, you know very well that the Ministry has a Directorate of Scientific Services which is responsible for research and has scientists and researchers who would be able to warn the Nation on what is happening with those species.

I may also inform you that when any country makes its own research and protection for a certain species, it can be added to the list contained in the Convention. I believe, you are just asking us to strengthen the work already going on in the Ministry. As you know, research cannot be done in isolation and that is why the Ministry is working very closely with institutions of higher learning, such as UNAM, on the matter. We are also working closely with the Ministry of Agriculture which also has a component of research when it comes to plants. Research is an ongoing process and your support will be highly appreciated. I agree, we need to keep a close eye on our species and protect them at all times.

Comrade Kaiyamo, thank you for your support. We take note of the journals which are available in this particular area in order to work closely with the Public Library and you made reference to the Minister of Information and Communication Technology. Technology facilitates our work and when we find some of these journals online, we can make use of them. It is one way of making the information available.

Your second concern is the same as the one raised by *Honourable Tjihuiko*. That is a Minister being given the power to appoint anyone in the Ministry as inspector. Honestly, the law will be implemented by the people and when the Minister appoints an inspector he/she knows exactly what is required of an inspector and the law itself has given the responsibilities of an inspector. If you prescribe to the law, for example, that the Minister may only appoint a director or deputy director as an inspector and then you receive a Report that in an area there are materials which are listed there and you need to send an inspector immediately

19 November 2008

**WILDLIFE PRODUCTS & TRADE BILL
HON NANDI-NDAITWAH**

before the evidence is destroyed, according to the Act the Minister can provide that certificate to anyone on the spot, because the person has to show a certificate that he is appointed as an inspector. If you confine it to specific people and they are not available, you may end up not doing what you wanted to do or achieve what you wanted to achieve.

There is no Minister who, in his or her own conscience, will appoint a person who is not able to do the job, but in order to be effective, you cannot prescribe the people to be appointed because you need to act immediately. That is what is put in the law to make this more operational.

I think I have answered on the issue of training, but you know what is the work to be done. The inspectors can be appointed to do permanent work, like the police, and you give them a certificate, they are inspectors to check what is happening.

Then on the issue of the Secretariat, Comrade Kaiyamo, the Act goes up to Page 11 and from there you have schedules. Many, if not all of these schedules are referring to the Convention and that is the Secretariat that is being referred to. It is not the Secretariat of the Ministry. In the Ministry you have the Management Authority and the committee accountable to the Management Authority. Those are the two bodies which are going to be in the Ministry.

On Page 32 it is indicated what the countries are allocated per year. You cannot do more than what is allocated to you and this came about after long consultations and negotiations for these countries listed here to be given that quota. Some of these even include problematic animals and we realised that when we are allocating trophy hunting quotas, we have to be very careful because we cannot go above our quota, because if you allocate everything to trophy hunting and then comes a problematic animal, you will have a problem to put down that animal because your quota has been used. That is what we are allocated in accordance to the Convention and we have to abide to it.

Honourable Tjihuiko, on Page 3 it is stipulated that the Minister must appoint the members of the technical committee on the recommendation

19 November 2008

**WILDLIFE PRODUCTS & TRADE BILL
HON NANDI-NDAITWAH**

of the Minister responsible for the Ministry, Office or Agency where the relevant staff member is employed. I want to refer you to 3(2)(a), (b), (c) and (d), specifically 3(c), “*A staff member whose duty relates to botanic research.*” There must be a botanic research institution and you have to ask that botanic research institution to submit names of people to be appointed. The same goes for (d): “*A staff member from the Ministry of Fisheries and Marine Resources.*” The Minister of Fisheries and Marine Resources knows the competencies of the staff in his Ministry and there is no way a Minister can stand up and say I am taking this person from your Ministry. You have to consult and then the Minister makes recommendations and then you can appoint.

This even explains the removal of members. “*The Minister may remove a member of the committee if his or her position in the Public Service has changed in such a manner.*” The Act is saying the person should come from the Ministry of Fisheries and Marine Resources and if the Minister gives the name to the Minister of Environment and Tourism and the Minister appoints that person and six months down the road the person resigns from that Ministry, that person cannot continue to serve in the committee because the Act is very clear that the person should come from the Ministry of Fisheries and Marine Resources. Now you need to go back and say, “*this person has resigned, we want another person.*” (Interjection)

HON TJIHUIKO: Who are experts!

HON MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM: Those are experts. Do you want to say when you were in that Ministry you were not an economic expert? I thought you were an expert on Economics, that is why you were in that Ministry.

Clause 7 deals with position on the committee becoming vacant. You are appointing people for three years and if, before the three years expire, one person resigns from the committee, the next person you are going to

19 November 2008

**WILDLIFE PRODUCTS & TRADE BILL
HON NANDI-NDAITWAH**

appoint will only serve the remaining term, but not to be appointed for a full three years. You cannot be appointed for three years because you are just completing the term of the person who was appointed initially.

You talked about Page 4, Clause 17. The committee determines its own procedures. I informed you that this committee is accountable to the Management Authority and the Management Authority is the Ministry and it is very clear from this Act that they are accountable. The procedure is not that they are determining the work they are implementing, the work they are implementing is already in this Act and it is already stipulated in the schedules attached to the Convention. What is stipulated here is only how they are going to do their work, namely administrative procedures that they are adopting. However, all the work is stipulated in the schedules attached to the Convention.

I have already responded to the issue of inspectors, that there is no way you can appoint a person when you know the person will not be able to do the work and you cannot list who should be appointed here, because there are times when those people may not be available and you are talking about action that needs to be taken immediately if this Convention and the Act to be effectively implemented.

Once again, thank you for your support and I am sure as a country we may be able to abide by the Convention that we have ratified and committed ourselves to. This one is only an instrument to enable us to implement that Convention, otherwise everything required is clearly stipulated in the Convention itself. I thank you, Comrade Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now Put the Question, that the Bill be now read a Second Time. Any objection? Agreed to. The Secretary will read the Bill a Second Time.

SECRETARY: Controlled Wildlife Products and Trade Bill.

19 November 2008

**MOTION ON PREVAILING POVERTY
HON T GURIRAB**

**RESUMPTION OF DEBATE:
MOTION ON PREVAILING POVERTY IN THE COUNTRY**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on the prevailing poverty in the country.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When the House adjourned on Tuesday, 28 October 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by Honourable Tjihuike. Honourable Venaani had the Floor and he may now continue.

HON MOONGO: The Member is on an official mission and somebody else may take the Floor.

HON T GURIRAB: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. This Debate has been going on for quite some time, but I rise to say a few things by way of support for the Motion.

Poverty is a global challenge. It affects more people in the south than in the north and here I am talking about global north and south. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY: On a Point of Order. I need some guidance from the Chair. Yesterday after a very acrimonious Debate, this House was divided procedurally to vote on a Motion that had as subject of discussion the issue of poverty. It

19 November 2008

**MOTION ON PREVAILING POVERTY
HON T GURIRAB**

also became very clear during the discussions the attempts that Government is doing to deal with this particular issue. Now, in order to avoid any situation where we would revert back to where we were yesterday and the days before yesterday, considering that the subject is more or less the same, would it not be prudent that the subject we are now discussing should be considered as dealt with under the Motion that we disposed of yesterday? I want the Deputy Speaker to give us some guidance and if need be, even the Standing Committee on Rules to guide us in this particular respect. I Move.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you Honourable Minister, it is true what you are saying, yesterday's Motion was on the findings of the National Planning Commission when they went to the South. It dealt with one Region and this one is talking about the whole country, not specifically for a certain Region. Therefore, I regard it as two different Motions.

HON T GURIRAB: Thank you, Deputy Speaker. Before you get excited, I am speaking here about the global south versus the global north, developed countries versus under-developed countries for those who are uninitiated. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: On a Point of Order. The Honourable Member, Tsudao Gurirab, has started on a wrong footing. There is no global south, nor global north. Therefore, Comrade Deputy Speaker, if the Honourable Member continues from that footing, we have rules which we could ask the Deputy Speaker to invoke. I want to advise him to deal with poverty in general, but if he wants to take it to the global south, we are not going to accept that.

19 November 2008

**MOTION ON PREVAILING POVERTY
HON T GURIRAB**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Member, please stick to the Motion.

HON T GURIRAB: It actually says that in my notes, the global south versus the global north. For the uninitiated, the south means developing countries, global north means developed countries.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, whilst Namibia is regarded as a lower-middle income country, the global statistics hide an ugly reality of pervasive and deepening poverty in Namibia. The Colleagues on the other side of the House who read the *Namibian* might have seen in this morning's *Namibian* that Government statistics are being cited in a Report which says that a third of Namibians are grovelling in poverty.

Deputy Speaker, poverty is a material state of being, it means a state of being unable or being ill-housed, mal-nourished and malnutrition is increasing in our country if you look at Government statistics. It means lack of skills, it means lack of good health, generally lacking a quality of life and in simple terms, people are poor because they lack or do not have assets.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the relative place of Namibia in the global book of prosperity only measures our economic output divided by the number of people, the so-called GDP per capita, but as Honourable Members are aware a more comprehensive measure of welfare or poverty, if you will, is the composite measure of human development index, which measures literacy levels, educational attainment, access to water, health, housing, access to shelter, maternal health, etcetera, etcetera. Clearly then, addressing poverty is a core function, the core business of Government, for its public authorities whose mandate it is to provide education, therefore skills and literacy and numeracy, health facilities, clean water, this is the Government's core mandate providing these issues which are being measured by the Human Development Index and that means people are poor. It is a core business that Government must provide this. (Intervention)

19 November 2008

**MOTION ON PREVAILING POVERTY
HON T GURIRAB**

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: On a Point of Information. I hope the Honourable Member knows that just 20 to 30 minutes ago one of your Members adjourned the Mineral Amendment Act which wants to implement that responsibility of the Government. Therefore, there is nothing to argue about, you are supposed to support it.

HON T GURIRAB: My short answer to that is that it should not take us 18 years to get there. My second part of the short answer is that the more we talk about these things, the more we may realise that it is our responsibilities. (Interjections)

Deputy Speaker, the provision of these social amenities is a core business of the Government. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable Tsudao, you are saying the primary responsibility of Government is to address poverty.

HON T GURIRAB: No, I did not say that. The provision of these amenities is the core business of Government. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS: The provision of those core functions, amenities, lies with the Government and the thing that every month-end at the CoD a cheque of N\$33,000 goes missing. In the unlikely event of CoD becoming the Government, how are you going to handle that when cheques go missing left, right and centre?

19 November 2008

**MOTION ON PREVAILING POVERTY
HON T GURIRAB**

HON T GURIRAB: That is a good question, it shows that as a responsible Member, all cheques which are missing, if any, will be traced and accounted for, that is how a responsible organisation work. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: On a Point of Information. Honourable Gurirab, you started well by saying that poverty is a global problem. We know that it is a global problem and that is why the United Nations introduced the MDG's, so that countries, Governments, States together with the international community should look for better ways to address these divisive phenomena. We recognise that, that there is poverty everywhere, not only in Namibia, everywhere. You can start from Mozambique to the whole of SADC, people are living in shacks everywhere, Zambia, Angola, Venezuela, even the richest countries with oil and then I must again remind you of India and even in the United States of America itself. It is a global phenomenon. We agree that the Government has a primary responsibility to address this, but the problems we have are so numerous – unequal trade, mineral resources being taken out of this country and processed somewhere else, coming back at high exorbitant prices. Those are the problems the world are facing and what we are requesting you is to learn from this Government so that one day, even in your dreams of dreams, when you come to power, you would not fight about cheques which are getting lost, you have learned something, that this Government is committed to the people of this country and it is trying its best to address the problem of poverty. You must take note of that, Honourable Member.

HON T GURIRAB: Honourable Deputy Speaker, again my short answer to my distinguished cousin is that because it is such a global problem, we must not tire of speaking of it, we must talk about it all the time, we must find solutions to it. That is my short answer.

19 November 2008

**MOTION ON PREVAILING POVERTY
HON T GURIRAB**

Honourable Deputy Speaker, as I said, it is a core business to look after the welfare of our people because otherwise what other business does this Government have? It is a core responsibility of those who aspire to Government and those who are Government and to render the citizens a quality of life and indeed to provide roads, rail and telecommunications to enable citizens to reach each other and the goods and service markets. (Interjection). Nobody here has opposed any railway, we have actually gone and worked on the railway.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, it is a matter of record that efforts have been made by this Government to address these issues of human development index. However, our social balance sheet remains unimpressive. In fact, Honourable Deputy Speaker, it is worsening. The extent and profile of poverty in Namibia is the combined function of history and this Government's public policy or should I say, failure of public policy? It is the past policies of exclusion, of racism and job reservation, of criminal neglect of education, of exploitation of lands and livestock of the natives. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: May I ask a question? Honourable Gurirab, you are saying that there was a criminal neglect of the social sectors. Who has committed that crime? Can you be clear?

HON T GURIRAB: I am talking about pre-Independence. I am saying it is the past policies of exclusion and denial, of racism and job reservation, of criminal neglect of education, of expropriation of lands and livestock of natives which greatly accounts for today's lack of ownership and lack of assets and capital and thus poverty by the vast majority of Namibians.

But Honourable Deputy Speaker, it is Karl Marx who writes in his Communist Manifesto that different philosophers have only interpreted the word that critically says that the point however is to change it. You cannot keep on saying it is blue and we do not like it. The point is to

19 November 2008

**MOTION ON PREVAILING POVERTY
HON T GURIRAB**

change it, so our good old friend, Karl Marx, makes the point about the historical injustices and the expropriation of the natives of land is not only to lament it, and not to get lost in the genesis and profile of today's pervasive and universal poverty which is so prevalent in our country, but the point is, what have the authorities of the day done about that. That is the issue, what have the authorities done about this poverty in the last 18 years, of the expropriation of the livestock and assets of the natives which is a cause? What have we done? (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: May I ask a question? How do you link the human development index without coming to the jargons, when it comes to our Constitution? The historical injustice that you have talked about, you know that we have the Bill of Rights that says you cannot touch the property of others. It means it constrains Government in taking certain actions to correct the injustice of the past. As a lawmaker, what would be your solution especially on the issue of property?

HON T GURIRAB: There is nothing in our law which says the expropriation of your grandparents' land and livestock should not be addressed. There is nothing in our Constitution that says that.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the record is a mixed one. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: May I ask a question? Honourable Gurirab, is it true when talking of poverty that there is a certain President of a certain Party who is about to be declared insolvent and for that reason the President is going to leave the National Assembly?

19 November 2008

**MOTION ON PREVAILING POVERTY
HON T GURIRAB**

HON T GURIRAB: Honourable Deputy Speaker, as I was saying, the record of Government's provision of social amenities is a mixed one. In the provision of public amenities such as health facilities, schools, clean water infrastructure development progress is being made. However, Deputy Speaker, Namibia's human development index which is a measure of welfare or alternatively, of poverty, has dropped significantly and critically.

HON KAIYAMO: May I ask my neighbour a question? Honourable Gurirab, do you not think that this Motion is opportunistic in the light that the Government has a policy on poverty reduction and in this policy I see that your Ministry, of which you were Permanent Secretary was part of the Committee to reduce poverty. Do you not think that this is an opportunistic Motion?

HON T GURIRAB: I believe Deputy Speaker, the former Colleague from the Ministry... (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I cannot allow two Members standing on the Floor while one is contributing. Please proceed.

HON T GURIRAB: I said I will leave that to the Mover of the Motion to answer. Honourable Deputy Speaker, inequality in income and wealth in our country has increased. Inequality and poverty in our country has increased. That is to say, Deputy Speaker, as a percentage an increase in wealth is concentrated among a small proportion of Namibians, whilst the vast majority of Namibians eke out a miserable existence. Our gini-coefficient, Honourable Deputy Speaker, inequality in income and wealth in our country has increased. Inequality and poverty in our country

19 November 2008

**MOTION ON PREVAILING POVERTY
HON T GURIRAB**

has increased. That is to say, Deputy Speaker, as a percentage an increase in wealth is concentrated among a small proportion of Namibians, whilst the vast majority of Namibians eke out a miserable existence. Our gini-coefficient, that is the measure of inequality, is one of the highest in Namibia. That is only a watch.

Also maternal mortality today, more Namibians die today at birth than at Independence. That is only a watch. (Intervention)

HON SPEAKER: You may continue tomorrow. On that note, the House stands adjourned according to Rule 90 to tomorrow, 14:30.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:45 UNTIL 2008.11.20 AT 14:30

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
ASSEMBLY CHAMBER
20 NOVEMBER 2008
WINDHOEK**

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any Petitions? Any Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Notice of Questions? Notice of Motions? Ministerial Statements? The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

**COMMITTEE STAGE:
SECTIONAL TITLE BILL**

SECRETARY: Committee Stage – *Sectional Title Bill*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Does the Honourable Minister of Lands and Resettlement Move that the Assembly now goes into Committee? It is Moved that I leave the Chair. Any objection? Who seconds? Agreed to. I now call on the Chairperson of the Whole House Committee to take the Chair. Honourable Hans Booy.

ASSEMBLY IN COMMITTEE:

**DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE
COMMITTEE:** The Committee has to consider the Sectional Title Bill.

20 November 2008

**SECTIONAL TITLE BILL
HON !NARUSEB**

Clauses, Schedule and the Title put and agreed to.

ASSEMBLY RESUMES:

Bill Reported without Amendment.

THIRD READING: SECTIONAL TITLE BILL

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Does the Honourable Minister of Lands and Resettlement Move that the Bill be now read a Third Time?

HON MINISTER OF LANDS AND RESETTLEMENT: I so Move.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is Moved that I leave the Chair, any objection? Who seconds? Agreed to. Any further discussions? Does the Honourable Minister of Lands and Resettlement wish to say something?

HON MINISTER OF LANDS AND RESETTLEMENT: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members of this august House, I have prepared a response of 10 pages and I want to beg your indulgence to read it.

I want to start by most sincerely thanking you all for the understanding that you have displayed in endorsing this very technical Bill. But before I go there, thank you, Comrade Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now Put the Question that the Bill be now read a Third Time. Any objection? Agreed to. The Secretary will read the Bill a Third Time.

SECRETARY: *Sectional Titles Bill.*

**RESUMPTION OF SECOND READING: MINERALS
PROSPECTING AND MINING AMENDMENT BILL**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on Second Reading –
Minerals Prospecting and Mining Amendment Bill.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When the House adjourned on Tuesday, 18 November 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by Honourable Minister of Mines and Energy that the Bill be now read a Second Time. Honourable Dienda adjourned the Debate on behalf of Honourable Mudge and he now has the Floor.

HON MUDGE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, I have some good news and I have some bad news. The good news is that it seems to me that you can relax, I am going to occupy the front page of the *Informanté* for quite some time. The bad news is that it is not going to carry on for too long. It is a pity that there are people who fail to make a positive contribution in the country. (Interjection). Yes, I will send my bank account number to any of those of you who want to contribute.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, I just want to make a very short contribution

20 November 2008

MINERALS PROSPECTING & MINING BILL
HON NGHIMTINA

regarding this Minerals Bill. I think what we should do is just to keep in mind that mines in general are making a fairly big contribution to the state coffers, 3% royalties that they are already paying, 37% tax, another 3% social responsibility that they pay and it is fine that we want to increase this royalty, but I think what should happen, because it could be a substantial amount and we are working with people who are making a very big investment in the country and to make sure that this whole thing will be transparent all the way, my request to the Minister is that we should consider not for the Minister to determine the percentage of royalty that individual mines should pay, but that that should be responsibility and the decision by Cabinet and not the Minister and this is the contribution that I would like to make. Thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Any further discussion? Does the Honourable Minister of Mines and Energy wish to reply now?

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members. I wholeheartedly thank the *Right Honourable Prime Minister*, for supporting the sentiments regarding our natural resources and what is due to all the Namibian people. In the absence of a Minerals Act I would have gone along with the Right Honourable Prime Minister to demand royalty payments retrospective to Decree No. 1 of the United Nations. However, since we already passed the Act to provide for and regulate the exploration and the mining sector, I suppose we can only improve on those provisions to better take care of natural resources and our people.

I fully concur with the Right Honourable Prime Minister that the export of unprocessed minerals from Namibia should be a thing of the past. The levy, as discouragement mechanism, however, needs to be discussed between myself and the Honourable Minister of Trade and Industry. Comrade Prime Minister, you would recall that I proposed a close

20 November 2008

**MINERALS PROSPECTING & MINING BILL
HON NGHIMTINA**

engagement between the two of us earlier this year during the Cabinet Retreat in Walvis Bay. I shall take this up with the Honourable Minister of Trade and Industry again. We shall investigate the proposal by the Right Honourable Prime Minister on the exposition of any export levy on raw minerals from Namibia.

I have also been contemplating regulations that put a limit on the amount of unprocessed minerals that can be exported from Namibia, which is just one of the several provisions that we have in mind in the Mineral Bill that the Right Honourable Prime Minister is aware has been a priority project of my Ministry.

I also take note of the Right Honourable Prime Minister's concern regarding foreign companies digging holes here and there in the process of trying to find mineral deposits. The carelessness and the irresponsible action by exploration and mining companies to our environment has now been adequately covered in the Environmental Management Act of 2007 and its regulations.

In addition to the Right Honourable Prime Minister's response with respect to corporate responsibilities, I would like to add that companies are expected to lead a practice of good corporate citizen and participate in a wide spectrum of activities.

Honourable Mushelenga, I thank you for your support and as for the statement and the comments regarding the diamond industry, I will wait for the Report before I respond.

Honourable Kawana indeed has reserved a double role as advisor to the Government and in this particular Bill is one of the few Namibians who has expertise in mineral laws. Honourable Kawana's contribution to this Bill, through consultation, had been overwhelming and the subject of local procurement services on the goods by mining companies. This issue is highly supported. As a matter of fact, I have been informed that it is extensively dealt with in the draft TESEF Policy.

The *Honourable Helmut Angula's* example of the copper price having

20 November 2008

**MINERALS PROSPECTING & MINING BILL
HON NGHIMTINA**

plummeted is noted. However, indications are that this is temporary and that the UPALITE of the economic development for metallic metals is forecast to grow for at least the next 7 to 10 years. As for the provision in law to address the increases in the rate of royalty when the markets are very favourable, the flexibility in the law already exists and we shall monitor the mineral market closely to ensure that maximum national benefits are derived from such increases.

Honourable Angula has also made reference to value addition seemingly not enjoying full Government support. In fact, this House has on several occasions debated the subject of value addition. The current local supply of rough diamonds from NAMDEB to the cutting and polishing factories is due to Government incentives. I am proud to state that the factory in Omaruru also received financial assistance from the Mineral Development Fund operating from my Ministry to the tune of around N\$20 million. The loan was granted at a very favourable interest rate and flexible repayment terms.

With regard to manganese mines, my Report indicated that they transport concentrate indeed. The Companies have indicated in their work programmes that they will construct smelters, however the challenges such as power availability are still being investigated for appropriate solutions.

I thank Honourable Angula for his forward-thinking and contribution to the industrial development of our country. I also wish to thank *Honourable Schimming-Chase* for her positive contribution and her support. With regard to the royalty benefiting the local communities where minerals are found, I wish to state that Honourable Schimming-Chase's idea has some merit. However, where the mineral deposits are being mined do not cover all the parts of the country. Her call could breed discontent, resentment or at worst, civil unrest. The emphasis should be on a proportional distribution of wealth to our citizens and not in terms of where the natural resources are mined.

I thank *Honourable Nambahu* and give him the assurance that vigilance and pro-activeness will ensure fairness. I agree with Honourable

Nambahu that it is time that we as Government participate in the mineral sector. It is exactly for that reason that I requested Cabinet for a Government company to be established. I am pleased to inform the august House that the company has been registered, the management will soon be constituted.

We shall also continue to interrogate the current Act in order to make progress provisions in the Mineral Bill that is intended to replace the current Act of 1992. This Bill is at an advanced stage and will be tabled before this august House during next year.

Honourable Dr Iyambo (Snr) started the process to improve royalties on the rest of the minerals. I picked up where he left off and I am honoured to complete a process that he started almost five years ago when he was the Minister of Mines and Energy.

Honourable Tweya referred to EPLs covering the whole country and some companies have been almost everywhere. The fact of the matter is that the current law does not place a limit on how many EPLs any entity can apply for. If an applicant has demonstrated that it has the technical and financial resources to undertake exploration and mining and no other applications have been submitted in terms of Section 125, such applicant, I submit, deserves positive consideration. I must say that I have granted EPLs to several Namibians, but to my disappointment many have sold off to the very foreigners they complain about for short-term financial gains.

I must also express my disappointment with the inconsistency of both the public and even fellow policy-makers. At one point they are hailing foreign investment as a result of the existing favourable policies and legislation; at another they are deploring the same policies and legislations and demand urgent changes. I believe that where we see a need to change the law in the interest of our people, we should debate it openly in this House and where appropriate, amend accordingly.

The Honourable Member may have information that is not at the disposal of my Ministry, because to my knowledge, areas covered by NAMDEB licences are geologically not known to have potential for gold. In any

case, we all passed the Diamond Act of 1990 with all its provisions, particularly those providing for diamond security and the protection of those glittering stones. My caution is that we should not get excited and emotional about the operations of some Companies. Just like in my profession, NAMDEB's main expertise is in diamond exploration in mining. If NAMDEB occupies an area with potential for other minerals, such technical verifiable information should be brought forward so that my Ministry can interrogate it and where the security of diamonds is not compromised, perhaps opportunities might be given to other Companies and entities to fully explore the potential of those other minerals. I am not defending NAMDEB, but merely stating what I have come to know over the years.

Again, to my knowledge, NAMDEB does not have licences in the Kunene Region. I am also aware that a number of Honourable Members in this House are shareholders and directors on Companies that have been granted licences, but they have remained silent partners and they have little knowledge of what is actually happening on the licences.

Honourable Tweya again appears to have information that is contrary to the database of my Ministry. To the best of my knowledge, only one Company explores and mines and has a subsidiary that polishes diamonds in Namibia. NAMDEB having EPLs everywhere is not totally true, the several companies that were granted EPLs in the Caprivi and Kavango Regions have not produced any results due to the challenging environment and the limited technical and financial resources. Almost all of them have now sought partnership with NAMDEB to tap into the resources of NAMDEB to ascertain the extent of mineralisation.

I thank Honourable Viljoen for his contribution and support.

Honourable Viljoen, I would like to assure you the intention is not to punish the mining companies, but instead to enforce statutory obligations that are supposed to be met by the extractive industries for the benefit of the Namibian population. I also have knowledge of the responsibility programmes undertaken by some of the Companies, however Honourable Viljoen would appreciate that Government may not build infrastructure

purely to serve a particular Mine, but that such infrastructure is designed to service the Nation way after the mine has come to its end of life.

I will address the issue of the taxes and royalties when I comment on Honourable Amadhila's contribution.

With regard to smelters and EPZ status, I wish to point out that the smelters are EPZ projects. However the Minerals Act provides for royalties and the two must be treated separately. The Companies mining manganese in the Otjozondu area have in fact proposed in their programme to build smelters and I have mentioned before the building of smelters and that the operation required a huge amount of energy. This is currently a challenge to the Nation.

Prediction by experts is that the mineral, and particularly the metal prices, will recover and will remain profitable for the next 7 to 10 years. If we do not prepare ourselves to share in the spoils, to use Honourable Angula's expression, the train will leave us behind. I thank Honourable Viljoen for his contribution and support.

Honourable Kuugongelwa-Amadhila, thank you very much for your contribution and support. I am pleased that the Honourable Kuugongelwa-Amadhila was able to make her contribution because of her very important role in the National Budget allocations. I stand firm in support of Honourable Kuugongelwa-Amadhila that royalties are not based on profits and that it is divorced from any other statutory, fiscal or social requirement. I have already dismissed the suggestion by some companies to pay royalties based on profit.

The concern by the Honourable Member regarding the lower and higher limits is noted. However, we believe that a transparent process, comprising submission of operational Reports and financial statements should guide the Minister in making decisions that would not suffocate the businesses, while at the same time it also does not compromise the benefits to the State and our people. I have contemplated that Honourable Kuugongelwa-Amadhila and I meet to brainstorm on conducting a cost-benefit analysis where feasible, reduce the rate of company tax in favour

of increased royalties rate. I say so because I am convinced that royalties will generate more funds to the State than taxes, particularly when I look at a situation where some companies have not been paying taxes in a long time. I also thought that in extremely difficult circumstances, different royalty payments might be considered, but this will be after a thorough investigative exercise.

