LIST OF MEMBERS OF THE NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

SPEAKER

Dr T-B Gurirab (Mr)

DEPUTY SPEAKER AND CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE

Ms D Sioka

THE CABINET

MINISTERS

(21 March 2005 – Elected in terms of Article 133 of the Constitution)

Mr N Angula (Prime Minister)

Dr L Amathila (Ms) (Deputy Prime Minister)
Dr G H Geingob (Mr) (Trade and Industry)

Dr N Tjiriange (Mr) (Minister of Veterans Affairs)

Dr A Kawana (Mr) (Presidential)

Dr N Iyambo (Mr) (Safety and Security)

Rev W Konjore (Mr) (Youth, National Service, Sport and

Culture)

Mr J Mutorwa (Agriculture, Water and Forestry)
Mr H Angula (Works, Transport and ommunication)

Ms N Nandi-Ndaitwah (Environment and Tourism)

Ms S Kuugongelwa-Amadhila (Finance)

Dr A Iyambo (Mr) (Fisheries and Marine Resources)

Mr M Hausiku (Foreign Affairs)

Dr R Kamwi (Mr) (Health and Social Services)
Ms R Nghidinwa (Home Affairs and Immigration)

Mr N Mbumba (Education) Mr C Namoloh (Defence)

Mr J Kaapanda (Information and Broadcasting)
Ms P Iivula-Ithana (Justice and Attorney-General)
Mr I Ngatjizeko (Labour and Social Welfare)
Mr A !Naruseb (Lands and Resettlement)

Mr E Nghimtina (Mines and Energy)

Mr J Ekandjo (Regional and Local Government,

Housing and Rural Development)

Ms M Mungunda (Gender Equality and Child Welfare)

DEPUTY MINISTERS

(21 March 2005 – Elected in terms of Article 133 of the Constitution)

Mr G Shihepo (Safety and Security)

Mr P Shifeta (Youth, National Service and Culture)
Mr P Smit (Works, Transport & Communication)
Mr I Katali (Agriculture, Water and Forestry)

Mr L Jooste (Environment and Tourism)

Mr T Tweya (Finance)

Ms L Lucas (Foreign Affairs)

Ms P Haingura (Health and Social Services)

Dr R Ndjoze-Ojo (Ms) (Education) Mr V Simunja (Defence)

Mr R Dinyando (Information and Broadcasting)

Mr U Nujoma (Justice)

Mr P Iilonga (Labour and Social Welfare)

Mr B Esau (Mines & Energy)

Mr I Katali (Lands and Resettlement)

Mr K Kazenambo (Regional and Local Government,

Housing and Rural Development)

Ms T Mushelenga (Trade and Industry)

Ms Muharukua (Gender Equality and Child Welfare)

SECRETARY

Mr N Goabab

DEPUTY SECRETARY

Mr F S Harker

LIST OF MEMBERS AND PARTIES WHICH THEY REPRESENT

CONGRESS OF DEMOCRATS (COD)

Ms E Dienda

Mr T Gurirab (Deputy Whip)
Ms N Schimming-Chase (Chief Whip)

Mr B Ulenga (Party Leader)

Ms L Kaveri

DTA OF NAMIBIA

Mr J De Waal (Chief Whip)
Mr K Kaura (Party Leader)

Mr P Moongo

Mr M Venaani (Deputy Whip)

MONITOR ACTION GROUP

Mr J Viljoen (Chief Whip)

NATIONAL UNITY DEMOCRATIC ORGANISATION OF NAMIBIA (NUDO)

Mr A Mbai

Mr K Riruako (Party Leader) Mr A Tjihuiko (Chief Whip)

REPUBLICAN PARTY

Mr H Mudge (Chief Whip and Party Leader)

SWAPO OF NAMIBIA

Dr L Amathila (Ms) (Deputy Prime Minister)

Dr M Amweelo (Mr)

Mr N Angula (Prime Minister)

Mr H Angula

Dr S C Ankama (Mr)

Ms L Basson Ms A Bayer Ms C Bohitile

Mr H Booys (Deputy Chairperson of the Whole

House Committee)

Ms H Christian

Mr Dinyando (Deputy Minister)

Mr J Ekandjo (Minister)

Mr B Esau (Deputy Minister)

Dr G H Geingob (Mr) (Minister)
Dr T-B Gurirab (Mr) (Speaker)

Ms P Haingura (Deputy Minister)

Mr M Hausiku (Minister)

Mr P Iilonga (Deputy Minister)

Ms E Iipinge

Ms P Iivula-Ithana (Minister)
Dr A Iyambo (Mr) (Minister)
Dr N Iyambo (Mr) (Minister)

Mr L Jooste (Deputy Minister)

Mr J Kaapanda (Minister)

Mr E Kaiyamo

Dr R Kamwi (Mr) (Minister)

Ms L Kasingo

Mr I Katali (Deputy Minister)

Ms J Kavetuna

Dr A Kawana (Mr) (Minister)

Mr K Kazenambo (Deputy Minister)

Rev W Konjore (Mr) (Minister) Ms S Kuugongelwa – Amadhila (Minister)

Ms L Lucas (Deputy Minister)

Mr N Mbumba (Minister)

Ms A Muharukua (Deputy Minister)

Ms M Mungunda (Minister)

Mr P Mushelenga (Assistant Whip)
Ms T Mushelenga (Deputy Minister)

Mr J Mutorwa (Minister)

Mr T Nambahu

Mr A !Naruseb (Minister)

Ms E !Nawases-Taeyele

Mr I Ngatjizeko (Minister)
Ms N Nandi-Ndaitwah (Minister)
Ms R Nghidinwa (Minister)
Mr E Nghimtina (Minister)

Mr U Nujoma (Deputy Minister)
Mr P Shifeta (Deputy Minister)
Mr G Shihepo (Deputy Minister)
Mr V Simunja (Deputy Minister)
Ms D Sioka (Deputy Speaker)

Dr N Tjiriange (Mr) (Minister)

Mr T Tweya (Deputy Minister)

Mr R /Ui/o/oo

UNITED DEMOCRATIC FRONT (UDF)

Mr J //Garöeb (Party Leader)

Mr M Goreseb

Ms G Tjombe (Chief Whip)

<u>APPOINTED BY THE PRESIDENT IN TERMS OF ARTICLE</u> 32(5)(c) OF THE CONSTITUTION

Mr R Diergaardt

Ms I Hoffmann

Ms A Manombe-Ncube

Mr C Namoloh (Minister)

Dr R Ndjoze-Ojo (Ms) (Deputy Minister)
Mr P Smit (Deputy Minister)

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY ASSEMBLY CHAMBER 05 JUNE 2008 WINDHOEK

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

ANNOUNCEMENT: RELIEF FUND

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: First announcement from the Speaker's Desk. Honourable Members, I would like to report to the House on the voluntary contributions made by the Honourable Members to alleviate the dire situation created by the drought and flood in the north of our country. The money collected amounts to N\$19,000 for which receipts were issued to Members who contributed. This amount will now be handed over to the Right Honourable Prime Minister who is the custodian of the Relief Fund. I thank all the Honourable Members for their humble contributions here at Parliament and elsewhere on their own in the North. I will now hand over the amount to the Right Honourable Prime Minister.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I would like to thank Honourable Dr Amathila and Senior Member of Parliament, Honourable Schimming-Chase, for initiating this activity. In my language they say – and I want you to listen very carefully: "Okugandja okutsilika, omukweni mu uvila tali ino muvila talili" which means to give is to invest. When you give voluntarily you are investing, which further means that you want to hear your neighbour celebrating rather than mourning. Therefore, this donation is an effort by Parliament to lessen the burden of those who have been affected by the floods. As a Nation we want to see the whole Nation celebrating. If someone is in distress, it is our responsibility to dig deep into our pockets and help them join the celebration with the Nation as a whole, even in their own distress.

TABLING OF REPORTS HON KAIYAMO

I thank you all who volunteered to contribute to this fund in the sum of N\$19,000. I would like to invite the colleague from the Emergency Management Unit to receive the amount.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Any Petitions? Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Honourable Kaiyamo.

TABLING: REPORT ON CONDITIONS OF CEMETERIES IN NAMIBIA

<u>HON KAIYAMO</u>: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I lay upon the Table, the Report on the Conditions of Cemeteries in Namibia by the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Human Resources and Social Development. I so Move.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Table the Report. Other Reports and Papers? Notice of Questions? Honourable Schimming-Chase.

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS

QUESTION 57:

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: I give Notice that on Thursday, 12 June 2008, I shall ask the Minister of Regional, Local Government, Housing and Rural Development the following questions:

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS HON SCHIMMING-CHASE

During the Budget Debate I suggested to Cabinet that since they cancelled all outstanding debts for outstanding car licence fees, whether they could not do the same for municipal debts, especially for the poor and pensioners.

Shortly afterwards it was reported in some of the newspapers that Cabinet was indeed considering this. In view of this, I would like to ask the following questions:

- 1. Is it true that Cabinet is considering the cancellation of municipal debts for the poor and pensioners?
- 2. Despite all protestations to the contrary, it is reported that people, including pensioners and widows/widowers have been evicted from their houses for not paying municipal accounts. Is this true?
- 3. Is it true that in some cases the amount owed was relatively small, to name one example, N\$6,000, and that partial payment by the owner of N\$3,000 was turned down and the house was hastily auctioned? If this is true, where do these people go, especially during the cold winter months?
- 4. Is the Ministry making any efforts to investigate these matters to find out who speculates by buying these houses and to institute measures to prevent people from losing their houses, especially in light of the statements from Government that this year's Budget was a *pro-poor* one?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Table the Questions, Honourable Member. I recognise Honourable Dienda.

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS HON DIENDA

QUESTION 58:

<u>HON DIENDA</u>: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I give Notice that on Thursday, 12 June 2008, I shall ask the Right Honourable Prime Minister the following question:

Is there a policy regarding state funerals or memorial services for serving Members of Parliament – and I am not talking about heroes? If the answer is no:

- (a) How is it handled?
- (b) If the answer is yes, can we have a copy of the said information?
- (c) Could we also be informed as to the cost of such funerals?
- (d) Who decides how much the State contributes to such funerals and on what basis is this done?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Notice of Motions? Ministerial Statements? Today is Thursday, the day initiated by the opposition benches for their questions to be answered. I now put Question 3 by Honourable Dienda. Does the Honourable Member put the Question?

RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS

QUESTION 3:

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I rise in my capacity as Acting Minister of Justice and Attorney-General to beg the indulgence of the Honourable Member that this question stands over.

05 June 2008 RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS BY HON VENAANI RT HON N ANGULA

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Question stands over. Question 8 is one by Honourable Moongo. Does the Honourable Moongo Put the Question?

QUESTION 8:

HON MOONGO: I Put the Question.

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I beg for the indulgence by the Honourable Member that this question be answered next week.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The question stands over until next week. Question 14 is one by Honourable Venaani. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

QUESTION 14:

HON VENAANI: I Put the Question.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I would like to request the Honourable Members to follow the questions on the paper because I am only going to give the answers.

Question 1: For the affected farmers, Honourable Venaani, the Government of the Republic of Namibia has put in place the coordination of drought information gathering directorates, that is livestock, water and crops. Farmers are encouraged to sell some of their livestock through the marketing scheme. Farmers who chose not to sell but transport their

RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS RT HON N ANGULA

animals from one farm to another for grazing, will only be covered for transport costs and not for feeds purchased.

Question 2: Yes, all farmers will be assisted under the scheme, both communal and commercial.

Question 3: Drought aid will not be provided or distributed to people in urban areas. This can largely contribute towards rapid urbanisation. Those not doing anything in towns or peri-urban areas should be urged to return to rural areas and be supported there.

Therefore, the objective of this programme is to assist the vulnerable groups, that is the elderly, disabled, children under five, pregnant and lactating mothers in the most affected areas. They must be affected by either drought, flood or any emergency-related situation and are mainly dependent on rain-supported agricultural activities.

The Cabinet has tasked the National Emergency Management Committee under the Chairmanship of the Secretary to Cabinet to provide guidelines to the Regional Emergency Management Units on the effective implementation of the programme and ensure that the intended beneficiaries benefit from the scheme.

Question 4: The food aid will be fairly distributed to all identified affected populations without any discrimination. Government officials of the Regional Emergency Management Units, under the supervision of the Regional Governors and their Chief Regional Officers will make sure that this is done accordingly. They will be responsible for proper storage, handling and timely distribution of the drought aid to all affected and identified populations. Strong emphasis will be placed on first-in-first-out principle, regular monitoring of warehouses and evaluation of the programme during the implementation to ensure proper control, supervision and sustainable utilisation of the resources. This is aimed at timely distribution of the commodities to intended beneficiaries in order to avoid over-stocking of food items in the regional warehouses. This is already the practice even with the current distribution programme in Erongo, Caprivi and Kunene Regions.

Timely detection of any deviation from the norm and prompt response to rectify any unwarranted situation will be the order of the operation. Rest assured that there will be no repetition of the past happenings. I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Question 15 is one by Honourable Venaani to the Minister of Education.

QUESTION 15:

HON MOONGO: I Put the Question on behalf of Honourable Venaani.

HON MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Unfortunately the Ministry of Education does not compile statistics on the number of learners who have dropped out of school due to poverty because that would be impossible, but if it is necessary, we could try to do so. However at the present moment we are not doing so.

The Ministry also does not compile statistics on the number of unschooled children – and Honourable Venaani, you are a young man, you cannot use words like 'unschooled children of farm labourers.' If a child did not attend school it is one thing, but to call them 'unschooled' is not exactly in order. Nor did we compile statistics on the number of San learners who are out of school. If we have to compile statistics, we have to do it on Namibian children throughout the country, because it might lead to discrimination if you target certain groups of people.

The Ministry will look at gathering these statistics in future reports and analyse Region by Region and not community by community. I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Question 16 is by Honourable Venaani to the Minister of Regional and Local Government, Housing and Rural Development. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

QUESTION 16:

HON MOONGO: I Put the Question on behalf of Honourable Venaani.

HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: Comrade Deputy Speaker, I would request that all the questions to Regional and Local Government be deferred to next week.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Question will stand over. Question 17 is by Honourable Venaani to the Minister of Works, Transport and Communication. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

QUESTION 17:

HON MOONGO: I Put the Question on behalf of Honourable Venaani.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Thank you very much, Honourable Deputy Speaker, I thank you for the opportunity to answer the questions posed by Honourable Venaani. It shows that Honourable Venaani has shown great interest in our efforts to develop the national infrastructure such as rail, in order to ensure economic growth and sustainable job creation in our country and in the sub-region as well as Africa at large. Honourable Venaani also demonstrates the importance of regional integration, since rail connection is one of the main imperatives that we should support and develop.

The questions by Honourable Venaani refer both to the already completed first phase as well as the ongoing second phase.

Question 1: What was the actual cost spent on the construction of the railway line to Ondangwa?

The construction of the railway line is in two phases. Phase 1 of the Northern Railway Line from Tsumeb to Ondangwa started in 2001 and was finalised in mid-2006. In terms of cost, the total amount of N\$858,904,000 was spent in the first phase and the finances coming from our Budget are N\$503,318,000; a loan from the African Development Bank – N\$202,358,000, the Kuwait Fund for Arab Economic Development – N\$102,725,000 and the Arab Bank for Economic Development in Africa, N\$50,332,000. These are the financial institutions we borrowed money from or who paid the whole amount.

On the other hand, Phase 2 from Ondangwa to Oshikango, started in September 2006. Thus far an amount of N\$146 million has been spent on the second phase of the project.

To complete Phase 2, an amount of approximately N\$300 million would be required. The construction costs of Phase 2 are expected to fluctuate. This would be dictated by the volatile oil price increases. The market dynamics should be taken into account.

Question 2: How much cargo, in volume, is currently transported with the railway line?

Cargo transported from Tsumeb to Ondangwa between April 2006 and March 2007 was 38,911 tons. This increased to 118,874 tons from April 2007 to February 2008.

Cargo transported from Ondangwa to Tsumeb between April 2006 and March 2007 was 324 tons and it increased to 1,722 tons between April 2007 to February 2008.

May I add that the railway line from Tsumeb to Oshikango is not a white elephant. It however is an instrument for economic prosperity. I call upon all Namibians to embrace development and always to think about the fate of tomorrow's generations.

Passenger services: One northern-bound diesel locomotive unit passenger train is scheduled for one trip per week over weekends from Windhoek and Ondangwa. About 3,017 passengers used the service between April 2006 and March 2007, while 2,683 passengers used the service between April 2007 and October 2007. Honourable Speaker, it is important to mention that at the moment we have a problem to transport passengers due to the condition of the railway line between Walvis Bay and Tsumeb, specifically between Otjiwarongo and Tsumeb, something that we have to rectify to ensure the safety of our passengers and we are currently working on it.

Fuel transport to Ondangwa: The BP fuel depot at Ondangwa will be commissioned very soon, while there are indications that Shell Namibia might also erect a fuel depot. This can only mean that TransNamib might have to acquire additional fuel tankers to transport this commodity to Ondangwa.

The train frequency varies between 15 to 20 trains per month in each direction, depending on freight available for transport. The frequency is expected to increase once the construction of the second phase from Ondangwa to Oshikango has been completed.

Question 3: Has the railway line eased the pressure on our road networks or are the roads still busier than before?

Yes, the railway line has definitely eased the pressure on road networks. This is judging from the volume of cargo that is now transported by road to Ondangwa and vice versa.

To illustrate the above statement, TransNamib Road Transport transported 16,466 tons of cargo volume from April 2005 to March 2006. This was before the commissioning of the Northern Railway Line. From April

2006 to March 2007, only 7,015 tons of cargo was transported by road, while during the period between April 2006 to March 2008, the cargo volumes transported by road was reduced to 1,750 tons of cargo volumes. It is evident that private sector companies and individuals that previously used road transport also now use rail transport.

It should be noted that the construction of the railway line does not necessarily mean complete elimination of road usage. There would still be vehicles that use the road to transport a variety of goods, more especially light and perishable commodities.

Question 4:

How viable is this project and how much funds do we need to spend on the second phase of the project?

This project is highly viable and with long-term benefits to Namibia and the inhabitants of the SADC Region. The direct and indirect economic benefits emanating from the railway line are too many to mention. Not only Namibia stands to benefit, but also our neighbouring Angola and the Region. The construction of the railway line is a national necessity equal to all other infrastructures. Therefore, such an investment spanning Oshikoto, Oshana and Ohangwena is not a waste of resources, but an obligation to the Nation. The viability of the project is inherent in its nature of job creation during and after construction.

A total of 19,148 people were employed during the construction of Phase 1, while new businesses opened up in Ondangwa and Oshikango, resulting in an economic boom. For example, there was no fuel depot beyond Tsumeb, now there is one in Ondangwa with others planned for other areas. Reduced road maintenance and preservation of roads are some of the benefits, amongst others, that make this project viable.

With respect to the cost, please refer to my answer under Question 1.

I trust that the Honourable Venaani will continue supporting all national development endeavours, encourage en inspire all Namibians to be proud of national developments.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, we had a SADC meeting with investors on the launching of the SADC Corridor yesterday and in due time we will bring an Executive Report for people to have a bigger picture of all the corridors in Africa, but more specifically in SADC, with information on mineral deposits as well as location of people to develop a master plan for corridor development in Africa and more specifically in SADC. Then the House will have a better understanding of the importance of the development not only of our road corridors but also our rail corridors.

We are also currently involved in discussions with Botswana which is really serious to build a railway line from Gaborone to our border and then we have to build our hundred kilometres from Gobabis to the border. When we have completed that, the flow of transport from Gauteng via the western corridor will definitely increase rapidly. We can be proud as Namibians for what we have done to take the leadership in corridor development, not only in terms of our roads but also the railway systems. Yes, there are still many challenges in terms of maintenance and rehabilitation of our existing infrastructure. This would ensure that we provide efficient and effective services to our Nation and to the rest of the neighbouring countries in the SADC and the African continent. Thank you very much, Honourable Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Question 18 is by Honourable Schimming-Chase to the Minister of Finance. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

QUESTION 18:

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: I Put the Question.

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I do wish to reply.

The first question by the Member was whether I was aware of NAMFISA's audit of GIPF and whether I have received a copy. I think I did respond to a similar question in this House not too long ago, where I indicated there was indeed an audit conducted on GIPF by NAMFISA and that is there a report which has been shared with my office, but that I was not in a position to share that report with Parliament because that report points to a number of issues that require follow-up action by NAMFISA and the revealing of which in public could jeopardise the follow-up measures by NAMFISA.

I think with that information I would have answered the remaining questions of the Honourable Member. The Government is fully cognisant of its responsibility to safeguard public interest and we do know that while NAMFISA is an autonomous body established by laws passed by this House, it has the responsibility to ensure Government that it does carry out its functions fully and the public interest is not compromised and it was in this regard that the Ministry of Finance sought to be informed by NAMFISA about the outcome of the investigation, which information it did receive and we do not have any reason to believe at this point in time that NAMFISA is not following through in order to safeguard the public interest and we would continue to be on our guard to make sure that everything that needs to be done is done by NAMFISA in order to ensure that the public interest is secured. We will however not be in a position to do anything that would be contrary to the autonomy that is given to this institution by the law or to jeopardise the due process that is ongoing. I think that fully answers the question by the Honourable Member.

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I thank the Honourable Minister for answering the question. I, however, do not agree that that means that questions 4 and 5 have been answered because it was made clear by one of the people working for NAMFISA that on question 5, the money were tax money and not Government money and

since four months have passed since I put the question, I would like to ask the Honourable Minister how long it would take for this audit to be brought to the House or will it not be brought to the House in spite of the fact that money comes from Government? Would the House then not have the right to exercise its oversight function? If however, it is going to come, could the Minister give an indication how many more months will pass, since almost four months have passed since the question was asked, before the report will be made available to the House? I thank you.

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: First and foremost, I do not think that it would be beneficial for myself and the Honourable Member to engage in a Debate, asking whether the GIPF Fund are funds belonging to the members of the GIPF or they are Government funds, because I believe all of us ought to be fully aware as to the status of the ownership of the assets of GIPF.

The only thing that I however deem appropriate to underline in this House, that, as I have indicated initially, Government is fully cognisant of its responsibility to safeguard public interest. It is quite cognisant of that and that is regardless of whether these funds belong to the public servants who are members of the public or they belong to the State. We are cognisant of the responsibility that we have to safeguard the interests of the Fund and we will continue to execute that responsibility that is entrusted to us by the Namibian public and by the laws that were passed by this House. I think it should suffice to say that.

When this Report would be made available to Parliament and whether it will be made available at all, I have indicated both today and earlier when I answered this question. In terms of the law NAMFISA is the one that is dealing with this Report and NAMFISA will deal with this Report as appropriate, of course taking cognisance of the need to safeguard public interest. Because NAMFISA is not a department of the Ministry of Finance and because the Minister of Finance is not empowered to prescribe on how NAMFISA is to conduct its affairs, I am not in a position to indicate when NAMFISA would conclude this investigation,

05 June 2008

safe to say that we have made it clear to NAMFISA that we expect that this matter should be dealt with conclusively.

The outturn of the process that has been conducted by NAMFISA would indicate whether that Report would be tabled in this House or not.

I, however think it is important to indicate here that it is not only when Government lays reports of investigations that are carried out by public institutions on the table that we do justice to the function that is entrusted to us. What is important would be that the due process has been carried out and the public has been safeguarded. If that requires that NAMFISA would have to take measures and call on other institutions that are required to do so, without necessarily bringing this Report to Parliament, then so be it. We should however not see it that that function would only have been carried out if the report is brought here. I do not think that would be right. Thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Question 19 is by Honourable Schimming-Chase to the Minister of Justice and Attorney-General. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

QUESTION 19:

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: I Put the Question.

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, seeing that the first part of this question by the Honourable Member may be termed a personal-to-holder question, it means it can only be answered by the substantive Honourable Minister, my Senior Colleague who is not here. May I beg the indulgence of the Honourable Member for the question to stand over and only to be answered by the substantive Minister of Justice and Attorney-General upon her return? I so Move.

05 June 2008

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Question stands over. Question 20 is the one by Honourable Tjombe to the Minister of Regional and Local Government, Housing and Rural Development. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

QUESTION 20:

HON TJOMBE: I Put the Question.

HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you, Comrade Deputy Speaker. I would prefer that Questions 16, 20, 29, 30 31, 32 and 36 be deferred because they were asked in February and in the meantime something unfortunate happened and I am sure the staff there could not do anything. I would ask the indulgence of the House that all those questions related to Regional and Local Government be deferred.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: All the questions directed at the Minister of Regional and Local Government, Housing and Rural Development should stand over. Question 21 is by Honourable Schimming-Chase to the Minister of Finance. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

QUESTION 21:

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: I Put the Question.

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: The Honourable Member wanted to know what measures are being contemplated by Government to address the impact of the expected recession in the world economy.

In my Budget Statement I gave a detailed outline of the global and regional economic trend and prospects over the medium term. I also highlighted how the Namibian economy is anticipated to respond to this.

There is a consensus amongst economic analysts that the global economy will experience a significant downturn in growth over the short to medium term, with growth projections revised downwards from 5% projected earlier. To my knowledge this downturn is, however, still limited to a low growth and there are no projections for a global economic recession *per se*, as far as I am aware.

Obviously, the possibility of slowing demand for commodities resultant from a slow global economic growth is posing some risk to our export industries and thus to our economic growth. However, the emerging markets which are the key drivers of global economic activities are still expected to experience robust growth and this will partly offset the effects of the slow growth in sub-Saharan African economies on global economic growth.

As a result sub-Saharan African growth is projected to rise still in spite of the slowdown of the slow growth in the global economy.

For the Namibian economy we also project a strong growth in 2008 which will continue over the MTEF and I think there is an agreement with local economic analysts who project that the economy would still grow about 4 percent even though there have been some slight adjustments from the earlier projects made of the economic growth.

How will the Government respond to these global economic trends? The proposed Medium Term Expenditure Framework provides a fiscal stimulus to the local economy that will equip the economy to withstand the effects of a global economic downturn. It is unfortunate that some colleagues wanted to call it a "spending spree of the Government."

Thirdly, Government interventions to the effect that weak potential for growth, such as tourism, aquaculture and agriculture have been significantly strengthened.

Further, the Medium Term Expenditure Framework addresses the key aspects of the economy which are critical for the sustainability of economic growth and for accelerating the pace of growth. These include

infrastructure development, small and medium enterprise development, developing skills and promoting labour productivity and promoting fair market competition. It furthermore supports the promotion of a diversified range of Namibian products to more diversified international markets.

The Honourable Member also wanted to know whether some price control measures will be considered by Government in the face of recent increases in commodity prices. The inflation levels in Namibia have remained within single digits since the mid-nineties, it is important to say, in spite of high and volatile international oil prices and rise in domestic food prices which are caused by some food shortages in the region and globally. As a local economy our economy will remain vulnerable to external shocks, including imported inflation and currency fluctuation which are anticipated to remain significant over the remainder of the Medium Term Expenditure Framework period.

In an effort to contain the inflationary process, the Bank of Namibia fighting the monetary policy by increasing the bank rates by a total of 150 base points over the second half of 2007 to 10.50%. Consequently, inflation saw a slowdown towards the end of 2007. However, the use of monetary policy to control inflation has to be considered in combination with the means to ensure affordability of credit for businesses, which is important for economic growth. This consideration necessitates caution in the use of monetary policy to fight inflation and it is in the light of this that the Bank of Namibia has not followed through when the Reserve Bank of South Africa further adjusted the interest rates a short while ago.

Government also used the Slate Account or the Energy Fund, as it is commonly known, as a mechanism to safeguard our economy from volatility in fuel prices. As a result of this arrangement, Namibia's fuel prices, although they have experienced an increasing trend because of strong increases in international oil prices, have remained below those of other countries in the Region, including South Africa from where we source most of our oil imports.

Government, as indicated earlier, is also engaged in economic intervention in order to ensure the stability of the economy and to ensure sustainable growth. To date such interventions of Government have been oriented towards investment in strategic sectors, such as education, health, energy, water, telecommunication and transport infrastructure. Through such interventions the State ensured stability of supply in prices of key services to the economy and our population and with that promoted a favourable macroeconomic situation and sustainable economic growth.

With regard to what is being done on the prices of commodities in Namibia, the Right Honourable Prime Minister recently announced that Government has established a committee to investigate the other options on top of the ones that I have outlined that are available to us in the light of the recent escalation in prices. Government will announce to the public the conclusion of this investigation. Until then it will not be possible for me to comment on what can be done. Thank you.

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I thank the Honourable Minister for the reply. With regard to the statement at the beginning, I would just like to refer the Minister to the date on which the question was put. It was put before the Honourable Minister spoke during the Budget. As for the rest, I suppose we will wait to hear what measures are going to come from Cabinet. I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Question 22 is one by Honourable Schimming-Chase to the Minister of Mines and Energy. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

24

05 June 2008 RESPONSE-QUESTIONS-HON SCHIMMING-CHASE HON NGHIMTINA

QUESTION 22:

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: I Put the Question. Honourable Deputy Speaker, I am not putting the first question because the Honourable Minister in his Ministerial Statement yesterday dealt adequately with the first questions, albeit three months after it was asked. However, the second and third questions I put.

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: Thank you, Honourable Speaker, it is now made easy for me to answer questions 2 and 3.

"Can the Honourable Minister also inform the House regarding what benefits, if any, the Government assistance running into millions to the Zimbabwean energy sector will be enjoyed by Namibian people?"

About a year ago when NamPower and ZESA signed a US\$40 million project to refurbish the coal-fired Hwange Power Station in Zimbabwe to supply electricity to the two countries, it was agreed that ZESA will repay the debt by providing electricity to NamPower at a much lower tariff than the actual regional electricity tariff.

The biggest and the most obvious benefit to date is that Namibians currently have not experienced any power cuts or load shedding like in South Africa, which is the regional super power in electricity generation, which had to switch off electricity supply to mines and aluminium factories. Namibia has been able to continue supplying electricity to its consumers, partly thanks to the forty megawatts of electricity power which NamPower is receiving from Hwange Project as early as January this year.

NamPower will be able to import the total of 150 megawatts affordable electric power from Hwange by September this year and that will continue for an agreed period of five years. Our Ministry and the Namibian Government, therefore, is convinced that Hwange Project cooperation

05 June 2008 RESPONSE-QUESTIONS-HON SCHIMMING-CHASE HON NGHIMTINA

between NamPower and Zimbabwean counterparts is a fair deal that would benefit both the Namibian and Zimbabwean people. Thanks to the Hwange deal, Namibia is not in a severe load shedding position like our neighbour, South Africa.

Question 3: "Are there any plans in your Ministry to look at alternative energy sources, such as wind and solar energy, in order to make Namibia less vulnerable and dependent on energy from other countries?"

I come straightforward to the programmes we have:

Solar energy: Yes, a lot has been done in the energy sector to investigate and explore other sources of energy in Namibia. The use of solar energy is one option which has been looked at. On the 5th of June 2007, a year ago, the Cabinet approved the implementation of the Off-grid Energy Master Plan as a tool to improve access to modern and cleaner energy services to off-grid areas in Namibia for the next twenty years.

And again on the 5th of June 2007, the Cabinet directed that all Government infrastructure or buildings' hot water requirements should be met through the installation of solar water heaters only.

Wind energy: Wind energy is a proven technology and can be implemented in less than two years. Namibia has sites along the West Coast that provide favourable wind regimes. Namibia's most favourable site is from Lüderitz along the coast to the north. A private investor is planning to set up a wind farm along the coast. A conditional licence has been issued by the ECB. The purchasing agreement negotiations are underway between NamPower and the investor.

Wind energy is a supplement to establishing conversion of power sources that are able to generate at a higher load factor. Existing jurisdictions in developed countries clearly stipulate how wind technology could be used to connect to the national grid.

I want to extend my invitation to the private sector to venture into power generation since a law has been passed in this Honourable House in this

regard. I thank you.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:45 HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:20 PURSUANT TO ADJOURNMENT

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The first Notice of Motion is the one by the Honourable Minister of Foreign Affairs. Does the Honourable Minister Move the Motion?

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS: Honourable Deputy Speaker, my Senior Colleague, the Honourable Minister of Veterans Affairs, who is the Acting Minister of Foreign Affairs, is not here. May I beg the indulgence of the House to adjourn this item until next week, please?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Motion stands over until next week. The second Notice of Motion is the one of the Honourable Minister of Works and Transport. Does the Honourable Minister Move the Motion?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I would like to request that this ratification stands over until next week, Tuesday.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Motion stands over until next week, Tuesday. The third Notice of Motion is the one of the Honourable Minister of Safety and Security. Does the Honourable Minister Move the Motion?

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Honourable Deputy Speaker, due to the fact that I am currently compiling some important information related to this Motion, I ask for the indulgence of the House to postpone the Motion until the 17th of this month. I so Move, Honourable Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Motion stands over until the 17th of this month. The fourth Notice of Motion is the one by Honourable Mr Ulenga. Does the Honourable Member Move the Motion?

<u>HON ULENGA</u>: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I would like to motivate this Motion on Tuesday, 10 June.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Motion stands over until next week, Tuesday. The fifth Notice of Motion is the one by Honourable Viljoen. Does the Honourable Member Move the Motion?

MOTION ON ACCOUNTABILITY OF PRINCIPALS AND TEACHERS IN NAMIBIAN SCHOOLS

<u>HON VILJOEN:</u> I Move the Motion.

<u>HON DEPUTY SPEAKER:</u> Who seconds the Motion? Any objection? Agreed to. Proceed, Honourable Member.

HON VILJOEN: Honourable Deputy Speaker, every school principal should strive to be the best principal in the Region. Every teacher should strive to be the best teacher in the school. When somebody is appointed in a certain post, for instance a school principal, the Ministry of Education has a very important responsibility to fulfil.

In the first place, you must tell the new principal what to do. Secondly, you must teach him how to do it. Thirdly, you must tell him after some time how he or she has performed.

Let us look at the three steps: Steps one and two are not neglected in our education system. Since Independence we embarked on many programmes to train principals and teachers how to teach and how to manage. This process is still ongoing at this moment. This part will also get the necessary attention under the ETSIP programme.

Step three is the problem: Tell me how my performance was. At the end of the year teachers and principals take note of the performance of the learners and the school. If it is good, it is good; if it is poor, it is poor. So what?

The principal is not held accountable for the poor performance of the teachers and the teachers are not held accountable for the poor results of the learners. The principal is not being held accountable for the school building, the premises and the hostel or what is going on in the hostel.

Why shall principals and teachers be concerned about their responsibilities if there is nobody whom they are accountable to? It is a relaxed and carefree situation without the necessary stress. How can academic results improve when there is no challenge to perform, no stress factor to motivate? If there is no big brother to account to, there will be no performance. Your child, for instance, will do his or her homework regularly as long as somebody checks it daily, but if you stop checking, he or she will do no homework. They will think that nobody is interested.

I think our problem in Namibia is that all of us know the answer, but we

do not want to deal with the problem because it is not in the culture of all of us to discipline our colleagues.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, I ask permission to mention something from the past. I hate to compare the pre-Independence era with today, but I only want to demonstrate my point. Therefore, I apologise because I am aware that I refer to a different situation with favourable circumstances.

Principals in our former white schools knew that if the results of their learners were poor, they had to explain in writing to the high officials in Education. After poor results, a school can expect a visit from an inspector and all the subject advisers. During that week of inspection every teacher receives a class visit and every file in the school is checked. The work of every teacher, the written scripts of every learner were scrutinised. After the inspection the school receives a full report. If there is no improvement at the end of the year, the principal can expect a transfer somewhere else to do other jobs.

I know many learners in Namibia have problems to prepare thoroughly for the next day. Learners have to walk long distances to attend school. Many learners do not have access to electricity to prepare their homework. Therefore, every teacher in this country should take this into account. A teacher should not present a lecture in the classroom and leave it to the learner to do the rest. The teacher should use the best method of teaching to ensure that after the lesson the learner understands the work and knows the greatest part of it, so that it is not necessary for that learner to prepare at a home without electricity. The teacher must do 90% of the work in class.

This issue of non-accountability is not only applicable in education, it goes right through the civil service and it happens because there is no big brother to account to.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, we can spend millions of dollars on education, we can import the best education system, we can put sophisticated electronic equipment in every classroom, but as long as the principal and teachers are not accountable, the Opposition Parties will

discuss Motions regarding education far beyond the date set for Vision 2030.

In 2004 I mentioned the example of what happened at Mweshipandeka, a school in Ondangwa. That school was well-equipped with equipment from Laudima and other donations from abroad, and yet the results were poor. On advice, the Permanent Secretary wrote a letter to the principal and staff and emphasised the fact that they are well-equipped and if there is not an improvement as far as the results were concerned, the Ministry has no other choice than to replace the principal and some of the staff. The consequences were a surprise to everyone: The results were excellent in comparison with previous years.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, I wish to conclude. All our efforts to improve our school results and our efforts to render a better service as Civil Servants will be in vain as long as the policy-makers do not embark on a well-planned system of accountability and as long as the supervisors do not have an effective system of performance appraisal. I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I thank you. Any further discussion? Honourable Mushelenga.

<u>HON P MUSHELENGA</u>: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I Move that the Debate be adjourned until next Tuesday.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Motion stands over until next week, Tuesday. The sixth Notice of Motion is the one of Honourable Viljoen. Does the Honourable Member Move the Motion?

31

05 June 2008

HON VILJOEN: Honourable Deputy Speaker, unfortunately I did not realise that it will be necessary to do it today.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Motion stands over until next week. The seventh Notice of Motion is the one of Honourable Venaani. Does the Honourable Member Put the Motion?

<u>HON MOONGO</u>: I Move on behalf of the Honourable Member that the Motion stands over until next week.

<u>HON DEPUTY SPEAKER</u>: The Motion stands over until next week. The Secretary will read the first Order of the Day.

CONSIDERATION: NATIONAL INTEGRATED EARLY CHILDHOOD DEVELOPMENT POLICY

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on consideration of the National Integrated Early Childhood Development Policy.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When this Debate was adjourned on Tuesday, 15 April 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by Honourable Deputy Minister of Gender Equality and Child Welfare. Honourable Tsudao Gurirab adjourned the Debate and he now has the Floor.

_

<u>HON GURIRAB</u>: Honourable Deputy Speaker, in view of the absence of the Minister, I pray for your indulgence to speak on this Motion on Tuesday.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Motion stands over until next week, Tuesday. The Secretary will read the Second Order of the Day.

MOTION ON ADDITIONAL FUNDING FOR BY-ELECTIONS

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on the provision of additional funding for by-elections in Namibia.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: When this Debate was adjourned on Wednesday, 30 April 2008, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by Honourable Moongo. Honourable Tjihuiko adjourned the Debate and he now has the Floor.

HON TJIHUIKO: Thank you very much, Honourable Deputy Speaker. Honourable Deputy Speaker, yes indeed, the issue on the Table is about the elections. The national elections is the most basic human right of people in any democratic country. Therefore, when we are talking about either funding of the elections or the running of the elections, we should look at it from the point of view that that is a democratic right of the people we are talking about.

When looking at the process of funding of elections, let us start by asking: How do we look at creating the most suitable conditions for a proper free

and fair election to take place? That is where we need to start. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: May I ask a question to Honourable Tjihuiko? Honourable Tjihuiko, do you recall how much money was allocated in the Budget for the funding of Political Parties? How much was it?

HON TJIHUIKO: It is not the money that makes the election more important, it is the process and I am looking at the process. The process I am looking at is the creation of a conducive environment for a free and fair election to take place and if you look at what has happened in this country for the last couple of years, yes indeed in this country we have free elections, but I am not sure whether we have fair elections. That is what we need to look at and the question is how. Let me try to look at and answer the question on how.

If you, for instance, have a system where the Ruling Party, as an example, declared on the 29th of April... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: May I ask Honourable Tjihuiko a question? Honourable Tjihuiko, do you know that in the United States Hillary Clinton won the popular votes, but Obama is going to be the candidate?

HON TJIHUIKO: Yes, I know and everybody thought that Hillary was going to win and what happened is that Obama won. Just as everybody is thinking that SWAPO is going to win the next time, but they are going to be in a position where they are today.

34

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: On a Point of Order. I thought as mature people I was putting the question to get elaboration. What I was going to say is that where are the fair elections in this world?

HON TJIHUIKO: The question in fairness in that process is the same thing. I am putting a big question-mark. That is why I am starting with reference to the statement that was made by the Ruling Party. I do not remember the exact date, but the Minister responsible for Information in the Ruling Party, SWAPO, made a statement that the official launching of the SWAPO Party election campaign has started.

Having said that, it means that the activities of the Ruling Party as from that date is an election campaign. Is it fair if the Government, the Ministers, the secretaries of the Ruling Party are using Government facilities, Government vehicles and S&T to go and address meetings in Eenhana and Omuthiya for election purposes? (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: On a Point of Information. I am always wondering at the Members of the Opposition sitting here in Parliament and getting allowances for Party activities and have a chance to campaign daily, and yet SWANU which is more nationalistic than many of the Parties here, is outside there and cannot come in because it does not have money. You get money and you campaign daily because Parties get allowances, but there are others outside who are more nationalistic who are left out. Is that fair?

<u>HON TJIHUIKO</u>: I was just about to get to that point. Before I come to that point, I said the election can be free, but I am referring to the fairness. The Ruling Party has officially started their election campaign,

using all the Government resources at their disposal and we cannot start, because we do not have Government vehicles, we do not have S&T. That is the unfairness that I am talking about. (Intervention)

HON P MUSHELENGA: On a Point of Information. Economists see fairness in a different perspective when they talk about elections, different from how political scientists see it. Firstly, it is not true to say that Government Ministers use Government S&T to go and campaign for Party activities. For your information, our Party has a budget for election purposes. Why you are always mentioning it here is because you see Ministers travelling in Government cars, cars for which they paid. I want us to make a clear distinction and not to confuse issues here.

HON TJIHUIKO: The point I am trying to bring home here is ...(Intervention)

HON RIRUAKO: On a Point of Order. I heard the Honourable Minister of Trade and Industry praising SWANU, but the *Troikas* have never won any seat in any Parliament in the world. That is what SWANU's background is and he knows it. We cannot tell the public that SWANU is more nationalistic. Trotsky was nationalistic but he died in Argentina. What happened? Let me withdraw that remark.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: On a Point of Information. Trotsky died in Mexico, not Argentina.

HON TJIHUIKO: That is the point that I wanted to come at, that when

we are talking about equal opportunities...(Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: On a Point of Information. I am asking guidance from the Chair, the Order says it is a Debate on the provision of additional funding for by-elections in Namibia. Can I be guided? The Honourable Member is talking about the process of fairness, etcetera, but my understanding is that there is funding available for the general elections but the concern in this Motion is additional funding for by-elections. Can we get back to the Motion because we are now really wasting time?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: You are right, Honourable Member, but sometimes the questions do divert the Members and they digress from the Motion. Come back to the topic now.

HON TJIHUIKO: That is why I made reference to the by-elections in Eenhana and Omuthiya. That is exactly what I am saying. The most important point that I wanted to make when I was disrupted is that the Minister of Trade and Industry to some extent made a point, that you have legally registered Parties, for instance SWANU, for instance RDP, but why can we not fund the activities of SWANU and the activities of RDP, the activities of SWAPO? That is what I am saying.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Where did you get that RDP? I only heard SWANU.

HON TJIHUIKO: RDP is a registered Political Party. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, **HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:** May I ask a question? Honourable Tjihuiko, you mentioned Ministers using Government cars. We are Ministers 24 hours and we pay taxes for the use of those cars, to use them as our own. Secondly, during the election the Parliament is not dissolved, so if during the election Parliament dissolves, then maybe during that time we can use our own private cars. However Parliament never dissolves during elections. Some of us have been here since 1990 and it means we use the cars 24 hours. The Honourable Minister of Trade, Honourable Geingob, asked why not SWANU. It is because they are not registered, they are not in Parliament. The same with the Minister, we are different from you. There is a difference between you as a Member of Parliament of NUDO, a Party in Parliament, and SWANU outside Parliament. You get allowances, not SWANU. The same with the Ruling Party, we are ruling, I am a Minister, so I use a Government car 24 hours. You as the opposition get an allowance and SWANU outside is not getting an allowance. Do you get it?

For instance, he is a Member of Parliament, he does not use any Government car, he is just the same as you and why is he not complaining? Why are Honourables Basson and Ncube not complaining? Why are you complaining and they are not complaining?

During an election I can go to Walvis Bay and address a SWAPO rally. In the morning I am doing Government work, visiting the Regional Council, the Local Authority Council and address a meeting as Government Minister and after that I can go and address a SWAPO rally as a politician. I can go to Otavi and address all Civil Servants, NUDO, SWAPO, RDP, whatever, I can call them as a Government Minister and address them and in the evening I can go and address SWAPO members.

He can however not go and address Civil Servants. Why is he not complaining and you are complaining? Why is SWANU not complaining and you are complaining?

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, the good thing about it is that the Honourable Minister agreed with me hundred percent. I said, and this is what the Minister agreed with, the election in this country is free but it is not fair. If you have a Minister saying that a Party that is not in the House should not be treated equal and he is also saying that we in this House should not be treated equal, I agree hundred percent that all the Political Parties, be it NUDO, SWANU, SWAPO, DTA, RDP, APP whatever, as long as they are registered, must be treated equal.

If a Party wants to participate in the election in Eenhana, NUDO is getting money for being in this House, RDP wants to participate, where are they going to get the money to level the playing field? (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: On a Point of Order. I have to make this Point which I think is very important. We are in this House not for our own sake, we are here for the interest of the Nation and the reason why the State of Namibia funds Parties that are in Parliament is in order to nurture and develop the democracy in our country. It is not to generate income for individual members who are members of Political Parties. This thing of this Party should get funded and that one and that one, should end because it is not about us, it is about us being able to reach out to the Namibian people in order for them to be politically educated and to participate in the democratic process. That is what it is all about.

We have however established benchmarks for accessing these resources because we do not want some politicians who are hungry for money to misuse that opportunity by just registering a Party with a fictitious name and then to say they must get public funds, whereas they do not have constituents and they are not doing to contribute to the development of democracy. It is about democracy and serving our people, not about you, Honourable Tjihuiko.

39

MOTION ON FUNDING FOR BY-ELECTIONS HON TJIHUIKO

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Minister, the good thing about your argument is that you also agree, if you are saying that the purpose of the funding of the Political Parties is to do the job which we have been elected for. We have been elected by the very same people. Now, if the Honourable Minister is taking a Government vehicle to address a meeting in Lüderitz in the afternoon and to address a SWAPO meeting in Lüderitz the next morning, you have used taxpayers' money for that activity. I do not have the same opportunity. Where is my right as an elected Member of this House? Where does my right end and yours start? (Intervention)

05 June 2008

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL

WELFARE: Comrade Deputy Speaker, if Honourable Tjihuiko has been sent to speak on behalf of Parties which are not represented here, he can say it directly. Honourable Tjihuiko receives a car allowance and he claims kilometre tariffs. (Interjections). Whether he pays or does not pay, he receives a car allowance and he goes with that car to address a NUDO rally. Why can he not give that car to those he sympathises with and then we will see whether he is serious. You receive a car allowance and now you come and cry crocodile tears.

<u>HON TJIHUIKO</u>: No, I think there is a serious misunderstanding. I did not bring in the names of the Political Parties which are not in this House. Somebody mentioned the name SWANU and I added the name of a Political Party in this House. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: May I ask a question?
Comrade Tjihuiko – I am calling you 'comrade' because at one time you were SWANU, we were calling each other comrade. The presence here is proportional and do you mean we should change the proportional because

some of the people are only here because of the leftover votes from our side? Do you want us to withdraw those votes? I think it is high time that we change the Constitution on the leftover votes and the winner takes all. It is proportional, NUDO has four members, SWAPO has 55 members this side plus six. You have three. Do you want us to withdraw our leftover votes from CoD, DTA, UDF and NUDO? Then you will never be here.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker... (Intervention)

HON RIRUAKO: On a Point of Order and on a Point of Correction. I do not want to create a problem in the Assembly. We had seven and we shattered because the day is gone, we cannot argue on that. We are supposed to be the Official Opposition here and you know that. Other Members of Parliament in the whole world have Government cars to begin with. If we had parameters we could have brought the whole Government into jeopardy and I said no, it is over. Take care of the truth and not of what you want to say.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Debate is on provision of additional funding for the by-elections.(Intervention)

HON RIRUAKO: Hundred thousand per year, I can bring it here in black and white and you are talking about what you are paid, while you are being paid twice as much as us.

HON TJIHUIKO: The Motion is about the funding ... (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Honourable Riruako made a serious allegation, claiming that votes were taken away from NUDO, but do you recall that was a recount of votes? At what stage were the votes taken away from you?

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: Honourable Tjihuiko, are you aware of the fact that during the recount there were thirty ballot boxes where the ballot papers were pulp because of water? Could you maybe inform us as to how they were counted?

<u>HON DEPUTY SPEAKER</u>: Proceed with the Motion. Come to the Motion.

HON TJIHUIKO: The Motion on the Table is the additional funding for by-elections and that is the point that I want us to address. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: May I ask a question? Honourable Tjihuiko, do you really expect NUDO to win if during the last election in Kavango Region a 16-year old girl introduced herself as a NUDO candidate. Do you really think that if you produce such a child you would get more than three? Are you serious with the elections if you introduce a young girl of 16 years to the Nation, that if they vote for her she will bring development to the Kavango Region. Are you really serious?

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, allow me to answer that one because that is very crucial. I am totally surprised to hear that from the Honourable Minister. The lady was not sixteen, she was twenty-

four and in this House we have been talking about empowerment of young people and I think SWAPO is one of the Parties which has more young people in this House than any other Party. Minister, you are now insulting the young SWAPO members sitting in this august House. That is very serious and I think the young SWAPO Members should think twice about what you have said.

The point that I am trying to make is additional funding and in conclusion I want to say that the additional funding that I am talking about should be equal, to create an environment where the participants will participate in the election on an equal footing. As long as we have a system where you give somebody a car allowance and you give somebody a 24 hours Government funded car ... (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY:

Honourable Deputy Speaker, On a Point of Information. The Honourable Member has earlier on alluded to the people who have voted the SWAPO Party to power are the same people who voted for his party and I want that to be very clear. There is a difference, because the SWAPO Party has been given a mandate and that is why we are on duty 24 hours to respond to the general public, including your members. That is the difference and on top of that, it has been said time and again – and I am repeating it – that we are paying tax on the vehicles we are using. We are paying tax for the use of the car in addition to the normal tax that we pay. That should be very clear.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I was saying that in order for us to be on an equal footing, we do not have a problem ... (Intervention)

43

MOTION ON FUNDING FOR BY-ELECTIONS HON TJIHUIKO

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, this Honourable Member has become a master on misinformation and I know that he comes to Parliament every day, not hoping to make a constructive contribution, but just to distort everything that the SWAPO Members of Parliament say. The point that is to be made here is that Members of Parliament are not remunerated on the basis of their Political Parties, they are remunerated on the basis of the public office that they hold. If you are a backbencher and you belong to an Opposition Party and you are paid a salary and benefits that are different from those of Ministers, it is not because you are an Opposition Party member. Our own SWAPO members who are not members of the Executive do get the same benefits and they do contribute optimally to the political programme and to building democracy in this country. Thus, this Honourable Member should not try to go around, telling the Namibian public that in Parliament the SWAPO members are paid this way and they are endowed with these benefits in order to enhance their political programme while we are paid so much.

05 June 2008

It must again be emphasised here that when we are public leaders, we are expected to discharge our duties 24 hours a day, 7 days a week and 12 months a year. Therefore, a Minister does not stop being a Minister just because he is at a public rally. If you are Minister of Defence and there is a threat to the integrity of the Namibian integrity, the President will say, "I want you here and make sure that the Namibian Defence Force responds in defence of the territorial integrity." You are not going to say, "no, I left my ministerial car there, now I have to try and hitchhike" and so forth. If he were to do that and he was not able to arrive in Windhoek until the next day, you will say he is incompetent. You will say, "you had a public vehicle allocated to you." Now, how do you expect the Ministers to leave the cars in Windhoek when they go and address rallies?

Finally, you have not yet responded to the comment by Honourable Iilonga that Members of Parliament who are not members of the Executive do get an allowance to enable them to pay for a vehicle in order to assist them to discharge of their parliamentary duties. Do you, Honourable Tjihuiko, use that vehicle to go and address members of NUDO at political rallies or not? If you do, what is the difference

between that and a Minister addressing a rally with a Government car? Please answer that question.

HON TJIHUIKO: The Honourable Members are asking questions and they are not giving me a chance to answer because they are so scared of getting the answers.

The answer to the question by Honourable Iilonga is simple: What I am saying is, let us have one system. I have never complained about you having a car. You pay tax and we are also prepared to pay the tax that you are paying if we can be at more or less the 80% of what you are getting. We are also representing people; we were also elected as you have been elected. We need to have access to these Government resources. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: On a Point of Information. Honourable Tjihuiko needs to know that I have been a backbencher for 5 years and I am the one who fought for those benefits you now have as a backbencher. We were not getting anything and we fought until we won you are now benefitting from our sweat. Thank us for negotiating for you on those benefits.

HON TJIHUIKO: Thank you very much, Honourable Deputy Minister. I think we should officially appoint the Honourable Deputy Minister as the official Trade Union leader of the Members of Parliament in this House. Please go ahead and negotiate for us.

In conclusion, Honourable Deputy Speaker....(Intervention)

45

HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: On a Point of Order, Comrade Deputy Speaker. He was saying we should all be treated equal, all the backbenchers, Opposition and Ruling Party, are treated equal. The difference is that we have cars to execute our ministerial duties. If you get a car, are you going to execute NUDO duties or which duties? Suppose you get the same treatment, the same car, what will you do with that car? This car is not to execute SWAPO duties, but ministerial duties. There is a different. If tomorrow I become a backbencher, I will just come and sit there and join you but I will never complain, because I understand I am no longer a Minister.

HON TJIHUIKO: In conclusion, Honourable Deputy Speaker, what I am appealing to the Colleagues is that all of us sitting in this House have one constituency, namely the whole of Namibia. If we want to be effective in providing services to the people and you give the one person a thousand dollars a month for petrol and the other person is getting the car, then let us look at a more reasonable system that would enable all of us to serve the people who have elected us. The first thing that happened is that all of us are Members of Parliament and at that level we should be treated equally, before you become a Minister. However, Members of Parliament are not treated in such a manner that they can represent the people who elected them.

With that sound and reasonable contribution, I rest my case.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I now recognise Honourable Ulenga.

<u>HON ULENGA</u>: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I rise to support the Motion of the Honourable Moongo and in supporting it, Honourable

Deputy Speaker, with all due respect, I think we are really getting offtrack by standing here, talking about the relative advantages and benefits to different parties and Members of Parliament because that was not the point that the Motion is making.

What the Motion is asking is for additional funding for by-elections. I do not want to be interrupted, there is no time. (Intervention)

HON RIRUAKO: On a Point of Order. The fact is that some Political Parties have money abroad and we know how much and some Parties have more than N\$300,000. The others have no way to also receive these funds. We know this! And this is a lump sum that put some Political Parties in a position to say what they want. However at some point we expect to get money out of your Government in a very right direction without any problem.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, like I said, I really support the Motion of Mr Moongo. I want to illustrate the reason why I support the Motion and the reason why this Motion is valid by citing what happened, for example, in Rundu at the beginning of this year where a by-election was conducted and where definitely there was not enough funds put aside for the conducting of that election and where the results were definitely affected by... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: May I ask a question?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Question declined. Proceed,

Honourable Ulenga.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, it is with all due respect that I decline the question by the Honourable Minister. I do not think ... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: On a Point of Order. We keep referring to the by-election in Rundu. We know there are still some people who during the Unita war fled to Namibia and some of them are Nyembas. Now the Honourable Member went and said, "we will do this for the Nyembas." How can you address people who are refugees in Namibia and they do not vote? The majority of those you were addressing were refugees. You did not go to the Namibians, you addressed refugees and now you come here and talk about the by-election in Rundu.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker... (Intervention)

HON RIRUAKO: On a Point of Order. Those people happened to be here for 40 years. I know what I am talking about, they have been here for 40 years, all of them. (Interjections). I am not talking about the young people, I am talking about all those old Nyembas. That attitude is not fair in Parliament that if you are a Nyemba you are not entitled to a position. You have to think about that. Let us accommodate them.