Honourable Kuugongelwa-Amadhila has touched on a number of significant issues regarding the implementation and the administration of the law to ensure that the statutory powers of the Minister are not eroded or compromised. I stand to consult in order to refine the formulations of the provision to ensure smooth implementation. Comrade Kuugongelwa-Amadhila, your contribution is highly valued and appreciated.

Honourable Mudge, I have taken note of what you have said, but before we impose royalties we have to take it to Cabinet. This is already the procedure and there is nothing wrong with that one.

Lastly, Honourable Deputy Speaker, with some of those constructive criticisms from some of the Members, I am pleased that this Amendment Bill has received overwhelming support from the House. My staff and I are looking forward to implementing the amendment for the betterment of the lives of our people. I thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Honourable Minister. I now Put the Question, that the Bill be read a Second Time. Any objection? Agreed to. The Secretary will read the Bill a Second Time.

SECRETARY: *Minerals Prospecting and Mining Amendment Bill.*

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:40
HOUSE RESUMED AT 16:15 PURSUANT TO ADJOURNMENT

20 November 2008

**REPORT: NAMIBIAN HARDSHIP MISSIONS
HON HOFFMANN**

**CONSIDERATION: REPORT ON VISITS TO
NAMIBIAN HARDSHIP MISSIONS**

SECRETARY: Consideration of Report of the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Security's visit to the Namibian Hardship Missions in Cuba, Ethiopia, Nigeria, Angola, Zimbabwe and the Democratic Republic of Congo.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Does the Honourable Hoffmann Move that the Report be considered?

HON HOFFMANN: Honourable Deputy Speaker, it is with great expectation that I rise to motivate the Report of the Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Security on its visits to hardship Missions in Cuba, Ethiopia, Nigeria, Angola, Zimbabwe and the Democratic Republic of Congo in August 2007 and May 2008, respectively, which was tabled in this House on the 4th of November 2008.

The Parliamentary Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Security has as its Terms of Reference and part of its oversight function over the Executive a duty to monitor, investigate, enquire into and make recommendations relating to any aspects of legislative programmes, budget rationalisation, restructuring, functioning, organisations, structure personal administration, policy formulation or any other matters it may consider relevant for the Offices, Ministries and Agencies falling within the category of affairs assigned to the Committee which shall, *inter alia*, include the following:

Ministry of Foreign Affairs;
Ministry of Defence;

Ministry of Safety and Security;
Ministry of Home Affairs and Immigration; and
National Intelligence Services.

The Report of the Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Security tabled in this august House deals with the Standing Committee's findings during its visits to the aforementioned Namibian Hardship Missions.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, it is not my intention to delve into the details of the Report that is before the House today. I have no doubt that Honourable Members have had an opportunity to peruse through the Report and, therefore, will be able to discuss the Report in detail. However, there are a number of issues contained in this Report which require attention and action of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, I should however hasten to point out here that some issues raised in this Report might already have been addressed by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. That notwithstanding, I wish to highlight some issues which my Standing Committee considers as being of great importance as they impact directly on the welfare of other diplomats at these Missions and on the general administration of the concerned Missions. They are:

Security situations at some Namibian Diplomatic Missions, such as the one in Angola, Nigeria and the Democratic Republic of the Congo. In Angola, for example, it is the understanding of the Standing Committee that diplomats in Angola are sometimes harassed by the Angolan Security Agencies while on the road in official diplomatic cars, contrary to the provisions in the relevant Vienna Conventions. If this is the case, the Standing Committee recommends that the Namibian Government, through the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, could raise this issue with its counterpart in Angola in order to ensure the safety and security of our diplomatic staff. The same should also be done in the case of Nigeria and DRC.

Communication with the headquarters from these Missions is a nightmare to say the least. It is simply very difficult to communicate with the

20 November 2008

**REPORT: NAMIBIAN HARDSHIP MISSIONS
HON HOFFMANN**

Ministry of Foreign Affairs not only to the rest of the country from these Missions. It is, therefore, recommended that the Ministry of Foreign Affairs as a matter of priority considers purchasing Cellphones for key staff members at these Missions.

In the light of the economic blockade imposed on Cuba by the Government of the United States of America, with it attendant consequences of lack of basic commodities, lack of spare parts, the socio-economic conditions in Cuba are hard. All the necessary basic commodities, spare parts and other essentials have to be imported from far-off countries, such as mainly Panama and Germany instead of importing them from nearby Miami in the USA. The Standing Committee recommends that the Ministry of Foreign Affairs considers the possibility of using the diplomatic pouch as a means by which our staff at these Missions could obtain some basic commodities from here. The Ministry should also consider buying office equipment here at home for our Mission in Cuba because the living allowance for all categories of staff and the Ambassadors is very small, considering the high cost of living in Cuba.

Given the growing number of Namibian students in that country, the Mission has been without a councillor since 2007 to deal with students' visas and other councillor matters. It is, therefore, recommended that the Ministry of Foreign Affairs urgently considers appointing a councillor at the Namibian Mission in Cuba.

In the case of Zimbabwe there is a general feeling that Namibia is downgrading her presence in that country and, therefore, something needs to be done in order to disabuse this perception, since the councillor at our Mission in Zimbabwe has not yet been replaced, thus this perception.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, it is my fervent hope that Honourable Members would discuss this Report with open minds and eventually approve it for the benefit of our staff at these Missions and for the smooth running of our concerned Missions.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, before I conclude my

20 November 2008

**REPORT: NAMIBIAN HARDSHIP MISSIONS
HON MUTORWA**

motivation, may I take this opportunity to express my thanks and gratitude to my fellow Members of the Standing Committee and the staff for their immense contribution in producing this Report. My thanks and appreciation also goes to the Heads of the Missions and their dedicated staff who assisted us during our visit to their respective Missions. I thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Any further discussion? Honourable John Mutorwa.

HON MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY:

Thank you, Comrade Deputy Speaker. I would like to commend the Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Security for the work that they have done, as contained in the Report, but also for the specific practical recommendations that they are making for the consideration of this House and eventually by the line Ministry.

I have read this Report carefully and when I looked at the findings and observations as contained in the Report, I do get the impression that more emphasis is put on, call it the shortcomings, the handicaps of specific host countries in which we have our Embassies and High Commissions. I am not a diplomat, but I know that many of these bilateral sensitive issues are normally handled through diplomatic channels. Be that as it may, I do not want us to get bogged down when we discuss this Report in discussing the shortcomings of those specific host countries and at the end of the day maybe create unintended embarrassments to those host countries. I am not implying that we should just glance over the shortcomings and hardships that our staff who are in those particular countries are experiencing and, therefore, I would like to move, if it was not already done by the Standing Committee, to take up this Report and subject it to scrutiny and action by the specific Line Ministry. Certain things are recommended here that could be done at that level. This would be my recommendation and as I said, when I read the Report I saw that much

20 November 2008

**REPORT: NAMIBIAN HARDSHIP MISSIONS
HON NAMOLOH**

emphasis is put on the shortcomings of the host countries. The sending country determines where we should open our Embassies or High Commissions and that is done by first assessing and then deciding to open a Mission in a specific country.

Comrade Deputy Speaker, seriously speaking – and I am not speaking on behalf of the Foreign Ministry, but I think we would do justice to the recommendations of this Report if the subject matter, as contained in the Report, is referred to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs for their action, as recommended. I Move.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Honourable Namoloh.

HON NAMOLOH: Thank you very much, Comrade Deputy Speaker. I would also like to thank the Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Security for this Report. Looking at the experiences they have recorded during their tour as a former Ambassador, I think little has changed since I served in some of these countries ten years ago.

In terms of Angola they mentioned the harassment of diplomats by the police, but we should not take it that it is a policy of the Government to harass diplomats in that country as this is a tendency of individual policemen who want to harass them in order to be given money.

Of course, the Report also tells us of the economic conditions in the given countries and that there is no potable water. When I was in Angola I had a very difficult time with my family as there was no water to bath. We used green water to bath. That was in Angola at that time in 1996 to 1998. You used green water to bath and the mineral water and cool drinks we drank, we ordered from Europe. There was only one flight per week to Namibia and once you ordered it from Namibia, the Customs clearance, but if you ordered through diplomatic cargo, it was cleared with less

20 November 2008

**REPORT: NAMIBIAN HARDSHIP MISSIONS
HON NAMOLOH**

hassles.

It is mentioned in the Report that cell phones have to be bought for the staff. I know very well that in the Missions in hardship countries, the Government provided very big radio stations – in Luanda, Havana, Addis Ababa, Harare and Lagos – which are very useful. They are cheap, you do not incur any costs and you can talk to Namibia, you can send messages like on a telex or on a computer, you can talk to the headquarters here and also to other Missions. I think the reason why these radios are not used today is because they are like computers and most of us fear computers. Therefore, they become white elephants and now we ask for mobile phones which are very expensive. The Ministry should determine whether these radios are still operational as they are very useful.

For instance, that time in Luanda there were no mobile phones and the telephone line between Luanda and Windhoek was non-existent. We used these radios, you could call the Ministry and be connected to your family members in Windhoek by telephone. It is very useful equipment, but I do not know whether they are still being used in the hardship countries.

On the last page they say to consider appointing councillors and Military Attaches at the Namibian Mission in Zimbabwe. The deployment of Military Attaches is the sole responsibility of the Ministry of Defence and it is considered on merit, given the activities on defence aspects we have with a particular country. It is not that we deploy them randomly as they are very expensive. We look at what military activities and relations we have with that particular country, mostly if we are buying equipment from there, how many students are being trained there and how many students are being trained at our institutions. Therefore, it is not necessarily the responsibility of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

The payment of living allowance is mentioned on Page 29. I know the Minister of Trade and Industry went to Cuba and if you pay your staff in Cuba in US Dollars, they are at a loss because in Cuba they use Euros. We thought that the US Dollar is universal, but now it has become somehow problematic.

20 November 2008

**REPORT: NAMIBIAN HARDSHIP MISSIONS
HON TJIHUIKO**

In the last Paragraph on Page 28 you are reading about Cuba and then they say, “*there is a general feeling by the host country that Namibia is downgrading her presence in Zimbabwe.*” Is it in Zimbabwe or in Cuba? The whole page talks about Cuba and then suddenly there is a small Paragraph here which states that there is a general feeling by the host country that Namibia is downgrading her presence in Zimbabwe.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, with these few observations I would want to support that these recommendations be forwarded to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I would like to request the Members to be brief and try to accommodate others. Honourable Tjihuiiko.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, when I was reading this Report there was one thing that really struck me and I was thinking that the countries we are talking about here are countries we have diplomatic relations with and they are countries that we must be careful with when we are raising issues that concern those specific countries. I do not have a problem with the content of the Report. I have a problem with the writing style of the Report. When you read it, you get a picture of a specific country and you start feeling sorry, but I do not know whether it was the intention to create that image or whether it was perhaps the language used.

I know that most, if not all, diplomats must be covered by various International Conventions and if something is not proper in that specific country, it should be raised in line with those diplomatic relations that we have with a specific country.

We are now discussing this Report in this august House and I do not know whether the diplomats of friendly countries have seen this Report and I do

20 November 2008

**REPORT: NAMIBIAN HARDSHIP MISSIONS
HON TJIHUIKO**

not know how they are going to feel when they get hold of a copy. You talk about water, you talk about the state of hospitals, you talk about security in a manner that could be differently interpreted and I think I would have put it differently. Seriously, that is my honest opinion.

If you look at point 5.4.1 on Page 6, for instance, the Namibian Diplomats do not have access to political office-bearers of the host country because of the difficulty in security appointment with them. The first impression that I got there is that the host country is avoiding seeing our diplomats. The way the Report is written will lead to different interpretations of the Report and that can easily cause some problems with some of us who are not masters in the language, like Honourable Dr Abraham Iyambo.

If I look at Page 9, point 5.6, it is about education and health. *“The Government schools in Abuja lack the required number of competent staff and facilities to provide quality education to students.”*

Point 6.82: *“Roofs of residents, including that of the High Commissioner, are leaking, including water pipes inside the walls.”* These things are not relevant to have been put in writing, but could have been explained to the relevant Ministry that indeed there are these certain problems. I think as much as we would like to see other people respecting and appreciating our difficulties, we should also do the same by showing some sensitivity. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:

On a Point of Order. I think we are treading on unchartered waters, as they say, because the concerns raised by Honourable Tjiuiko may be true, but they may be interpreted in two ways. They may be true and may also be seen differently. However, in terms of governance here, this Report is the same as the one we were debating the other day, because these are observations by Parliamentarians on these specific Missions. Therefore, when it is brought to this house of debate, it should not be construed in any way. I agree with the concern that perhaps when we are dealing with documents like this one and put them in the public domain,

20 November 2008

**REPORT: NAMIBIAN HARDSHIP MISSIONS
HON TJIHUIKO**

we must know how to deal with them, that this is not the position of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, nor that of Government of the Republic of Namibia, these are observations of Parliamentarians who were at Missions and who perhaps were using information by individuals. Let us have that backdrop that it is not a Government position.

HON TJIHUIKO: Sometimes when you read something, everyone has his own interpretation. What the Honourable Deputy Minister is saying is exactly what I was talking about. What I am saying is that if you have a Report that is being discussed at this level and it says about Angola, a friendly country: *“Given the situation, Diplomats feel insecure because of police intimidation and total disregard...”* This is the Report that is being discussed in this House, that is why I am saying that even if there are those problems, there are many ways to address those issues, but I do not think that there should be a Report that would be discussed openly about countries that we have diplomatic relations with and you are putting it the way you are putting it here. I agree with you hundred percent, but that is my view.

I am sure that yes, indeed, these are the things they have observed and made their recommendations and we need to look at the recommendations, but if you look at the recommendations, it will not address some of the issues that are highlighted here. I would, therefore, appeal that, maybe because of the time factor that we will not be able to discuss the whole Report thoroughly in this House, we may need time to consult with the Diplomats in Namibia before we decide on the actual action that we are going to take. There are things that we can do within Government and Ministries, but I think there is a serious need for us as a Government to take up the issue with the specific diplomats and see how this can be addressed in a manner that would be acceptable to all of us, because I believe that if Angola or Nigeria has written a Report about Namibia the way you have put it, I would not have been happy about it. Thank you very much.

20 November 2008

**REPORT: NAMIBIAN HARDSHIP MISSIONS
HON KAIYAMO**

HON KAIYAMO: Comrade Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. When you are part of a team, you take collective responsibility. If you read all our Reports in the past, they read the same way and before this Report was tabled, it was discussed with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs said it could be tabled. It was therefore not hijacked.

Colleagues, my warning to especially some of you who might become diplomats next year is to take care of this Report, seriously, because you might get the shock of your life and you will come back to read this Report.

I want the issue of cost of living to be noted by all of us, because if you give the same dollar to a Colleague in Zambia, in Tanzania and Egypt, is it not fair because the cost of living is not the same and the conditions are not the same. For example, in Nigeria the electricity is off every five minutes and it disturbs the television and the radios of the colleagues who are there. It means the colleagues who are in those countries are worse off than the others in other countries.

The issue of security is a reality. Colleagues in Nigeria and Ethiopia need to have security in front of their doors, but the Government of Namibia only pays for security of the Head of Mission and the other staff must pay out of their pockets while their colleagues at other Missions do not have these problems. Therefore, the cost of living must be taken into account at especially the hardship posts.

Another aspect is the Reports by the Ambassadors which are being ignored. When you yourself are there you would see.

The other point, with all respect to all former Ambassadors here, is the *bourgeoisie* mentality of some of our colleagues. All of you at a Mission were spent the SWAPO to represent the country, but now your children are being discriminated against. The Ambassador's car is supposed to pick up all the children of the Mission staff, but they only pick up the Ambassador's child and the other staff are struggling. (Intervention)

20 November 2008

**REPORT: NAMIBIAN HARDSHIP MISSIONS
HON KAIYAMO / RT HON N ANGULA**

HON TJIHUIKO: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? The point you are raising is very serious, these *bourgeoisie* Diplomats who are discriminating against others, are some of them sitting in this House or are you referring to ones who are not sitting in this House? If they are sitting in the House, please name them so that we know.

HON KAIYAMO: Those Colleagues are not in this House, I am talking from my own experience. For example, the children of the Diplomat are going to the same school and the secretary has to leave her office to go and collect her child at the same school where the Ambassador's car picked up only one child. Why do we not just take a car to pick up all the children, why this *bourgeoisie* mentality?

To my Colleagues in Cabinet, before you approve an Embassy to be established, make sure that you approve money. This Report states on Page 7: "*Embassy in Brazil, Embassy in Vienna, Embassy in Botswana, Ambassador to be appointed*", without meaning that Foreign Affairs must see whether they can get from the little money you give them to maintain these embassies. That is why I say, when we decide to open Embassies, we make sure that we give them money that time, not three years later. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: I know that the Ambassadors are appointed by the Head of State, but it does not mean that when the Ambassador is appointed he should go there if you do not have money. If you do not have the budget, you do not have the budget, do not send the person even if the person is appointed. But I know Ambassadors are appointed by Head of State, but the administration of Ambassadors is done by the Ministry.

HON KAIYAMO: You send a poor Colleague to Brazil and there is no

20 November 2008

**REPORT: NAMIBIAN HARDSHIP MISSIONS
HON LUCAS / HON DR A IYAMBO**

money even to pay electricity. He or she must take from the salaries of the staff to pay electricity and wait for three months for money to come.

This Report is the reality on the ground and we as Parliamentarians need to discuss these realities to help our colleagues whom we sent to these Missions, because they are suffering. You are there at a Mission, you cannot come home when a family member dies, you are suffering at those Missions. You are worse off. As Parliament we must support the colleagues in these Missions. I support the Report.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I thank you very much. Honourable Lukas.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, this Report addresses serious concerns. I wanted to ask the indulgence of the House to postpone this Report until the 25th of November.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Dr Abraham Iyambo.

HON MINISTER OF FISHERIES AND MARINE RESOURCES: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I will not touch on issues of Foreign Affairs, I will touch on something else which is on Page 27 and this is the Spanish airline where we have lost N\$6,7 million and we are not going to get this money back.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, according to point 11.2, the manager of Iberia Airlines in Havana for one or the other reason not known by our

delegation, failed to provide our delegation with flight tickets to Rio De Janeiro and our delegation had to reroute and in the process they had to go to London, etcetera, and according to point 11.6, the National Assembly has lost N\$6,7 million and according to Trip Travel, this money cannot be reimbursed to the State. Is it true that it is N\$6,7 million or is it a typographical error? If it is N\$6,7 million, can we not recommend that the Iberia Airline pay back to the Government of Namibia if it was a human error by one of their officials? Thank you very much.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise Honourable Nghimtina.

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: This Report is the first of its nature in our Parliament and it seems it is an administrative issue it was supposed to have been seen by the Ministry.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: According to Honourable Kaiyamo they consulted the Ministry.

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: It seems it is an administrative Report and administration is being dealt with by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. If they cannot handle the situation by themselves, they automatically have to take it to Cabinet. Cabinet has the power to allocate money if so required.

Honestly speaking, for the first time I can go along with Honourable Tjihuike that we have to be very sensitive on some issues if we are making it public. We can handle the situation as a country, there is no difficulty, but we need to have a way how to handle these issues.

20 November 2008 **REPORT: NAMIBIAN HARDSHIP MISSIONS**
HON MOONGO

As it was said by General Namoloh, the Minister of Defence, we also used to get Reports on the issue of Military Attaché's, but you have to sit down and find out ways. We go to Cabinet and then Cabinet makes a decision for us to rectify something which was not correct.

Therefore, let us in future take these Reports very seriously before we make them public. That is the only comment I have. Thank you very much.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Honourable Moongo.

HON MOONGO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, as a member of the Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Security I support the Report because it is straight to the point. This is not a political Report, it is a practical Report and it shows the wrongs and errors. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY:
On a Point of Information. I would like to remind the Honourable Member, as a member of the Committee, that he has forgotten to do two things: One, to read the Report and secondly, to sign the Report.

HON MOONGO: It is a pity that I was on a foreign mission and I could not sign it, but it is a practical Report which really shows the mistakes and we learn from mistakes. If we do not want self-criticism then we cannot improve. I support the practical Report and I thank you.

20 November 2008

**REPORT: NAMIBIAN HARDSHIP MISSIONS
HON DIENDA / HON KAAPANDA**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Dienda.

HON DIENDA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I only have two questions and the first one is on Page 9 on education and health. “*The Government schools in Abuja lack competent staff and facilities to provide quality education to students.*” Honourable Deputy Speaker, I am concerned, because recently we received a lot of teachers from Nigeria to teach our children here, so I do not know what type of quality education will we get from them if they cannot even provide quality education in their own country.

On Page 27, point 11.6, with regard to Trip Travel where it is written, “*See attached note from Trip Travel*” but there is no note attached. I want to see all the expenses of the trip and also the notes of Trip Travel. Can you please provide us with that? Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Honourable Kaapanda.

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY: Thank you very much, Comrade Deputy Speaker. I would just like to say one or two things in relation to what Honourable Kaiyamo said regarding the hardship at some of the Missions and also the lack of resources in terms of transport and security.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, let me say something on transport. It is in most cases impossible for an Ambassador’s car to provide transport to all the children at a Mission, unless maybe and if the number of children are small and all the children attend the same school. Honestly, it is a sedan car and the Ambassador has an image as somebody representing the country. (Intervention)

20 November 2008

**REPORT: NAMIBIAN HARDSHIP MISSIONS
HON KAAPANDA**

**HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT
AND CULTURE:**

On a Point of Order. I am a bit confused and if the Honourable Member who has the Floor could assist me. I must confess that I myself have not read this Report, but listening to the remarks made about inadequate teachers in a particular country, for example, are we now discussing the shortcomings or failures of a particular country where we have a Mission representing us? How does it correlate that we are doing it at such a public platform? Is it really wise for this august House to deal with Report as it is at the moment? I am not against us criticising ourselves or talking about what we are not doing for our Missions out there, but I am concerned about us discussing the shortcomings of other countries where our members are representing us. This to me is a bit dangerous and I am afraid that this debate may send out a very wrong signal to other countries.

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION

TECHNOLOGY: I totally agree with the Honourable Member.
(Intervention)

HON HOFFMANN: On a Point of Order. I just want to correct a mistake. The amount is N\$6,764 and not N\$6 million. Three members of the Standing Committee went to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs to have a discussion on this Report and the Minister advised us to table the Report here for discussion. That is the information I wanted to give. It was me myself, Honourable Mushelenga and our Principal Clerk.

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION

TECHNOLOGY: I wanted to say something on the car of the Ambassador. (Intervention)

20 November 2008

**REPORT: NAMIBIAN HARDSHIP MISSIONS
HON KAAPANDA**

**HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT,
HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:** Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Report says “*Government schools in Abuja lack the requisite number of competent staff and facilities to provide quality education to students*” and then it says, “*it was suggested that prospective Namibian students should not consider studying in Nigeria.*” It is here at 6.5.1. The first Paragraph, last sentence: “*Private schools which have the necessary facilities are very expensive, hence the diplomatic staff children are sent elsewhere or home. It was suggested that prospective Namibian students should not consider studying in Nigeria even if Nigeria offers a scholarship.*” I thought the Mission maybe went to study the conditions of Namibian Diplomats, but now we say Namibian students should not consider going to Nigeria. Then it says health services: “*Counterfeit drugs are real and constitute a major threat to the health and safety of humans.*” Are we now criticising the whole Nigerian State?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: You could have taken the Floor to address those issues.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: On a Point of Information, Comrade Deputy Speaker. I just want to correct the wrong perceptions on the Floor. This Report was never discussed with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs as is being alluded to. What the Committee came to seek from us is whether they can table this Report before the House. That is when they came, they did not come and present a copy of the said Report to the Ministry so that we could in advance know the content of the Report.

We are discussing two issues. There is a difference discussing the Report with the line Ministry and seeking permission to table the Report. I just wanted to clarify that.

20 November 2008 **REPORT: NAMIBIAN HARDSHIP MISSIONS**
HON KAAPANDA

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I want to conclude by saying... (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: On a Point of Order, Honourable Deputy Speaker. I do not know under which rule of our Standing Rules and Orders, but I will humbly request to postpone this Debate to some other time, rather than going the way we are going.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please conclude, Honourable Minister.

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY: Honourable Deputy Speaker, due to the ... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY:
On a procedural Point of Order and in light of what the Honourable Deputy Minister has just stated and she also earlier on indicated her desire to adjourn the Debate, I am rising in terms of Rule 117 to try to find out whether under the current circumstances where there are arguments and counter-arguments and to avoid any confusion, whether the Honourable Deputy Speaker could not invoke Rule 117 and accede to the request of the Honourable Deputy Minister to adjourn this Debate to another date?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: We are waiting for the Deputy Minister to give us the green light, which means to adjourn the Debate.

She is on my list. Honourable Kaapanda is the one holding us hostage. I told him that he should conclude so that we allow the Deputy Minister to adjourn.

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I was just going to propose what Honourable Mutorwa has proposed, that we should postpone this Debate. I rest my case.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Somebody has already proposed. I now call on the Deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I beg the indulgence of the House to postpone the discussion on this Report until the 25th of November 2008.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Debate stands adjourned until 25 November 2008. The Secretary will read the Fourth Order of the Day.

**RESUMPTION OF DEBATE: MOTION ON
PREVAILING POVERTY IN OUR COUNTRY**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on the Prevailing Poverty in our Country.

20 November 2008

**MOTION ON PREVAILING POVERTY
HON T GURIRAB**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When the House adjourned on Wednesday, 19 November 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by Honourable Tjihuiko. Honourable T Gurirab had the Floor and he may continue.

HON T GURIRAB: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I was about to conclude. I was saying in conclusion, talking about the present illnesses occasioned by poverty in our country and I was saying as part of that, that arising from poverty, currently more children die at birth in our country than they did at Independence. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Before you talk about infant mortality, is it true that CoD was created as a job-creation Party?

HON T GURIRAB: Honourable Deputy Speaker, our school system not only is wasteful, but has in the fashion of a lunatic jettisoned an army of ill-schooled youth with more than 50% of them dropping out for the last eighteen years at Grade 10. I was making reference to a Report yesterday in the *Namibian* newspaper of which the Colleagues on the other side of the aisle... (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: May I ask Honourable Gurirab question? Honourable cousin, I wanted to find out from you, you said infant mortality rate has increase since Independence. That is not true and you know very well that before Independence there were not these fatal diseases such as HIV/AIDS and all those diseases. They did not exist, these diseases were created somewhere and they circulated. They were not here. What is the biggest threat to our poverty? It is HIV/AIDS and you know how much money it cost us. The Minister has made revelations here about the money we spend on anti-retroviral drugs to

20 November 2008

**MOTION ON PREVAILING POVERTY
HON T GURIRAB**

prevent transmission from mother to child and why should you try to confuse the Namibian Nation? That is the truth, it has not increased at all.

HON T GURIRAB: I am happy to agree with my cousin on the HIV/AIDS related problems. I am just citing, just in case you did not have sight of this Report from the Ministry of Health. And the Ministry of Health is saying that more children today are dying at birth than at Independence.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, incidentally, the Report which I was referring to yesterday which I see my Colleague has a copy of here says that there is a direct link between levels of educational attainment and poverty. What this then means is that by allowing so many children to leave school without completing school and acquiring skills, Government is directly contributing to poverty. That is what it means. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: On a Point of Information, Comrade Deputy Speaker. I think it is fine, we can speak in this Parliament and give all the information, but one thing must be crystal clear and that is, when you deal with the statistics before Independence until Independence and from then until now, please be critical because of the level of notifications of issues at that time. I want to deal with this issue of increased infant mortality at least with that view in mind, that the notification has been limited and, therefore, to make that comparison, you may make a serious mistake. We can also critically take this Report to task, we know people come and make Reports for their own interest sake. Therefore, let us be very careful. Honourable Member, to say simply because many children are not completing their education and, therefore, it leads to malnutrition and poverty, is definitely far from speaking the truth. Take note of that, Honourable Member, seriously speaking.

20 November 2008

**MOTION ON PREVAILING POVERTY
HON T GURIRAB**

HON T GURIRAB: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I am happy with what the Honourable Minister is saying. Here we have a Government Report and what I am saying is what the Government says. It would be helpful that the Minister's notification is put in the official Report, because if that does not happen, then we will use the statistics the way you present it. What the Government Report is saying is that malnutrition has increased; what the Government Report says is that more children die at birth and these are Government statistics. (Interjections) This is a Review of Poverty and Inequality in Namibia from Central Bureau of Statistics.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, it is common cause that our school system and, therefore, our learners compare very poorly with the Regional statistics and also with those of the continent generally. Yet the youth we must rise to those policies to be skilled and better empowered would constitute a frontline in the battle against poverty. I find it incredible that we will come here and contest the Reports and this has been going on since last week, official Reports which Government generates. I find that incredible. (Interjection) If that is the case, then we must be concerned as taxpayers that our money is being wasted on meaningless Reports. If you do not believe your own Reports, what should we believe? Why should we believe anything that Government tells us, when you are wasting Government money to generate Reports which are meaningless?

Honourable Deputy Speaker, because of historical inherited low levels of skills and our wasteful education systems, we have created very few skills which do not help our citizens to fend for themselves. Often, Honourable Deputy Speaker, we rise in this Honourable House to talk about the fabulous wealth of our country. Yes, I agree, potential wealth I would say. But to paraphrase Mwalimu Nyerere again: "*If people do not have skills, they will walk around barefoot on diamonds.*" That is what happens here.

Let me conclude, Honourable Deputy Speaker, with reference to our country's Constitution. I hope the *think tank*, my good friend Abraham heads will produce Reports which are better than the one's which Government produces. I would like to cite from Chapter 2, Article 95, dealing with Principles of State Policy and I cite from Sub-clauses (e), (f),

20 November 2008

**MOTION ON PREVAILING POVERTY
HON T GURIRAB**

(g) and (i):

The state shall actively promote and maintain the welfare of the people by adopting, *inter alia*, policies aimed at the following:

- (e) Insurance that every citizen has a right to fair and reasonable access to public facilities and services in accordance with the law;
- (f) Insurance that senior citizens are entitled to and do receive a regular pension adequate for the maintenance of a decent of a decent standard of living and the enjoyment of social and cultural opportunities;
- (g) Enactment of legislation to ensure that the unemployed, the incapacitated, the indigent and the disadvantaged are accorded such social benefits and amenities as are determined by Parliament to be just and affordable with due regard to the resources of the State;
- (i) Insurance that workers are paid a living wage adequate for the maintenance of a decent standard of living and the enjoyment of social and cultural opportunities.”
(Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: On a Point of Information. Honourable Tsudao, the Chapter 11 you quoted here says, “*Principles of State Policy, Article 95, Promotion of the welfare of the people.*” It does not say that the State must provide, it says it must promote and this is exactly what we are doing. We are promoting public amenities. It does not say the State shall provide. Read your Constitution properly.

HON T GURIRAB: If you get a copy of the HANSARD, you will note that what you tried to attribute to, I have not said that, but you said I did. I can read, that is only one thing I can do.

20 November 2008

**MOTION ON PREVAILING POVERTY
RT HON N ANGULA**

Honourable Deputy Speaker, in conclusion, it is not only Napoleon's army which marches on its stomach, but democracy's very survival may depend on addressing the dehumanising poverty. That is the lesson Marie Antoinette did not learn, by saying "*give them cake.*" I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise the Right Honourable Prime Minister.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Yes, we are discussing a very, very serious issue of poverty and I want to say it is true that poverty is, number one, historical. You cannot deny that. Secondly, poverty is a class issue. Thirdly, poverty is a geographical issue in the sense that poverty is more endemic in the rural areas and poverty is gendered in the sense that women-headed households are poorer than those headed by men and above all, poverty is a race issue. That is true, there is no denying that.

However, Government has designed programmes to address this issue and it is a matter of time. I said poverty is historical if you calculate when the Germans started to alienate land from the Herero people and you cannot restore the prior situation in eighteen years. It is something you have to do over time. Therefore, the Affirmative Action Loan Scheme, the Resettlement Programme to restore land so that you can have a productive asset.

The same thing with Education: Four billion in your Budget to promote access and quality and it is a question of time.

There is a Poverty Reduction Policy of the National Planning Commission and again it is a question of time. We all recognise that we have a challenge of poverty, nobody is denying that and we have to recognise that and if you see our NDP 3, it is a pro-poor document to address exactly poverty and inequalities in our society.

20 November 2008

**MOTION ON PREVAILING POVERTY
RT HON N ANGULA**

We are not talking about a quick fix, there is no quick fix about poverty. It is a process which would take some generations to be overcome and the products of overcoming is there. While we are overcoming poverty, we have created social safety nets, one of them being the social pension, another one subvention to the orphans and vulnerable children, another one workmen's compensation. If you have all these social safety nets in the Budget, they are worth one billion just to create that safety net while we are dealing with the fundamental issue of poverty, but the Government is aware and the Government is committed to address poverty over time. That is the message.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. In terms of Rule 90 of our Standing Rules and Orders, the House stands adjourned until, Tuesday, 25 November 2008.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:45 UNTIL 2008.11.25 AT 14:30

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
ASSEMBLY CHAMBER
25 NOVEMBER 2008
WINDHOEK**

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

**ANNOUNCEMENT: VACANCY IN THE
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Announcement, Honourable Members. A vacancy has occurred in the National Assembly as a result of the resignation of Mr Ben Ulenga in terms of Article 48(1)(c) of the Constitution with immediate effect.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any Petitions? Any Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers?

**TABLING: ANNUAL REPORT 2007-2008
EMPLOYMENT EQUITY COMMISSION**

HON MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE:
Comrade Deputy Speaker, I lay upon the Table, the Annual Report 2007/2008 of the Employment Equity Commission.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please table the Report. I recognise Honourable Hausiku.

25 November 2008

**REPORTS AND PAPERS
HON HAUSIKU**

**TABLING: AFRICAN UNION COMMISSION
QUOTA LIST**

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: I lay upon the Table the African Union Commission (Namibia) quota list and list of nationals deployed at the Headquarters of the African Union Commission

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please table the Report. Notice of Questions? Notice of Motions?

NOTICE OF MOTIONS

HON T GURIRAB: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I give Notice that tomorrow, 26 November 2008, I shall Move that this Honourable House discusses the increasing political violence in our country and expresses its concern. I so Move.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Table the Motion. Ministerial Statements? The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

**COMMITTEE STAGE: CONTROLLED WILDLIFE PRODUCTS
AND
TRADE BILL**

25 November 2008

WILDLIFE PRODUCTS & TRADE BILL
HON NANDI-NDAITWAH

SECRETARY: Committee Stage – *Controlled Wildlife Products and Trade Bill.*

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Does the Honourable Minister of Environment and Tourism Move that the Assembly now goes into Committee?

HON MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM: I so Move.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is Moved that I leave the Chair. Any objection? Who seconds? I now call on the Acting Chairperson of the Whole House Committee to take the Chair, Honourable Bayer.

ASSEMBLY IN COMMITTEE:

DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: The Committee has to consider the *Controlled Wildlife Products and Trade Bill.*

Clauses, Schedules and the Title put and agreed to.

ASSEMBLY RESUMED:

Bill Reported without Amendments.

25 November 2008

**WILDLIFE PRODUCTS AND TRADE BILL
HON NANDI-NDAITWAH**

**THIRD READING: CONTROLLED WILDLIFE
PRODUCTS AND TRADE BILL**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Does the Honourable Minister Move that the Bill be now read a Third Time?

HON MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM: I so Move.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection? Who seconds? Agreed to. Any further discussions? None. Does the Honourable Minister of Environment and Tourism wish to say something?

HON MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members. I would like to thank all of you for your support in passing this Bill in the National Assembly and I rely on your support when we are finally going to implement this Bill when it becomes a law, to make sure that as a Nation we benefit from our natural resources, both the fauna and flora. I thank you very much.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now Put the Question that the Bill be now read a Third Time. Any objection? Agreed to. The Secretary will read the Bill a Third Time.

SECRETARY: *Controlled Wildlife Products and Trade Bill.*

25 November 2008

**MINERALS PROSPECTING & MINING
AMENDMENT BILL
HON NGHIMTINA**

**COMMITTEE STAGE: MINERALS PROSPECTING AND
MINING AMENDMENT BILL**

SECRETARY: Committee Stage – *Minerals Prospecting and Mining Amendment Bill.*

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Does the Honourable Minister of Mines and Energy Move that the Assembly now goes into the Committee?

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: I so Move.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is Moved that I leave the Chair. Any objection? Who seconds? I now call on the Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Bayer, to take the Chair.

DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: The Committee has to consider the Minerals Prospecting and Mining Amendment Bill.

Clauses and the Title put and agreed to.

ASSEMBLY RESUMED:

Bill Reported without Amendment.

25 November 2008

**MINERALS PROSPECTING & MINING
AMENDMENT BILL
HON NGHIMTINA**

**THIRD READING: MINERALS PROSPECTING AND MINING
AMENDMENT BILL**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Does the Honourable Minister Move that the Bill be now read a Third Time?

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: I so Move.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any objection? Who seconds? Agreed to. Any further discussions? Does the Honourable Minister of Mines and Energy wish to say something?

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: Thank you very much, Honourable Members, for supporting the utilisation of the Namibian resources in the best interest of all the Namibian people. We need your support once we are going to implement this very important Bill and we hope that once we are working together, our country will accrue more than what we are receiving today. Thank you very much.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now Put the Question, that the Bill be now read a Third Time. Any objection? Agreed to. The Secretary will read the Bill a Third Time.

SECRETARY: *Minerals Prospecting and Mining Amendment Bill.*

**CONSIDERATION: REPORT ON VISITS TO
HARDSHIP NAMIBIAN MISSIONS**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Consideration of Report of the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Security on visits to Hardship Namibian Missions abroad.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When this Debate was adjourned on Thursday, 20 November 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Hoffman, that the Report be adopted. The Honourable Deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs adjourned the Debate and she now has the Floor.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, with your permission, may I revert the Floor to Honourable Ida Hoffmann, the Deputy Chairperson of the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Security?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Honourable Hoffmann.

HON HOFFMANN: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, in terms of Rule 33(d) of the Standing Rules and Orders, I Move that the Motion on the discussion of the Report be withdrawn with the concurrence of the House. I so Move, Honourable Deputy Speaker.

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON PREVAILING POVERTY
HON TJIHUIKO**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Table the Motion. The Motion is withdrawn. The Secretary will read the Fourth Order of the Day.

**RESUMPTION OF DEBATE: MOTION ON PREVAILING
POVERTY IN THE COUNTRY**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on the Prevailing Poverty in our Country.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When the House adjourned on Wednesday, 19 November 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by Honourable Tjihuiiko. The House adjourned in terms of Rule 90. Any further discussion? If none, does the Honourable Tjihuiiko wish to reply?

HON TJIHUIKO: Thank you very much, Honourable Deputy Speaker. Before I start, I just wanted to ask the Honourable Deputy Speaker, that I am concluding and according to the Rules, you are not supposed to be disrupted while concluding. I hope I will have your protection.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, allow me, first and foremost, to thank everybody who has contributed to this very important Motion, a Motion that was meant to challenge the collective wisdom of the people's representatives in this august House, a Motion that has given the Ruling Party, in particular, and the Namibian Nation, in general, to critically evaluate Government Policies and Programmes on poverty alleviation in all 13 Regions.

I will fail in my duty, Honourable Deputy Speaker, if among the many contributors I do not give a special vote of thanks to *Honourable Tsudao*

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON PREVAILING POVERTY
HON TJIHUIKO**

Gurirab for his outstanding and informative presentation or contribution.

Looking at the US Government statistics on poverty in this beautiful country of ours, the picture is grim and one of hopelessness, because it has become clear that Government Policies and Programmes on poverty reduction did not bear the desired fruits.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, poverty is real in Namibia, it is increasing at an alarming rate. This is evidenced by the uncontrolled mushrooming of shanty towns all over the country. Let us look at the Incidence of Poverty by Region, 2003-2004 Report by the National Planning Commission's Statistical Department.

Kavango Region, 56.5% of the people in Kavango are classified as poor and I am looking at these statistics because I remember that we were discussing the Motion on Karas and in that discussion I said that before we look at the overall picture of the country, we may come up with misrepresentation of poverty or the suffering of our people in our country.

In Kavango Region 56.5% are classified as poor, 36.7% are severely poor.

REGION	POOR	SEVERLY POOR
Ohangwena Region	44.7%	19.3%
Oshikoto Region	40.8%	16.6%;
Hardap Region	32.1%	21.9%
Omusati Region	31%	12.8%
Caprivi Region	28.6%	12.5%
Omaheke Region	30.1%	17.5%
Otjozondjupa Region	27.8%	15.8%
Kunene Region	23%	
Karas Region	21.9%	12.5%
Oshana Region	19.6%	12.8%
Erongo Region	16.3%	4.8%
Khomas Region	6.3%	2.4%

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON PREVAILING POVERTY
HON TJIHUIKO**

These are the statistics that we were referring to the other day, so poverty in Namibia is not Regionally based, it is an overall problem and it needs an overall approach.

Again, Honourable Deputy Speaker, for us to have a clear picture of poverty in Namibia, let us again look at the Incidence of Poverty by language spoken in households 2003-2004.

Khoisan is the poorest, 59.7% are poor and 39% are classified as severely poor.

Rukavango – 53.4% are classified as poor and 34.9% are severely poor.

Damara>Nama – 34.2% poor and 21.4% severely poor.

Caprivi – 24.5% poor and 10.8% severely poor.

Otjiherero – 17% are classified as poor and 8% severely poor.
(Interjections) You are not listening, that is why you do not follow what I am saying. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Member be serious, how could the language be poor?

HON TJIHUIKO: It is a problem of not listening. I said, let us look at incidences of poverty by main language. Therefore, I do not have to say Otjiherero language, it is obvious, unless you are coming from outer space. It is a Government Report and it is stated like that in your Government Report. The problem is that they do not look at their own Reports.

Oshivambo – 25.8% poor; 11.8% severely poor.

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON PREVAILING POVERTY
HON TJIHUIKO**

Afrikaans – 7.9% poor; 3.5% severely poor.

English – 0.6% poor; 0.4% severely poor.

German – 0.0% are classified as poor and 0.0% classified as severely poor.

These are the statistics of the Central Bureau of Statistics of the National Planning Commission.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the 13 Regional Poverty Profile by the National Planning Commission is another case in point. Poverty in Namibia is increasing at an alarming rate simply because of lack of Government Policies and Programmes. It is simply because of the fact that the Ruling Party has failed and they have failed completely to implement Government Policies and Programmes. That is the reason why we have this situation in this country. The policies are there, good policies, nicely done, they are there in all the Ministries but there is nobody to implement them because of the lack of political will of the Ruling Party to implement their own policies and programmes.

To implement Government Policies and Programmes needs one thing and one thing only and it is to have the people with ability to do the job. If you opt to employ incapable people from your Region, from your village, a card-carrying member of your Party, what do you expect? Obviously, if you plant a cabbage you will eat cabbage and this is the cabbage that you are eating now.

What we are experiencing now, Honourable Deputy Speaker, is what SWAPO has planted for eighteen years. If you plan to create employment and to fight poverty, you do it in policies and programmes and implement those policies and programmes. If the Ruling Party's plans and strategies were the ones to create employment opportunities, instead of creating jobs for pals, then those who do not have family and friends in positions will end up at the street corners.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, to illustrate my point, let us look at the

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON PREVAILING POVERTY
HON TJIHUIKO**

recently announced SWAPO think-tank under the chairmanship of my good friend, Dr Abraham Iyambo. Let us look at that critically. This Committee was loaded with the very same Permanent Secretaries who have been given an opportunity to implement Government policies for the last 18 years. The very same people have been given an opportunity to think and they have proven that they cannot think. How could you have given them an opportunity for 18 years and they have not done anything and you now give them an opportunity to think? That was a mistake.

I believe that the Ruling Party has so many people, they could have brought in new blood to look at what has been done for the last 18 years critically and to make the necessary recommendations. How could a Permanent Secretary evaluate him or herself to make recommendations for him or herself to implement what they have not done in 18 years? That is the problem that has created poverty in this country, Honourable Deputy Speaker.

If one looks at the problem of non-implementation of Government Policies and Programmes in order to fight poverty and I think we should listen very carefully because it is very important for you to take note of the fact that the problem is not the one of producing documents. If you go to Swakopmund, the Cabinet Retreat will produce documents, Vision 2030, National Planning Commission documents, but when are they going to be implemented to fight poverty? (Interjections) We need to fight poverty, we do not need to sit back and say that we have produced documents and good policies. Good policies are only good if they are implemented and have results.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, if Government was or is concerned with the state of affairs, they should have brought in people with knowledge to take charge of the situation. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY:

I want to refer the Honourable Deputy Speaker to Rule 114(c).

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON PREVAILING POVERTY
HON TJIHUIKO**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Minister, do not mislead us. It does not apply when somebody is replying. It is the same as a Minister who is responding to a Bill. He is responding.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, if Government was or is concerned about the state of affairs in Government, then they could have brought in people with knowledge in the various sectors of economy, professionals who could have evaluated the performance or lack thereof, think critically and advise Government.

Before I conclude, Honourable Deputy Speaker, our Government decided to create a think-tank of the very same people who are on all the Boards, the very same people... (Interjections). It is the Ruling Party, so that is why we have a problem of implementing Government Policies and Programmes. You put the same person as the police officer, as the prosecutor and as everything and I do not think that is the best way.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, looking at the current statistics on poverty in this country... (Intervention)

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE,
SPORT AND CULTURE:** Honourable Deputy Speaker, I am rising under Rule 126, Point of Privilege.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, the people are crying, people are hungry, people are poor and the Ministers are behaving in that fashion, they just do not care about what is happening to their people. They are not serious about these issues.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, look at the current statistics on poverty in this country, no Region, no language group was spared from extreme

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON PREVAILING POVERTY
HON TJIHUIKO**

poverty in this Land of the Brave, but Government has decided to spend plus minus N\$2.3 billion under the MCA in one area. The bulk of the money will support the one area, but no Region is spared from poverty in this country. The criteria that were used to come to the decision is not known to us, all what we know is that south of the red line should not be a priority area to the Ruling Party.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, let me conclude by proposing – and I think this is very important – that the National Planning Commission should as a matter of urgency call a national convention or conference on poverty. Let us give the Namibian people an opportunity, a chance to express themselves. We have failed and we have failed miserably, let us get new ideas from the people themselves. It is very important for the National Planning Commission to organise that conference or workshop as a matter of urgency. Unless the people’s representatives accept the fact that our people are poor and we are serious about it, then the poor people will not continue watching them swimming in wealth while their children are sleeping hungry. Unless we do something, there is going to be a revolution. There is going to be a revolution whether we like it or not, enjoy your privileges today, tomorrow there will be a situation where all of us, Opposition as well as the Ruling Party, may not be in a position to control them. But you will take the blame because the people of this country has given you a responsibility to take care of them and you have failed them.

If we continue ignoring the plight of the people, democracy and rule of law will not mean anything to a hungry person and very angry person.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, with this I hope that this House will support this Motion and move to the point where we are going to address the problems of our people. Thank you very much.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Honourable Tjihuiiko. I now put the Question that the Motion be adopted. Any objection? (Interjections) The Motion says at the end, “*to discuss the*

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON PREVAILING POVERTY
HON NUJOMA / HON DR KAWANA**

current prevailing poverty, hunger and disease prevalent in our country. I wish to request the relevant Ministries and Departments to update this august House on the implementation of those goals as to address poverty in Namibia.” That is all. That is the request of the Motion and it ends up there. Maybe the Ministries will take the responsibility of updating the House. (Interjections). I have to divide the House if there is objection.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, we are objecting to the remarks made in this House by Honourable Tjihuiko. That is what we are rejecting to. The reply is utter nonsense, nonsensical and rejected with the contempt it deserves.

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, you read the original Motion which did not require voting for any action, but it is for those relevant Ministries to take note and, therefore, in my humble opinion there is no need to put the Question. The Debate has been concluded and those Ministries are tasked to address poverty, not along the lines of the content of the speech, which is political propaganda and uncalled for, but within the policies of the Government as adopted from time to time by this House and those Ministries will take note of the assignments given to them to address poverty, including our Budget, which is a *pro-poor* Budget. Along those lines we take note, Comrade Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Agreed to, the Ministries will take responsibility. The Secretary will read the Fifth Order of the Day.

**RESUMPTION OF DEBATE:
MOTION ON OLD-AGED PENSIONS**

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON OLD-AGED PENSIONERS
HON MOONGO**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on Water Debts Owed to NamWater by Communal Farmers.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When the House adjourned on Thursday, 16 October 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by Honourable Tjihuike. Honourable Moongo adjourned the Debate and he now has the Floor. Honourable Moongo.

HON MOONGO: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. Allow me to condemn the violence in Outapi by the SWAPO members. And I appeal to the Police to arrest those members who are involved in disturbing peace and disrupting meetings. Honourable Deputy Speaker, it is a pity that the SWAPO Party is always inciting the smaller Parties within the DTA to resign from our Party.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:40

HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:15 PURSUANT TO ADJOURNMENT

HON MOONGO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, this Motion used to be a DTA Motion, as everybody knows, and hopefully SWAPO also influenced NUDO to take over the Motion. As everybody knows, NUDO usually fights DTA while they hijacked the Motion. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: May I ask Honourable Moongo a question? Honourable Moongo, can you advise this House, can an Official Opposition be an Official Opposition without a head? Is it possible?

25 November 2008

MOTION ON OLD-AGED PENSIONERS
HON MOONGO

HON MOONGO: I think it will be in my speech. That is why they hijacked the Motion and every positive issue from the DTA. Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, it is historically known that NUDO is a tribal Party while the DTA is a multi-national Party. I would like to congratulate the Ministry and the company who increased pay-points... (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, may I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable Moongo, I am not sure whether you said NUDO is a tribal Party, are you aware that the DTA was formed out of the eleven tribal groups in Namibia with an objective to fight and prevent real Independence of this country?

HON MOONGO: Well, I am aware that the DTA brought many people from different backgrounds together, because they hated each other and South Africa divided them. Then they brought the people together and I think that was the first step towards unity in Namibia.

I would like to congratulate the Ministry and the Company who increased pay-points of the elderly people. Let the Ministry educate the pensioners to use the Village Committee and the elders of the churches if they do not have anyone in their families to help them.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, Namibia has a comprehensive law against victimisation. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: On a Point of Order. The Honourable Moongo is addressing the wrong Motion. Due to the powers vested in the Deputy Speaker, the Sixth Order was changed to the Fifth. Now he is talking

25 November 2008

MOTION ON OLD-AGED PENSIONERS
HON MOONGO

about pensions. I want the Honourable Deputy Speaker to Rule the Honourable Member Out of Order.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Honourable Deputy Minister is Out of Order, because number 5 is on pensions and it is what he is addressing. In my book here the numbering is different.

HON MOONGO: I was saying that Namibia has a comprehensive law against victimisation, also against indecent and degrading treatment. Therefore, I do not want to see pensioners being transported in wheelbarrows to the pay-points. I am also disturbed when I see very old people coming to the pay-points in wheelbarrows and some even dying while waiting in long queues. They died in an indecent and disrespectful way and this must come to an end, let us find another way of addressing this problem.

Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, the old-age people must be exempted from paying for hospitals, water, electricity and church fees. They must be exempted from paying VAT. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: On a Point of Information on the serious allegation by Honourable Moongo that the senior citizens are being charged at hospitals. To the contrary, we made a statement last year and this year all senior citizens, orphans and vulnerable children will no longer pay user fees at hospitals and all our facilities. I do not know where he is getting this information from. Thank you.

HON MOONGO: That was just spoken, it was not implemented. As

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON OLD-AGED PENSIONERS
HON MOONGO**

the Colleague said, SWAPO failed at the implementation, therefore it was only verbal. They must be exempted from any tax when they buy. SWAPO instigated some officials to declare some elderly people dead and to terminate their pensions without a death certificate and take the money. That is clearly corruption. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Honourable Member is really Out of Order. Why? Can he show this House an order given by the SWAPO-led Government to people to declare their elderly dead? If it is happening, we need to instruct the police to arrest the Honourable Member because he allows crimes to take place and then come and make false allegations without any basis. Honourable Moongo, please, I am always asking you to become mature and grown-up. You are just like a child, honestly.

HON MOONGO: Who is the child now? Is it the one beating up people while we have a Code of Conduct, while we have Article 17 which allows Political Parties to have public meetings? You are behaving like a child. I have knowledge that there are people who were declared dead... (Interjections).

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Member, seriously, if you do not have proof that a Political Party declared people dead while still alive, are you being serious?

HON MOONGO: I am serious, I have the names, come to my office and consult. (Intervention)

25 November 2008

MOTION ON OLD-AGED PENSIONERS
HON MOONGO

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, I need it tomorrow, bring it tomorrow.

HON MOONGO: Yes, I have the names of people who were declared dead and I already had to revive... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY: I am rising on a Point of Order, a serious one for that matter. I am referring to the Rules, and Rule 108(g) on Page 68 sets certain general restrictions that are applicable to us as Honourable Members when we debate issues here. The Honourable Member says he has the facts outside, but this Rule is very clear that an Honourable Member is restricted, "*may not refer to the names of persons or any statement of fact unless they are deemed necessary to render the question intelligible and can be authenticated.*" I would like to appeal through you, Honourable Deputy Speaker, that your Office there should apply this Rule so that we have an intelligible Debate on a serious matter like this one. Thank you.

HON MOONGO: Usually the policy of SWAPO is that the top officials should be SWAPO cadres, and therefore I am saying this is done in the companies. Those are SWAPO members, every top official in every directorate is a SWAPO and that is why I say, any mistake by them is a mistake by SWAPO.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Honourable Member made a statement that old people even died in wheelbarrows

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON OLD-AGED PENSIONERS
HON MOONGO**

while waiting to receive their pension. It is a very serious statement. He is an Honourable Member and the Nation is listening. Can the Honourable Member come with facts, where, when and who these elderly people were who died in wheelbarrows while waiting for his or her pension. We cannot entertain irresponsible and unintelligent statements. It is degrading this House, it is an insult to the Members of this House. Honourable Deputy Speaker, I will plead that we must deal with issues and these are not cheap politics. I rest my case.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Member, please read your speech.

HON MOONGO: I appeal to the Colleague to visit pay-points so that you see the wheelbarrows and that the old people are brought to the pay-points in wheelbarrows. I even assisted them. My goodness, you do not visit the pay-points!

I, therefore, appeal to the Government to bring these things to an end. The elderly people must no come to the pay-points anymore. Find another way, consult the committees and the headmen or the church to assist, so that these malpractices can stop.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Members of the DTA of Namibia introduced Article 95(f). (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY: On a Point of Information. The Honourable Member made an incorrect allegation that all the directors in Government are members of Swapo. That is not true. Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Honourable Member should not use this platform, this august House, to

25 November 2008

MOTION ON OLD-AGED PENSIONERS
HON MOONGO

mislead the public out there that all the directors in Government are members of SWAPO. It is not true and he knows it.

HON MOONGO: The DTA of Namibia introduced Article 95(f) of the Constitution because they knew that the Members of Parliament will ignore the plight and the suffering of their parents. The Members of Parliament will underpay them and that is why they put this article in the Constitution which says that the senior citizens are entitled to receive an adequate pension for the maintenance of a decent standard of living and enjoy social and cultural opportunities. What is N\$450 per month? (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY: On a Point of Information. Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Moongo indicated that even he himself assisted an elderly person in a wheelbarrow who eventually died. I do not know who is really to be blamed if that elderly person is sick and that is why he or she died. Why is it that a person who is sick, who cannot stand by him or herself, is taken to the pay-point, whereas there are procedures that elderly people who cannot walk may appoint representatives officially to receive the pension on their behalf? What is the Honourable Member really trying to tell the people?

HON MOONGO: Even yesterday I went to a certain pay-point and I helped to lift somebody who could not stand on his own. I, therefore, want the Ministry to educate the pensioners and the community to understand... (Intervention)

25 November 2008

MOTION ON OLD-AGED PENSIONERS
HON MOONGO

HON DEPUTY PRIME MINISTER: I was told that Honourable Moongo goes to pay-points and he is looking particularly for very old people to use his wheelbarrow, yet the Honourable Member has a car. Why does he not take his car to the pay-points and help the elderly?