<u>HON ULENGA</u>: Honourable Deputy Speaker, on the Nyemba question, I think Jerry must go to Rundu and Kavango and tell the people

themselves, he must not tell me. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: On a Point of Order. To cut a long story short, CoD currently, forgetting Kavango, your members joined the APP, Shixwameni took it, so there are no members, so you cannot refer to him. You did not get a vote because they went with Shixwameni, so blame Shixwameni and not the Government or any other

Party.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I have not said a thing yet. Everybody understands that next year is election year and we also know that hopefully later this year there is going to be a substantive Amendment to the Electoral Act. I therefore do not want to mix up things here and on the question of additional funds for purposes of by-elections, the finances that were put aside by Government to fund the by-election in Rundu Rural West were not sufficient. For example, the Electoral Commission had to put up 4 mobile teams to run about 12 mobile stations... (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: On a Point of Information to Honourable Ulenga. When he started, he said people who spoke before him went off the track and now he comes up with the funding of the by-election in Rundu but the Motion is not asking the Government of the Republic of Namibia, which is a SWAPO Government to give money to the Electoral Commission. Honourable Moongo wants them to be given money. In Eenhana you got N\$12, that is enough for you and you are still going to get less than that.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, when you have a Constituency that is so large, that is about 200 kilometres in length like Rundu Rural West, which stretches from Rundu to the border of the region... (Intervention)

HON P MUSHELENGA: On a Point of Information. I do not know whether Honourable Ulenga is deliberately trying to misinterpret the Motion by Honourable Moongo. We were here when Honourable Moongo was motivating the Motion and it is not a question of additional funding for Government or Electoral Commission operations, he was talking about additional funding to Political Parties when we have byelections. What we are saying is that Political Parties receive money from Government, it is a question of budgeting, you must make provision when you budget that there is likely to be by-elections, so let us budget for this. You have already received funds from Government.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Deputy Speaker, in a Constituency that is so large and so vast, a mobile team is given the opportunity... (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: On a Point of Information. Rundu Rural Constituency borders Rundu Urban and Kapako. This story of 200 kilometres is not my story.

HON ULENGA: I was there myself, I have driven it. Honourable Deputy Speaker, what happened in Rundu was that the mobile teams given the task to run the election in the rural parts of the Constituency could not do their job because they did not have enough resources.

The teams themselves did not have enough. In the first place, when team number 1 started with the elections at 07:00 at the first mobile station and they had about three hours to finish, after three hours not only half of the people in the queue had voted. The team however had to move on to go to supervise at the second mobile point. What happened was that the Electoral Commission, as an emergency measure, had to go and hire ballot boxes which were not initially made provision for. They had to create teams which were not initially made provision for. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: On a Point of Order. Honourable Ulenga, when you started talking you told the public out there that the funds for the by-election in Rundu were insufficient. Now you dilute that by saying that when the Electoral Commission found that they needed other teams to rescue the situation, they hired new people. How can you hire if you have no resources?

<u>HON ULENGA</u>: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I will explain to you. They went to hire from the existing polling stations. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: On a Point of Information, Honourable Members. Not very long ago Honourable Ulenga was in Rundu, but there is a strong story circulating now that if you go there and go into certain lodges, you may be arrested because apparently you gave them invalid cheques. If you want more information I can give it outside, but this is just informing you.

<u>HON ULENGA</u>: Honourable Deputy Speaker, that cannot be Ben Ulenga because I did not pay with a single cheque when I was in Rundu.

However, Honourable Deputy Speaker, that is how I read this Motion by Honourable Moongo and what happened in Rundu was a direct cause of insufficient funds being set aside for a by-election.

The Electoral Commission did not have enough teams to run all the voting points. They ended up taking from the existing teams, taking one person here, another person there, taking one voting box here, another box there. They had to create new teams that were not in their papers, with the result that the Parties, CoD, SWAPO, NUDO, which were there to monitor the elections, were not even informed that a new team would be created on the voting day. The result was that we could not monitor some of those points. (Intervention)

HON RIRUAKO: My humble opinion is that we use the machine, talk about something new, not talk about what happened. Let us talk about what is to be done and how it is to be done and move in a new direction. As simple as that.

<u>HON ULENGA:</u> On the question of voting machines, I believe that is on the cards, but I really think that would be the wrong way of using resources for elections. Anyhow, that is not the topic now. The question is, what happened in the Rundu Rural West by-election was a disaster and it was a disaster caused... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: On a Point of Order. Honourable Deputy Speaker, I think the Honourable Member should listen to the advice from our Chief. The Chief advises that you should not speak about something which is already water under the bridge, but about the way forward. The Chief said we should leave Eenhana and Rundu and the Chief is an elder and we must respect the elders.

52

<u>HON ULENGA</u>: Even despite all the interruptions, Honourable Deputy Speaker, I think the point that I made with regard to insufficient polling points has been taken. (Intervention)

HON **DEPUTY** MINISTER OF **INFORMATION BROADCASTING:** On a Point of Information. During the by-election in Rundu Rural West I was also in the field. There was no issue about lack of resources for the officials who were involved in the elections. Because there were so many people in the queue, we had to agree with the officials that teams should be divided, to have the same team on the same route and you cannot leave people behind at a polling station due to the time factor. The teams were divided and it was agreed by the Parties that the teams could be divided to attend to both Polling Stations without leaving out any people who could not vote. We should not talk about chaos and lack of resources. And the party officials were in the same team, it did not come from any other team from any other polling station. We were in the field and maybe you were somewhere else, you were only informed about what was happening.

About the additional funding to Political Parties as mentioned in this Motion, there are calls in this House from the Opposition and in the Nkurenkuru elections money was given to this Party to go and campaign. Do you know what happened? They ended up watching soccer in Nkurenkuru instead of campaigning. How can we give you money to go and do political work and you end up watching soccer? How can that happen if we want additional funding for Political Parties?

HON ULENGA: Thank you, Deputy Speaker, that is exactly how the elections were rigged in Rundu. It is good that you were in the field. Both of us were in the field, do not say I was anywhere else. What happened simply was that there was no way that the parties could monitor the elections. (Intervention)

MOTION ON FUNDING FOR BY-ELECTIONS HON ULENGA

HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: On a Point of Order. The Member said the elections were rigged and he never complained. There is a provision in the law if a Member feels it was rigged. Who rigged the elections?

<u>HON ULENGA</u>: I will maintain that the elections were rigged, perhaps not in a conventional way like Jerry wants. (Interjections) Listen, you cannot go and introduce additional boxes which were not marked, you cannot go and introduce impromptu polling stations which were not made provision for and then say the elections were fair. They were rigged. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS: On a Point of Order. I was part of the Nkurenkuru elections and I believe the CoD also contested those elections. When I went there, for the information of the Honourable Members, we were told that on two occasions one of the members of the CoD, who is a Member of Parliament, went there twice to address an empty tent. If they lose elections under such circumstances, how can you say the elections were rigged, when they do not even have people to address? Even if we give them N\$ 10 million, they will go there and there will be no people, they will just address empty tents. Is that really feasible in Namibia?

<u>HON ULENGA</u>: Honourable Deputy Speaker, another reason why we need to give additional money... (Intervention)

<u>HON BASSON</u>: On a Point of Information. Comrade Deputy Speaker, I am from the Hardap Region and I was the Regional

54

05 June 2008

Coordinator. What I know is that some of the Political Parties, especially Opposition Parties, do not have structures in place – no structures! And the only time they come to the people is at the time of elections and then they talk about rigging. How can it be rigged? They are not campaigning, they do nothing, they only come there for elections. As we are sitting in this House now, the SWAPO Party has structures, the sections, the branches at district and regional levels, the Politburo and they are busy right now. They are however sitting there, just waiting for elections. I just wanted to give the information that the Opposition Parties should not come here in Parliament and say they want money. They are not working and that is the information I wanted to give.

HON ULENGA: I am not fighting SWAPO. I am talking about additional money coming from Government. After the Rundu Rural West by-election, I and a team from the CoD and the DTA that were on the field went to conduct an exit poll. We went to a village which participated in the by-election and we asked them... (Intervention)

HON RIRUAKO: I have the right to say that the election was rigged because I have people around me and they moved around and those who used to be your representatives turned against you. We cannot keep on talking about the issue, it happened in broad daylight. We are talking about additional money, but we must come with a new scenario in order to cope.

<u>HON ULENGA</u>: I am not interested in fighting the Chief. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: A Point of Order.

HON ULENGA: Why should you allow that, Honourable Deputy Speaker?

.____

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Points of Orders are allowed in our Standing Rules and Orders.

<u>HON MINISTER OF EDUCATION</u>: On a Point of Information. Exit polls can only be conducted... (Intervention)

<u>HON ULENGA</u>: You do not know what I am going to say about exit polls. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF EDUCATION: No, you mentioned that you were conducting exit polls and exit polls can only be conducted by a neutral person. You cannot, after I voted, come to me and ask, "did you vote for me?" I will tell you I voted for you. That is the right of a citizen, but this should be done by a neutral person, a newspaper or whatever, not by a Party trying to get votes.

<u>HON ULENGA</u>: Honourable Deputy Speaker, anyway, we conducted exit polls... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: Comrade Deputy Speaker, just like Honourable Basson said, currently SWAPO has sections in most if not all parts of the country. We have branches in every town and village. We have regional and district structures. CoD does not have

structures. All the Parties do not have structures. If you join a Party today, tomorrow you are the secretary general of that Party. In SWAPO you have to be a member for five years before you are elected as a branch secretary and five years before you are elected to the district and regional level and ten years to be a member of the central committee. We have structures. The people who come to your meetings are SWAPO members. We tell them *go and listen to what they say*. You address SWAPO members and then you say they are going to vote for you. In 1989 the people went there to eat the *boerewors* and then they voted for SWAPO.

As long as the CoD is divided, do not expect the ordinary person to come and vote for CoD. You do not have structures and unfortunately Shixwameni took all your votes in Kavango. Forget Kavango, you do not have votes in Kavango. And NUDO, it was the first time the people in Kavango heard about NUDO. Therefore forget about that. As long as UDF is just for Khorixas, forget to come to power. You cannot get an equal share when it comes to finances because SWAPO covers the whole country. MAG – forget about it!

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Ulenga, proceed. I think you can wind up now because of the time.

<u>HON ULENGA</u>: What should I wind up if I had not spoken? I will continue to speak tomorrow.

HON RIRUAKO: We talk about how many offices we have in Kavango. They cannot be only in Rundu. NUDO has offices throughout Kavango. You are supposed to be seen. Now is the time to come to a new method, please. (Interjections).

57

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, SPORT AND NATIONAL SERVICE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, on a Point of Order. I am really sorry to interrupt the Member who has the Floor and this is also by no means disrespect, but I am just rising on a Point of Order, that I am very much worried about the decorum of the House as the Debate is going on at the moment. This is more of laughter, almost a circus and I am worried about that. I am also worried about the fact that Members are addressing each other on first-name terms. Yes, we know they are friends, they are colleagues, comrades, but here they are supposed to be Members of Parliament and address each other as Members of Parliament. It seems the Honourable Member will continue tomorrow, therefore I thought I must raise this Point of Order just to make these remarks.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I did not hear anybody who said "*Ulenga*". If there is somebody who did it, please, next time it should not be repeated.

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, SPORT AND NATIONAL SERVICE: To assist the Honourable Deputy Speaker, time and again I heard, even with all respect, Honourable Ulenga referring to the Minister as "Jerry" and vice versa, "Tjihuiko". That is what I mean. One should rather talk about the Member on the other side of the House or the Honourable Member having the Floor, etcetera, for the decorum of the House. That is what I am worried about. Thank you very much.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: In terms of Rule 90 the House stands adjourned until Tuesday, 14:30.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:46 UNTIL 2008.06.10 AT 14:30

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY ASSEMBLY CHAMBER 10 JUNE 2008 WINDHOEK

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

<u>HON SPEAKER</u>: Any Petitions? Any Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Honourable Diergaardt.

TABLING: PROGRESS REPORT ON MOTION ON PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES

HON DIERGAARDT: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. On behalf of the Members of the Standing Committee on Constitutional and Legal Affairs, I wish to submit a progress report on the Motion of Self-representation by Law of People with Disabilities at all levels of Government.

Honourable Speaker, the above-mentioned Motion was tabled by Honourable Alexia Ncube in the National Assembly and was subsequently referred to the Standing Committee on Constitutional and Legal Affairs on the 12th of June 2007 for further consultation with various stakeholders and to report back to the National Assembly.

Honourable Speaker, on behalf of the Chairperson of the Standing Committee of Constitutional and Legal Affairs I would like to update or inform the Members of this august House on the progress so far in respect of this Motion.

The Standing Committee has thus far consulted with the Right Honourable Prime Minister, the National Federation of People with Disabilities in

TABLING OF REPORTS HON DIERGAARDT

Namibia. Meetings were also scheduled with various Political Parties represented in the National Assembly, but had to be called off due to other engagements by the Political Parties.

Further consultative meetings are scheduled with the Ministry of Health and Social Services, Namibian Employers Federation, the Namibian Employees Federation and eventually, with His Excellency, the President of the Republic of Namibia. The Standing Committee's initial research has found that Uganda has legal instruments in place which address the plight of people with disabilities, similar to the ones being suggested by the Motion of Honourable Ncube. Hence the Standing Committee thought it prudent to pay a consultative research visit to the Republic of Uganda and to either Senegal, Cameroon or Ghana, depending on the outcome of the Standing Committee's research on these countries.

Once all stakeholders have been consulted, a full report will be tabled in this Honourable House for consideration. I so Move, Honourable Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Member table the Report? Any further Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Honourable Mutorwa.

TABLING: REPORT ON WORLD FOOD SECURITY

HON MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY:

Honourable Speaker, I lay upon the Table for the information and reference of the Honourable Members, the Report and Declaration on World Food Security as adopted by the High Level Conference on World Food Security that took place in Rome, Italy from the 3rd to 5th of June 2008.

60

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS HON VILJOEN

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Minister table the Report? Any further Reports or Papers? Any Notice of Questions? Honourable Viljoen.

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS

QUESTION 59:

HON VILJOEN: Honourable Speaker, I give Notice that on Thursday, 19 June 2008, I shall ask the Honourable Minister of Mines and Energy the following question:

We are all aware of the fact that the National Petroleum Corporation (NAMCOR) suffers major losses. Did the mentioned losses have any influence on the last increase of fuel prices or will it affect the cost of fuel in any way in future?

QUESTION 60:

HON VILJOEN: I give Notice that on Thursday, 19 June 2008, I shall ask the Honourable Minister of Education the following questions:

- 1. How many learners from Grade 1 to 4 in Namibia receive education through their mother-tongue as medium of instruction?
- 2. What is the number of learners from Grade 1 to 4, respectively for each of the national languages in every education region in Namibia?
- 3. How many learners from Grade 1 to 4 receive education through the medium of the official language, English, in every education region?

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS HON MOONGO

QUESTION 61:

HON MOONGO: Honourable Speaker, I give Notice that on Thursday, 19 June 2008, I shall ask the Minister of Defence the following:

- 1. Can the Minister confirm or deny that NDF member no. 17074776, Mr Petrus Vilho, was unfairly retired by the Medical Board in 2002?
- 2. What ground did the medical board use if he was treated by a traditional healer who did not disqualify him with a permanent disability and rather gave him sick leave?
- 3. Is it true that some other patients who have been suffering for many years are still on the payroll? Is it nepotism or favouritism practised in the NDF?
- 4. When will Petrus Vilho, who is fit, be reinstated as stated by Dr Katjitae (Speacialist Physician) and Dr E Kamati, General Practitioner (GP)? I hereby attach the documentary proof of those doctors.

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Member table the Motion? Any further Notice of Questions? Any Notices of Motions? Honourable Viljoen.

NOTICE OF MOTIONS

HON VILJOEN: Honourable Speaker, I give Notice that on Tuesday, 24 June 2008, I shall Move –

That this Assembly discusses and considers the replacement of the present school curriculum for religious and moral education in all grades with

NOTICE OF MOTIONS RT HON N ANGULA

Biblical Christian Education, taking into account the principle of freedom of religion.

Furthermore, the Christian education being an integral part of the training of prospective teachers.

I also Move that this Motion be referred to the Standing Committee on Human Resources, Social and Community Development. I so Move.

11 d 17 11 M 1 d 11 d

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Member table the Motion? Honourable Prime Minister.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: I give Notice that tomorrow, Wednesday, 11 June 2008, I shall Move –

That this Assembly, in accordance with Article 127 of the Namibian Constitution, approves the reappointment, by His Excellency the President, of Mr Junius Etuna Kandjeke as Auditor General of the Republic of Namibia for a period of a further 5 years. I so Move.

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Prime Minister table the Motion? Any further Notice of Motions? Any Ministerial Statements? The first Notice of Motion is the one of the Honourable Minister of Foreign Affairs. Does the Honourable Member Move the Motion?

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: I will Move the Motion on Thursday.

CONVENTION ON FISHING VESSELS HON H ANGULA

HON SPEAKER: The Motion stands adjourned until Thursday. The second Notice of Motion is one by the Honourable Minister of Works and Transport. Does the Honourable Minister Move the Motion? Who seconds the Motion? Agreed to.

ACCESSION: CONVENTION ON STANDARDS OF TRAINING, CERTIFICATION AND WATCH-KEEPING FOR FISHING VESSELS PERSONNEL

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, while Namibia is already a party to the main Convention on Standards of Training, Certification and Watchkeeping for Seafarers (STCW) 1978 as amended in 1995 in general, she has not yet acceded to a similar Convention on Standards of Training, Certification and Watchkeeping (STCW-F) 1995, which specifically covers fishermen on board fishing vessels.

This Convention requires State Parties to undertake to promulgate laws, orders and regulations to ensure that, from the point of view of the safety of life and properties at sea and the protection of the marine environment, seagoing fishing personnel are qualified and fit for their duties.

These standards are considered to be the highest practicable safety standards for fishermen on board fishing vessels.

In terms of Section 356 of our Merchant Shipping Act of 1951, the Minister of Works and Transport has promulgated new Regulations on Education, Training and Certification of Namibian Seafarers in 2004.

These regulations repealed the old Regulations on Certificates of Oualifications of 1998.

CONVENTION ON FISHING VESSELS HON H ANGULA

The new regulations set new safety standards of training, certification and watch-keeping for fishermen and are consistent with the accepted international safety practices provided by the STCW-F Convention.

The accession to such Convention will, therefore, bring Namibia more benefits, such as the following:

- It will serve to bring to the attention of the International Maritime Organisation (IMO) that Namibia has incorporated relevant international safety standards into her domestic laws and has promulgated regulations to give effect to this Convention.
- Namibia will qualify to request technical, assistance for the training of technical, personnel; establishment of institutions for training of fishing vessel personnel; supply of equipment and facilities for training institutions, etcetera.
- The accession will also boost the status and credibility of the Namibian Maritime and Fisheries Training Institutions. The training institutions will, therefore, receive international accreditation of both the IMO and International Labour Organisation (ILO).
- The maritime and fisheries qualifications will enjoy reciprocal recognition by other member states.
- Last but not least, Namibian fishermen will enjoy employment preference when seeking employment on board fishing vessels at home and elsewhere abroad.

The accession to the Convention will involve no extra work and hence, no extra cost to the Government. This is because the accession will not require any extra work to be performed, in addition to the work already undertaken by my Ministry when attending to the enforcement of existing regulations.

CONVENTION ON FISHING VESSELS HON DR AMWEELO

I, therefore, strongly recommend to the Parliament that Namibia accedes to this Convention and that the Minister of Foreign Affairs is delegated to effect the accession on behalf of the Government. I so Move and I thank you, Honourable Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Minister for his statement. Any further discussion? Dr Amweelo.

HON DR AMWEELO: Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members of the National Assembly, I rise to support the International Convention of Standards of Training, Certification and Watchkeeping for Fishing Vessel Personnel (STCW-F).

The objectives of the Government to accede to the International Maritime Organisation Conventions are to ensure the safety of life and property at sea and also to prevent and combat pollution of the marine environment ships and to promote the maritime interests of Namibia.

The International Maritime Organisation has long ago reported that at least 80 to 85% of all accidents at sea are due to human error. What we know is that personnel working on board fishing vessels are more exposed to dangerous situations than personnel on board cargo carriers and we have more than 200 fishing vessels in our country.

Despite this fact, the International Maritime Conventions have basically been directed at the safety on board merchant shipping vessels and not the fishing fleets until we got the Torremolinos Protocol and the International Convention on Standards of Training, Certification and Watchkeeping for Fishing Vessel Personnel (STCW-F) 1995. I know that the Government has already acceded to (STCW) 1978, which as amended, sets the standards of competence for seafarers internationally. Amongst its provisions is a requirement for Parties to the Convention to communicate

CONVENTION ON FISHING VESSELS HON DR AMWEELO

information to IMO on the measures adopted to implement the Convention nationally.

The STCW-F Convention specifically shall apply to the personnel serving on board seagoing vessels continuing to fly the flags of the State according to class economic activity. That study was carried out in 1990 to 1991. It was noted that no other economic activity represents so many accidents as the fishing industry, even when compared to the normal high-risk activities in mining, building and construction industries. Therefore, it is very important to support this IMO Convention for the improvement of safety for fishing vessels.

The other benefit for acceding to the IMO Convention is that our fishermen's certificates are going to be recognised both nationally and internationally. Only a few countries have acceded to these conventions.

It is also interesting to note that the representatives of the industry have voiced reluctance to accept the Directorate's efforts to implement, for example the requirements of the STCW 1978 and the STCW-F 1995 Conventions. These two Conventions are probably the most important instruments ever agreed on internationally to improve the safety standards for seafarers. It shall further be noted that these safety standards are the minimum agreed on by the representatives from the shipping and fishing industries who have participated in the development of new maritime legislation through an *ad hoc* Committee. These include fishing vessel construction regulations, radio regulations and the shipping regulations. Participation of the Industry in enhancing the safety on board ships and vessels is necessary, however only to a certain extent.

If the STCW-F Convention is acceded to, it will help our fishermen to be recognised nationally and internationally, therefore I fully support the Convention to be acceded to. I thank you very much.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member for his substantive contribution. Any further discussion? Does the Honourable Minister of Works and Transport wish to reply?

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Thank you very much, Comrade Speaker, and I would like to thank the Honourable former Minister of Works, Transport and Communication for his constructive comments on this very important Convention. Thank you very much.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Minister for his reply. I now put the Question that the Motion be adopted. Any objection? None. It is agreed to. The third Notice of Motion is the one of the Honourable Mr Ulenga. Does the Honourable Member Move the Motion? Who seconds? Any objection? Agreed to. Honourable Ulenga has the floor.

MOTION ON ZIMBABWE

HON ULENGA: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. May I also start by welcoming you back and I hope that all that good work has been done and wrapped up in Cuba.

Having said so, Honourable Speaker, I thought I should take issue with the way the original wording of this Motion has been interfered with and I am not so sure whether this is the correct language that it should take.

It is purely for grammatical reasons, Honourable Speaker, and I am sure you yourself, being who you are, would take issue with this. It is not how I worded the Motion. For example, I Moved that this Assembly "urgently

dictates", not "debates" because I never intended that the Motion's wording be translated into Namlish. However, this is not the issue, the issue is the substance of the Motion. (Interjections). We can talk about that outside.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, when I initially Moved this Motion on the 23rd of April 2008, Zimbabwe had been waiting for the election results in that country, both presidential and parliamentary, for nearly one month. Today it is almost three months since those elections were held on the 29th of March 2008 and the political and economic crises in that beloved neighbouring African sister-country has gone on. That is however not a new development, Zimbabweans have fled their country in their millions for years now to escape economic hardships. It is not possible any longer to quote the inflation figures for Zimbabwe for they change exponentially almost every ten seconds.

Honourable Speaker, this Motion is not about Zimbabwe's economic crisis, it is about the political crisis that has deepened and degenerated even further into a veritable regional emergency, developing even more deleterious social complications for the southern African region as a Government that has reached the lowest levels of legitimacy tries to prop itself up, using violence, killings, arrests, detention, beatings and the general intimidation and harassment of its opponents and the general population to remain in power at all costs. This Motion is on the political crisis and it is on that that I will ask the House to debate and take a stand.

Honourable Speaker, when the election results were finally oozed out of ZEC, the Zimbabwe Election Commission, in April, then opposition Movement for Democratic Change (MDC), was announced to have won the parliamentary vote with 109 seats out of the total of 210 of the House of Assembly of Zimbabwe being in their favour. Some of the polls in some constituencies had to be postponed because of deaths from natural causes of some of the candidates and yet the overall results were clear and beyond doubt.

Honourable Speaker, the presidential results took more than a month to crystallise. After some of the dust had cleared, it became clear that

Morgan Tsvangirai of the MDC was at least numerically the front-runner, but falling short of the 50% plus 1 vote criterion to be declared the winner. I am not necessarily on the one side or the other.

Honourable Speaker, the fact that, despite this convincing win in parliamentary elections, the MDC still remains in opposition is the issue, because that is a fact. However the winning looks so convincing, the MDC still remains the opposition. The presidential run-off was delayed contrary of the provisions of the country's constitution. The country has slid into a dangerous political limbo, where the people had spoken, but their mandate has been ignored. Political violence has descended on Zimbabwe, characterised by the murder, beatings and detentions of those who support political parties other than Zanu-PF. As we speak today, more than 60 opposition activists have been murdered since the elections, 8 of those over the last weekend only. More than three thousand people have sustained injuries in political violence and have been treated in hospitals and clinics across Zimbabwe. Many Members of Parliament have been arrested and detained, the latest amongst who are Mr Eric Matinenga and Mr Nelson Chamisa. Honourable Speaker, the leader of the MDC, Morgan Tsvangirai himself was arrested twice in three days last week alone, as the opposition was attempting to launch their campaign for the presidential run-off expected to take place on the 27th of June.

Mr Speaker, the details from the Zimbabwean situation are grimy and grisly. The important question is, where do we stand on this issue, and what can we do as Namibian Members of Parliament to reverse this situation?

Honourable Speaker, as Zimbabweans prepare themselves for the important coming run-off, they need to do so in an atmosphere of peace, freedom and in the absence of political violence. What we can do is, we can cooperate with others to achieve that for Zimbabwe and we shall have failed not only Zimbabwe, but Namibia itself if we do not take a stand and make up our minds on this one.

Honourable Speaker, the President of the MDC and the preliminary winner in the first round of the presidential election has recently written a

letter to the South African President, Mr Thabo Mbeki, informing the latter that the MDC, which is a principal stakeholder in the Zimbabwean issue, has withdrawn their endorsement and their support for Mr Mbeki as SADC mediator on Zimbabwe.

For those of you who have not seen the letter, I can assure you it is a painful piece of literature. It details how the SADC and their mediator have betrayed the cause of freedom, of peace and of democracy and, indeed, the long-term stability in Zimbabwe and the region as a whole. Mr Tsvangirai for the first time publicly reveals how Mr Thabo Mbeki and, therefore, his other SADC counterparts have known of the evil machinations of the Mugabe Government against its own people, how they have been urged to act and how they have not acted.

Honourable Speaker, according to this letter, from within the Zimbabwean military and security establishment itself, the plans to launch the most horrendous violence against the opposition have been revealed to Mr Mbeki. Mr Tsvangirai has accused Mbeki of a lack of neutrality, he accused him of interfering in the MDC's internal matters, accused him of blocking United Nations intervention and of blocking important relevant reports... (Intervention)

HON KAURA: On a Point of Order. Honourable Speaker, we are obliged by our Rules, when we are referring to a Head of State at least to add the attachments and not to refer to him as "*Mr Mbeki*". He is His Excellency President Mbeki.

71

HON SPEAKER: In which context? I heard "Mugabe Government" and there is nothing wrong with that.

HON KAURA: *Mugabe-Government* and *Mr Thabo Mbeki*.

HON SPEAKER: No, "Mr Thabo Mbeki" is correct. There is nothing wrong with that, as long as it is "Mr Thabo Mbeki". Honourable Ulenga, continue.

<u>HON ULENGA</u>: Honourable Speaker, indeed, both the Presidents of Zimbabwe and South Africa are Their Excellencies. I just do not have to say so every time I mention their names, but I acknowledge that.

Honourable Speaker, as I was saying, Mr Tsvangirai has accused the South African President, Mr Mbeki, of a lack of neutrality, of interfering in the MDC's internal matters, he accused him of blocking United Nations intervention, of blocking important relevant reports pertaining to the Zimbabwean issue and accused him of breaching important principles of mediation.

Honourable Speaker, the Namibian Parliament and, indeed, the Government cannot ignore the position taken by the MDC and by Mr Tsvangirai. Namibians are part and parcel of the MDC and of the southern African region and, indeed, of Africa. As such Namibians cannot escape the fundamental question and its ramifications: Where does this political violence and lawlessness take Zimbabwe; what does it do to the rights of all Zimbabweans to live in their country in peace and freedom, safe from political repression and free to elect a Government of their choice? What does it do to the freedoms that we ourselves have fought for so hard and to the freedoms that we ourselves cherish so deeply? What does this imply for the freedoms in Africa, for democracy

MOTION ON ZIMBABWE HON T GIRIRAB

in Africa and for economic and social progress in our Region?

Honourable Speaker, the freedom of the people of Zimbabwe is finally, ultimately tied up to our own. Our own political achievements in terms of freedom, democracy and peace are being threatened by what is happening today in Zimbabwe. Our Government has become an accomplice in the trampling of the political rights of a neighbouring sister country. Our silence will mean acquiescence to tyranny, political oppression and murder of innocent Zimbabweans unless we speak out.

Honourable Speaker, for that reason, we must speak out and condemn this violence and the political repression of the people of Zimbabwe in the clearest and most categorical, of languages. In the light of the MDC leader's letter to President Thabo Mbeki of South Africa, we must recommend to our own national leader and President, President Pohamba to withdraw Namibia's endorsement of Mbeki as the SADC mediator in Zimbabwe. We must speak in the sternest of tones to Mr Mugabe, saying namely that the Namibian National Assembly does not approve of his rubbishing of that neighbouring country and of that sister people. Namibia must demand the optimum atmosphere for free and fair elections in Zimbabwe. Namibia must reject any other arrangement or any other result. This, Honourable Speaker, is the century of freedom for the people. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member for his statement. Any further discussion? Honourable Gurirab.

HON T GURIRAB: Honourable Speaker, I rise in support of the Motion and I do so because of two reasons:

Firstly because our country is a product of international solidarity. Parliaments across the world rose in their Parliaments to speak in defence

MOTION ON ZIMBABWE HON T GURIRAB

of our dignity and our freedom.

Secondly, Honourable Speaker, I do so because I expect, and rightfully, that when our country descends into similar chaos as is happening in Zimbabwe, that we would expect parliamentarians right across the world also to stand up in their Parliaments and speak in defence of our dignity and defence of our rights.

Let me paraphrase a German clergyman during the dark hours of Marxism in that country. When those who were targeted were being removed, he says he kept quiet because he was not a communist. He also kept quiet when his neighbours were being targeted because he was not his neighbour. When finally they came for him, because he has failed to speak, he thought speaking on the rights of others or by speaking on fundamental rights we are actually speaking for ourselves, but when we fail to do that for others, when it is our turn there will be nobody to speak for us.

Honourable Speaker, next week I will be in Zimbabwe as part of a group of Africans helping Zimbabweans to do the right thing. To me it is a supreme act of solidarity that we must stand with Zimbabweans of all shades as their country descends into chaos, that we stand by them and assist them to do the right thing.

I think we are bound by the values which we ourselves stand for to support this important Motion and to say to the people of Zimbabwe that they can trust and rely on us in their hour of need. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member for his contribution.

<u>HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS</u>: Comrade Speaker, may I Move that the Debate be adjourned until Thursday?

MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON VILJOEN

HON SPEAKER: The Debate on this Motion stands adjourned until Thursday. Any objection? None. Agreed to. The fourth Notice of Motion is the one of Honourable Member Viljoen. Does the Honourable Member Move the Motion? Who seconds the Motion? Any objection? Agreed to. The Honourable Member has the Floor.

HON VILJOEN: Honourable Speaker, my previous Motion dealt with accountability of teachers and principals of schools. I then identified a problem, a problem of accountability in Namibia.

Last year the Standing Committee on Human Resources had a briefing session with the Ministry of Works, Transport and Communication. The purpose of that meeting was prompted by a tour of the mentioned committee last year and the management of the Minister of Works and Transport was invited to shed light on certain problems which were identified. I decided to bring this Motion to Parliament because there is a perception amongst people in Namibia that Government is responsible for the whole parcel – Government must plan, provide, build, renovate and maintain and the users of Government buildings, be it Government houses, flats or official buildings and the premises on which the properties are built have absolutely no responsibility to maintain.

Last year much was said on the hospital in Otjiwarongo and I am not going to repeat it, but what was amazing about that visit is that the Accounting Officer accompanying us, when we pointed out that the premises and the buildings are dirty, agreed, but did not realise that his poor management is the cause of the problem. He was supposed to be the big brother.

A month ago I visited Daan Viljoen near Windhoek, and it is obvious that nobody is accountable. The lawn where day visitors used to camp has vanished. It was cared for long before Independence. One of the drains flooded the area and taps were running, while one of the toilets was blocked. I reported it to the office, but I am sure that the status quo is still

10 June 2008 MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON VILJOEN

the same. I experienced the same at the camping site in Halali.

When I rent my house to somebody I have to draw up a contract that I, the owner, am responsible for the outside of the building, I must renovate and keep it clean and the tenant is responsible for the inside of the house.

I wish to refer to schools and hostels. The Honourable Ulenga asked a question last year on a certain hostel which is in a state of dilapidation, but so is most of the schools and most of the hostels. The Ministry of Works reported that they were being called out and in some cases travelled hundreds of kilometres to attend to a blocked zinc or a blocked sewerage pipe.

Namibia does not have the money to start renovating all Government properties, but on the other hand, something must be done because the time will come that we will have to rebuild schools and hostels because it will be cheaper to build than to renovate. (Intervention)

HON SPEAKER: The House will rise for refreshments.

HOUSE ADJOURNED AT 15:40 HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:15 PURSUANT TO ADJOURNMENT

HON VILJOEN: I wish to come up with a solution to the problem. Every school and hostel in this country has a development fund. Part of it should be used to replace broken windows and door locks or to fix other small problems. A handyman should be appointed and paid to replace the door locks and to attend to blocked zincs and washbasins.

When you drive through the cities and towns in Namibia it is easy to identify Government houses. The occupants do nothing to maintain the

buildings and premises. Gardens are not cared for and they are untidy and the house of the neighbour depreciates.

Now is the time to act. My guidelines for schools and hostels are that they make the principal and superintendent of the hostel accountable for the buildings under their control. Give somebody the authority to see that the principal and the superintendent adhere to the stipulations. They must submit reports at the end of each term to indicate what renovations were done internally. Make an allocation of say, N\$5,000 per year to every school and hostel for renovations and smaller reparations and keep proper control of the money spent. Pay one of the institutional workers to do the work of a handyman in cooperation with the principal and superintendent.

Honourable Speaker, I think that my Motion is an appeal to the Government to do something. I do not have the authority, the Opposition Parties in this House do not have the authority, the Ruling Party has the authority to implement a simple, workable plan to make Government buildings respectable places. We must stop talking year after year on the same Motions. As long as we talk we will do nothing.

One of the biggest problems in Namibia on all levels is a total lack of discipline in the workplace, a total lack of supervision and a total lack of desire to do things in an excellent manner.

Honourable Speaker, the Committee on Human Resources tabled their Report on this matter a month or two ago, but I am convinced that absolutely nothing was done so far to the recommendations of the Committee. I am convinced that the success of any Ruling Party any place in the world is not in their election manifesto, which is only a document, but the success is how the practical matters on the ground are dealt with and I am convinced that the success or failure to deal with the mentioned problems will play a very important role in the coming election. Any Government reaps the fruits of a *laissez-faire* policy. Let us start somewhere to stop the process of deterioration to enable us to be proud of all our Government assets. I thank you.

MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON P MUSHELENGA

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member for his motivation. Honourable Mushelenga.

HON P MUSHELENGA: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. I rise to say a few words on the Motion of Honourable Viljoen.

I was part of the Standing Committee on Human Resources' visits to the regions last year which made, amongst others, recommendations regarding the issues raised by the Honourable Member. I also raised that issue of taking care of Government buildings during last year's Budget Debate.

Honourable Viljoen started very well, but he almost spoiled the Motion by trying to bring some political jokes. This Motion is non-political. In fact, when you go around, it is not only about school buildings, it is about all Government buildings and I said here that there are those people who are renting Government houses. If you go around in a particular street in a particular suburb, it would be easy to identify that this is a Government house, looking at the way people are not taking care of these properties. A person is just concerned with cleaning the walls, the yard looks very dirty, everything is dilapidated and that is very unfortunate.

If you around in the Regions – and I mentioned this to the previous Minister – people are not doing small maintenance jobs. We visited one hospital in Kavango Region and the bulbs are not replaced because the Ministry of Works is not there. (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: May I ask the Honourable Member a question, please? You made a very important point, that if you are going down the streets you can easily recognise Government houses. For the last 18 years we have been seeing these houses, for the last eighteen years these houses have been deteriorating. How many years does the Government need for them to act, instead of talking about it, doing something about it?

10 June 2008

MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON P MUSHELENGA

HON P MUSHELENGA: I warned earlier on that this Motion should not be politicised. We are trying to address the problem here. I know you are saying the Government has taken too long because of next year's elections. Politics will come Thursday when we discuss your Motion, wait for Thursday. (Intervention)

<u>HON VILJOEN:</u> Honourable Speaker, it was not my intention to make politics of this issue, but if something good happens, everybody in Parliament says the SWAPO Party Government did it. I however asked the question, if they do their homework and see that it is their function to look at Government properties, it is not politics, it is a fact. I do not want to make politics, but this is a fact.

HON P MUSHELENGA: Honourable Speaker, I deliberately made the introduction I made because I do not want the Opposition to think they are the only ones who are concerned about the state of Government buildings. I said I have already addressed this issue previously before this Motion even came here.

I think what the Ministry of Works and Transport should do is to come up with measures which would penalise those occupying Government buildings and not taking care of them, because there are others who also need accommodation who could take better care of these properties. If you do not take care of the property properly, then you must make way for those who are prepared to take care of these properties.

With these few words, Honourable Speaker, I support the Motion. Thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank Honourable Mushelenga for his contribution. Any further discussion? Chief Ankama.

MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON DR ANKAMA

HON DR ANKAMA: Honourable Speaker, I would like to make a few remarks on the Motion by Honourable Viljoen.

Honourable Speaker, last year I was very upset when I looked at some of the Government properties, including houses, hospitals and schools. Some of the defects on the properties could probably be done locally or in-house and I find it very, very strange why people treat Government properties like that.

There was a time when we went to certain schools, we found basins broken and water was running for quite some time, I understand for about six months. By that time I was leading the delegation and I stopped the delegation and I said, "we cannot look at this." We went to the Regional Office, we found the manager who is supposed to manage the Region sitting outside with the cleaners. He did know who we were, I summoned him and then we went with our five, six cars back to those schools. I told him that I wanted a Report by the next Monday when I go back to my office.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: May I ask my comrade a question? Comrade Chief, you say you were really upset when you found Government houses in a dilapidated condition. What is your comment on the lights here in Parliament? What is your comment?

HON DR ANKAMA: Comrade Deputy Minister, I would not comment at the moment, but basically what happens is that it is upsetting to see Government properties vandalised.

What I am trying to say here is that I did not have power *per se*, I was just somebody leading a committee, but when we went to those two places with these guys who apparently signed a contract to do the work while the

<u>10 June 2008</u>

MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON KAAPANDA

water has been running for 6 months, I eventually threatened them that I want to see this being repaired within a day and by Monday I want to see a fax, reporting that this work has been completed. In actual fact, I did not really have any power but this work was done that very Friday.

What I am saying is that we should really work hard and ... (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: May I ask a question, please? Honourable Chief, you are making the point that these things can be done. The problem is that there is nobody who says, "go and do it" as you have done. Do you not think that perhaps it is better to have you as the Minister of Works?

HON DR ANKAMA: Do not create some kind of political sabotage here, we are talking facts. What we are saying is that Regional Offices responsible for the Government properties should really do their work and there should be serious supervision to check whether indeed these guys are doing their work as they are supposed to do.

Overall I am in support of the Motion if it does not bring in any political issues. (Intervention)

HON SPEAKER: Minister Kaapanda.

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY: Thank you very much, Comrade Speaker. The issue under discussion is a very important issue and all of us are very much concerned about the state of Government properties.

10 June 2008 MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON ULENGA

However, Comrade Speaker, measures have been taken to address the improvement of the condition of Government properties. Among other things, a new tenant agreement has been introduced that stipulates the duties and responsibilities of every Government tenant, failing which the Ministry of Works reserves the right to evict the tenant. This tenant agreement also includes the new revised rent agreement of Government properties that commensurate with the value of the property, likewise the income of that particular tenant. Furthermore, the tenant agreement prohibits sub-letting of Government properties.

The Ministry has been involved in the renovation of Government properties for which this new tenant agreement will be issued to the tenants and then extended to all those tenants occupying Government houses.

In addition, Cabinet approved a submission from the Ministry of Works to introduce maintenance units in every Government institution that will undertake spot checks on a daily basis on maintenance activities and I think through those measures we will see improvement, although it may be slow. These measures however indicate the commitment and seriousness the Ministry attaches to the improvement of Government properties in terms of maintenance. Thank you, Comrade Speaker.

Hanamahla IIIanaa

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Ulenga.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Speaker, I also stand up to support and endorse this Motion by Honourable Viljoen and I have a few comments to make, first of all to allay the fears of those Colleagues, especially on the Ruling Party side, who seem to be worried that this Motion may be politicised.

In the first place, I do not think there is a single Member of Parliament in this House who is not a politician. If there are any, they can stand up so

10 June 2008 MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON ULENGA

that we can see them. Those Members of Parliament who are not politicians should refrain from speaking politics. Let the politicians do politics.

However, Honourable Speaker, in supporting this Motion I will be the first to say the fault and the responsibility for taking care of public property should not be laid at the door of Government alone. Of course, Government has a responsibility and in that regard it is very significant that the Motion tabled by Mr Viljoen does not necessarily say what particular type of Government building. We thus have all kinds of buildings that are public property and the responsibility and accountability of the users of the buildings will depend on what kind of building it is and what kind of user we are talking about.

Definitely, if it comes to tenants, the people who rent Government houses should have the primary responsibility to look after the houses, but then certain things must be made possible for them to do so.

I understand in certain buildings those people who use these buildings are told not to replace anything, for example. If they are forbidden from replacing anything, then the rule must be very clear who will replace and by which means.

Honourable Speaker, a few years ago I visited a school in one of the rural areas of our country. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: May I ask a question? Is the Honourable Member, Ben Ulenga, President of the CoD, a politician or the representative or ambassador of MDC in Namibia?

10 June 2008

MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON ULENGA

HON ULENGA: Honourable Speaker, as I was saying before I was rudely interrupted by a Member of the House, some years ago I visited a school in the rural area of our country and talking to one of the teachers, I noticed that almost every window in every classroom was broken. I decided to raise the matter with the principal of the school... (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: May I ask the Honourable Member a question, please? If you look at the state of Government houses, do you see any difference between the state of Government houses and the state of the houses at Mixed Village at Brakwater? Do you see the difference?

HON ULENGA: Thank you very much for the question. Honourable Speaker, I must say I have always suspected that those buildings belong to the State. Now it is confirmed.

Honourable Speaker, talking about this particular school, I went to the principal and I asked him... (Intervention)

HON SPEAKER: For the Speaker's information as a citizen, what is that the two Honourable Members understand that the Speaker does not understand about these houses, the question now to Honourable Ulenga to confirm what these houses are? Just inform me as you proceed.

<u>HON ULENGA</u>: Honourable Speaker, I just confirmed my suspicions with regard to the situation at the Mixed Camp, but I take it the main issue really is the Motion by Mr Viljoen, so I would like to continue. (Intervention)

10 June 2008 MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON ULENGA

HON SPEAKER: What is the Mixed Camp?

HON ULENGA: He put a question, it is dilapidated and it looks bad. It almost looks like some of the Government houses in the use of some citizens of the country.

Honourable Speaker, this school I happened to have attended when I was younger and one day I broke a windowpane, I was playing, throwing a tennis ball and the tennis ball hit the pane, the pane broke and the principal of the school that time, an uncle of mine, was immediately on me, wrote a note on paper, gave it to me, addressed to my dad, saying "your boy has broken a windowpane at school, we will appreciate it if you can send 25 cents so that the school can replace the pane." (Intervention)

HON SPEAKER: The good old days.

HON ULENGA: Yes, the good old days. My father went to look for the 25 cents and in a week's time the pane was replaced. When I spoke to this particular principal who is principal now at this school and I asked him or her why the windows were broken, he or she said, "we have reported it at Ondangwa." They had reported at Ondangwa and they were still waiting for the response. The principal was saying that the people at the Ministry of Education are always slow to act on these issues. I asked him or her whether this was the responsibility of the Ministry of Education or the Ministry of Works. (Intervention)

HON DR ANKAMA: Honourable Speaker, may I ask Honourable Ulenga a question? Honourable Ulenga, you are using "he or she" for the principal you met. You are thus not too sure whether he was a man or a woman?

10 June 2008 MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON ULENGA

HON ULENGA: Honourable Speaker, I am just trying to keep the gender identity of the person out of the matter. The person may easily know that I am talking about them because I have consulted only a few schools on this issue.

Honourable Speaker, seriously, when I asked this person whether it was the Ministry of Education or the Ministry of Works, then this person was not sure whether they reported the matter to the right ministry. That is the kind of situation that you find with many of the users of Government buildings, that sometimes they do not even report the issues to the right ministry.

When I asked a similar question in this House a few months ago, I realised that I was also led up the wrong path, because regarding the school in Otjinene which I visited and where I found almost every single object broken or dilapidated, the people there said they had reported the matter to the Ministry of Education. I came to this House and I raised the matter with the Minister and the Minister said it was not their responsibility; it was the responsibility of the Ministry of Works. That is the situation with regard to many of the users of Government buildings. First of all, they do not take responsibility, they have the attitude of saying it is a Government building, so *it is Government property, I will not look after it, the Government must look after it themselves*. Then the very same people are not so sure which particular section of Government should have the responsibility of looking after these places.

However, Honourable Speaker, I think there are certain specific buildings of Government that should be the sole responsibility of Government and Government officials to look after, especially buildings such as hospitals, prisons, police stations. If there is nobody somewhere in Government who makes sure that the necessary equipment and tools are provided to look after these buildings, then you cannot expect the ordinary users, like police officers and so on, to get this stuff and go and clean and maintain generally the buildings.

10 June 2008 MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON NUJOMA

I remember in this regard when we visited a police station in the Karas Region two years ago and we raised a similar matter with the officer in charge. He related his frustration with his head office in Windhoek, how they always sent a list of articles needed to be sent to them so that they can be used in the maintenance of the buildings and how they are being told time and time again that the Budget of the previous year did not make provision for the purchase of such materials.

Honourable Speaker, I think sometimes the users who are members of the public can be held responsible, provided that Government and us in this House bring our side by passing the necessary Budget and amounts which would be used to make sure that these Government buildings are properly maintained.

Honourable Speaker, with those few remarks, and emphasising that politics is our business and that if SWAPO is feeling the heat, they should just get out of the kitchen, I support the Motion.

HON SPEAKER: I thank Honourable Ulenga. Honourable Nujoma.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Thank you, Honourable Speaker, I also rise to make a contribution to the Motion introduced by Honourable Viljoen and I support the Motion.

The point I wanted to raise is that we have not really internalised the issue of ownership of these Government buildings, hospitals, police stations etcetera. We have not really internalised that these things belong to us. The buildings and infrastructure, everything is ours, all of us including Honourable Tjihuiko. The problem is that after Independence and Tjihuiko was correct, he stated here that eighteen years and SWAPO has done nothing... (Intervention)

HON ULENGA: On a Point of Order. Honourable Speaker, may I ask the Honourable Nujoma a question? Honourable Speaker, does the Honourable Nujoma, by saying that he has not yet internalised this important issue of ownership, say he still thinks the public buildings in Namibia belong to the colonial Government or what?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: I was saying that these buildings belong to all of us, including you, Mr Ulenga. You have been referring to His Excellency Thabo Mbeki as "Mr", so you do not deserve the title of "Honourable". I will now call you "Mr Ulenga".

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Deputy Minister, I gave guidance on that, "Mr" is an honourable title. Leaving it out is different. To say Mr Thabo Mbeki, there is nothing wrong with that. To say "Thabo Mbeki" is wrong in this House. Whatever the intention might be of a speaker to refer to a Head of State as "Mr", there is nothing wrong.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Mr Ulenga, saying, that this Government infrastructure belongs to all of us including me and you and all our children, the future generations and so on. The problem is that after Independence there was a perception created, and the Opposition is guilty and they have contributed to that understanding that this is now SWAPO properties, they must be sabotaged, they must be destroyed. Why were these things not happening before Independence? That is the question. Yes, because SWAPO respected the buildings, that these were the infrastructure of this whole country, we never encouraged our supporters... (Interventions)

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Speaker, may I ask the Honourable Deputy Minister a question, please? The Honourable Deputy Minister is making a very serious statement, that there is an intentional sabotage of Government properties. If the Honourable Deputy Minister is aware of that and the Minister, then he must have information that would have helped to arrest those who are deliberately misusing Government properties. As a Minister, when are you going to provide that information to the police so that action can be taken to bring those people to book?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: That is why I started by saying we have to take ownership of these buildings, they are ours. We are not coming from the moon, I was out of this country for a few years and I came back. Honourable Tjihuiko, you and me were at Augustineum, you know how that school was. Not a single window was broken. We were at so many other schools... (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Would you be so kind as to accept a question? Honourable Deputy Minister, Honourable Tjihuiko reminds us almost on a daily basis here that he was a member of the management of the Ministry of Trade and Industry and that in fact, he was one of the founding staff members of that Ministry. Do you not think the Honourable Member can demonstrate his own responsibility by indicating to this Parliament how the directorate of which he was a deputy director has managed better the houses that we allocated to that Ministry during the period of many years that he has been deputy director at the Ministry of Trade and Industry? Do you not think he can do better by just showing us that he was able to do better than the rest of us?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Exactly. We would be happy if he could demonstrate that, but he is not coming up with any

solution. He is saying the Government has done nothing for the past 18 years, which is not true and he knows that very well.

What I am trying to stress is that the SWAPO Party Government and the Opposition should work together so that we educate our supporters, sympathisers, that these Government institutions are ours, they belong to us and they are sacrosanct, they are so important.

There is a tendency in certain areas, and that was why I was trying to articulate my point... (Intervention)

HON ULENGA: Honourable Speaker, on a Point of Order. I would not want the Member to sit down without having withdrawn that specific statement that he made, namely that I am not worth being called an Honourable Member. That is just out, I am an Honourable Member and whatever his opinion is, he must withdraw it.

HON SPEAKER: I will not necessarily ask the Honourable Member to withdraw. Regardless of what I said, each matter has its own context in this House. By mutual agreement through all the Parties represented here and by consensus of the Members of the House we have agreed that we must refer to one another as Honourable Members, regardless of what the differences are. That applies here in this House.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Comrade Speaker, I agree with you but the issue is that if you want to be recognised, recognise others as well. President Thabo Mbeki has been elected by the people of South Africa to lead them through a process of free and fair democratic elections and we should respect him as such. He is an elected leader of the South African people and he is a respected leader of Africa, he is a

10 June 2008 MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON NUJOMA

respected leader of SADC. You cannot come here and call him "Mr". That is the respect we want. (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: On a Point of Order. Honourable Speaker, with due respect, we should follow the parliamentary procedures and rules. These proceedings are being filmed and recorded, the kids will see these things and the Honourable Deputy Minister should withdraw unconditionally the statement that he has made.

HON SPEAKER: I am not going to ask him to withdraw.

toilet pots. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. What I wanted to say is that we need to internalise this important issue of ownership, that all these institutions, Government buildings are ours. We have to educate our children. The Opposition and the SWAPO Party Government have a responsibility to educate our children, starting from home. That is why I am saying that there is that perception that this is a SWAPO Party Government, it is their things, we have the right to destroy the

HON VENAANI: Honourable Speaker, on a Point of Information. Honourable Deputy Minister, I vividly remember visiting a Western African country in the early nineties and boasting about Namibia's Independence and the progress and looking at conditions and I was really not exposed to African situations deeply. This old gentleman said to me: "Young man, listen here, you just wait, you are black like me, your country will be like ours very soon, don't worry, so stop complaining."

10 June 2008 MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON NUJOMA

The problem does not only lie with Government properties. Take my farm and yours, we can easily identify farms that belong to us. Is it a cultural thing? Is it a cultural weakness? Yes, there is an inherent problem that we need to address. (Interjection). Then we should address those issues and do not blame the Opposition for creating some of these problems while there are some inherent problems that we need to address.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Honourable Venaani, this is not an issue of culture, it is not a cultural problem. (Interjection). No, it is not. You have a tendency of looking down upon yourself, "because I am black I must destroy, I must break windows." That is what you are saying That is the point we want to stress here, that that is probably what you tell your people. It is not a cultural problem.

When I was studying in the UK, graffiti was a problem. They are writing everywhere on the walls, in the toilets, everywhere. Is it a cultural problem? That is a European country, but because they have resources they have managed to resolve that problem. They installed surveillance cameras in the buses, in toilets and all these *botsotsos* were apprehended. It is just a question of resources.

I can tell you that if we had the resources, we could also have managed to apprehend all these students who are throwing stones. That is therefore not a cultural problem. The problem is that we have to teach our people to accept that all these things belong to all of us. We are all major shareholders in these buildings, they belong to us, they belong to our future generations and that is why it is important that we preserve these buildings.

On that note I support the Motion and I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Deputy Minister. Honourable Amweelo.

<u>10 June 2008</u>

MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON DR AMWEELO

HON DR AMWEELO: Thank you very much, Comrade Speaker. I am rising to say something on this Motion and I would like to talk about the responsibility.

I was also a member of that committee Honourable Viljoen and Honourable Ankama talked about. We went to the Regions to look at the buildings and other infrastructure, but what I have observed is that some people do not understand when it comes to the renovation and maintenance. The Ministry of Works is responsible for minor renovations and maintenance, but the line Ministry is responsible for major renovations and maintenance. If it is a school, it should be the Ministry of Education; if it is a clinic, it should be the Ministry of Health. The funds for major renovations should be under the line Ministry.

The Ministry of Works prepares contract documentation, but they do not have funds for major renovations, but people are not aware of this information.

Comrade Nujoma said that it is the responsibility of everybody, all of us. It is our infrastructure and I agree with him that our people need to be educated, starting from home.

I was in Okonguati and that school is a new, but we went there we saw that the walls were cracked. Sometimes the problem is construction materials, because if you buy bricks from any unregistered factory, the bricks are not tested. Sometimes the people buy bricks from those unregistered factories which are not tested because bricks need to be tested in a laboratory to make sure that they comply to the standards. If not, you will build today and tomorrow you will see cracks.

Therefore, the Ministries responsible should take care of major renovations and the Ministry concerned must make sure that the funds are available, not the Ministry of Works. The Ministry of Works only prepares the tenders and contracts for major renovations, but will take care of minor renovations. Sometimes we do not have money, the money lies with the line Ministries.

10 June 2008 MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON NAMBAHU

The other issue that I would like to share with the Member is with regard to the assignment. There was a Cabinet decision that all Government houses be sold, but the decision further said that not all Government houses must be sold, some must be assigned to the Ministry concerned. Sometimes we found that when the house was assigned to the Ministry concerned it has already been vandalised. Therefore, sometimes it is not the responsibility of the Ministry of Works, we have already assigned that building to the Ministry concerned and they should take care that the building is not vandalised.

With this information, I would only like to say that we should take care and education should start from the home and everybody should be involved. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank you. Honourable Nambahu.

HON NAMBAHU: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. I also want to add my voice to the Motion, but I want to bring in a different dimension.

Time and again we fought about these properties, they are identifiable, they stand out because of their dilapidated nature and the lack of care and when Budget time comes we talk about it, it is business as usual. I however think maybe something is lacking which we should also look at and it is actually what the former Minister of Works and Transport has alluded to.

There are measures in place regulating the tenants, but how many of us are aware of the obligations that the tenants have? I think we should start there.

Another thing is that this is just one of the various Government properties, but we seem to be attaching more importance to only some Government properties. For example, when it comes to Government cars we are very much concerned about where they are parked? They are however equally assets with value and maybe the same public policing that is taking place as far as cars are concerned should also somehow take place as far as Government properties are concerned. There is no justification whatsoever that you can find a Government house where there is a small path that leads to the house in the middle of tall grass. What justification could there be? There are actually no consequences and most of the Civil Servants at the entry level can tell you that they were not allocated houses because these houses were already occupied. If this person is however not taking care of the property, why is it that there are no consequences for that?

The information given by Honourable Dr Amweelo that Government houses are allocated to other Ministries, an outsider will just accuse Government blankly. There are probably some Government Ministries that are taking care of the houses allocated to them and it will not be fair for us to make a blanket statement, but how do I distinguish that this one... (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Speaker, may I ask the Honourable Member a question, please? Honourable Members, is the question on the table looking at the Ministry of Works or looking at Government properties? Whether it is under the auspices of the Ministry of Works or the Ministry of Finance, the interest here is that Government buildings must be maintained. Therefore, when you address the issue, do you not think we should address the issue as Government houses or properties, irrespective of whether they are under the Ministry of Works, the Ministry of Finance, the Ministry of Trade? It is still Government buildings, so address the issue as Government buildings, irrespective of the Ministries.