HON MOONGO: I appeal to the Ministry to identify those who are not able to stand and those very, very old people be helped by the headmen or by the church. I appeal to you and you do not want to listen. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: I want to give a bit of information. Honourable Deputy Speaker, I really appreciate that Honourable Moongo seems to be concerned about the plight of our elderly, the pensioners, but of course, he seems to be misrepresenting the truth in this House. The Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare has a system whereby people who are so sick or who are so old that they cannot reach the pay-points by themselves, can appoint people who can represent them, authorised by them and these are the people who go there. The cases that he might be referring to might relate to something else. One of our challenges we have is the misuse of the pensioners' funds, especially by business people who own shebeens. These are the very people whom you find being carried in wheelbarrows from the bottle stores after the money has been taken. That is a big challenge. The one big challenge we have is that the Government is doing well, having increased these grants from N\$30, N\$50 at Independence to N\$450 today. It is progress. It is not satisfactory but this is something worthwhile. There are very few countries in the sub-Region that are doing this. The concern is that especially leaders, church leaders, Traditional Leaders like Mr Moongo, to help to educate our people how to utilise this money and not to put up structures like shebeens and others that would be utilising these moneys. We also appeal to the young people not to drop their kids with the old people so that they do not utilise the pension for their own survival but to

25 November 2008

MOTION ON OLD-AGED PENSIONERS
HON MOONGO

maintain the grandchildren.

I must also inform that the Ministry has invited all the Regional Councillors of the 13 Regions of our country, wanting them to provide names of places where we can establish new pay-points in order to address the situation of long distances that people travel. The Regional Councillors and constituency councillors are responding to this request and the situation will improve.

When the term of the current service provides comes to an end during the middle of next year, the new system is going to be more friendly to the old people. But we need the Traditional Leaders and community leaders to help the old people to utilise this money for their own survival and for betterment of their lives as opposed to using this money for bottle stores and shebeens. Thank you very much.

HON MOONGO: It is a pity that the majority of Traditional Leaders have no cars but only wagons and wheelbarrows. I requested the Traditional Authorities to be given transport and you rejected it here. They are still using wheelbarrows and wagons. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: May I ask a question? What do you do with your *Ompale*, what do you use it for?

HON MOONGO: *Ompale* is an appreciation shown once a year. Everybody who harvested can give to a king the smallest that he can, a little mahangu or something from his harvest of the whole year as a blessing to the king. That is a tradition, we cannot avoid it. That is not enough to cater for all problems.

I was saying that no human can survive on N\$450 monthly. The health of

25 November 2008

MOTION ON OLD-AGED PENSIONERS
HON MOONGO

elderly people prevent them from cultivating food or to generate any income. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: May I put a question to the Honourable Member? Is it not the case, Honourable Moongo that the employees of Uukumwe are paid less than N\$450 per month?

HON MOONGO: I invite the Colleagues during Christmas to come and visit, so that you can be impressed and also try to have a sound business like that one. Uukumwe already employs 80 people who were unemployed, who were neglected by the Government. It is a pity to dispute that.

The pensioners cannot afford to pay for tractors to plough their mahangu fields with such little amounts of money and I hereby request the commission of inquiry to investigate the living standards of the parents of Members of Parliament, because it seems you do not want to help your parents. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Honourable Moongo, may I ask you a question? Is it true that you are overcharging the elderly with your tractor?

HON MOONGO: Uukumwe is the only one which helps the elderly people to cultivate, because the Government used to pay little money. (Intervention)

25 November 2008

MOTION ON OLD-AGED PENSIONERS
HON MOONGO

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: Is it allowed for an Honourable Member to promote or advertise his business in this august House?

HON MOONGO: It is from the side of SWAPO. You are interested in hearing about Uukumwe and you are the ones promoting it, because you did not start anything. I, therefore, request the commission of inquiry to investigate the living standards of the parents of Members of Parliament, how they live. It seems you are ignorant, your parents are in the cold, they are in the sun and I want an investigation. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Honourable Member is really provoking the situation, forgetting that he built Uukumwe through slush funds which they were given to prevent the Independence of this Land of the Brave. The Honourable Member must not forget that he used to travel with Savimbi to Ndjamba where they went to steal diamonds and ivory. You must return those things to the Angolan owners.

HON MOONGO: The Colleague never saw me trying to smuggle diamonds. I am doing honest business as a small business person, I struggled on my own and I made it. But you only beat up the people in Outapi and paid them to cause disorder, which is prohibited in Namibia. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: You are saying there must be an investigation about how our parents are living and I am happy about that, but passing at Onamulunga police roadblock near your parents' house, why did you move away from there?

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON OLD-AGED PENSIONERS
HON MOONGO**

HON MOONGO: If you want to establish a business you must be hardworking. If you consult me, I will give you some information on how to establish a sound, progressive business. I do not want to tell everybody.

Some elderly people who used to receive their pension through the bank have to wait two, three months for the money and they are suffering. I request the Ministry to investigate as those who are paid through the bank are suffering. I would like a change and I therefore, request that the elderly people's pension must be increased to N\$1,000 per month in order to cater for their daily needs and proper food. As everybody knows, elderly people are sickly, they need transportation and they have to attend hospitals and clinics. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: On a Point of Order. Honourable Moongo is supposed to help the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare. If what he said really is the truth about people getting their money through the bank, he as a leader was supposed to approach the Minister with the names and dates and we would value your contribution as a Headman. You should not only talk and talk, you do not solve problems that way. If that is true, bring that information to the Ministry. You can even give us the correct information now and we can just call the office and they can trace those people. Do not always come with propaganda, Honourable Moongo, you will not gain anything.

HON MOONGO: I do not want my time to be wasted because of long speeches, I thought he was asking a question, but he can investigate in many Regions, not one Region. It is not one or two people, it is more than two hundred people and countrywide, it is more than that. We really need assistance from the Government to either educate the old-aged people and to educate the Headmen to assist. I appeal to the Ministry which deals with these elderly people's pension to assist and to educate them on how

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON OLD-AGED PENSIONERS
HON TJIHUIKO**

to get help, so that all these things I mentioned here today can come to an end. Please, otherwise it is not a good thing and we do not want to see people next year coming to the pay-points in wheelbarrows. We do not want to see that.

I, therefore, appeal for the elderly people to get a better life, although this Motion was being hijacked by NUDO members. I support the Motion.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any further discussion? Does Honourable Tjihuiko wish to reply?

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I seek your indulgence to give my response tomorrow afternoon.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The response will be tomorrow. The Secretary will read the Sixth Order of the Day.

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS OWED TO
NAMWATER BY COMMUNAL FARMERS**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on Water Debts Owed to NamWater by Communal Farmers.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When the House adjourned on Wednesday, 29 October 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Venaani. Honourable Riruako had the Floor

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON KAZENAMBO**

and he may continue. Any further discussion? Honourable Kazenambo.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL
GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:**

Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members. I want to make my contribution on this Motion, the issue of water debts owed to NamWater by communal farmers.

I have carefully listened to the Mover of the Motion and I also carefully listened to the intervention by the Deputy Minister of Agriculture, Honourable Katali and I want to make my contribution on this Motion based on my experience on the ground, not necessarily confining myself to the water debts owed to NamWater by the communal communities from the Okamatapati area, but generally the debts owed to NamWater across the country, but also touching briefly on the Okamatapati area.

The history of the debt in the Okamatapati area or Okakarara area is a regrettable situation in my view, regrettable that at one point, instead of having stakeholder collaboration or cooperation with the intention to solve the problem, there was dishonesty from certain quarters. At one point some members of the community were used as political shields and water became a political issue where some Parties were trying to use this water situation as a tool. (Interjection)

HON MEMBER: Name them!

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL
GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:** DTA

for example and that time it was in collaboration with NUDO. They were using this water issue, unfortunately and sadly, and this sometimes happens in African politics where poor communities are used by politicians who mislead them. (Intervention)

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON KAZENAMBO**

HON TJIHUIKO: May I ask the Honourable Deputy Minister a question? Honourable Deputy Minister, I want to get you right. Did you say that the DTA was the one who was responsible for telling people not to pay for water? I just want to get the picture clear.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Including NUDO. Proceed.

HON MOONGO: On a Point of Order. Is it allowed to misinform the House? While the Colleague was in Botswana he already knew what DTA was doing here? Is it allowed to mislead the House?

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL
GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:**

Some confusion was raised in the minds of certain people. I was born in Botswana but the time the Honourable Member is referring to, I was a full-uniformed PLAN combatant, hitting hard against South African lackeys, puppets, betrayers, who betrayed the liberation struggle, snakes, cowards, irresponsible political cockroaches, mercenaries. (Intervention)

HON MOONGO: On a Point of Order. Does he refer to the Parties in Namibia or can he withdraw all those words? He is insulting the people and the Parties of Namibia. He is insulting the people, he is insulting the Parties and he is accusing the Parties of being puppets. Are those really words needed in this House? Is that the attitude he has? This must come to an end to provoke the situation. We do not want war anymore. You were a coward, you never fought and I was a commander. You were fighting the war in Botswana, you were not at the front, you are lying!

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON KAZENAMBO**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Members, can you stick to the Motion?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: In our journey to where we have arrived, there were persecution and killings and this process resulted in some people being born in exile. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: Do you recall that one day late Honourable Maxuilili was calling Comrade Riruako a puppet and then the late Honourable Tjitendero said, "*Honourable Maxuilili, can you please withdraw*" and Honourable Maxuilili said, "*I withdraw, but he is still a puppet.*"

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: But we do not encourage that nowadays. Honourable Deputy Minister, please talk on the debts owed to NamWater.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I will talk to the Motion, but as I am talking to the Motion, Honourable Deputy Speaker, bear with me. It has become a punching bag, it has become politics. When the puppets of the former mercenaries are pushed into a corner, they tend to use those who were born in Botswana as if they are not citizens of this country. These politics emanate from NUDO, Tjihuike has said it in this House, Moongo has referred to it, but this puppet... (Intervention)

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON KAZENAMBO**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Member, please this story of “*puppet*”, I know I once made myself guilty of using that word “*puppet*”, but please, can we avoid that?

HON TJIHUIKO: On a Point of Information. Honourable Deputy Speaker, I have listened to the Honourable Deputy Minister’s contribution with great interest. The first thing that I have seen is that the Honourable Deputy Minister has nothing to say and as usual he just stood up to say something. He is referring to NUDO. NUDO was not by then and when we are talking about puppets, when you are naming people like Chief Riruako and you are talking about puppets, we know of people sitting on that side of the House who were members of *Eyuva* and these are the people who were supporters of the very same Parties that you are referring to as being puppets. When you try to get into that politics today, we will reach a point where we would say that Honourable So and So was a member of the DTA or was a member of this Party or that Party. If you want us to get into that politics, which some of us are not very much interested in because I was never party to that, then we will get there. But I would like to ask the Honourable Member to stick to the issue. If you want to get into puppets, nobody will be exempted. Personally I know those real SWAPO members, I know the five to twelve SWAPO members who have become more SWAPO than anybody else. Please do not go that way.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I have never mentioned Chief Riruako in my intervention, that one should be noted.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, I have never made reference to those who were born in Botswana, it came from there and I think as natural justice I have the right to reply and I put in perspective this thing of when the people are cornered, they will try to say Kazenambo was born in

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON KAZENAMBO**

Botswana, but for me that does not take anything from me. But there are citizens who were born in Botswana who are affected by these types of talks and I will speak on that today. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY:

Honourable Deputy Speaker, I just want to give correct information, because the intervention of Honourable Tjihuiko referred to Members of different Parties which are not SWAPO and he said nobody is going to be exempted. I want him to withdraw, because to be honest, some of us have never been party to any other Party than the SWAPO Party. He must withdraw that. He cannot say nobody is going to be exempted, that is totally wrong.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Tjihuiko, if you made that statement, please withdraw it, because some of us did not belong to other Parties.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, we must be consistent. The Honourable Deputy Minister was calling people on this side cockroaches, puppets, all these things. You had your earphones on, but nobody has asked him to withdraw. If you want me to withdraw, the withdrawal must come from all sides, otherwise you can kick me out, I am not going to withdraw it.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Tjihuiko, understand me, if I am busy reading about your Motion, this Motion is by Honourable Venaani, I am reading what will happen at the end of the Motion. I am not hearing what is going on because I am not concentrating. I was

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON KAZENAMBO**

concentrating here. If you heard about cockroaches, puppets and so on, raise the issue and I will make that person to withdraw. You did not raise it. (Interjections). Honourable Members, I cannot allow a circus in this House. You did not raise the issue that, “*tell the Honourable Member to withdraw.*” I will make that Member to withdraw.

HON MOONGO: How can an ex-commander of the liberation be called a puppet by such a person who was not a commander? It is not fair! I am insulted now.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Moongo, you were a commander of the liberation, but you were supposed to bring that issue to my attention and ask the Honourable Member to withdraw.

(Interjections). Honourable Tjihuike, withdraw the word you have used because it implicated everybody. Please, for the sake of progress.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I will be happy to withdraw because the boots fit the feet.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: What I am saying is that through our journey through the existence of this society there was persecution and as a result of that persecution, some people were born in exile and I am proud that I have been born in exile because of the historical life that took place in this country. I do not regret. (Intervention)

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON KAZENAMBO**

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: On a Point of Order. Honourable Tjihuike did not withdraw. What he said means exactly the same, that no one will be spared. He must just withdraw unconditionally and he cannot put conditions to you as the Presiding Officer. I just request you to ask the Honourable Member to say “*I withdraw*” without any condition attached.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Tjihuike, please do not put conditions, remove the words, “*the boot fit the foot*” or whatever you said.

HON TJIHUIKO: But that is not a condition. What do you mean “*the boot fit the foot*?” I want to proceed.

HON TJIHUIKO: Which one do you want me to withdraw?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just withdraw that nobody is going to be left out.

HON TJIHUIKO: Can I repeat after you, I withdraw.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: We should regard ourselves as brothers and sisters, we are not enemies. Our people out there should take an example from here.

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON KAZENAMBO**

HON MOONGO: To be fair, if the Deputy Speaker did not hear that we were insulted and the Parties were insulted, cockroaches, puppets, by the Honourable Colleague, let him withdraw that.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I cannot be drawn backwards and forwards. I do not like going backwards and forwards. If something is being discussed is when you remember what happened last year and then come and do this because it happened last year.

HON MOONGO: No, he said it only ten minutes ago.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please proceed, Honourable Deputy Minister.

HON BOOYS: On a Point of Order. Honourable Deputy Speaker, this House used to have very good discipline when it comes to the Presiding Officer and the Members, but nowadays you will see people arguing with the Presiding Officer. It has never happened. We must bring back that discipline. If you speak, Members should sit down and when you give them the Floor, they may rise and speak. Let us bring back that attitude and that discipline. When the Presiding Officer speaks, we sit down.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: Like I said, the people who were born in Botswana in exile, together with those who were born in other countries, are full citizens of this country.

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON KAZENAMBO**

They happened to be born there by either the freedom fighters of yesterday and the freedom fighters who concluded the Liberation Struggle. They were not born in exile by choice and I take pride and patriotism in that I was born in exile and I fought from the start to the end together with many and I have never corroborated with the enemy, I have never left others in the battle and today I demand to be called a commander. A commander of SADF (South African Defence Force) or a commander of PLAN? PLAN is all we have in this country in 1990 after the ceasefire in Angola was signed. We do not know of any of our commanders who corroborated with the South African colonial regime. Those were betrayers and we do not have respect for them. (Intervention)

HON MOONGO: The Colleague does not know me and he does not know my history and he is fabricating. It is unfair to tell a history which he does not know. He does not know when I came and why. It is because we were arrested and detained by SWAPO. We did not have a trial or anything and he must withdraw. He is not telling the truth. I was at the front and he has never been at the front.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Members, I never heard Honourable Kazenambo mentioning that it is Honourable Moongo.

HON MOONGO: He referred to me. It is unfair!

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: He spoke in general. Please Honourable Kazenambo, help us. Since you started you are only talking about general things, you have not come back to the Motion. When are you coming back to the Motion?

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON KAZENAMBO**

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL
GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:**

Honourable Deputy Speaker, I shall not argue with my respected Deputy Speaker, but as I am about to speak the Motion, of course as a product of that liberation struggle I know that we used to have false guerrillas and false guerrillas also used to appear as commanders. The PLAN commanders that I know of were not here before 1989. (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, for the last 15 minutes we have been listening and can the Honourable Deputy Speaker use Rule 102 and 103 and Rule the Honourable Deputy Minister Out of Order so that we can proceed with the Motion?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Honourable Member is requesting the Deputy Speaker to Rule. You Members do the same, especially you two and I do not know which one should I start with. Proceed Honourable Member, I will Rule you Out of Order.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL
GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:** I was saying that this Motion was used as a political carrot and in that process the guilty parties misled the community members. (Intervention)

HON DR AMWEELO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, may I ask a small question? I just want clarity. Say for example the commander is fighting on the battlefield and immediately the commander leaves his soldiers, runs away while they are fighting the battle, how are we going to call that particular commander? Is he a coward or how are we going to call him? If you can help me please.

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON KAZENAMBO**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Amweelo, you are Out of Order because we have closed that chapter of commanders. We are addressing the Motion.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: The Deputy Speaker is using her power and I cannot answer that and I will explain that we call them collaborators and betrayers and run-away deserters, renegades. (Intervention)

HON MOONGO: On a Point of Order. Could he withdraw the word “*deserters*”, because we were detained at the front, we did not desert. He must withdraw, he is lying! Why do you not withdraw it? It is not the truth and everybody knows. You were in Botswana, you do not know anything.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Member, did you address Honourable Moongo? Please address the Motion.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: Honourable Speaker, I am addressing the question... (Intervention)

HON VILJOEN: On a Point of Order. I think the people outside will think that we are concluding this year with a circus and the main player in the circus is the Honourable Deputy Minister. Can you appeal to the Honourable Deputy Minister to speak on the Motion because for half an

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON KAZENAMBO**

hour he has been playing this cat-and-mouse game?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Member, please, there are a lot of Members who want to contribute. You started at 17:00 and look at the time and still you are not yet at the Motion. Proceed, Honourable Kazenambo.

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: May I ask the Honourable Deputy Minister a question? Honourable Deputy Minister, do some people have the privilege and right to condemn SWAPO every day?

I keep on saying, why is this person so anti-SWAPO? Every day they get up, they talk about SWAPO, how SWAPO failed and when we are reacting, we get this. Can we in the future debate the issues, for SWAPO is not there just to be condemned and to keep quiet. We heard the whole afternoon SWAPO being condemned and now that we are reacting, we have a crisis. When some people think they are immune, you attack.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:

Honourable Vice-President of SWAPO, I think we are like what is said in *Animal Farm* by George Orwell, and it looks like in this animal farm some animals are bigger than others because since I started here, I have not been allowed to speak on the Motion, but SWAPO was attacked through me, I was attacked through intervention and maybe I do not have any right of reply, because questions are being posed to me and attacks are levelled against me and maybe I have to keep quiet. I have never spoken to the Motion, I have been receiving interventions and I was trying to respond. Can the interventions now be limited? (Intervention)

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON KAZENAMBO**

HON TJIHUIKO: May I ask the Honourable Deputy Minister a question, please? Honourable Deputy Minister, do you know that SWAPO does not have the right to reply?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: I am ignoring that one, but as I am proceeding, as Kazenambo has been the circus player here, the one who saw that Kazenambo is a circus player is a circus master.

I was saying that this issue was used as a political carrot. There were some people who discouraged the people in the rural areas not to pay for the water, to accuse the Government that the Government is failing to address the plight of the people. At one point we knew of a community in a certain area which were discouraged from participating and benefiting from Government projects in the disguise that when people benefit from those projects, then they are being bribed by SWAPO. This is the sad reality of where we are coming from and this is also the case with regard to water. People were told not to pay for the water, the Government will eventually settle this matter or were told that in some Regions people are also not paying for water. Unfortunately this language contributed to the problem of debt accumulation. (Intervention)

HON MOONGO: On a Point of Order. Does the Honourable Colleague have proof that a certain Party was influencing people? Can he provide the proof here?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: I have told you that there were certain Political Parties, I will not be drawn into naming Political Parties, but in my language there is a saying that,

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON KAZENAMBO**

“Ohungire Kapotu a pena Kapotu” meaning do not talk about a one-eyed person when you are a one-eyed person, because that one-eyed person may think that you are referring to that one-eyed person.

In the case I said there were certain Political Parties that encouraged people to pay for the water and then, unfortunately, the water debts accumulated. That is the sad story that needs to be taken into consideration.

The other element also related to the accumulated debts on water is sometimes the parastatals which are managing water as a resource. Maybe they have the correct policies and I will not question them, and they are under good and capable line Ministries, but my personal experience outside in the field is that the maintenance part of the water system is neglected. Sometimes the pipes have burst and there is a water leakage, but the officials on the ground tend to become kings and queens on our own and we neglect to hear what the communities are saying and then the communities are faced with these water bills. It is another element which really needs to be taken into consideration.

That is not specifically with regard to the Okamatapati issue, but generally these things are happening and they are happening even in the cities.

Sometimes there is a water leakage at your house and your water bill does not correspond and when you try to raise the case, it is not heard. Sometimes our companies need to be above board in their approach.

Those dealing with bulk rural water supply, especially NamWater, should try to invest in equipment and resources to help communities in the rural areas, where they will come with mechanisms that when they install a water tank which is used by the entire community, the situation will not be left to the Water Point Committees and where you have the situation that Kazenambo has one thousand cattle and Kazenambo Junior has two cattle, but they are from different homesteads, but the water bills are the same.

We find that some people are not honest and some rich people in the rural areas play poor and when the communities are being presented with water

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON TJIHUIKO**

bills, they know very well that out of this one thousand, our cattle are just ten or five. The logistical provisions should be such that it will help communities in the rural area to pay according to the water that they have used, because sometimes the stronger are pushing the weaker to the side. Those companies which are distributing water should look at the logistical part and come up with mechanisms that would help communities to help themselves, not to be locked into arguments or to be left to committees, some of them that tend to be influenced by strong forces from somewhere.

That is the appeal that I am making and since I have taken long because of the interventions, perhaps I would end with the appeal that as the Government is addressing the water bills, especially those handled by a parastatal such as NamWater, there is a need to hear from the stakeholders, the end-users of the product as to how efficiently and how effectively and how fairly is this product distributed, charge and how the product is maintained, so that the maintenance will not be passed to communities. This is my only appeal with regard to this matter, notwithstanding the collaborators. I hope this is a lesson and they will now stop influencing the communities. I rest my case.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Honourable Tjihuiiko. Speak to the Motion, Honourable Member.

HON TJIHUIKO: Thank you very much, Honourable Deputy Speaker. I do not know why you are reminding me of that because normally I am always speaking to the Motion.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the issue on the Table, water debts, is crucial in the sense that water is life. Every creature needs water to survive. Therefore, when you are talking about the issue of accessibility to water, it is an issue that concerns all of us.

I have heard of the history of those who were advising citizens not to pay

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON TJIHUIKO**

for water. I have heard through comments also the politics that were played during that time, but the fact remains that as lawmakers, as leaders we cannot ignore the plight of the people, because there were those who out of their own wisdom decided to create conditions that are now affecting the very same people that I hope they wanted to help. Those people must be exposed. We have a democracy and we need to know exactly who were the people who were responsible for telling them not to pay for the water.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, if we are talking about asking NamWater to write off water debts, personally I do not believe that that is going to solve the problem, because the moment that they write off these debts, the end of the month people will not pay. We have not yet looked at the problem, we are looking at the solution and the solution is not for us as lawmakers to tell people not to pay for the water. (Intervention)

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL
GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:**

On a Point of Order. Honourable Tjihuiko must adjust, he must say some people may not pay. To say "*people will not pay*" is generalising and there are responsible people who are paying their bills. Do not generalise.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I am not sure whether I said "*people will not pay*" and if that is what I said, I just have to change it: There are people who may not be able to pay and the reason why at first I said people may not pay, is exactly what the Honourable Deputy Minister was saying, that there are people capable of paying for water and these are the people who are encouraging people not to pay, so that the weaker and the stronger can be in the same boat, using the weaker people to come to Government and ask for the debts to be written off. Those who have thousands of cattle in communal areas are the ones who are not paying water and they are the ones who are using people like the San, but the San community does not have access to water, they are drinking free

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON TJIHUIKO**

Government subsidised water.

The point that I wanted to make is that, as much as we all appreciate the fact that there are people who cannot afford to pay, the bottom line is that we must identify the reasons why they cannot pay. Let us look at that problem and say how best they can be assisted to pay for water and once we have identified that, we will turn around and say, *“yes indeed, if we write off these debts, then as of next end of the month, they will be able to pay because we have put the necessary system in place that would enable them to pay or we have identified the problems as to why they are not paying.”* Not everybody will not pay, I do not think that everybody will not pay. However, let us identify those cannot pay and let us assist them, whereby we would know that this section of the community should not be asked to pay for water, but we should also consult NamWater. (Interjection)

HON MEMBER: Was that not said before?

HON TJIHUIKO: We should consult NamWater, because if we decide, trying to please the voters, we should know that we may kill off the company that is sustaining itself.

Whatever we are doing, we should also be careful not to create another TransNamib and then start complaining that NamWater is being given money, NamWater is running to the Honourable Minister of Finance and looking for money, but we have created those conditions. We need to try and balance these two and before we take any decision, I believe that we need to encourage...(Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: On a Point of

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON TJIHUIKO**

Information. I will be very good if Honourable Tjiuiko could inform his Councillors in Okamatapati and Okakarara to start paying, those who are able to pay and have not paid. We will start on a very good footing if we can encourage our people. We know of DTA Councillors and NUDO Councillors who have discouraged these people to pay their water bills, while we know they are in a position to pay, people who own more than one thousand cattle. They are there and we know who they are? Why do you not start there and tell them to pay? That would be very good and then we can look at the other people who are not able to pay. We are not saying we are against that, but those who are able to pay must pay. We must start there, including yourself.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, the water problems did not start from 2004 when NUDO... (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY PRIME MINISTER: On a Point of Information. I just want to inform my Colleague that the San people do not have animals, all they have is that bucket to go and collect water to drink.

So, to say that the San people do not pay is a story I do not want to buy. Please withdraw that.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Prime Minister, you did not get me. I was saying that people with cattle, the rich ones, are using the weak ones, they are using the San communities to go to Government and ask for free water. What do they do? They will start using that water. I was saying that we must develop a system where the weak should be protected and not be used the way they are being used now. That is what I was saying, so we are together there. (Intervention)

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON TJIHUIKO**

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: On a Point of Information. It is not the intention to always be tribal and I am glad that the Honourable Deputy Prime Minister stood up. Why mention the San as the weak while we also have Hereros who are weak? What are you trying to portray?

HON TJIHUIKO: As much as you may have your experiences, I have experiences in a certain area where even the weak Hereros are better off than the weak San. They are the ones who are using water. Coblenz is a living example and I am not just saying this for the sake of saying it, it is practical.

The point that I wanted to make, Honourable Deputy Speaker, is that when we are trying to solve the problem of water, I believe that institutions like NamWater, the Ministry of Agriculture and the Ministry of Finance, who at the end of the day may be asked to come up with a package, should be allowed to develop an idea. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, may I ask the Honourable Member a question? When the Honourable Member started his motivation, he said he heard of a certain campaign against the SWAPO Party Government, that some people should pay for water. Who are those Parties which were campaigning? Could he mention at least two examples for the record?

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I was saying that through discussions and comments in this House statements were made that there were certain Political Parties who encouraged people not to pay for water. It was a statement in this House. Normally you do not attend Parliament and you are always taking people back because you have

25 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON TJIHUIKO**

missed certain things, Honourable Minister.

Before I conclude, Honourable Deputy Speaker, I am of the opinion that if we really want to address this issue, it would be premature for us just to stand up and say, “*write off water debts.*” That could easily have a serious impact on the sustainability and profitability of NamWater for them to be able to provide clean and safe water to the communities. Therefore, we should try to balance these two and it would be unfair to ignore the Ministry of Agriculture and only deal with NamWater or just approve a Motion here and put the burden on one sector before we have done our homework properly.

I believe what we need to do in this Motion is not to say we must write of the debts, but to say we have to look for a solution to the problem of water in this country. Water is also a problem in towns, so it is very important for us to have a system that would not be confined to communal areas, but a system that would be looking at the whole issue of the water problem in the country, whether in rural areas or in urban areas. I rest my case.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: On that note, Honourable Members, the House stands adjourned under Rule 90 until tomorrow, 14:30.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:45 UNTIL 2008.11.26 AT 14:30

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
ASSEMBLY CHAMBER
26 NOVEMBER 2008
WINDHOEK**

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

NOMINATION OF NEW MEMBER

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: First announcement from the Speaker's Table: I have been informed that the CoD has nominated Mr Alfred Chilinda in terms of Article 48(2) of the Constitution to fill the vacancy which occurred in the National Assembly as a result of the vacation of his seat by Mr Ben Ulenga. I now call upon the Chief Justice to administer the Oath or Affirmation to Mr Chilinda.

CHIEF JUSTICE SHIVUTE: Administers the oath to Mr Alfred Chilinda.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now declare Mr Alfred Chilinda as a duly elected Member of the National Assembly. Congratulations. You may take your seat. I thank the Honourable Chief Justice, Honourable Shivute, for again rising to the call of duty on short notice. Thank you, Honourable Chief Justice, and we now release you to attend to your daily duties. Thank you very much.

Any Petitions? Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Notice of Questions? Notice of Motions? Right Honourable Prime Minister.

26 November 2008

**NOTICE OF MOTION
RT HON N ANGULA**

MOTION OF CONDOLENCE

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members of this august House, I Move as an unopposed Motion –

That this Assembly –

On behalf of the Namibian Parliament expresses its heartfelt condolences to the bereaved family, friends and comrades of Kuku Helvi Kondombolo, mother of the Founding Father of the Nation and First President of the Republic of Namibia, Dr Sam Shafishuna Nujoma, who passed away this morning in the Medi Park Clinic in Ongwediva.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, I now call for the observance of a minute of silence, prayer and meditation. I thank you.

ASSEMBLY OBSERVES A MINUTE OF SILENCE

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Ministerial Statements? The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

**RESUMPTION OF DEBATE MOTION ON ECONOMIC AND
SOCIAL CONDITIONS OF OLD-AGED PENSIONERS**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on the Economic and Social Conditions under which Old-aged Pensioners are Living at Present.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When the House adjourned on Thursday, 16 October 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by Honourable Tjihuiko. Honourable Tjihuiko adjourned the Debate for his reply and he now has the Floor.

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON OLD-AGED PENSIONERS
HON TJIHUIKO**

HON TJIHUIKO: Thank you very much, Honourable Deputy Speaker. I am going to reply and those who were in the House yesterday may remember that I made a very good statement yesterday, but what happened yesterday was in fact not the real me, that was a starter. The real me is just about to start.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, allow me to thank everybody who have contributed to this very important Motion.

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: On a Point of Order. I only want to find out whether, according to the Rules of the House, a short-sleeved shirt is allowed in the House?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Chief Whip of that particular Party should maybe call upon his Member.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Speaker, allow me, first and foremost, to thank everybody who have contributed to this very important Motion, a Motion that was looking at the interest of our old-aged pensioners.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, this Motion is in fact not a Motion that was looking at the interests of the present pensioners, what we are trying to do now is to prepare a conducive environment for ourselves when we are there, to have created a condition that is going to be in our favour. Therefore, what we are saying here is not for them, but to take note of the fact that this Motion is for ourselves. It is a bridge that we are building for ourselves because we are very close to being in the queue. Therefore, it is very important that we will look at it from that angle.

As I said, I want to be very brief and I am going to conclude by saying that let us look at the pensioners, let us look at the living standards of the

26 November 2008

MOTION ON OLD-AGED PENSIONERS
RT HON N ANGULA

old-aged people that are deteriorating on a daily basis. We have all agreed that poverty is gripping the country and once we have realised these things, then we need to look at the living conditions of our forefathers and mothers, the leaders, the pioneers, the people who have brought us to be here today, that they should not be left behind. That is very important for us as lawmakers, to make sure that our old-aged people are being taken care of. (Interjection)

HON MEMBER: Are we not taking care of them?

HON TJIHUIKO: At the present moment I do not want to make a recommendation by saying that Government should increase the pension by N\$100 or by N\$1,000 or N\$2,000, but my appeal is to the Ministry of Finance to look at their Budget and make sure that through cut and paste the contribution to the old-age pension is adjusted. My humble request is that it should not be less than N\$500. N\$1,000, N\$2,000 or even N\$501 will be fine to me, but less than N\$500 is a disaster, they will not survive. That is my appeal and I hope that this is very reasonable and acceptable to all of us in this House and therefore, I do not think there is going to be any opposition. Let all of us support this Motion and make sure that our old-aged pensioners are going to be a little better off than they are now. N\$500 plus will be reasonable. Thank you very much and I hope that all of us are going to support it.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now Put the Question that the Motion be adopted. Any objection?

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Mine is not an objection, but I want this to be entered in the records. Honourable Deputy Speaker, this Motion addresses a very important issue. However, unfortunately we cannot budget on the Floor of the National Assembly. When Government has

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON OLD-AGED PENSIONERS
HON DR TJIRIANGE / HON NANDI-NDAITWAH**

resources available – as it has been done before – will surely continue to improve the social pensions of our senior citizens, but we cannot budget on the Floor of the National Assembly. Thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Honourable Member indicated in the first instance that the Motion should be referred to the relevant Parliamentary Standing Committee. That is why I am putting the Question now for the adoption and referral to the Standing Committee.

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: I want to know the consequences of the adoption, even if it goes the Committee. Does it mean as of next year we shall have the N\$500 because we have adopted it? What do we adopt?

HON MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM: Honourable Deputy Speaker, maybe to assist the National Assembly to take a decision on the matter, I want the Table to assist us and read the whole Motion. Then we know exactly what the Motion is asking for, because it has been on the Order Paper for some time now.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Maybe to assist the House: *“I shall Move that this Assembly seriously discuss and consider the unacceptable economic and social conditions under which our old-aged pensioners are living at present; and that the Motion be referred to the relevant Parliamentary Standing Committee for further in-depth study and Report back to the Chamber for further consideration.”* That is what the Motion is seeking.

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON OLD-AGED PENSIONERS
HON RIRUAKO / HON BOOYS**

HON RIRUAKO: Madam Chair, I do not think that we have a problem to discuss it. It can be referred, it can be scrutinised and brought back to the House to be discussed. What more do we need to say? I think that is right and fair. I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: What direction have you given me now?

HON BOOYS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Legislature does not deal with Budgets, the Budgets are dealt with by the Executive and to budget for an institution is the responsibility of the Executive. I do not think that this House can prescribe to the Executive to budget money for the elderly. All of us know that the budgeting function rests with the Executive and I rest my case.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Riruako, I am the Presiding Officer here and now I now Put the Question, that the Motion be adopted. Any objection? There is an objection. The House is divided. Those Members in favour, please rise. Those Members against, please rise. Those abstaining, please rise.

In favour:	-	12
Against	-	33
Abstentions	-	0

The Motion is rejected. I would like to recognise the presence of the Members of the Nigerian National Assembly Service Commission who are on an official visit to Namibia. The Secretary will read the Second Order of the Day.

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON MBAI**

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS OWED TO NAMWATER
BY COMMUNAL FARMERS**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on Water Debts owed to NamWater by Communal Farmers.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When the House adjourned on Wednesday, 29 October 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by Honourable Venaani. The House adjourned in terms of Rule 90. Any further discussions? Honourable Mbai.

HON MBAI: Thank you very much, Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members of this august House. I rise again to bring my brief contribution on the Motion under discussion. Secondly, let me make use of this opportunity to express my profound gratitude and appreciation to the Ministry and more especially the Division of Rural Water Supply for achieving some of its objectives, such as its efforts to increase the water coverage with the ultimate goal of providing reliable and closer access to water for rural communities in the whole country.

However, the rural communities in some parts of our country, such as Kavango, Caprivi, Ohangwena, Oshikoto and Kunene are walking long distances and wait for more than ten minutes to collect potable water. I, therefore, encourage the Government to continue providing potable water to these communities for the Government to fulfil its national objective in order to achieve Vision 2030.

The Government has also reached a further milestone in providing potable water to more than 90 percent of the communities through the Waterberg Pipeline Scheme.

I also realise, Honourable Deputy Speaker, that Namibia is an arid country

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON MBAI**

with very limited underground water resources. Thus any extension of water installations need to be treated and, therefore, it would be costly to the end-user.

There are also many communities in many parts of our country that need water installations to be extended in order to expand their farming as a livelihood, but due to the cost and affordability aspect, they are hesitant to apply for an extension. The former Head of State and Founding Father used to urge people to put up small vegetable gardens in their backyards, but the cost of water made it impossible to engage in such farming. So again, another effort to curb poverty and promote food security has not been realised.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Honourable Venaani's Motion on rural water supply requested this Honourable House to consider the writing off of all historical debts. Allow me to give this House a brief background of what led to the accumulation of these debts.

I concur with the previous speakers in this House that somehow the unwillingness to pay for water was because of fear for the unknown. It was the first time for rural communities to pay for water consumption. Initially the Community-based Management Implementation Strategy, which commenced in 1997, was structured in three phases, being capacity building as the first phase, operation and maintenance as the second phase and the final and third phase, full cost recovery. Government instead skipped the two phases of implementation, namely capacity building and operation and maintenance. While the implementation of the first two phases was discussed through a technical committee appointed by the relevant Ministry, Government all of a sudden went to implement the third phase, that of full cost recovery.

Let me give you a case study which I am very cognisant of. The community under the Waterberg Pipeline Scheme requested for an audience with the then Honourable Minister of Agriculture, Honourable Angula, since late 1999, but the community only managed to meet the Honourable Minister in early 2002. This audience was necessitated due to a lack of implementation of the abovementioned phases of community-

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON MBAI**

based management. The timeframe to have audience with the Honourable Minister has resulted in the increase of the water bills and also the lack of the implementation of all these phases. While the communities were waiting to meet the Honourable Minister, the first water bill was issued to communities for payment. Thus it has become difficult for the communities to catch up with the accumulated heavy bills and high interest rates.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, it is therefore unfortunate and incorrect that the resistance in certain cases were backed up by political support by some Regional and Local Authority Councillors – if it is true. What attributed to accumulation of debts in our areas, such as Karas, Namib, Khomas, Brandberg, Kavango and the Cuvelai water supply areas and more especially in the Municipal areas of the country? If there was a perception that the resistance was politically motivated, the same perception could also be entertained that the introduction of fast cost recovery was deliberately and haphazardly introduced to penalise political opponents in some areas. No, it was merely because of lack of proper consultation and improper implementation of all these phases by the Ministry in all the water supply areas.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the issue of full cost recovery has been introduced to rural communities and most of them are unemployed and depend on a few others who are employed. It is really unfair to expect these poor rural communities to be able to settle all the historical debts. The Executive arm of our Government sometimes introduce amnesty to parastatals such as the NBC, Air Namibia, name them and write off their debts and most of those beneficiaries are those who are well-off, employed and living in urban areas. Therefore, it is unfair to write off the debts of well-off people and expect the poorest of the poor to pay for this huge historical debt.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, I will concur and support the statement of the Honourable Deputy Minister of Agriculture about the project whereby all communities' supply points were converted to individual off-takes. If this was done prior to the implementation of the full cost recovery, this implication could have been averted. I, therefore, encourage the Ministry

26 November 2008

MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON MBAI

to continue providing individual off-takes of water and Government must go ahead... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: I am sorry to interrupt the Honourable Member, but I want to ask a question. I want to know, Honourable Mbai, whether you are aware that some of us, the politicians, in some cases are to blame for the accumulation of the debts by some communities, because some politicians were encouraging people not to pay, for political reasons, with the aim of embarrassing the present Government and this has been done at rallies. Do you not think that as politicians we have contributed to this problem?

HON MBAI: As I said, the resistance was absolutely not politically motivated and if there were Political Leaders, Councillors and Regional Councillors that were instrumental in encouraging people not to pay for water, then the Honourable Minister is very much welcome to come with the names of those political leaders and also at which rallies and what time. He is welcome to indicate the names of these Colleagues and at that time I was the Councillor for the constituency and I was instrumental, when I picked up that Traditional Leaders and some leaders in the area resisted the payment with the excuse that in some areas of our country people are not paying, it is only us in this area that are forced by Government to pay for water, I took a delegation of Traditional Leaders and Political Leaders to the North of the country. We visited many areas where the payment for water was introduced. The reason was to encourage and to motivate that everybody is paying.

Furthermore, Honourable Deputy Speaker, I support that the Government must go ahead in implementing Cabinet Decision No. 18th/16/10/07/007 that a study by an independent consultant be commissioned to investigate sustainable tariffs for water and that another independent consultancy also be engaged to determine subsidy schemes to assist those who cannot afford the tariffs.

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON MUTORWA**

Honourable Deputy Speaker, in conclusion, I would request an amnesty for all NamWater historical debts to be written off in all affected areas and I therefore, support the Motion.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise Minister Mutorwa.

HON MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY:
Thank you, Comrade Deputy Speaker. I would like to make a few remarks on this very, very important subject of water provision. In actual fact, my Colleague, the Deputy Minister, has already made the statement which underlines the position of Government through the Ministry of Agriculture, but in light of how the Debate unfolded, I would like to say a few things.

First is to underline the fact that water in the context of our country, Namibia, is a very scarce, precious, expensive, indispensable, life-giving and life-sustaining commodity. Namibia is one of the few countries in southern Africa, in the SADC Region that does not have perennial or ever-flowing rivers within or inside the territory of the Namibian State. The three or so perennial rivers of Kunene, Kavango, Zambezi and its tributaries and the Orange are geographically located on international borders that Namibia share with other sovereign states, like Angola and Botswana in the case of the Kunene and Kavango, respectively, Zambia, Zimbabwe, Malawi, Mozambique in the case of the Zambezi River and South Africa and Lesotho in the case of the Orange River. The management of such rivers that I have just mentioned are regulated by international conventions which, *inter alia*, state that no single sovereign state would have the exclusive right of utilisation of such resource. That is the reality in which we find ourselves. We can make use of this water, but always taking into consideration that there are other sovereign states that share those waters with us.

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON MUTORWA**

Groundwater, in terms of boreholes, is also limited in Namibia. Then the process of extracting such groundwater, in terms of borehole drilling, is definitely not cheap and it will never be cheap. Again, that is how our country was created through nobody's fault. The transportation of water through pipes and canals is also expensive. That is the reality of Namibia.

Therefore, I would like to appeal, as others have done already, that when we talk about water in Namibia, we, the politicians, who have the luxury of protection in this Chamber must not misuse water utilisation and management for cheap political purposes, for example by telling people untruths – untruths which will haunt you – that water is free. It is not free and it cannot be free.

What is important, as I stated when the debate started, is that the Government of the Republic of Namibia has been seized and is still seized with the issue of finding ways and means of putting in place mechanisms that would look at the water tariffs that are charged, mechanisms that would look at possible ways of how to go about in terms of subsidising the rural poor that we always talk about. Government has been seized and in actual fact, yesterday I did Report to the Cabinet about the independent consultant study that Honourable Mbai is talking about. That Report is out and Cabinet in its wisdom is further subjecting that Report and it has been referred to the relevant Cabinet Committee dealing with economic development and parastatals for further input.

Therefore, if at the end of the day the intention of the Motion is not for cheap political point-scoring, we cannot ask Parliament to write off the debt, but if the intention of the Mover is that this Motion would be referred to the relevant Parliamentary Standing Committee so that it can also have an input on the issues of, for example, possible mechanisms how to go about in terms of making the tariffs affordable and also putting up mechanisms on how the Government should go about in terms of subsidising those that are really poor, then we would not have any objection, so that the Parliamentary Committee can link up with the Cabinet Committee in terms of already strengthening what we are proposing for Cabinet's final consideration and approval early next year.

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON VENAANI**

Then we would not have an objection. I thought I needed to make this very clear. Thank you, Comrade Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I thank you very much. Does the Honourable Venaani wish to reply?

HON VENAANI: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members of the august Assembly, allow me this opportunity to briefly convey our Party's condolences to the Founding President and his family for the passing away of the Nation's grandmother, a woman, a mother who has lived a long life, has seen all the trials and tribulations of our Nation and that God has taken to rest and she has lived a good life that all of us can emulate.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, I think that the Honourable Minister of Agriculture has prematurely divulged the consultation and being the good politician that he is, I think we are on the same wavelength.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, I want to raise two important issues. First and foremost, I want to thank all those Members who have participated in this Debate and let me put on record that our Debates in this Chamber would remain wanting if problems that confront our people are brought to this House and all that can be said about these problems is that it is cheap political-scoring. Be that as it may, it is the duty of all of us collectively and individually as political organisations and representatives of the people of Namibia to bring their problems and challenges to the Floor of the House and my organisation and I cannot be called names when bringing these problems to this Chamber, because I believe that the duty of a Party in public office is to look at these problems and try to find solutions to them.

However – and I want to correct *Honourable Kazenambo* – to start arguing that there were political organisations that asked people not to pay

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON VENAANI**

water is not true – at least not our Party, perhaps yours, because if you start propelling that argument, I would ask you, “*our Party never controlled the northern Regions politically since the Independence of this country, but who has told the people in the North not to pay water, why do they have an accumulated debt?*” (Interjection)

HON MEMBER: Your neighbour!

HON VENAANI: Is he so influential that he can tell people not to pay? Then the argument would be that people on the other side of the aisle have told the people not to pay. Some of these arguments cannot hold.

I want to thank Honourable Mbai most sincerely for what he has said, because I remember there were chiefs who were saying that it is Honourable Mbai that wants people to pay for water in Okakarara. I come from that Constituency. I was the leader of the Youth League, I had to intervene to explain to people that the legislation was passed by all Parties in the National Assembly, it is not Honourable Mbai.

Just to tell you the severity of the problem, we even put up an all-Party Technical Committee in the area which was led by Honourable Mbai, the late Eric Hingaruru, my father and so many people, to put everybody on one board to address the problem of water.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:40

HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:18 PURSUANT TO ADJOURNMENT

HON VENAANI: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I was saying that it would not help this country, nor its leadership, to start blaming one another on who has done what. I think the underlying problem of this

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON VENAANI**

water debt is poverty and I am sure some of us on both sides of the aisle are paying the water for our relatives in rural communities. (Interjection). Some do not have rural communities, therefore it is “*some*”. Therefore, we have an issue of poverty that we need to address.

One issue that I also want to touch on which *Honourable Katali* raised is the fact that the people using the Waterberg water carrier are able to sell cattle to earn foreign currency. It is not that the other communal communities cannot do that, but we all know it is because of the red line and that is also something that has to be debated in this House. Because of the red line the people cannot afford now and you must understand how African society spread wealth. The reason that you and I bought commercial land is because we fled from the rural community’s problems. When you are living in a homestead, you might have a hundred cattle but a hundred people are making a living from those cattle and everybody expects everything. People might have a number of cattle at their disposal, but how many people are deriving a livelihood from those cattle? You are talking about students at university, you are talking about funerals and people are making a living from those cattle. They are not running commercial entities. You and I who own commercial farms are attempting to run our lives commercially, but the cattle in the rural communities are not run commercially, people are selling for basic needs, they are not selling to put money in the bank or to pay an overdraft.

Therefore, the reason why our colleagues on the other side of the red line are suffering now is because of the poor market prices that they are receiving for their animals. If you look at the number of oxen that are roaming the Mangetti area and if they can get 80 or 60% or even 100% of what Meatco is paying in Okahandja, those people in Mangetti would become instant millionaires, but it is because of the red line and we have to ponder on that issue. (Interjection)

HON MEMBER: Come to water, not the red line.

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON WATER DEBTS
HON VENAANI**

HON VENAANI: I am just responding to the issues that were raised. If you wanted to say something on the red line to score some points, do that.

I want to conclude by saying the following and I think it is a matter for another Debate and that is the argument that is advanced by the other side of the aisle, arguing that we cannot budget in the House. There is an element of truth in that, that of course, the Executive cannot budget here, but the whole of the Legislature can direct the Executive Branch to consider in the future. (Interjection)

HON MEMBER: Not direct, recommend!

HON VENAANI: Direct, this House can direct the Executive. If a Motion is passed in this House to do something, the Executive would be compelled to comply. There are three tiers of Government in this country.

The Legislature can direct. Now there is this fight of who has supremacy. Of course, the Executive has supremacy because the Party with the largest number of Members of Parliament forms Government, but to argue point blank, saying that we cannot bring motions with financial implications in this House, is not correct. Please, it is an issue that we need to clarify and it even applies to the Motion that you voted against. (Interjections). You are confused by the numbers but the structures remain.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the intention of this Motion is to really try to investigate. That is why from the onset I have proposed that this Motion be referred to a committee, for us to go to our communities and investigate all the reasons. I know to try to solve the problem is to write off the debts, I believe that is the way to do it, but the Standing Committee can make other recommendations to this House to be accepted or rejected. That is the reason why I said this Motion should be referred to a Committee. Therefore, it is not a political Motion. I have been on record and this side

26 November 2008 **MOTION ON ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT**
HON DIENDA

of the House has been on record of bringing motions of national importance to this House. Therefore, it is another Motion amongst many of national importance that are going to come and I want to thank the Members who supported the Motion. I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. The Motion seeks to be referred to the Standing Committee on Economics and Natural Resources for investigation and Report back to the House. That is the request of this Motion. I now Put the Question that the Motion be adopted. Any objection? Then it is agreed to. The Secretary will read the Third Order of the Day.

MOTION ON ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT
OF NAMIBIAN PEOPLE

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on the Economical Empowerment of Namibian People.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When the House adjourned on Thursday, 16 October 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by Honourable Kavetuna. The Honourable Minister of Works and Transport had the Floor and he may continue. Any further discussion? I recognise Honourable Dienda.

HON DIENDA: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members. I would like to contribute to this important Motion. It is just a pity that the Motion on the prevailing poverty in our country was concluded before I could make my contribution. Both

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT
HON DIENDA**

Motions are addressing the issues and are similar, which makes my contribution easy.

I have followed the contributions by the Honourable Members and I tend to see that all of you are in agreement with the Congress of Democrats Party's Manifesto on economic empowerment, mainly to need to aggressively tackle the problem of poverty, extreme inequalities and unemployment in our society. Growth will mean nothing if it does not reach the majority of our people.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, this is not a matter of discussing the laws that were passed by the lawmakers, but rather an issue of implementing the decisions and laws that were approved by this Honourable House. If we look at the economic disparities in the country between the haves and the have-nots, between poor and rich, this House has the obligation to spearhead, through the Minister of Finance, laws that are suitable for our Nation.

China is what it is today because of manufacturing. China is crossing the world economy because they do not have any problems as they are purely into manufacturing. We Namibians are importing even toilet paper, cement and many other things. Yes, the economic status quo before Independence does not differ from the one of today. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: May I ask a question? Honourable Dienda, you are advertising and hailing the Chinese. When did you come to love them?

When did you come to like them? You had a Motion here which condemned them. Are you also aware that they are not capitalists? Whatever you see here is capitalism and they are socialists. Are you aware of that?

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT
HON DIENDA**

HON DIENDA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, if somebody is good I will not deny that fact, I am not that type of person. You were my mentor and I acknowledge it because you taught me what I know today. Thank you.

The economic status quo before Independence does not differ from the one of today. The problem that we have in this country was that after... (Intervention)

HON DR AMWEELO: May I ask my daughter a small question? What you are saying that we are even importing toilet paper is not true. We have a factory in the Southern Industrial Area which is producing toilet paper. Are you aware of that?

HON DIENDA: My father, I know of that factory, it only produces toilet paper for one week in one year's time, so it is not enough. The problem that we have in this country is that after taking over from the previous Government, we kept the status quo. Let us look at the effects of the current economic policy on the lives of Namibians.

Access to credit facilities: Who are the ones who qualify for loans at banking institutions or any other financial institution? Housing loans are only meant for a select few, leaving the rest of the Nation without proper housing facilities. The requirements attached to a housing loan are beyond the limits of our people. So many people who are even employed by the Government cannot afford a house. Interest on housing loans and the period of the repayment of that loan are so high that people houses are being auctioned because of default payments. As long as each every Namibian in this country are not in a position to afford a house, people will remain poor. People who are owners of houses already do not even qualify for any other loans at banking institutions. Maybe the time has come for Namibians to have Banking Institutions which cater for Namibians and not treat Namibia as an affiliate of other countries.

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT
HON DIENDA**

(Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: May I ask the Honourable Member a question, please? Honourable Dienda, you are saying people cannot afford to buy houses and you were saying the situation has not changed that much since Independence. Are you saying that the strategy by the Government not to build affordable houses is a strategy to enable people with enough land to accommodate those in charge? I understand that the kids who were at the Honourable Minister's office have been taken to Mix and the owner of Mix is apparently making good money now because he has more clients. Do you think that is the strategy?

HON DIENDA: I think with National Housing Enterprise which cannot provide houses for the low-income group, yes there is a change in the status quo. What happens to all these banking institutions who try to do business in Namibia and pretend to be people-oriented? After some years in the business they pack their belongings, leave the country or reintegrate with already existing institutions. If the interest rate is reasonable people will pay back easily, but currently the interest is killing us. Does it make sense for one to repay a housing loan over a period of 30 years with a price of N\$500,000 and at the same time paying back a car loan of the same price within 5 years? Our policies must be revised to suit the Namibian Nation's needs and not those inherited from the colonial regime

Secondly, Honourable Deputy Speaker, discrepancy between the haves and have-nots: I am supporting the amount budgeted for the war veterans. This is done with the aim of taking into consideration the inflation rate of our country, but still, what I cannot understand is why the same principle cannot be used when it comes to the pensions of old-aged people.

High crime rate: Because of this unfair distribution of our resources, people are becoming involved in criminal activities. Namibia, with a

26 November 2008 **MOTION ON ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT**
HON DINYANDO

small economy, can only thrive through meaningful interaction with the global economy. This is important in the field of trade, investment, technology and solidarity. What the Congress of Democrats is therefore preaching is, let us add real value to Namibia's economic resources.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, I support this Motion. Thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Honourable Dinyando.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY: Comrade Deputy Speaker, I rise to add my voice to those who have spoken before me on this very important Motion introduced by Honourable Kavetuna in this august House.

To give economic empowerment a meaningful dimension, one has to look back at our history as an African Nation. In the 17th century more than 36 million African men and women were taken into slavery in order to work on plantations, factories and farms, which resulted in creating the developed world we see today. Colonialism deprived Africans of land and livestock, disempowering them from economic activities. Africans were moved from prime land and driven to special native reserves.

After attaining freedom and Independence, Africans were drawn into conflicts, be it political or economical, by those who exploited the natural resources on the African continent. Africans were forced to fight in the white man's war and what did they get after the war, tobacco and bicycles while whites were given land. Whose land was it?

After the long and bitter struggle for liberation, we gained our hard-won freedom and Independence and today we are buying the land Namibians

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT
HON DINYANDO**

sacrificed for. After gaining freedom and Independence African states did not have institutions like the World Bank and IMF for reconstruction and development, but borrowed and still continue doing so, resulting in being dictated to what African states should do through structural adjustment and indebtedness. The United Nations year in and year out declared Africa as the world's poorest continent despite its abundant natural resources.

Having said that, the question arises as to what shall we do in order to rectify the situation by using and applying the concept of economic empowerment for wealth creation, job creation, poverty reduction, ownership of natural resources and upliftment of the living standards of the previously disadvantaged Namibians.

In Namibia the factors of production, such as land and capital, are not in the hands of the majority. Our natural resources, such as diamonds, copper, gold and zinc are not under the control of the majority. Most businesses are foreign owned, be it retail shops, insurance companies, banks and other institutions in our economic sector.

Economic empowerment should be seen as a transformation of ownership in the domestic economy. It has to empower various groups of black origin to secure a permanent place within the country's economy. Economic empowerment should address at short, medium and long term levels. Economic empowerment is to bring those who were previously disempowered, to benefit from the new economic power-sharing arrangements. It should also address issues of poverty and unemployment.