HON NAMBAHU: I was trying to find the question-mark in his statement but I failed to locate it. As a result I will just proceed.

10 June 2008 MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON NAMBAHU

The distinction is actually for the purposes of apportioning responsibility. If a certain Ministry is taking care of its part of the responsibility, would it be fair for us to say it is Government property? Maybe some distinction should be made and we will be able to pinpoint who is it that is not taking care of the Government properties.

Maybe a thorough study should be done and some proper measures be put in place so that there are consequences for those who are not taking care of Government property. Then someone can come in, from an ideological point of view, saying that Government is unable to manage this, privatise it. It is simply because we are unable to come up with an adequate regime of property management. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF EDUCATION: On a Point of Information. I think we should not belabour this point, I think we recognise the fact that there is a need for us to do something about Government property and that there is a need for us to have ownership of this property. After the explanation of the former Minister of Works, Transport and Communication I want to inform the House that indeed a study has been done that Honourable Nambahu is referring to and a Cabinet decision has been made. The Ministry of Works has been given a directive to come up with what Honourable Kaapanda has just told us. Therefore, the decision has already been taken and action is being taken to renovate. I am just taking on board the suggestion that we should train our people to have ownership of this property.

Maybe the one major challenge for the new Minister of Works and Transport is to put the houses in a condition in which you could have them then being taken responsibility of. At the moment they are too much in a dilapidated condition for you to put conditions on how they should be well looked after. Maybe we need some kind of major renovations done and new tenants taken into those buildings with new responsibilities assigned to them. At the moment you cannot tell the tenants to look after these houses because the houses are in a deplorable condition already, or

10 June 2008 MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON IILONGA

the classrooms or the hostels. I think we should take this issue as a Government concern without having to say this Ministry is doing better than the other. We have a condition we have to fix and then put rules in place to make sure that it improves. That is my contribution towards this Debate.

HON NAMBAHU: Some information is coming out of this Debate and we probably only have to support the Motion. Have we not had the Motion, some of these things would probably not have been brought up and the policing aspect cannot be resuscitated in the absence of that information. I do not know whether we have to wait for that information to come over or whether we will go ahead with the Motion and commission a research or we wait for that information to come out. I only want to say that there should definitely be consequences for those who are not taking care of the property, whoever they are. That should definitely be the case. I support the Motion.

<u>HON SPEAKER</u>: I thank the Honourable Member. Honourable Iilonga.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: Comrade Speaker, I rise to make a few remarks on this important Motion of Honourable Jurie Viljoen on the responsibility and accountability with regard to Government properties.

As Comrade Nujoma said, the Government assets are our properties and we need to look after them. When you look at our staff establishments, you find one school is very big and there are only two cleaners and those aspects should be taken in consideration.

I am also happy to hear from Honourable Kaapanda and Dr Amweelo about the decentralisation of maintenance. That is an important aspect and I hope that is going to be of some assistance.

10 June 2008 MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON IILONGA

Schools have board members and there are school buildings in all thirteen Regions and therefore, we would find that people in the management or overseeing those activities of those schools are not only from the SWAPO Party. Therefore, I would ask Honourable Tjihuiko to educate his members to look after those assets as their own and they must not think it belongs to SWAPO. It is their children who are educated at those schools.

Whenever Government is renting buildings from the private sector you are lucky if they paint it, but you find that the Government spends millions on partitioning. I am referring to the Ministry of Environment which moved from the SWABOU building to where it is now. I can tell you that they spent a lot of money and the monthly rental is very high. Let Government implement its programmes just the same as the private sector. The Government is an organisation, it has that responsibility.

When I look at the conclusion of the Motion, the Mover wants the Motion to be referred to a specific parliamentary committee.

HON DR AMWEELO: May I ask my Colleague a small question? Comrade Iilonga, you are saying renting is very costly because the Government pays a lot of money. Do you think if the Government introduced the BOT – Build, Operate and Transfer – it would be better than renting?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: Comrade Speaker, I was busy with the conclusion of the Motion. This is not in line with responsibility and accountability, because the Honourable Member got this information when the Parliamentary Standing Committee visited the Regions. The Government is again going to spend money on things which you have already identified, because you were part and parcel of that Standing Committee and I really do not think we need to replicate what has already been done.

10 June 2008 MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON MOONGO

The Honourable Deputy Minister of Education has informed us that a study has already been done, so let us not again spend money on trips to the Regions.

We have to deal with the problem of dilapidated Government buildings and cars like the private sector does. If you break a window, they are not the ones who are going to replace that window, the Government has to replace it. I want to propose here that what the Government has to do is to renovate the house and put in place an agreement that, "you found it clean and you will leave it clean." Those are the few comments I wanted to make on this very important Motion.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Deputy Minister. Honourable Moongo.

<u>HON MOONGO</u>: Honourable Speaker, this is a good Motion and I intend to raise some points of concern.

During the liberation struggle, buildings such as those of the Traditional Authorities were destroyed and have been in a highly dilapidated state for seventeen years and I am pleased to hear that there was a Cabinet decision to renovate Government properties. However, I would like to know under which ministry these properties of the Traditional Authorities would fall, because it seems the Ministry of Regional and Local Government, Housing and Rural Development is not interested to either demolish these structures or renovate them.

Those structures cannot be replaced by this Namibian Government. Maybe you do not visit the Traditional Authority, but the building is bigger than this Chamber and it was well-built.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: On a Point of Information to Honourable Moongo. He

10 June 2008 MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON MOONGO

must first look at his own Uukumwe, how dirty those buildings are. (Interjections).

HON SPEAKER: As Honourable Members in the House, let us spare each other embarrassment.

HON MOONGO: For your information, Uukumwe is well-built and it is being renovated.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: I will not repeat that. Honourable Moongo mentioned Uukolongadhi and Uukwaludhi, those have already been renovated and also Okahao and even at Uukwangula where I was on Sunday. They are busy renovating. If you pass there and close your eyes, then that is unfortunate.

HON MOONGO: Mr Speaker, Uukwadludhi is a different case, but every traditional set-up has a big hall where they gather and they are wellbuilt. (Interjections). Not only in Ondangwa, also in Eenhana and everywhere.

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: On a Point of Information. Honourable Moongo, what the Colleagues behind me are saying is correct. Those halls you are talking about were renovated during my time as the Minister of Regional and Local Government and Housing. The Ndonga hall you are talking about, it is the Traditional Authority themselves who said they do not want that hall to be renovated, they want it to remain as it was bombed and in that place they have new offices. You must know that. You can go all over, all traditional buildings have been renovated and that is a fact.

MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON MOONGO

<u>HON MOONGO</u>: Thank you for the information, that set-up is a huge building and it is impossible for the Traditional Authority to renovate it. It is impossible. It should be seen as an example. The old Ndonga traditional set-up looks bad, it discredits our Government. If we demolish it we will never again have such a structure in our lifetime.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY:

Honourable Speaker, I am not asking a question, I just want to add to the information given by the Minister of Safety and Security and the Honourable Member must listen. You have been informed that the Traditional Leaders themselves, including yourself, have opted for a new building instead of maintaining the old one. Could you please revert back to your Traditional House and convince your colleagues to do something else and not to ask Government to renovate it.

<u>HON MOONGO</u>: What I am saying is that the old structure is there and it looks very bad. It gives a bad image to the Government and either we demolish it or we renovate it and if we renovate, we will never in our lifetime have such good buildings.

HON NAMBAHU: May I perhaps suggest to the Honourable Traditional Leader that he is differing from the institution to which he belongs and he could probably go and make these suggestions to the proper place and King who has opted otherwise. This is the wrong place for that suggestion.

HON SPEAKER: The Honourable Member is in this House not because of his a traditional position, but as an Honourable Member.

HON MOONGO: I am a Member of Parliament and I have a right to say what I am saying. All the Ministries are washing their hand, the Ministry of Justice does not want to build community courts, the Traditional

10 June 2008 MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON MOONGO

Leaders are still under trees and everybody is just washing their hands and ignoring their responsibilities. Who is going to build the community courts and when will the traditional offices be built? I am happy that the Ministry of Local Government has built offices for the councillors, but when will the Traditional Authority offices be built countrywide? Nobody is serious with their duties and this is disturbing not only peace but the whole set-up. We cannot sit under trees our whole lifetime while you are in offices. You think you are not touched, but you are touched because you were born from there. Do you not feel ashamed when you see your leaders under trees? Should they be under trees while you are in comfortable offices? (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING: On a Point of Information. I think the statement by the Honourable Moongo that the Traditional Leaders are sitting under trees and do not have offices is improper. We are aware that there are buildings and the chiefs have offices in those structures where they can operate from.

HON SPEAKER: It is an obvious case of politicking, but we are in Parliament.

HON MOONGO: I take note of his concern. When is the Government going to initiate kindergartens? They have been under trees all these years. The parents have been trying to get a few bricks together to build small structures.

HON SPEAKER: That is irrelevant to the Motion, Honourable Member.

<u>HON MOONGO</u>: It is on buildings. The kindergartens under trees are no more in good shape.

MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON IIPINGE

HON SPEAKER: I thought I would give the Floor to the Minister, but Honourable Iipinge insists to take the Floor.

<u>HON IIPINGE</u>: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. I rise to support this very important Motion on responsibilities and accountabilities on the use and maintenance of Government properties.

I assumed from the discussion that there are two types of responsibilities, one on the part of the tenant and one on the part of the landlord. I do not want to pre-empt my Colleague's report, but I think it is very important to stand up and say what I would want to say on this one.

I support very much the Honourable Members who have proposed public education of all citizens – not only children but all citizens of this country – to know that the Government is not something that you touch, the Government is me and you and these properties belong to all of us.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable lipinge, what was that?

HON IIPINGE: The SWAPO Government should suffer. (Intervention)

HON VENAANI: Honourable Speaker, the Honourable Member has a right to tell the truth if she so decides, but I think what she has just said is very, highly unparliamentary. As a mother I ask her to withdraw in the interest of our children. I cannot translate what she said, but being the person that she is, an elder, a mother, she must withdraw. I am not contesting whether what she said is always said, but all I am saying is that what she said is unparliamentary.

HON SPEAKER: Unfortunately the Speaker did not get the exact meaning of what the Honourable Member said. (Interjections). Honourable Members, let us cool down a bit. In order for the Speaker to

10 June 2008 MOTION ON GOVERNMENT PROPERTIES HON IIPINGE

rule one way or the other, the Speaker needs to know what exactly it is the Honourable Member has said that might be objectionable to Honourable Venaani and in the absence of that, I cannot do that.

HON VENAANI: Honourable Speaker, my culture would not allow me to translate, but literally the word is "s-h-i-t", which is unparliamentary.

<u>HON SPEAKER</u>: I want someone to help the Speaker to be able to rule.

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: I want to propose that the Secretary, who understands well what it means, to just whisper in the ears of the Speaker so that the Speaker understands. It is unparliamentary, he can whisper in the ear of the Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: I have read between the lines of what the Minister has said and I would, therefore, advise the Honourable Member to withdraw those words.

<u>HON IIPINGE</u>: Honourable Speaker, I withdraw but I simply said what is said in the location, so I withdraw. However the point I am trying to make is that the Government belongs to all of us and all of us should be responsible to educate our people not to vandalise the properties that belong to all of us.

Having said so, it is not a SWAPO Government *per se* because all of us are Namibians, we are all citizens and the properties belong to us. Today it is SWAPO ruling, tomorrow it is another person but the same house will belong to that Government.

Having said that, I support the Motion.

10 June 2008

<u>HON SPEAKER:</u> The House stands adjourned under rule 10 until tomorrow afternoon, 14:30.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:46 UNTIL 2008.06.11 AT 14:30

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY ASSEMBLY CHAMBER 11 JUNE 2008 WINDHOEK

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

HON SPEAKER: Any Petitions? Any Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Honourable Kaiyamo.

TABLING: REPORTS OF STANDING COMMITTEES

HON KAIYAMO: Honourable Speaker, I lay upon the Table, Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the 10th Annual Conference of Association of Public Accounts Committees held in Polokwane, South Africa on 8-9 October 2007, for consideration.

I further lay upon the Table, the Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the review of the Report of the Auditor-General on the accounts of the Namibian Development Corporation for the Financial Year 2005/2006.

I furthermore lay upon the Table, Report of the Standing Committee on Human Resources on the outreach to Oshana, Ohangwena, Oshikoto, Erongo for note taking.

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Member table the Reports? Any further Reports and Papers? Minister Kawana.

TABLING: ANNUAL REPORT OF THE NATIONAL PLANNING COMMISSION

TABLING OF REPORTS HON DR KAWANA / HON MBUMBA

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS: Honourable Speaker, I lay upon the Table, Annual Report 2006-2007 of the National Planning Commission.

TABLING: REPORT OF THE NAMIBIAN LIBRARY AND INFORMATION COUNCIL

HON MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Honourable Speaker, I lay upon the Table, the Report of the Namibian Library and Information Council on its regional visits between 2002 and 2006 on the Status of Libraries in Namibia. I so move.

HON SPEAKER: Please table the Report. Any Notice of Questions?

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS

QUESTION 62:

<u>HON KAURA</u>: Honourable Speaker, I give Notice that on Thursday, 19 June 2008, I shall ask the Honourable Minister of Health and Social Services, Honourable Dr Kamwi, the following:

- 1. What is the patient-doctor ratio in Namibia?
- 2. The area of Okakarara, Okamatapati and Okondjatu has a population between 25,000 and 30,000 and served by only one doctor. In the morning at the Okakarara Hospital he does the rounds of the patients and only after lunch does he attend to outpatients. Is that situation normal or is an improvement imperative?

11 June 2008 NOTICE OF MOTIONS HON MUTORWA / HON H ANGULA / HON KAURA

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Member table the Question? Any further Notice of Questions? Any Notice of Motions? Minister Mutorwa.

NOTICE OF MOTIONS

HON MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY:

Comrade Speaker, Sir, I give Notice that on Tuesday, 24 June 2008, I shall Move –

That leave be given to introduce a Bill to provide for the preventing, monitoring, controlling and eradication of plant pests, to facilitate the movement of plants, plant products and other regulated articles within and into or out of Namibia; to provide for the certification of the phytosanitary standards of plants, plant products exported from Namibia; and to provide for incidental matters.

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Honourable Speaker, I give Notice that on Wednesday, 18th of June 2008, I shall Move-

That leave be given to introduce a Bill to amend the Road Traffic and Transport Act, 1999; to provide that certain appointments are not invalid due to the failure to issue a certificate of appointment; to further regulate the renewal procedure of and circumstances for the replacement of driving licences; and for matters incidental thereto.

HON SPEAKER: Will the Minister table the Motion? Honourable Kaura.

<u>HON KAURA</u>: Honourable Speaker, I give Notice that on Wednesday, 18 June 2008, I shall Move –

NOMINATION OF MEMBERS HON DR T-B GURIRAB

That this Assembly deliberates the removal of the Windhoek landmark, the Reiterdenkmal or the equestrian monument, with a view of leaving it in place and to find another suitable spot for the Independence Memorial Museum, for example the spot where the Old Location Hospital was located. I so Move.

NOMINATION OF MEMBERS TO STANDING COMMITTEES

HON SPEAKER: Any Ministerial Statements? I have been informed by the SWAPO Party that the following Members will serve on the Standing Committees:

- Honourable Juliette Kavetuna to serve on the Committees on Human Resources, Social and Community Development and Legal and Constitutional Affairs;
- Honourable Anna Beyer to serve on the Committee on Human Resources, Social and Community Development and Public Accounts;
- Honourable Eunice Iipinge to serve on the Committee on Economics, Natural Resources and Public Administration.

I now, in terms of Rule 19 of our Standing Rules and Orders, officially announce Honourable Kavari, Honourable Kavetuna, Honourable Beyer and Honourable Iipinge as members of the respective committees with immediate effect.

ANNOUNCEMENT ON QUESTION PAPER

HON SPEAKER: Second Announcement: I would like to draw your attention to the green Question Paper. I have actually not been educated as to why I am supposed to do this. From now on, a table of contents will

APPOINTMENT OF AUDITOR-GENERAL RT HON N ANGULA

appear on the front page of the Question Paper for ease of reference. The table of contents will provide the name of Ministers to whom questions have been put and the questions and numbers.

The first Notice of Motion is the one by the Right Honourable Prime Minister. Does the Right Honourable Prime Minister Move the Motion? Who seconds? Any objection? Agreed to.

APPOINTMENT OF AUDITOR-GENERAL

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Thank you, Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members. Mr Junius Etuna Kandjeke was appointed as Auditor-General by His Excellency the President in terms of Article 127(1) of the Constitution, which stipulates that: "There shall be an Auditor-General appointed by the President on the recommendation of the Public Service Commission and with the approval of the National Assembly."

His term has now ended. During his term, he conducted his assignment with dedication and professionalism. In addition, Mr Kandjeke and his staff were given all the support and cooperation by the various accounting officers of the Offices, Ministries and Agencies of Government in the conduct of their work. Mr Kandjeke represented Namibia as first Chairperson of the Africa Organisation of Supreme Audit Institutions and participated in the audit of the SADC Secretariat and supported the establishment of SADC Organisation of Public Accounts Committees.

Acknowledging the suitability and professionalism of Mr Kandjeke, His Excellency the President has decided to reappoint Mr Kandjeke as Auditor-General for another five-year term. The Public Service Commission too recommended his appointment.

Therefore, in terms of the provisions of Article 127(1) of the Constitution, I humbly request this august House to approve the appointment of Mr

11 June 2008 APPOINTMENT OF AUDITOR-GENERAL HON VENAANI

Kandjeke today as Auditor-General for another five years. Thank you for your understanding and support.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Prime Minister. Any further discussion?

HON VENAANI: Honourable Speaker, I rise to support the reappointment of Mr Kandjeke as Auditor-General as per Article 127(1) of our Constitution. It is rightly true that Mr Kandjeke came as a very serious underdog to this position, we had a lot of reservations and so forth, but overall the Office of the Auditor-General and its reports have seen a significant improvement.

Many of us who are engaged with the Auditor-General in the Public Accounts Committee have seen many improvements and many unaccounted agencies are now coming up to account. For now, I am going to approve his reappointment with the call to further improve on the many local authorities that are not up to date with their books. However, he carries the confidence of the Public Accounts Committee and many of us have seen an improvement in his office. With these few remarks, I personally support his reappointment.

<u>HON SPEAKER</u>: I thank the Honourable Member. Honourable Tjihuiko.

HON TJIHUIKO: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. I rise to support the reappointment of the Auditor-General. I think he has proven that he is capable of doing the job and as Honourable Venaani has just said, many improvements are visible.

I only wanted to make a passionate appeal to those who are responsible that once a recommendation has been made by the Auditor-General for the improvement of a specific institution, it should be taken seriously, because

11 June 2008 APPOINTMENT OF AUDITOR-GENERAL HON T GURIRAB

the appointment of the Auditor-General is constitutional and therefore, he is carrying out a constitutional obligation. It is very important for us as lawmakers, it is very important for the various Government Ministries and institutions to take his recommendations seriously and to try and implement and improve on what has been recommended.

With those few remarks, I support the reappointment.

<u>HON SPEAKER:</u> I thank the Honourable Member. Honourable Gurirab.

HON T GURIRAB: Honourable Speaker, Honourable Tjihuiko has stolen my speaking notes, but I am rising to support the Motion on the reappointment of Mr Kandjeke. We worked closely with Mr Kandjeke

through the Committee responsible for oversight on Public Accounts and indeed, as Colleagues who have spoken before me have said, he has proven his worth.

I was going to say two things: One, what Honourable Tjihuiko has just said, that there are two parties to this.

One is that the Office of the Auditor-General does the audit and there is an equal responsibility on the side of the audited agencies, that once the Reports are tabled here and regularly and routinely approved, that the responsibility is then on the side of the agencies to implement the Reports that are approved in this august Chamber.

Perhaps the time has come that we need to carry out an audit on the audits of the Auditor-General to see to what extent the Reports of the Auditor-General are implemented to improve the reporting on Government finance.

Lastly, Honourable Speaker, Article 127(1)(ii) which the Right Honourable Prime Minister has made reference to in the Constitution also makes reference to an Act of Parliament that needs to be passed by this

11 June 2008 APPOINTMENT OF AUDITOR-GENERAL HON DR ANKAMA

Honourable Chamber. I have been asking for it as long as I have been in this Chamber and I again take this opportunity to say that the time has come that Government tables also an Act to regulate the functions of the Office of the Auditor-General.

With those few remarks, Honourable Speaker, we support the reappointment of the Auditor-General.

<u>HON SPEAKER:</u> I thank the Honourable Member. Honourable Ankama.

HON DR ANKAMA: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members. On behalf of the Chairperson of the Public Accounts Committee, who is not present, and indeed on my own behalf as Deputy Chair of the Public Accounts Committee, I would like to state the following regarding the appointment of Mr Junius Etuna Kandjeke, Auditor-General of the Republic of Namibia:

The person of Mr Kandjeke is characterised by academic integrity and ethics. He is a sound professional person in his dealings and has good management attributes. The Public Accounts Committee has worked closely with Mr Kandjeke, almost at every Public Accounts Committee meeting and we have seen the professionalism in him and his Office in general.

A lot of the activities that the Public Accounts Committee has carried out are, indeed, a result of his sound professionalism and his Office.

We feel the reappointment of Mr Kandjeke is a fulfilment of the oversight function on the financial matters of the Republic of Namibia by both the Public Accounts Committee and in collaboration with the Office of the Auditor-General.

Therefore, without any reservations, we feel it is the correct appointment and, indeed, we think that a lot of issues that are necessary to enable the

11 June 2008 APPOINTMENT OF AUDITOR-GENERAL HON DR KAWANA

function of the Office of the Auditor-General to function better need to be revisited and be updated for us to be able to oversee the financial status of the entities and Ministries that receive Government funding.

With these words, we would like to throw our weight behind the reappointment of Mr Junius Kandjeke. We support his reappointment and we thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member. Honourable Kawana.

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. As the person who tables the Budget of the Auditor-General, let me use this opportunity to support the Motion as tabled by the Right Honourable Prime Minister and indeed, let me also use this opportunity to respond to the Honourable Tsudao Gurirab in reference to Article 127 of the Namibian Constitution.

Indeed, as the Honourable Member is aware, particularly those days when he was an accounting officer like me, the functions of the Auditor-General are stipulated clearly in an Act of Parliament, called the State Finance Act of 1991 and I am very surprised that the former accounting officer is questioning this Article.

I also want to give information to the Honourable Members, that a decision was taken to separate the functions of the Auditor-General from the State Finance Act of 1991 and a new Bill will be tabled in this House which relates to the functions of the Auditor-General. Otherwise I support the Motion. Thank you very much.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Minister for his contribution. Any further discussion? Does the Right Honourable Prime Minister wish to reply?

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Thank you Comrade Speaker. Let me thank all the Honourable Members for the confidence expressed in Mr Kandjeke. I am quite sure that he is going to make sure that his office performs optimally.

Thank you, Honourable Kawana, for explaining the process which is taking place to draft a new Bill on the Office of the Auditor-General and it is also hoped, Honourable Tjihuiko, that some powers will be given in that new Bill to the Auditor-General to take to account those people who do not respond to the recommendations of the Auditor-General. In the meantime, the oversight committee should monitor who is not responding to the recommendations and take those people to task. You have that mandate from the electorate while the Bill is coming to Parliament. I thank you for your support.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Right Honourable Prime Minister for his reply. I now put the Question that the Motion be adopted. Any objection? None. Agreed to. The second Notice of Motion is the one of the Honourable Venaani. Does the Honourable Member Move the Motion? Who seconds? Objections? Agreed to. Honourable Venaani has the Floor.

MOTION ON XENOPHOBIC ATTACKS IN REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA

HON VENAANI: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. I gave Notice a week ago to motivate a Motion on the xenophobic attacks that recently manifested themselves in our neighbouring republic, South Africa, with a view to draw some lessons as a country that we can learn from what has happened there.

Honourable Speaker, let me from the onset say that in fact the entire world's citizens are immigrants from the one or the other place.

We, especially the Bantus, happen to be immigrants in this country. The difference might be the generations and the ages that it has taken. So, immigrants are all over the world and all of us came from somewhere. I am not aware whether the Right Honourable Prime Minister can claim to be a homogenous Namibian, he also comes from somewhere.

Honourable Speaker, I must confess from the onset that the introduction of this Motion created a lot of public debate out there. The newspapers wrote about it, articles were run in our daily papers, trying to analyse the situation of xenophobic attacks. However, let me start by saying that the past few weeks' events that were fed to us through the electronic media from South Africa were, at most, actions of brutality that cannot be expected by any human being, State or Nation. I shall not attempt to analyse the xenophobic attacks on our neighbouring state South Africa, but I want our Nation to learn from the lessons of those attacks.

Therefore, the Motion does not seek, nor does it intend to judge the South African people, but it does seek to raise the relevant comparisons that we as a State need to guard against and learn.

We expressed solidarity with the victims and challenged the South African community to be accommodating towards their brothers and sisters in the SADC Region, with whom they shared not long ago a common history, culture and destiny. Of course, our nationals were also affected by these horrendous crimes against humanity. It is further commendable to support the leadership of South Africa, in particular, and the Region in general, for having condemned these violent attacks on humanity.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, nearly every State in the world is confronted with some sort of xenophobic behaviour in one fashion or another and even more so for greater prosperous Nations, because of their attracting economic opportunities and inhabitants feel a certain degree of resentment towards immigrants. Therefore, Namibia is no exception by all accounts.

Honourable Speaker, we all know that every now and then we see in the electronic media of many of our African brothers that are going to Europe

through Morocco on ships, at times trying to swim across the ocean to get to the other side for a better living. The same situation is daily manifested in the Mexico-United States border where you find a lot of people who are dying in their quest for better living opportunities on the other side in the United States. Therefore, these attacks are not new at all.

African immigrants living in Spain were in 1999 subjected to three days of attacks.

In order to make these inhumane measures acceptable, the general public is bombarded daily with propaganda, alleging the country is being overrun by immigrants who are stealing the homes and jobs of Spanish people, bringing diseases and drugs into the country. We too are softly singing these songs and harbour these feelings that others are taking our jobs and opportunities.

Honourable Members, the question that comes to mind is: What is it that has driven fellow black people to burn, butcher, rape, torture, plunder and loot from fellow Africans? Is it truly because these fellow Africans, whom they now actively and without shame call "foreigners" are taking jobs from locals, that they are taking houses from foreigners, that they are responsible for the escalation in crime, that they are even accused of taking South African women? If we as national leaders do not step up and mitigate these beliefs, whether myth or reality, we might and we should accept the same revolt from our poor citizenry.

The dichotomy that inherently exists among our people is that we lack to critically address the issue of immigrants and start the politics of tokenism, talking in some and not all. For example, in South Africa it was black on black, forgetting that other foreign immigrants exist in South Africa, be it whites of European descent, Pakistanis or whoever. In Namibia, we also have these tendencies, we put our efforts more on Zimbabweans and Chinese and forget about other immigrants who live within our midst.

Xenophobic behaviour in all its manifestations is wrong and cannot be tolerated by any form of humanity. However, there are underlying issues

that we critically need to examine and address to help ourselves to avert any future similarities of such acts of brutality.

I believe, Honourable Speaker, the greatest challenge that faces our legislative process is the question of whether laws that we make and international instruments that we accede to are understood by our citizenry in general. We have signed the SADC Protocol on the Facilitation of Movement of People, but is there any understanding and acceptance by our citizenry? Of recent African leaders are talking about a union Government for all Africans. Are these proposals only understood by leadership, or is there coordination with the people of our continent? It is my fervent submission that many of the laws that we enact are not deeply entrenched in the minds of our people and efforts need to be done for grassroots to understand it.

When you talk about free movement of goods and services across the SADC Region, many of our people do not really understand why a person from another country should come and live next-door and compete with him or her. For as long as we do not make sure that our citizens understand the laws that we legislate and accede to, there will always be a vacuum in society that would leave the poor not knowing about the need for those laws.

Honourable Speaker, a clear challenge, in my opinion, is our over-simplified immigration laws that lack the capacity to account for the number of legal and illegal immigrants in this country and what their purpose is in Namibia. We can and must protect all immigrants, be it refugees or legal immigrants, as per international instruments and requirements of human rights, but we must be able to account for the souls that prefer to make this country their home country. The lack of the Ministry of Home Affairs and Immigration to justify and explain the number of Chinese nationals that are in Namibia is worrisome and a lack of accountability. Every permission granted to a person to enter our country must be measured against the availability of economic needs and compared to assistance to our infant markets.

We need a system in place that would give us a limit of how many legal immigrants would be allowed into the country per year and in what specific areas would they be needed and in which industries, rather than allowing a carte blanche where people are competing with a *kapana* business in Onesi. This creates resentment because people feel... (Interjection) I am just giving an example and I am talking about legal immigrants, whether it be South African immigrants working in banks today. We should be told why banks need those people... (Interjections)

Let me say what I want to say. It is important for us as a country to be able to measure our capacity, how many people can be allowed to be in the country and under what conditions and we must be able to account. We must be responsible to make sure that all lives are protected in this country, but protecting all lives, you must be able to account who are here and for what purpose are they here.

Honourable Speaker, currently a problem is experienced in the Epupa constituency between the nomadic Himba people and some Asian miners who are mining there. Generally, there is also a question of the general understanding of business principles.

If these people feel that those people are just taking their land and they are paying peanuts for the stones they are taking from our land, we need to be able to mitigate some of these problems to avoid them.

The dictionary says "xenophobic" is to feel foreign about any other person, but I think xenophobic is not only foreign. We are also foreign to one another in our own country. Sometimes our behaviour is also foreign to one another and sometimes we speak about it jokingly, but we are creating resentment of one another.

For example, in my village where I come from, when you ask young Herero boys of 18 years to dig a trench for us to get a water pipe, they will come and tell you, "no, go and look for Ovambos to do the job because it is so difficult." When we smile about it, you create a resentment that it is only certain people who can do these kinds of jobs and it is wrong. We say things to one another, we refer to each other as "*kwangaras*" and it

seems we are saying it jokingly to one another, but we create resentment between one another.

Even in our own lives and marriages, if you give your hand to somebody from another clan of ethnic group, you also have xenophobic behaviour. You would ask your daughter whether she is sure she wants to get married to that one. These are realities which exist amongst us.

The situation in South Africa did not start yesterday. The mere fact that you have a country that refers to a foreign as "akwerekwere" creates resentment and people fight with one another and these are some of the behaviours that we, as a country should fight against. These are some of the issues that we as a country need to fight against and try to create a society that would accept and tolerate one another.

Firstly – and it is a priority – we must develop skills capacity of all the marginalised and poor, create new jobs, roll out essential services, health and education, and bring the poor, both Namibians and non-Namibians into the mainstream of the economic and social participation.

Secondly, we must assist our neighbouring countries to solve their economic problems, so that their people no longer need to look for an escape route out of poverty. This must include the campaign to reform world trade, so that it no longer benefits the rich and powerful developed world at the expense of the poor developing countries.

The world has become a global village, no citizen of any country can only afford to be in his home country forever. We must cross-fertilise and build a new chapter of humanity, based on mutual tolerance and respect.

Honourable Speaker, with these few remarks I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member for his contribution. Honourable Angula.

MOTION ON XENOPHOBIC ATTACKS RT HON N ANGULA

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Thank you, Comrade Speaker. I would like to make a humble contribution to this very important Motion.

The Motion is addressing inter-human relations and inter-human relations are very important because our safety and security depend upon how we manage the inter-human relations.

In terms of inter-human relations, in my view, there are four levels of consciousness. The highest level is that of a global citizen, saying that I am a citizen of this world. I think I qualify for that. I was born in Namibia, grew up in Zambia, worked in New York, and came back to Namibia. I see myself as a global citizen and I want everybody else see him/herself as a global citizen, to be able to go anywhere in the world and make a contribution or live in peace.

However, it is not exactly like that. When it comes to Africa, Marcus Garvey said "Africa for Africans", and I do not want to see an African being called a foreigner in Africa. I do not want to hear that.

As Honourable Venaani said, there were great migrations caused by famines and wars and these things have been going on for some time over the centuries. However, since the Europeans brought borders to our continent, we have become nationalistic. That is the third level of consciousness.

We want to think of ourselves as Namibians, no more as Africans, forgetting that whatever progress Africa has made, that progress came about because of African solidarity. We forget that. Being the underdog in the world, if we do not work together, we will get nowhere. If we think that nationalism is something to be celebrated, we are fooling ourselves.

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS: May I ask the Right Honourable Prime Minister a question? Honourable Prime Minister, the statement that South Africa is where it is today because of African solidarity, are you aware that Africans as far as from Tanzania

121

11 June 2008

MOTION ON XENOPHOBIC ATTACKS RT HON N ANGULA

went to work at the mines there through terrible exploitation in order to develop South Africa. That is why there are people right up to Tanzania who can speak Xhosa and Zulu better than some of the South African citizens. Are you aware of that?

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Yes, I am aware that the Ngunis of eastern Zambia and the Matebele of Zimbabwe originally came from South Africa. It is just as if I worked in New York and I came back to Namibia.

Therefore, we should not forget the consequences of Tsekane. (Interjection). Kaura will go back to Cameroon. We should not forget the consequences of Tsekane, it led to people migrating to other parts of Africa and the Ngunis were settled in Zambia and the Matebele settled in western Zimbabwe and the others in Mozambique. We should not forget about that.

Africa has been for Africans all the time because of this continuous movement of people until somebody invented the word, "makwerekwere".

The Honourable Member said Africa must unite to fight against nationalism.

<u>HON KAURA</u>: May I ask the Honourable Prime Minister a question? Honourable Prime Minister, how about us Namibians who refer to South Africans as "*shimbongolos*?"?

HON SPEAKER: The House shall rise for refreshments.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:40 HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:15 PURSUANT TO ADJOURNMENT

122

MOTION ON XENOPHOBIC ATTACKS RT HON N ANGULA

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: I was just making a contribution to the Motion of Honourable Venaani on the nature and origin of xenophobia and there was a question on the Floor about "*shimbongolo*". This is not specific to South Africans, "*shimbongolo*" simply means a violent person, who is inclined towards violence. If South Africans are inclined towards violence, they might be called that, but it does not refer only to them.

I was saying that the highest level is being a global citizen, the next one is being a citizen of Africa, a Pan-Africanist and lower down is being a nationalist, a Namibian and the lowest one is being a tribalist, which is the worst one. Then you discriminate against the others.

I was saying that Kwame Nkrumah said Africa must unite. At least of Africans we should feel that we are citizens of Africa and as Africans, we know that since the 14th, 15th centuries when Africans were shipped out of Africa as slaves, the concept of solidarity became central in our interrelations.

If you go to Brazil and you find a Diaspora African there, you will feel solidarity with that person because you know that that person is displaced. I would like to see the same thing when the fellow African comes from Nigeria to Namibia. He is in Africa and as long as he has come here legally according to the existing laws, I do not see any reason why there should be discrimination. Today you chase Angolans from there and when all the Angolans have gone back to Angola, then next time, if you are a Herero, you will say the Ovambos must go. Then when the Ovambos are gone, you start looking for others. When the others are gone, you start looking for the Mbanderus. When the Mbanderus are gone, you start looking for the Ondara-Maharero, they should go, Tjitambi and that is NUDO.

This thing is dangerous, it does not take us anywhere. It will not help us to solve any problem, the hate of somebody you do not know.

MOTION ON XENOPHOBIC ATTACKS RT HON N ANGULA

In my language they say that you never know who is going to bury you. Therefore, you must help even a stranger when he comes to your village, because when you die, you might be buried by that stranger because you will never know who is going to bury you.

Since in my language many are supposed to be *maporo*, "*epongo*" is the wanderer and every mother has a responsibility to feed a stranger, because next time it is your son who is a stranger somewhere. That is what makes Africa to be Africa, that social solidarity. That is what makes us Africans, because today you feed a stranger and your own son will be fed by a stranger somewhere else in Africa or somewhere else. When we were refugees, we were fed by other people, the Russians, the Chinese, the Swedes, the Zambians and other people.

Now we turn around and perceive the Africans who have come into our neighbourhood to be enemies. For what reason? There is no justification and I am proud that at least in Namibia we sing the African National Anthem to remind our citizens that we are part of Africa; we are part of a big family called Africa.

What we should do is to work hard, because it is the propaganda related to poverty, which makes us do things which are unexplainable. That is what people exploit. Whether we call it a third force or whatever it is, it is our poverty and we think that when we harass a foreigner we will become rich. You will never become rich; you will just stay what you are, even poorer.

A South African friend told me that when they chased the Somalis in their townships and looted their shops, the Somalis have gone, their shops are looted, there are no shops. Now they are worse off. It is just like shooting yourself in the foot.

Therefore fellow Africans, let us not see our poverty in the eyes of other people, let us see poverty in our own eyes and start working hard to build our own riches. In so doing we will at least become good Africans. Let us be good Africans and accept each other. Thank you.

MOTION ON XENOPHOBIC ATTACKS HON T GURIRAB

HON SPEAKER: Good lecture. Honourable Gurirab.

HON T GURIRAB: Honourable Speaker, I rise to support this very important Motion because it would be remiss of me not to do so.

Honourable Speaker, the context in which this Motion has been tabled is the recent unfortunate and tragic developments in our neighbouring country, South Africa. However, this is an African-like problem and I heard on News 24 that yesterday more than one thousand Congolese were thrown out from our northern neighbour Angola. This is a problem that happens all the time on our continent and it is something from which we should draw lessons here in Namibia on how to treat this phenomenon. The unfortunate events which happened in South Africa is not something we can gloat about.

Honourable Speaker, xenophobia represents an irrational and unfounded fear of the other. It is true, Honourable Speaker, that the post-colonial entities which we have inherited and which we call our Nation states are but colonial constructs, cutting across communities and groups of diverse communities, grouping them together into what we accept as Namibia and other entities as countries.

This unfortunate development that has happened in South Africa is something that is not new. It happens all the time in Africa where we as Africans are involved in a process of self-annihilation. There are many of these examples but I wish to make reference only to Cote d'Ivoire as a classic example of a country being pushed to the brink of being destroyed because of our reluctance as Africans to accept each other. People have lived there for generations but all of a sudden, they are saying, "who is Namibian or who is a Zambian" Therefore, it is a question of accepting each other.

In Rwanda, Honourable Speaker, as we know, neighbours killed each other because they could not accept the other and led to our own African modern-day genocide. But in so many cases of self-destruction and self-annihilation the climate and environment for these orgies of self-

MOTION ON XENOPHOBIC ATTACKS HON T GURIRAB

destruction and communal killing are prepared by us, the leaders. How blithely do not we speak here in Namibia about foreigners who come here to take our jobs, to engage in what is said too often in this Chamber, marriages of convenience to steal our birthright from us?

Only last week in this Chamber, Honourable Speaker, a Cabinet Minister rose, referring to a whole community in the Kavango Region as foreigners. (Interjection) I am saying, one of your Colleagues stood up here last week in this Chamber and referred to a community in Kavango as foreigners. Our newspapers have lately been full of attacks on the Uukwanyama community instituted by the SWAPO Party.

In Rwanda the campaign to kill and murder started with campaigns on the radio. Here the campaign starts... (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable Gurirab, do you really have proof that SWAPO has an agenda against the Oshikwanyama-speaking Namibians? Who told you that and were you present? That is just propaganda. That is their aim to cause you to believe and this is what we are saying, we must fight against xenophobia. You already started with tribalism, because when you said SWAPO hates Kwanyamas, what have you planted in the minds of people who listen to you? You cause them to say we must defend ourselves.

HON T GURIRAB: Honourable Speaker, the Uukwanyama Traditional Authority I am sure can speak for themselves, but from my side, in Rwanda the campaign to kill and murder started with campaigns on national radio while leaders of the country kept quiet.

In our country we go on the national radio, we write articles in newspapers, we stand under trees to malign whole communities and call them foreigners. If we keep quiet as they did in the case of Rwanda, we will of course know where we are going.

MOTION ON XENOPHOBIC ATTACKS HON SHIFETA

Honourable Speaker, generally we are weak on this thing of being Namibian. It would appear that so many of us are reluctant Namibians who would rather be other things. The education on accepting others firstly must come from our own homes. I am always surprised by the kind of stuff my children comes with at home about what one says about the other and it is our children.

These are things which we say about the others at home that our children go and repeat at school on the playground and I am too often surprised by what my children tell me is being said about each other in the playground. As I said, these things come from our own homes.

Our Constitution, Honourable Speaker, sets very high standards, principles and values on respect for human dignity. If we follow these high principles, bring up our children by these precepts of our Constitution and make it part of our own political education, we shall be able to create a model country for all who live in Namibia, irrespective of whether they hail from other religions or are natives of our soil or from elsewhere. We must fight against xenophobia. We must fight against this thing of not accepting one another. I support this Motion.

<u>HON SPEAKER:</u> I thank Honourable Gurirab for his contribution. Honourable Shifeta.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. I want to contribute to this Motion.

First, let me say that immigration is part of human development. There are factors that cause us to immigrate as human beings, be it political, economic or social factors. Those are causes of immigration.

As people of the Universe, we need to accept one another. It can be a problem of another country today, and you would think that today you are well off, but tomorrow it could be your turn and you would be forced to

MOTION ON XENOPHOBIC ATTACKS HON SHIFETA

immigrate to other countries whose citizens you are chasing away. It is something that we should really educate our people on. First, we need to educate our people as Africans and secondly, as peoples of the Universe.

Many of the countries in southern Africa got Independence because of the solidarity of others, be it Namibia, be it the struggle for social justice in South Africa, Mozambique, Zimbabwe, Zambia or all these countries.

For instance, the case of South Africa is a very fresh one and I do not think that it is supposed to come from there because just yesterday others, the same people we are chasing away, accommodated us. It gives us the impression that we do not appreciate and if we do not educate our people to think where they came from, these are the situations we are going to be confronted with in the future.

We even have internal immigration, when people move from their places. They move to those places because of different factors and they are not just moving aimlessly. It is because of human needs that guide them to go to those places and I think we need to educate our people to accept one another, because if we do not do this, it will be there today and tomorrow it can be here. We do not know that we are not going to be confronted by that situation in the future.

Therefore, it is good that this Motion was brought up here in order that we sensitise our people, because these are things that are being forced on us. There are people who are instigating others, because I do not think that poverty could be a justification for chasing and killing other Africans. It cannot be a justification.

We can do some other things than killing other Africans. It is even embarrassing. No African is a foreigner in Africa. The impression is that these are foreigners. I think we must explicitly condemn such kind of attitude and therefore, educate our children. Those that were born after Independence and at Independence do not know the history and only if we start educating our children will they learn to co-exist and even our communities, because it starts from there. We should learn to co-exist as people from different tribes, from different communities, from different

backgrounds. We need to learn to accept one another and to co-exist. If we do not do it now, it starts from there.

Therefore, I really think that we need to educate our people so that when things of this nature happen, they will be aware of the causes.

HON NCUBE: Thank you Honourable Speaker, I want to know whether the Honourable Deputy Minister is also aware of other Africans who are coming to Namibia for certain expertise but who are looking down on Namibians? Do you not think that they perhaps also need sensitisation when they come to Namibia, to know that they are just here because of their expertise and not because we are stupid when we need them?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: Yes, it vice versa. I think we must value each other. We should not look down on others and I think you are hired because of your expertise and not to think that you are superior. It is true that there can be such cases but then we should also not justify that to start with resentment, that if this is the attitude we must reciprocate. We must be able to educate them. Some people are told Namibia is a very poor country, so you are going as an expert to deliver expertise and those people are nothing. Therefore, they come with that attitude because of this mentality. We should educate those people. Thank you, Honourable Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you Deputy Minister. Honourable Kaura.

<u>HON KAURA</u>: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. When we are interrogating this issue of xenophobia, especially which has been sparked recently in South Africa, we must look at the cause of these xenophobic reactions.

As far back as 1904, during the German-Herero warfare, Chief Samuel Maharero migrated from here, through Botswana up to Transvaal and up to today, there are Hereros living in Northern Transvaal at Ipalela and there was no xenophobic reaction against them up to now.

We know that some of our great leaders, like Honourable Toivo ya Toivo, Shipanga and many others were working in Cape Town, South Africa and this was when OPO was founded to be transformed into SWAPO. There were no xenophobic reactions against them.

Many African leaders in Namibia, Botswana, Zimbabwe, Zambia and Malawi were all educated in South Africa and there was no xenophobic reaction against them. However, what is the cause of xenophobia today, what is leading to this xenophobia in South Africa? Let us look at the causes, let us examine it if we can, to cure it? Where does it come from?

In 2000 we were in Cape Town with the SADC Parliamentary Forum and we were in a hotel and one gentleman, the waiter, came and said, "Tate Kaura" in plain Oshivambo. I asked; "Do you work here?"; "Yes, I have been here for many years", he said.

Many Oshivambo-speaking people live in South Africa and there were no xenophobic reactions against them. The Hereros are living there, what is the cause of the xenophobia in South Africa today? Let us call a spade a spade.

The cause of the xenophobia is the influx of thousands of Zimbabweans into South Africa because of the economic meltdown in Zimbabwe and because of the unfortunate political situation today in Zimbabwe. This influx has led to the xenophobia.

Let us look at the cause and let us solve the problem, let us try to find a cure for the economic meltdown in Zimbabwe and the Zimbabweans will go home and this xenophobia thing will disappear.

But you see, yesterday when Honourable Ulenga was addressing this issue... (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: May I ask a question? Honourable Kaura, talking about thousands of Zimbabweans going to South Africa, are you aware that apart from the Zimbabweans, there are also thousands of Nigerians in South Africa to the extent that there is a certain area where even the South African Army cannot get into, especially as it happened in Cape Town and Johannesburg and many other immigrants into South Africa? Are you aware of that?

HON KAURA: I am very aware of it. However, you know, there is a tragedy here in the SADC Region. I was reading an article the other day that people cross the Limpopo River, which is infested with crocodiles and they have to cross that river by all means, regardless of the crocodiles and they went to a witchdoctor who apparently said if he rubs them with certain potions, the crocodiles will not see them. So forty of them were rubbed with this potion and they jumped into the Limpopo River. Only one swam back to tell the story that all the other thirty-nine were eaten by crocodiles.

That is the situation which is confronting us and we must apply our minds and be sympathetic to our brothers in Zimbabwe and this economic meltdown and try to find a solution to that, so that this xenophobia which has erupted in South Africa can come to an end. That is my personal plea. Thank you very much.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Nujoma.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Thank you, Comrade Speaker, I rise to support the Motion introduced by Honourable Venaani, my young brother. It is a very important Motion and I thought I must also say something. I am also a global man, I have been everywhere in Africa, Europe and secondly I am a Pan-Africanist and a nationalist and I do not have any xenophobic tendencies.

Before I start, let me first pay tribute to the gallant freedom fighters of SWAPO, those who have contributed to the liberation of this country, those who have worked tirelessly through sweat and blood in the military, in the diplomatic and all other fields which have paved the way for the Independence of Namibia and then to the Constitutional Conference which adopted this modern Constitution which enshrined the fundamental human rights and values. We have the founding fathers of our Constitution here and I would also like to pay tribute to them. They thought it wise to provide in Article 10 of our Constitution for equality and freedom from discrimination. They have prohibited discrimination on the grounds of sex, race, colour, ethnic origin, and religion, creed of social or economic status. Therefore, this is the law; we do not discriminate in this country.

HON KAURA: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? A person is an honourable Namibian only if he is a supporter of the Ruling Party. If he is not a supporter of the Ruling Party, as it is the case with the Queen of Uukwanyama, he has to be vilified and denigrated. Eighteen years after Independence, forty-six Herero Traditional Leaders are not yet recognised because they are not members of SWAPO, therefore they are outlanders, they are not Namibians. Will that not lead to xenophobic reactions?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: That is not true, Honourable Kaura, that is misinterpretation of the real facts on the ground. The Queen of Uukwanyama is a fully-fledged SWAPO Party member. I have been with her at several meetings and she has never uttered a word about the DTA or this divided CoD. The true fact of the matter is that after Independence the SWAPO Party Government ... (Intervention)

HON ULENGA: Honourable Speaker, with all due respect, on a Point of Order. I should ask the Honourable Member to desist from speaking any further and rather sit down, because the more he speaks, the more he

11 June 2008

MOTION ON XENOPHOBIC ATTACKS HON NUJOMA

reveals his xenophobic soul, especially with regard to Namibians who do not agree with him. Rather keep quiet.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Yes you see, these xenophobic tendencies are articulated by you, Honourable Ulenga. Yesterday you said here that the elections in Zimbabwe were delayed for almost one month... (Intervention)

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Members, actually the discussion has been wonderful so far, wonderful in the sense that you were speaking to the subject. It is a very serious subject and I hope that as we are speaking we are addressing the Namibian Nation as leaders and let us not have partisan politics.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Honourable Speaker, you know that they divert you from the subject matter. What I was saying is that the SWAPO Party Government immediately after Independence enacted the Racial Discrimination Act of 1991 and secondly, in 1998 we acceded to the Convention against Racial Discrimination.

HON MEMBER: You are discriminating with impunity.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: This shows the commitment, the total commitment of the SWAPO Party Government to eliminate racial discrimination and xenophobia. Up to the present moment we have submitted two reports to the UN on this specific Convention against Racial Discrimination. Therefore, Namibia has done everything in its power to eliminate racial discrimination through the law. We have all the mechanisms in place as we are speaking now.

Coming back to the topic, what I wanted to do is to show that we are really committed to the fight against racial discrimination and xenophobia. It cannot be allowed in this country. The Police are there to enforce any manifestation of racial discrimination, but unfortunately at the present moment our very important institutions, such as the national broadcaster, sometimes the newspapers – the fourth estate, it is not part of the institutions – are not being used to protect the interests of the Namibian people. It is in the media there. They are misleading the Namibian people that the SWAPO Party Government is against the Queen of Uukwanyama, which is a total misrepresentation of the truth. The Uukwanyama Queen is a fully-fledged member of the SWAPO Party. Where do they get that from? (Intervention)

HON MOONGO: On a Point of Information. Is the Honourable Member aware that the top chiefs or the heads of communities are not supposed to be fully-fledged members of SWAPO? Are you aware that they are supposed to be neutral and not support any Party? They should be neutral. I am not a community leader, I am only a member of the Traditional Authority but I am not leading. Read your Constitution and know your Constitution. The Chiefs and the Queen are supposed to be neutral as stipulated in the Constitution.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: You call yourself a Chief and yet you are a politician. What are you telling us? You are the Headman of Omalaala, yet you are here and you are supposed to lead your people. You see, this is again misleading.

What we need to do in order to fight xenophobia in our country is to make sure that all the institutions of the State...(Intervention)

134

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Speaker, I just want to be clearer on what the Honourable Deputy Minister has said. May I ask him a question please? Honourable Deputy Minister, I want you to repeat because it is very important, did you say that the Queen of Okwanyama is a fully-fledge SWAPO member? Is that what you have said, for the record?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: She is and I confirm it, she is a SWAPO member. What is the problem with that? Is Chief Riruako not a member of NUDO, the Paramount Chief? (Intervention)

HON KAURA: May I ask the Honourable Deputy Minister a question? Honourable Deputy Minister, what we are reading here in the newspaper which is said by Mandume Pohamba, accusing the tribal authority of being sell-outs and known traitors that are led by the Queen of Uukwanyama and she is a fully-fledged member of SWAPO and she is called a sell-out and a traitor, is that what you are telling us?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: This is what we are saying that the newspapers in this country are guilty because they promote tribalism, ethnicity and division and this is the root cause of all the problems. That is why we are saying it is the fourth estate in this country. The newspapers in this country do not contribute to national unity and that is the problem. We must all look at ourselves as, Namibians first, as Africans and then as global people, people of the world that have all the rights in this world.

Therefore, when a foreigner comes to Namibia through legitimate means, through the ports of entry, they are always accorded the full rights, which are enshrined in this Constitution. We have never violated that. Intervention)

135

HON MOONGO: On a Point of Information. I appeal to the SWAPO Party to make sure that that person who insulted the Queen should be withdrawn from the Party and thrown out, because we cannot tolerate that a leader be insulted.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Honourable Moongo, I want to remind you of the subject matter under discussion, that Honourable Venaani is asking us to debate the current xenophobic violent attacks that are showing their ugly face in our neighbouring country. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF EDUCATION: On a Point of Order. Honourable Speaker, may I offer clarification? Will former and ex-members of SWAPO please stop issuing instructions and orders to the members of SWAPO? So says the Deputy Secretary General of SWAPO Party.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: As I was saying, all foreigners who come into this country, whether through legitimate or illegitimate means, are accorded all their rights enshrined in this Constitution. (Intervention)

<u>HON MOONGO</u>: Is it allowed in this House for the Deputy Secretary General of SWAPO to confirm the insult of a certain leader? A community leader is insulted and he is confirming it in this House. Is that allowed?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: The SWAPO Party Government enacted the Refugee Convention of 1961. (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: Please allow me to ask a small question to the Honourable Deputy Minister of Justice. Honourable Deputy Minister, this story of the insult to the Queen started last week in the papers. It gives such a bad image of the Ruling Party. Why is it that the Ruling Party up to date has not reacted and put the record straight, that what was reported in the newspaper is not correct? Why is it that you sit comfortably and let the process continue and today you are crying? Do you not think it was perhaps true what was written in the newspapers?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: I was saying the SWAPO Party Government went further to enact the Refugee Convention to accede to the Refugee Convention.

Therefore because of that we are cooperating with our international partners, for example the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees and many other instances to promote the welfare of the refugees who have fled wars, xenophobia and all those other evil manifestations. This is another total commitment of the SWAPO Party Government.

As we are speaking now, all those people who have run away from difficulties because of war, hunger and diseases are housed at our refugee camp at Osire and we are providing education to them. After completing their secondary school we even go further to integrate them into the Namibian society. Some of them have graduated as doctors, nurses and they are contributing to the welfare of the Namibians today.

What we should learn is to accommodate each other. We have been living in exile as refugees and here we are, we are contributing to national

development because of the assistance by other countries and the sacrifice by other people. They were not looking at us as refugees, insulting us and telling us that we are not welcome in their countries. They shared with us the little they had. That is why we have a country called Namibia today and we should be grateful to them.

Therefore, what is important is that the other institutions of the State should also come in and assist, for example in education. All these important institutions should come in and let us educate our children that when somebody is fleeing from hunger and poverty, they should be assisted. That is our custom and our tradition.

I know that you are coming from somewhere and you are passing at night, the people in the North would say, "Omujenda nandjira ina rara nondjara". Those are the core values.... (Intervention)

<u>HON KAURA</u>: Honourable Deputy Minister, if tomorrow three million Angolans come across the border into Namibia, what do you think would be the reaction of the Namibian people?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Honourable Kaura, in 1975 they came here in their thousands and some are still here and we even went further to give permanent residence to those Angolans who have been living in Namibia. My friend, we are committed to the values of Pan-Africanism and we are living according to those core values. That is why I say all State institutions must be geared up to support this noble cause, so that we educate our young people to be accommodative. (Intervention)

138

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: Comrade Speaker, may I ask a question? Comrade Nujoma, Honourable Kaura asked what would happen if thousands of Angolans come here. We already have them here. What happened to us when we fought in Angola in order to liberate this country? We were not a million but we were thousands. What did the Angolans do to us?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Even though the Angolans had difficulties at Independence, they were trying to put their institutions in order. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: On a Point of Information. According to the statistics there are 12,000 applications by Angolans to become Namibian citizens, but those registering in some of the Regions are estimated to be about 50,000. However, they are here every day, some children are crossing the border, attending school in Namibia. Our health facilities are also accommodating them. What is the problem?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Honourable Kaura, the noble thing for you to do is to tell our partners, the western countries, that they must impose sanctions on independent and democratic countries. That is the cause of the problem in Zimbabwe. You are saying the people were crossing rivers infested with crocodiles. What was the root cause of that? It is the sanctions imposed!

11 June 2008

MOTION ON XENOPHOBIC ATTACKS HON NUJOMA

The only crime Mugabe has committed is to give the land to his people and now he must be demonised and you are happy, Honourable Kaura, while today you are saying you want compensation for your land. (Intervention)

HON DR AMWEELO: May I ask a small question? Comrade Nujoma, are you aware that Honourable Kaura was in America for many years and he was not chased away?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: I am aware that, he was in the United States, first as a student, then a teacher and then a politician. That is good, he acquired the necessary skills and experience to come and contribute to Namibia's development. (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Speaker, may I ask the Honourable Deputy Minister a question, please? I think we are taking this Motion very lightly and we are dining and wining while Africa is on fire. Honourable Deputy Minister, are you aware that recently, for the first time, the business people in the North have expressed their concern about the influx of the Chinese? Are you aware of that? What does that mean to you while you are wining and dining? These people are sitting there watching you.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: The problem is this anti-Chinese phobia which some of you, like Honourable Dienda, are always whipping up. That is exactly what we call xenophobia and all of them are against the Chinese, but the Chinese came here to construct our roads,

11 June 2008

MOTION ON XENOPHOBIC ATTACKS HON NUJOMA

etcetera, and helped us. If the Chinese have problems, we also need to help them. That is the principle of international solidarity. They gave us arms during the liberation struggle. (Intervention)

HON MEMBER: You were paying them.