It is a well-known fact that after Independence some Namibians were economically empowered through fish quotas, Affirmative Action Loan Schemes, mining concessions, Aquaculture, Conservancies, to name but a few. The question arises as to what extent such empowerments have contributed to poverty alleviation, job creation and wealth creation, etcetera.

Economic empowerment is not about luxury, but to create and expand

26 November 2008 **MOTION ON ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT**
HON DINYANDO

wealth so that as many Namibians could benefit. The areas of concern we should look into in terms of economic empowerment are: Acceleration of the land reform programme, the willing seller and willing buyer arrangement is cumbersome. A way should be found as how to address the land issue in the best interest of the majority. If one can take for example from the start of the programme on resettlement, the affirmative action loan scheme... (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: May I ask a question? Comrade Dinyando, you mentioned a very important point, willing seller, willing buyer. Do you not think it is high time now we say that anybody can own land if he or she can afford, provided that after ten hectares we start with 20% tax? Would that not maybe be a solution? Up to ten hectares you are exempted from tax, but when owning more than that, you start with 20%. That would also be a mechanism to prevent that they divide the farm amongst the children. I think that is one of the issues we need to look into.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY: Comrade Deputy Speaker, in 1991 we had a Land Conference in this country which made recommendation after all the deliberations on land. I think it is high time that we revisit those recommendations and see whether years down the line those recommendations are still in line with the current situation we are facing in terms of land distribution. That would enable us to address the issue raised by Honourable Iilonga.

I was saying that if you look at the Affirmative Action Loan Scheme, the programme on resettlement and the amount of money we get from the AgriBank for individuals to acquire farms which are so expensive and Government buying farms, then these two amounts put together is quite a huge amount which amounts to millions and these millions are going to a certain section of our society to their benefit

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT
HON DINYANDO**

while those of us who acquire farms through those programmes remain indebted and I do not know how long we are going to carrying on paying those debts.

Blacks should participate in ownership of the commanding heights of the economy, not token types of arrangements, but add value so that black business people can influence and control the course of business. The development of the black professionals into a highly and semi-skilled workforce across all aspects of society in order to drive the economy. The growth of black-owned small and medium enterprises with the support of Government through tendering and procurement. The private sector to provide more opportunities for workers to acquire a stake in the economy through shares. Guarantees be put in place in form of quotas of black employment at certain levels of Companies and quotas of black ownership of Companies across the economic sector.

I am not saying that we should just put blacks into those positions, but for Companies to have a quotas for blacks to take part in such business ventures.

To achieve all these, we should move in unity, networking and collaboration and form partnerships. These are crucial to forge strategies for business growth and survival and is a long-term commitment for the future of this country, and an investment in expanding our domestic consumer market. All these can only be realised when there are policy guidelines and legal frameworks and I commend the SWAPO Party Government through the Office of the Prime Minister for having developed a strategic document, known as Transformation of Economic and Social Empowerment Framework (TESEF).

Economic empowerment is not an event but an economic revolution. Therefore, we should be proactive, creative and never give up access to resources such as land, finance and other agricultural resources. The Private Sector should also be proactive and creative to engage in black empowerment in a genuine way. Failing to do so the Government has to intervene with regulations and legislations.

26 November 2008 **MOTION ON ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT**
HON DINYANDO

There have been misconceptions from other parts of society about the term “*economic empowerment*”. To others it means a risk, free preferential entitlement, allotment of finance by Government, handouts and racism in reverse. But economic empowerment is seeking to substantially and equitably transfer and confer ownership and management of economic resources to the majority. It seeks to ensure a broader and meaningful participation of black people in order to achieve sustainable development, progress and prosperity. It is about skills development for both men, women, youth and people living with disabilities, it is about poverty alleviation, access to finance and rural development. (Intervention)

HON VILJOEN: On a Point of Information. The Honourable Deputy Minister is dealing with bigger issues of Companies which should empower people, but I think we must go to the smaller issues. On Monday I visited Pupkewitz and a lot of people were sitting around with paint brushes, looking for work, and when I left the premises, they said, “*please tell the people there in Parliament we are sitting here.*” A Chinese Company was working at my house with 4 Oshivambo speaking workers and we discussed some issues and they said, “*these people do not pay us, we get N\$200 per month and N\$200 for transport.*” They said, “*if we go to the Unions, these people pay the Unions and the Unions do nothing.*” I think we must start on the ground and enable the workers to get a job.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY: Comrade Deputy Speaker, that was information, but we should also bear in mind that the current situation we are facing comes to the political field, the political aspects of this country. We do not see Honourable Viljoen pulling crowds from other sectors of our community, we see him pulling crowds from the same people he got at Pupkewitz, but we do not ask what he can do to empower them for them to be given employment. We do not go to that extent. The ball is in our

26 November 2008 **MOTION ON ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT**
HON DR GEINGOB

own court, poverty and unemployment will only be addressed if we are owners of our natural resources, committed and hardworking.

As we were united in the fight for freedom and Independence, we must also act in unity in the fight for economic Independence. There is no universal pass to development, each society must find its own strategies. With these few words, Comrade Deputy Speaker, I support the Motion and I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Honourable Minister of Trade and Industry.

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: Thank you, Comrade Deputy Speaker. Like Honourable Dienda my aim was to participate in the Debate on poverty, but somehow I missed out, but since it is somehow interrelated, I thought that since there are a lot of prophets of doom on that side, and I asked somebody whether the duty of the Opposition Parties is just to be pessimistic, just to cry and cry and dig out what they think is the bad side of our country. I said I was in Cuba recently and that Island is going through hurricane after hurricane, but people are so positive and I asked why is it so, and they said "*patriotism, love for the fatherland and motherland, patriotism.*" Then I was wondering, are our Opposition Party members not patriotic enough and I am not the one to judge them on that one, but I was wondering why is everything they see in this beautiful country always so negative? They even influence those who are sitting outside who are trying to grade our country to be negative, because they listen to what people are saying in this country.

Then I ran around, and came across this Report, Namibia 2004 – Millennium Development Goals Report and I just looked at some of the statistics and I was asking, "*do Honourable Members sitting on that side also see these kinds of Reports?*" Really, it is not fair that we as

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT
HON DR GEINGOB**

Honourable Members can paint such a negative picture of our country.

The Government here never denies that there is poverty in this country. Has anybody stood up here and said there is no poverty in this country? Has anybody here said that we have solved all the problems after Independence? And in your right mind, is it possible for the Government which has only been in power for 18 years to solve a problem of one 100 years? You know we had Apartheid here, we were discriminated against and left out from the mainstream of economic activities. You know that, at least the black ones know that. But we want to act as if poverty was brought about the SWAPO Government after Independence.

My dear Colleagues, we are sending wrong signals and you know the history very well. We have a Report and these figures must have been updated because they come from 2004. *“Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger.”* Proportion of households living in relative poverty, because poverty is relative, you are poor in relation to Honourable Mudge, in relation to Geingob, you are poor in relation to somebody else in your own country. Some African-American brother said: *“Dear brother, a black pauper in America is better off than the richest man in Africa”* and I said, *“my brother, you are dreaming, poverty is relative, you must compare yourself with Rockefeller or Bill Gates because you are competing in that society, not in Africa”*.

Equally, it would be good that we look at relative poverty. After Independence in 1990 it says here, *“proportion of households living in relative poverty were 38%.”* That is even lower than many other countries. By 2006 it went down to 28% – down! Proportion of households living in extreme poverty was 9%. It went down to 4% in 2006. These are statistics whereas we are saying nothing has changed, the poor are becoming poorer. That is the language we are hearing daily, especially espoused by Honourable Mudge, Honourable Viljoen, people who did not know poverty and are now experts on poverty. Really, it is painful to tell the truth. (Interjection)

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT
HON DR GEINGOB**

HON MUDGE: It is painful to see what is happening in the country.

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: I was born into poverty and we have been freed by SWAPO to travel and you can see the parts you never went to. That is why you are now seeing the poverty and I am glad you are sympathising with people who are poor. But where were you in 1975? Were people not poor that time? (Intervention)

**HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT,
HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:** May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Dr Geingob, is it true that Honourable Mudge and Viljoen for the first times in their lives went to Katutura after 1990 although they were born here? They were born in Windhoek, but they do not know the other part of Windhoek and now they see the poverty for the first time, thinking that it is something new.

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: I would not like the Honourable Member to feel guilty, we are talking about facts here. (Intervention)

HON VILJOEN: May I ask the Honourable Minister a question? Is it fair that some Members in this House live on perceptions? Honourable Minister Ekandjo, before Independence I was superintendent of a hostel and every day I took the people to the hostel in Katutura and back. Secondly, my parents came from Angola and they were dumped at a borehole and they had to survive. Three years later they got a loan from the Government to build a house. Therefore, we know what poverty is.

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: I would have liked the Honourable Colleagues that I mentioned not to feel guilty or to be defensive, because you are the collective of those who were deprived and I am also equally speaking to Mr Mudge. It is very painful when Mr Mudge woke up today, sitting in this Parliament and discovered there is poverty in this country. He is trying to imply there was no poverty in this country before. We all admit there is poverty, we are supposed to work together to solve the question of poverty, but you want to put blame on somebody. That is the issue I am talking about and you are acting like things got worse because we are in power. That is the point I am making and I giving you some statistics. (Interjection).

Honourable Mudge, I do not agree with what you are saying, but I sit and I listen. I gave examples... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND ATTORNEY - GENERAL: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Comrade Minister, having shared this august House with an Honourable Member called Dirk Mudge, the Honourable Member is not in this House, I am recalling history because I was here when he was here and I am not putting it in a negative way, but having served the Nation with that Honourable Member, what legacy do you think he has bequeathed to the offspring who is currently sitting with us here?

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: I served with Honourable Dirk Mudge in the drafting Committee. We drafted this country's Constitution. When we were having problems, I used to adjourn the Drafting Committee of which he was a member. We used to be invited by *John Le Guerda*, Foreign Minister and asked to go there and iron out certain things in the national interest and I will tell you that I came to respect him, because when it came to addressing issues that we were trying to solve because we all knew there were problems in this country, there was oppression, there was apartheid, we knew that, we

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT
HON DR GEINGOB**

come from that background, but when we were meeting, trying to address that issue, he was very realistic and because of that we moved on and we adopted the Constitution.

Now he has retired and I would have hoped, since I am an older man, and that person was coming, like the Honourable Minister of Finance, who has a better perspective of the world and Namibia, but to my disappointment, if I can compare the two... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: I am extremely sorry to interrupt my Colleague whom I very much respect, but I just want to ask a small question. Honourable Comrade Geingob, Honourable Viljoen has said that his family was poor, they were settled at a borehole and then later given a loan by Government. In those statistics that you are reading or elsewhere, how many blacks were settled at boreholes and given the same loans so that they can get out of poverty?

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: Thank you very much, Colleague. Seriously, you all know me and the white community knows me, we worked for reconciliation. We said, let us hold hands and nobody can doubt that, but for any white person to sit especially in the Parliament and to try to act like we were equal in the colonial time is misleading. First, he is fooling himself and misleading the people outside, definitely, because we know there was Apartheid here. If a white person claims to be poor, he would join us. We are not saying there are no white people who are poor, Honourable Kazenambo said there are whites who are poor and we agree, there are some poor white people, but the other day the Honourable Member was quoting statistics of language groups and he said German-speaking, zero poor persons, English-speaking, zero poor persons. But since you are Afrikaans-speaking, maybe there are poor people. Now, are you denying the fact that white people had privileges and about seven years ago I even said they were now joined by a new middle class of bourgeoisie of 5% of blacks. Why do you want to defend

these things? (Intervention)

HON VILJOEN: Not five.

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: 10%. I wish it could have been 50%, but you know it is not true. These are realities and we have to be honest if we want to solve the problem. We have to address the Cancer and not look at symptoms and we have diagnosed the disease. You are making a serious mistake. We are impressed that you are gathering a few black people at rallies and therefore, you are going to Katutura. I do not know why the whites go there. Now it is a question of recruiting the blacks, maybe giving them a little food because they are hungry. (Interjections). Former DTA. Why are there whites at your rallies?

Colleagues, unless we all join hands to also tackle political issues and economic issues, we are going to live in a dream world, we are not going to be solving the problem. Let us be realistic.

Let me go on and let me quote and I want us to discuss these figures as Namibians. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: May I ask a question? Sometimes you may see a black woman here in town, crossing the street carrying wood on her head. If we were to see a white woman carrying wood, the whole Namibia will call each other and say, “*look!*” Do you not think everybody will come running and say something has happened to Namibia, something is wrong?

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT
HON DR GEINGOB**

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: I do not want to be quoted that I am making a hate speech, as people normally like to do. Therefore, let me talk about statistics.

All of us who are here know we come from different backgrounds. If my children, who are privileged, are going to be told ten years from now, "*you are privileged*", they should not deny that. I will teach them and say, "*I suffered for you so that you can be better off.*" But to deny that whites were better off is not being honest and that is not going to help us to solve the problem together.

When my Colleagues used to say, "*do not buy our stolen land*", I used to say, "*if a white person came and stole your land a hundred years ago and a white boy was born on that soil, are you visiting the sins of the father on that child? That child is a born Namibian with the same privileges and rights like any black Namibian.*" The people are saying, "*I was also born on a white man's farm and I must equally have the same privileges.*" These are realities. We are not visiting the sins of apartheid fathers to the free, liberated Namibians. I hope they are liberated and if they are liberated they should know where we came from. We cannot pretend the country was always peaceful like that, that we were sitting together with whites and blacks, eating together, joking together and dancing together. It was not like that. Unless we recognise that, we are not going to be able to solve our problems. Please, do not feel guilty, we are talking about realities of our country. (Interjections).

Therefore, let me go on with my statistics. Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger. There is and was extreme poverty and hunger and it is still there. Proportion of households living in relative poverty, 38%, it went down to 28%, it must be going down. It has been said there is no improvement, people are getting poorer and poorer. Proportion of households living in extreme poverty, 9% that time, now 4%. It must have gone down, there is a change. Achieve universal primary education – these are dealing with the Millennium Development Goals – primary school enrolment, 89 if you counted all population groups lumped together. In 2004, 94%, in 2006, 95%. By now it is about close to 98%. These are facts, these are statistics. Are we denying that progress has been made? Why always be

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT
HON DR GEINGOB**

negative?

Survival rate for Grade 5 – 1990 - 75%, 2003 - 94%, 2006 - 95%. It must be more. Literacy rate between 15 and 24 years: In 1990 – 88%, 2003 – 89% and 2006 – 94%. It must be higher now. (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I am sorry to disrupt the Honourable Minister, I just wanted to find out something. Is that Report for 2004 or 2006 that the Honourable Minister is referring to? At the beginning I thought the Minister was saying the Report of 2004.

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: I give you facts here. If the facts are painful and you want to divert it, that is alright. The Report says 2004 here and then it goes on to 2006 that is not my problem. Now that you saw I am hitting, pointing out, you want to divert. We cannot do things like that. Let them grow up. I keep on saying the figures are going up or going down, that is a fact you must take when we go to tangents, that means you are in trouble.

Gender equality and empowerment, primary education girls per hundred boys, in 1990 – 102, 2003 – 100 and 2006 – 100. They say good progress is made. Secondary education girls per hundred boys: In 1990 – 124, in 2001 – 113. They say it is slow, not quite good. Tertiary education girls, it was 162 in 1990, 111 and 100. Again they say it is good. I do not see the point there.

Proportional seats held by women in National Assembly – 9% in 1990, 19% in 2003 and 30%t in 2006, but obviously today you know it is about 32%. We have actually met the SADC requirement.

This Report is talking about shortcomings too, it is trying to analyse what we are going through and any analysts who does not give both sides of a story is not a good researcher. Just to select negatives to paint the country

26 November 2008 **MOTION ON ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT**
HON DR GEINGOB

in a bad light, it will be shameful if I am doing that.

Infant mortality – 1 000 live births, it was 67%, in 2003 – 52% in 2006 – 36%. Not good. Under five mortality rate, again in 1990 – 87%, in 2003 – 71%, in 2006 – 54%, again coming down although slow. Proportion of one year old children immunised against measles: 57, 71, 80%. Very good.

So, really, let me not bore you with these figures because I am making my point and we are getting nervous. The biggest problem we have ...
(Intervention)

HON VENAANI: Honourable Deputy Speaker, may I ask the Honourable Minister a question? Honourable Minister, you are propagating that the Opposition is bashing your Government, but when in your political career since Independence have you congratulated the Opposition for having said the right things for the country or is the Opposition only bashing the Government and not saying something positive?

Secondly, on the score of the statistics, I am impressed by your statistics and how it was written, but I am not sure whether they address the Motion at hand.

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: On the first question, I isolate individuals from the opposition who make sense, like you sometimes and I will say when somebody from the Opposition is making sense – sometimes, not always. I just had an interview in the United States and I talked about elections. I said it is not perfect in our country although we maintain our democratic culture and peace and unity, not only because of the Ruling Party, but because of the Opposition Parties too. It is written somewhere, I can give you that. Therefore, where I have to point out the truth I will do that, but you do not give the

26 November 2008 **MOTION ON ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT**
HON DR GEINGOB

opportunity quite often to do that, because most of the times you are negative, you are cry babies and you want to get sympathy through crying foul. That is the problem.

The second question, I answer questions that make sense. This is a Debate and it is dealing with poverty, to empower whom? The poor people. You cannot be empowered if you are not poor, so we are dealing with poverty, to empower them. It is the same thing.

I was trying to say that Government and everybody is aware that because of HIV/AIDS there were setbacks in the progress we were making in health, but you cannot blame that all on the Government. It is a worldwide problem, actually a crisis and we ought to work together to solve it and we are doing it. However, you come here and blame it on the Government. Can I ask the Honourable Members on that side, when we maintain democracy and peace here, is it just because of us on this side? I thought we are all contributing, but if we are all contributing to that and bad things in the society are only caused by the Ruling Party and Government, then it follows that all other good things are also just because of the Ruling Party. Do not argue like that! (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I would like to put a question to the Honourable Minister after hitting the nail on the head. Honourable Minister, do you think Honourable Mudge would dare to address a rally in Katutura if we did not promote reconciliation, political harmony and mutual acceptance in this country?

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: Well, I talked about Honourable Dirk Mudge, we had Honourable Pretorius, we came together to say we were wrong, let us start anew. I would have thought that people who came after the them would be more progressive, more enlightened to see the reality. Of course, it is true, his father sat down with us and paved the way so that we can have this reconciliation and I would have thought

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT
HON DR GEINGOB**

that even the son would have been so gracious to say, “*you, the founding fathers, thank you for allowing me to be here, to have my own Party which is going to have even blacks as members*” – I hope as equal members.

They could have said that, but people want to be negative and when I point out the truth and the truth hurts, they think we are attacking them. I am not attacking anybody personally, but facts are facts.

I was talking about HIV/AIDS and here are some statistics on that score. HIV/AIDS prevalence among 13 to 19 year old women, 6%, it went up to 11 percent and then down to 9%. It should now be further down. HIV/AIDS prevalence among 22 to 24 old year old women: It was 11%, went up to 22% in the year 2003 and then went down to 15%. Even there progress is being made. Dear Colleagues, let us be realistic, it is our country, we cannot build it by trying to be negative and by exaggerating.

TB treatment success rate: 58, 69, 75%. These are facts, not propaganda. Environmental and development partnerships – these are all things you know, we are doing very well.

Proportional households with access to safe, clean water. This is very important, we talked about water today. In 1990 – 45% and you all know that is the truth, unless you were not travelling to the northern areas that time and were just living in Windhoek and the Police Zone. It is understandable, not your fault. Then in 2003, 80 percent! *Hoor julle? Moet ek Afrikaans praat?* 80% and also 80% in 2006 and it must have gone up. 80% from 45%! Is that not progress? Tjihuiko, is that not progress?

Proportion of households with access to basic sanitation, bucket toilets and so on. 15%, then it became 21% and it is now 50% or more, because these are old figures. Did you hear that? Did you hear that? (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE AND ATTORNEY GENERAL: I would just like to pose a small question particularly on this issue of bucket toilets. I do not know which other countries in the world have a system such as ours called bucket toilets. Comrade Minister, have you ever heard of that system elsewhere in white residential areas of Namibia? Have you ever heard it being mentioned and who created such a system, by the way?

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: When I was in the United States I learned a lot of the black people's struggle there and the slaves had buckets. Slaves were given bucket toilets. But it is a poverty issue and where you have racial divides, that is always high – Brazil, South Africa and Namibia. Again it shows that racialism ... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: I am so sorry to interrupt my Vice-President, but Comrade Vice President, through the Deputy Speaker, it is on a point of order. In the late seventies when my brother, who is now the Director of Education in Karas, was studying in South Africa at Western Cape, his coloured friend came to visit and the next morning he wanted to go to the bathroom – and we also had that bucket system, but because of the SWAPO Women Council, led by me, we threw them in the municipality and then we got flush toilets, but anyway, leaving that one – then he asked, "*August, waar is die toilet?*" He said: "Outside there." Then he ran out and he said: "*Hoekom gaar julle kak op?*" Why are you collecting this stuff?

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I thank my daughter for the information provided, but in conclusion, what I am trying to do is just to appeal to all of us as Namibians, because I am a very proud Namibian when I see our races. Sometimes I sit there at Independence Avenue and I watch our people

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT
HON DR GEINGOB**

moving, black and white, all ethnic groups mingling, walking around as free people and I am very proud. When I came in 1989 I was sitting there and I never used to see so many blacks there. These are the facts. 09:00 they must go to Katutura, out of the city, this former Kaiser Strasse. These are realities! You have to know history to know where you are today and ... (Interjection). Why do you want to defend apartheid? When there was apartheid here, the blacks had to go. Are you denying that? (Interjection).

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Henk Mudge, where did you get the Floor? Honourable Mudge, do not look down on me, do you hear me? Do not look down on me, let us change our behaviour. You just have your way of addressing issues, that is not the way.

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: I will stand here and say that there are problems in this country. After we came into power there were problems, there were challenges and it does not make me to feel guilty because I am saying that. Why should somebody sit here and do you not think you are insulting us? We, the black people, were oppressed in this country, the black people were excluded in this country. We are now sitting here together, trying to address that issue. What I am trying to say is, do not put the blame on one side only. (Intervention)

HON MOONGO: On a Point of Information. We are talking about reconciliation and progress and non-progress, did SWAPO not fail in 18 years to change the bucket system? Was that not enough time for you to change the bucket system? We have Article 17 and we have the right to campaign freely and you are still beating up people in Outapi. Is that really fair? You are guilty and you will remain guilty!

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT
HON DR GEINGOB**

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: I was trying to conclude and I was trying to say that these kinds of reactions and debate of denial is not going to lead us in maintaining unity and peace and the eventual economic equality we are looking for. We can only reach that if we can admit – like even the Americans are admitting today and therefore, elected a black man... (Intervention)

HON VENAANI: I am terribly sorry, but the apartheid system was so dehumanising, to the point that we never understood why we had toilets outside. In winter or in the rain you had to run from the house to the toilet and today it is even more expensive to build a toilet outside the house, it is cheaper to have it in the house because some of the walls would cover you. The reason why we had outside toilets was to dehumanise us, it was not making economic sense to build an outside toilet, but it was just to dehumanise you. Look at Khomasdal, Khomasdal the toilets were inside, Katutura's were outside. These are some of the realities.

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: Can you hear me? Open your ears! I do know that there are some spots, some individuals who make sense in the opposition and you are one of them. Did you hear me now? (Intervention)

HON VILJOEN: Honourable Deputy Speaker, may I ask a question? We are not defending apartheid, it is not true, but I want to ask the Honourable Minister a question. He said the Americans voted for a black man as President. Do you know that we also vote for a black man in this country as President?

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: I was saying there are some and maybe just one or two. It is always one and then the other one goes back to the fold to defend the party line and destroy their good record and then the next day, like today, what you have said just summarises what I was saying. You are now supporting me from that side, that what I was saying is so true. Dehumanising things were put in place to dehumanise blacks. That is how I like a black person to talk. I would also like to have a white person saying yes, things were wrong, let us hold hands and correct it. Thank you very much.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I recognise Honourable Dr Tjiriange.

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: I will be very brief without preliminaries. As I was listening to Honourable Dienda, I thought I should say a few things because she touched on something very important, economic empowerment.

Sometimes we are doing things which are not necessarily in the interest of what we want to achieve because of the system in which we were forced. You know our background and what we wanted and we watered it down, it came to something similar to capitalism here and because of that, we have a problem with empowerment because you are talking about freedom of what, protection, and those who have are getting more and more and suppressing the ones who do not have. I want to give examples of the process of empowerment.

Some of the programmes that we want to have in place are being destroyed by capitalist organisations. Take the cement industry, today we do not have cement here, you will not find it in the shops, but when Cheetah Cement wanted to come here, Holcim immediately came with a strategy of sabotaging what we wanted to achieve. The cement went down to N\$20 per bag ... (Intervention)

26 November 2008

**MOTION ON ECONOMIC EMPOWERMENT
HON DR TJIRIANGE**

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: May I ask a question? Comrade Minister, are you aware that that owner of the cement came to our Namibian businesses and said if you buy five bags, you are given three free of charge? Are you aware that that is how they sabotage the economy of this country?

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: This is exactly what I am saying, that there was a big strategy to make sure that we do not have our own independent cement industry here. The moment that they succeeded, they went back to where they are and today a bag of cement is even N\$130. The same with the vehicles. We had something in Gobabis and there was even one in Witvlei. What happened? The big companies elsewhere had to sabotage so that we do not empower ourselves. When we want to produce our agricultural products here, they make them elsewhere and sell them cheaper so that our supermarkets do not buy from ourselves.

Because of the system we have we do not have power to protect our infant industries and as long as we have that, it will be very difficult for us to empower ourselves.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: On that note the House is adjourned until tomorrow at 14:30 under Rule 90.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:45 UNTIL 2008.11.27 AT 14:30

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
ASSEMBLY CHAMBER
27 NOVEMBER 2008
WINDHOEK**

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

ANNOUNCEMENT

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: First announcement from the Speaker's Desk. The National Assembly Secretariat HIV/AIDS Committee wishes to announce that in commemoration of the World Day on the 1st of December 2008, the Secretariat arranged a voluntary counselling and testing session for both Members of Parliament and the staff. It will be a mobile clinic and will start at 10:00 and end at 13:00 in the foyer. Honourable Members should be counselled and tested. Please be informed that no testing result will be made available to the organising committee. End of announcement.

Any Petitions? Reports of Standing and Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Dr Iyambo.

**TABLING: ANNUAL REPORT
MINISTRY OF FISHERIES AND MARINE RESOURCES**

HON MINISTER OF FISHERIES AND MARINE RESOURCES: I lay upon the Table, the Annual Report of the Ministry of Fisheries and Marine Resources, 2006.

27 November 2008

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON MUNGUNDA**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please table the Report. Notice of Questions? Notice of Motions? Message from the Head of State? Ministerial Statements? Honourable Minister.

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT:
GENDER-BASED VIOLENCE**

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Members of this august House, allow me first and foremost to extend my condolences to the family members who lost their beloved ones through gender-based violence. Our hearts are with them.

Violence against women is both a cause and consequence of discrimination against women and their inequalities and subordination and the continued pervasive violence against women undermines progress towards the goals of human rights, development and peace. Our Constitution, which is the Supreme Law of our country, accords every Namibian citizen the right to live a dignified life, enjoying his or her fundamental freedoms and rights. However, heinous acts of violence are perpetrated against women and children, which is contrary to our Constitution and also for those ones who are coming into our borders.

His Excellency President Hifikepunye Pohamba officially this year's sixteen days of activism on the 21st of November 2008 and also launched a high-level strategic sectoral committee of gender-based violence. This year's theme is, "*As we stand united against abuse of women and children, baby dumping and human trafficking.*"

Securing gender equality and ending violence against women is very high on our Government's agenda. His Excellency President Hifikepunye Pohamba sent a strong message that gender-based violence should not be

27 November 2008

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON MUNGUNDA**

treated as an optional or marginal task, but it should be on everybody's agenda, Government, private sector, Traditional Authorities, civil society organisation, state-based organisations, community-based organisations, NGOs and churches and it is against this background that Cabinet in 2002, when my mother was the Minister of Women Affairs and I was the Deputy, resolved that a high-level strategic inter-sectoral committee on gender-based violence be established, which was amended in 2002, through the Ministry of Gender Equality and Child Welfare.

The committee's primary role would be to advise on the roadmap for combating gender-based violence at household and community levels and to develop and strengthen the implementation of various strategies which aimed at eliminating gender-based violence in our country. Our Cabinet also resolved that this committee be a cross-sectoral committee and be launched by the highest office, His Excellency.

Last year, Dr Kawana, the Minister of Presidential Affairs and Acting Attorney-General, officiated on behalf of His Excellency President Pohamba, at the National Conference on Gender-based Violence which was held in Windhoek in June last year, which adopted various recommendations that are multi-sectoral, outlining responsibilities and capacity gaps that required to be strengthened to improve the implementation of laws, policies and programmes aimed at the elimination of gender-based violence. It is my hope that these recommendations and other strategies will be the primary focus for implementation.

Gender-based violence reflects and reinforces inequities between men and women and compromises the health, dignity, security and autonomy of its victims. It encompasses a wide range of human right violations, including sexual abuse of women and children, rape, domestic violence, sexual assaults and harassment, trafficking in persons and several harmful traditional practices. Anyone of these abuses can leave deep psychological scars and damage the health of women and girls in general, including their reproductive and sexual health and in some instances result in death.

From the daily crime Reports, incidents of domestic violence and violence

27 November 2008

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON MUNGUNDA**

in general are on the increase in Namibia. Babies, young girls and even grandmothers are among the victims. According to the national statistics on gender-based violence – the database which was launched in 2006 by the First Lady – 12,563 cases were Reported to the Namibian Police in 2007 and these are only the Reported cases, because most of the cases are not Reported. These are incidents of assault, attempted rape, grievous bodily harm and murder, of which grievous bodily harm recorded the highest, which is 10,652 out of 12,563, followed by rape, which is 1,111, while murder is 329 and indecent assault and attempted rape recorded below 300 cases.

The Government of the Republic of Namibia, on its commitments to eradicate and combat gender-based violence and violence in general, put in place the following laws to protect the rights of women, men and children. Such laws are:

Combating of Rape Act 8 of 2002;
Combating of Rape Act 8 of 2000;
Maintenance Act 9 of 2003;
Married Persons Equality Bill;
Immoral Practices Amendment Act; and
Children's Status Act.

In addition to the above legal instruments, Women and Child Protection Units, which we are doing in a joint venture with the Ministry of Safety and Security, who was also present at the official launch this year, were also established in all 13 Regions where the main objective is to assist victims and domestic violence and give them a place of safety. Furthermore, the Government is a signatory to various international instruments and further commits itself to protect the rights of its citizens through the fulfilment of Namibia's responsibilities under the Beijing Platform for Action and the UN Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women, the 1992 African Charter on the Rights of the Child, 2004, Protocol to the African Charter on Human Rights and People's Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa, 1992, the SADC Addendum on the Prevention and Eradication of Violence against Women and Children and many more. Recently, the SADC Protocol on

27 November 2008

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON MUNGUNDA**

Gender and Development was signed by the Heads of State at the last summit in 2008 in South Africa.

Comrade Deputy Speaker, Members of this august House, after my speech flowers will be distributed for the sixteen days of activism and I also prepared these ribbons which we will wear for the 16 days against gender-based violence and also a poem, and I will quickly read the poem which will be distributed:

This is a reflection of a young lady who was killed by her husband through gender-based violence and someone wrote a reflection on her funeral and I am reading his poem:

“We had our first argument last night and he said a lot of cruel things that really hurts me; I know he is sorry and didn’t mean the things he said, because he sent me flowers today. I got flowers today, it was not our anniversary or any other special day. Last night he threw me into a wall and started to choke me. I think like a nightmare, I could not believe it was real, I woke up the next morning sore and bruised all over. I know he must be sorry because he sent me flowers today. I got flowers today and it was not Mother’s Day or any other special day, last night he beat me up again, it was much worse than all the other times. If I leave him, what will I do, how will I take care of my kids, what about money? I am afraid of him and scared to leave, but I know he must be sorry because he sent me flowers today. I got flowers today, today was a very special day, it was the day of my funeral. Last night he finally killed me, he beat me to death. If only I had gathered enough courage to leave him, I would not have gotten flowers today, the day of my funeral.”

I thank you, Comrade Speaker, for allowing me this and call on all my Colleagues that we talk about gender-based violence and the solution. May God bless you all, thank you.



27 November 2008

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON NGHIDINWA**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I recognise the Honourable Minister of Home Affairs and Immigration.

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT:
NATIONAL DOCUMENTS**

HON MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION:

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, I rise to inform the august House and the Nation out there on the activities going on throughout the country. The mobile programmes to issue birth certificates and Namibian identity cards started at the beginning of November this year until March 2009. However, when I visited some Regions, like Gobabis, Windhoek, Eenhana, Oshakati, Ondangwa, Rundu and Tsumeb, the identity documents are still piling up there. The Ministry is now doubting whether some people are just applying and never come back to collect their national documents and the same with the Namibian passports. The system is now working faster, waiting periods were reduced drastically. Please come and collect your identity documents.

I would like to invite all those who applied for their identity documents from 1990 up to 2008 to go to their Regional Offices to collect their national documents rather than to go for new applications during these mobile operations. Double registration is a waste of resources and time.

One example is the newly established sub-Regional offices. When I visited them, for example Kahenge sub-Regional offices in Kavango Region where people used to complain of long distances to reach the Regional office in Rundu, but now their identity documents are still piling up in that newly established office. We gave instructions to all our officers in the Regions to list the names and places of birth of all those applicants' identity documents in the offices and send them to the media, churches and the Regional Councillor's offices for announcements.

27 November 2008

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON NGHIDINWA**

If a particular person has passed away, please notify or Report it to the Ministry of Home Affairs and Immigration so that we can destroy or remove it from the stock.

For the Nation out there, we are humbly requesting them to be patient, stay in your places and stick to the programmes. The mobile teams will reach all the corners of the country. The staff members of the Ministry of Home Affairs and Immigration are working together with the Honourable Governors and other councillors to inform the Nation where to go to acquire national documents.

The applicants need to have their baptism card from the churches and if possible, to bring along health passports and the parents' identity documents. Parents need to register their children with correct names to avoid the issue of changing of names at a later stage, which is the case in the Ministry now. It was discovered that some of the names that were wrongly printed on national documents was attributed by the parents themselves during the registration process. For example, a mother registering children without consulting the fathers or children registered by grandparents with nicknames. However, human error by staff members are also noticed in that regard and we will correct it.

Therefore, dear fellow citizens, national documents are our identity for today at any stage up to the day when we are going to depart from this planet. Correct date of birth and the names are needed on our national documents at all times.

Lastly, I would like to encourage the staff members of the Ministry to respect older people at all places during this process. You need to give them all the necessary information, not just to send them back. I noted that some citizens from Omaheke, Otjozondjupa and Erongo were sent back to their Regions. Some of them came there many years back and got married in those Regions. They are well-known by communities and church leaders within those specific areas. I think it is better to register them where they are, as the system of the Ministry is now computerised, talking to each Region. Let us solve the problem once and for all.

27 November 2008

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON NGHIDINWA**

Foreign national should go through the right process to become Namibians. With the Angolan nationals who stayed in Namibia for many years the problem will be solved in due course. Police, headmen, chiefs, councillors and all community members need to put their eyes to those mobile trucks and buses, it is your property. Once again, go and register yourself for birth certificates and identity documents, collect your identity documents and keep them safe.

With these few words, I wish you a Merry Christmas and a Happy New Year for 2009. Thank you very much.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any further Ministerial Statements? Question 87 is by Honourable Nora Schimming-Chase to the Minister of Foreign Affairs. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS

QUESTION 87:

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: I Put the Question.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker, for the opportunity. It is not true that clarity does not exist regarding the Line Ministry in Question No. 87. My response to this question is that the question is misdirected. Should the Honourable Member wish to get any assistance as far as this question is concerned, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs will be more than willing to provide advice accordingly. I thank you.

27 November 2008

**RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS
HON TWEYA**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Question No. 88 is by Honourable Tjihuike to the Minister of Finance. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

QUESTION 88:

HON TJIHUIKO: I Put the Question.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I did not have time to consult with the Minister as she does not feel well today. This question can stand over.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Question 92 is by Honourable Mr Viljoen to the Right Honourable Prime Minister. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

QUESTION 92:

HON VILJOEN: I Put the Question.

HON DEPUTY PRIME MINISTER: I am sorry, as the previous speaker said, we did not consult, so let it lapse for next year.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Question 94 is by Honourable Moongo to the Minister of Foreign Affairs. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

27 November 2008

**RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS
HON LUCAS**

QUESTION 94:

HON MOONGO: I Put the Question.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Thank you very much, Honourable Deputy Speaker, for the opportunity to respond to Honourable Moongo's question of the 23rd of October 2008.

Honourable Speaker, earlier this year the Namibian Embassy in Angola conducted an interview with so-called Namibian prisoners in Angola and concluded that most of these prisoners are Angolans, while others are nationals from West Africa, claiming to be Namibian citizens. Upon further investigation the Namibian Embassy in Angola concluded that none of the names provided by Honourable Moongo do exist.

On the question of Namibians being forced to vote for MPLA, I must categorically emphasise that no Namibians have been made to unlawfully vote in the recent Angolan elections or any other elections for that matter. I thank you.

HON MOONGO: Thank you for the answer, but the fact remains the same that there people are there, I have concrete information.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Question 95 is by Honourable Moongo to the Minister of Foreign Affairs. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

QUESTION 95:

HON MOONGO: I Put the Question.

27 November 2008

**RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS
HON LUCAS**

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Thank you very much once again, Honourable Deputy Speaker, for the opportunity to respond to Honourable Moongo's question of the 30th of October 2008.

Honourable Moongo asked the Minister of Foreign Affairs if it is true or false that in many Angolan prisons and police cells, Ondjiva and Peu-Peu in particular, there is a long death list of those who died in detention and is it true that most of the names are that of Namibians?

The Ministry of Foreign Affairs was not aware of Namibians being detained in Ondjiva by the Angolan National Department of Criminal Investigation until it was informed by the Namibian Embassy in Luanda that it received an anonymous e-mail dated the 21st of October 2008 from a certain Mr Emilio Mbango of the National Society for Human Rights. In the said e-mail there is a direct link to the first question posed by Honourable Moongo. The question is stated as follows: *"I want to ask the Minister of Foreign Affairs if he is aware of the Namibian citizens who are being detailed illegally by the Angolan authority in Ondjiva town since the 29th of August 2008. These people are being kept in different prisons and they are being tortured, starves."*

Honourable Deputy Speaker, I found it strange that the questions posed by Honourable Moongo are similar to the ones posed by the National Society for Human Rights to the Namibian Mission some time ago. The Namibian Embassy in Angola conducted an investigation into these allegations and concluded that none of the names provided by the National Society for Human Rights agent, nor by Honourable Moongo, do exist.

Furthermore, I am not aware of a long death list of those who died in detention in Angolan prisons and police cells, as claimed by Honourable Moongo.

Question 2: Honourable Moongo may recall that the Government of the Republic of Namibia, through the Office of the Prime Minister, requested the International Committee of the Red Cross to conduct such an investigation in the early nineties. The International Committee of the

27 November 2008

**RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS
HON LUCAS**

Red Cross conducted its investigations and compiled a series of Reports which were tabled in the National Assembly during that period. Since this exercise was undertaken already, I see no reason why the Government or the International Committee of the Red Cross should conduct another investigation into Namibians who disappeared at the time referred to by Honourable Moongo.

Question 3: Honourable Moongo asked the Minister to explain as to why the Convention of Missing Persons was not ratified in Namibia. Honourable Deputy Speaker, I have to request Honourable Moongo to be more specific in naming the convention in question, because according to the records of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and the United Nations such a convention does not exist. I thank you very much.

HON MOONGO: I thank you for the answer, but on the last one, I think the Convention on the Disappearance of Missing Persons is well-known to everybody and it is a pity if the Ministry says that there is no such convention. Thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Question 96 is by Honourable Moongo to the Minister of Justice. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

QUESTION 96:

HON MOONGO: I Put the Question.

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, may I ask the indulgence of the Honourable Member to reintroduce this question next year, given the fact that the Honourable Minister of Justice and the Deputy are not here?

27 November 2008

**RESPONSES TO QUESTIONS
HON TWEYA**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Question 98 is by Honourable Schimming-Chase to the Minister of Finance. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

QUESTION 98:

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: I Put the Question.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: It will stand over, Honourable Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The question lapses. Question 100 is by Honourable Moongo to the Honourable Speaker Honourable Member, I Rule this question Out of Order.

The Standing Rules and Orders only make provisions for questions to be put to Minister, not to the Presiding Officers. This question should be directed to the Right Honourable Prime Minister responsible for the Public Service under which this question resorts. Rules 77 and 81 will tell you where you should address your questions. Therefore, the question is Ruled Out of Order, no discussion.

Question 101 is by Honourable Viljoen to the Minister of Finance. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

QUESTION 101:

HON VILJOEN: I Put the Question.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: I ask the indulgence of the Honourable Member to reintroduce the question next year.

27 November 2008

**RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS
HON NAMOLOH**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Question 102 is by Honourable Moongo the Minister of Defence. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

QUESTION 102:

HON MOONGO: I Put the Question.

HON MINISTER OF DEFENCE: Thank you, Comrade Deputy Speaker. I would like to answer the questions put by Honourable Moongo, but first I would like to register my disappointment on the way the Honourable Moongo states his question. This question does not clarify as to what, where and when it happened. He is supposed to present clear information so that we can answer. I nevertheless want to respond to the Honourable Member as follows:

The Ministry of Defence has no knowledge of member or members of the Namibian Navy being victimised. Namibia is a democratic country and no institution is above the law, including the NDF. I would like to point out that the Namibian Navy, like the whole NDF, has laid-down procedures in place for the chain of command which the members could use to air their grievances, as stipulated in the Defence Act 1 of 2002 and the Military Disciplinary Code (MDC). However, if the Honourable Member is in possession of concrete information that the Defence Act was not followed properly, I am requesting him for this information to be furnished to my office for proper investigation to be instituted.

On the issue concerning human rights, the NDF respects each individual member's rights. For this reason, the Navy encourages its members to Report cases of human rights violation to the authority for proper investigation to be carried out.

With regard to democracy, I would like to inform the Honourable Member that Military organisations all over the world have one command systems. Military commanders are not elected but are appointed. The commanders' orders and decisions are not questioned unless they are

27 November 2008

**RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS
HON NAMOLOH**

illegal in terms of the Namibian Constitution and the law of armed conflict. Therefore, in that sense one can say there is no democracy in the NDF.

Question 2: In his second question Honourable Moongo asked: *“When are we going to be educated in capacity-building and democracy and human rights as part of the Namibian Constitution?”*

My answer to the Honourable Member is that a member of the Namibian Defence Force, including the Navy, know their human rights and the supremacy of the Namibian Constitution to all laws of the country. Thus, they are ready every time to sacrifice their precious lives in defence of their country and the Constitution. When seamen join as recruits, they undergo a basic military training at Osona Military School in Okahandja and in this training, whatever the subjects, they get introduced to the Defence Act (Act 1 of 2002) and the Military Disciplinary Code in which they are taught about their rights, what to do in case their rights are infringed, etcetera.

Therefore, I am convinced that the seamen are aware of the avenues that they are to exploit when they feel they are not treated humanely.

Question 3: *“Is it true that healthy relations are deteriorating and that discipline is in danger?”* Again these are mere speculations and allegations. There were no indiscipline cases Reported by the Navy. The NDF is well-equipped to deal with an indiscipline case from any of its members. The Defence Act which was tabled and passed by this august House has provisions to deal with any disciplinary matters.

Question 4: *“Is it true that seamen are resigning due to underpayment? How many resigned since then?”* On this question I want to inform the Honourable Member that low salaries is a national problem and does not only affect the members of the Navy alone. Besides this, naval and air force personnel are in high demand worldwide, even European countries are experiencing brain-drain professionals leaving for greener pastures. I am not aware of a seaman who has resigned, citing underpayment as a reason for his or her resignation. The Government is doing its best to

27 November 2008

**RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS
HON NAMOLOH**

improve the terms and conditions of service of all civil servants, including Defence Force Members.

Question 5: *“Is it true that cleaners are also worse underpaid in the Navy and the Marine?”* The Honourable Member should know that the salary scale of cleaners in the whole Government is the same. There is no salary difference for cleaners of the Ministry of Defence and that of other Government Ministries, Offices or Agencies. If indeed cleaners are underpaid, this is a national problem.

In conclusion, Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, the military profession demands great physical and mental stamina. It is not a profession for the faint-hearted. Recently the Navy was conducting a selection course for those who applied to be inducted in the Marines. This course was physically demanding and some candidates have succumbed and did not make it. It was conducted by naval officers who have undergone the same courses in other countries. Sometimes people have the tendency to raise issues of human rights when they find the going tough. This might be the people who alleged that they are being victimised. I hope I have fully responded to the Honourable Member’s questions, the questions are however too general and I am not in a position to respond to specific issues. My advice to Honourable Moongo is to properly frame his questions, in future to be specific and not to generalise. I thank you.

HON MOONGO: I would like to thank the Honourable Minister for the long answer, but I was also informed that in Defence there is no democracy and how can you defend the country if you do not obey and uphold the Constitution? No human rights, no democracy, what country are you defending now?

HON MINISTER OF DEFENCE: I earlier told the Honourable Member that in the military it is one-man command. Therefore, if you

27 November 2008

**RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS
HON DR AMATHILA**

have to exercise democracy in command issuing, then there will be no Defence Force. You dictate orders, you dictate instructions and the members of the Defence Force are ready to sacrifice their lives for the defence of the country, defending the democracy of this country and the Constitution, as I said earlier on. I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Question 103 is by Honourable Viljoen to the Right Honourable Prime Minister. Does the Member Put the Question?

QUESTION 103:

HON VILJOEN: I Put the Question.

HON DEPUTY PRIME MINISTER: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I do not think this question is worth standing over until next year. Let me just say that honestly, Honourable Viljoen, we talk of democracy, we say people can express themselves, but I am wondering how the Right Honourable Prime Minister would guess, if somebody comes into Namibia and opens his or her mouth, what this person is going to say. You are now asking the Prime Minister that you were not protected. We did not know and I think the Prime Minister was not even there. If people come and they have the right to express themselves, how do we prevent anybody from whatever he or she is saying? Really, to want the Prime Minister to protect everybody does not make sense to me. Could you maybe phrase this question differently because as it stands now, I do not think it is worth answering and it should not even stand over for next year. I think it goes and dies. Thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: On that note the House rises for tea-break.

27 November 2008 **MOTION: ECONOMICAL EMPOWERMENT
HON DR TJIRIANGE**

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:45
HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:15 PURSUANT TO ADJOURNMENT

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Since we are rising today, I ask the Honourable Members to be very brief. The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

**RESUMPTION OF DEBATE: ECONOMIC
EMPOWERMENT OF NAMIBIAN PEOPLE**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on the Economical Empowerment of the Namibian People.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When the House adjourned on Wednesday, 27 October 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Kavetuna. The Honourable Minister of Veterans Affairs had the Floor and he may continue and conclude.

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: Comrade Deputy Speaker, I would like to appeal to the House to let me conclude my contribution without interruption since the time is not on our side.

I was yesterday talking about the sabotage by industrial giants aimed at preventing us to achieve meaningful and independent economic development in our country. I mentioned the example of a cement company which deliberately strategised to prevent Cheetah Cement Factory to operate in Namibia. They deliberately lowered the prices of the cement to force Cheetah out of business, later just to come back and raise the prices again. Having succeeded in doing so, the country is today

27 November 2008

**MOTION: ECONOMICAL EMPOWERMENT
HON DR TJIRIANGE**

suffering because of unacceptable high prices of cement. Should we have stood up and supported the opening of the Cheetah Cement Factory or any other factory for that matter, we could not have had our country in this untenable situation where a bag of cement has actually become so expensive that it is no longer affordable to the majority of the people of our country. I did say the sabotage did not end with the cement industry, the car plant in Gobabis was sabotaged as well. So was the car plant in Witvlei. Our agricultural produce is rotting on the farms, because some products are deliberately dumped here at cheaper prices so that we do not have our own vibrant economic agriculture, that is crop production, etcetera.

Namibia Breweries was also targeted for this sabotage by companies such as South African Breweries. We should develop and adopt an effective policy to protect our infant industries, otherwise we shall never become an industrialised country and expand our manufacturing base and if we do not expand our manufacturing base, we might as well forget about empowering our people.

I know that it is not so easy to do this in the face of the rules of the World Trade Organisation, but we can surely do something to boost industrialisation of our country and reduce poverty as a result.

I think the time has come for us to sit down and put in place tangible measures, even if they appear to be painful and difficult, to prevent foreign companies and foreign economic interest to sabotage our economic development. Economic empowerment of our people cannot be achieved as long as we are helpless against the foreign sabotage of our efforts.

Finally, I would like to comment on the debate which took place yesterday in this august House. Honourable Viljoen was trying to portray himself as having been born from a poor family. Yes, I do not dispute that. His poor family, his parents that is, was settled at a borehole and then required to buy the land. They had to find a loan from financial institutions and buy the land around the borehole. That was indeed a poverty reduction strategy which was targeting the reduction of poverty among the whites,

27 November 2008 **MOTION: ECONOMICAL EMPOWERMENT**
HON DR TJIRIANGE

since this opportunity was only to whites. Not so? I do not think the blacks were receiving these boreholes.

Let us now pause and reflect. Whose land was this on which the boreholes were drilled? What happened to the original owners of this land? That is, who were the people who occupied this land before it became open for the Viljoen family from Angola to buy that piece of land?

HON VILJOEN: Honourable Deputy Speaker, on a point of order. I am referring to the area in the Nossob, south of Aranos. At that time and after that time there was nobody living there. The San people were traditionally going through and hunting, but they did not occupy or work the land.

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: That is now even worse, that is even worse. There is no area in this country where there were no people of this country. There was no area in this country which people of this country did not call that area their ancestral land.

Why was this borehole and financial loan not available to the Tjiriange, Witbooi, Konjore and !Naruseb families? I suppose Tjiriange, Witbooi, Konjore and !Naruseb families were here when the Viljoen family arrived from Angola and they were equally poor and needed that land. I suppose the Tjiriange, Witbooi, Konjore and !Naruseb families were made landless, poor and were thus languishing in poverty in the concentration camps that are called native reserves. We were removed from these areas, put into concentration camps that are known as reserves in order to make room for the Viljoens. That is the situation. The reality and the painful truth... (Intervention)

27 November 2008

**MOTION: ECONOMICAL EMPOWERMENT
HON DR TJIRIANGE**

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I am terribly sorry to interrupt the Honourable Member who is doing so well, but I would like to put a question to him if allowed. Would you agree with me, Honourable Minister, that some of the original inhabitants of that area, starting from Gochas next to the Oab River, stretching to Nossob, are today still refugees in Botswana because of the war? Would you agree with me?

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: This is exactly what I am talking about. Some of these things show the insensitivity by some people on these issues. Today we are in a country where so many good fertile land is owned by some people and they claim it is theirs as if there were no people before. The graves of our forefathers are on those farms that you are occupying. The reality and the painful truth of the matter is that the black people of this country were removed forcefully from the land to make room for you to “buy” the land through the colonial Government scheme which was tailored to reduce or eliminate poverty only amongst whites at the expense of blacks of this country.

Even more painful is the reality of the national reconciliation policy which requires that those who were forcefully and without compensation removed from their land should today buy the same land at such exorbitant prices from the people who were settled on the land through schemes that were designed to drive blacks into poverty. However, for the peace to prevail in our country, we painfully accepted this policy.

However, there should be poverty reduction strategies in the country which will, as a matter of historical reality, take these factors into consideration. I think time has now come for us to sit again and reconsider our land reform policies after having learned from the experience of the implementation of this policy for the last post-Independence years. We cannot pretend that everything is fine with the land reform as we are carrying it out today. We, indeed, need to sit down and make this policy even more user-friendly for the poor and landless people of this country. We are talking about a sensitive issue, we are

27 November 2008 **MOTION: ECONOMICAL EMPOWERMENT**
HON DR RIRUAKO

talking about areas that we remember where our forefathers and foremothers have been buried. Even if you want to go to those areas, we have to ask permission from people who came from Holland. It is very painful.

Therefore, this is the situation and I want to assure you that *aluta continua E vitória é certa* until we get this.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Honourable Members, let me remind you that we should stick to the Motion. I recognise Honourable Chief Riruako.

HON RIRUAKO: I am not here to blame anyone, Deputy Speaker, I blame myself. We have the right to put right what happened to us. Now, why do we keep on accusing one another while we have that right? It is our decision and can be changed by this House. We made a mistake, it creates a problem for us and to erase that problem is for us to come together and to put right what has written without our consent. (Interjection)

HON MEMBER: Which problem?

HON RIRUAKO: I am not here to tell you which problem, you know what we are talking about. You keep on playing and joking until your death, I do not know why. That is not fair, we cannot keep on arguing.

One day I was going to ask permission from Okatjiho to bury a deceased whose father is Tjiho at Okatjiho at and then I was told that the owner of the farm in Germany does not allow the deceased to be buried here.

27 November 2008 **MOTION: ECONOMICAL EMPOWERMENT**
HON RIRUAKO

What? You are not allowed to bury any deceased here, that is the decision of the owner in Germany. He is not even staying there, but the decision is taken in Germany to bar anyone to be buried there. What is that?

We do not know where is our land, where we belong, what is called ours, what is our heritage. The Parliament must tell the people of Namibia where is there heritage, where is their land. We can tell them several good things, but the treasure which belonged to them is not theirs. What is that? It is for us as Parliamentarians to recall what has been written and to rewrite what will benefit the people of this country. (Intervention)

HON VILJOEN: Honourable Deputy Speaker, may I ask the Honourable Chief a question? When God created the Earth, it was vast and empty with no people and then it had people. When your ancestors came to this country, were they the first human beings to live on the land you claim to be yours?

HON RIRUAKO: I am not here to play games. You want to play games. Who was the first in the United States? That is a question. You do not know who was first. It was the Portuguese and who is in the United States today? Everybody. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF EDUCATION: On a Point of Order. The proximity of the two Honourable Members is too close for comfort and they should please speak through the Deputy Speaker of the House.

HON RIRUAKO: There was no black man or half a black man to become the President of the United States. Have you observed Barack Obama's ... (Intervention)

27 November 2008 **MOTION: ECONOMICAL EMPOWERMENT**
HON RIRUAKO

HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: May I ask my Chief just a small question? Honourable Chief, do you not think that maybe in order to preserve peace and blood, we separate the two of you, because you are too close and when the Honourable Chief just looks at his neighbour, we do not know what will happen next, because it seems as if you are addressing your neighbour there.

HON RIRUAKO: My neighbour must control himself and I have to control myself. We cannot keep on arguing, my dear friend, let us settle this matter once and for all and we have to come together as brothers. Therefore, agree with me to rewrite the Constitution in order to benefit everybody in this country. That is the name of the game. Thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I give the Floor to Honourable Kavetuna to reply.

HON KAVETUNA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members. I rise to express my appreciation to all Honourable Members who constructively contributed to this important Motion. Very important to note is that it is my hope that we as decision-makers will ensure that Namibia will narrow the current gap between the rich and the poor by ensuring that the laws passed by this House are being implemented and we as Parliamentarians will exercise our oversight function in the implementation.

Some sectors of Namibians will no longer go to bed on empty stomachs. Available resources are being distributed equally in an effort to alleviate poverty. Tenders are given for the first time to the youth, the women, to avoid over-empowering some selected few. Namibians are empowered to

27 November 2008 **MOTION: ECONOMICAL EMPOWERMENT**
HON RIRUAKO

own strings of big supermarkets, clothing outlets, furniture shops, to name but a few. We will stop giving handouts to people who are not capacitated in terms of manufacturing, skills, management and accounting skills and who will not have the drive to change their own lives.

As I have said in my statement, it is the people who have to initiate and change their own lives, therefore we must no longer give handouts to these people, because all projects that we are wasting money on will collapse.