-

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: No, we were not paying them. We are saying that those who come through legitimate means and also through illegitimate means have the full right under this document. You must keep that in mind.

HON T GURIRAB: Honourable Speaker, I rise in terms of Rule 29(h) because the Honourable Member has been on the Floor for the last 29 minutes. According to the Rules, he only has 10 minutes.

HON SPEAKER: My officials are keeping time, they will advise me accordingly.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Comrade Speaker, I was saying that the xenophobia sentiments are being whipped up by irresponsible statements by leaders, irresponsible statements by the media and irresponsible statements on the national radio. Those are the evils,

MOTION ON XENOPHOBIC ATTACKS HON VILJOEN

which must be combated collectively by all State institutions to ensure that that xenophobia tendency does not rear its ugly head.

Honourable Tsudao Gurirab mentioned Rwanda. Rwanda is a vivid example of what happens with xenophobia. What created that xenophobia and who contributed greatly to that xenophobia? It was the media in Rwanda it was the radio. (Interjection). Whatever, I am not an Englishman. I am an African and I went there to get ideas, I did not go there to get the correct spelling. That is why you people are looking down upon yourselves, because you want to be American, you want to speak like the English. I am not English, I am African and I am proud of what I am. You will never be English, you are a Namibian and be proud of yourself and of your inheritance and your values. You know, I am so proud that sometimes when I speak Otjiherero or Oshivambo, I can gossip because some of those Colleagues do not understand. But do you want to tell me I am stupid, knowing so many languages? Do you want to tell me I am stupid?

HON SPEAKER: Before I give the Floor to Honourable Viljoen, I am once again pleading with the Honourable Members. As Honourable Members are repeatedly saying, this is a very important subject you are debating, but the Debate is not addressing the subject, it is becoming a laughing matter and I am concerned about that. If it is true that the subject of the Motion is serious, as some of the Honourable Members have said and you are right, then the Debate should measure up to that seriousness of the Motion. Honourable Viljoen.

HON VILJOEN: Honourable Speaker, may I ask the Honourable Deputy Minister a question, please? Honourable Deputy Minister, I agree with you that we are Namibians we are not English. Would you please

11 June 2008

MOTION ON XENOPHOBIC ATTACKS HON KAAPANDA

phone my wife, because she always says I must practise when I am alone to improve my pronunciation?

-____

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Honourable Viljoen, it is regrettable that you claim to be a Namibian but you can hardly speak any Otjiherero or Oshiwambo or Damara/Nama. Those are the things we are saying we must encourage. As Honourable Viljoen is saying, we must learn each other's languages, each other's cultures, each other's values and embrace them. That is the only way we can build one Namibia, one Nation.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Deputy Minister. Any further discussion? Honourable Mushelenga.

HON P MUSHELENGA: Honourable Speaker, after such high chemistry, I hope the House agrees with me that it is in order to postpone the Debate on this important Motion to next week, Wednesday.

HON SPEAKER: Any other Honourable Member who wishes to make a contribution prior to Tuesday next week? Minister Kaapanda.

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION

TECHNOLOGY: I thank you for the Floor Comrade Speaker. My contribution will be a very short one and I would just like to say that it is a bit strange to use the word "foreigner" when we are referring to fellow

MOTION ON XENOPHOBIC ATTACKS HON KAAPANDA

Africans, people of the same colour, culture, customs and continent. We are in the process of integrating Africa as a continent and do you want to tell me that we are trying to unite foreigners in Africa? Honestly, we are applying the wrong vocabulary in this context.

Comrade Speaker, I would like to appeal to you that whoever takes the Floor should not use the word "foreigner." We should say "Africans from other African countries." The people of South Africa are either Namibians, Zimbabweans, homogeneous and they are not foreigners. They are on their own continent they belong here. Why should they be referred to as foreigners? That is a wrong word. (Intervention)

HON KAURA: Honourable Minister, what we are talking about is not foreigner, it is a stranger. Xenophobia is a reaction against a stranger. Even if an Oshiwambo-speaking person walks into your house in Windhoek, he is a stranger and you will have a xenophobic reaction against him. The word "xenophobia" refers to a stranger, not to a foreigner and a stranger is anybody.

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION

TECHNOLOGY: Comrade Speaker, if we were to take this xenophobic reaction and try to put it into that context, that people who are attacked in South Africa are not foreigners, but they are African, then we are being xenophobic ourselves. Honourable Kaura, if you are insisting that the terminology applied in this particular context where Africans in South Africa are being attacked and called foreigners, strangers, then we are also being xenophobic and contributing to the escalation of violence against people from other countries, not trying to reverse the trend, the attitude of aggressiveness against those who do not belong in our midst, that we think they are not part of us or they do not belong here.

11 June 2008

MOTION ON XENOPHOBIC ATTACKS HON KAAPANDA

Therefore, the word itself is wrong and if you insist using it, I think you are making a grave mistake. Let us just use the words "Africans from other African countries." I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Minister, before you sit down, may I ask you a question? Would that mean that except for Africans, xenophobia is allowed for others, everybody else not African?

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION

TECHNOLOGY: No, an emphatic no. Let me explain: Xenophobia is an attitude of not welcoming somebody from outside and that is a non-African culture. Somebody mentioned here that in the African context we are always welcoming strangers from other parts of the country or across the border, because we see the value of people coming from... (Intervention)

HON NCUBE: I need guidance, Honourable Speaker. How should we deal with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs if we are not to use the word "foreign?" Should we do away with the name Foreign Affairs or what?

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY: Foreign affairs, external affairs, external relations. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS: Comrade Speaker, let me assist my Colleague here. The Ministry of Foreign Affairs does not refer to people, it refers to affairs.

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION

TECHNOLOGY: Exactly. Let us take the word "foreigner" out of the Debate and refer to people from other countries. Comrade Speaker, it is just proper and fitting to put the Debate in the right context. I rest my case.

HON SPEAKER: I thank you. Honourable Schimming-Chase.

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. Honourable Speaker, I have listened attentively to the Debate on what we all agree is a very serious Motion, and I would like to start by saying that one element that I have missed is the differentiation. Nobody who has taken the Floor has spoken about the thousands of South Africans who demonstrated against what was happening.

Some of us have taken the Floor and said what is in our Constitution and what we have acceded to, but we have not made mention of what is in the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa. They also have a Bill of Rights.

We have not talked about those people who come and spend tens of millions of South African Rand, buying the most beautiful and expensive houses in select areas in South Africa where there were no xenophobic attacks. We are talking about attacks by the poor against the poor. The

rich are left out of it and I think we need to make mention of that, because at one point or another we have to look at the root cause of the problem. Why are the rich – and I am using it as an example – the rich Nigerian drug dealer who lives in a posh house in Johannesburg not being attacked while he contributes to the crime? Why are those who pretend to marry South Africans and take away the people's individualism, even marrying them, why are we not talking about them? Why are we only accusing the poor for attacking the poor?

I remember when we fought the liberation struggle and some people here are talking about the founding fathers as if there were no mothers. However, when we started our political careers we were saying racism will one day be removed and we will have a class struggle and that is where we are today and we are not looking at it in terms of being a class struggle. We need to start there. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: May I ask Honourable Schimming-Chase a question? (Interjection). It was brought to my attention that one must speak like an Englishman. Venaani thinks he is more European than African. Honourable Nora Chase, you are saying the root cause of the problem in South Africa is the poor fighting against the poor and you have categorised that as a class. If the poor are fighting against each other, which class are they? I would understand if you said the poor fighting the rich or the middle class or whatever. Poor against poor, where is the class element?

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: Honourable Speaker, I think we have all read Karl Marx and so on, I do not hold with the notion of insulting Africans by saying, "I am African, therefore I cannot say xenophobia." It is an insult to the African man and woman, especially Namibians who left from there without knowledge of foreign languages and studied

throughout the whole world in all languages and made a success. I do not hold with that. May I just finish answering the question?

If I am not wrong, the Honourable Deputy Minister studied in Russia, amongst others, because he said he travelled the world. We have all read Karl Marx and Lenin and Trotsky and if the Honourable Deputy Minister thinks class struggle is only between a higher and a lower class, then maybe we should go back and read Lenin and Trotsky again, because there are some of us – and Honourable Kaiyamo will bear me out – who pretend to belong to the working class or the petty bourgeoisie while they are grand bourgeoisie. Maybe we should study that again. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: On a Point of Order. The Honourable Member is speaking as if everyone who took the Floor spoke in favour of xenophobia. No Member who participated in the Debate supported it, except my father who wanted to bring in Zimbabwe to fight Mugabe The question is, why are you starting to attack something, which everybody is against? We are against xenophobia because we are a product of internationalism. Our African sisters and brothers are the ones who made us to be where we are, if you do not know that. Please concentrate on the Motion, do not say others spoke in favour of xenophobia here.

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: Honourable Speaker, I ask for your support because I do not know where the Honourable Deputy Minister was when I spoke, but I certainly at no point supported xenophobia and attacked people. Maybe if we can start listening to one another we would understand each other.

I was talking about the fact that there are foreigners – and Honourable Minister, excuse for saying that, but they are not nationals, they are

foreigners – who have invested immense amounts of money and are living it up in South Africa and nobody attacks them. (Intervention)

HON NAMBAHU: May I ask a question? Honourable Schimming-Chase, you are actually going into a direction which I think is the proper one, because the issue of xenophobia in South Africa is quite recent and it is not really well-documented and studied. There are Honourable Members who seem to have conclusions as to why it is happening and they seem to have the answers and understand the root causes. You mentioned one very important thing and that is the issue of the Nigerians. It is documented in South Africa that the Nigerians are running drugs. (Interjections). It is documented, let me just say what is said by the South African Police, that the people who have drug factories are actually white compatriots in South Africa and they are using the Nigerians as runners. It is the Police in South Africa who are saying these things.

If we do not address some of these things and the other Colleagues are saying there is a third force, all of a sudden these people are in harmony and all of a sudden xenophobia starts, we must really investigate and I would encourage you to go in that direction. From now on, our Colleagues who are addressing this issue should try to be objective and investigative.

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. When we lived abroad, there were instances when people who were not of the nationalities in the countries which they lived were attacked and it always happened that it was those who felt that their jobs were taken away, their houses were taken away. So it is not strange to South Africa and when we want to be self-righteous about ourselves, we must be very careful that we will not be allowed to swallow our words one day, because Namibians are no different to the other people in the world and it can happen to us.

MOTION ON XENOPHOBIC ATTACKS HON KAIYAMO

That is why this Motion is so important and there is a need for it to be discussed with the seriousness that it deserves. (Interjection) Legislation does not solve problems, it facilitates. We should learn the lesson that if we do not provide adequate education, if we do not provide jobs, if we do not provide houses but rather rob the poor of their houses, very soon the same thing can happen here.

What is important for us to do is to try to analyse and differentiate. I am not saying everybody in South Africa is guilty of xenophobia, every brutality that is there. What I was saying is that I did not hear that differentiation and as long as we cannot take it with the seriousness that it deserves, history will one day take care of it. We can have the most wonderful Constitution in the world, but if we have young people at the age of 16 and 18 becoming criminals because they do not see a future or they do not have an education or jobs, then we are wrongly patting ourselves on the back, because we are not the example, we are the fortunate ones. We are doing well, our children study and are educated everywhere, but we were not elected for that, we were elected to care for those who are on the streets, those who are being thrown out of their houses and those who might one day get up and see an enemy in every non-Namibian who has a better life. We need to think of that, Honourable Speaker. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Speaker Kaiyamo.

HON KAIYAMO: Honourable Speaker, I always want to take a scientific approach. My Colleagues have made very dangerous statements here, such as Nigerians dealing with drugs in South Africa. Where did you get this information? You talk about white compatriots dealing with drugs and I do not want to be part of that, I want you to prove that information to this House. I do not want to be part of that. Unless the Colleagues can give us the source of that information, I do not want to be part of that statement. I thank you.

150

MOTION ON XENOPHOBIC ATTACKS **HON NAMBAHU**

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Nambahu.
HON NAMBAHU: Thank you, Comrade Speaker. This is public information in the South African media as well as the internet. Everybody knows, it is public information, unless there are those who do not have access to this or not making use of it. There is nothing new here it is something that is public knowledge. Thank you very much.
HON SPEAKER: Any further discussion?
HON P MUSHELENGA: Honourable Speaker, I Move that the Debate be adjourned until next week, Tuesday.
HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: I Move that this House adjourns until tomorrow, 14:30.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:45 UNTIL 2008.06.12 AT 14:30.

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY ASSEMBLY CHAMBER 12 JUNE 2008 WINDHOEK

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

<u>HON SPEAKER:</u> Any Petitions? Any Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Honourable Nambahu.

TABLING: REPORT OF STANDING COMMITTEE ON CONSTITUTIONAL AND LEGAL AFFAIRS ON TRADITIONAL LEADERS

HON NAMBAHU: Honourable Speaker, I lay upon the Table, the Report of the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Constitutional and Legal Affairs on the Consultative Meetings conducted on the Motion by Honourable H Mudge on the Election, Appointment and Recognition of Traditional Leaders in Namibia for consideration.

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Member table the Report? Any further Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers?

TABLING: REPORT BY STANDING COMMITTEE ON FAMILIARISATION VISIT TO SOUTH AFRICA

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS HON MOONGO

HON DIERGAARDT: Honourable Speaker, I lay upon the Table, a Report of the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Constitutional and Legal Affairs on the familiarisation visit to the Parliament of the Republic of South Africa during 9 to 14 September 2007 for consideration. I so Move.

HON SPEAKER: Any Notice of Questions? Honourable Moongo.

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS

QUESTION 63:

HON MOONGO: Honourable Speaker, I give Notice that on Thursday, 19 June 2008, I shall ask the Honourable Minister of Regional and Local Government, Housing and Rural Development the following:

- 1. Is it true that Veronica Williams, residing in Shandumbala lost ten goats, arbitrarily confined in the kraal in Oshakati Municipality against the policy of SPCA, the basic freedom for animals, freedom from pests, hunger, pain, injury, fear or abnormal behaviour, preventing molesting of animals and also Article 13(1) for prevention of disorder crime for protection of the rights and freedoms of others?
- 2. Can we enforce Article 39 to terminate the Municipality of Oshakati on a vote of no confidence and misuse of power?
- 3. How many goats, cattle and donkeys died during 2006/07? Were they compensated? When will the owner of the ten goats be compensated as stated in Article 16(2)?

HON SPEAKER: Any further Notices of Questions? Any Notices of Motions? Honourable Mushelenga.

LEAVE OF ABSENCE

HON P MUSHELENGA: Honourable Speaker, I Move without Notice that leave of absence be granted to the Minister of Justice and Attorney-General, Honourable Pendukeni-Ithana, until the 30th of June 2008.

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Member table the Motion? Any further Notice of Motions? Any Ministerial Statements? This being Thursday, we will commence with the Questions. Question 3 is by Honourable Dienda. Does the Honourable Member put the Question?

QUESTION 3:

HON DIENDA: I Put the Question.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Comrade Speaker, I wish to respond to the question posed by the Honourable Dienda as follows:

I thank the Honourable MP for raising questions on the operation of the Maintenance Act 9 of 2003. As will become apparent from my response

to the Honourable Member's specific questions around the work of maintenance officers, the situation at one office will not be fully representative of the position throughout the country.

I can, however provide the statistics of maintenance complaints lodged with the Magistrate's Court, Windhoek since the Maintenance Act (Act 9 of 2003) came into operation.

In 2003 – 2,159 complaints were lodged; 2004 – 1,297; 2005 – 1,292; 2004 – 1,260; 2007 – 1,072, 2008 – 260 complaints lodged from January 2008 until 5 March 2008.

In Windhoek there is one magistrate assigned solely for the Maintenance Court, who handles enquiries and consequential criminal hearings. A fulltime prosecutor, a maintenance officer and four legal clerks support this Magistrate. In all other districts countrywide, district magistrates also handle maintenance matters and the prosecutor assigned to these courts is the maintenance officer.

The Maintenance Court was established with the specific purpose to ensure that the necessary support is provided when children are neglected by one or both of their biological parents. Where the respondent offers to pay an amount, the case is postponed for a reasonable time, as requested by the respondent, to make the required payments.

Where a complaint is received, the person liable for support of a child is summoned to appear before Court for a full inquiry into such person's financial ability to provide the required support.

The Court should do everything possible to convince the respondent of his/her duty to support his/her children and in all possible ways encourage the respondent to provide such support without imprisoning the latter.

Only when it is clear that the respondent is able but refuses to provide such support to his/her children, the Court, in terms of the Act, is allowed to imprison such respondent for failing to comply with a court order.

It is, therefore, hardly possible for a Maintenance Court to satisfy the needs of every complainant and often the clerks and/or the Magistrates are blamed for the respondent's failure to support his/her children.

We should therefore realise that the neglect of children is a serious societal problem, which is not solely the responsibility of the courts. If every member of society teaches children in their upbringing to take responsibility for their actions, maintenance cases should be minimal, unlike the present precarious situation where the neglect of children has become the order of the day, rather than the exception. The notion to fix all societal shortcomings with legislation should, therefore, in future be replaced with values, which are instilled in our children during childhood to ensure that they are responsible during adulthood.

Question 1:

No initial training is provided but in-service training is provided on a daily basis to the maintenance officer and other administrative clerks in the Maintenance Division. It is expected of the maintenance officer and clerks to acquaint themselves with the Maintenance Act (Act 9 of 2003) on a regular basis.

Question 2:

The Magistrate, with the assistance of support staff, is responsible for record-keeping and a file is opened for every maintenance complaint. Complaints from the public can be reported to the magistrate.

Question 3:

- a) The work of maintenance officers in this office is personally observed by supervisory officials for monitoring purposes.
- b) Supervisory officials include the head of office in the case of Windhoek, the Magistrate, the maintenance officer, the administrative head as well as the prosecutor who is an *ex-officio* maintenance officer.

- c) Supervising officials check case files on a regular basis.
- d) Supervising officials do not necessarily interview complainants. Complainants are interviewed by the maintenance officer or members of the support staff who assist with maintenance matters. Complaints about the performance of staff members or lack thereof is handled by the Magistrate.
- e) Support dealing with maintenance matters are supervised by a maintenance officer who is supervised by the Maintenance Magistrate.

Question 4:

Maintenance officers are legal clerks and legal officers appointed of different grades and levels in the respective job categories in the Public Service with different scales of salaries.

Question 5:

- a) No investigators have been appointed since the Maintenance Act came into operation because this job was previously done by the police and we have budgetary constraints.
- b) At the time of promulgation of this Act, the Police assisted the Courts to trace defendants. When the Police were no longer available for these purposes, Messengers of the Civil Court were and are still utilised to serve the Court process when the whereabouts of a defendant is known. This practice has thus far not required or necessitated the appointment of fulltime maintenance investigators provided for in subsection (4) of the Act.

12 June 2008

RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS HON DR N IYAMBO

c) Should reports be received from investigators, it would not be available to the general public because the contents of reports are confidential.

I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Deputy Minister for his reply. Question 8 is one by Honourable Moongo. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

QUESTION 8:

HON MOONGO: I Put the Question.

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Honourable Speaker, I wish to reply to the question by Honourable Moongo.

I will attempt to answer the question by Honourable Moongo by explaining the situation on the ground in order for Honourable Moongo and other Honourable Members of the House to understand what this Community Police Volunteer Service is and how it operates. If Honourable Moongo agrees, that is the line on which I want to respond to the question.

First, this Community Service is voluntary and composed of people that offer their services voluntarily to help the Namibian Police in policing

RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS HON DR N IYAMBO

crimes in the country. They are composed of two categories. One category is called Police Reservists. The Police Reservists get some basic police training and they are issued with appointment certificates that they are operating as such and they have the power to arrest.

However, these Police Reservists are not remunerated at all. The condition is that those who want to offer their services to their country, their people and communities must do so voluntarily and secondly, they must be employed in order to avoid that they demand to be remunerated. It is a voluntary service and people must be employed or self-employed and they can be farmers, business people, etcetera. The majority of them are farmers whom I want to congratulate for what they are doing for their country in combating crime. They are working hand-in-hand with the Police, they are doing very well, and they are not remunerated.

The second category is volunteers who work in providing information to the Police either where crime has been committed or where they suspect crime will potentially be committed at a particular place of by particular people. They are simply volunteering, they are not remunerated and they are not even trained. Therefore, all you need to do is to come to the police and say you want to volunteer to help the Police to combat crime in the country. This is how this group works.

Therefore, answer to the question whether the service is ending is no, the service is continuing.

The second question is on how they are going to combat crime. It will be combated as the Police are doing it right now, by trained uniformed men and women and by using all those other auxiliary services. That will continue, it will not end.

How many have left the programme is not an issue. As I have said, some have volunteered, some are reservists, anybody can say, "thank you very much, I have other commitments, I end here." That is fine, that is not an issue. Therefore, whether there is an issue of nepotism in the recruitment of these members, I think you will agree with me that even if there was such an effort for nepotism to creep in, it cannot come in. What for?

RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS HON DR N IYAMBO

They are not remunerated, they volunteer their services. Is it nepotism just because you have to go to sign on? This service is done in accordance with the love of your country. That is all. That is really the basic principle. Even Members of this Honourable House are more than welcome to offer your services for your country, including Honourable Moongo. I think that satisfies your question, the issue of salaries does not come in.

<u>HON SPEAKER</u>: I thank the Honourable Minister for his reply. Honourable Moongo.

HON MOONGO: Thank you for the answer, but was there no agreement that those who volunteered and they have become experts will be enrolled when the Police enrol new members? Is it fair that somebody serves for ten years and he sees you enrolling the one who has no experience? Will it really help us if we take people from outside while we have the experienced ones?

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Honourable Moongo, former comrade, when you have unemployment in this country and people make themselves available to come and work, the expectation is that maybe one day I may be considered. They might have been told that those of you who have shown interest and there is clear evidence that you are good material, but above all, you must meet the conditions and requirements of the recruitment.

RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS HON DR N IYAMBO

If you have the necessary qualification for the recruitment, there is a possibility for you to be considered, but no guarantee. I think that is what might have happened. Question 16 is one by Honourable Venaani. Does HON SPEAKER: the Honourable Member Put the Question? **QUESTION 16: HON VENAANI:** I Put the Question. **HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY:** I am temporarily in charge of this Ministry. May Questions 16, 20, 29, 30, 31, 32, 36, 41 and 57 please stand over until next week? HON SPEAKER: Question 19 was put by Honourable Schimming-Chase. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: Honourable Speaker, I explained last week that it was directly to the person and therefore it stood over until the

Minister is present. That is why it stood over last week.

12 June 2008

HON SPEAKER: Question 23 is by Honourable Dienda. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: Rule 81 on page 57 implies the questions answered are those of the Members who are present in the House. Only if time allows can the questions be put by deputised persons afterwards. Maybe it has become practice, but the Rule says we start with those who are present and only if time allows, in accordance with (d), can we deal with the questions by those who are absent.

<u>HON SPEAKER</u>: It has been the convention, which I inherited. For now you will go along with me that we continue.

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: I am not as clear as to what the Rule actually says which the Honourable Minister is referring to. It is not clear to me what we are doing that is outside our Rules.

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: Since this is the practice we can go ahead, but I want us, through the Secretariat, to interpret this Rule. My understanding of Paragraph (b) of that Rule is that the person, who put the question, stands up and puts the question. If somebody is absent, that is done at a later stage, according to Paragraph (d), time allowing, if somebody is deputised to put the question. You first deal with the questions by those who are present and if time allows and if

RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS HON DR NDJOZE-OJO

somebody is deputised to put the question, then we deal with those. However, since we have been doing it, we can go ahead. Maybe the Speaker could ask the Secretariat to interpret the Rule.

QUESTION 23:

<u>HON SCHIMMING-CHASE</u>: I Put the Question on behalf of Honourable Dienda.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Honourable Speaker, I thank the Honourable Member for posing the four questions and the responses are as follows:

The Ministry of Education has taken over the task of pre-primary education from the Ministry of Gender Equality and Child Welfare as from 2008. One hundred schools across the country have started to offer pre-primary education as part of the formal education system. By next year, 2009, the number is expected to double. The pre-primary phase will cater for children between the ages of 5 to 6 years.

This phase has become part and parcel of the Ministry of Education and it will allow for proper realignment of movement across various phases of the system.

The phases in formal education at the Ministry of Education are as follows:

12 June 2008

RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS HON DR NDJOZE-OJO

- 5-6 Pre-primary
- 7-10 Lower Primary
- 11 13 Upper Primary
- 14 16 Junior Secondary
- 17 18 Senior Secondary

HON SPEAKER: Question 24 is by Honourable Dienda. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

QUESTION 24:

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: I Put the Question on behalf of Honourable Dienda.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The response to Question 24 is as follows:

The policy on pregnancies among learners in schools allow the teenage mother to stay at home for one year after giving birth in order to take care of her newborn baby. This is because the baby needs the biological mother's care in the first months after birth. The policy was also implemented to avoid learners from having babies as they wish and speedily return to formal school as if nothing has happened, because this will bring about moral hazard amongst learners. The Ministry believes that sexual activity should be delayed until after a learner has completed formal schooling, so as to allow him or her to pay maximum attention to

12 June 2008

RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS HON DR NDJOZE-OJO

and derive maximum benefits from the educational programme and so as to allow sexuality to be practised within a safe and emotionally mature relationship.

Staying out of school for a year after giving birth should not be seen as a punishment but rather as an effort by the Ministry and the Nation to allow the mother to provide love and care to her newborn baby.

The one year off should also be viewed as a rehabilitation period for the young mother to prepare herself to get mentally and physically fit to continue with her education.

Usually learners who fall pregnant and come back one year after giving birth are more determined than before. Teachers, parents and guardians are also expected to play a vital role in making sure that these learners are ready to continue with their education now that they have a responsibility towards their newborn children. I thank you.

	SPEAKER: Ques rable Member Put th		•	Hono	urable Die	nda.	Does	the
QUES	STION 25:			_				
	SCHIMMING-CH irable Dienda.	ASE:	I P	ut the	Question	on	behalf	of

RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS HON DR NDJOZE-OJO

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF EDUCATION: In the past, when the Ministry of Education used to offer financial assistance to students in the form of bursaries, the Ministry could place graduate teachers from colleges and universities at any school in any town and Region of the country. Many of the graduate teachers had a problem with this system.

When the financial assistance was changed to a loan scheme, teacher graduates were free to apply to any school of their choice based on the vacancy list released by the Public Service. This has resulted in many graduate teachers being unemployed because of their reluctance to apply for teaching posts available at schools in remote and rural areas. The Ministry is thus forced to employ Grade 12 graduates to teach the learners. The Ministry is aware that there are many unemployed teachers. We have asked them to approach their regional education offices, submit their names and the office will place them at any school once a vacant post is available.

In terms of the Public Service Staff Rule B2 Part 2, if an applicant applies for more than one post, he or she must submit a separate application for each post. In order for the recruitment process to be fair and transparent, each post should be advertised and anyone who is interested should apply for the position in writing. Teachers are no exception to this rule. It is even more important for teachers to apply because they even have to apply within their fields of specialisation.

The Industrial Relations Section at the Division of Human Resources of Head Office, in consultation with the Regional Offices, is responsible for all complaints and investigates claims regarding corrupt practices.

The Government of Namibia signed a bilateral agreement with the Federal Government of the Republic of Nigeria in October last year to send Nigerian Science and Mathematics teachers to Namibia. This agreement will come into effect in 2008.

These teachers are fully paid for by the Federal Government of Nigeria and all the Namibian Government is expected to cater for is accommodation and medical expenses to agreed-to specifications. The

RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS HON DR NDJOZE-OJO

Ministry of Education has already forwarded a request to the Nigerian High Commissioner for about sixty volunteer teachers to come and assist in the areas of Science, Mathematics and Information and Communication Technology at senior secondary level in rural areas where Namibian Science and Mathematics teachers are reluctant to go.

It is important to take note that all costs, excluding accommodation, will be paid for by the Nigerian Government.

The Nigerian teacher volunteers will not replace, nor will they take the place of the Namibian teachers, but will rather be working alongside the Namibian teachers to assist them in strengthening the teaching of these subjects.

Moreover, it is expected that many Namibian Science and Mathematics teachers shall use this opportunity to upgrade themselves through Open and Distance Learning and even through fulltime studies at institutions of higher learning. The Ministry is waiting upon the Federal Republic of Nigeria to finalise the process to send the volunteers to Namibia. They are expected to arrive before the end of this month, June 2008, for a period of two years, renewable based on satisfactory performance. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Deputy Minister for her reply. I have perused the Rule you made reference to, Minister, but I think that is not what the Rule says. On Tuesday I will come and clarify the position. The House shall rise for refreshments.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:40 HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:20 PURSUANT TO ADJOURNMENT

HON SPEAKER: The first Notice of Motion is the one of Honourable Schimming-Chase. Does the Honourable Member Move the Motion? Who seconds? Any objection. Agreed to. Honourable Schimming-Chase has the Floor.

MOTION ON EDUCATIONAL CRISIS AND FUTURE OF GRADE 10 DROPOUTS

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: Mr Speaker, Sir, I rise today to motivate my Motion that this House debates the ongoing education crisis, with special reference to the future of all Grade 10 dropouts, with the aim of seeking national and lasting solutions to this ongoing national crisis in education and how it affects the youth of Namibia and the development of our country as a whole.

Mr Speaker, Sir, this crisis affects all of us as a Nation and we should debate it in that light. His Excellency, President Hifikepunye Pohamba, has raised this issue on many occasions, most recently during his State of the Nation Address when the President stated: "I wish to ensure the Namibian people of our Government's resolve to create opportunities for all our youth to realise their full potential. Our Nation's future depends on our youth who must be moulded to participate actively in the social and economic development of our country."

His Excellency the President continued: "And the only way to do that is to provide an education which has as its main aim to do just that, to enable all Namibian children to realise their full potential. There can be no doubt in our minds, no rationalisation to state that the dropping out in Grade 10 is realising their full potential.

Namibians are not unteachable, they are not less able to perform than others worldwide. Most of us in this august House today are proof thereof."

Many of us were victims of apartheid education. We had Bantu Education, the main aim of which was to keep us uneducated and to rob us of the opportunities to develop to our full potential and yet, in spite of all these, Namibians sought education wherever we had a chance. We did this in Russian, in Polish, in Finnish, Swedish, German, Chinese, to name but a few and we succeeded. We need to ask ourselves, therefore, why can the large number of Namibian youth not do the same today? They are not in exile they are in an independent country. They are not the victims of a racist and oppressive educational system, but free citizens in a country that should be interested in their education.

Mr Speaker, Sir, allow me to quote more from His Excellency the President where he says: "We need to redouble our efforts to improve the state of education." We cannot deny this, the President says the state of education must be improved and this, Honourable Speaker, is the light motif of my motivation. All of us are called upon to improve the education of the youth of today, the leaders of tomorrow.

Mr Speaker, Sir, allow me to quote the Honourable Minister of Education. In this motivation of the Education Vote during the Budget Debate, which was headed, "Preparing for a Competitive Nation", the Honourable Minister of Education states that: "The ideal growth and development of a society is one that (a) knows how to operate, manage and build the instruments of production and to create, adapt and master new techniques on the technological frontier; (b) it is a community that is able to impart this knowledge and know-how to the youth whether by formal education or apprenticeship training; (c) it is a community that chooses people for jobs by competence and relative merit, promoted and demoted on the basis of performance; (d) it is a society that affords opportunity to individual or collective enterprise, encourage initiative, competition and emulation; and it is a system that allows people to enjoy and employ the fruits of their labour and enterprise."

The Honourable Minister of Education went further and, amongst others, mentioned the cause of the problems in our education system as follows: "The causes of these problems are, inter alia, the education system is growing at a rapid rate against the very slow growth in resource

allocation to critical areas of education, such as skills development that can enable the country to stimulate employability and self-employment opportunities; teacher housing to make possible for well-qualified teachers to take teaching posts at rural schools. In the absence of well-trained teacher, instead under-qualified teachers are recruited. Of the 20,333 teachers in the system, 894 had no teacher training, while 19,439 are professionally qualified. Of those that are professionally qualified, 1,480 have an academic qualification of less than Grade 12. 3,285 have at least Grade 12 plus one to two years of tertiary education."

I am quoting this, Honourable Speaker, because I submit that the lack of qualified teachers is not the root cause of the educational crisis, it is a very small part of the problem. The root cause goes much deeper and I will come back to that. In fact, the absence of well-trained teachers is a result of the crisis in our education and not its cause.

Let me go back to the example I gave of our educational system under apartheid. Let us ask the question: What opportunities did teachers have at that time compared to the opportunities they had in the last eighteen years of our independent educational system?

When we went to primary school, we had teachers with St. 6, some had St 8, many without teacher training and yet we had committed teachers who imparted knowledge to disciplined students in a disciplined educational environment. This, Honourable Minister, is what the Executive has to say about the system. Let us look at us now as the Legislature.

Again, the Honourable Minister of Education stated: "The education and training sector has been at the centre of critical constructive Debate in this august House, not only this year but over the years." I cannot agree more, Honourable Minister and yet I have to express the concern that much of it has remained just that – Debate, questions, sometimes answers but almost no implementation.

We have made a habit in this House of polarising the discussion. More often than not, attempts to raise the issues were laughed at. Members were accused of having hidden agendas, campaigning for elections and so forth. The time has now come, Mr Speaker, for us to listen to the call of the President and to debate the issue in that spirit. It is a national problem. It needs national solutions.

Mr Speaker, Sir, if you move from the Executive and the Legislature to the private sector, one has to admit that even the private sector has spoken up about our education system. Just a few weeks ago, the President of the Chamber of Mines, Mr Otto Shikongo, had this to say about our education system: "It is not a good education system. We can sit here and deny that is happening. Many people these days send their children outside the country for better education opportunities. Shikongo said the fact that many students battle to gain entrance to South African Universities is testimony that the education system is not in a good state. This state of affairs contributes to the lack of required skills in the country, especially critical skills such as artisans and geologists. He charged that there are many unemployed artisans on the street despite the shortage of the skills, which he said is evident in the quality of the education. He says no good to take up half-cooked artisans."

Even civil society, especially the churches, have on numerous occasions criticised the education system and even the youth organisation, especially those of Political Parties, have been part of this criticism. Parents and community as a whole are dissatisfied.

It all goes to show, Mr Speaker, that the crisis in our education system is a national and not a party-political one and, therefore, we have to look at the root cause of the crisis.

Mr Speaker, Sir, what happens to pupils in Grade 10 and 12 are the symptoms, not the cause of the disease. The cancer starts much earlier. It starts with early childhood education or the lack thereof. I am glad that at last early childhood education has been removed from the Ministry of Women Affairs and back to education where it belongs, because for many years pre-school education was treated as the stepchild of the Ministry of

Education. I recall vividly my contribution to a Debate on education in this House where I emphasised the importance of laying a solid educational basis before the child starts Grade 1. The then Deputy Minister Buddy Wentworth answered and stated categorically that preschool education was not deemed to be a priority.

In fact, as I said, the responsibility was given to the Ministry of Women Affairs and Child Welfare at the time, a Ministry without expertise in the field of education.

Because of this, the majority of Namibian children, especially those children of the poor who could not afford to send their children to private schools and could not provide the educational environment at home, those children entered Grade 1 without pre-school preparation. They then became part of our system of education, which is based on various phases and this is where the disease gets worse.

Here a child is allowed to fail once during a phase. If the child fails a second time, the child is transferred to the next phase. In a worst-case scenario a child can reach Grade 10 without passing once, it will only take twice as long. Then in Grade 10 suddenly the axe falls. Fail once and you are out of school.

I have yet to understand how a child who has failed Grade 1 can perform at Grade 2 or has failed Grade 2, can perform at Grade 3 all the way up to Grade 10. When we went to school you had to pass Sub A before you could go to Sub B. It meant you had to master the relevant knowledge that is required at that level before you could be exposed to another level. I fail to understand how somebody who has not mastered Grade 1 can understand what is going on in Grade 2.

Mr Speaker, Sir, I have spoken in this House before with reference to the development of the child's intellect by connecting the neurons from the time the child is in the womb. I do not wish to go into it again because many people did not understand what I was talking about. However, I will just say in summary that every child in the womb is given a number of neurons, which eventually decide intellect and if those neurons are used

and encouraged, then they connect and the connected neurons are the ones that result in the intelligence of the child. If those neurons are not connected because they are not stimulated, they die, the child will never develop, and as it goes for generations, it disappears.

All I can say, therefore, at this point is that unless we connect the neurons of the children by teaching them to use their brains and those neurons before they get to Grade 1, we have lost the battle because empirical scientific evidence states that at the age of 5 you have either developed it or you have not. You cannot make up for it.

Mr Speaker, my purpose in proposing a national conference of all stakeholders is that after eighteen years of Independence we have still not managed to work together as stakeholders in education. Some of us will blame the pupils, others blame the parents and then again, we blame the teachers or we blame the Ministry, but we have not yet realised that unless all these groups work together, we will not find a cure for the disease.

We as Namibians, especially since Independence, always emphasise our respective rights but we never talk about our responsibilities and this is what goes in our educational system. Allow me, therefore, just to look a little bit, at what are the responsibilities of all the stakeholders in our education system.

The child has the responsibility to attend school regularly. That child must do homework. Especially in our classes where there are forty or sixty pupils, the only way the teacher can detect what weaknesses the pupil has is if the pupil does homework. That pupil must read and if you look at the report that was tabled here yesterday and libraries in the country, you will see that we do not encourage a reading Nation and a Nation that does not read, is a Nation that has no knowledge.

Just to talk about reading skills and to quote: "The majority of schools, especially in the Omaheke and Otjozondjupa Regions, complained about poor reading skills amongst learners. The Ministry's automatic promotion policy was given as a major cause of this problem."

Mr Speaker, I spoke to teachers and I have looked at examples, that a Grade 10 or Grade 12 pupil, when he writes, "I do not know the answer", he says, "I do not 'no' the answer." They do not spell, they do not read.

Apart from studies, it is most important that all our children must know that it is their duty and their responsibility to write examinations. If you study the results published in the newspapers of Grade 10 and Grade 12, it is amazing and shocking to see that there are more incompletes than symbols for subjects written. An incomplete means that the child did not write the examination. Therefore, with all the efforts from all sides, the child just does not turn up for the examination and therefore, cannot pass Grade 10.

The second arm, in terms of the stakeholders of the education, are the parents and what are their responsibilities? Parents must become involved in the education of their children. They must attend parent-teacher meetings to know what is happening to their children. You speak to the teachers and they say some parents come and if they come, they do not even know in what grade their child is. However, go to the private schools, the parents attend parent-teacher meetings. They know what the problems are with their children. We as parents seem to think we do not have a duty, but we have, we have. The parents must ensure that the children have books because without books, they cannot learn, but above all, they must ensure that the children attend school, that they study, that they do their homework and that they write their examinations.

Let me come to the teachers: Many teachers go to school without being prepared. They do not teach in such a way as to excite the pupils to listen. Sometimes you see them sitting outside in the sun, especially in winter. Very often the teacher comes in, takes a book and reads and while the teacher is reading, the teacher cannot observe what is happening in the class, even to see whether the children understand. It is the teacher's duty to assist children, especially by instilling in them a love for reading and it is imperative that teachers must teach the children study skills. Our children do not have study skills. You can talk to people who are at the university and polytechnic, they do not know how to study. (Interjection).

While Rome was burning, Nero played his fiddle, it did not stop Rome from burning.

Honourable Speaker, let me come to the role of the Ministry and let me state that Government must be commended for the fact that every single year around 25 percent of our Budget goes to education. But – and this is a very big but – what do we get for the money? How much of this is expended on education itself and taking care of, amongst others, the following responsibilities: Providing adequate infrastructure, classrooms, books, libraries, science laboratories and computers. Again, if you read this report, it is amazing that at a number of schools the kids do not have an idea of what a computer is, let alone how to work with that computer and this is in 2008.

It is the duty of the Ministry to provide up-to-date educational programmes. If this automatic transfer has resulted, amongst others, in this evil, let us get rid of automatic transfer. It is not a question of according blame, it is a question of saying we tried thus far, we have failed collectively, let us seek collective solutions.

It is the duty of the Ministry to provide proper housing for teachers and proper hostels for pupils, because a teacher who does not have a proper house in which to sit and do preparation and to mark, will not be able to perform to the best of his or her ability. It is the duty of the Ministry to provide education of high quality and standard.

Mr Speaker, I do not exclude the private sector from this endeavour. It is the duty and responsibility of the private sector to contribute to the attempt made by Government, because once the child has finished school, the child goes and works for that company. The time has come that we must review these multi-nationals that are based in our country who support educational programmes in South Africa but do not support educational projects in Namibia, but yet we pay them.

We must go further and say the time has come that Namibians should be able to take the management positions in the banks and the insurance industry. If you look at it today, it is still white-male dominated. It is not

going to change until the private sector can be called to task to participate, to grant more scholarships, to grant in-service training and facilitate the education of poor children by granting them holiday jobs so that they can learn on-the-job and have money to buy books.

Finally, Mr Speaker, civil society and the community has a responsibility. When we were children and were found to be on the street during school time, any uncle or aunt would walk you back to school. Today children are roaming the streets and nobody cares whether they are at school or not. It is time that the older generation does to the young generation what our parents did for us.

Before Independence our churches ran some of the best schools. During the time of the Interim Government the churches were stopped from producing their Grade 12 results — Oshigambo, Martin Luther — because their results were so good they were shaming the Government schools. Today it is not happening to that extent and therefore, we must look back collectively at our strengths and our experiences and build on the experience of that which has succeeded.

We must work together to strengthen the moral behaviour of our children and we can only strengthen that moral behaviour if we model proper moral behaviour, because we cannot ask our children to do what we are not prepared or willing to do. We must bring back that moral fibre of the Namibian Nation that has gone lost.

In the past, as I have said, the community took care of the children. Today it is sad, especially if you go to the rural areas and Katutura where the poor people live, during school hours the shebeens are making such loud music that you cannot hear the teacher. You can take the children to the classroom to go and study, they cannot study because the music is loud. We need to do something about creating the environment for our children, which will encourage them to study. We must make sure that this happens. It is our duty.

Mr Speaker, in conclusion, I say that the blame game cannot, has not and will not work and praising each other for a job well done, despite the

ACCESSION TO AMENDED STATUTES/ INTERNATIONAL IDEA HON HAUSIKU

reality staring us in the face, will not clear the disease. This is why I am asking this House to debate the issue with dignity and respect and at the end to support my Motion calling for a national conference of all the stakeholders that I have talked about today. We will then remind ourselves that unless we all work together, fully aware of our common and separate responsibilities to our children, they will not be granted the chance to develop to their full capacity and potential as the President promised that it is the duty of this Government to do. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank Honourable Chase for her statement. Any further discussion?

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Speaker, in the absence of any contribution, I would like to adjourn the Debate until next week, Wednesday.

HON SPEAKER: The Debate on this Motion stands adjourned until next week, Wednesday. The second Notice of Motion is the one by the Honourable Minister of Foreign Affairs. Does the Honourable Minister Move the Motion? Who seconds the Motion? Any objection? Agreed to. The Minister has the Floor.

ACCESSION TO AMENDED STATUTES OF INTERNATIONAL IDEA

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Comrade Speaker, I have the honour to introduce the amended Statutes of the International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance in this august House for ratification.

ACCESSION TO AMENDED STATUTES/ INTERNATIONAL IDEA HON HAUSIKU

Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members, the International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance is an inter-Governmental organisation based in Stockholm, Sweden. It was established in 1995 to promote and advance sustainable democracy worldwide; improve and consolidate democratic electoral processes, strengthen and support national capacity to develop the full range of democratic instruments; and increase knowledge and enhance learning about democratic electoral processes.

Currently, the Institute has twenty-four Member States throughout the world and regional office in Africa, Asia and Latin-America.

Namibia joined the International IDEA in 1997 and has since worked closely with the Institute by participating in the programmes and contributing funds to the overall work of the Institute. As a member of International IDEA, Namibia collectively contributes to the growth and sustenance of democratic ideals, good governance and development of electoral process worldwide.

The direct benefits being accrued from our country's membership to the International IDEA include the following:

- 1. Participation in joint programmes such as Political Parties Development through workshops that are held in Member States and sponsored by International IDEA.
- 2. The use of programmes of electoral reforms provided by International IDEA on request by individual Member States;
- 3. International IDEA provides and sponsors experts to train and develop specific electoral training materials in accordance with the needs of Electoral Commission of Member States; and

ACCESSION TO AMENDED STATUTES/ INTERNATIONAL IDEA HON HAUSIKU

4. International IDEA develops and supplies reading materials to Member States with the prime aim of increasing knowledge and enhancing learning about democratic electoral processes.

Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members, at the Extraordinary Meeting of the Council of International IDEA held from 23rd to 24th of January 2006, Member States of the International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance decided to amend its Statutes. The Amendments were underpinned by the following key principles:

- To make the Council of Member States the overall decision-making body for the Institute;
- To transform the Board into a Board of Advisors; and
- To transform the associate membership category into an arrangement for cooperative partnership.

As a member of International IDEA, Namibia is required to take a decision on the ratification of the amended Statutes in accordance with her national procedures.

Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members, it is on that basis that I request this Honourable House to ratify the amended Statutes of the International Institute for Democracy and Electoral Assistance. The ratification of the Statutes by our country will pave the way for Namibia to continue benefiting from the Institute's programmes and contributing to worldwide efforts in strengthening democracy and good governance.

I want to conclude, Comrade Speaker, by indicating that the Council will meet next week from Tuesday to Thursday and I have been requested to report as to what we have done on the programme in connection with the ratification of the amended Statutes.

With this, I thank you very much.

179

ACCESSION TO AMENDED STATUTES/ INTERNATIONAL IDEA HON T GURIRAB

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Minister for his statement and information that I am sure the Honourable Members would make use of. Any further discussion? Minister of Fisheries.

.

HON MINISTER OF FISHERIES AND MARINE RESOURCES:

Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. Just a small question for clarity. What we are to ratify is an International Institute, so what I want to find out is whether it is an institute like a college, a university, a non-Governmental organisation or what is it?

HON SPEAKER: Any further discussion? Honourable Gurirab?

HON T GURIRAB: Honourable Speaker, I rise firstly to support the accession to this amended instrument, that we ratify the Amendments to the Statutes of the International Institute for Democracy. I believe that it is a good thing to do, that we are part of a family of countries, which belong to an institute of this nature, because it helps us to benchmark what we are doing locally and that is my second point.

We are already members, through SADC we have what is known as norms and standards for democratic elections in our region and as a continent, we also have at AU level principles for democratic elections. Why I am making reference to all these is that we understand that as elections approach next year, that we would want to re-look at our instruments here, the electoral law which governs our elections.

In the past, we have raised some problems with our electoral laws, in some instances even ending up in courts of law. Because of that,

ACCESSION TO AMENDED STATUTES/ INTERNATIONAL IDEA HON NAMBAHU

Honourable Speaker, what I wish to ask is; because we are members of all these bodies and speak to each other about the norms and standards and principles of democratic elections in Africa, whether they are benchmarked to what I would presume, for lack of better words, international standards.

I am saying this, whilst we will have an opportunity this year to look at our electoral laws, that we ensure that we draw the best elements from the ones that are being promoted through institutions like this, that we draw the best ones and amend our laws such that we have the best model drawn from all the experiences from all other countries.

Is that the sort of thing this Institute does and if so, when we come to that stage that we look at amending our legislation, is this the sort of thing we would want to do to bring in expertise from an institute like this one to help us to look at our laws? I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member for his contribution. Honourable Nambahu.

HON NAMBAHU: Thank you very much, Comrade Speaker. I would like to give my support, but there are a few things I would like to be clarified on.

What necessitated the coming into being of such a body? Secondly, there are 24 countries who are Members and we would like to know with whom we are going to be sharing the platform. Unfortunately my senior Colleagues, the leaders of the Party have left and I would have liked to be guided on what is our position as the Party, so that we can really give our

12 June 2008

ACCESSION TO AMENDED STATUTES/ INTERNATIONAL IDEA HON MOONGO

support to that. If those questions are answered I will definitely give my support. Thank you very much.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Moongo.

<u>HON MOONGO</u>: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. In my understanding of the international role to promote democracy, I feel we can support this, but I have a question.

Are the SWAPO Members and the SWAPO Party educated enough that they are not interested in such an institution? They do not want to attend seminars in order to be educated on how true democracy could flourish in the country.

This is my query, that I have a serious concern that if the Government lacks democracy, what type of democracy are we going to have in future?

With this I support the Motion.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member. Honourable Nujoma.

ACCESSION TO AMENDED STATUTES/ INTERNATIONAL IDEA HON NUJOMA / HON DR TJIRIANGE

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Thank you, Comrade Speaker and I would like to thank the Honourable Minister of Foreign Affairs for tabling the ratification of this International Institute of Democracy.

My question is, is this International Institute of Democracy subject to International Law like all the other international organisations, such as UNESCO and the others? Is it the norm for States to ratify treaties or statutes which are basically non-Governmental organisations by nature? I am confused as to what we are really going to ratify, because it appears that this Institute for Democracy is a non-Governmental organisation. If this Parliament ratifies it, it is going to be subjected to a non-Governmental organisation. I know agreements are entered into between States and Governments. This is my question to the Honourable Minister and I think we need more clarification before we agree to this.

HON SPEAKER: I am surprised Honourable Members, the Minister will answer, I do not know whether IDEA preceded our Independence, but if not, then it came into being shortly after our Independence. It is very well known to SWAPO, it is well known to the Republic of Namibia. I was the first Foreign Minister, serving twelve years, and the people who created it are very good friends of Namibia, children of Olaf Palme and who have had longstanding dealings with the Institution and for Honourable Members to confess publicly that this is the first time that they have heard about this makes for bad listening. Honourable Tjiriange.

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: Honourable Speaker, you have almost said what I wanted to say. My understanding is that we are actually already members of this body. We have been functioning since then, being members of this body. In the meantime there is an

183

12 June 2008

ACCESSION TO AMENDED STATUTES/ INTERNATIONAL IDEA HON KAAPANDA / HON KASINGO

Amendment to the Statute and this is what we are requested to agree to and adopt. Therefore, we are already there. In the meantime things have been approved, Amendments brought, and that is what is being asked from us to adopt.

Therefore, in the same vein as the Speaker, it seems as if we do not know this Institute, but we have been members all along. We are only asked to accept the Amendments to the Statute. I feel we do not have to waste time, whether we want the Amendments or not. I urge that we support the Amendments and move forward.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Kaapanda.

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. I should say that after hearing the Honourable senior Minister clarifying the position of the Namibia *vis-à-vis* the International Institute for Democracy, I am satisfied and I support the Motion.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Kasingo.

<u>HON KASINGO</u>: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. I also want to ask about this institution before I agree to it.

12 June 2008

ACCESSION TO AMENDED STATUTES/ INTERNATIONAL IDEA HON KASINGO

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: May I ask a question? Maybe the problem is that we are new in this Parliament. I do not know whether it was ratified before. That is why we are asking, we do not know.

If this Parliament has ratified the Statute and what is now being sought is an Amendment, then it is fine. However, we do not know whether it was ratified by this Parliament.

HON KASINGO: Honourable Member, I have to say I am as ignorant as many of us, apart from the few, and this necessitates that all of us need to be informed about such instruments. Whenever such instruments come for ratification in future, it should probably also go to the Standing Committee so that everybody could know.

Having said that, since Namibia is a Member State of the African Union and the African Union has developed guidelines for observing elections, I would like to know whether there is a seat in Stockholm for the African Union and are they also benefiting from us? The other member states who are not members of the African Union, are they also benefiting from our own guidelines?

Secondly, apart from the benefit of enriching the knowledge, if an election is held in Sweden or another European country, would you as a member be invited to go and observe elections in Europe or is it only Europeans who come and observe our elections here?

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Tjihuiko.

ACCESSION TO AMENDED STATUTES/ INTERNATIONAL IDEA HON TJIHUIKO

<u>HON TJIHUIKO</u>: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. Before I make my contribution, I wish to welcome back the Honourable Minister of Fisheries and Marine Resources. I really missed him.

Honourable Speaker, I am finding it a bit difficult to understand. Here we are requested to ratify the amended Statute and I wonder whether we have seen the original Statute. What is it that we are amending? Which chapters, which areas and why is there a need for the Amendment?

I was trying to listen carefully to the Minister's motivation and I could not see what is being amended and why. Perhaps that is my first question, Honourable Minister.

Secondly, I believe that given the misunderstanding within the Ruling Party, where the right hand does not know what the left hand is doing, to the extent that those who were supposed to advise us, such as the Deputy Minister of Justice, do not even know, it gives us the impression that we may not have been properly informed as to what is it that we are going to ratify. I do not know whether it would then be right for us to say yes, indeed, let us ratify it. We may end up ratifying something that we do not even know what it is. I do not think that we should be put under time pressure and be informed that the meeting will be sitting tomorrow, therefore I need to have an answer. We need to know more, we will ratify it in our time and then we will let them know.

We should not be pressured by time, they are sitting there, therefore we should ratify something we do not even know. If we can be provided with more information I would appreciate that and then we could ratify.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Venaani.

ACCESSION TO AMENDED STATUTES/ INTERNATIONAL IDEA HON VENAANI

HON VENAANI: Honourable Speaker, thank you very much. I would like to take the very same line. It is a matter I have raised a couple of times when we have acceded to various international agreements and instruments. What the other side of the isle has just demonstrated is a coordination of these international instruments. I believe that every key Ministry is the custodian of a certain instrument because it falls under their ambit, but under the structures of the country every agreement should be approved by the Ministry of Justice, who should look at its implications *vis-à-vis* the country's laws. As long as every Ministry is bringing its own international instruments without coordination with the Justice Department, we would have these kinds of arguments.

Of course, the Deputy Minister of Justice is right in that regard that when we agree to the Amendments it would have an effect on us, but it is also clear that we have already acceded to this body and it is just a matter of Amendments.

I just want to re-emphasise my earlier point that I have raised with the various international instruments that we acceded to, that we need an international instrument depository within Government, for one office to be able to know how many international instruments have we agreed to, their implications on our laws, their direct applicability to the country and so forth. What is lacking is this coordination and my point was proven today that there is a lack of coordination.

When the Colleagues are saying they do not have the instruments, I think it is fair for the House not to be seen as approving things that they do not know.

I would plead to the Honourable Minister of Foreign Affairs to allow time for these Amendments to be scrutinised by the Colleagues, so that the House, through the eyes of the public, can familiarise themselves with the consequences and the effects of the Amendments that are sought. I thank you.

ACCESSION TO AMENDED STATUTES/ INTERNATIONAL IDEA HON ULENGA

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member. Honourable Ulenga.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Speaker, I pressed my button basically also to say what the Honourable Tjihuiko was saying. At first, I thought it is a kind of a joke, but listening to so many speakers who seem to be confused about the issue, I think it is only right that we request the Minister to perhaps give information, not only to the House but also within the caucuses.

I remember last time before Mr Rukambe was replaced at the Electoral Commission of Namibia, it was publicly announced that he was taking up a post at IDEA in Sweden. That kind of information easily gets lost. Several of the workshops that Members of Parliament have attended with EISA in South Africa have been sponsored by IDEA, but I can see that somehow, somewhere that information had gone lost.

I do not remember exactly when endorsed the actual Statute. Perhaps it happened when I was not here or I did not pay enough attention. I think it is good that we ask the Minister to spread more information so that people know what they are doing.

I would therefore suggest that the Debate be adjourned until such time that the Honourable Minister could give us information. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: You are the last speaker on my list. If you do not adjourn the Debate, then I will give the Floor back to the Minister to reply.

ACCESSION TO AMENDED STATUTES/ INTERNATIONAL IDEA HON HAUSIKU

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Comrade Speaker, I will just make a few comments and of course, adjourn the Debate as Members have requested.

First on coordination, you know the main coordinating office for all international instruments that we ratify is the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and we do have every file. Secondly, Honourable Ulenga has indicated that he attended several seminars and workshops that were organised by the International IDEA and I am sure that all of you have been going to these meetings. Of course, that does not mean that you have accepted the principle.

Comrade Speaker, I want to react to specific questions. Comrade Minister of Fisheries, what is being amended is not the organisation, it is the Statute, the guiding principle document that stipulates the principles under which the institution works.

Secondly, this is not a Non-Governmental Organisation. In my statement, I said it is an Inter-Governmental Organisation. It is only Governments, which accede and become members to this organisation.

The other issue is that we should draw a distinction between guidelines on electoral principles and this organisation. This organisation is not about imposing or devising guidelines for electoral procedures, this organisation is about promoting through education, specifically of Parliamentarians like ourselves, the democratic principles and systems. As I have indicated, when there is a need in your Electoral Commission for training programmes in terms of democratic and building interaction between Political Parties, simply meant, Ruling Parties, Opposition Parties and otherwise, you can apply as a Member State that they send experts to guide and give you the necessary information as to how one can go about it.

Member States – yes, South Africa and Botswana are members and quite a number of African countries are members, but I will provide the list if need be. (Intervention)

ACCESSION TO AMENDED STATUTES/ INTERNATIONAL IDEA HON HAUSIKU

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Speaker, I just wanted to ask a tiny question to the Minister so that I can also understand the procedure. Honourable Minister, I just wanted to know, you were saying that the documents have been deposited with the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. When are these international agreements compared to our laws?

HON MINISTER OF FOREIGN AFFAIRS: Honourable Speaker, I cannot answer questions that are not relevant. I have been in Government for eighteen years and every legal document is scrutinised by the Ministry of Justice and Attorney-General. However, I am talking about the Ministries that are responsible for depositing and record taking; that is what I am talking about.

Comrade Speaker, the questions by Comrade Kasingo, Honourable Tjihuiko and Honourable Moongo, who continues to say SWAPO is undemocratic, will be answered when we are finally considering this.

I want to make it clear that I did not want to put the National Assembly under pressure. That is a misunderstanding. I will not put this House under pressure to approve and ratify the amended Statute. I was just doing my job and you must know that, as the Speaker has indicated, this is an old organisation and we must sometimes accept reality. When we went to Stockholm with the President a year ago, we went to this institution. After meeting them, we went to one of the institutions at the university and we were shown all the documents of our mediation. There is no need for us to be suspicious as if we are getting involved with institutions, which are not above board.

Comrade Speaker, having said that, I would like to adjourn the Debate on this Motion to the 8th of July 2008. Thank you.

HON SPEAKER: The discussion on this Motion stands adjourned until the 8th of July 20008. The third Notice of Motion is the one of the Honourable Ulenga. Does the Honourable Member Move the Motion? Who seconds? Any objection? Agreed to. Honourable Ulenga has the Floor.

MOTION ON MINING SECTOR

HON ULENGA: Honourable Speaker, thank you very much. I would like to start the motivation of this Motion by quoting Jim Wisely, an Englishman who said a very fundamental thing about the wealth of nations. He said: "The natural wealth of a country is the property of its people." It does not have to be said by an Englishman, it is such a straightforward, simple reality and truth.

Secondly, Honourable Speaker, I will quote a more familiar document: "Land, water and the natural resources below and above the surface of the land and in the continental shelf and within the territorial waters and the Exclusive Economic Zone of Namibia shall belong to the State if they are not otherwise lawfully owned." That is Article 100 of Namibia's Constitution.

The last quotation that I am citing in this regard goes as follows: "Secrecy, being an instrument of conspiracy, ought never to be the system of any regular Government." This, interestingly, I saw only the other day in the Namibian newspaper and it is a quotation from the works of Mr Jeremy Bentam who apparently was an American political scientist.

Mr Speaker, Namibian minerals and the mining activities have throughout our known history, been the backbone of our economy and our trade. Even before colonial occupation the local communities had gone out and had mined and traded amongst each other and with others in the minerals of this country. Of course, I am talking about the more sensible ones,

with diamonds, they played *onyune*, but with others such as copper and iron, they did proper economy.

Honourable Speaker, minerals have also been the lure that brought fortune hunters from distant shores to our country and some will even say the curse that has led to untold suffering at the hands of foreign fortuneseekers.

Such a situation exists especially in the diamond mining sector and has existed, where at the present moment, of course, the mighty national corporation called De Beers, headed by the Oppenheimers, had dominated the diamond mining scene for nearly a century.

Indeed, Honourable Speaker, this year, 2008, has been a hundred years since one Sacharias Lewala, who was actually Zack Legwaila, a Tswanaspeaking man, discovered the first diamond in the sand near Lüderitzbucht. Mr Lewala, I understand, was a railway operator but having had worked in Kimberley before he came to Namibia, had the sense of recognising a diamond from other shiny pebbles and so in 1908 Lewala picked up this wonderful stone near where Kolmanskop is now, the ghost town of Kolmanskop.

Some, because of this event, have been calling for celebration, but according to others, including myself and I am sure the Minister over there, there has not really been much to celebrate about as far as Namibians were concerned.

For many decades and for a mere pittance Namibians have crawled in the sand day in and day out, looking for diamonds which then made a fortune for foreign multi-national corporations, namely in this case the De Beers Corporation, Anglo American and of course their principal families.

Those Namibians who were "lucky" to be employed in the diamond mines had the devious luxury of apartheid slave labour conditions, of living in single-sex hostels or compounds with their very entrances and exits strictly controlled, without their families and earning, what Dr Kilinan yesterday evening called, at the event that you also attended, Mr Speaker,

earning pocket money, for indeed that is pocket money that workers have always earned either in the mining industry or anywhere else, especially during the apartheid days.

Unfortunately, Honourable Speaker, this exploitation continues to this very day. If you take NAMDEB workers, for example, they still continue to work for pocket money, because no employee can today live with his family, buy a house, put all the children through school, have medical aid and all the necessities of life with the kind of salary that NAMDEB offers a typical starter in Oranjemund today.

NAMDEB, as we all know, employs most of its workers on fixed term contracts. That means you work four months, then the contract is over, and then you come again for four months. This of course excuses the company from paying any pension, medical aid, etcetera, to their employees.

For many Namibians, Honourable Speaker, especially the people from the southern regions on the lands of whom the diamonds were discovered, the discovery of diamonds led to their lands being directly stolen through, for example, the proclamation of the so-called Sperrgebiet. We know that immediately diamonds were found with the help of Legwaila, the Government then, which was the German Imperial Government, declared an area of about 25,000 square kilometres, 350 kilometres in length and almost 100 kilometres in width as the Sperrgebiet, in other words, forbidden territory.

The people of especially the South were then condemned to a forgotten life of penury, that is extreme, abject poverty, not even permitted to stand on the outside and peer through the fence.

Not a single instance, as we speak today, of corporate social investment has occurred, especially in the Karas or Hardap Regions, as far as we know. No school, no hospital, no road, no kindergarten, no old age home, no social plan, nothing, zero! Honourable Speaker, going back to this quotation that I made at the beginning, how then is it to be understood and how does it apply to our

reality, namely that the natural wealth of a country is the property of its people?

Honourable Speaker, as we speak now, the company of NAMDEB is the country's largest single employer and today mining, especially diamond mining, is still the Namibian economy's backbone. However, as some of us have read from the media, it is only a short while longer and the remaining reserves will all have been exhausted. Soon the company, NAMDEB, which is owned fifty-fifty by Government and De Beers, will start with retrenchment exercises, which will eventually, when the mine closes, send everyone home to other Regions of Namibia and render Oranjemund another ghost town just like old Kolmanskop.

Honourable Speaker, it is my considered opinion and that of many Namibians that I have consulted, that our diamonds have not been in the past, nor are they now optimally applied in the economic interest of all Namibians to turn around our economy and to bring wealth and prosperity to our people.

Honourable Speaker, as we all know, the town of Oranjemund is a private farm of De Beers. It is almost a city the size of Windhoek – not really but getting there.

Everything, from its water to the buildings, the roads, the trees, and the sand beneath the people's feet, is De Beers' property. Of course, now you are saying NAMDEB even though I will talk about the reality of this fifty-fifty arrangement. It is run and controlled by the company.

A few years ago there was this wonderful idea that Oranjemund would be brought under civil democratic authorities like any other town in the country. What happened to this idea I do not know. I understand, Honourable Speaker, the manager that was employed by NAMDEB to look after this and to move the town closer towards Local Government, has now resigned and has not been replaced. I also understand there is a hasty activity of resignations from other managers as well.

Honourable Speaker, in the 1980s there was something called an Interim Administration in the country. It did not do much good. However, there is one thing that stands out from that period in our country's history and that is that in the early 1980s the then Interim Administration commissioned something called the Thirion Commission to look into the issue of over-mining in the diamond industry. Needless to say, Honourable Speaker, the Commission found overwhelming positive evidence, indicating that De Beers has been over-mining the reserves to the detriment of the future independent Government and the Nation to be born.

The present Government has not properly followed up the Thirion Report and I suggest that one of our tasks as overseers of the activities of the country that this report should be followed up.

Today, Honourable Speaker, many people, including those employed by NAMDEB and De Beers, believe that the fifty-fifty arrangement between Government and De Beers is a sham and that it is De Beers who continues to get the lion share of the benefits derived from our diamonds and the profits. It is further believed that over-mining has continued deep into the Independence period and that all production projects are controlled and continue to be controlled by De Beers and the South African expatriates. Neither in management, nor on the board do the Namibians have any real influence. The latest agreement between De Beers and Government was again concluded in total secrecy, as the first one before it and of course, that is where my secrecy quotation at the beginning also comes in.

Secrecy, Honourable Speaker, regarding matters of public interest, especially when it comes to public governance, should just be out. We hear of course, here and there, sometimes from the media that the present agreement extends to local Government cutting and polishing companies being able to access diamonds locally. I understand, for example, that about 16 percent of production goes for these local cutters and polishers. What is not clear and should be made understandable is 16 percent of what, because on the other hand I understand it is only 16 percent of a certain specific category of diamonds. When the real stones are found they do not even get into this category which includes the 16 percent.

It is a shame that even when these companies set up base here at home with the aim to target diamonds from Namibian shores, they were still forced to buy and source diamonds on the international market.

What was the sense of setting up base here if they had to go and buy diamonds in London and other places while those diamonds come from Namibia in the first place, when these companies can buy from a locally established Namibian Diamond Trading Company, NTDC?

Honourable Speaker, as Parliament, however, and through our relevant Parliamentary Standing Committees, it is high time that we get our hands into this issue. We need to carry out our proper oversight function of the mining industry, especially when it comes to diamonds.

Honourable Speaker, the multi-national corporation, De Beers, has gathered billions from Namibia's diamonds and supported in the past, as we know, the apartheid occupation of our country and the underdevelopment of our people. They profited more than handsomely from this. Over a century, they invested in and built up other countries. Go to London, go to Johannesburg and Cape Town if you want to know in painful detail, what I am talking about. However, they have invested exactly zero in Namibia, nor in Namibia, neither in the southern regions where the diamonds are mined, nor in the north where the labour has been sourced over almost a century, nor is there one single monument to the diamond industry.

My Colleague was quoting Mr Otto Shikongo earlier on when she was motivating the Motion on education. Mr Shikongo, the President of the Chamber of Mines, indeed as recently decried the lack of locally skilled people in the mining industry specifically.

For De Beers that means they have just been harvesting without planting. They have not ploughed back in terms of training artisans for the mining industry. It is indeed a shame that such a big company of international repute has totally ignored the training of local people and right now the Government is being blamed, also by Mr Shikongo, that the Government

is not processing the applications of foreign expert workers quickly enough so that they can be employed in the local mining industry.

The fact is these are the people who in the past ignored the training of Namibians. Of course, the processing of foreign applications must be hastened, but there must be an emphasis on the training with the assistance of these companies of locally skilled artisans, so that Namibia can have its own people. SWAPO has completely failed in doing this. (Interjections) Do not invite me to get into SWAPO, because I have so much to say. Let us talk about De Beers.

Honourable Speaker, Namibia has been holding up and carrying half the sky when it comes to international diamond production and the value and worth of diamonds. Everyone has heard of the fabulous gem quality of Namibia's diamonds. If you want to put that into simpler language, it simply means that they are the best in the world. De Beers, as we understand, uses these diamonds as the so-called sweeteners in the marketing of their entire multi-national product, the so-called mix.

The question is simple: When is Namibia as a country and as a people going to benefit from our natural resources, especially diamonds? That benefit should not happen tomorrow, it should happen today and Honourable Speaker, it is only if we as MPs can take a stand in this House as the Nation's elected representatives and demand that justice be done, and indeed take practical steps to ensure that the proper oversight work is carried out, that we as a Nation will succeed.

Therefore, it would not only be enough for us to debate this Motion here, it is indeed important that the relevant committee that deals with economics gets its hands into this whole sage and clears it up. I thank you, Honourable Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: I believe Honourable Ulenga did not intend to suggest that Mr Lewala was a foreigner.

197

12 June 2008

MOTION ON MINING SECTOR HON ULENGA

Tswana-speaking Namibians have been in the country, South West Africa/Namibia prior to 1904 and the railway industry in Namibia came first before the southern neighbouring country. Therefore, the name, Lewala, should not imply that he was a foreigner, Namibians have been working in Kimberley mines, so there was a Namibian who learned the skills there and when he came back, working on the railway, happened to be the one who found this diamond. Both the diamond mining was first in Namibia, railway industry was first in Namibia. He was a good Namibian, so Joel Lewala in Botswana should not think that we are talking about his uncle.

HON P MUSHELENGA: Honourable Speaker, before the adjournment of the House I wanted to seek the indulgence of Honourable Ulenga and of the House as Chairman of the Standing Committee on Economics, Natural Resources and Public Administration.

I listened attentively to Honourable Ulenga and actually, the Committee proactively started this process, we have already visited NAMDEB and all the issues that Honourable Ulenga mentioned. The Committee is already doing these things and it would be proper to wait for the Report.

HON SPEAKER: Why do you not adjourn the Debate and make a substantive statement?

HON P MUSHELENGA: I Move that the Debate be adjourned.

HON SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned until Tuesday, 17 June 2006.

<u>12 June 2008</u>

<u>HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:51 UNTIL 2008.06.17 AT 14:30</u>

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY ASSEMBLY CHAMBER 17 JUNE 2008 WINDHOEK

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Members, I would like to recognise the presence in the Speaker's Gallery, Honourable Ombudsman, Advocate Walters, accompanied by an outstanding team of our brightest in uniform. Welcome to the Assembly Chamber. The Ombudsman is engaging the uniformed staff of the Ministry of Safety and Security, but because of the oversight responsibility of the House and need to ensure accountability they are here and we recognise their presence.

Any Petitions? Any Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Honourable Minister Kaapanda.

TABLING: ANNUAL REPORT 2007: NAMIBIA POST LIMITED

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY: Mr Speaker, I lay upon the Table, Annual Report 2007 of Namibia Post Limited.

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Minister table the Report? Any further Reports and Papers? Any Notices of Questions? Honourable Moongo.

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS HON MOONGO

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS

-

QUESTION 64:

HON MOONGO: I give Notice that on Thursday, 26 June 2008, I shall ask the Honourable Minister of Presidential Affairs the following:

- 1. Is it not high time to enforce Article 26(1) to tighten security to prevent further national disasters threatening the lives of Namibian farm owners?
- 2. What action will the Minister take to prevent killings, as Namibia lost many farmers, such as Krafft Michael and Sambiana in Dordabis, the Russian couple near Okahandja and the lives of tourists near Windhoek and Wilhelmina Nangula Shafa near Oshakati lost his life and eight family members lost their lives at Kareeboomsvloer near Rehoboth?
- 3. Can the Namibian Government uphold, defend and provide law and order as stipulated in Article 115 of the Constitution? Can the Minister of Presidential Affairs explain the future security of farm owners and national security in general?

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Member table the Questions? Any further Notice of Questions? Any Notice of Motions? Honourable Mushelenga.

NOTICE OF MOTION HON P MUSHELENGA / HON VENAANI

LEAVE OF ABSENCE

HON P MUSHELENGA: Honourable Speaker, I Move without notice that leave of absence due to official business be granted to Honourable Clara Bohitile until the 30th of June 2008. I so Move.

<u>HON SPEAKER:</u> Will the Honourable Member table the Motion. Honourable Venaani.

HON VENAANI: I give Notice that on Tuesday, 1 July 2008, I shall Move –

That this Assembly debates a proposal for the Windhoek Municipality, in a bid to resuscitate its ailing bus services, to introduce a Windhoek school bus service. This is an attempt to ease the pressure on parents that are heavily affected by high oil prices for paying back and forth for their school-going children. To collectively share the cost of a bus service will help to mitigate the high oil cost.

I shall further move that this proposal be referred to the Standing Committee on Human Resources for further consultation. I so Move.

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Member table the Motion? Any further Notice of Motions? Any Ministerial Statements? The Notice of Motion is the one of the Honourable Minister of Safety and Security. Does the Honourable Minister Move the Motion? Who seconds? Any objection? Agreed to. The Honourable Minister has the Floor.

MOTION ON NAMIBIAN POLICE AND PRISON SERVICES

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, before I Move this Motion in this august House, I would like to inform the Honourable Members that I was overwhelmed by the information that I got to provide to the Honourable Members, but due to limited time I decided to mention a few things that could give you a clue of the things that the Police and Prison Services are facing in the country today.

Should there be Honourable Members misbehaving like Honourable Moongo, arrangements have been made to take care of issues like that in advance.

Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members, a month ago when I introduced my Ministry's Vote in this Honourable House, you asked many questions, which I informed you I would answer later after I had visited the Regions and familiarised myself on the conditions on the ground.

I have so far visited seven Regions and what I saw what prevailed there was almost similar in every place that I have visited. They differ only in the magnitude of their appearance.

You asked me about the size of the establishment of the Police and Prison Services, their accommodation needs, timely supply of uniforms, availability of official transport for duties, suitable equipment for

communication purposes, why they are operating in dilapidated Police Stations. Why do they need to be there where they are? Why could more Police Stations and posts not be established, why do they respond to scenes of crime very late after reported, what is the level of their remuneration and what does their general wellbeing look like? Those were some of the questions that the Honourable Members have asked me.

I would, therefore like to give you a synopsis of the multitude of problems the Police and Prison Services personnel are facing today. I want to make it very clear at the beginning, that by doing so I am not apportioning any blame or pointing any finger at anybody, because these services that are being provided by the men and women in uniform belong to all of us, particularly Members of this august House. If this were to be Budget time, Honourable Nora Schimming-Chase would have said, "we will not disagree with that Vote because that is our Vote." I am sure you have heard of the Tanganyika Group – that is how we support each other.

First of all, I would like to pay tribute to my predecessors who established and dealt with the many problems of the Police and Prison Services right from the beginning of our Independence in 1990. They are, His Excellency Hifikepunye Pohamba, His Excellency Sam Shafiishuna Nujoma, Honourable Jerry Ekandjo, Honourable Marco Hausiku, Honourable Rosalia Nghidinwa, Honourable Andimba Toivo Ya Toivo, and last but not least, Honourable Peter Tshirumbu Tsheehama – the only Tshirumbu we have in SWAPO.

The establishment of the Namibian Police and Prison Services is drawn from the Constitution of Namibia.

The mission of the Police, among others, is to combat all kinds of crime in partnership with the community and other law enforcement agencies. It also has to strive for continued provision of an efficient and effective Police service to the public in order to maintain peace and stability, thereby contributing to an environment conducive to social and economic development.

It further pledges for respect of individual human rights, without compromising it in the upholding of the tenets of law and order, safety and security of all persons residing in the Republic of Namibia.

The Prison Service is, indeed an integral part of the entire Namibian criminal justice system. Its mission, among others, is to provide protection to those who find themselves at the wrong end of the law, by providing reasonable, safe, secure custody and keep them in humane prisons in accordance with universally accepted standards, while assisting the offenders in their rehabilitation, reformation and social integration as acceptable law-abiding citizens.

The size of the Police to date is 10,700, of which 480 members are civilian components. The rest are made up of members of the Special Field Force Division, detectives and uniformed personnel. The required number that is suitable to serve the current population of Namibia is 16,842. If we were to reach this number, the Ministry must train more than 1,000 police recruits every year. Unfortunately, resources are not always available to do so because we all know the country has too many competing needs and as a result, we can only train 300 recruits per year. Lack of funds is, therefore, a problem for all sectors of our economic development and not only peculiar to the Ministry of Safety and Security.

Therefore, if we continue to train only 300 recruits per year, it would be difficult for us to replace those policemen and women who are leaving the Force for greener pastures, resigning, retiring or passing on. We can thus not train sufficient members to meet the number of those leaving the Force.

The current number of the Prison Service is 1,586. The appropriate number to serve the Prison Service is 2,500. If we were to reach this number, it would require that we train more than 300 new recruits per year.

Honourable Members should take note that half of the members of those two services together are made up of people appointed under the Peace Project. These members are ex-combatants and Namibians taken from

other Ministries who were then taken in these services by political directives.

It is important to note that except for remuneration of those members, no other provision was made available to accompany their appointment.

It was also not possible to work out modalities to ensure all required provisions, such as accommodation, transport, communication equipment, uniforms and so forth for their integration. In any case, in spite of these problems, those political directives served the country well by integrating our compatriots. While we have achieved so much so far, these services now need to be professionalised to bring them to the required professional level of expectation. These are some of the activities and consultations that I will undertake with other stakeholders in order for us to move forward.

Accommodation for the Police and Prison Services leaves much to be desired. There is a severe shortage of accommodation in terms of offices, Police Stations, holding cells and prison buildings. The holding cells for women and juveniles in Windhoek, in particular, are not the types we should be proud of and when I visited them, I thought we could definitely do better. I have consulted some of my Colleagues and we may have to go the extra mile to see what could be done in that respect.

There are no adequate quarters for married couples and no barracks for single members. A pathetic situation is experienced particularly among the Special Field Force Members who are today deployed at the border posts. They are living in dilapidated tents and the then UN makeshift caravans. In fact, some members of the two forces, even here in Windhoek, are sleeping in shacks and *kambashus* around Katutura and Brakwater Mixed Camp. Some offices and houses are not even safe.

The transport requirements in the two Services are pathetic and very, very old. Some of those vehicles have already clocked 650,000 kilometres and are very often in garages. Resources are not available for them to be replaced speedily. Some organisations like Rössing Uranium, the Motor

Vehicle Accident Fund, the Uhlenhorst Farmers Association have donated vehicles to the Police.

In that vein, I would like to humbly appeal to other businesses and individuals at large to donate vehicles, three-wheel motor cycles for border patrol and two-way radios and computers for the Police and Prison Services.

A minimum ideal situation for the smooth operations of these two Services would be to reach at least a 90 percent mobility rate and 95 percent satisfaction in terms of personnel recruitment to respond to crime incidents.

Very often members of the community are very angry because Police arrive very late at scenes of crime, but the truth is that there is no mobility.

The hygienic conditions of the Police holding cells and the prisons leave much to be desired because of the lack of sufficient funds to buy cleaning materials. Funds are not enough to buy equipment for road blocks and other necessary items needed, such as hard-skin vehicles, search and rescue equipment, scene of crime equipment, specialised snuffer dogs, to mention but a few.

In this respect, Honourable Members, the information was provided to this Honourable House in the Report of the Ombudsman when he visited the Regions. I am sure you have copies and you can refresh your memories about it. These dogs are very important but very costly. I am told they cost up to N\$80,000 and in addition, you must have funds for their veterinary attention. Honourable Members, these and others are really matters we need to pay attention to at an appropriate time.

The salaries of the Police and Prison Services are some of the lowest in the Public Service. Comparing salaries of some of the services where the Police resign and go to, for example the recently established Anti-Corruption Commission indicates a huge difference in the salary margins. I feel a serious review of the salary structure of the two services is warranted. In my view, that is long overdue. I cannot understand that in

the same Public Service the salaries of the Anti-Corruption personnel, particularly in the case of the Police, are double that of the normal national Police. They are not doing extra work not done by the Force they are coming from. Why does the Public Service Commission have a structure, which is far better for others in the same Government? I understand the difference between the national Police and the municipality, because the Municipality is autonomous, but I have difficulties to understand the one of the Anti-Corruption Commission.

Prison buildings and Police cells: The scope of the Prison Services is stretched to thirteen prison institutions in the country. However, the number of prison buildings is not yet sufficient. For example, half of the population of Namibia residing in Omusati, Oshana, Ohangwena and half of Oshikoto are served by only one prison at Oluno. Most of these institutions are old and do not meet the minimum international standard requirements regarding shelter and hygiene. Some of them are no more economic viable for renovation.

To address the present overcrowding in police cells and prisons, additional prison buildings and new police holding cells have to be constructed. Currently the overcrowding is caused because some of these cases stay long in the Police cells due to the fact that it takes a long time to investigate the cases. In some cases, the relatives cannot afford to pay bail. When Legal Aid has been requested to provide lawyers, it takes a long time for an answer to be given. I have for example, found people in the Police cells who have been waiting more than a year for an answer and that is the situation we have today. Therefore, when those types of cases are added one after the other, the cells become overcrowded, filthy and the conditions are unbearable. We must do something in this respect.

The present situation of overcrowding could be addressed if the whole criminal justice system works together. We need to have permanent Magistrates appointed to all Courts, including the smaller ones. People stay in the Police cells for two months because the Magistrate is not available. It is very important to introduce an effective community service for offenders. A school for juvenile offenders must be completed and additional rehabilitation centres must be constructed. Specialised services,

for example, social workers, psychologists, doctors and the clergy must be looked into.

Common crimes in Namibia: Generally, crimes are increasing in Namibia. A comparison is as follows:

Namibia: 260 per 100,000 for a population of 1.8 million.
Lesotho: 120 per 100,000 for a population of 2 million.
Zambia: 140 per 100,000 for a population of 9 million.
Zimbabwe: 165 per 100,000 for a population of 11.9 million.
135 per 100,000 for a population of 33.5 million.

Something must be wrong with Namibia, we always top.

Most of these incarcerated offenders are those with less serious offences who could as well benefit from the Community Service Orders.

Persons who are in police cells and prisons are between the ages of 19 and 35 years. Common crimes that are committed in Namibia include assault, shoplifting, *crimen injuria*, stock theft, housebreaking, grievous bodily harm, knifing, rape, including gang rape, murder and crimes related to drug abuse and alcohol.

In fact, in Namibia some shebeens are open 24 hours per day, with people drinking and committing crimes afterwards. These people must strike a balance between trade profits and escalating crimes in the country.

There are 118,000 firearms in the hands of the public. In addition, there are those unlicensed guns in the hands of the public. On the other hand, between 600 and 700 new licences are being applied for per month and the question is, what are these firearms going to be used for? Something must be wrong in Namibia.

Recently, more and more attention is being paid to corrupt crimes as opposed to other crimes. Corruption must be fought at all levels, but the fight against common crimes must not be left in the closet because they are the ones that are today running out of control.

Issues of money laundering are becoming a worrisome development in Namibia. There are owners of businesses that do not have banking accounts in this country, yet they are caught with foreign currency being taken out of the country. Honourable Members, that is nothing else but economic sabotage of our country.

I want to thank the Community Volunteer Services and Police Reservists, particularly farmers who are fighting crimes together with the police. Much more can be done in that respect.

There are, of course, special needs for the police in terms of human resources and equipment. The Police urgently need specialised training and supply of specific equipment.

Due to the FIFA World Cup tournament in South Africa and the CAF African Cup of Nations in Angola, both in 2010, it is likely that those two events could attract criminals to this part of the world, including Namibia. Such crimes could include money laundering, kidnapping, terrorism and others. The fight the next waves of terrorism, we will need specialised training, including the supply of critical identified equipment from countries and peoples of good will at home and abroad.

Now I am proposing a way forward:

To address these problems and others, there is a need, amongst others, to provide sufficient financial resources to recruit the required human resources and to introduce an appropriate remuneration structure that includes danger allowances for the Police and Prison Service personnel. There is a need to provide acceptable accommodation, to make available adequate transport, to continuously supply uniforms and other supplies, to supply specialised communication equipment and to urgently provide specialised training.

Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members, at the end of my explanation I would like to thank my Deputy Minister, Special Adviser, Permanent Secretary and all staff members of my Ministry. At the same time, I strongly condemn the few Police and Prison Services personnel who are

17 June 2008 MOTION ON POLICE AND PRISON SERVICES HON DE WAAL

taking bribes and in doing so, are tarnishing the name of their respective Forces. Shame on them!

To the thousands of men and women in uniform who are doing their job very diligently I must say, you are doing a noble task and providing the country with hope. Their commitment and dedication to their duties make us proud. To them I say, continue to excel!

Honourable Members, I am saying all these things because this is our motion and this House has an overseeing function of what Government is doing. Therefore, I am requesting this Honourable House to take note of the information provided. Comrade Speaker, I beg to Move. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Minister.

HON DE WAAL: Honourable Minister, you have mentioned the sniffer dogs which are very expensive, have you ever tried to speak to the kennel clubs in Windhoek specifically, because there are a number of people who would be very willing to assist the Police in training these dogs. You can buy an Alsatian, a Spaniel, a Labrador for maybe N\$500 to a N\$1,000. It is not the dog that is expensive, it is the trainer.

Can I not help you to contact the kennel clubs and get some people free of charge to train the dog handlers and the dogs, because it will be much less than what you have told us?

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Honourable De Waal has given very useful information. If the Police are not already to do that, that information will be taken up seriously.

17 June 2008 MOTION ON POLICE AND PRISON SERVICES HON DR TJIRIANGE / HON SCHIMMING-CHASE

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: Comrade Speaker, many members in the Police Force and Prison Service are going to qualify as veterans of the liberation struggle and I am saying this with confidence, because we had the Peace Project, which you referred to, of which the idea was to incorporate these people into these Services. I can say without hesitation and quite a number of them will qualify as veterans of the liberation struggle.

Therefore, there are many things that the Ministry of Safety and Security and the Ministry of Veterans Affairs can do to address the plight of the two forces and improve upon the lot of these people. I am not going to state here as to what programmes may be appropriate for them, but as we have been contacting each other on many occasions, we shall articulate these programmes and see how best the Ministry of Veterans Affairs can also be engaged in addressing the plight of these honourable members of the Force.

I have been engaging the Ministry of Safety and Security since the inception of the Ministry of Veterans Affairs and this engagement will be continued and intensified so that we can solve many of the problems together. I believe that many members of the Police Force and the Prison Service are legally employed by the Ministry of Safety and Security but they are the constituency of the Ministry of Veterans Affairs and I think we can work together.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Minister for his contribution. Honourable Nora Schimming-Chase.

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. Honourable Speaker, I would like to commend the Minister for the open way in which he spoke without fear or favour. Even in summary, the

17 June 2008 MOTION ON POLICE AND PRISON SERVICES HON SCHIMMING-CHASE

Honourable Minister has raised very serious questions and I would like leave my Opposition jacket and to put on my jacket as a Member of the Standing Committee of Foreign Affairs, Defence and Security for the past nine years. There is not a prison or a police cell in this country that we have not visited, our Reports are here, and everything that the Honourable Minister is speaking about is what we have seen.

I venture to say in all honesty, that some of our Police and border post members live in hovels that none of us would be prepared to live in. If we thank them and praise them, we have to say there is something special about the Namibian people that allow people to make those sacrifices and continue making it year after year. In other African countries, the reaction would have been different, so we have to commend our people.

Honourable Minister, I am very happy that you have raised the question of professionalism, because without us making that a priority, we are not going to get the type of service that we want and after eighteen years of Independence, I am convinced that we can get people who can be trained and become professionals at their level.

I have spoken about the infrastructure, but in all our praise, we also have to be honest. In our report to this House, we mentioned Police cells and Prisons and Police offices where there is not a single car which is in a running condition.

HON SPEAKER: The House will rise for refreshments. Honourable Schimming-Chase will continue.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:40 HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:15 PURSUANT TO ADJOURNMENT

213

17 June 2008 MOTION ON POLICE AND PRISON SERVICES HON SCHIMMING-CHASE

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: Honourable Speaker, I was saying that whilst we found police stations where there is not a single car in working order.

We also found a few police stations where every car was in order, but it was in working order simply because of the discipline that was used in order to ensure that people take care. We must start thinking that renovation is much cheaper than buying new and it does not help putting money aside to buy new cars if within six months those cars would again be off the road.

The mobility rate is very important and I support the Honourable Minister in everything he said, because all of that is contained in the recommendations that are coming from the Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Security.

I know the next question is going to be, "but where is the money going to come from?" Maybe we must consider this for an additional Budget. However, let me make another suggestion, which was also made by some of the youth members talking on radio this morning: Why must we spend N\$8 million on a museum? Why do we not use State House, which also reflects the history of depression by both the Germans and the Apartheid regime? Why do we not make a museum of State House, take that money, and start improving the lot of the police officers and the border guards? I think the time has come for us to prioritise because the national cake is not getting bigger.

HON SPEAKER: By State House you mean the new State House or the old one that will soon be vacated?

214

17 June 2008 MOTION ON POLICE AND PRISON SERVICES HON NUJOMA

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: Honourable Speaker, I mean the old one, I cannot say the new State House reflects the oppression of the Germans and the Apartheid regime. The old State House will be empty as soon as the President moves.

HON SPEAKER: There are other uses for it.

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: I am suggesting those uses, because I am suggesting that at this point, giving the Police and Prison officials better living conditions is a greater priority than a museum. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member for her contribution. Honourable Nujoma.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Comrade Speaker, I would like to join the others in commending the Honourable Member for his Motion on the need for human resource development and other related matters of the Namibian Police and Prison Services. I agree with the Honourable Minister that we are facing tremendous challenges with regard to human resource development of our national Police and Prison Services. The prisons are overcrowded, we have read the Ombudsman's Report, we have the Report of the Parliamentary Committee on the conditions of our Police and these matters need to be addressed as a matter of urgency.

17 June 2008 MOTION ON POLICE AND PRISON SERVICES HON NUJOMA

Again, the whole issue comes back to the issue of resources and the cake is getting smaller and smaller. We are facing so many other challenges, such as drought and floods, the HIV pandemic, etcetera.

HON VILJOEN: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable Mr Uutoni Nujoma, we are aware of the fact that the Police can be as effective as any other Police Force in the world, but if there is a problem with our court system, why is it not possible to train enough magistrates and appoint them permanently to solve the problem in the country?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Yes, the problem is that we are a developing Nation and as the Minister motivated, he wants to build our human resource capacity and this cuts across all institutions, whether the magistrates, the legal advisors, the Anti-Corruption Commission. We have a serious lack of human resource capacity and that is what we need to develop.

Unfortunately the Apartheid Regime did not train our people, the courts were manned by white magistrates, the Police were white and a few blacks who were used as informers. Now we have to embark upon that process and it is a process, which needs a lot of resources.

That was however not the issue I wanted to raise. I wanted to ask the Honourable Minister about the increasing crime rate in the country. Recently there has been a spate of burglaries of Government buildings, Offices and Agencies and I was one of the victims. My office was broken into, computers and everything was removed and my concern is that up to this day I have not received any feedback as to what has transpired, what has happened. Where are the Police with the investigation? It is not only the Ministry of Justice but also at the Magistrate's Courts themselves

where we had court records stolen and this is of serious concern. I only wanted to know from the Honourable Minister whether he would be able to follow up on these matters and inform us as concerned citizens. I do not know whether the burglary at my office was politically motivated by RDP or CoD, but I will not go to that extent.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Deputy Minister, stick to what you were saying.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Honourable Minister, as I said earlier...(Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: May I ask the Honourable Deputy Minister a question, please? Honourable Deputy Minister, I cannot agree with you more that we have limited resources. Are you aware that there is a word called 'priority?' Secondly, being the Deputy Minister of Justice, have you seen the Report by the Standing Committee on Security on the visits to prisons of December 2002 in which one of the recommendations says: "The delay in trials should be eliminated since it is unfair to have people awaiting trial for more than six months to a year as it has been observed in the different Police Stations"? What has happened to this if you are aware of it?

-

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: This question keeps on coming up but let me assure you that the root cause for the delay of trials

is because there is a combination of factors involved. It is the Police, it is the Ministry of Justice and the defence lawyers. Sometimes they double-book cases and then they ask the Magistrate to postpone the case. It is a combination of factors and we cannot only blame the Police or the Ministry of Justice. We can also not blame the private sector, which also contribute to these delays. However, this is not unique to Namibia. I have travelled to certain countries where it is even worse.

Just to give you an example of Guantanamo Bay where the prisoners are kept by the American forces and up to this day there has been no trial. At least in Namibia we try. Therefore, it is not unique to Namibia, this is a problem of the whole execution of the Administration of Justice but we try to manage with the little resources we have. Countries with big resources do not even manage. Can you imagine people sitting in Guantanamo Bay for six years without a single trial? That is what they call justice. Thank you, Honourable Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Deputy Minister. Honourable Mbai.

HON MBAI: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. As usual, I will be very brief. I rise to make a very brief contribution and to appreciate the other Colleagues that would like to postpone the Debate until a later stage.

Honourable Minister, I think we have demonstrated our trust and confidence in the Minister by approving the Budget allocated to the said Ministry even in the absence of such a well-motivated speech. I also have confidence that the Minister will in his way forward try his utmost best to implement the Community Volunteer Service.

At one stage when I was a Councillor in the Otjozondjupa Region we were invited to encourage the establishment of Police Reservists. (Interjection) It is very different from the Epango, which was established a few years ago. There was so much support for the establishment of the Police Reservists, but unfortunately, it did not come off the ground in some areas.

I would, therefore, like to encourage the Minister to go ahead with the establishment of Police Reservists, particularly in the farming areas.

I would also like to come to Honourable Uutoni Nujoma and mention the inauguration of Community Courts. I believe this could also support the Police.

This is my contribution in support of the Police and Prison Services which are always talked about and which have been overdue for a long time. I believe that the Minister, after good consultations and after we have approved the Budget, has the structures and funds to put these things in place.

HON SPEAKER: I thank Honourable Mbai for his contribution. Honourable Nambahu.

HON NAMBAHU: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. I would like to join other Members who have commended the Minister for a well-articulated exposé.

This Debate really boils down to one issue, namely the issue of resources and it is important that we find these resources. It is important in the sense that when you go around in this country and South Africa and talk about some of these programmes, someone would ask, how is it possible for countries with huge resources like yours to have problems like these?

17 June 2008 MOTION ON POLICE AND PRISON SERVICES HON DR AMWEELO

When it comes from a senior Minister, it is maybe worth posing some of the following questions:

How far have we applied the concept of sovereignty over our natural resources in order for us to derive the maximum benefits for the people who share and cohabitate the space where those natural resources are? Have we made a tabulation that we are getting this much from tourism, without actually saying how much from eco-tourism, how much from other sources. People are always asking us how much are we getting from mining and is it not time for us to draw up a table, that from diamonds we are getting this much, from uranium this much, from copper this much, from zinc this much. Otherwise, it will not make a good defence for us to always say there are no resources.

When we say there are no resources, we are only looking at one area, namely spreading the tax-base and only look at the revenue from tax collection, but what are the benefits from other resources? Until we answer some of these questions and apply our minds to some of the modern concepts where people are asking, "what are we doing with the resources of Namibia to benefit each and every one of us", I do not see us solving the problems such as the one we are discussing. I am inviting this country and all of us as Members of this House to apply our minds in this kind of direction. Unless that is answered I do not see the Debate going anywhere. Thank you very much.

HON SPEAKER: I thank you very much. Honourable Amweelo.

HON DR AMWEELO: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker, I also rise to support the very good Motion motivated by Dr Iyambo. I only wish to mention a few points.

Namibia is a very big country and our Police cannot manage with the transport at their disposal. If anything happens in Dordabis and they do not have transport, then they cannot go attend to that. I therefore support the Minister when he says that transport to support the Police is very, very important.

I also want to advise the Minister by saying that with the rising price of petrol, we need to fix the vehicles, one tank for petrol, the other tank for gas, so that our Police can travel long distances.

It is also very important that the Police have the necessary equipment to identify and control crime, and not only crime, but traffic accidents where they need equipment, such as radar and cameras for those who are speeding.

The Minister also mentioned that we need to strengthen the capacity of our Police, which is very important. In addition, if there is not good accommodation, bad sanitation will follow and we really have to provide accommodation with good sanitation.

With these few words, I support the Motion by Honourable Iyambo.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Minister for his contribution. Honourable Kazenambo.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: I will be as brief as possible. Coming to the Motion, let me say I most sincerely support this people's Motion and I want to make my contribution based on my personal observations, personal encounters and try to put into perspective the environment in which the Police Force is expected to

operate. I want to link this to the question of resources and

that which Honourable Mbai mentioned, namely Reservist Units or Community Police.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I am not aware of any country across the globe which would say that they have enough resources. All countries, all Governments, even countries like Switzerland would tell you that they have problems with resources and the subject of resources needs to be conceptualised and put into perspective. Are we talking about limitations on monetary resources? Are we talking about material resources? Are we talking about human resources or are we talking about lack of mannerism and even lack of cooperation, because if there is no cooperation, you may have plenty of resources but you will not achieve your objectives and goals.

Therefore, having said that, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I cannot agree more with what the Honourable Minister has said and with the observation made by Honourable Nora Schimming-Chase about accommodation and conditions or service of our Police officers. When you visit those places, you want to close your eyes and leave the scene as soon as possible. That is the reality outside there. If we want to deny that, we are not honest with ourselves because then we are falling into the same trap as people who hate to see the Police, but when they are in the trouble to ask, "where are the Police, what are the Police doing?" We cannot deny the pathetic conditions in which the majority of our Police officers find themselves, especially in the remote areas.

Those of us who are talking about resources should not only point a finger at Government alone, the entire society should do more to appreciate our Police, prison officials and even the army. We need to develop a positive attitude towards these men and women who find themselves in uniform, because sometimes our attitude is not as appreciative as it ought to be.

I can give you a classical example why I say all of us as society and not only Government need to appreciate account and assist the Police. If you go to Katwitwi Border Post, our Police officers there have no access to electricity and I am not saying this to blame the Ministry of Safety and Security, but maybe the Ministry of Safety and Security will tell me that it

is lack of resources, but NamPower is providing electricity at Katwitwi and this is a classical example. Whom are they expecting to guard those poles, to guard those electric installations? It is painful that people who guard that Station 24 hour around the clock are the men and women in uniform and it means that you do not have a heart, the person is guarding your installations, but you cannot provide them with electricity even to cook. That is capitalism at its worst, to be honest. This has nothing to do with the Government, it is also our social responsibility as private sector, all of us, even private companies. You will find them driving their big high-powered cars and the Police are driving *skoroskoros*. Of course, I know these rich companies would say they are paying tax to the Government, but if you own a corporation and your co-partners have limitations, can you not help them? I mean, the people are addressing your problems, they are with you on the ground and why can you not assist them to achieve the goals?

That is why I am saying that the resources include cooperation and attitude towards one another in different services we are rendering to society. The society can equip them with radios, with cars, with money, etcetera. If the society they are policing is polluted rather than clean, their work would double or even triple because they are dealing with a multitude of problems.

In Gam the very same community at the border there insults the Police who are deployed. The people are loading their cattle and when they come there and the Police say this is border control so that the animals cannot pass. Tomorrow Veterinary Services say that your animals cannot be sold, then we, the members of the community, including myself, I throw my weight around, saying that I am a Deputy Minister, display how rich and powerful I am, how uneducated the Police are. That is the attitude they receive from us in terms of the tribe they belong to, the fact that they are not speaking Oxford English and so on. That is the problem of a society on the wrong footing. After I have done that, I would expect those very same Police whom I have left devastated to have a high morale.

Therefore, the Namibian society must address the plight of the Police in order for them to help us and live in a peaceful environment by changing our attitudes towards our men and women who are in uniform.

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Honourable Speaker, the Honourable Deputy Minister mentioned a place where some time back during my previous portfolio there was something that led me to go there. The story he has related, although not specific, of how the Police are sometimes referred to, which makes one not feel comfortable, the reference was that even if you speak to these people they do not understand what you say. They are saying they cannot even afford NHE houses. These references are obviously to people who are working and the nature in which they find themselves socially and it is not encouraging. I just thought that I could share that and I am sure that he has heard even more things. It is just to say the reference to the police and their capacity there is sometimes not really helpful to what they are doing as human beings.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: And that reference is not only confined to that area, it is a general observation across this country. Even in town here, they are called vulgar names and the society does not respect its Police, its armed forces. We must not see them as *kakunyas*, they are our people. They may have different backgrounds, but currently they are not protecting Pienaar, they are protecting us, they are protecting our children and our wealth while they are coming from those tents.

We say their uniform is not beautiful – cheap things, petty. However, it is not the Police who are at fault at Katutura, it is us from the bars. We drink at these bars, stab one another and afterwards condemn the Police that

they are not responding. The Namibian society must start behaving decently so that the environment they are policing could match their limited resources. While Government must prioritise its activities, the society must also prioritise its behaviour. With these few words I support the Motion.

<u>HON SPEAKER</u>: I thank the Honourable Deputy Minister. Honourable Moongo.

HON MOONGO: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. I would only like to put the record straight. As everybody knows, the DTA of Namibia has all the time been demanding the well-being of the Police and Defence as well as benefits and we have been saying that they are underpaid. I only want to thank the Minister that our dream was realised.

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable Vice-President of DTA, when are you going to hold a congress? Now you are monitoring the developments in Zimbabwe before holding your congress.

HON MOONGO: SWAPO advised the Zimbabweans and now they are in hot soup and they are now trying to advice the father Party, the DTA, in Namibia. It is impossible to be advised by you, we are mature enough.

17 June 2008 MOTION ON POLICE AND PRISON SERVICES HON TJIHUIKO

I was also disappointed during the course of the seventeen years that some Police officers collaborated with syndicates. As we have been saying, do not underpay the Police otherwise it will be dangerous. However, you have now realised that and I am happy that the Minister has come up with this Motion. I support the upliftment of the Police as we used to do it. I support the Motion.

<u>HON SPEAKER</u>: I thank the Honourable Member. Honourable Tijhuiko.

HON TJIHUIKO: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. Let me start by congratulating the Honourable Minister for the well-motivated statement. It is not only the statement but also the manner in which the statement captured the minds of those who really want to make a meaningful contribution to this Debate.

Honourable Speaker, I do not think that there is much to add to what the Minister has said.

I do not want to put pressure on the Honourable Minister of Finance by saying that there must be money for us to meet the demands before we know exactly what the Ministry needs.

Before we start talking about how much money we need to Budget for what the Minister has just put on the Table, we need to know exactly what it is that we want, how much money we need for us to be able to do exactly that and I think that is where we need to start.

Honourable Speaker, I was going through the Report by the same Committee of Security when they were looking at the state of our Defence Force and if you go through that Report, it was professionally done with a

17 June 2008 MOTION ON POLICE AND PRISON SERVICES HON TJIHUIKO

clear recommendation. If we go that way, we will be able to know exactly what the immediate needs of the Ministry are and what we can do tomorrow and that is where we need to start.

Honourable Speaker, with your permission, let me quote one of the recommendations from that Report and that is recommendation 12.3.7. This is the way that I want us to go: "The annual recurrent Budget given to the Ministry of Defence may not solve the problem being faced by the Defence Force. It is, therefore, being recommended that the Ministry of Defence submit to NPC its comprehensive development plan which should then be registered as a capital project by the National Planning Commission."

If we try to do it that way, then I think we will be able to put the Minister of Finance in a position to look at the needs of the Ministry in good time. I understand that there is a Budget Committee of Cabinet and they would be able to look for ways of cutting here and there so that we would be able to meet these requirements. There is no way I can sit comfortably in my house, hoping that everything is going to be fine, knowing that as I am sitting in this august House that my house is safe if we are not looking after our uniformed forces.

It is not criminal for us to be open and honest and say our uniformed forces are not properly looked after. I am not criticising anybody, but all of us, including myself, need to put our heads together. I think the best way for us to go about this is to follow the process that the Ministry of Defence has followed and try to do it that way and I am sure that the Honourable Minister of Finance will come up with magic and do something about it.

With these few comments, I support the Motion.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member for his statement. Honourable Dienda.

HON DIENDA: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. Honourable Speaker, I will first congratulate the Honourable Minister and thank him for the good Report. At least now, we can say what we wanted to say every day when we were told about cheap political points.

First of all, Honourable Speaker, performance appraisals: Honourable Minister, I was conducting a funeral of a person who was serving in your Ministry for 22 years. There were so many people singing hallelujah songs about the good worker this person was. After 22 years in the service, he was still a constable. What are your requirements for people to be promoted? At the end of the day we are not giving these people any hope to remain in the Force because they are not promoted. What are the requirements and why have people not been promoted after 22 years?

My second point is about salaries. Yes, the salaries are low, but are we only talking about salaries or are we talking about all the benefits like the housing scheme. People are getting a salary of **N\$800** per month and you cannot buy a house with such a salary, our Police officers are staying in shacks. What do we expect from them? This is why we are saying bribery is taking place within the Police Force, because their salaries are too low and another way of getting extra money is to do things the illegal way.

With regard to transport, the Police officers are working until 10 o'clock in the evening, there is no transport available, and with a salary of N \$800 a month, these people have to take a taxi. Therefore, at the end of the day it is also dangerous for our Police officers to work shifts and to move from their houses to the workplaces.

Then I have another problem on the Prison Services and I know that some Honourable Members will not agree with me. I feel the punishment the people got is already enough, but when you visit prisoners, you will find that most of them, especially the young ones, are being involved in sexual acts in prison. Whether we deny it or not, it is happening and there are no condoms available. When they are released, some of them have HIV/AIDS because they were not protected in the prison. How will we handle this matter?

Prisoners need to be protected within the prison itself. It is already enough to be sentenced to twenty years and now you are being sentenced with a disease called HIV/AIDS. (Intervention)

HON MOONGO: We put them in prison in order to punish them and not to lead a luxurious life with sex. Now you are informing us that they have sex there, which is prohibited.

HON DIENDA: I thought you were visiting the Prisons and now you are saying you did not know that people are having sex there. Honourable Moongo, just go to the Prisons and you will find out that people are sexually active and they need to be protected and we have to talk about how we will protect the inmates. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable Dienda, can you confirm from the Honourable Minister how they perform this sexuality in prison?

HON DIENDA: My dear, you people are saying you do not want to accept gays and lesbians in this country, but it started in prison. Therefore, you are thinking that men and men are not having sex, they are having sex in prison and that is where it starts. Women and women are having sex because they have needs and they will help each other with their needs. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: Honourable Speaker, I would like to come in on a Point of Order. Honourable Dienda was rightly saying that we as Africans and Christian people of Namibia do not want to promote same-sex relationships but on the other hand, you are contradicting yourself. If we now provide condoms, what message are we sending?

HON DIENDA: My dear, I am talking about reality, I am not talking about dreams. We are dreaming here that these things do not happen. Honourable Speaker, it is time for us to face reality in this country. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: May I ask Honourable Dienda a small question? Honourable Dienda, you talk about same-sex relationships and transmission of HIV/AIDS. I want to know how women transmit AIDS to one another.

<u>HON DIENDA</u>: Honourable Deputy Minister, I think we want to ignore the facts in this country. We do not want to talk about the things that we have to face in this country. There are certain things that we want to ignore. Ignoring gay and lesbian relationships will not help us, but talking about it will help us. If we are constantly saying...(Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: Honourable Dienda, I was a prisoner, myself and Honourable Ulenga were on Robben Island for 8 years and others who

have been in that prison for 20 years and we never had those things you want to promote here and we are still alive. We are alive and strong, we did not practise these homosexual things. How can you talk, as a Christian and you are always the one who wants to promote this? We are told by the Bible is why Sodom and Gomorra was destroyed, because of men and women who enter sexual relations? Those things are criminal and I was expecting Honourable Dienda to ask the Prison officers to make sure that these people are not allowed to do that and if they are found, they should be punished. That is what I want you to say, not to tell your child that if he goes to Prison he has to do that.

<u>HON DIENDA</u>: Honourable Speaker, I will not be intimidated, I will have my say.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Dienda is just a messenger. The message is not what we want to hear, but that is the message she is delivering. She is speaking of the existing realities.

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: On a Point of Information. Honourable Speaker, a few years ago this House received a Report of the African Union Commissioner for Prisons. She had visited prisons across the African continent. It is not a unique thing in Namibia, it is reported even in the United Nations that these things happen and the problem in our prisons is that the prisons are so full, the Police and the wardens are so few, they are unprotected and sometimes cannot even enter those cells. In addition, if anybody here wants to pretend that they have not heard of rapes in prison, then they are living on another planet. These things happen, it is a criminal act and by providing a condom, you are not encouraging it. By providing a condom, you do not allow a person, who has been punished for theft, to be given the death sentence. He will come

out of there infected with HIV/AIDS. It would be better for us to read what is happening in the world than to come here with narrow-minded ideas.

HON DIENDA: Honourable Speaker, the weak people in prisons are the ones being raped. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: On a Point of Information. I was privy to the Report of the African Commission on prison conditions in Namibia and there was no mention of the provision of condoms. It is not true. The Report even praised the prison conditions in Namibia as one of the best in Africa. The only remark that was made by the Commissioner was that we should improve the conditions of the pre-trial prisoners. But overall our prisons are first-class.

·----

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: On a Point of Information. I read the Report, the Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Security and that was the basis on which we decided to visit the prisons and we saw what was happening.

I did not say that the Report said we must provide condoms, I said the Report spoke about the conditions that make it possible for gang rapes in the privacy of the cell when the Police are not properly trained in order to go in there. Do not misquote me, read the Report.

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: She wants to misquote me.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Minister, please withdraw that.

<u>HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD</u> <u>WELFARE</u>: I withdraw, Honourable Speaker.

<u>HON DIENDA</u>: Honourable Speaker, I want to speak about special training and I do have a problem with the communication. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION:

May I ask the Honourable Member a small question and give some information? Are you aware that if you taste beer, you always want to drink it and if you dish out condoms in the prisons, it means you want them to do so, because sex is like alcohol, it is stimulating you to do so.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Members, we are national leaders, we are lawmakers and what we should be focusing on is not so much how one Honourable Member in his or her contribution phrase the problem. If any Honourable Member in this House has verifiable information that the things Honourable Dienda is saying are not factually true in Namibia, I

would want that Honourable Member to rise and to put that matter right and say that same-sex, as objectionable on religious grounds or on any other grounds, does not take place in Namibia. Can any Honourable Member rise and say yes, it does not happen in Namibia?

HON DIENDA: Honourable Speaker, I want to speak about communication in the Police. I am on communication, not on condoms. (Intervention)

HON KASINGO: I would like to put a question to Honourable Dienda. I was listening attentively to your statement and your argument on the need to provide condoms in prisons. This is not the first Debate on this matter, it also occurred some years back, but I have a dilemma. Even if what you state is information, that sexual relationships take place between men and men, female and female, are you also aware that we have a criminal offence called sodomy on our law books? Suppose you are the Minister of Prisons and you direct a certain director in your Ministry to distribute condoms, are you not going to be part of that criminal offence?

HON DIENDA: Honourable Speaker, then I think we have to implement that Act in the prison. I am on communication, Honourable Speaker. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: On a Point of Information. I would like to join Honourable Dienda by sharing her sentiments on the issue of the availability of condoms in

prisons. It would not take us as a society anywhere by playing ostrich politics, it will not take us anywhere by playing to the gallery. It will not take us anywhere by talking popular language, we need to face the reality of how the globe is evolving and then develop effective mechanisms to respond to the changing developments, some of them that are not to our liking. That is the reality of the world. I am joining her on this matter, the Ministry of Safety and Security need to consider how they will accommodate this matter.

Even couples who were married in church and who are not supposed to have extra-marital affairs, as well as teenagers are encouraged to have condoms. Rapes take place in prison and the availability of condoms does not mean that you are told you must have sex. Availability of condoms is not a passport to having sex. However, there are people in prison who are weak and my daughter or son may find himself in prison tomorrow.

If they are distributing condoms in schools, in churches and bars, it is because the condom is a protective measure to protect you in cases of certain actions. It is not a passport to have sex.

Therefore, I support Honourable Dienda that if we are not playing ostrich politics, condoms are for protection against a disease and if we have outdated and backward laws on our statute, we should address this versus the question of prisoners and weak prisoners, for that matter. I join and support her.

HON DIENDA: Thank you, Honourable Kazenambo. We are even distributing condoms to schoolchildren and there is nothing wrong with it. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: On a Point of Information. I know I will have the last say at the end of this Motion, but

let me give information at this point in time and I am not going to join the fight whether this or that, but just to indicate to you the efforts that the Ministry is making to try to overcome the overcrowding of the prison population.

Currently we have a place in Tsumeb where it is standard that four people stay in one cell. The next step, which is now in progress, is that that facility be continued to be extended to provide a condition where only two people stay in one cell. I hope when that is completed it is going to eliminate the overcrowding, which could lead to the things we are talking about here. However, what is happening right now is not consent for things to happen, it is a situation where there is no option. What I am saying is, it is a situation, which is there and we have to address it. We cannot violate our own law, but let us work to create conditions that might lead to what we want. Currently, unfortunately, there are problems, let us accept it.

<u>HON DIENDA</u>: Thank you, Honourable Minister. On communication...(Intervention)

HON RIRUAKO: I have to give this information. Last year or the year before, the prison wardens took a prisoner to his beloved girlfriend and this did happen, we discussed it here. It is not a matter that they must not be given condoms, they take them out to take care of themselves and they bring them back to prison. They are going to bring the disease from outside. The wardens take them to their girlfriends and they come back to prison. The other things you mentioned here are just secondary and the Minister concerned knows about this. That is why condoms must be available because they take them outside the prison to have sexual intercourse with people outside.

236

<u>HON DIENDA</u>: Honourable Speaker, on communication, I think we have a problem when it comes to Police centres here, when one wants to lay a charge, the communication between you and the Police officer. Some of us do not understand the English we have adopted here. (Intervention)

HON DR AMWEELO: On a Point of Information. Comrade Speaker, I want to tell my Colleague that the distribution of condoms in prisons is not important.