It is with these few remarks that I would once more like to thank the Honourable House for the overwhelming support during this Debate. Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, initially I brought this Motion to the House for discussion only. I, however, during the lengthy Debate realised the need for a further in-depth study and consultation. Thus I beg the indulgence of this House to refer this Motion to the relevant Parliamentary Standing Committee. I so Move, Honourable Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Table the Motion. I Put the Question that the Motion be adopted. Any objection? Agreed to. The Motion is adopted to be referred to the relevant Committee. The Secretary will read the Second Order of the Day.

RESUMPTION OF DEBATE: MOTION
ON EFFECTS OF SHEBEENS AND ALCOHOL ABUSE

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on the Effects of Shebeens and Increasing Alcohol Abuse in our Communities.

27 November 2008

**MOTION ON EFFECT OF SHEBEENS
HON VENAANI**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When the House adjourned on Wednesday, 22 October 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Kavari. The House adjourned in terms of Rule 90. Any further discussion? I recognise Honourable Venaani.

HON VENAANI: I will be very brief. Honourable Deputy Speaker, I rise support the Motion as Moved by Honourable Kavari of the CoD and I want to raise a few points.

Honourable Speaker, alcohol abuse in this country is one of great concern and yesterday and today many Members were reflecting on the poverty index of this country, why our people are poor and we are confronted with poverty, but poverty is increased by alcohol abuse and I want to speak on alcohol abuse in the context of education. Alcohol abuse is in the classrooms where the Nation's young ones must be educated, sometimes by those that should impart the knowledge and most of the time they are the recipients. The schools are closing tomorrow and if you go to many of the high schools in Windhoek, you will find young boys and girls half drunk, coming from liquor houses and there is this connotation attach to being cool. If you drink then you are a cool young person, if you smoke you are cool. If you drink you are funky. Therefore, I think we have a serious problem of alcohol abuse in this country.

Go to the rural communities, even when we are receiving good rains and people are supposed to plough, they are busy brewing and these are some of the concerns that we have, that we cannot confront poverty ...
(Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: May I ask a question? Honourable Venaani, are you aware that the Traditional Leaders have passed a by-law that during the ploughing season no cuca shop may open between 08:00 to 14:00? Are you aware of that?

27 November 2008

**MOTION ON EFFECT OF SHEBEENS
HON VENAANI**

HON VENAANI: I have heard of it in some communities. In the community I come from you would find people selling their cattle at auctions to take their children to school, but after receiving the cash you would find half of the community drunk. Yes, I have heard of some communities that have put those measures in place, because alcohol is not necessarily bad, but the abuse of it is bad and we really need to have an information campaign on the use of alcohol.

You would find that a person must send his child to university, but when his peers come to that auction, he would Report the N\$2,000 as missing at home, but he was also missing for two days and you do not know what went missing, him or the money. These are some of the problems that society is confronted with and of course, there is this big debate about the mushrooming of shebeens.

The mushrooming of shebeens especially in areas where you have children is a problem and then the shebeens are open up to 03:00 in the morning. Young people, thinking that it is funky to drink, would not even concentrate on their work, so we must implement the law that we have enacted here and make sure that a person who is running a shebeen has a licence.

As we are moving towards the festive season, we will find how many car accidents are caused by drinking and driving. Sometimes it is so painful that this person has taken it upon himself to drink on the road, but he takes the life of a productive Namibian. Surely our citizens should be told that what they are doing is really wrong, because you are taking the life of a productive Namibian that could have contributed and this person loses his life as a result of the recklessness of another person. You can go through all the legal measures, culpable homicide, but a life is lost, there is no compensation whatsoever.

Therefore, I think all of us should be in agreement on this continuous abuse of alcohol. If we look at Botswana – and sometimes we should also copy and apply – the leaders of Botswana are talking about closing the shebeens at 7 o'clock and I want to be record that I am supporting what you have done in Tsumkwe, Honourable Deputy Prime Minister, because

27 November 2008

**MOTION ON EFFECT OF SHEBEENS
HON NGHIDINWA**

it is the reality, the people are abusing alcohol and the businessmen are getting rich but the society is not developing.

I do not want to take much time, being the last day, but I think that the alcohol abuse problem should be addressed and we should address it. (Interjection). He is also in agreement that there is a serious problem and as we are going into the festive season we do not want to hear that twelve people have died. We have a small population of 1,2 million and people die as a result of recklessness and we should be in the forefront of that campaign to make sure that we save lives during this coming festive season.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, with these few remarks, I support the Motion.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Honourable Minister.

HON MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, we can talk about alcohol until tomorrow morning because it is a real problem in our society and that is why I want to commend the Mover of this Motion, Honourable Kavari.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, before Independence we were always told that people are drinking because of the war situation, but shortly after Independence we thought that maybe they are celebrating the Independence. Maybe it is because of war trauma, maybe we are still thinking of the past, but what happened? Namibia lost most of her talented nationals in our communities due to alcohol abuse.

I regard alcohol as the killer number two after HIV/AIDS, because alcohol can force a person to do things which he or she would not normally do.

27 November 2008

**MOTION ON EFFECT OF SHEBEENS
HON NGHIDINWA**

For example, rape, killing somebody and many other social problems, some of them already mentioned by Honourable Venaani. Therefore, Honourable Deputy Speaker, when we are discussing the issue of alcohol abuse, we need to know the root causes of alcohol abuse, the consequences thereof and the effect of alcohol on the society.

Some of the reasons why people are drinking are to release their stress and frustrations, they feel relaxed. Some are kind of socialising and it may be genetic and be inherited because it is my blood. Some families are cannot stay without drinking. Some people think that alcohol can cure some illnesses or diseases. Those who have shebeens say it is a means of income generation. That is why some of them just drink to attract new customers to buy them more and then they become alcoholics.

Traditionally alcohol was only used on special occasions, such as weddings. Some of them were made from local fruits or millet, like sorghum, maroela, etcetera, but the percentage was 0,5 percent per volume. What happened when brown sugar arrived in this country around 1960, is when tombo, ndevere and everything started. What makes alcohol a dangerous substance, bottled in modern bottles, are ethanol and glycerine. These are the substances which make us dependent on alcohol. They make us feel reluctant to sleep and make us feel confused and it makes us drink more. The quantity of such substances depends on the percentage of alcohol per volume in the bottle or in alcohol container. Beers are always between 4,5 to 5 percent, wine from 7 to 14 percent and the strong ones beginning at 40 to 100 percent per alcohol volume.

Alcohol and Health: This substance makes the blood arteries soft, which contributes to internal bleeding. That is why sometimes people who get drunk just leave and are gone forever and then we think that they are bewitched by alcohol, but they are bewitched by alcohol. Such substances are destroying the vital organs of the human being, for example, brain, heart and liver. In some cases it makes men weak, it also reduces production of semen as well as fertility. (Interjection). Yes, that is why you are not getting more babies. It changes the steam of human beings... (Intervention)

27 November 2008

**MOTION ON EFFECT OF SHEBEENS
HON NGHIDINWA**

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, may I request through you the Honourable Minister to explain in detail. Did I hear her saying men are weak or something like that?

HON MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Honourable Deputy Speaker, it weakens the men and reduce their fertility. (Interjections).

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: Then allow us to have more than one wife and you will see the results.

HON MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM: On a Point of Order. I know it was not said by the Minister on the Floor, but it is recorded on the system. Can that be withdrawn, to allow two wives to see the results? Can that be withdrawn?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I did not get it. What was said?

HON MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM: It was said by my father, I do not want to repeat, but I am sure he will agree just to say "*I withdraw.*" If I can quote directly, he said: "*If you allow us to have two wives, you will see the difference, the results.*"

27 November 2008

**MOTION ON EFFECT OF SHEBEENS
HON NGHIDINWA**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Could you withdraw that without conditions?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: With all due respect to my daughter, I withdraw that.

HON MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Comrade Deputy Speaker, it is good that the comrade withdraws, because it would not make sense if you cannot do anything for one wife, what about the two?

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, with all due respect, I would appeal that the Honourable Member on the Floor be Ruled Out of Order for what she just said, because that was withdrawn. It was withdrawn, so she could not remark on that one.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Withdraw, Honourable Member.

HON MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: 50% of diseases and illnesses of patients in Namibia are caused by alcohol abuse.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: May I ask a question? If we do something about the

27 November 2008

**MOTION ON EFFECT OF SHEBEENS
HON NGHIDINWA**

shebeens, what about those supermarkets selling beer where a person can buy in big quantities and go and drink? It was not there before but we introduced it by law and it even caused some shebeens to close down. Even in Shoprite or Pick & Pay, people are buying and they go and drink during the night. What can you say about that?

HON MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: I think the Minister of Trade and Industry will assist us in that regard in future and amend that law. (Intervention)

HON MOONGO: On a Point of Information. Will you not appeal to the other women in Namibia who, because of jealousy, use *juju* (witchcraft) to prevent the husband from going to the other one and now you blame liquor. It is only because of *juju* which you usually use.

HON MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: During the weekends or end of the month, most of the car accidents and beating of wives and children occur because of alcohol abuse. Women who abuse alcohol during pregnancies are giving birth to babies with Fetal Alcohol Syndrome. That child looks normal, but the brain is not normal and sometimes even their appearance is not normal.

Alcohol and the Families: The families with an alcoholic are always affected at all spheres of their lives. They are always worried and stressed due an unsafe environment. Their lives are not guaranteed whether in a car or at home. They spend more money on alcohol which is not returnable. Consequently, unemployment, violence against women and children, death in family and poverty are their daily bread in their lives. Alcohol does not consider the status of a person, whether a person has a Master's or is illiterate, alcohol is like HIV/AIDS, that is why alcohol is the greatest contributing factor to the spread of the HIV virus.

27 November 2008

**MOTION ON EFFECT OF SHEBEENS
HON NGHIDINWA**

It is a fact that alcohol abuse can destroy the human being's life in many ways and pull him down from a high level to the bottom-line. Some researchers concluded that alcohol abuse is a social disease which can complicate the whole life of a human being. Alcohol in our families destroys the cultural values and moral set-up in the communities and promotes laziness, bad behaviour and attitudes in our youth. It minimises the ties of love between families and promotes hatred and less attention to the good upbringing of children.

Alcohol and Education: The 24-hour shebeens are affecting the performance of learners in the society. Most hazards has a psychological effect on the brain. Learners who are alcoholics cannot perform well. Alcohol has been destroying our young Polytech learners and takes them to the street. Teenage pregnancies and early dropout from school are always the consequences of alcohol abuse. Poor performance in Grade 10 and 12 can also be attributed to the abuse of alcohol, sometimes by some teachers and learners. Building shebeens near schools is regarded as a big temptation to both learners and teachers.

Alcohol and Socio-Economic of our Country: Yes, there are those who are thinking that shebeens and bottle stores can boost the economy of the country, but in reality it only empowers the factories and the big companies like breweries. The shebeens do not earn any interest or commission from selling alcohol. I am saying this because I had a shebeen myself some years back in the 1980s. What I have been spending is more than I earned from the shebeen, that is why I stopped it.

When you count the people who died after they used to buy from your shebeens, Honourable Moongo, sometimes they were beaten or died of HIV/AIDS, then you develop inner guilt because you are losing your customers for ever.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, it is not easy to change the selling of alcohol in the country, it needs commitment, understanding and efforts to change the attitude of our people and to replace their business with something else which can sustain their socio-economic lives. Researchers need to do more to determine the problems affecting our societies due to shebeens

27 November 2008

**MOTION ON EFFECT OF SHEBEENS
HON NGHIDINWA**

and alcohol abuse. Rehabilitation centres need to be established in remote areas to rehabilitate those who are affected by alcohol and those who have become total alcoholics. There is already that rehabilitation centres in remote areas do better than ones in urban areas. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY PRIME MINISTER: Can I ask a question? Honourable Minister, the worrying factor for me is our *shibukus* traditional brews where nowadays you read that human parts are found in these drums of homemade alcohol. As the Minister of Home Affairs it would perhaps be nice to get to the Traditional Leaders in the villages and warn against this because the other day we read that a child who disappeared was killed and they are taking these body parts from destitute children and also from old people to make the brew more potent. That is a very worrying thing and now with Christmas time they would want more potent *shibukus*. How can we prevent that?

HON MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Prime Minister, your point is really very important. That is why in my conclusion I will make some recommendations on how we are going to deal with that alcohol problem and other related issues.

Government, churches and other non-Governmental organisations need to do more to sensitise our people to understand the enemy number two, alcohol, and the complications of alcohol abuse in our societies. Women groups and the youth need to lead the way in this campaign against alcohol as they are the victims at the end. We all know women are rape victims, killed and the youth become heads of households of families when parents perish as a result of HIV/AIDS and alcohol related illness.

I want to see a campaign for women not to go to shebeens even for one week in this country. You will see that the men will not go there either, they only go there when the women are there. Let us try that.

27 November 2008

**MOTION ON EFFECT OF SHEBEENS
HON NGHIDINWA**

In the same vein, I would like to encourage women to do more with informal business. During the informal business survey of 2004, they were heading the informal sectors in some Regions. They are making *kapanas*, selling of baskets, timber, old clothes, tailoring and many others. When you visit most of the open markets, you will see that there is a change from shebeens to other sustainable income generation. That is why they need more financial assistance and I would like to congratulate the Ministry of Trade and Industry because they are doing well to support this women. However, we need them to reduce shebeen licences and replace it with other opportunities, for example manufacturing companies, etcetera.

The Agriculture Ministry needs to work together with the Ministry of Trade and Industry, the Ministry of Gender Equality and Child Welfare, the Ministry of Youth to promote exchange programmes of business women and youth within the country and outside the country for them to learn that people cannot be sustained from shebeen income generation only, but also from other business opportunities. China, India, Philippines, Madagascar, Ghana, Zimbabwe, Tanzania are some of the good examples.

Change of attitude takes time and it takes time for people to realise their own mistakes. I hope that with an awareness campaign we will overcome the problem.

HON MOONGO: On a Point of Information with regard to what Honourable Dr Amathila said. In my area somebody was accused of having body parts in the tombo and then he ended up being beaten up and killed and I was present afterwards when we threw the tombo out and there was nothing. It was a matter of jealousy. This happened in my area, I do not say it did not happen in other areas. It was only accusations and no parts were found in the tombo, but the man was dead.

27 November 2008

**MOTION ON EFFECT OF SHEBEENS
HON NGHIDINWA**

HON MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION:

Change of attitude takes time as some individuals spend more time at the denial stage to realise their own mistakes. I hope with the awareness campaign we will overcome the problem.

The advertisement of alcohol through the media needs to be minimised at all costs because it promotes the desire of drinking. (Intervention)

HON NASHANDI: On a Point of Information. Comrade Deputy Speaker, there exists technology to brew beer without alcohol. During my twelve year stay in Libya I came to realise that their beer does not contain any alcohol at all.

HON MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION:

Thank you very much for the information. Therefore, let us unite and work together, one can overcome the problem of alcohol and the increase of shebeens in the societies. We need to be good examples to the Nation in all our endeavours, like what the Honourable Deputy Prime Minister has done at Tsumkwe and Bravo. You can see that those people have really changed their minds.]

With these many words, I support the Motion and propose that the Motion be referred to the Standing Committee on Human Resources, Social and Economic Development for further discussions by the public and I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Does Honourable Kavari wish to reply?

27 November 2008

**MOTION ON EFFECT OF SHEBEENS
HON KAVARI**

HON KAVARI: Honourable Deputy Speaker, allow me to thank everybody who has contributed to this very important Motion, in my view, that looks at the well-being of our society. There was an unanimous agreement that alcohol is ruining our community and that its distribution should be controlled and also that we should embark on awareness to teach people on responsible drinking.

We have a law that was enacted in this august House and as it was echoed by Members and also my Colleague, Honourable Kavetuna, that we are enacting laws and then we fail with the implementation of our own laws in this country. We have a law and it is not being implemented, so it is my hope that these discussions has created awareness in the law enforcement agencies to enforce the implementation of the law.

Therefore, Honourable Speaker, without much ado, I would humbly request that this august House accepts this Motion. I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I Put the Question, that the Motion be adopted. Any objection? Motion adopted and referred to the Committee. The Secretary will read the Third Order of the Day.

**MOTION ON PRACTICAL IMPLEMENTATION OF
LANGUAGE POLICY**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on the practical implementation of the language policy as it affects mother-tongue instruction from Grades 1 to 3.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When this Debate was adjourned on Thursday, 16 October 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a

27 November 2008

**MOTION ON LANGUAGE POLICY
HON KAVETUNA**

Motion by Honourable Dienda. Honourable Kavetuna adjourned the Debate and she now has the Floor.

HON KAVETUNA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members. The term, “*nationalism*” is never far from the list of many speakers nowadays. It evokes strong positive and negative feelings depending upon whether it is being praised by the community for opening up a gap for us to integrate as one Namibia, one Nation or to condemn our uniqueness as a multi-tribal country with people who tolerate one another with our different languages.

The level of development of our children’s mother-tongue is a strong predictor to the second language development. Children who come to school with a solid foundation in their mother-tongue and further develop it in the first three grades, develop a stronger literacy ability in a school language. When parents and other caregivers, like grandparents, are able to spend time with their children and tell stories or discuss issues with them in a way to develop their mother-tongue vocabulary and concepts, children come to school well-prepared and comprehend academic skills effectively and they succeed educationally.

Children’s knowledge and skills transfer across languages from the mother-tongue they have learnt in their home to the school language. From the point of view of children’s development of contact and thinking skills, the mother-tongue and English are interdependent. Linguistic, cultural and religious diversity within a school are the cornerstones of social integration and a foundation of nationhood. While our learners may not be physically punished for speaking their mother-tongue in school, as was previously done, a strong message is communicated to them that if they want to be accepted by teachers and the society, they have to renounce any allegiance to their home language and culture. Unfortunately it can have disastrous consequences for children and their families. It violates the children’s right to an appropriate education and undermines communication between children and their parents.

27 November 2008

**MOTION ON LANGUAGE POLICY
HON KAVETUNA**

Any credible educator will agree that schools should build on experiences and knowledge that the children bring to the classroom and instruction should also promote children's ability and talent. Whether we do it intentionally or inadvertently, when we destroy the child's language and rupture their relationship with their parents and grandparents, we are contradicting the very essence of education.

The destruction of the language and culture in school is also highly counterproductive for the community in which the children are living. In an era of globalisation, a society that has access to multi-lingual and multi-cultural resources is advantaged in its ability to play an important and social and economic role on the world stage. At a time when cross-cultural contact is at an all-time high in human history, the identities of all societies are evolving. The identities of societies and ethnic groups have never been static and it is a naïve illusion to believe that they can become static, mono-cultural museum exhibits by prospecting when the pace of the global change is as rapid as it is.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, in essence mother-tongue promotion in school helps develop not only the mother-tongue but also the children's ability in the school language. Children perform better at schools that effectively teach the mother-tongue and, where appropriate, develop literacy in the language. By contrast, when children are encouraged to reject their mother-tongue and, consequently, its development stagnates, their personal and conceptual foundation for learning is undermined.

It is against the background and knowledge that the Ministry of Education put up a policy that children should be taught in their mother-tongue in lower primary in simple language from Grade 1 to Grade 3. Why is it not happening? Children's mother-tongues are fragile and easily lost in the early years of school. Many people know how quickly bilingual children seem to pick up conversational skills in a national language in the early years of school. Now it takes longer for them to catch up. However, educators are often much less aware about how quickly children can lose their ability to use their mother-tongue or even in the home context.

27 November 2008

**MOTION ON LANGUAGE POLICY
HON DIENDA**

The extent and rate of the language loss will vary according to the concentration of the family from a particular linguistic group in the school and neighbourhood. Where the mother-tongue is used extensively in the community outside the school, the language loss among young children will be less. Parents will not go unblamed in this destructive process. They are the main culprits who many times communicate with their children even in broken English. This trend is wrong and totally unacceptable.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the cultural, linguistic and intellectual capital of our society will increase dramatically when we stop seeing culturally and linguistically diverse children as a problem to be solved and instead open our eyes to the linguistic, cultural and intellectual resources they bring from home to the schools and society.

It is in this vein that I am putting my weight behind this Motion and would like to request the Ministry of Education to ensure that next year all Grade 1's children are taught in their various mother-tongues. I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I have to cut the list short and the last person to contribute will be Honourable Dienda for her reply.

HON DIENDA: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. I followed the contributions in this House and also on the phone-in programmes, the Chat Show and I have realised that there are so many challenges regarding the implementation of this language policy and without wasting time, Honourable Deputy Speaker, I would therefore like this Motion be referred to the Standing Committee on Human Resources, Social and Community Development to follow up this matter...(Intervention)

27 November 2008

**CLOSING REMARKS
HON T GURIRAB**

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF EDUCATION: On a Point of Order. She is actually replying and she ought not reply until the responsible Line Ministry has commented and I registered my name. I have registered my name.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am sorry, Honourable Deputy Minister, it is due to time constraints.

HON DIENDA: To the Standing Committee of Human Resources, Social and Community Development to follow up this matter with the relevant stakeholders which have done research on this matter and to Report back to this House as was requested. I thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now Put the Question that the Motion be adopted. Any objection? Agreed to.

Honourable Members, I think all the Motions which are seeing on the programme will lapse until next year. You still have the right to reintroduce it next year. Since today is our closing day, the custom is that at the closure of the last session of each year, leaders of Political Parties are given the opportunity to make their closing remarks on the parliamentary activities. We start with the Official Opposition and end with the Prime Minister. Honourable Tsudao Gurirab.

HON T GURIRAB: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I believe we have debated on many Motions which are important for the life of our country. We have passed laws in this Honourable House which will improve the welfare and life of our people and have now come to the end of this

27 November 2008

**CLOSING REMARKS
HON VILJOEN**

year. As we are preparing for the festive season and as we leave from here, we will still be doing work of our political organisations. From our side we can only urge that that work which we will be doing in recruiting new members, in mobilising our citizens to our different causes, will be done peacefully and that there will be no violence in conducting politics. There is violence at the moment and I urge one and all that we should leave this House to conduct politics and prepare for next year's elections and that politics will be conducted peacefully and that there will be no violence and that no lives will be lost during the festive season.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, may I take this opportunity to wish all Honourable Members, their families and all a restful festive season and those who are travelling both within and outside the country will do so safely and that we look forward to seeing all of you here next year. Drive safely, look after your families and God speed. I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I recognise Honourable Viljoen.

HON VILJOEN: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I wish to thank every Member in this Honourable House for the year 2008. I have learned from every Member, be it what he or she said or just his or her presence and patience. Parliament is closing today and let us use the time to do some evaluation of ourselves, that we shall realise that politics is not the ultimate and that we should realise that we are human beings in the first place, and secondly politicians and that we have an equal responsibility towards all Namibians, despite their political affiliation, skin colour and historical background; that we should use the time to strengthen our family ties and unite in our celebrations of the birthday of our Saviour, Jesus Christ. Enjoy the rest and if you drive, drive safely and come back as loyal and disciplined Namibians as you always do. I thank you.

27 November 2008

**CLOSING REMARKS
HON MOONGO / HON MUDGE**

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I thank you. I recognise Honourable Moongo.

HON MOONGO: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. First of all, this year was a very difficult year and we lost many MPs, as we today also lost our grandmother and it was really a difficult year. This was also a year of intolerance and we still have people in hospital who were injured in violence. I appeal to the Parties in Namibia to obey the Code of Conduct which we signed and Article 17 and I appeal to the leaders of Political Parties to educate their members. We hope next year will be a good year and we wish the voters well and those who committed crime, to face the law. With this I wish you a Merry Christmas and a Happy New Year. Thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. I recognise Honourable Mudge.

HON MUDGE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, today we leave this House for two and a half months, this weekend we will get our salaries, the end of the month we will get the salaries again and end of January we will get our salaries once again, we will go to homes with electricity, hot water, we have vehicles, we put in fuel and we go on holiday with our families. However, while we are doing that, I think we should also reflect on those in the country who cannot afford to do that. I think we all agree in this House that there are a lot of people who are suffering. Without blaming anybody, all I am saying is that as lawmakers we must reflect on this very seriously in this coming recess period and come back here next year, and however difficult it may be, to act in a way and do things which will improve the living conditions of our people. I know and believe that as we sit here, everyone of us, is what we really want to achieve in this country and that we work together under maybe difficult

27 November 2008

**CLOSING REMARKS
HON TJIHUIKO**

circumstances next year when it is election year and there will be politicking, but still while doing that, we must focus on the real issues in the country.

Having said that, thank you very much for everybody this year, some people will have to do some homework and study the history, what really happened, but while we are doing that, may I wish you all a very, very precious time with your families and a Christmas to be done in the way it should be done and a prosperous New Year until we see one another again. Thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Honourable Tjihuiko.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, thank you very much. I was hoping that I am going to be the last speaker so that I can have enough time. Thank you very much for the opportunity. As lawmakers I believe that we have done a very good job. We have passed a number of laws and Motions were discussed in the spirit of unity. I believe that we have shown political maturity when we were discussing issues and, therefore, I believe that this was a good beginning and next year should not be different because of what will happen at national level.

Let me conclude by thanking the Desk of the Speaker and the Deputy Speaker for the mature and professional manner in which we have handled this House under, to some extent, very difficult circumstances caused by some Members. I think you have proven beyond reasonable doubt that you are very professional and I hope that it is going to continue in the same spirit.

With these few remarks, NUDO wishes all the Members of this House to have a nice holiday. You should not go and relax, you should go and work, represent your people, because you are not on holiday, we are being

27 November 2008

**CLOSING REMARKS
HON //GAROËB**

given an opportunity to go to the Regions and work with the people. Thank you very much.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Chief //Garoëb, UDF.

HON //GAROËB: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker, for the opportunity. First of all, I would like to express our heartfelt condolences to the Father of the Nation and his family for the loss of our grandmother. According to our tradition she is actually not dead but only went home.

Mr Speaker, in absentia, Deputy Speaker and the staff, thank you very much for the hard work you have done to lead this House throughout the year. Honourable Members of this august House, thank you for your comradeship and cooperation. I want to wish you all a Merry Christmas, but I do not want to understate the present political climate and repercussions for our beloved country. It might seem incoherent or insignificant, but this order might precede evil in political history of mankind. It oils the fires of instability, fires of insecurity, fires of anarchy, fires of rebellion, fires of terrorism. As leaders this is a challenge we have to face head-on without compromise, to shine our wisdom beyond the tenets of destruction for the sake of our people and our country. There cannot be a better Christmas thought than unity. There can also not be a better Christmas gift than peace and prosperity and my humble prayer is, "*Lord, save Namibia.*"

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Honourable Vice-President of SWAPO, Honourable Geingob.

27 November 2008

**CLOSING REMARKS
HON GEINGOB**

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: There is a time and season for everything. We have debated, we have fought and we must go and reflect with our families. I would like to wish the Speaker, the Deputy Speaker and all the Members a happy season's greetings and prosperous New Year. Please come back safe. Thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I now call on the Leader of the House, the Deputy Prime Minister, to say something and close the House until the 17th of February 2009.

HON DEPUTY PRIME MINISTER: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members. It gives me great pleasure to announce that we are now going to close Parliament. In closing the Parliament today, I would like to request you to go and rest your brains. Do not go and campaign until we see each other again. You are requested to rest your brains so that you come back fresh. Tate Moongo, no campaigning, no quarrels, please go and have a rest, make sure that your shebeen is safe for everybody and I must say that this year was a wonderful year, typical Namibian politics. We sometimes had heated discussions, but coffee time we went and we sat together and we were drinking tea together. Nobody brought in a strange object here to throw at each other, like you see in some Parliaments. Let us keep that tradition.

Next year is a different year, but right now, please go and have a rest, drive safely, we want to see you all back here until elections when perhaps some of you will not be here. Thank you very much for everything and I would like to say how grateful we are to our Speaker and Deputy Speaker who have controlled this House despite everything. Thanks to the press who covered our discussions. Please drive safely, I know you are not going to drink and drive, but remind your drivers that they should not drink and drive. We would like to see you back next year. Merry Christmas, prosperous New Year and thank you for everything.

27 November 2008

I would like to propose that the House adjourns until 17 February 2009.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:45 UNTIL 2009.02.17 AT 14:30.