<u>HON SPEAKER:</u> The responsible Minister tried to clarify the situation. We have moved on from condoms.

HON DR AMWEELO: No, I just want to give some information.

HON SPEAKER: Not on condoms.

HON DR AMWEELO: Not really condoms, but I want to say that before we talk about PPE, we have to check the source, identify the source. If we failed to protect the source, we try to protect the spreading of the disease along the way. We give information and now the last resort is PPE, which is personal protective equipment, the last resort. We must

first think about the two methods, the source, information dissemination along the way and then the last resort is PPE.

HON DIENDA: Honourable Speaker, I was saying that I think we need some translators at the Police Stations. Sometimes when we are laying charges and there is nobody who can translate what we want to say and when you come to court, you will realise that the statement is not what you have said. Because of English there is misunderstanding and the message does not get through as intended. I would like to urge the Minister of Prisons to bring in translators at our Police Stations or to send those Damara/Nama-speaking Police officers to the Karas Region so that they can communicate with the people there. I support the Motion. Thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member for her contribution. Honourable Ulenga.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Speaker, I did stand up earlier on, proposing the adjournment of the Debate to Thursday. However, at the time when the Debate was so heated with regard to what Honourable Dienda was saying about condoms and especially because somebody mentioned my name, I thought perhaps I should actually stand up and talk right now. However, I think some of the issues have been cleared but still I can stand up and talk on the Motion right now because I think it is such a hands-on Motion that it does not actually need too much research.

Honourable Speaker, when I heard that the Honourable Minister was going to move this Motion, I was going back and forth. On the one hand, I was feeling it is such a wonderful thing that the Minister is going to talk

about this issue. It has never come from a Member of Cabinet before. I thought, does it mean that we are now going to have a situation where the reality has at last been noticed and realised?

Honourable Speaker, however, I also thought it sounds like tongue-incheek, because what is the Minister going to say that has not been said about conditions in our safety installations and institutions, including Police and Prisons? However, I must commend the Minister that finally a Member of Government is acknowledging the entire situation that is facing this country and this society with regard to the infrastructure, but also the human resource situation and other resources with regard to Prisons and Police.

Therefore, let me briefly talk about attitude. The attitude of Government until now, unfortunately, has been that of ostrich politics and I am not going to talk about sex and condoms that excite you so much.

A few years ago, I stood up here after Honourable Nora Schimming-Chase and I visited this prison. This is a hotel that I visited in 1973 when it was brand-new. That place is as big as the new State House and most probably would cost the same if you had to rebuild it. Most probably, it would cost N\$1 billion just like the new State House. I was shocked to find that when it was raining, the prisoners had to huddle in a corner because the water was seeping through the ceiling. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: May I ask the Honourable Member a question?

Honourable Ulenga, you say you brought this issue up before and I remember that I asked you a question, because you also brought the question of condoms. We have been on Robben Island for many years but we never used those things. Do you remember that I asked you the same question that time to which you are referring now?

239

HON ULENGA: Honourable Speaker, I thought the issue of the condoms has been resolved, but on the other hand...(Intervention)

HON RIRUAKO: On a Point of Order. If we are discussing prisons, let the prisoners of those years chat on their own.

Call a spade a spade. Let us forget about what you have seen behind the bars where you were, let us close that door to the public, it is a closed chapter. You know what I am talking about.

HON ULENGA: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. What I am talking about is fortunately not the condoms now. The fact of the matter is that it has taken some time for these places to be deteriorating and there have been people trying to point this out. One of the examples that I referred to and other people have spoken about is the deteriorating condition of the infrastructure. Can you imagine a prison where people are not supposed to be able to escape, oozing water from the ceiling? When I spoke about it, the Minister went to see it and he told me privately that, "yes, you are talking the truth, water is seeping through the ceilings."

When you look at that whole infrastructure and not only that, all over the country, you need to have a replacement of those buildings. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: May I ask the Honourable Leader of the Opposition a question? Is the Honourable Ulenga aware that there are thousands of Namibian children who go to school under trees and shacks who are exposed to rain and weather elements of all kinds? Is he saying the world should be so surprised by a

leaking roof of a prison but not be surprised by the backlog in our social provision?

HON ULENGA: Honourable Speaker, fortunately I am not surprised, I am frightened. And you know what, you look at these things and today is a rich day because two Honourable Members have stood up and have touched me with their words, one of them Honourable Kazenambo and the other one Honourable Nambahu. What Honourable Nambahu just talked about now is the question of priorities. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: I am rising on a Point of Order. Honourable Speaker, when the Honourable Minister Angula was asking something, the Honourable Member who has the Floor said that he is not surprised but he is frightened, but I want to tell him that we on this side do not have a spirit of fear, but of love and of sound minds, according to the Bible. That is why these sound minds cannot understand that you are promoting a sin. When you say you are in fear you are making it worse, you should rather be surprised.

HON ULENGA: Unfortunately she did not understand the word 'afraid'. I am afraid because when I look at what the Honourable Nambahu talked about in terms of priorities...(Intervention)

241

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: On a Point of Information. Honourable Ulenga, you do not need to be frightened when the roof is leaking, it is a normal phenomenon of wear and tear. Even your house is leaking, as Honourable Justus Garoëb's house is leaking as well. He ran away from his house because it is leaking. It is a normal phenomenon, it is wear and tear, this Government has a renovation programme under the Ministry of Works, and they look after all these Government institutions. The other day my office was leaking but it has now been repaired. That depends on the resources and you do not need to be frightened, Ulenga, there are priorities among priorities. Therefore, Ulenga, you do not need to be frightened, this Government has never arrested people who practise same-sex. Not even one has been arrested to this day, but what is objectionable is showing the children that it is okay today.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Deputy Minister, I did not hear Honourable Ulenga addressing same-sex.

HON ULENGA: The Members want to get back to the same-sex story, but I will not talk about that today.

Honourable Speaker, indeed, the issue that Honourable Angula is talking about is the question of when we will have to deal with all these issues at the same time. You have, on this hand, children going to school under trees, on the other hand you have prisons, not only one, having to be rehabilitated. On the other hand you need hospitals that need to be renovated, you will be completely overwhelmed, and this is what makes me happy today that Honourable Nambahu is talking about us as a country sorting out our priorities. The Minister has just done that, because the Minister has come to talk about what we need to do, not only with human resources but also with the infrastructure with regard to our Prison and Police Services. (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Speaker, may I ask the Honourable Member a small question, please? Honourable Ulenga, I am afraid to ask this question, but are you aware that when you said, "*I am afraid*", people understood it as when people were talking about new broom?

The second question is, are you aware that the Honourable Member on that side of the House is talking about the roof of the Ministry of Education leaking, Finance is leaking, this one is leaking, the hospital is leaking, everywhere at the same time, but they have decided to spend N\$8 million on a museum. The roof is leaking, kids are under trees, the trees are leaking but N\$8 million is spent on a museum. Where is the priority?

HON ULENGA: Honourable Speaker, I still have a few minutes left. Let us concentrate on the important issues. One thing that comes out that needs addressing is the attitude of members of Government, not all of them. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: I am sorry to interrupt Honourable Ulenga, but let all of us agree and there is nobody who is disputing what prioritising means. On a Point of Information briefly, to belittle a museum to be something of little value, that is why in this society our history is not conserved, because a museum is the storage of the historical background and there is no way to belittle a museum.

<u>HON SPEAKER</u>: Honourable Deputy Minister, the Motion is not about museums.

HON ULENGA: If we do not quickly change our attitude to that displayed by the Minister and a few other Members of the House today, then we are fighting a losing battle. We need to completely embrace the attitude and the spirit in which the Minister introduced the Motion and then we have a chance and a hope of going forward.

Honourable Speaker, I want to speak about another kind of attitude. The Minister and his area of responsibility have an uphill job. This is also reflected in the attitude of your officers themselves. We need to take out the village, the *lokasie* out of these officers and place the State responsibility in them.

A few years ago I went to prison and I would like to show this by example, there was a uniformed prison officer. He stood there in uniform and there was a prisoner regaling the prison officer with the jokes of the village. The unfortunate situation, but which could be overcome easily in this country, is that you come to work in the prison in Windhoek, you are from a village somewhere at Buitepos, and unbelievably, here comes your homeboy, coming to prison. This upsets State relations completely. When you are in that uniform, you are a State official, not a villager or whatever, you are there representing State interest, you are of the State.

HON SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned under automatic adjournment until tomorrow, 14:30.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:46 UNTIL 2008.06.18 AT 14:30

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY ASSEMBLY CHAMBER 18 JUNE 2008 WINDHOEK

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

HON SPEAKER: Any Petitions? Any Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Any Notices of Questions? Honourable Dienda.

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS

QUESTION 65:

HON DIENDA: Honourable Speaker, I give Notice that on Thursday, 26 June 2008, I shall ask the Honourable Minister of Defence the following questions:

The Ministry of Defence has invited young Namibian girls and boys between the ages of 18 to 25 years to apply to be recruited in the Namibian Defence Force. In the *New Era* of Monday, 02 June 2008, the Ministry of Defence has requested the potential candidates who have been short-listed to undergo full medical examinations.

- 1. Except for the Khomas Region, all potential candidates met the age requirements. Why were youngsters in Khomas who are older than 25 years being considered as it is not the case in other regions?
- 2. What will the Minister do to rectify the problem?

NOTICE OF MOTIONS HON DE WAAL

- 3. Out of so many candidates, only 138 female candidates were recruited while the male counterparts were 862. In view of this, this is in violation of the Affirmative Action Policy as well as the International Convention on Gender, which we have signed. In view of this, can the Honourable Minister please explain why there are so few female candidates?
- 4. Statistics show that girls are amongst the top performers at school. Why do they not qualify?

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Member table the Questions? Any further Notice of Questions? Any Notice of Motions? Honourable De Waal.

REPORTS OF AUDITOR-GENERAL REFERRED TO NATIONAL COUNCIL

HON DE WAAL: Honourable Speaker, I Move without Notice that in terms of Article 74(1)(b) of the Namibian Constitution, the Reports of the Auditor-General for the following Local Authorities and Regional Councils be referred to the National Council:

- Municipality of Windhoek for the Financial Years 2004 and 2005;
- Municipality of Walvis Bay for the Financial Year 2007;
- Municipality of Walvis Bay for the Financial Year 2007;
- Municipality of Karasburg for the Financial Year 2007;

NOTICE OF MOTIONS HON DE WAAL

- Municipality of Henties Bay for the Financial Year 2005;
- Municipality of Otjiwarongo for the Financial Year 2005;
- Municipality of Mariental for the Financial Years 2006 and 2007;
- Town Council of Okahao for the Financial Year 2006;
- Town Council of Outapi for the Financial Years 2004 and 2005;
- Town Council of Khorixas for the Financial Years 2002, 2003, 2004, 2005 and 2006:
- Town Council of Ongwediva for the Financial Year 2007;
- Village Council of Leonardville for the Financial Year 2006;
- Village Council of Uis for the Financial Years 2003, 2004 and 2005;
- Regional Council of Omusati Region for the Financial Years 2002, 2003, 2004 and 2005.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, on the advice sought from the Office of the Attorney-General in 2007 in moving this Motion and the referral of these Reports, this House should set out the procedures to be followed by the National Council. I, therefore, move that the following procedures, as recommended by the Attorney-General's Office, be followed by the National Council in reviewing the abovementioned reports:

- 1. The National Council automatically refers the reports to its Standing Committee on Public Accounts and Economy.
- 2. The Public Accounts and Economics Committee meets to review page by page the reports with advice from the Auditor-General.

NOTICE OF MOTIONS HON DE WAAL

- 3. The Committee then, with the assistance of the Office of the Auditor-General, requests accounting officer to respond to the audit observations and/or opinions and questions formulated.
- 4. They will then review the responses and with the assistance from the Office of the Auditor-General decide to accept the Report as recommended by the Auditor-General or may decide to call on individual Accounting Officer for further clarifications, conduct Public Hearings. If and when necessary, prepares its Report and make the necessary recommendations to the National Council for adoption; tables and motivates its Reports in the National Council. The National Council considers and adopts the Committee's Report and the National Council refers the full adopted and motivated Report to the National Assembly.

Honourable Speaker, I just want to inform Honourable Members that the previous Reports that we have sent to the National Council have made very good progress and we will soon hear from them. I so Move.

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Member table the Motion? Any further Notices of Motions?

NOTICE OF MOTIONS

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: I give Notice that tomorrow, the 19th of June 2008, I shall move, that leave be given to introduce a Bill to amend the Value Added Tax Act of 2000 so as to zero-rate fresh and dried beans, sunflower cooking oil, animal fats and bread and cake flower; and to provide for incidental matters.

248

ANNOUNCEMENT HON DR T-B GURIRAB

HON DR ANKAMA: Honourable Speaker, I Move that tomorrow, the 19th of June 2008 I shall move:

That this Assembly discusses, assesses and ascertains the seriousness of unemployed Namibians with professional training and qualifications.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Member table the Motion? I have two announcements to make and it is deliberate that I do it at this stage rather than at the beginning as is the practice. When I am done the Honourable Members will appreciate.

The first one is as follows: I have been informed by the Government Chief Whip that Honourable Members will serve on the respective Parliamentary Standing Committees and National Groups as follows:

- 1. Honourable Dr Moses Amweelo has been withdrawn from the Standing Committee on Constitutional and Legal Affairs and appointed to the Standing Committee on Economics, Natural Resources and Public Administration and the IPU Group.
- 2. Honourable Juliet Kavetuna and Honourable Anna Bayer will be Members of the CPA Group; and
- 3. Honourable Eunice Iipinge will be a Member of the IPU Group.

The second announcement will be followed by something else and it is to acknowledge at this stage the presence of the following persons on the Floor of the Chamber: Honourable Sharonice Busch, she was the Speaker of the Children's Parliament, a very competent person. Welcome. Alicia Brandt, Junior Councillor of the City of Windhoek, accompanied by Emily Van Zyl of the City of Windhoek.

MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON MUNGUNDA

HON SPEAKER: Any Ministerial Statements? Honourable Minister of Gender Equality and Child Welfare.

MINISTERIAL STATEMENT: DAY OF THE AFRICAN CHILD

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: Comrade Speaker, before I deliver my Ministerial Statement on the Day of the African Child, 2008, I would like to congratulate the following recently appointed female Members of Parliament, Honourable Kavari from the CoD, Honourable Kavetuna from the SWAPO Party and Honourable Bayer also from the SWAPO Party. We have now reached the goal set by the SADC Gender Declaration, which states that at least by 2005 we must have more than 30% of women in decision-making in Parliament. We are now at 31.8%.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members of this august House, I have the great honour also to acknowledge the presence of the Speaker of the Children's Parliament, 2008, Ms Sharonice Busch and also Honourable Alicia Brand, the Junior Councillor for the City of Windhoek.

We are remembering a very sad event that took place on the 16th of June 1976 in Soweto, South Africa, where hundreds of young children were brutally killed by the Apartheid soldiers. On this day, young children organised a march through which they were demanding better education, also to be taught in their indigenous languages and have English as a medium of instruction.

The Day of the African Child was established by the African Union to remember the thousands of black school children who marched on 16th June 1976 in Soweto. During that march, hundreds of young boys and girls were shot down. The first one who was shot was Jack Peterson at the age of twelve years old. The Day of the African Child honours the

MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON MUNGUNDA

memory of those killed and the courage of all the young boys and girls who marched that day.

This important event is celebrated every year under the auspices of the African Union in memory of those innocent children who perished in Soweto on the 16th of June 1976. On that fateful very cold morning, the children demonstrated that they could stand up for their own rights. For African countries, like Namibia, this cay creates a unique platform for measuring Government's commitments, achievements and services geared towards the children of Namibia.

In 1991, Namibia signed the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child and is committed to adhere to the principles thereof. Namibia is also a signatory to the African Charter on the Rights and the Welfare of the Child. The Government, through the Ministry of Gender Equality and Child Welfare, has put up a National Policy for Orphans and Vulnerable Children that guides the Government on responses with regard to the orphans and vulnerable children. The National Plan of Action coordinates all the different activities regarding children. The Right Honourable Prime Minister Nahas Angula also launched it last year. Different Conferences and Workshops took place to accommodate the views of the children within the programmes and projects and it should go out to all the regions for the implementation of the National Plan of Action and in all Regions children participate and make decisions.

I have the joy to share some achievements of the Ministry from 2006 to date.

The OVC Food Support Programme was implemented in six northern Regions of Namibia under the coordination of the Ministry of Gender Equality and Child Welfare with the support of the United Nations World Food Programme.

In November 2003, the Government made an appeal to the World Food Programme for food assistance to some 643,000 drought affected people in the country and the World Food Programme in turn agreed to assist

MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON MUNGUNDA

111,000 orphans and vulnerable children in the six Regions of Caprivi, Kavango, Ohangwena, Omusati, Oshana and Oshikoto.

The Emergency Management Unit in the Office of the Prime Minister coordinated the first phase of the programme from the 1st of March 2004 to the 31st of August 2005.

With the second phase, the Ministry of Gender Equality and Child Welfare was mandated with the overall coordination of the programme with the same targeted number of 111,000 beneficiaries. The total number of food insecure OVC registered across the six Regions was 92,089.

The main objective of the Food Support Programme was to provide food aid as an interim measure, whilst transferring as many qualifying OVCs as possible onto the Government Child Welfare Grant system paid through the Ministry of Gender Equality and Child Welfare. As mandated through the Children's Act (Act 33 of 1960), the Ministry of Finance has continuously been making additional Budget allocations to cater for the increasing number of orphans and vulnerable children who qualify for the grants.

During the programme period, two Community Household Surveys were conducted in July 2006 and May 2007, respectively, by the Ministry in conjunction with the World Food Programme as part of monitoring and evaluating the impact of the programme on the beneficiaries. Both studies confirmed that households hosting orphans appeared to be better off in terms of food security, as they were found more likely to have access to agricultural land, livestock and were more reliant on pensions, food assistance and Government grants as livelihood sources than households without orphans. Households hosting vulnerable children were found to be more affected by poverty and relied on food assistance as a main source of livelihood.

During the implementation period from April 2006 until April 2008, the Ministry managed to transfer 46 643 children out of the registered number of 92,086 onto the Child Welfare Grant System across the six regions. At

MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON MUNGUNDA

the present moment we have 190,000 orphans and vulnerable children for the financial year 2007/08 compared to 60 129 from the previous year.

With assistance from UNICEF, the Ministry also developed information brochures on Services for Children in Need, Community Support for OVCs, Birth Registration and Child's Right and a Child Belongs to All of us, which were disseminated countrywide for the communities to acquaint themselves with the services available and how to access them.

The Ministry of Gender Equality and Child Welfare runs a children's home in Eros, Windhoek, for children in need of care. It caters for 140 children by ensuring their daily maintenance and education up to University level.

The After-School centre provides after-school activities to children at risk and street children. With the financial support from UNESCO, the centre offers computer classes and training on income-generating activities to parents of those children who are involved in the programme.

Now I would look at the impact of the OVC feeding scheme.

From 2006 to 2008 we distributed 15,670 tons of food aid across the six targeted regions. More than 47,000 eligible OVCs were transferred to the Government safety net and are in receipt of child welfare grants through the Ministry.

A social mobilisation campaign was carried out through radio announcements and local level announcements. Through access to grants, more children were able to return to school or to be kept in schools. The food distribution at constituency and nearer distribution points also benefited those who were in remote areas, far from facilities such as shops to purchase food. The programme also ensured increased opportunities to access grants through the issuing of national documents by the Ministry of Home Affairs and Immigration and I would like to thank my sister, because her mobile teams assisted the children to get documents.

MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON MUNGUNDA

There is an increased awareness of the Government's social grants. More people know about the grants through this programme, because people were ignorant and children were deprived of their rights.

This year's theme is "Children's participation – children be heard and seen." If we look back at what happened as a result of the resistance of children, we acknowledge that the thoughts, opinions and courage of our children are very important. In Namibia, our children are our most valuable asset. Children are making up the greatest part of our Nation. The Government, through the Ministry of Gender Equality and Child

Welfare and other Line Ministries will continue to provide services to protect the rights of our children.

Comrade Speaker, Sir, the theme of the Day of the African Child for 2008, "Children's participation – children be heard and seen", fits very well what Namibia has been practising over the last couple of years. In 2001, Namibia demonstrated seriousness with regard to the involvement of children in decision-making. That was when I was Deputy Minister of Women Affairs and Honourable Ndaitwah was the Minister of Women Affairs. In 2001, the Honourable Minister Comrade Ndaitwah took two children to the UN Special Session for Children in America. The Minister brought a San girl child from Tsumkwe who that time was in Grade 7 and when the girl came here, she stayed with me because we could communicate in Damara/Nama and then the girl left for America.

Then that girl and a boy from one of the primary schools here left with the Minister and when the Minister came back, she told me she speaks English, she stood up there as a Namibian San girl and participated and told the children what the children want and that was British, not Namlish.

The City of Windhoek, through the Junior Council, is also grooming children over a period of two years to become outstanding leaders as they are demonstrating in all children programmes. The Director of Ceremonies this morning was a Junior Councillor and the Junior Mayor gave the vote of thanks. We also have the Speaker of the Children's

MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON MUNGUNDA

Parliament who then made a statement on behalf of the Children's Parliament.

Comrade Speaker, in May 2007 the Children's Parliament tabled 26 Motions. Two Motions were rejected and four were withdrawn. I will just highlight a few of the Motions to safe time. They tabled a Motion on crime perpetrated by young people. They tabled a Motion on unconstitutional use of corporal punishment in school, a Motion on the Grade 10 repeaters, a Motion on the unavailability of access to libraries in rural areas. They tabled a Motion on the recruitment of foreign teachers at the expense of the trained Namibian teachers and a Motion on the increasing number of school dropouts and a Motion on the teachers who are not performing properly at school. They tabled a Motion on school girls to return to school after delivery and the last one, a Motion on poor school infrastructure. These were the Motions, which were tabled during the 2008 Children's Parliament by the children Parliamentarians.

Inasmuch as the Government has a responsibility to provide accessible services to the Children, I would like to appeal to our children to grab the opportunities that are at their disposal. They must use the opportunity to go to school and remain in school until they have finished school. They must not involve themselves with criminal activities, alcohol and drugs. Children should abstain, we are not going to distribute condoms in schools, and we will ask the children to abstain from sexual activities until they are physically and mentally mature to deal with relationships.

In conclusion, I want to call on our parents to create safe homes for our children. The phenomenon of domestic violence is very disturbing and destructive for our children's development. It is the primary responsibility of parents to look after their children, to be involved in the lives of their children, to listen to them, to provide answers, to love them and to spend quality time with their children.

The children's first responsibility is to be obedient to their parents and to all other adults and authority that come across their way. They must study hard and never take education for granted. Some African children paid with their lives, like the children of Soweto on that fateful day of 16th June

18 June 2008 ROAD TRAFFIC AND TRANSPORT BILL HON H ANGULA

1976, to receive quality education. A child of 12 years old was killed and those children's blood waters the freedom of the African children. Therefore, the children should hold up the banner of education. Let us continue to build on the bravery of the African child. God Bless the children of Africa. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Minister for her statement. Viva African children, viva. The first Notice of Motion is the one of the Honourable Minister of Works and Transport. Does the Honourable Minister Move that the Bill be now introduced?

ROAD TRAFFIC AND TRANSPORT AMENDMENT BILL: INTRODUCTION AND FIRST READING

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: I Move the Motion.

HON SPEAKER: Who seconds? Any objection? Agreed to. Will the Honourable Minister please table the Bill? The Secretary will now read the Bill a First Time.

SECRETARY: Road Traffic and Transport Amendment Bill.

ROAD TRAFFIC AND TRANSPORT AMENDMENT BILL: SECOND READING

18 June 2008

ROAD TRAFFIC AND TRANSPORT BILL HON H ANGULA

HON SPEAKER: Does the Honourable Minister of Works and Transport Move that the Bill be now read a Second Time?

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: I so Move.

HON SPEAKER: Who seconds? Any objection? Agreed to. The Minister has the Floor.

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Comrade Speaker, Sir, Honourable Members of the House, I rise to introduce before this august House the Road Traffic and Transport Amendment Bill, which has been necessitated by a number of pressing issues and loopholes that need to be closed.

Comrade Speaker, the Road Traffic and Transport Act, 1999 (Act 22 of 1999) hereinafter referred to as the Act, was enacted by Parliament in December 1999 and promulgated with effect from 6 April 2001 through Government Notice No. 52 published in Government Gazette No. 2503 of 30 March 2001.

At the time of implementation, a number of sections and provisions of the Act remained latent mainly due to the non-existence of relevant regulations to foster proper and systematic implementation as well as inappropriate institutional set-up and lack of technical competence in the Ministry to ensure compliance to prescribed standards.

Since then a lot has taken place, hence the need to somewhat align the Act in response to current pressing needs created mainly by an oversight that

18 June 2008 ROAD TRAFFIC AND TRANSPORT BILL HON H ANGULA

crept in during the phasing-in of the credit card type SADC driving licence, as well as shortcomings in the appointment and certification of authorised officers in terms of section 11 of the Act.

Amendment of Section 11: Section 11 of the principal Act empowers the Minister, subject to the Public Service Act, 1995 (Act 13 of 1995) to appoint such persons as authorised officers to serve in different categories as provided for under that section. In addition, the section also authorises Local Authorities, subject to the approval of the Minister, to appoint such persons as licence inspectors, vehicle examiners and driving examiners to serve as such in their areas of jurisdiction. The section further stipulates that upon appointment in the form of approved by the Minister, as it is required of such officer, to produce his/her appointment certificate if requested to do so in the execution of his/her duties.

It happened that due to administrative and logistical problems, many appointments of authorised officers were made without appropriate documentation being issued in accordance with the provisions of Regulation 2 of the Road Traffic and Transport Regulation, 2001. Regulation 2 required authorised officers to be registered by the Ministry of Works and Transport before they are allowed to perform their duties.

The above provision has been fully complied with, as some officers were registered in September 2004 despite being in the field from 2001 when the Act and Regulation came into force. This situation poses a potential problem that these officers have instituted many prosecutions in terms of the Act, while not being properly registered and issued with registration certificates as required by the Act. This Amendment, therefore, seeks to legalise legitimate actions taken by authorised officers in the performance of their duties in terms of the said Act from the date of implementation to close the possibility of these cases being declared illegal, thus opening floodgates for civil litigation against Government.

Amendment of Section 37: Currently the Act does not allow a person whose licence has expired to apply for the conversion of such licence to the new SADC credit card type licence. The Act further makes no

ROAD TRAFFIC AND TRANSPORT BILL HON H ANGULA

provision for holders of expired driving licences to apply for the renewal of such licences after expiration.

This arrangement has turned many Namibians into criminals, not for reasons of their choice but by reasons beyond their control as they were prevented by different circumstances from exchanging their old driving licences for the new ones. The majority of those affected are diplomats, students in foreign countries, inmates and those who were hospitalised at the time of the conversion period.

This Amendment seeks to allow holders of driving licences that became invalid for various reasons not of their making to apply for the replacement or renewal of such licences after expiry, but will not allow such persons to drive a motor vehicle on a public road by virtue of such expired licences.

Amendment of Section 40: The introduction of the SADC credit card type driving licence culminated in the nullification of the old green-card licences. However, the transitional process of changing over to the new licence system was not without impediments. It was realised rather late that the conversion of the old licences should have been done not only in accordance with categories or date of birth of the holder, but should have also considered different categories of licence holders. Flexibility should have been allowed to accommodate those who were outside the country on foreign missions, prisoners, hospital-bound patients and students in foreign institutions who could not meet the 31st of August 2005 cut-off date for the exchange. All licences not converted up until then ceased to be licences for the purposes of the Act.

The proposed Amendment therefore seeks to allow those with driving licences that are no longer regarded as licences to apply for the replacement of such licences.

Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members, I therefore recommend to the Parliament to consider and adopt the Bill without further delay. I thank you.

MOTION ON INDEPENDENCE MUSEUM HON KAURA

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Minister for his statement. Any further discussion? Silence means consent. Does the Honourable Minister wish to reply?

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Comrade Speaker, I adjourn my reply pending the rectification of a mistake I have seen here through a proper Amendment to the 24th.

HON SPEAKER: The consideration of this Motion stands adjourned until next week, 24 June. The second Notice of Motion is the one by Honourable Kaura. Does the Honourable Member Move the Motion? Who seconds the Motion? Any objection? Agreed to. Honourable Kaura.

HON KAURA: Honourable Speaker, my History professor at Long Island University used to remind us: "Fools and idiots forget about the past and they end up making the same mistakes." I hope this will not epitomise the Namibian Nation, which has suffered so much for the greatest part of the last century. We have suffered enough insults from those who lived in ivory towers, employing their superior firepower to keep us in bondage. They came up with spurious explanations to justify their inhumane acts of degrading our dignity and humanity, but we persevered and survived.

Those who colonised us even tried to explain that when Jan Van Riebeeck landed in South Africa in 1652, there were no people, but *Hottentots*. To them *Hottentots* were not people, but they took the women of the *Hottentots* and fathered the Coloured Nation from non-people. That is how ridiculous one can become to justify anything.

MOTION ON INDEPENDENCE MUSEUM HON KAURA

The equestrian monument is a clear demonstration that when the German Imperial Army landed here, they found people who were not prepared to surrender their birthright on a silver platter. They fought for their country, they fought for the peace of Namibia, but not for the peace of Germany. The German Imperial Army and the present German Government will never deny that they did not find people in Namibia and did not take the land by force, using the ultimate means of inhumane cruelties. The German Imperial Army and the Imperial Government erected that monument to demonstrate their invincibility and their unequalled military prowess. They erected it to warn the natives never to think of confronting the German might. They erected that document to scare the natives into submission.

I think the German Government is regretting today because when we are demanding reparations, they cannot deny the atrocities because they left behind indelible footprints.

When the *Blue Book* was written, those who wrote it never thought that the black people will ever be able to read it and it will stand out in total condemnation of the European civilisation.

By 1926 when people like Marcus Gavi started traversing the world, condemning slavery and colonialism and the cruelty of the much revered European civilisation, the *Blue Book* was immediately taken off the shelves. It is difficult today to find a copy of the *Blue Book* because it condemns the so-called superior European culture of civilisation.

Now the rhetorical question is: "Are we prepared to obliterate that piece of history which illustrates the inferiority and cruel nature of the inhumane European culture which is touted as pure and imitable?" Do we want to exonerate them so that there is nothing with which to confront them? Do we want to take the Blue Book off the shelves so that there will be no evidence of the European cruelties perpetrated on our soil? Today we treasure the White Lady of the Brandberg because those are footprint left behind by our ancestors on the rock of time and we are proud about that. It is our obligation to keep it there for thousands of years to come because our ancestors left it behind so that we could know they were

MOTION ON INDEPENDENCE MUSEUM HON KAURA

there. They seem to state unmistakably to whomever is passing by, "we passed through here before you."

Our forefathers with sweat and labour erected the equestrian monument and at night, they were hit with a loaf of brown bread on the chest as payment. We shall inflict pain on the memory of our ancestors who in their own way are saying, "we passed this way, we were here."

Let us leave that piece of stone standing right there in place as our forefathers placed them there in 1912, 96 years ago. Let it continue to be a reminder to those young Namibians who waged the war of liberation until the flag of the Independent Namibia was hoisted to know they did not take those actions in isolation, but they were following the proud tradition set by their forebears.

As we are all growing old, they must come to the equestrian monument with their children and say, "this is where our forefathers and mothers started" and then take them to the Heroes Acre and say, "this is where we ended, it is for the young generation to further build on this proud tradition."

By tearing down the equestrian monument and reconstructing it somewhere else, it will become a photocopy, not the original. Its historical significance will be severely compromised and my submission is that we must leave it intact where it is.

That the Christuskirche, the Parliament and the equestrian monument are the biggest tourist attractions in Windhoek and they occupy a triangle which is unique. Let us not destroy this aesthetic building, Honourable Members.

There is a spot where the Old Location Hospital was situated and ironically, that piece of strategic land is lying idle up to now. Why can the Independence Memorial Museum not be constructed there? That place is not hidden and it is easily accessible on Hosea Kutako Avenue. I hope

18 June 2008 MOTION ON INDEPENDENCE MUSEUM HON ULENGA

Honourable Members will take my request seriously and I thank you for your anticipated support. Thank you very much.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member for his statement. The House shall rise for refreshments.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:40 HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:10 PURSUANT TO ADJOURNMENT

HON ULENGA: Honourable Speaker, I am very happy to take part in the Debate on Honourable Kaura's Motion, namely to deliberate the removal of the Windhoek landmark, the *Reiterdenkmal* or the equestrian monument and give my opinion on the issue.

You know, it is so innocuous the way it is called here, it is almost whitewashed; it is called "Reiterdenkmal" and the equestrian monument. It is as if it is about the best riding horses and it does not say the reality of what it stands for. It is amazing how people come to whitewash their history. I do not mean Honourable Kaura because this is how it is called, Honourable Kaura is just quoting the actual verbalisation of the monument and its history.

Honourable Speaker, it is always painful to leave a place one has been acquainted with a long time and people are usually very reluctant to break with the past. When I was growing up, the people around where I grew up used to sing praise for Windhoek as the place or the city of the horse that is ridden by the brave giant who never dismounts. When I used to listen

MOTION ON INDEPENDENCE MUSEUM HON ULENGA

to this kind of description, I had no idea of the history behind the *Reiterdenkmal* and when I first came to Windhoek, I went to see this famous landmark.

However, Honourable Speaker, however painful it is, I think in this case we as a Nation need to move on and start thinking of new *denkmals* which are more symbolic to our existence as a Nation and put them at the most prominent places in our society as a sovereign Independent Nation. Therefore, in this particular case I would like to differ from my Honourable friend, Mr Kaura. I am definitely one of those who say, let us take the Nation on now, let us move not only the *Reiterdenkmal*, but all colonial relics must find a proper place in a Namibian colonial museum and I do not see any need for prioritisation in this case. I am not saying they must move tomorrow, we must wait until we have the necessary resources.

However, if we have the money and the time to erect symbols, we must now create those symbols of independent nationhood, put them where they ought to be put. I am not for the destruction of the *Reiterdenkmal* and reconstruction of it.

I must share an experience. In 1990 I travelled to the Slovakian part of that once united Republic of Czechoslovakia and there is a place there called Moser, a city famous for its crystal glass. The time that we came there, believe it or not, the City of Moser was in the process of moving a whole church from one section of the city to another, a church taller and bigger than the church that we have here.

They have dug it out, they have put some stuff under it, they put it on wheels and they were moving that church about five or more kilometres to another place.

This *Reiterdenkmal* can be dug out, put on wheels, moved to wherever the City of Windhoek and other responsible people choose to put a colonial relics museum. We need to have that kind of thing within our society, it must be there but it must just have a proper place.

MOTION ON INDEPENDENCE MUSEUM HON ULENGA

I am worried, Honourable Speaker, when we throw many things all together. I take this hill to be the symbol of our nationhood, of our sovereign independent nationhood. I think that is why those who chose it for their symbols thought it was very appropriate because it was almost the highest hill in town. It is very appropriate, so it is good Parliament is here, other Offices of State are here, so let us not mix them up with the symbols of colonialism.

I still think I have some powers of suggesting. I would suggest that the statue of Hosea Kutako, not seated but standing, six metres tall, should be standing right there where the *Reiterdenkmal* is today. A statue of Hendrik Witbooi, the first people in this country who called for a united independent nationhood should be standing together with this Parliament and not like tiny little puny figures like it has been done. Perhaps we did not have the money. Actually, one can also talk about prioritising here, but they should be a really prominent feature of the city, especially Hosea Kutako because despite all the arguments, he was really the most prominent figure in the formation of our Nation.

Let us just make the differences, Honourable Speaker. There should be a proper place for colonial relics. The other day I attended a presentation here at the Franco-Namibian Cultural Centre and other Members of the House were also there and we had this whole presentation of Namibia and apartheid, very relevant stuff and I understand there is going to be a museum in Walvis Bay where all these are going to be put. I am always pained in my heart, why do we not have a place in Namibia where people can see a page of the past and all those kinds of things, the shackles we were shackled with when Namibians were imprisoned. There must be a place in our history. Let us just look carefully and select where we need to place these articles.

Honourable Speaker, I appreciate very much the fact that Namibia is a tourist country. In fact, perhaps most of our foreign visitors come from, of all other places, Germany. For whatever reasons they come, they are welcome. It is just a question of moving from one point to another. We must carefully guide our visitors into the steps in which our Nation is moving. If they used to come here and look at the new Parliament and

MOTION ON INDEPENDENCE MUSEUM HON ULENGA

they look at the *Reiterdenkmal*, let us have other indications so that they know the *Reiterdenkmal* is 60 kilometres from here or 30 kilometres or a few kilometres away in another part of the city. Put it together with even this church here, we can create a better church or another *denkmal* and put it up here.

The issue is that people learn and they get used to certain things and when they have to break it, it is always painful, but the time will come when it is appropriate and people will take the appropriate symbols of their time as those that must be in the relevant places.

I definitely suggest we should continue to encourage our visitors, especially those who come from Germany and they pay there, that they also must accept the reality of Namibian sovereign nationhood and Independence and must go where they can also see other things, that they get the whole country in its full perspective.

I was once asked the question by somebody: How can they see the graves at Cassinga? Not only do they have relations who died there, but the whole issue of Cassinga seems such a prominent issue in the Namibian history, the history of the struggle, the history of oppression and so forth. I said this place is in Angola, it is very difficult to get there and this person asked whether there is no possibility to just move some kind of symbolic relic of Cassinga, or of Shark Island, of this and that, of Hamakari, of Oshikuku and place it in one place of remembrance of pain in Namibia where everybody can come and see? When you go to many countries, you hear this was not the actual spot, this is just a symbol brought here and the spot was about 200 kilometres away from here. If we could do it in such a comprehensive way when we have the time and the money and we create a nice, relevant, appropriate museum of the relics of history, put all these things there, put up our splendid statues, not to living persons, which would be very inappropriate, but statues of those who have meant so much to our history of Independence and sovereign nationhood and put them at appropriate places.

Honourable Speaker, I rest my case with those few words. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank Honourable Ulenga for his contribution. Honourable Kazenambo.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:

Thank you, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members. This is one of those Motions that can be divisive and it is one that could at the same time be unifying, depending from what angle and what perspective we are looking at this Motion.

Since there had been no prior consultation that I am aware of between the Whips of the different Parties and in my Party, there was no caucus on this Motion, I will speak on this Motion from what I am as a person and how I relate to the subject under discussion. I do not need to go and do research or consult about it, because it is in the House of Debate and one can see from the previous two speakers, the Mover of the Motion and Honourable Ulenga that this is the nature of this Motion. That is how we look at it from different perspectives.

It will be very difficult for me to pronounce the name written here, but I know what is meant here. Therefore, in my own simple language and in the language I understand, please, when I am saying that, I am referring to *kongoro no mundu*, I refer to this Motion. If I continue referring in my intervention to Otjirongo tjo kakambe, I am referring to that Motion.

This subject, for me as a person, is just like somebody talking about Kongua in Tanzania. I heard of Kongua in Tanzania as a young person when I started becoming clear about matters and distinguished between light and dark. Why I did I know of Kongua in Tanzania because the hope of the oppressed Namibian people rested in the pioneers of the Namibian liberation struggle who were preparing themselves to wage the liberation struggle and their symbolic base was in Congo and Tanzania. As an offspring of refugees, Kongua and Tanzania was a symbol for me, that one day I will come home and one day coming home, the point of reference

was ko *Tjirongo tjo kakambe* and *Ongoro nomundu* became a very historic symbol. It symbolised defeat and symbolised continuation of the liberation struggle, but the point of reference is there, as long as that man is riding on the horse, we get finished or we have to put our flag on top of it. That is what it meant.

In Kongua, in Tanzania it meant that those who were preparing themselves would come and capture that horse and control it. That is how I came to know about this place.

When I grew up during the liberation struggle and became a PLAN combatant, we were saying that our central point is Windhoek *Ou shakeno Oko Windhoeka*. Namibia is so big with beautiful places, but we said the central point is Windhoek. That was our slogan in PLAN, that whatever mountains and valleys and rivers we are going to cross, that central point is Windhoek. This place, the capital, was our central point.

Those who are asking, why is he saying this, you cannot cut me from my historical roots and nothing will cut me from that and you cannot change me to be what I am not. Understand me from that perspective. For me that horse is in the door of one of the notorious concentration camps, which we used to call *Orumbo Otjombondi*. It is right in front of it, it is where my mothers, my grandmothers, my parents were kept in captivity and the crime, which they have committed cannot be explained by anybody here, neither here or in heaven. Nobody here will tell me why our people were put in that *Orumbo Otjombondi*, that concentration camp of faeces, human remains and human faeces. Nobody can tell me why they were kept there and that thing is on the doorstep of that concentration camp.

For me as a person speaking here, the great-grandchild, if you go between the current Windhoek Cemetery and the office of TransNamib, my own biological uncle *Katjikumbua* was tried right in front of that horse there. There was a tree there, he was tried there and he was moved there for hanging. He was moved from between Otjosazu between Ovitoto and Okahandja, brought here, my own biological uncle, Katjikumbua Kukuri. He was removed from that place and taken to be hanged there on a tree at

the spot where he is buried right now between the Windhoek Cemetery and the office of TransNamib. Therefore, it is a reference point, it means a lot to me as a person. It is not a horse and a gun, it is the reference point of colonial engagement, of combatants engaging the fascists of colonialism.

When we were running across a river, if we take the traces along Otjinene, when we crossed into Nyae-Nyae, we named places. Some of them are named Omungondo, some were Ondjora, Samuel Maharero and when he was leading my grandparents, he travelled along those lines. He found Herero women digging for food in the desert and when he was greeting them, they said to him "Muatje ua tate motupura tjike, tua etua i ondjembo ja Katjikumbua o ndjeya okutu sanisa imba". Translated, when he talked to these women in the desert, digging for food for their survival and asked them what are they doing, the said: "How can you dare ask that? It is the war of Katjikumbua, it is the gun of Katjikumbua", meaning that when Maharero declared war, the result was that for them to be in that condition. In addition, when he left with his bodyguards he started laughing and not laughter of joy, he was laughing a laughter of tears. He said "Vese vetje nao, orondu tjiveya okusana ingo va sanisiwa i ami". That was the situation.

Therefore, when we are touching some of these symbols, when some of us pass at those symbols, they are not symbols without meaning, they are not only colonial symbols, but they are symbols that give us a mixture of joy and sadness. They symbolise success, that today I, the grandson of the people who were pushed with those guns, crossing valleys, crossing mountains, moving with thirst and hunger, has emerged victorious. We have emerged victorious, that is what that symbol means.

I am saying that we need to look at these symbols from different perspectives. We commemorate Cassinga Day and it is high time that this Nation starts educating each other, because some Namibians distance themselves from Cassinga Day. Those poor innocent people, kids, young Namibian son and daughters who perished at Cassinga were fighting for the Independence of all of us, they paid with their blood and their language, and background does not matter. It is the cause, to which they

committed themselves. However, one person talks symbol when he talks about Cassinga Day, when he talks about Ohamakari, he just sees some symbol, it is just a name, but for some Namibians it is something which you cannot separate from them.

One person will ask, how can Kazenambo dare compare Cassinga with that symbol? I am saying it is pure, narrow naivety, either hypocrisy at its best or trying to interpret and erase history. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: Comrade Speaker, I want to ask a tiny question to the Honourable Member. Honourable Kazenambo, are you aware that the survivors of Cassinga were taken down to the Keixananab Skills Training Centre and when they died, they were wrapped in grey blankets and thrown in unnamed graves in Mariental's black cemetery. Are you aware of that?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: I am aware of that and you know, history to me has always been a coincidence. The day I crossed the Kwasangula River into Livingston, I crossed with ex-PLAN combatants who were detained at Mariental.

It is historic for me as a person, to cross that river to go and pick up guns. I crossed with people who said they would never surrender. *Never surrender!* For me it was historic and therefore, I did not surrender because it was a blessing, it was historic. I crossed with people who said, *no matter how you treat us we will never surrender.* It was an encouragement that, if I am facing this and if my fellow colleagues could say they will never surrender. It will keep me going. It kept me going.

Sometimes people say I must not judge myself. I am not judging myself and I am not feeling guilty, but in the process, we need to educate one another. Our thoughts sometimes are so cheap, sometimes are so narrow. We only select, but if you are debating, you need to balance and cater for those who have limitations in interpreting and appreciating this. What I am saying is that the history of this country manifested itself in a manner that affected us differently. For us today to forge a very strong coherent Namibian Nation, we need to appreciate how a subject will impact, will affect other Namibians, how will they interpret it, rather than just interpreting it in our own narrow environment and understanding.

Namibia is a rainbow society, it is a cultural society, and our people were subjected to different cultural experiences, war encounters and historical background. To unify, let us consult and consult widely. To take an action, let us appreciate the people who may have been the first in that specific area and how it was developed and how it has affected them. Then if we do that, we will build a solid foundation. If we however try to belittle and not appreciate the understanding of how other people feel, we will always wonder why we are not moving forward as a coherent Nation as we are supposed to do. It is because we are not engaging, we are not sensitive to the feelings of other people. This is all I am saying.

Therefore, through that process I am saying, please let us consult, let us appreciate, let us leave that thing there. My proposal is that we leave that *Ongoro nomundu* there where it is. It is where it is and even when we are engaging now, talking about reparation, one of the symbols which these people left is that horse and to me it represents how they were chasing young women and kids. That is why they put it right at the door there. After they chased them with that horse, they captured them and kept them there.

Further, before I conclude, Honourable Speaker, history is also important. The horse is at that place there and a few metres from that horse you have Chief Hosea Kutako sitting here, Reverend Hendrik Witbooi sitting here, Reverend Hamutumbangela sitting here, the giants of the liberation struggle, the giants of victory. They have therefore balanced that horse. They are sitting here right in front of this building and by the way, this

MOTION ON INDEPENDENCE MUSEUM HON VILJOEN

very same building is one of those notorious buildings that the colonialists have built. It is no more a colonial place. I am talking now. If we have to remove it, it means that we also remove this place and choose a place in Katutura and put it there – and even the current State House.

I agree with Honourable Ulenga that some of the things can be moved to a historical museum, but we also need to touch some of the things because they mean something emotional to some of the citizens.

As we are doing these things, let us appreciate and consult what the members of our society feel. It is also a good idea, I would assume, to incorporate it with the Independence museum, that from this horse the Independence achievement and you put them together, it will not do any harm and it stands as it is. To however touch it and remove it, you are touching a big name of the citizens of this country.

With these words, I rest my case and I am saying that as we are dealing with symbols of this nature, let us also consult on what they mean to certain citizens of this country. For me it is not tourism, for me it is historical, for me it is my blood, for me it is the blood of my mother, for me it is blood of my sisters, for me it is my oppressed people to which today I do not have an answer, why were we hounded with that horse, why were we kept in that concentration camp? With these words, I rest my case.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member Kazenambo. Honourable Viljoen.

<u>HON VILJOEN</u>: Honourable Speaker, thank you, I will be very brief. History is my subject and from a historical point of view, I cannot support

the moving of any historical monument to another place and I think that

18 June 2008 MOTION ON INDEPENDENCE MUSEUM HON NAMOLOH

those who are busy with the planning of reconstructing that site under discussion should reconsider such a decision. Thank you very much.

HON SPEAKER: I thank Honourable Viljoen. Honourable Minister of Defence.

HON MINISTER OF DEFENCE: Thank you, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members. I would speak both as a Member of Parliament and a retired general who has fought in the war.

In war, history is written by victors and not by those who are defeated and the monuments or statues, which were erected are for the victors, the rest are museums. All of us say that history has taught us and even if you look at the height of the statue in question, it dominates, it is a symbol of being above everything. If there is any statue in this country of our forefathers who fought for this country, it is below that one.

The colonial monuments may be very important and significant of that part of our history, but they should not dominate by height.

When we walk around the streets of Windhoek with our children and grandchildren they ask, "you say you fought for the Independence of this country, was he one of you?" It is because he occupies a very dominant height. When you say, "no, he was our oppressor", it is defeating what we fought for.

We have seen that people in other countries, which were at war pulled down most of the statues. Those who fought and won pulled down the statues of those who were defeated. A statue symbolises the power in a place, it is a form of showing your dominance in a particular place and of course, in the minds of the people as well. You have to be proud of it, it is high up there, you look at it and raise your head to look at it. You do not look at it at your own level, you raise your eyes to look at it. It is above you and it must dominate you.

MOTION ON INDEPENDENCE MUSEUM HON NAMOLOH

When the First World War was fought in Europe, most of those remembrances are not statues. They are museums and concentration camps. We were there in Germany, Poland and in other European countries and we know, but this country was fought for from 1894 and we should see their statues in the places where they fought. They were the conquerors. Even if they did not defeat the enemy in that particular battle, the war was won.

Our forefathers started the war, our generation completed the objective and we must put them somewhere to be proud of them and we must raise our eyes when we look at them. We should however have those who oppressed us to be there at dominant heights. They could be put somewhere in a museum as a remembrance to the future generations and not at dominant places.

I also think the Independence Memorial Museum is something very significant and it cannot be replaced by one statue of the coloniser or oppressor. An Independence Memorial Museum will mean a lot in our history and that is why it is being sought. I think we need to clear our minds as to what we want for the future and not only the past. As a Nation, we need to look at that.

Of course, sometimes if justice is not properly defended it may become unjust. You may think you are defending justice, but it becomes unjust. You will be unfair to yourself and the future generations. History is for all of us. (Intervention)

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: May I put a question? I am just wondering when the realisation of the height of the monuments became so important, because if that was the consideration, why are our three national heroes lower than that? Who took the decision to make them lower? Must we now remove the *Reiterdenkmal* to correct the mistake of putting our own leaders lower?

MOTION ON INDEPENDENCE MUSEUM HON RIRUAKO

HON MINISTER OF DEFENCE: The people who erected these statues of monuments had in mind that one day that one will be removed. It is not that it should remain there permanently. I think that was the idea, that that one should not be the dominant statue in the country. (Interjection). Who told you they never thought about it? No, they would have thought about it.

Honourable Speaker, I want to urge that the Independence Memorial Museum should be built there and this one should be removed and go into a museum. I rest my case.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Minister. Chief Riruako.

HON RIRUAKO: Honourable Speaker, I respect the whole House and you must listen to me very carefully. I cannot leave any stone unturned. The Honourable Member mentioned his uncle and if you look at this document I have here, the name of his uncle is my boss. He had two names, one is Kukuri, named by the Namas, one is Kamaisa, named by my forefathers and he is a student, he knows what I am talking about. He was hanged there.

My own grandmother went from the concentration camp to another graveyard where the colonial Government used to have their graveyard.

Talk about something that is touching, but not the horse alone. As long as you are fighting the Germans to give us reparation to repair what they have done, that horse must remain there and we point out to them what they have done, the way you mentioned that it is so high.

MOTION ON INDEPENDENCE MUSEUM HON RIRUAKO

Do not be in a hurry, we have many people here who are going to survive and who are going to erect the right museum there. However as long as we are fighting them to repair what they have done to us that horse must remain there. They did not erect that horse there, it was us. Our people dug out those stones to erect a railway line or road.

However if the museum could let that statue survive, that is in order but first we need our reimbursement before we are going to take the horse away. They were so proud after killing, they used to drink beer at that *Alte Feste* and our people used to be hung there and after they got drunk they looked at it, "scheisse Eingeborn" in front of that horse. That horse has to remain. I am not against removing it, but after they have reimbursed us. Why should I keep the horse after everything has been done? We are going to remove it from here and put a museum here and now we are going to look down upon people who have defeated us before. We have to be reimbursed and then the horse has to be moved.

It is not only the horse, there is Kurt Von Francois in front of the municipality. The first thing he tried to study very carefully is to find out how he could rid of Maharero altogether. He is the man who caused their deaths.

We can do that after we have accomplished our objective. Let them give us back what was ours and then after that we have to get a museum where we can go and show our children this was so and so, who did that. Let us not discuss that now, let us fight hard to get our reimbursement and then write history in the right way.

I know the colonialists have written our history, it is true, but they have put themselves as very, very highly respected people who know how to take care of the people, who are rubbish. When they were defeated, they did not say they were defeated. At Ohamakari they were defeated, completely defeated and General Von Trotha was so stupid the next morning, but unfortunately we did not have any knowledge that we have defeated them, we move this side.

MOTION ON INDEPENDENCE MUSEUM HON RIRUAKO

Now we must correct the history, not by other people who do not know our intentions. I am not saying the horse should be there to impress anybody. It is the Germans, who happened to put the horse there. First of all, free the history and tell them we are going to move it away from here to here and I am going to write the history in the correct way and you will come over here to read what I have said and you are going to compare our version and your version.

I am not here to say the horse should be kept there permanently, but let us finish the war first. We did not finish the war at all. Economically we were so suppressed. The land price has been put so high by the horse, it is N\$400 per hectare, N\$500 per hectare, N\$1,000 per hectare and they did not even buy it. It did not even cost them a sixpence, the whole Parliament had to endorse the issue, and the public was watching us, was that how the land reform was supposed to be? That is the question.

It was in that concentrate camp they made children. Some of them gave birth. Some of them did not give birth. It was their babies, not our babies. People did not have any rights or any time to have intercourse with somebody else to make children, it is them who did that and after we had to take care of the children ourselves, give them names because they did not have names.

Our mixed intentions and mixed feelings must be carefully considered. The horse cannot remain there. When Samuel Maharero came here, he had to pay for his funeral to be buried next to his father. He had to buy from the municipality and the same municipality wants to move the horse today. The horse must be removed. Why not ask first, why the municipality?

Why did they not ask any permission from us, why them? Do they have a right above us? Is that the right way this should be done? Let us caucus on the right way to handle matters.

For the time being, the horse has to remain there, Minister of Defence, until you have accomplished what I am saying here. After you have accomplished that, you build your museum and I am not against it. Let

MOTION ON INDEPENDENCE MUSEUM HON IILONGA

the horse remain there and we have to tell them all the time, "you read those words at that statue" and you make sure what those words meant. It will be in a museum for everyone to see, to hear, and to know what was written there. That is the way to do it. I rest my case and I think you know what I have meant by that. The whole Parliament agrees to what I have said, you have to take them to Germany and demand what belongs to you and after that, we are going to put it in a museum.

It is not only that statue, what about Kurt Von Francois? The fact remains that he must bring our heads, he cut off 715 heads from humans and took them to Germany. Did you know that? We have a better case and we have to fight for it, then we have to change the history to that is befitting to everybody of this country. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Chief. Honourable Iilonga.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: Thank you, Comrade Speaker, I rise to contribute to the Motion dealing with monuments.

History, as said by those who spoke before me, is the history of the Namibian people, it cannot be claimed to be the history of only some Namibian people. The history of the German colonial forces is a sad one in Namibia and the Namibian people can be proud that we kept it there for 18 years. It could have been destroyed in March after Independence. We have them in the country where we erected a monument as a sign of reverence of our freedom fighters, but destroyed by Namibians who are against the victory of SWAPO as a liberation movement that time.

18 June 2008 MOTION ON INDEPENDENCE MUSEUM HON IILONGA

There are those who are more comfortable when they are with the colonial masters. They destroyed that statue, because it is not for them. It is not a victor. They do not want to see it here in Namibia after Independence for SWAPO to remember our ex-combatants who were killed by the colonial forces and it was destroyed completely.

We however have a colonial statue which, as put by those who know the military history, is higher and our people do not really understand why that horse is there. Some may understand, but most see it as a decoration. Some would say *matu i koTjomuise tjo muatje Karondoroka*". They do not link that to the colonial history, some who know the colonial history will link it to that.

I am therefore happy to hear Comrade Kazenambo saying that at that statue is where our people were massacred. I was expecting that the proposed Independence Museum must be built there, resembling our people who were massacred there, how they were bayoneted. We keep this horse in the museum and we tell our children to go and see that horse, to see that statue of Von Trotha and you will see how these people were massacred, otherwise the children will never know. It is fortunate that you brought it here so that we know there were people who were massacred there.

Consultation is good and it is better to say the Independence Museum to be built here and let us know what happened during those wars to our ancestors, which we always say their blood sustained us until victory. Let us understand that the contributions come from different understandings but as Honourable Kazenambo said, we are a rainbow people and we must say this is not going to be destroyed like it happened in Iraq or like what happened in the former GDR. We want to defend the statues standing here, but the same Germans are the ones who destroyed all the symbols of Karl Marx and Lenin. Go to Iraq, you saw yourselves when they were clapping hands and now they are crying. Go to Russia, they even renamed Leningrad back to St Pietersburg. Those people have only one nationality in those countries and they no longer have the power of colonialism.

MOTION ON INDEPENDENCE MUSEUM HON IILONGA

I see Honourable Viljoen said he does not want the statue to go because he is very proud of it. It is just as if they are saying they still have the economic power and it is true. Because of our unions the people think we are cowards, but I just want you to understand that this statue is not going to be destroyed, it has be put in a museum.

All the people must suggest what they want to see at this Independence Memorial Museum in order for us to know what happened. Countries show the kids what happened during colonialism so that they do not become traitors, go back to those problems, and experience what their ancestors had gone through. Now we have that horse there, they do not even know what that horse stands for, the history is distorted and therefore, Comrade Speaker, honestly speaking, our people did *ombunguhiro* there for you and me to feel proud today.

Buildings are not the issue. Even this one can in future be turned into a museum, we are not going to remain standing here. When we were building the State House, you were crying and now you want us to have a statue of a colonial master, a person who killed our people. That horse must go to a museum and we want our leaders who were massacred there to be put there and the bayonets to be put there for our Namibian children to see their history, that this is where they come from. The horse must go to the colonial museum. (Intervention)

HON VILJOEN: Honourable Speaker, I think all the people who spoke on this topic did in a responsible way, but the Honourable Member is using the opportunity to make a personal attack. I regret it and I think if it is your way of doing it, then you are a poor person. I thank you.

280

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: Thank you, Honourable Viljoen, yes I am a poor man and I know why I am poor. Even though you denied me education I managed to be in this House.

In conclusion, let us not take the proposal to remove this statue as trying to hurt certain Namibian communities here. My proposal is that I personally want to see that our people who were massacred here to be seen in the proposed Independence Memorial Museum and that the dates to be recorded. Those who did that, like Von Trotha and all those statues must go to a museum like in any other country. We will not destroy it. Some countries did not even consider to put them in museums and they do not even have photos.

We say the horse will be there in a museum and our kids can come, read, go, and say, we must not go through what our ancestors went through. I really want to see that the Honourable Member must have understanding that there are no bad intentions with that *Reiterdenkmal*. All countries, which got their Independence removed all colonial signs, but we will not throw away our history and we will still fight for the reparation. The Chief said it must be there until they pay, they will not pay because they do not want their horse to go. How can you say, unless they pay it will be removed? Then they will say they will not pay and they keep the horse there.

With that, Comrade Speaker, I say all colonial statues must go to a colonial museum. This time I agree with Honourable Ulenga and thank him because today he really acted like a Namibian. I rest my case.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Kawana.

18 June 2008

MOTION ON INDEPENDENCE MUSEUM HON DR KAWANA

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. I rise to add my voice to the Motion before this august House.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Speaker, standing on a Point of Order, can I on a Point of Information say the following: It is regrettable that a Member in this House spoke as if to throw doubts on my... (Interjections)

HON MEMBER: He commended you!

HON ULENGA: Throwing aspersions on my integrity as an Honourable Member of this House. It was totally uncalled for in this kind of discussion. With this kind of correction, I thank you and it should be withdrawn.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: I withdraw.

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS: Honourable Speaker, I have always maintained that the African race or may I say, the black race, is the most forgiving race on earth.

MOTION ON INDEPENDENCE MUSEUM HON DR KAWANA

As you are aware, we lost millions of fellow Africans during the 300 years of slavery. When the DRC was colonised, 10 million Africans died. That number is equivalent to the number of people who died during the First World War – one country in Africa, the DRC.

As Comrade Iilonga said, when the Eastern Block changed their political system, including Germany, all statues which were not in line with the political atmosphere of the day, were destroyed. Those who witnessed the fall of Baghdad saw that the very first statue to be destroyed was that of Saddam Hussein. Therefore, time has come for Namibians to tell their true history, not distorted history as it was told by the colonial regime.

The statue in question represents one of the most painful chapters in the history of our country. As the Honourable Riruako said, it symbolises the genocide committed against our people. Namibia is today sparsely populated because of that history.

Honourable Speaker, I have always asked myself, why is it that when an injustice is done against other races, they get reparation, but when the same injustice is perpetrated against the black race, those who committed such atrocities are not even prepared to apologise? They are not prepared to say only one word — "sorry". I have always asked myself that question.

Honourable Speaker, it is for this reason that I would like to see statues of liberty at the same spot, as previous speakers have also suggested. I would like to see the statues of Samuel Maharero and Hendrik Witbooi and these two statues must be taller, twice as tall as the statue of this war criminal that is depicted there. In my view it will have a meaning, a meaning which says we have overcome oppression, we are courageous as a Namibian Nation, we are heroes of our struggle, we have completed a mission that was started by the Hendrik Witbooi's, Samuel Maherero's, Mandume Ndemfayo's, Iipumbu ya Shilongo's and many others.

The statues of Samuel Maharero and Hendrik Witbooi must be taller than the statue, which is there. The time has come for us to tell our true history.

After listening to some of the Honourable Members, I would like to make a compromise. As a compromise I suggest that the Motion be referred to the relevant Standing Committee of this august House, that Committee must undertake public hearings to listen, to gauge the views of our Nation, and I hope that the Mover of the Motion will consider my proposal and Move an Amendment.

With this, I thank you, Comrade Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: the Honourable Minister for I thank his contribution. Honourable Nujoma.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Comrade Speaker, I also rise to contribute to this Debate. Having listened to all my Colleagues in this august House and recalling the old days when I was with Comrade Ulenga in the USSR, undergoing military training, that time when Honourable Ulenga used to think like myself, horizontally and vertically, we were at all times ad idem. We were always of the same mind. However, today he has surprised me, it seems to me he is now coming back to be the real Ulenga I used to know and that is why I want to support you Ulenga and I agree hundred percent with what you have said. You said what I wanted to say, there remains nothing for me to say. Those were wise words of the Ulenga I used to know.

Therefore, I also agree with the General who was very articulate and mentioned everything in the book, that you cannot compensate victors with statues and honour them. Comrade Iilonga mentioned that we were supposed to have erected our own monuments a long time ago and remove these ones and put them where they belong, perhaps in the dustbin of history or somewhere in a museum. I agree with the wise expressions of the Colleagues, that the best place will be the Independence Memorial

Museum where we can put all these historic relics where our children can study our own history. These are the people who have committed the injustices, who have committed the genocide, firstly against the Namibian people, secondly against the African people and thirdly against all our people who are scattered in the Diaspora. How will those people feel when they come here and we are celebrating and honouring the war criminals and their horses?

Therefore, I agree with the honourable speakers here who have made a positive contribution to this Debate and I fully support the proposal by Honourable Kawana that it be referred to a relevant committee and let us consult.

When I first went to the North, my uncle was asking me, "are you from the sha Kaizer?" Here Kazenambo was also mentioning about the Ongoro no mundu and now people are singing it as if they are praising the colonial history. Those are the distortions, which we must guard against. When you listen to the Herero music now, it seems as if you are praising this Oviritje. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: On a

Point of Order. I am sorry to interrupt Honourable Nujoma, but I cannot help to interrupt him. I fully support what Honourable Kawana has suggested, if you go to the Caprivi Region today, the name Caprivi is from a German coloniser, but there was a suggestion that the Caprivi Region should be called the Lyambezi Region. Some suggested Itenge and when somebody calls Itenge, some of us belittle it to Muyongo. That is cheap analysis, cheap understanding of things. Muyongo can use it for his own distortions, but some people will agree with the suggestion to understand Nation building.

285

MOTION ON INDEPENDENCE MUSEUM HON NUJOMA

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Member, that is beyond a Point of Order, you are making another speech.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: On a Point of Information. I was saying that the people have sentiments about the Caprivi Region because of historical developments and not that they are glorifying Von Caprivi, but historical developments in the formation of this Nation and it is sentimental to them.

Today Otjomuise carries a typical colonialism, there was nothing called Windhoek, it was Otjomuise, /Ae//Gams and so on and today it is Windhoek and we have accepted it, a typical colonial name, which was used by the German colonisers and the list goes on. Let us understand these things from a historical perspective.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Honourable Kazenambo, we must be careful, because we have our young people there, they are following our history. Maybe one day they will be much more radical than us who followed the footsteps of Samuel Maharero, Hendrik Witbooi and all the others and perhaps our generation is a little bit lenient, we are saying, let us take these statues to a place where our children can learn the history. Maybe some people will come here and take over and they will destroy those things. I am telling you! Some of the young people are asking us, "why are you allowing these things to happen in this country, why are you being insulted left, right and centre, our leaders, why are we being insulted in our own country by foreign media, they pump in money here in order to insult our leaders here." Our children may be more radical than us. Maybe they will burn all these things.

MOTION ON INDEPENDENCE MUSEUM HON HOFFMANN

I have followed the wise words of Honourable Ulenga that there is a place for historical relics and this is not a radical departure. If you follow the western countries, the so-called democratic countries, they have invaded other countries, they have destroyed all the monuments there, as Comrade Ulenga has clearly articulated here. In Baghdad, the world was watching how they were destroying Saddam Hussein. Why was it destroyed?

In the eyes of the western countries it represented a sad history, a history of brutality against the Iraqi people, as they say. Now the opposite is happening again, the Iraqi people are under constant bombardment, they are dying every day in their thousands.

Let us not create a situation where our young people will one day become too radical and then destroy everything. We must prevent those types of things from happening and let us take these relics somewhere and create an Independence Memorial like all the other countries. Other countries have done the same. Then we move forward with our history.

I support the proposal by my Colleagues from this side, minus Kazenambo. Thank you very much.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member. Honourable Hoffmann.

HON HOFFMANN: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. I stand up to add my voice to this very important Motion and I will be very brief.

I agree that the symbol remains until the genocide war reparation has been paid. It does matter if it takes a year, thirty years, but even if we are not there, the generations will continue with it.

18 June 2008 MOTION ON INDEPENDENCE MUSEUM HON HOFFMANN

Also on 28 May when we were commemorating the hundred years of release of our people from the concentration camps, a decision was taken that our people will walk and go to the place where they can get the heads of our leaders, our people who were slaughtered by the Germans.

I agree that this history is not only for certain tribes, but also for all the people, the Nation of Namibia. Some people have noted that our history is forgotten and that was of the oppression of the previous South African regime. People are even saying there are people who do not have history. It is not because we want it to be like that, but it was because of the situation. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: May I ask the Honourable Member a question?

HON HOFFMANN: No thank you, I do not have enough time, let me continue. The symbols must remain so that our children must know. From today, it must happen that, the history must be taught in the schools, the true history in the right way.

It is very painful that only now in 2006 Honourable Chief Riruako has brought it here and to some people it seems nothing will happen. At least there are some people abroad who are very much concerned about this issue and also discuss it, even if it is not discussed at the Parliament. It is a very important history for all the people of this country, the Namibian Nation must know what has happened, what the Germans have done to our people, especially with the Extermination Order, *Volkemoord*, which said "kill the women and children." (Intervention)

18 June 2008

MOTION ON INDEPENDENCE MUSEUM HON HOFFMANN

HON MEMBER: Wipe them out.

HON HOFFMANN: Thank you for that, wipe them out. That is history and the whole Nation must be honest to ourselves, write the true history, and teach our children the true history so that we can unite as one Nation, one Namibia. I thank you.

<u>HON SPEAKER:</u> The House shall rise and adjourn and resume tomorrow at 14:30.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:50 UNTIL 2008.06.19 AT 14:30

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY ASSEMBLY CHAMBER 19 JUNE 2008 WINDHOEK

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

.____

HON SPEAKER: Any Petitions? Any Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Honourable Kaiyamo

TABLING: REPORT OF SECOND SESSION OF CHILDREN'S PARLIAMENT

HON KAIYAMO: Honourable Speaker, I lay upon the Table Report and Communiqué of the Second Session of the Children's Parliament from the 6th to the 9th of May this year for consideration.

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Member table the Report? Any further Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Minister !Naruseb.

.____

TABLING: ANNUAL REPORT, 2006: COMMUNAL LAND BOARD

TABLING OF REPORTS HON!NARUSEB

HON MINISTER OF LANDS AND RESETTLEMENT: Comrade Speaker, I lay upon the Table the Annual Report 2006 of the Communal Land Board.

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Member table the Report? Any further Reports or Papers? Any Notice of Questions? Any Notice of Motions? Any Ministerial Statements? Question 19 is by Honourable Schimming-Chase. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS

QUESTION 19:

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: Honourable Speaker, I do not know if the Table Office is not aware of it, but it was requested that this Question should stand over until the Minister herself is present. I will put it when the Minister is present.

HON SPEAKER: Question 26 is by Honourable Dienda. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

QUESTION 26:

HON DIENDA: I Put the Question.

RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS HON DR NDJOZE-OJO

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF EDUCATION: The question was on school boards and the answer is as follows:

School boards can introduce feeding programmes to assist orphans and vulnerable children and they are free to source funding from non-governmental organisations, the school alumni or any institution of their choice.

The Ministry of Education also has feeding programmes at 518 primary schools in all thirteen Regions. The Namibia School Feeding Programme, as it is known, is only applicable to primary schools where learners are more vulnerable because they are less able to take care of themselves. The number of learners that are currently benefiting from the programme is plus minus 100,000 and they are fed at a cost of about N\$15 million annually.

The Namibian School Feeding Programme was started by the United Nations World Food Programme, which provided financial assistance in 1992 to 147 schools in Keetmanshoop, Khorixas and Windhoek. In 1994, the programme was expanded to all thirteen Regions. In February 1997, the World Food Programme pulled out and the Ministry of Education solely took over from there with the aim of ensuring better health and regular school attendance.

Learners who are entitled to benefit from the Ministry's School Feeding Programme are as follows: They are learners who are orphans or who are neglected, abused and marginalised, or whose parents earn less than N\$500 per month or learners who are staying with their grandparents, learners who are being raised by single parents or whose parents are unemployed, learners showing signs of malnutrition, and learners who eat less than two meals a day.

The procedures that are followed for a school to benefit from the School Feeding Programme are as follows:

• The school completes an application form;

RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS HON DR NDJOZE-OJO

- Applications are forwarded to the Regional Education Office;
- The Regional Director recommends the application;
- If recommended, the application is forwarded to the Permanent Secretary for approval;
- Upon the Permanent Secretary's approval, the Head Office includes the particular school on the distribution list.

The community has the responsibility of collecting wood, providing cooks, building a cooking shelter, acquiring plates and spoons, providing soap for cleaning, providing cooking utensils and providing building materials to construct a storeroom.

Sometimes these kinds of activities are also used to pay in kind for the school development fund. If you cannot afford in monetary terms, you can actually contribute by doing this and then your child is covered.

The following is a table indicating the number of schools and number of learners who are benefiting from the programme.

Region	No. of Schools	No. of Learners	
Caprivi	83	12,499	
Erongo	24	4,774	
Hardap	40	9,338	
Karas	30	9,338	
Kavango	220	27,259	
Khomas	10	1,331	
Kunene	78	8,197	
Ohangwena	33	5,251	
Omaheke	27	6,094	
Omusati	36	4,196	
Oshana	8	715	
Oshikoto	45	6,398	
Otjozondjupa	31	7,096	

I	thank	you,	Honourable	Speaker.
---	-------	------	------------	----------

.____

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Deputy Minister. Question 27 is by Honourable Dienda. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

QUESTION 27:

HON DIENDA: I Put the Question.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: As an obedient Public Servant, I will try to answer and you have to follow the questions on the Question Paper as I am not going to read the questions.

On Question 1 the answer is as follows: Apart from supervisors for newly proclaimed Local Authority areas and by-elections, only unemployed Namibians are required to submit applications with the following requirements: Grade 12 or Grade 10 certificate with previous registration or polling experience. New applicants strictly Grade 12 and above. Computer literacy and drivers' licence is an added advantage. Applicants should only be a resident of the Region, constituency or local authority area where the electoral activity takes place.

A selection committee comprising of the Electoral Commission of Namibia officials is tasked with the sorting of applications, short listing and selection of the registration or polling officials.

To Question 2 the answer is as follows: Definitely disadvantaged persons are given special preference both at constituency level and ad head office. The Electoral Commission tries to include these persons even if they do not meet the requirements, as long as they have basic literacy. The Electoral Commission does not discriminate against those living with HIV/AIDS. Applicants are not requested to disclose their HIV/AIDS status when submitting applications due to confidentiality.

In addition the Electoral Commission highly considers the gender balance when making final selections.

Answer to Question 3: Remuneration is done as per Treasury approval, based on the job category and description of the particular temporary position that is registration supervisor, returning officer, presiding officer, registration officer and polling officer. However, Government officials are paid less than unemployed persons for the mere fact that they get their normal salaries from their respective Ministries on top of election payments.

Answer to 3(b): Although Government officials have been used in the past in supervisory positions for small elections, such as newly proclaimed local authority elections and by-elections as registration supervisors and presiding officers, the Electoral Commission embarked on the recruiting only unemployed citizens for different election processes, including continuous registration of voters.

Government officials are appointed in supervisory positions for the mere fact that in case of an event where the Electoral Commission has to trace the supervisors, it can be done through the Ministry's Permanent Secretary. It is a known fact that unemployed people move from one place to another in search for work and immediate location might be a problem in an emergency. For example, in 2003 for the general registration of voters, the Electoral Commission advertised for Government officials to apply through secondment by their respective Permanent Secretaries with the consent of their supervisors. These officers were recruited in supervisory positions for the mere fact that in case of an event where the Electoral Commission has to trace the

supervisors, it can be done through the Ministry's Permanent Secretary. It is a known fact that unemployed people move from place to place.

In 2004 the Electoral Commission of Namibia used the same database and wrote letters to different Ministries' Permanent Secretary to second Government officials only if they could be released by their immediate supervisors. As could be seen in the 2004 election reports, out of 7,434 polling officials for Presidential and National Assembly elections, 4,843 were unemployed. In addition, 51 of those unemployed persons were people with disabilities. The same persons were recruited for the Regional Council elections as the two elections were only two weeks apart.

Answer to 3(c): Not only the Electoral Commission, but all credible institutions will not prefer using inexperienced persons as trainers.

Question (d): The Electoral Commission of Namibia is using trainers from the Election Support Consortium. The Electoral Commission and Legal Assistance Centre and Namibia Institute of Democracy, Democracy Support Centre, the Ministry of Education and Culture, etcetera.

Invitation has also been extended to UNAM but with no success. It should also be noted that trainers from other institutions have their work schedules and only avail themselves when they have no pressure from their own work. Obviously, the Electoral Commission will not be kept hostage by the unavailability of staff from other institutions, but do the training themselves.

Question 4: Joint preparations for the Local Authority elections for Oshikuku, Ruacana and Okahao in 2005: The Electoral Commission sent letters to Regional Councils of Okahao, Ruacana and Oshikuku Constituencies to identify three candidates for each Local Authority area through the Constituency Development Committees to be interviewed by the Electoral Commission for the selection of suitable education officers, one for each of the three respective local authorities for a period of two months. The Constituency Development Committees regarded local education as important for the credibility and ownership of the electoral process by the locals, hence their education.

Again in 2005, for the elections of Ruacana, Oshikuku and Okahao, the Electoral Commission also used Government officials in supervisory positions, but the rest were unemployed Namibians, mostly the youth.

Question 4(a): The criteria for the candidates do not include political-party affiliation.

4(b): The Electoral Commission does not recruit officials based on political-party affiliation. In addition, the Electoral Commission regarded constituency officers as Government officers of the Regional Government but not necessarily as political-party officers, as any elected member will operate from the offices regardless of which party these persons are affiliated to.

Additional information: Caprivi Region has a team of eight registration officers, all unemployed youth. Hardap Region has eight registration officers, all unemployed youth. The Karas Region has eighteen registration officers, all unemployed youth. Kunene Region has eighteen registration officers, all unemployed youth.

For the Rundu Rural West constituency by-elect in December 2007 the Electoral Commission employed forty-eight registration officials, all unemployed, of which three were disabled persons and one registration supervisor who was a Government official. Similarly, ninety-six polling officials were recruited and three disabled persons were among the group.

I hope I have satisfied the curiosity of Honourable Dienda. Thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Prime Minister for his detailed answer. Question 28 is also addressed to the Right Honourable Prime Minister.

QUESTION 28:

HON DIENDA: I Put the Question.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: I totally and wholeheartedly agree with Honourable Dienda. However, I would like to suggest to her that she puts the question to the Minister of Works and Transport who is actually responsible for airports. Thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Prime Minister. Question 33 is by Honourable Dienda. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

QUESTION 33:

HON DIENDA: I Put the Question.

HON MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. I rise to respond to questions raised by Honourable Dienda concerning labour inspections in Namibia.

Honourable Dienda started by saying that labour inspectors seem to be a huge problem for the Namibian working people. I want to clear this misconception by putting the role and functions of the labour inspectors into the legal framework within which they operate, namely the Labour Act (Act No. 6 of 1992), which soon will be replaced by the new Labour Act (Act No. 11 of 2007).

Under the current Labour Act of 1992 as well as the new one, labour inspectors deal with disputes of rights, meaning that they deal with basic conditions of employment as stipulated in the Labour Acts. The said Labour Acts have provided for collective bargaining process, which may, if failed, result in disputes of interests. Any other working conditions, which go beyond the stipulated basic conditions of employment in the Labour Act, will not fall under the jurisdiction of the labour inspectors as such.

The stage of toy-toying usually comes when collective bargaining between workers and employers fails or does not take place at all, due to reasons and difficulties experienced at and in the negotiation process.

Labour inspectors, therefore, do not deal with collective labour relation issues, but only with dispute of rights, as stipulated in the Labour Act, and they do this through inspection and investigation. The Labour Commissioner, on the one hand, deals with collective labour relation matters, such as conciliation, mediation and soonest with arbitration.

I would also like to use this opportunity to inform the august House that through labour inspections, labour inspectors cater for labour protection, for the workforce at all workplaces which can be defined as protection from unfair labour practices, such as non-payment of wages or salaries, unfair dismissal, etcetera, as provided for in the Act.

Question 1: How many labour inspectors do we have in all thirteen Regions?

Right now, labour inspectors are indeed very thin on the ground all over this vast country which has around 2,500 formal workplaces and over 75,000 informal establishments, including commercial and communal farming sectors.

The Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare currently has fifteen regional labour officers all over the thirteen Regions and there are only 38 labour inspectors. However, there are only one or two inspectors at each of the offices due to the severe understaffing of the Labour Inspectorate.

While labour inspectors are public servants, they are in fact an essential and necessary component of the Public Service and Private Sector's working environment.

In order to illustrate this point, I would like to give the Honourable Members some of the latest statistics from the last Financial Year, which is self-explanatory.

Labour inspectors have conducted 496 inspections all over the country. Out of the 3,957 labour complaints lodged at labour offices in the country, 3,119 were solved amicably and 522 remained pending due to many factors. Some labour complainants cannot be traced for follow-up.

An amount of N\$56,380 was paid back to employees after their labour cases were handled by the labour inspectors of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare.

In many cases, labour inspectors are, therefore noticed only if they fail in their duties or their assumed duties, but the measure of social stability being enjoyed now can be largely credited to the effectiveness of their work.

Question 2: What kind of ongoing training is provided to them?

Regular training is provided to the labour inspectors, mainly with the financial and technical, assistance from the International Labour Organisation. The latest training was about the Integrated Labour Systems, which integrate the work of labour and occupational health and safety inspectors or also known as factory inspectors who are specifically catering for the protection of employees from hazards at workplaces.

There is an ongoing ILO sponsored training, which is likely to be completed by the end of this year, 2008

Question 3: Who is supervising them and how often is it done?

In terms of section 3 of the current Labour Act, the Minister responsible for labour appoints labour inspectors and they are furnished with a certificate signed by the Permanent Secretary.

The Director and two Deputy Directors head the Directorate of Labour Services, under which labour and factory inspectors fall. A Senior Control Labour Officer regularly supervises labour inspectors in the Regions and there are four Chief Labour Inspectors for Southern Central, Northern and North-Eastern parts of the country, and they are directly supervising the offices in their respective Regions.

The abovementioned senior and middle management go, on a regular basis, to visit all regional and district labour offices as to check on how directives communicated from the Headquarters are being implemented, assess the effectiveness of inspections and identify challenges thereof.

Question 4: Complaints from the public can be submitted to the Headquarters in Windhoek about allegations of poor service from any of the labour inspectors.

Investigation is taking place and answers can be given within two weeks as per the Customer Service Charger of the Directorate of Labour Services, the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare, in particular, and that of Public Service in general.

I thank you very much.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Minister for his answer. Question 34 is by Honourable Dienda. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

QUESTION 34:

HON DIENDA: I Put the Question.

301

HON MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: I want to take the Floor and answer the questions by Honourable Dienda.

The first question was: How often is research done on the demands of workers in the labour market?

The Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare gathers information on the Namibian labour force, using two types of surveys and official records, namely:

- Household-based surveys
- Establishment-based surveys; and
- Administrative records

Household-based Surveys: These surveys are conducted at the level of households. Information on employment, unemployment as well as demographic and characteristics of individuals in households is collected through these surveys. The Labour Force Surveys and Informal Sector Surveys are examples of household-based surveys. Both of these surveys are conducted after every three years. However, plans are underway to incorporate an informal sector module in the upcoming labour force survey.

Establishment Surveys: This type of surveys target establishments (businesses) and the main respondents are owners/managers of establishments.

These surveys collect information on the number of employees employed in different occupations across different industries in the country. Information on vacancies that are hard to fill due to lack of skills are also identified through these surveys. Establishment surveys are carried out through Occupational Wages Survey and Skills Assessment Survey. An Establishment Survey is carried out after every two years.

Administrative Records: These data are produced as a by-product of the administrative functions of an agency, such as a Government department. In undertaking these functions, often under the authority of a set of laws or regulations, an organisation will generally register or record a great deal of information, which is needed for the administrative process. The Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare uses administrative records of the Ministry of Home Affairs and Immigration on expatriates. Statistics on expatriates are important in assessing their impacts on the job market as well as the dependency of the economy on expatriates. This exercise is undertaken after every five years.

Question 2: How wide are the findings of the research distributed?

After surveys are conducted, the information is analysed and reports of findings compiled, reports are released through a press conference where the major findings are revealed. Information on the survey findings is further disseminated to the wider public through complementary copies to Ministries and to education resource centres, national libraries, archives, university and polytechnic, research institutions, Regional Councils, etcetera. The future intention is to organise workshops to disseminate the information from surveys if finances allow.

Question 3: How are the findings used for the introduction of relevant courses at tertiary education and other institutions?

As stated earlier, information on the skills demanded in the labour market is revealed through the findings of the surveys. Highest levels of education attained by those employed in different sectors of the economy are also reflected in the survey reports.

Information from reports on the expatriates reveals the skills needed in Namibia and gives an indication on how to reduce dependency on expatriates through effective training of Namibians by academic institutions as well as on-the-job to enable them to occupy positions occupied by expatriates.

Information on the skills composition of the expatriates as well as their occupations will reveal the skills needed in Namibia and it will thus spur those on to create new as well as adjusting existing ones in order to meet the needs identified in the findings.

Question 4: How often are life skills teachers informed in order to enhance the career guidance at schools?

Career guidance is carried out by the Sub-division Vocational Counselling Services in the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare. The sub-division is staffed by qualified and registered psychologists and psychological counsellors. They are responsible for offering a professional career guidance service. This is done in schools and at Ministry's offices. When they go to the schools, their contact persons are the life skills teachers. In Regions where the Ministry has vocational counsellors, they visit schools for orientation talks, that is to inform the learners about the advantages of engaging in vocational counselling. This is usually done at the beginning of the year. The life skills teachers do the arrangements. Some schools see the counselling as important, while others do not, counselling is usually a voluntary process.

The Ministry supplies free of charge its Career Guidance Books entitled "Careers in Namibia 2005/2006" to all schools with Grade 8 and above. Each school receives two books for the library and one copy for the life skills teacher. These books contain vital information on how to apply for jobs, the different colleges and the entry requirements, companies and organisation and types of occupations they have institutions where one can get loans and bursaries, etcetera. This book is in short a packaged vocational counsellor itself. To those who have access to the Internet, it is also available on the following address: www.ics.gov.na.

The frequency of contact of ministerial staff with the life skills teachers is an ongoing process. It is driven by the staff's and the life skills teachers' initiatives. The relevant life skills teachers have hundred percent access to information, which is necessary for career guidance through the career guidebooks. The life skills teachers organise annual career fairs for secondary schools in different regions. On almost all these fairs,

vocational counsellors are invited to exhibit. For example, on the 6^{th} to the 7^{th} of February our vocational counsellors attended such a fair in Rehoboth. On 11 to 13 February they attended another one at Academia Secondary School in Windhoek and on 14 to 15 February they attended another one in Walvis Bay.

During the fairs, there is a great chance of getting one-on-one contact with vocational counsellors and teachers during career guidance sessions at their schools.

Lastly, I would like to mention that we have vocational counsellors stationed in the following Regions: Khomas, Oshana, Karas, Kavango and Caprivi. We are driving a process whereby we will have at least one vocational counsellor per region. I thank you very much.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Minister. Question 39 is by Honourable Viljoen. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

QUESTION 39:

HON VILJOEN: I Put the Question.

HON MINISTER OF LANDS AND RESETTLEMENT: Honourable Speaker, with all very noble and good intentions, this Minister is unable to respond to something that he does not even know when it happened. Maybe we need to pass this on to the appropriate Ministry.

RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS HON SMIT

HON SPEAKER: Maybe Honourable Viljoen will re-look at the question and in consultation with the Minister, redirect the question to the appropriate Minister. Question 40 is by Honourable Mbai. Does the Honourable Member Put the Question?

QUESTION 40:

HON MBAI: I Put the Question.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. The question by Honourable Member is about lack of drainage structures on District Road 2344, that is the road from Omaruru to Omatjete-Otjiwarongo in the Daures Constituency.

Reference is made to the Notice of Question Number 40 and lack of drainage on this specific road. Firstly, we appreciate and thank the Honourable Member for acknowledging the regular maintenance work that is carried out on the abovementioned road. We are encouraged to know that our efforts to maintain our roads are recognised and appreciated by road-users.

As correctly observed by the Honourable Member, the road between Omaruru and Omatjete lacks adequate drainage structures. This, however, is not a unique situation in the country. A number of other roads in our vast country have similar conditions, which is as a result of a severe lack of funds to be able to carry out all important maintenance activities on all our roads.

To meet and mitigate this serious problem of a lack of drainage structures, we are currently constructing cut-off walls on these roads to try to

RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS HON SMIT

minimise the washing away of the roads during the rainy seasons. However, as long as the funding issues persist, we shall continue to have roads like the DR 2344 with insufficient structures.

Honourable Speaker, we will appreciate it if the Honourable Member may assist us and the House to allocate more funding for road maintenance and to build roads and if the House will also assist us to increase the fuel levy. We are so used now to the increase of fuel levies, why can we not add more to maintain our roads?

With these few remarks, I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: The House shall rise for refreshments.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:40 HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:25 PURSUANT TO ADJOURNMENT

HON SPEAKER: The first Notice of Motion is the one of the Honourable Minister of Finance. Does the Honourable Minister Move that the Bill be now introduced?

VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL: INTRODUCTION AND FIRST READING

19 June 2008

VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: I so Move, Honourable Speaker.

.

HON SPEAKER: Who seconds? Any objection? Agreed to. Will the Honourable Minister please table the Bill? The Secretary will now read the Bill a First Time.

SECRETARY: Value-Added Tax Amendment Bill.

HON SPEAKER: Does the Minister Move that the Bill be now read a Second Time? Seconded? Objection? Agreed to. The Honourable Minister has the Floor.

VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL: SECOND READING

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members of the House.

As announced by His Excellency the President yesterday, Government is taking a number of measures to deal with the impact of rising food prices in our country. The proposed interventions include the VAT zero-rating of some basic food items. It is in this regard that I would like to motivate

the tabling of the proposed Amendments to the Value-Added Tax Act No. 10 of 2000.

Before I move to the tabling, allow me to give an account of the economic developments that have led to the increased food price and outline some of the options that Government has considered as remedial measures to address the economic plight of the Namibian people.

As mentioned by His Excellency the President, the phenomenon of spiralling food price inflation is not confined to Namibia, but it is part of a global trend that is affecting many countries across the globe. The root of the problem of high food prices comprises a number of factors. These are poor harvests in some major food exporting countries during 2007 due to adverse weather conditions; diversion of land and food grains, including maize and other cereals to produce ethanol as a substitute for petrol, diversion of land for fodder and grazing and food grains, including corn and other cereals to produce livestock feed and steep increases in oil prices that drove up the lost of commercial production of food crops through increases in the prices of fuel, fertiliser and plant chemicals.

At the same time, the global demand for food grains, oils and fat, milk and milk products and meat has been increasing due to growth in population and shift in consumption patterns of growing middle classes worldwide to high protein diets containing meat, milk and milk products. This combination of lower food supply increased production cost and growing demand has been behind the recent increase in food price escalation.

The consequences are particular felt in the net food and oil importing countries of sub-Saharan Africa to which Namibia belongs. Namibian food prices have risen by up to 30 percent in April 2008. As a result, Namibians with low incomes are finding it increasingly difficult to make ends meet.

It should be understood, however, that the underlying process of this inflation requires a global response. Most of the affected food items are traded internationally at market prices and coordination between importing and exporting countries is vital to achieve any lasting solution.

19 June 2008 VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

While international consultations on the issue are gaining pace, any supply side response will take some time. What countries can do in the short term, however, is to mitigate the impact of high food prices especially on the poor.

At the country level, the Government of Namibia convened a task force to come up with proposals on how to provide relief to those most vulnerable. The task force investigated a range of options, which were scrutinised with regard to how effective they would be in providing relief to the poor and how fast they could be implemented. They were also assessed in terms of their opportunity costs to Government.

Following in-depth deliberations, Government decided to pursue the following measures as announced in the Presidential Address:

- VAT zero-rating of three essential food items, namely sunflower cooking oil, animal fat, fresh and dried beans and bread and cake flower;
- Strengthening the capacity of the Namibian Fish Consumption Promotion Trust to expand the distribution of fish throughout the country; and
- Expanding the Namibian Food Feeding Programme to cover non-boarding schools in the rural areas and townships.

Of the above instruments, the Value-Added Tax zero-rating cost Government approximately N\$34 million per annum in terms of revenue lost. The Budget deficit will consequently have to be revised up by the same amount. The other two choices will be funded by realising savings within the existing Budget.

As we have indicated before, Government maintains flexibility in its fiscal policy to take special measures aimed at address specific situations should this be deemed necessary. Under the current Budget, there are already a number of programmes that are targeted to provide relief to the poor, such as the increase in the social grant, extension of the orphans and vulnerable

19 June 2008 VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

children's grant coverage, Food-for-Work Programme and relief to disaster victims. These proposed Amendments must be seen in this context.

We know that this well-intended measure faces the risk that the relief will not be passed on to consumers. We hope that retailers will show patriotism and allow this benefit to trickle down to the consumers and not to capture some of it in their profit margin. Ultimately, only the consumer can put pressure on retailers to lower their prices in accordance with the VAT reduction.

I, therefore, call upon all our leaders, including the Honourable Members of this House to support the public information campaign in this regard in order to empower the public to be able to support the implementation of this measure. The public needs to be aware of the items on which the zero-rating will apply and to demand the reduction in price of those items commensurate to the amount of the abolished VAT. I am not by this encouraging the public in engage in confrontation against traders, I am simply encouraging them to assert their rights as citizens.

I must reiterate that the above measures are only aimed at mitigating the impact of high food prices, but they cannot address the root causes. This has to be done on the production side. While international efforts are underway to come up with solutions, we need to do our share at the country level.

A number of measures have already been taken by our Government to increase food production in Namibia in the medium term. For example, the Ministry of Agriculture was allocated N\$3 billion over the Medium Term Expenditure Framework period, which includes N\$360 million for irrigation infrastructure projects and technology improvement under the Green Scheme. Similarly, AgriBank has increased the effectiveness of the Affirmative Action Loan Scheme by extending production loans to help new farmers optimise their output. In addition, the necessary legislative Amendments have been put in place to allow AgriBank to finance aquaculture projects.

19 June 2008 VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

The Land Acquisition and Development Fund that so far focused on buying farms and resettlement will soon also provide support to resettled farmers to set up production.

The Development Bank of Namibia has seen its capitalisation increased to expand its lending activities to small-scale projects, especially in the rural areas. Moreover, the current Budget makes provision for fertiliser subsidies to small-scale farmers in communal areas, amount to some N\$61 million over the Medium Term Expenditure Framework period.

Further support is provided to the Agricultural Sector by making a number of inputs tax deductible. In addition, part-time farmers are able to offset losses from their farming activities against the tax bill on their main source of income. For example, for the tax year ending February 2007, farming losses of N\$133 million were offset in this way and this is a form of subsidy.

All these efforts are aimed at raising agricultural output and improving food security in our country.

Internationally initiatives have included a resolution by the African Development Bank Governors' Board, at its meeting held in May 2008 in Maputo, that the Bank Management comes up with proposals for dealing with the problem of rising food prices specific to the African context, including the role to be played by the Bank.

We shall follow these developments closely and try to maximise the expected benefits locally. The Bank has introduced new instruments aimed at promoting accelerated growth in African economies. These include the private sector farming facility and the fertiliser facility. The Bank's staff visited our country recently to publicise its activities also to the private sector audience at a private sector information-sharing seminar that took place here in Windhoek on the 9th of June 2008.

I want to call upon the private sector, including our farmers, to make full use of these facilities as well as the ones provided by Government that I

VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL HON P MUSHELENGA

referred to earlier in order to help our country to find a long-term solution to the economic problems facing us.

To conclude Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I wish to appeal for a focused and short Debate on this proposed Amendment, since the benefits only become accessible when the Bill is passed into the law. Therefore, the longer we keep the Bill here, the more we delay the benefits to the public.

With these few remarks, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I table the Amendment Bill for the consideration and approval by this House. I thank you.

<u>HON SPEAKER:</u> I thank the Minister for her motivation. Any further discussion?

.____

HON P MUSHELENGA: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker, I will try to be very brief because I concur with the Honourable Minister of Finance that it is important that we expedite the process of approving this very important Bill that is aimed at mitigating the high cost of food prices.

Government should be praised for coming up with these measures, but of course, there will always be some people who would be saying, "Why is it only on these items, why not on other items?" Government derives its income from taxes, both from direct taxes as well as from indirect taxes.

From direct taxes, Government introduced marginal rates to ensure equity. The more you are paid, the higher the tax you pay; the lower you are paid, the lower the tax that you pay.

Coming to zero-rating VAT on essential foodstuffs, it is obviously a relief measure that would benefit the poor people in our communities, because these are the basic foodstuffs. Even in the church we pray, "Give us this day our daily bread", so it is important that it becomes zero-rated.

However, as the Minister says, we need public support for these measures, because you will now find out that the Government would zero-rate VAT on these projects, yet traders, shop owners will not reduce the prices. While benefiting from the zero-rating of VAT on these foodstuffs, they would keep the prices of these foodstuffs at the same level they are now. That is why it is important for the consumer groups to really come in, as the Honourable Minister said, not in a confrontational manner but in a manner that will make the traders to understand that when relief measures are introduced, it is not only to benefit them, but it is to benefit the consumers.

With these words, Honourable Speaker, I support the Bill.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member for his contribution. Honourable Schimming-Chase.

HON SCHIMMING-CHASE: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. Honourable Speaker, I rise to commend the Executive for this action that has been taken. If you will recall, I have suggested amongst others that one limits the mark-up on foodstuffs so as to make it easier for the poor to be able to buy the food. I do not think that everybody has the right response, but I welcome the response of the Executive that, even though that was not taken into consideration, what in fact is being tabled here is a valiant attempt. I am proud to recognise that the Government of Namibia is doing what many Governments are doing to try to fight the big problem that is going to face us with food shortage.

19 June 2008 VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL HON ULENGA

Therefore, in keeping with the request of the Honourable Minister, I will end there and say I support the Bill and congratulate the President and the Executive for having taken this decision.

<u>HON SPEAKER:</u> I thank the Honourable Member for her contribution. Honourable Ulenga.

HON ULENGA: Honourable Speaker, the mistake is maybe mine because I walked in a little late, but first just to say it is a good thing that Government has finally moved on this issue. Everybody has been waiting for this kind of step to happen. I just have a few questions and I say the mistake may be lying with me because I walked in late.

Knowing the Namibian people and the way they can be so literal, I wonder whether the animal fat includes milk or did the Minister already talk about milk and dairy products? In addition, if that is not included, would it be too much for it to be included? Many Namibian communities just depend on *pap en melk* for their daily staple.

I see here there is bread and cake flour, which are both wheat products. I do not know whether maize is included.

Then the Minister seems to have talked about the ways of putting some campaign to make sure that the retailers keep to this regulation and law. I wonder whether this cannot be strengthened so that there is some punishment on those who may be caught cutting out the VAT factor, by increasing the prices in an unjustified manner. Because we do not have strong consumer lobbies in Namibia, most of the people who buy these kinds of products would not even know about the consumer lobbies. I wonder how we can really make it work in practice. It is just a question and I do not think it really has to depend on the Minister, but how can it be

19 June 2008 VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL HON NAMBAHU

made to work effectively? I thank you, Honourable Speaker, I support the Amendment.

<u>HON SPEAKER:</u> I thank the Honourable Member for his contribution. Honourable Nambahu.

HON NAMBAHU: Thank you very much for the opportunity to wholeheartedly support this Bill and to actually urge the traders to emulate Government. It should be emphasised from the word go that Government is sacrificing income because we all know that VAT represents a source of income, but Government has gone to the extent of sacrificing it in recognising the problem the poor and all the citizens are facing. Notwithstanding all the other problems, which exist, it is simply to appeal to the morale and patriotic instincts in all of us to emulate Government. They have sacrificed and it is going to be reflected in Government's income. If Government does that, who else out there is not supposed to emulate this kind of gesture by Government? The business people definitely have to emulate this and put it into practice.

I will definitely heed the call to make short contributions, but I wanted to register that and appeal to my compatriots to heed that good example of Government and cut on their profit margins. I support the Bill wholeheartedly.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member for his contribution. Honourable Viljoen.

VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL HON VILJOEN / RT HON N ANGULA

<u>HON VILJOEN</u>: Honourable Speaker, I wish to support this Motion and I also had a problem with animal fat and I would like the Honourable Minister to explain what it includes.

Then I am concerned that some of the businesses may increase the prices of these types of food and then it will not be worth this effort and it must be monitored. Thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank Honourable Viljoen for his contribution. Prime Minister.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Mine is just to thank the Honourable Minister of Finance for swiftly responding to the Cabinet resolution and fast-tracking this Amendment. At the same time, I would like to thank the Ministry of Justice for providing technical services to assist the Ministry of Finance.

Secondly, I want to say that as citizens, we are faced with a big problem as far as the cost and supply of food is concerned. Yes, Government is doing its part by zero-rating additional items plus mahangu and maizemeal. However, we know that despite the zero-rating of maize-meal the price of maize-meal has been going up. That we know and we know why. One is what the Minister has said, that the price of maize as a commodity is set by the international market, demand and supply. Even if it is zero-rated in Namibia, the high price on the market itself is a problem.

Another problem is the transport cost, which really means that we as citizens must also make our own efforts, especially those who have access to land and particularly those who live near permanent water sources, to really start small things to support your families. That is the only way we can secure sustainable food supply.

VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL RT HON N ANGULA

I also hope that the informal traders who trade in *omaere* will also increase their reach, to reach more people. I was encouraged the other day by Mr Sydney Martin, one of the successful farmers, who has branched out into milk cattle and he is supply *omaere* to Katutura through his own channels. It is good to have this type of trading so that people do not only depend on going to Woermann Brock or Shoprite, but also to source food from small traders like those that Mr Martin has done. That will really help out. If everybody is going to depend upon formal shops, I do not see that we are going to cope with this situation for the next twelve months.

What we have to do is to encourage the informal people, those who are able to provide commodities and also encourage those who can to produce for themselves whatever they can. Whether it is a chicken, a goat – I understand goat milk is the best in fighting malnutrition – or a small garden if you are near a source of water to support your family. That is really the way to go.

Otherwise, with the price of these formal products, which are determined by the world market, and the ever-increasing oil price, even if Government zero-rates all the products, I cannot see a solution. The source is the problem and these Government efforts should, therefore, be matched by our own personal efforts as consumers, to try and supplement whatever we buy from the shops with our own production.

For example, in my house we have decreed that of the seven days a week, four days we eat mahangu pap with dried vegetables, the traditional way. We have to go back to our traditions if we want to survive. On Sunday you can have a special meal, perhaps Pasta and some other things. However, if you decide that from Monday to Sunday you are going to eat Pasta, you are going to be in trouble. I, therefore, hope that Honourable Tjihuiko will also declare *pap and omaere*.

This is a serious problem because the food prices cannot come down because there is a shortage of food, the oil prices, etcetera and we have to look at our own traditional systems of food production if we want to survive. (Interjection). Viljoen eats *biltong*, *pap en biltong*. Everybody has something.

19 June 2008 VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL HON TJIHUIKO

Honourable Members, the message is that Government is trying, but Government cannot solve all our problems, we have to meet the Government halfway. Thank you.

<u>HON SPEAKER:</u> I thank the Honourable Prime Minister. Honourable Tjihuiko.

HON TJIHUIKO: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. Allow me to congratulate the Ministry of Finance for the quick action that they have taken to address this issue.

I agree hundred percent with what Honourable Nambahu has just said, that Government acted but this is not only for Government. Government has shown a sense of responsibility, but they will not succeed unless all the key players in the economy put their hands on the wheel and try to get the process going. However, I think this is where the question of participation by the private sector is crucial.

If we are talking about reducing tax on basic necessities, we should not only look at this and say Government should reduce tax but we are going to get our money by increasing the price of commodities. It would not help. It must be seen to be a joint venture between the private sector and Government and all of us. That is why I am supporting what Honourable Nambahu has just said.

The other point I want to raise as far as the private sector is concerned is the question of cross-subsidisation of products. This should not be seen that they are going to reduce the price of the mentioned commodities and increase the prices of other essential products. That would also not help. We should look at it from the point of view that as Namibians, as citizens, we are going to put our heads together and try to help those people in that

VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL HON MBAI

section of the community who cannot afford to meet these demands. If we do it that way, the reaction of the masses will not only affect Government, it will also affect the private sector, because if they start feeling the pinch, they will go out there and help themselves whether the police are there, whether the Government is there. They will go out there and help themselves to that and that is a situation we should avoid by all means. That is why it is important for us to join forces and do everything in our power to meet each other halfway. I feel it is a commendable action that Government has taken and that is the best way to go about it.

With those few comments, I support the Amendment Bill.

<u>HON SPEAKER</u>: I thank the Honourable Member for his contribution. Any further discussion? Honourable Mbai.

HON MBAI: Honourable Speaker, thank you very much. I would also like to congratulate the Honourable Minister of Finance for coming up with a remedy that has been overdue for quite some time. I would also like to urge the Honourable Members of the House not to dwell too much on this Bill because I concur with the Minister that the longer we have this Bill in the House, the longer we will delay the implementation.

I would like to appeal and request that whenever you want to assist the consumers in such a way, you need to produce these commodities, and the production cost of commodities, more especially of the farmers, is so high.

At one or another stage I would request the Executive to meet the farmers halfway in terms of licks, fodder and production cost of these commodities. With this I support the Bill.

VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member for his contribution. Does the Minister wish to reply?

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Honourable Speaker, I wish to do so and I will start, by thanking the Honourable Members of the House, firstly for their overwhelming support for the Bill across Party lines. I think that we should more often have something like this, when issues of national interest and very urgent issues require our urgent intervention, we somehow find each other, so that we are able to intervene in a timely manner to address the problems that face our people.

I would just like to comment on a few queries raised by some of the Honourable Members.

Firstly, the point of Honourable Schimming-Chase with regard to whether we could not limit the mark-up by businesses. I think all of us would want to be able to do so, but in a free market where businesses set their own prices and go into business because of the profit motive and we do not have a legal framework to actually control them, we are not able to do so. If we try to do so without a legal framework, we would probably be taken to court and we would probably lose. However, I think there is an effective way to deal with this situation and that is efficiency of the market. If there were enough competition in the market that would discipline all the business people because they know that if they overprice their products, the customers would go to the next person. Nevertheless, the problem is that there is not enough competition in the market and people actually get away with all kinds of behaviours because customers do not have alternatives, especially in the rural areas where you may have one or two shops.

We hope that as we continue to develop our economy and continue to market our country and attract many more investors and our own small and medium enterprises grow to become big business and provide for the

VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

needs of our markets, there would be better competition and our pricing would be much more efficient.

Animal fat does not include dairy products, it is just the fat that is used for cooking. The reason why we were not able to cover all the animal fat products is that there is a wide range of these products and they could have an impact on the Budget that would not be sustainable. That would mean that the opportunity cost would be too high and it would no longer be efficient to go that way. Milk is also not included in that classification. Milk is an industrial product, it is used in sweets, in all kinds of things and if you zero-rate milk, you are not only zero-rating the milk used in the homes, you are zero-rating the milk procured by factories to make sweets and all other products and the impact on the Budget would be significant.

Maize has already been zero-rated and as somebody has already mentioned, unfortunately the price of maize is not much lower than the price of other foods that are not zero-rated. This is just an indication that sometimes these well-intended measures may actually be eroded as a result of people that want to divert the benefits for their own personal gain.

A question was asked whether we could penalise those who do so, but unfortunately not. We can only penalise them if they continue to charge VAT because some of them may be too lazy to remove VAT, they will continue charging people VAT and then they keep the money to themselves. If they do that, we can penalise them. If they do not continue to charge VAT, they only divert the amount that was supposed to be VAT payment into their own profit, we unfortunately cannot penalise them because it is a free market and they can set prices.

We only want to appeal to their conscience, as we have all done on this Floor and for the public to put pressure on them. Make sure that you know which goods are zero-rated, compare and make sure that the person knows that bread was supposed to go down by **N\$1,20** as a result of zero-rating and that you can go to the next shop if he does not bring down his price. That would probably be the only way that we can get them to trickle these benefits down to the consumers.

VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

With regard to the subsidies to the farmers, I have referred to subsidies in my statement that we already provide. First, we have started with the initial stage of a fertiliser subsidy as a pilot project in a few regions in order to get an impression of how much would be involved and it will be rolled out over time. I would not say that it would be rolled out to the commercial areas, but I think the Ministry of Agriculture would after next year be able to tell us what exactly this programme would look like.

In addition to that, I have also referred to the tax deductions in the offsetting that we allow against the taxable income. As I have said, that is just another form of subsidy. If you earn your salary as an MP and you have a farm and you incur a loss there, you can offset that loss, you can deduct your expenses on your salary. This is equal to being refunded the money that you have paid in tax and is, therefore, a subsidy. Whether we can afford more subsidies is a matter of affordability. The fiscal policy retains flexibility. If we are in a position to provide more relief, we can. Unfortunately, we are sometimes constrained by scarcity of funds and we are not able to do that because there are also competing needs.

I want to round up by once again thanking the Honourable Members for their support and for making their interventions to brief and to the point so that we can conclude the discussions today. I hope the Colleagues in the National Council would emulate this example, so that next week the Members of the public would be able to enjoy these benefits already. Thank you very much.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Minister for her reply. I now Put the Question, that the Bill be read a Second Time. Any objection? Agreed to. The Secretary will now read the Bill a Second Time.

SECRETARY: Value-Added Tax Amendment Bill.

19 June 2008 MOTION ON UNEMPLOYED PROFESSIONALS HON DR ANKAMA

HON SPEAKER: The second Notice of Motion is the one by Honourable Dr Ankama. Does the Honourable Member Move the Motion? Who seconds the Motion? Any objection? Agreed to. Honourable Ankama has the Floor.

MOTION ON UNEMPLOYED PROFESSIONAL QUALIFIED NAMIBIANS

<u>HON DR ANKAMA</u>: Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, this Motion seeks to discuss, assess and ascertain the seriousness of unemployed Namibians with professional training and qualifications obtained from recognised, credible educational institutions here in Namibia or abroad, such as from Cuba, Russia, Zimbabwe, etcetera. This Motion further intends to discover the unemployability of the aforementioned professionals for recommendation and appropriate action in favour of their predicament.

The rationale behind this Motion, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, is that I keep on meeting a substantial number of Namibian graduates from the University of Namibia, Polytechnic, vocational training institutions, colleges of education and some with foreign qualifications.

Individuals, as they are, they talk about their disappointment and frustrations with regard to their unemployable status vis-à-vis their qualifications. They also talk about the term as a "corrupt" recruiting system in both the public and private sector, that people with no professional qualifications, for instance with Grade 12, are being preferred for job opportunities above trained candidates.

Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members, you must have come across unemployed Namibians with qualifications from our own recognised institutions of higher education in our country and should this be the case,

why and how come that we keep on training people for fun while Namibia is in dire need of skilled people? Which institution is supposed to direct careers in Namibia and on what basis?

I am trying to look at the approach and Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members, in this regard I feel there is a need to institute a decentralised research unit for this country to complement those which are run on individual basis by Ministries, for example. I am talking about the need to have a national research unit with decentralised databank countrywide in order to readily facilitate access to data to all those who need them, individuals or entities. This will help individual students and ministries to do appropriate planning for careers in demand. It further creates a loop for job attachment and recruitment. This process will lead us as a Government to meet our national developmental agenda.

Having this in place, we will have low risk of having professionally trained people roaming our streets.

As a Government will be better positioned to tackle the overall unemployment situation, particularly of those people without proper training and/or education countrywide.

In my conclusion I appeal that this Motion be discussed with the zeal it deserves to lead to a desirable resolution. Further, it is my appeal that finally this Motion be referred to an appropriate Committee for research and proper recommendations.

I so Move, Honourable Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member for motivating his Motion. Honourable Mushelenga.

325

19 June 2008 MOTION ON UNEMPLOYED PROFESSIONALS HON P MUSHELENGA

HON P MUSHELENGA: Honourable Speaker, I rise to make a contribution to the Motion introduced by Honourable Dr Ankama. Perhaps I would plead with him to broaden it more and not only to concentrate on professionals, but perhaps to add professional groups as they, in their own humble way, have some skills that could be very helpful to the development of our economy, as I will elaborate later.

Honourable Speaker, I have met a number of people who have been trained in very important fields, particularly from our own institution, UNAM, especially in the field of marine biology and agriculture, in particular and a lot of them are roaming the streets. This could be a source of frustration.

Every day we say we need people to study Science, but what happens after studying Science? We find ourselves in the streets and something should be done.

Coming to agriculture, we have land and abundance of water in the Caprivi and Kavango Regions. Obviously, we could come up with projects that would be able to assist these people to come up with productive activities and, therefore, sustain these activities with the proceeds from their products. The same is with fisheries. I want to commend Honourable Abraham Iyambo for the aquaculture projects he has started this year, but perhaps we need more of these for these young professionals trained in marine biology.

Coming to our nationals who have obtained their qualifications from the former East Bloc countries...(Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Speaker, may I ask the Honourable Member a question, please? Honourable Mushelenga, you commended the Minister of Fisheries on the aquaculture projects, but is it true that most of these projects are mainly in certain areas, like in Omaheke and Aminuis or has it been rolled out to all the areas?

19 June 2008 MOTION ON UNEMPLOYED PROFESSIONALS HON P MUSHELENGA

HON P MUSHELENGA: Honourable Tjihuiko obviously asked the question, but he knows the Minister of Fisheries was going to refer to this when he made his intervention on this important Motion.

Let me proceed to say that there is a general attitude in some quarters of our society to look down upon or to criticise people who have been trained in former East Bloc countries. The same people who do these things are the people who received treatment by medical practitioners trained in some of these countries, in particular Russia and Cuba. However, when they recruit in their respective institutions, they would rather go for people trained in Western countries as preferable candidates than those trained in the Eastern countries. I think, after eighteen years we must really try to move from this Cold War type of international politicking where we inherited some of these attitudes.

As I said, I wanted the Honourable Ankama to broaden the scope of his Motion. Not all of us are perhaps talented to perform academically speaking, but some of us might be able to do better in vocational training. That is the practicality and reality of human nature. Some are gifted academically some are gifted artistically and will do better with vocational training.

To give an example, the Standing Committee on Economics, Natural Resource and Public Administration visited one of the diamond polishing companies. When this company was established they said they need people who have completed Grade 12 but do not have good enough marks to go to the universities or polytechnic, because inasmuch as these people may not be good, academically speaking, have some skills and talents required for, for example, diamond polishing. They are very good artistically speaking and they can do the job. Therefore, I want this Motion to be broadened to also accommodate and embrace this group of people, so that in their own way they will have their own statistics for the jobs that they would be required to do. When, next time we need to recruit people to do voters registration, we do not need to have Civil Servants leaving their jobs to do this. When we have Grade 12 learners who are unemployed, who can at least to these jobs and earn something, rather

than teachers and other professionals leaving Government offices to go and do the registration of voters or act as polling officers. These people could do that. That is why we need to broaden this Motion so that we accommodate professionals and non-professionals, so that each and everybody will have an opportunity of eating and tasting the Namibian cake.

With these few words, I support the Motion and thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member. Honourable Kaiyamo.

HON KAIYAMO: I also rise to support this good and scientific Motion by my Honourable Colleague, which is also of scientific nature. I am also, in agreement with what my Colleague said and what I am going to say are not rumours, because some of the Colleagues like rumours.

I was tasked by SWAPO Party and Government to represent Namibia in the Soviet Union during the time of Gorbachev and I found students there, sent by SWAPO to study and I saw what they studied. When they came back here, they could not be employed. These are not rumours. We have colleagues who have a mentality of being against the people who studied in communist countries, because they feel those countries do not have the same standards as capitalist countries. I am talking about Soviet Union, Cuba, Bulgaria. (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: May I ask the Honourable Member a question, please? Honourable Member, I know what you are saying is not a rumour, students were sent by the Government to the Soviet Union to study, they did their level best, passed their examinations, came back with diplomas and degrees and when they came back they could not be employed by the very same institution that sent them there. If that is what you have said, what was the purpose of sending them there and how do you expect somebody else to employ them if you yourself will not employ them?

HON KAIYAMO: No Colleagues, this is a patriotic Motion. When I went to the Soviet Union I found cadres of the SWAPO Party sent by SWAPO and that was the time we took over the Namibian Government. We did not understand that we also need to employ the colleagues from this part of the world. That is what I am saying. If it were not for the intervention of the Founding President, some of them would not have been employed. These are not rumours, these are realities. It is exactly like

Mannetjie, like my Colleague here. When Mannetjie came from Cuba, he was squatting in one of these houses up there, unemployed. These are realities, not rumours.

Due to the intervention of the Founding President, some of these Colleagues were employed at the bottom of the ladder and they could not be promoted because of their qualifications. Therefore, I support the Motion by the Colleague that we need to have a look and de-capitalise our minds, this mind of thinking that the people who studied in the Soviet Union are worth nothing. (Intervention)

HON DIENDA: May I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable Kaiyamo, when you enter the Katutura Hospital, all the Cuban doctors are there but I never saw any Member of Parliament being treated by those Cuban doctors and Government brings them in here so

that they can do a service to our population, but those of us who have invited them, do not make use of those Cuban doctors. Why not?

<u>HON KAIYAMO</u>: Honestly speaking, the Cuban doctors are doing a good job. During our visit recently to the Regions, I met some of the doctors whose time expired and the people were asking them to renew their contracts. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: On a Point of Information. In the 2005 when I had an asthma attack I was treated by Namibian and Cuban doctors and doctors trained in former socialist countries and I am still here. It is really devoid of truth to say we are not using their services. All of here use their services, except those who are against them.

HON KAIYAMO: And to come back home, sometimes we close our eyes to the realities on the ground. We have students trained at UNAM in library services, who have diplomas and degrees, but they are not employed and they are on the streets here. They are told they do not have experience.

I want us to support this Motion so that our qualified Colleagues would get jobs. (Intervention)

<u>HON NAMBAHU</u>: May I ask my Colleague a question? Honourable Kaiyamo, do you not think that to avoid that problem we should just

introduce a subject called "Experience" at the university and all other places?

HON KAIYAMO: Maybe it is a good idea. We need to have a look at it. Now we have people roaming the streets who are qualified and because some of them did not study in Cape Town, like some of us, you do not want them to be employed. You hardly see somebody who has been sent to South Africa on the street, but every second one trained in the Soviet Union is on the street.

With these few words, I support my Colleague's Motion.

HON MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: On a Point of Information. I agree with Honourable Kaiyamo that this attitude of our young graduates from Polytechnic or UNAM not being employed in the public or private sector is making them leave this country. That is the one big problem which causes them to leave this country. Thank you, Comrade Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: Any further discussion? Honourable Nujoma.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: I thank you for the Floor, Comrade Speaker. I also rise to support this Motion and I agree with Honourable Mushelenga that it must be broadened. What the Colleagues have said is the truth and nothing else but the truth, our people have been

discriminated against by this perception and misunderstanding. If you look at countries like the United States and others, they are looking for diversity in education, they attract all those talents, you will have scientists who go to the moon, and some of them are even from Namibia. However, we tend to look down upon the people who have been trained in socialist countries.

What is shameful is that those people in the socialist countries, in Cuba for example, have the highest literacy rate in the world. They have the highest health standards and the most important thing, they feed themselves, and they produce their own food. We tend to look down upon the Chinese when they come here, but those people are more than a billion and nobody dies of hunger. They produce their own food, but when they come here, we laugh at them and we say they come here to gain experience.

India has almost a billion people and they send their people to all the countries in the world. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS: Comrade Nujoma, are you aware, contrary to the statement that has been made by one of the Members of the CoD that the majority of doctors in Spain are from Cuba?

Are you aware of that?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: I agree with you and even the scientists who process food in the same field as Comrade Iyambo. He is a scientist in food processing as he is sitting there and he is a product of Cuba. He followed his studies in the UK and all over the world and there he is, he has devised the concept of aquaculture and now we do not want to support him. We can use those unemployed students in that field.

We are just blaming others for our own shortcomings, but we must stand up and start producing our own food. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: Honourable Speaker, I want to tell the Son of the Nation that Dr Abraham Iyambo told me three weeks ago that after he studied in exile he was baking bread for the soldiers and the children. Are you aware of that?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Yes, I am very much aware. We have acquired these skills in SWAPO. We are so diverse that I can even clean toilets, I can do everything and in fact, I am a qualified mechanic as I am sitting here. If your car breaks down, I know where to start and what to look for. (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: May I ask the Honourable Deputy Minister a question, please? I am sure that the Honourable Deputy Minister was not listening to the Motion. The Motion talks about our own kids, trained and qualified in Namibia who is not employed in the country. It is not talking about Cubans. It makes a reference to Namibians trained in Cuba or Zimbabwe. Is it possible for the Honourable Deputy Minister to enlighten us on the plight of our own kids who have graduated from our own institutions of higher learning and why they are not being employed? Forget about the Cubans, whether in Spain, Liberia or wherever. It is not the issue. The issue is our own kids.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: The problem is the perception, which has been created by our bureaucracy about everybody who has been trained in a socialist country, because there is that fear of the unknown, that the socialist countries are monsters. Those are the perceptions and unfortunately, we had to compromise at Independence. (Intervention)

<u>HON NAMBAHU</u>: Comrade Nujoma, are you aware that most of the Cuban exiles in Miami are working, but there is no communism in the United States where they are working?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: That is exactly what I said. Honourable Nambahu, the skills we are looking down upon in our own country, without any appreciation at all of what the international Cuban doctors are doing in this country and we condemn them. Look at the United States, they are even recruiting doctors who were sent by a friendly Cuban Government to come and assist the poor Namibians. They are even poaching them from Namibia. How do you answer that question? Why are they being poached from here through dubious means? (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF EDUCATION: On a Point of Information. I want to thank the mover of the Motion, but I also want to draw attention to the studies that are being done in our country. The unemployment situation in Namibia is not necessarily because there are no people who can occupy those positions. Sometimes it is a mismatch of the skills available to be matched with the demand of the labour market. Of course, the people have been trained and they have skills, but the skills that they have are not necessarily what the labour market requires. That is why the Government put ETSIP in place to see what is the problem, that

we have people who are seemingly qualified, but they cannot access the labour market. What we are trying to do through the expansion of the vocational education centres in all the Regions and through the Ministry of Youth and Sports are to ensure that the Grade 12 unsuccessful candidates who did not make it to higher institutions could access these kind of facilities. The Government is therefore in the process, from the Retreat we have emphasised vocational education, and we are in the process to do that. Many other issues may be discussed, but that is the dilemma and that is the mismatch. I thank you.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: I agree hundred percent with you, ETSIP is alive and we support ETSIP. It will go a long way to address these serious shortcomings. What I was saying is that we should not look down upon the skills we have in this country. Let us utilise them because it is sometimes an excuse to make the Government fail.

When people are looking for jobs, they are told to go and look for jobs at Sam Nujoma. This is what our people are telling us, this is the truth! *Kapena Ilonga*, but yet they are advertising that they need people.

The private sector is not forthcoming in helping Government to address this serious shortcoming. (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: May I ask the Honourable Deputy Minister a question? From what the Honourable Deputy Minister of Education has just said, that it is not a question of people being unemployed because they are not qualified, but because they are qualified in the wrong fields, that perhaps why you have people who are qualified but unemployed. Now you are talking about the training in socialist countries and are you trying to tell us that our institutions are socialist oriented. That is why people who are coming from those institutions are not being employed because it

is the same like they have been trained in Cuba or Soviet Union or what is the point you are trying to bring home? On the other hand, do you agree with what the Honourable Deputy Minister has just said?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: I was saying that the bureaucracy we have inherited greatly contributed to this. Why is the SWAPO Government not employing the people? You must remember that at the drafting of the Constitution we agreed that we would retain the Public Service, which has a completely different mentality with regard to Nation building, with regard to national development, with regard to the diversity of the problem. Those are the problems and I rest my case.

HON SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned until Tuesday, 14:30.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:49 UNTIL 2008.06.24 AT 14:30

NATIONAL ASSEMBLY ASSEMBLY CHAMBER 24 JUNE 2008 WINDHOEK

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON SPEAKER took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

HON SPEAKER: Any Petitions? Any Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers. Honourable Minister of Finance.

TABLING: REPORTS OF AUDITOR-GENERAL

<u>HON MINISTER OF FINANCE</u>: I lay upon the Table, Reports of the Auditor-General on the accounts of –

- Fisheries Observer Fund for the Financial Years ended March 31, 2003, 2004 and 2005;
- Namibian Broadcasting Corporation for the Financial Years ended March 31, 2006 and 2007.

<u>HON SPEAKER:</u> Will the Minister table the Reports? Minister Mbumba.

TABLING: EDUCATIONAL STATISTICS

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS HON MOONGO

HON MINISTER OF EDUCATION: Honourable Speaker, I lay upon the Table, Educational Statistics for the year 2006 by the Education Management Information System of the Ministry of Education.

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Minister table the Report? Any further Reports and Papers? Any Notice of Questions? Honourable Moongo.

QUESTION 66:

HON MOONGO: Honourable Speaker, I give Notice that on Thursday, 03 July 2008, I shall ask the Honourable Minister of Information and Broadcasting the following:

- 1. Is it true or will the Minister deny that there is a serious shortage of equipment that prevents the NBC to cover the entire Nation?
- 2. How many television cameras does the NBC have?
- 3. When will the NBC afford to buy enough television cameras in each Region to cover all the thirteen Regions?
- 4. How many vehicles and interview recording equipment does the NBC have in every Region?
- 5. Why does the management of NBC allow the SWAPO Party to monopolise the Namibian Broadcasts? Is this not corruption or does the Minister condone corruption?

24 June 2008

VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

HON SPEAKER: Will the Honourable Member table the Questions?

Any further Notice of Questions? Any Notice of Motions? Any Ministerial Statements? The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day?

VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL: COMMITTEE STAGE

SECRETARY: Committee Stage – *Value-Added Tax Amendment Bill.*

HON SPEAKER: It is Moved that the Assembly now goes into Committee. Any objections? Who seconds? Agreed to. The Acting Chairman of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Mushelenga, will take the Floor.

ASSEMBLY IN COMMITTEE

24 June 2008

VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL HON DE WAAL

ACTING CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: The Committee has to consider the Value-Added Tax Amendment Bill.

Clause 1 put.

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Chair of the Whole House Committee. I would like to Move an Amendment to Clause 1 of the Bill to make sure that the zero-rating that is granted under this provision would also apply to bread, because the current formulation has the effect that the bread itself would not be zero-rated.

I Move that Clause 1 of the amended Bill be amended so that bread is included in the category of zero-rated items. I so Move.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Will the Honourable Minister table the Amendment? Any discussion to the Amendment? Honourable De Waal.

HON DE WAAL: Thank you, Honourable Chairperson. I hope it is not something which has been discussed but I just want to enquire from the Honourable Minister, that when we say 'sunflower cooking oil', do we mean it in the smaller sense of the word, because 'sunflower' is a very specific cooking oil.

24 June 2008 VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL HON DE WAAL

It is specifically made from sunflowers and there are many other blended oils that can be used that are much cheaper than sunflower. Sunflower is actually nowadays a very expensive oil and by saying 'sunflower cooking oil', we are pushing ourselves into a corner. You must first then look at the label of the oil and see whether it is actually made from sunflowers to fit this description.

My proposal would be that scrap the word 'sunflower' and just use the word 'cooking oil'. That would be much better and much safer. I so propose, Honourable Minister.

<u>ACTING CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE</u>
<u>COMMITTEES</u>: Does the Honourable Minister wish to explain?

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Honourable Chairperson, we only have a bit of a logistical problem, in the first instance, because any further Amendments must be done in a certain format. I understand the concern of Honourable De Waal as far as a specific brand name is concerned, but the concern that we had is that there are some cooking oils that are not basic and much more expensive and one wonders whether we want to subsidise the whole range of cooking oil. However, I do understand the concern that he raised that if there are other brands of the same category as sunflower oil they are not covered, we do for example not have to include olive oil. It is deliberate because it is more expensive and the purpose that is served by olive oil can be served by sunflower oil. (Intervention)

HON DE WAAL: Oil that is a mixture of sunflower and groundnuts.

24 June 2008

VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL HON VENAANI

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: No, is it oil or fat? I would have to disappoint the Member in that regard, because I do not see how the clause could be amended on the Floor now. The only alternative that remains is for me to have a closer look at the proposal that you are making and postpone the agreement on this Clause, but the question is, do we want to do that?

HON DE WAAL: Yes, until tomorrow.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Any further discussion? Honourable De Waal.

HON DE WAAL: Honourable Chairperson, I would be quite happy if you say cooking oil, excluding olive oil. I would be quite happy if you do that.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Honourable Venaani.

HON VENAANI: Honourable Acting Chair, I am just rising to protest against the argument saying that olive oil is expensive oil. We all know that there are some poor people suffering from certain diseases who may

24 June 2008 VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL HON NUJOMA

not use sunflower cooking oil, the doctors prescribe that they use olive oil. I am protesting, seeing that olive oil is a deliberate expensive product, it is because of various reasons and it must be included.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: I recognise Honourable Nujoma.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Thank you Chair, I only want to plead with Honourable De Waal that sunflower is just an example of that category of oils. 'Sunflower' means a category of those oils, excluding the expensive oils and I do not agree with Honourable Venaani, because this olive oil is a luxury, it is expensive. We are talking about basic things, which the people can afford.

I would really urge Honourable De Waal that this is a category of those oils, which means sunflower and others, whether they come from groundnuts and other products, which are reasonable and affordable. Let us move forward, you are always claiming that you represent the people here, but now you are delaying the Amendment Bill.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Honourable Members, I want to appeal to your conscience, when this Bill was tabled we were told it is of an urgent nature. I take note of legitimate concerns that Honourable Members are raising, but I also take note of funny comments that some Honourable Members are trying to make. We are able to effect Amendments, whether through Council and then bring the Bill back here. I just want to alert the

24 June 2008 VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL HON TJIHUIKO / HON VENAANI

Honourable Members on that. Let us just bear in mind that we do not need to derail the process. Honourable Tjihuiko.

HON TJIHUIKO: Honourable Acting Chairperson, I think that the comments by Honourable De Waal, which were accepted by the Honourable Minister of Finance in principle, to look at what we are talking about, is the most sound thing we can think of. Actually, I believe that if we could have said that Honourable De Waal could take it up with the Honourable Minister and see which types of oil, instead of waiting for the National Council to bring it back to us for Amendment just to rectify that. I think it is a question from all of us, trying to understand what type of oil we are talking about, since Honourable De Waal made the same point. If we could allow Honourable De Waal and the Honourable Minister of Finance to perhaps get together to look at it critically and together see what is it that we are talking about, that would help all of us. I think it would be very difficult to debate something without knowing the difference.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Honourable Venaani.

<u>HON VENAANI</u>: Honourable Acting Chair, I think we can still go ahead and agree that the Honourable Minister uses a yellow paper and scrap the word 'sunflower' and table an Amendment straight away on the Floor of the House.

24 June 2008

VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL HON VENAANI

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Then you are opening it up for any cooking oil.

HON VENAANI: Honourable Colleagues, you cannot specify brands, because calling it 'sunflower' refers to a particular brand. (Intervention)

<u>HON RIRUAKO</u>: It is a minor thing we are discussing. The proposal is that Honourable De Waal and the Minister must meet and come up with what they think is right for us.

HON VENAANI: Honourable Acting Chair, I think our intention is very clear. The House wants to zero-rate cooking oil, not olive oil. There is a difference between olive oil and cooking oil. We cannot attach a particular brand, because if you take a person who is selling cooking oil from another brand that is not sunflower and you say that he cannot zero-rate his oil because it is not in the Amendment, he can take you to court and win.

Our intention is very clear that we are talking about cooking oil and let us scrap the word and bring the Amendment on the Floor and move ahead.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: I recognise Dr Abraham Iyambo.

VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL HON DR A IYAMBO

HON MINISTER OF FISHERIES AND MARINE RESOURCES:

Acting Chairperson, because of the urgency of this Amendment, I propose that we do not take too long on the semantics of defining oils. I am sure when the experts used that word might have paid attention to specific things. I therefore, propose that, if it is acceptable, that we allow the Honourable Minister of Finance to consult only until tea-break and if there is nothing, we go ahead. Thank you very much.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Do I have the concurrence of the House on that? Agreed to.

Clause 2 put and agreed to.

I shall report progress and ask for leave to sit again after tea-break.

ASSEMBLY RESUMES

HON SPEAKER: In the interest of finding an amicable solution, the Speaker will allow the consultations to take place and we will come back to settling this matter. The Secretary will read the second Order of the Day.

MOTION ON REMOVAL OF REITERDENKMAL

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on the removal of the Windhoek landmark, the Reiterdenkmal, with a view of leaving it in a place and to find another suitable spot for the Independence Memorial Museum.

HON SPEAKER: When the House adjourned on Wednesday, 18 June 2008, in terms of Rule 90, the Question before the Assembly was a Motion by Honourable Kaura. Any further discussion?

HON MINISTER OF YOUTH, NATIONAL SERVICE, SPORT AND CULTURE: Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members, let me at the onset thank Honourable Kaura for tabling the Motion under discussion. This gives us an opportunity not only to air our views, but also to clarify the intention of the Government notwithstanding the sensitivity of the issue under discussion. I thus hope it will be approached and discussed with the necessary care, understanding and respect for each other's feelings and sentiments.

Comrade Speaker, before the Debate on the very sensitive Motion concerning the construction of the Independence Museum and everything that goes with it concludes in this august House, please allow me to provide some elaborate historical dimensions on the significance of building the modern-day museum at the site that it has been earmarked for and its associated perspective to the society.

I have followed the current Debate with keen interest and it would be a historical remiss if I do not highlight a few contesting issues in my humble attempt to offer the much desired and, I believe, needed explanation on the subject.

Allow me, Comrade Speaker, to quote Ayi Kwei Armah as follows: "A people losing sight of origins are dead, a people deaf to purpose are lost. Under fertile rain and scorching sunshine there is no difference, their bodies are mere corpses, awaiting final burial."

This incisive quote of Ayi Kwei Armah is reminding us of a people losing sight of their origin and therefore, as a result faces a terrible backlash. In the paper titled, "The Destruction and Construction of Africa", William Makgoba described a story in distant days antiquity when the Roman Empire sentenced an African city to death. "Carthage must be destroyed". As a result, the city was destroyed in the end. Today, as people wander amongst its ruins, only their imagination and historical records enable them to appreciate its magnificence. Not only our African being makes it possible for us to hear the piteous cries of the victims of the vengeance of the Roman Empire.

We, therefore, can say that all human civilisation rests on the fundamentals of such as the ruins of an African city of Carthage. It is within the context of rebuilding the old African city of Carthage that the modern-day monument, Namibia, must be looked at.

The rebuilding process is an actual analysis, the restoration of our history as a people, the restoration of our pride of being an African foremost, and most important, who we are – of course Namibians.

The importance of the above citation is to put into context the real challenges of Africans and Namibians, and particularly those of us who speak of an African renaissance. Our mission is to tackle the deplorable legacy of colonialism, imperialism and apartheid as manifested many at times by statues, symbols and objects.

Honourable Members will surely recall that the attempted destruction of Africa and Africans through slavery, colonialism and imperialism was aimed at three important areas: One – our history; secondly – our culture and heritage and more critically, our consciousness of our being. The destruction and construction of Africa is encapsulated in the phrase, "

Carthage must be destroyed." It is from this perspective that I want us to approach this Debate.

In our efforts as a Nation to tell the history from our perspective, it is important that certain misconceptions in our society must be corrected. In an Independent Namibia, our mandate is to respond to the demand of the masses of our people and the present and future times and demands.

The Reiter Denkmal Monument is a symbol of oppressive colonialism. It represents a very painful chapter in our struggle for nationhood and the right to exist as an independent human being. The space that it strategically occupies reminds us daily that indeed it seems as if we are still under colonial supervision. The soil, on which the Reiter Denkmal Monument has been erected depicts the victory of the German soldiers in their own interpretation.

Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members, I am of the opinion and I am in agreement with the notion that we should retain historical statues and artefacts intact and bring in those lacking, but in a relation that should portray our real history of the struggle and the subsequent Independence.

The Alte Feste was a German garrison and was surrounded by a huge concentration camp of Namas and Hereros which were used as a human shield for German soldiers in the garrison during the 1904-1908 war. This area includes the soil on which the Reiterdenkmal Monument has been erected, depicting German victory. That is the soil where our forbearers were held in captivity.

This is the soil on which our torchbearers for the struggle for freedom succumbed to torture, hunger and malnutrition. I can clearly recall the story about the captain of the Veldskoendraers of Koës who went on a hunger strike in that particular concentration camp, refusing to eat the food given by the enemy and who died of hunger in that very concentration camp.

Is this the humiliation that we can desire for our ancestors who inspired our Independence struggle? Would this be the way we will intend to glorify the cowardly massacre of Namibians on their own soil? In an Independent Namibia I do not believe that we can ever think like that. How can we destroy or alter history? I believe this can never be our intention and was never the intention of the Namibian Cabinet when it discussed and decided on the action of building an Independence Museum, not to destroy or alter history.

The only intention is to relocate the Reiterdenkmal Monument to be part of the garrison, which is the Alte Feste. We certainly did not mention any destruction of the Reiterdenkmal Monument or even the relocation to it at a distant location or a hidden place, because it cannot be hidden, it is a historical fact, it is a Monument reminding us about our painful history and it should be there. The Reiterdenkmal and his horse is actually at the exact spot where the concentration camp in which our people died was located.

Honourable Members, take your time and have a look at this picture that portrays the concentration camp that was put up those days right in front of the Alte Feste. There are copies available for those interested. Have a look at this picture depicting captured Ovaherero women in front of the Alte Feste. These were the people who perished in that camp.

The decision to move the Reitedenkmal Monument was taken at a Cabinet meeting way back as Decision 16/26.06.01/003 when the current Ministry that I am now heading was known as the Ministry of Basic Education, Sport and Culture. There it says that: "That an Independence Memorial Museum be constructed at the open area adjacent to the Alte Feste Museum and that the Reiterdenkmal Monument be relocated to a place in front of the Alte Feste building", which in my understanding does not take away the Reiterdenkmal from history or wipe it out. It just moves it to a spot where it will be closer to the Alte Feste and then allow space for the Independence Memorial Museum to be erected.

This is a Cabinet decision that my Ministry merely has to implement. This means that if there is any change, justifiable of course, this has to be made by Cabinet who took the decision.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I think this must be in line with the policy of national reconciliation. In our quest for true humanity, we must inform the Nation on the importance of history and thus, the relevance of relocating the Reiterdenkmal Monument to a spot that clearly illustrates the historical perspective and reality without distortions of the history and the construction of the new modern museum is concerned.

Therefore, these things must be arranged and put up in such a way that they will still clearly portray what happened and tell the history of this country and Nation. The area in question is strategic in the sense that it shall be accessible and within walking distance from the city centre, which will allow the members of our society to readily access the museum. It shall also allow tourists and foreign visitors to access the museum easily from nearby hotels and conference centres, likewise the Alte Feste and the Reiterdenkmal. It shall also serve well in the sense that it is the soil on which our ancestors sacrificed their precious lives.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, it is incumbent upon us to note that every Nation build museums at strategic areas with historical importance to depict its history. For example, in our neighbouring South Africa, the modern museum that has been built to tell the South African story, the Apartheid Museum, was built on the space overlooking the area where gold was discovered. It shall only be suitable if we erect ours, that means our Independence Memorial Museum, at a place where our ancestors were held in a concentration camp in order for it to serve as a symbol of their bravery and resistance amidst hostile conditions. It will in that way portray the subsequent victory by the Namibian people without destroying the history and without downplaying the historical importance and the sentiments that symbols like the Reiterdenkmal Monument have for, if not all of us, at least for many of our people.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I do believe that upon completion the museum's architectural picture, like that of the pyramids in Egypt, the sculptures of the Ancient Kingdom of Congo Delta, the Shangai, like the buildings of Timbuktu, like the temples of Ethiopia, like the ruins of the great Zimbabwe and the rock paintings of Twyfelfontein, the modern-day Namibian museum will speak.

It will of course, in combination with the Alte Feste, the Reiterdenkmal and all other monuments that we put up, portray our contribution to the formation of an African civilisation, yes formation of a Namibian Nation that respects history, that knows what national reconciliation means, what it means to differ or have different sentiments, but reach out at a common goal.

Therefore, I hope, Comrade Speaker, that this Debate and this Motion will be handled in such a way that we will proceed to conserve our history, conserve the remembrance of our people with the necessary respect and sentiments we have for all our people who succumbed in the struggle, who fought for our Independence.

Comrade Speaker, once again, I thank you for your kind attention and I hope that I have made a humble contribution. I hope that it will contribute that this Motion from now onwards be dealt with, with the necessary understanding and so that it does not seem that we as Namibians are necessarily differing on this and fighting each other, but we are discussing something that we inherited commonly and that is portraying our common history as a Namibian Nation. Comrade Speaker, I thank you very much.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Minister for his contribution. Honourable Bayer.

24 June 2008 MOTION ON REMOVAL OF REITERDENKMAL HON BAYER / HON RIRUAKO

HON BAYER: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, the Honourable Minister put what I wanted to say so eloquently, but I still wish to comment on the Motion of Honourable Kaura, that the Reiterdenkmal should remain where it is presently.

In my opinion, the right place for it to be moved to is the Alte Feste Museum as it will fit in with the exhibitions in that museum. It is not being destroyed or taken away and wherever it stands, it will not change the history of this country, for it is not only written in ink, but with the blood and tears of this Nation.

I therefore add my voice to those who feel that the Reiterdenkmal should be relocated to its new stand. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Chief Riruako.

HON RIRUAKO: We have heard from the Minister who has spoken, but the concentration camp for those men and women was at that area where some people are now playing football. That football is played on the bones of the people who were massacred there and it is still there. How do you feel about that?

It is said that the horse must remain there to illustrate the treatment of those people by the Germans and the museum must be erected there to express what they were doing to those people. You did not mention some of the elements, they used to engage in sexual activities right there openly and take pictures.

We as Hereros fought them. We never captured their women. They did not respect any woman or child, they killed them all and they were socalled civilised people. They managed to do that and you are playing

24 June 2008 MOTION ON REMOVAL OF REITER DENKMAL HON RIRUAKO

around what happened, the so-called reconciliation. Who can reconcile with that?

What happened is that we came to an agreement not to kill women and children. They killed women and children. When one time some of the Herero troops killed women and children, they were punished by the authority of the day. They never punished their soldiers for doing so. Why not? They refer to themselves as civilised people.

To erect the horse in front of the Alte Feste does not mean anything. You must erect a tomb on that place where they are now playing football. That museum must remain there where they are performing everything on top of the people who died. Some people were hanged alongside the horse. (Intervention)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Comrade Speaker, may I ask the Honourable Chief a small question? Honourable Chief, you are now narrating our history, which we really appreciate. I am also one of those descendants whose grandparents were also massacred. I just want to ask you this question and I want you to tell us in an honest manner:

As a young person, I look at the history of the suffering of our people and you are talking about the massacre of the Herero and Nama people. It is a long history, which started there with the Hereros, but it continued with other population groups. The Damaras were also there. How could you distinguish a Damara from a Herero while all the population groups were living in the central area here?

How can you distinguish the Damara from an Ovambo who came from the North to work in the mines to contribute to the development of this country? My own understanding is that we have suffered during that period, starting from the Herero War up to the liberation struggle by all the people of Namibia. Why do we always want to separate the history? We are talking about national liberation, so why can we not talk about the

24 June 2008 VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL

history of our suffering people so that whatever comes, should be for the people of Namibia? That is the question, Comrade Speaker.

<u>HON SPEAKER</u>: You will have an opportunity when we return after tea-break. The House shall rise for refreshments.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:40 HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:10 PURSUANT TO ADJOURNMENT

HON SPEAKER: The Debate on the second Motion which is on the Floor now will be suspended for the time-being and I give the Floor to the Minister of Finance to report back on the consultations.

VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL: RESUMPTION OF COMMITTEE STAGE

ASSEMBLY IN COMMITTEE

VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

ACTING CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: The Session of the Whole House Committee is called to order.

Clause	1, a	s amended,	put.	

MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you, Honourable Acting Chairperson of the Whole House Committee. I just want to report progress to the House on the consultations that we held with Honourable De Waal.

We agreed to let this provision go through as is, subject to the Amendments that I have made and continue with our consultations between now and the time that the Bill goes to the National Council and if we feel that there is a need for some Amendments to be applied, then those will be taken up with the National Council.

For now the proposal is that this Clause be approved by this House.

ACTING CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Any objection? Agreed to.

Title put and agreed to.

ASSEMBLY RESUMED

.____

24 June 2008

VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

Bill reported with Amendments.
HON SPEAKER: Does the Honourable Minister Move that the Bill be now read a Third Time?
VALUE-ADDED TAX AMENDMENT BILL: THIRD READING
HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: I so Move, Honourable Speaker.
HON SPEAKER: Any objections? Who seconds? Agreed to. Does the Honourable Member wish to reply?
HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Honourable Speaker, I would just
like to once again thank the Members of the House for their support and
for their understanding to keep the Debate as short as possible and to thank the public for their understanding.

24 June 2008 MOTION ON REMOVAL OF REITERDENKMAL HON RIRUAKO

HON SPEAKER: I now put the Question, that the Bill be now read a Third Time. Any objection? Agreed to. The Secretary will read the Bill a Third Time.

SECRETARY: Value-Added Tax Amendment Bill.

·-----

<u>HON SPEAKER:</u> When the House recessed for refreshments, Chief Riruako had the Floor.

MOTION ON REMOVAL OF REITERDENKMAL

HON RIRUAKO: Honourable Speaker, I am not here to explain to the Members of Parliament who was doing what and for what reason. If I happen to enclose everything, I may say that everybody participated in this struggle for liberation against Germany.

If I recall how Samuel Maharero was sent by the man whose name you do not know, I think by Perizua Kaputuaza, now Kaputuaza and somebody else were Damara and they have taken the risk to save Samuel Maharero.

He could not be alive if it were not for Kaputuaza. That is the answer to you. Please, afterwards you have to go into the history and learn it.

24 June 2008 MOTION ON REMOVAL OF REITERDENKMAL HON RIRUAKO

Nehale trained here in this country, and the letter was sent from here to there and Kambonde refused to join, but Nehale sustained that patriotism to the end. Some of the treaties were written, some were not even written.

The Namas lost, but eventually we joined one another to fight together. That is not the question, it is here, they suppressed the people of this country, that is what we discuss here and the issue was that horse and the words written on that Denkmal. Go and read and interpret it in other languages. What was that? They praise themselves, they gave themselves honours, that is insult to injury and the people of this country have to look at those words without other indications of what they were doing, who was killed, how he was killed, how they were suppressed and oppressed, what has taken place at that place of genocide. While the genocide was taking place, they were just doing illegal things that one human being cannot do to another human being that I cannot even mention a second time. It is painful and it is an insult to injury.

If you want the horse to be there in front of the Alte Feste, that museum that depicts what they were doing must be erected there where the football course is to show the public what were the activities, who did what to whom. We cannot just bury everything because we want to take the horse away, those activities must be interpreted in a very clear way. They want to understand what the cause of that horse was.

We are not going to reconcile silently, we have to tell them what they have done to us. I am not against reconciliation but they do not want to reconcile with us, we know that. They do things, which is unacceptable.

In other words, I may say to the House that we here want to prove to them that we are civilised. We did in the first place but they would not listen: "Do not kill women and children, do not kill priests" and they killed everybody and they could not care a damn. These people do not respect who they are and we are there to give them options or their desire without even telling them what they were doing. I want them to know what they have done to us and this is not a Herero issue anymore, to those who are questioning me, what do you mean by 'other people?' It is an issue for

24 June 2008 MOTION ON REMOVAL OF REITERDENKMAL HON DR TJIRIANGE

this House and the House is there to tell the public as a whole or whoever does not understand what we mean by these issues.

It is not my issue, it is not a Herero issue, it is an issue for this House. If you do not want to give your ideas and expressions to the issue, it is up to you.

I may say to my Colleague that if you want to keep the horse there, that tomb must be erected there and everything will be taken care of for them to know what they have done, for them to know what their forefathers have done to us.

Keep the horse if you want to keep the horse, but their children must know what they have done. Without that it must be removed. What is the use of keeping the horse there while our children know nothing about read it? I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Tjiriange.

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: Thank you very much, Comrade Speaker. I rise to strongly support Reverend Konjore's address to this House. I think he has really hit the nail on the dot and if we go by the way that he has articulated the issue, we shall have no problem.

Comrade Speaker, I remember reading a book about Lenin, a revolutionary leader of the Russians after the October Revolution, where he was saying that, "we should not fight monuments, the October Revolution was not about destroying the monuments, but to destroy the system. But nevertheless, the history of the workers who fought against the system must be equally represented." This was done because many people wanted the monuments of the Tsars and others to be removed and

24 June 2008 MOTION ON REMOVAL OF REITERDENKMAL HON DR TJIRIANGE

completely destroyed, because of that, they are still standing there, but they did not change the history of that country.

I am not saying that this monument should be taken and destroyed, but the way it is now it is distorting the history. It is distorting the history in the sense that the monument is about the victory of the Germans over the people of this country and those who were victims of that horse and that gun are nowhere represented in the history as that horse is represented there. It is as if they came and took the country from kudus and other things, as if there was no resistance.

There is a horse there depicting victory – victory over whom? Where are the victims of that horse? Where are the victims of that gun? It is not equally represented there.

We are talking about this place being a very sentimental place. Few people probably know that there was a serious concentration camp there, which in Otjiherero is called, "orumbo katjombondi", meaning that it is a terrible place or something like that. People died there.

I remember when I was the Minister of Justice and I commissioned the Supreme Court building, there were bones found there and probably they were from that era. That whole place was a terrible place. Then they came and depicted the victorious horse and rider, but nothing about the victims who resisted that horse. This is what we are talking about.

Therefore, I think the motivation by Comrade Konjore that the horse is not going to disappear, it is going to be taken to where the administration was, where it actually belongs, without necessarily....(Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: May I ask the Honourable Minister a question, please? Honourable Minister, you are saying that that horse does not represent the victims, which I agree with, it is true, but why is it necessary to be relocated to another place? Why can we not just do away with it?

24 June 2008 MOTION ON REMOVAL OF REITERDENKMAL HON DR TJIRIANGE

The reason why I am asking that question is because "history" is not 'mystory', is not 'his-story', it is history, things that were there.

Now if we are saying that it is representing something we do not want to see anymore, why is it necessary for us to take it from there and to put it another place where it will be seen again?

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: It is a good question. In history there are certain things that you would not like to hear anymore because they remind you of something that you do not want to remember, but the mere fact that it has happened is history. It has happened, whether you like it or not.

Nobody will deny the fact that the Germans have actually exterminated us here. We do not want to hear it, it is not good, but that is a historical fact that it happened and that is represented by that horse. You cannot deny that.

It is not a good history for us, it is a history that reminds us of wrong things, but it had happened, we cannot bury it. In that sense, let the children know that there were people in this country who were destroyed by this horse.

There is nothing wrong for that horse to be relocated at the garrison where it is was being commanded from and here where the concentration camp was located the history of the victims will be depicted. These will be supplementing each other. This is the killer this is the victim.

Therefore, I think the motivation of Comrade Konjore is absolutely up-todate and excellent. There are other things that we can easily do away with or remove... (Intervention)

24 June 2008 MOTION ON REMOVAL OF REITERDENKMAL HON DR TJIRIANGE

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR AND SOCIAL WELFARE: I want to ask a question to my senior. When I listened to what Comrade Konjore and those who contributed earlier said, the only difference was that some said it should be put in a museum and some said it should remain where it is. The majority said they want to see something for those who were killed there. Where is the difference? The people are now fighting each other. They think we differ, but where is the difference? The only difference I see is that some say the horse should remain where it is, some say it should be put in a museum and then reflect what happened at that site. Where is the difference? Nobody said it should be destroyed, but only that we want to see history depicted there. I feel Comrade Konjore only put the public at ease. There is no difference here.

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: Comrade Iilonga, you are correct, I never said there was any difference because I was not even here when these things were being discussed and I do not talk about rumours. I am only speaking about what I heard from Honourable Konjore. When the other Members spoke, I was not here and I do not have any information about differences.

I am just trying to emphasise the fact that this particular monument has to be moved to a certain area and that is what I want to underline. Of course, there are other things, which do not make sense to me that we can conveniently do away with. For example, we are talking about this horse and it is a historical fact that they came with horses and killed us, so let it be there. I do not understand why, for example, we still have to call the mountains between here and the airport the Bismarck Mountains. Bismarck was notorious.

Those things we could easily do away with without any problem, but these historical things can be dealt with in the fashion that Comrade Konjore has said and I just stood to support that. Let us build a museum at this place, let us take the horse to where Comrade Konjore has said. Among all the options that might have been mention I am attracted by this option. If

24 June 2008 MOTION ON REMOVAL OF REITERDENKMAL RT HON N ANGULA

there were other options, I do not know about them, but I support this option.

Having said so, I would just beg that we conclude the Debate and say that we build the museum.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you, Minister. Right Honourable Prime Minister.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Thank you, Comrade Speaker. I just want to say one or two things. The Debate about this German horse has helped to enlighten some of us about the history of that place and to be honest, the debate is not about the horse, I think the Debate was intended to be about the museum, what kind of museum is going to be there. I think the horse is just a coat for what people really want to talk about. I think what people want to talk about is actually the Museum, not really the horse, because of the nature of that place and there are many places in Namibia of that type about which we must one day take a decision to declare them as monuments, some sacred places which must be developed and documented for this history of the people.

We have Ohamakari, we have Shark Island and, of course, for me, Namutoni and we have many other places in the South. The Vaalgras Chiefs were fighting against colonialism and I am quite sure there are battlegrounds there which should be noted.

The first battle against the German colonialists were actually fought near Gobabis by Kahimemua Nguvauva and others and Nicodemus Kavikunua. Those battles started from there and they went on and the major one was Ohamakari, followed by concentration camps like this one which was here at the Alte Feste, Shark Island and others.

24 June 2008 MOTION ON REMOVAL OF REITERDENKMAL RT HON N ANGULA

I feel these things need to be properly documented and be declared national monuments so that the history of the people, their suffering and their resistance are not forgotten.

It is unfortunate that we have to discuss these things under the theme of the horse rider, while the horse rider was actually the perpetrator of the crime of colonialism.

Therefore, what we perhaps have to think about is how to treat such places where people were hanged, where people were abused, where people lost their lives in a hopeless situation. I think that is the real central question.

For now we follow what the Honourable Minister of Sports and Culture has suggested to us so that we can move on, but I think we have a larger agenda to identify those places, document them properly and declare them as national sacred places for the generations to come. Then we will do justice to the sacrifices of those forebears who suffered under those circumstances.

That is my short contribution. Thank you.

·	-						
HON SPEAKER: contribution. Any fu				Prime	Minister	for	his
HON TJIHUIKO:	I move th	nat th	e Debate be	adiourne	ed until tor	norra	ow.
	Timove th	iat tii	e Decare se	aajouin	od until tol	none	,,,,

HON SPEAKER: The Debate is adjourned until tomorrow afternoon. The First Notice of Motion is the one of the Minister of Agriculture, Water and Forestry. Does the Honourable Minister Move that the Bill be now introduced?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY: Honourable Speaker, due to circumstances beyond our control, I seek the indulgence that this Bill be introduced on Thursday.

HON SPEAKER: So decided. The Second Notice of Motion is the one of Honourable Viljoen. Does the Honourable Member Move the Motion? Who seconds the Motion? Any objection? Agreed to.

HON VILJOEN: Honourable Speaker, when we embarked on a new education system in Namibia after Independence, a large number of subjects with new names were taken up into the broad school curriculum. One of these subjects was Religious and Moral Education or RME, as it was called in short. RME replaced Biblical Studies as a subject. RME is a conglomerate of a number of religious views and trends put together in one curriculum. The idea was to enable learners to become familiar with all other Religions.

Due to the compilation and content of the curriculum of RME, children and teachers lost interest and the periods became even free periods to do homework. RME can be seen as a compromise to satisfy everybody in the country. I am convinced that RME was introduced as a humanitarian gesture to demonstrate the principle of freedom of Religion. It was the

brainchild of foreign advisors. (Interjections) I am busy motivating, Honourable Minister.

The curriculum for Biblical Studies, on the other hand, was based only on the Christian principles of the Holy Bible. It dealt with the whole Bible from Genesis to the last book, Revelation. One of the reasons why there is peace in our country is because any person can live up to his or her religious conviction.

We are all aware that many wars over time were fought over this issue. When the destruction of the Twin Towers in the United States of America took place, Americans were shocked and could not believe that God could allow something like that to happen to them. Their warning answer came: "Why should God protect you? You have banned him from your schools."

Right from the beginning, many representations were made to go back to Biblical Studies. There was no response from the authorities. The consequences were that many private schools were established to satisfy the need for Christian education.

At the beginning of June, some Parliamentarians received a letter, which was addressed to the Chairman of the Council of Traditional Leaders, King Immanuel Kauluma Elifas. Copies were sent to His Excellency, the President and to all spiritual leaders. The purpose of the letter was explained as follows: "I am writing the letter to Your Majesty as Chairman of the Council of Traditional Leaders, seeking the support of our Traditional Leaders in overcoming the ever-increasing moral and social evils in our society. These evils are caused by the absence of the knowledge and fear of God among our people, particularly amongst our young generation. Earlier we were under the church and the Bible was taught as subject. This helped our children and youth to grow up with the knowledge of their Redeemer and Saviour, Jesus Christ."

On 5 May 2008 the CCN issued a press release with the following message: "It was resolved that the need for Christian education and for bringing back Biblical instruction by means of redesigning school

curricula be realised. It was recommended that Christian education should be an integral part of the training of prospective teachers."

Honourable Speaker, there is really an outcry from people all over Namibia and we deny them the opportunity of learning the Bible at school. We claim that 90% of the Namibian population are Christians and many of the remaining 10% were brought up in Christian homes. Christians are the majority in this country, why is it necessary to compromise with a small minority? Why are we afraid? Are we afraid of offending a few people by sacrificing our children? (Interjections).

This Motion is not about history or a language syllabus, it will not cost the Government extra money.

This Motion is about Christianity and eternity and every Member in this House should take a decision which will have far-reaching consequences for our country and for each Member personally. We do not have to change the Constitution or any law or regulation. Since Independence, all syllabi for school subjects have been changed. We Namibianised all school subjects, why not Christianise RME?

If we agree on this Motion the consequences are that we have to use our own teachers to change the curriculum, we must liaise with those in charge of the university and colleges to change their training programme for teachers to enable them to teach Biblical Studies. We must inform all schools and Regional Offices of this change in policy and that everybody should implement it.

I wish to conclude: What is the reward? Yes, there is a reward and I quote from the Bible: Deuteronomy 30: "This day I call heaven and earth as witnesses against you that I have set before you life and death, blessing and curses. Now choose right so that you and your children may live and you may love your Lord your God, listen to His voice and hold fast to Him." I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank Honourable Viljoen for his motivation. Honourable Kayetuna.

HON KAVETUNA: Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members of this august House, the Motion being discussed at the moment came at the right time, in days in which our society is faced with a number of serious challenges, such as gruesome killing of innocent people and other social ills.

Our Constitution, in Article 21(b) and (c), gives us, the citizens of this country, the fundamental rights and freedoms that include the freedom to practise any religion and to manifest such practice in the freedom of conscience and belief. It is with this in mind that I would like to believe that along with Christianity, other religious practices and beliefs should be equally considered to be included in the school curriculum. This will enhance our effort to restore a degree of morality in which we find ourselves today. It will, however, widen the spectrum of our initiative to create a harmonious and a caring Nation.

This move will not only do us technically good, but it will assist us to promote the principles of the fundamental freedoms, as stipulated in our Constitution.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, as we are discussing the issue of education, allow me to touch on the issue of the Grade 10 failures.

This topic had been discussed at various occasions in the past and was used by some to score political points, while others continue to believe that this will be their powerful tool in gaining votes from the young Namibians. As a young citizen of our beautiful country, I do not see why this has to be an issue that generates such mass hysteria and excitement among many people. The Grade 10 failure rate should be seen as a serious stumble block and a disturbing factor to the progress of our society and the general well-being of our Nation.

Please allow me to congratulate our Government and the Ruling Party, SWAPO, for their strong determination and assurance that these young people are given a second chance.

Honourable Members, I would beg your indulgence to hear me out, as I am going to tell you the truth and nothing else but the truth on whether the problem of our education is the system or not. It is my humble and considered view that the education system is not necessarily the problem. I am saying this because I am a product of the Bantu Education myself, a system that did not reflect anything about my beloved Motherland, culture, heritage and traditions, a system that humiliated and deprived us of our rights because of its inherent attitudes against blacks, a system that served only the interests of the whites by entrenching their social and economic advancement.

My experience of the Cape Education System is so bitter that I will never want it to show its face in this world again. I have suffered dehumanisation and humiliation of being forced to call Afrikaans my mother language, my *moedertaal*. The COD, it was called the *Kaap Onderwys Department*. The COD system expected us to know the characteristics of cattle such as Brahman and non-indigenous cattle that many of us have never seen in our areas when we were doing Agriculture.

We are sitting here today, trying to point fingers to the issue of transfer as the basic problem, as if it never happened in the previous system. There were those people who usually teased that they were jacked.

We called the system the promotion system, the transfer system, which is the same transfer that we are dealing with today. If you fail once, the second time you will be transferred to the next grade.

In all honesty, this Namibian education system is ... (Interjections).

HON ULENGA: The Rules allow a Point of Order.

HON SPEAKER: I thought it was a maiden speech.

.____

HON KAVETUNA: In all honesty, this Namibian education system is what a country like ours needs as kids as early as Grade 1 are taught to touch, to feel and to see. Yes, the system is the best and it needs a massive effort from all of us who are concerned about quality education, including the officials in the Ministry, the parents, the teachers and very important, the learners themselves. The political will is not a question, it has been excessively shown by our leaders from all walks of life, including the opposition. Let us try to address issues that will assist us to make this excellent system work and improve our results.

One thing that I would like you to bear in mind is that not every learner who enrols in Grade 1 is a possible Grade 12 candidate after twelve or fourteen years of the formal education cycle. There will be those who will leave throughout their school career, those who will lose interest in reading the books, but who are ready to do things with their hands. There will be visitors on earth who will enjoy causing problems, who do not even have a purpose in life. Not all this can be rectified by any education system in the world. That is why this good system should be modified to accommodate and be friendly to every learner with his or her shortcomings.

I strongly believe that the recommendations below will be of much assistance to create a positive impact on our education system:

• Introduce technical subjects from as early as Grade 4 that will be formalised and be an exam subject from Grade 8. This will help us to identify and develop artisans as early as possible.

- We should not wait until they fail Grade 10 and encourage them to attend Vocational Training Centres, as they will only do this just because there is no other option.
- School Boards should play an active role in the results of their schools.

On the issue of readmission of the Grade 10s, it should not be at random, there is a need to categorise those who failed this grade as the school will not be able to accommodate a double number of learners every year.

That is why we have to look at possibilities like those who fall short of 4 points, may be given a second chance to write in January. Those who obtained 15 to 20 points should be readmitted in formal schools. Those who get less than 15 points should obviously go to NAMCOL. This will help us to control the huge numbers of learners who drop out of the system and lessen the burden on the already overcrowded schools.

We perceive the high unemployment rate, poverty and other social ills, like severe alcohol abuse in our country, as a ticking explosive. It will serve no purpose for me to attempt to discuss the effect that this unpleasant situation has on our Nation before getting information at hand. In the true sense of the letter, how many unemployed people, including youth, does Namibia have? Why are they unemployed? What are their qualifications, skills, talent and very important, what do these people want to do to become employable?

The issue of the availability or unavailability of employment opportunities should be secondary to the baseline vital information for proper planning, coordination of plans to create employment and huge wastage of resources, duplication of activities that do not have an impact on the lives of the majority are some problems that we need to look at. Everybody wants to do something on their own, specifically between the NGOs, the Government and other institutions.

Honourable Speaker, the legend of the African revolution, Mzee Julius Mwalimu Nyerere, along with his *ujamaa* movement, the struggle for the total social well-being of the people of this continent, put more emphasis on the aspect of health: "No Nation will develop if its people are not healthy. A healthy Nation is a developed Nation." It is with this conviction and my passion for health that I deemed it necessary to touch on this important subject in my first speech in this august House.

HIV/AIDS remains the biggest challenge in our country as the number of infected continue to increase despite the massive efforts and resources that our Government and other partners are pumping into the fight against this dreadful disease. Mechanisms and other modalities should be devised in order for us to control the spread of the pandemic once and for all.

As we all know, we cannot address HIV in isolation without linking it to other causal factors that heavily contribute to the spread of HIV, such as drug abuse, social factors such as poverty, irresponsible sexual practices, traditional and cultural aspects. Our Government should be applauded for having introduced the ART programme that extends the life of those who at one point saw death as the only hope when they were diagnosed with HIV. It is very essential to intensify and strategise ways on how we could put a frozen mark of no more infection. The following could be that we will make strides in the process of compacting the spread of this disease.

Periodic review to determine the impact of ARV therapy, a scientific research through a vaccine trial should be embarked upon to enable us to determine various aspects surrounding the vaccine in our own context. The issue of male circumcision should be taken up. Awareness and mobilisation campaigns should be initiated throughout all spheres of our society.

The current statistics of the ASC, which is the Antenatal Survey that is being used to illustrate the impact of HIV and AIDS on Namibians, may not be a true reflection of the situation on the ground. If one Namibian man could be responsible for the pregnancy of only one woman, the picture could really have reflected the truth, but it is unfortunately not the

reality. It is, therefore, imperative to conduct a national HIV survey to validate our statistics.

HIV is like any other sexually transmitted infection. A policy should be devised that would encourage pregnant women to bring their partners for testing during their first ASC visit.

Honourable Speaker, I would further like to express my concern on the rate at which Government is losing revenue in the current development when most patients are granted permission to be treated at Private Hospitals because a number of Specialists and a number of General Practitioners are not working at the State Hospital anymore.

This unfortunate draining of the Government coffers was prompted by the deteriorating condition of our private rooms at our State Hospitals. Private rooms in the State Hospital are essential for Private Patients without medical aid and those who are on our Government Aid without Complimed. The need for these wards cannot be over-emphasised. It is needed, therefore it should be upgraded in order to be more patient friendly, infection free, for patients to experience value for money.

On administration of these wards, there is a need to computerise the admission records. This will be of great assistance in the billing of items used for patients, so that it could be charged. Payments should be modified for Namibians and non-Namibians. This will only be realised when management and the doctors in question sit together and consult on action, based on what is essential for the betterment of these wards.

Honourable Speaker, there is no logic to have plus minus 100,000 members on the Government medical aid, but not to have facilities for them to access the service in times of need. Members of the Government Medical Aid experience humiliation and severe difficult conditions when in need of urgent medical care. These members have to visit private hospitals in cases of emergency or casualties where they have to pay a certain amount for the facility and for the doctors on the spot, as these private hospitals are not contracted to treat the members on the Government Medical Aid. If admitted, they have to search for an

ambulance and take the risk of transporting the patient to be admitted at Central Hospital, which is a very inconvenient and risky act to many of these poor people.

The Ministry should, therefore, consider to reopen the Central Hospital Casualty as a matter of urgency as it will lessen the burden on the Katutura Casualty and reduce loss of lives due to lengthy queues and procedures which are observed when one visits health facilities, especially during the end of the month period.

Furthermore, a stratified premium for the Government Medical Aid should be considered. This can be done by looking at a number of issues, for instance categorising of benefits and other factors that will involve quality medical provision. The current *one-shoe-fits-all* approach on the monthly contribution is not likely to make our medical aid more effective. A Minister or a Member of Parliament cannot pay the same amount as a cleaner. Therefore, the national health authority should work on a health package that will be conducive and very sustainable to the Government and its members.

Honourable Speaker, I would finally like to express my gratitude to the SWAPO Party and its entire rank and file for having granted me the opportunity to serve the Namibian people in this august House. I would further like to pay homage to the people of great Otjozondjupa, especially of the beautiful town of Otjiwarongo, our family town, the youth community at large, my friends and comrades and all who inspired me in one or another way. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Member for her statement. Honourable Iyambo.

HON MINISTER OF FISHERIES AND MARINE RESOURCES:

Honourable Speaker, we from the Ruling Party will always continue working closely with the Honourable Members from both the Ruling Party and the Opposition in the House. We want our Colleagues to know that when we object to some of their Motions, it is not because we hate them, it is because of principles on which we cannot negotiate. It is because of laws and the Constitution on which we do not want to negotiate. We will however always allow them to speak unhindered when things are in line with the Constitution and the Rules of this House. Anything outside that we will definitely speak out and rectify what we need to rectify, including the Honourable *Meneer Viljoen*.

Therefore, there is no sympathy when we reject the Motions that are not in line with the Constitution, not in line with our Rules and therefore, Honourable Speaker, what I was looking for when I stood up earlier on was guidance, guidance from the fathers and the mothers of the Constitution, looking at the Right Honourable Prime Minister, the Honourable Hage Geingob as well as the Speaker and many, many mothers and fathers of the Constitution.

I doubt whether the Motion of Honourable Viljoen is in line with our Constitution, particularly Chapter 1, Article 1 of our Constitution. This article says the following: "The Republic of Namibia is hereby established as a sovereign, secular", and I do not know how to say it in Afrikaans, "serkulêre". It is a "sovereign and secular democratic and unitary state founded upon the principles", etcetera.

Therefore, Honourable Speaker, I want to debate on the issue of the secular State and ask that questions to the mothers and fathers:

Is this in line with our Constitution that we as lawmakers are debating something that seems not to be in line with the Constitution of the Republic of Namibia? If it is allowed, I will not continue, but if it is not allowed, I would like to have the Motion of Honourable Viljoen rejected. (Intervention)

24 June 2008 MOTION ON BIBLICAL STUDIES AS SUBJECT HON DR A IYAMBO

HON TJIHUIKO: May I ask the Honourable Member a small question? Honourable Minister, you are doing quite well, but are you aware that every afternoon when we are opening this august House, we are always praying? Are you aware of that? If you are aware, why are we praying every afternoon?

HON MINISTER OF FISHERIES AND MARINE RESOURCES:

Honourable Speaker, as a Member of this House, having been here for some time now, I would be very dull if I am not aware. I am very much aware because I do also participate in that Prayer. Just to add that apart from the Prayer, the Honourable Members should be very clear that we also take the affirmation when we start every day. Are you aware of that? However, you do not have the floor to answer.

Honourable Speaker, what I am saying is that this Motion, unless I am advised otherwise, is against the Constitution of the Republic. (Intervention)

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: I am sorry to interrupt your speech, but can I ask you a small question? Honourable Iyambo, are you aware that despite the fact that we pray here to respect each other, the very Honourable Member who asked you a question violates this Prayer of respecting each other?

HON MINISTER OF FISHERIES AND MARINE RESOURCES:

Honourable Speaker, I am constantly and consistently observing that from Honourable Viljoen and I am very much aware that he has been doing it

too much. I am very much aware, Honourable Speaker, and Honourable Tjihuiko too.

Honourable Speaker, I am saying that this Motion is against the Constitution of the Republic of Namibia and it should be rejected now and in the future if it comes back. I, Move that we reject this Motion, Honourable Speaker. Thank you very much.

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Honourable Minister. Honourable Geingob.

HON MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY: I thank you, Honourable Speaker. The previous speaker was calling upon the fathers and mothers of this Constitution and I just put my name down because I happen to be the father and I was the Chairperson of the Drafting Committee.

We were very interested in defending the right of the minorities, so much so that we chose an electoral system of proportional representation, which could allow minorities who did not have any support to be sitting in this House, namely Honourable Viljoen, to protect their right to be heard, to participate. Honourable Viljoen is denying 10% of other religious people that right and he said, "forget about it." You are saying that. He said, "forget about the 10% minority."

Anyway, the issue is still the same. We are protecting the rights of minorities like you, like me, like all of us. That is why we took that voting system. You say Namibia is 90% Christian, therefore, why worry about 10%?

If Muslims are 1% or non-Christians are 1%, do they not have a right to exercise their beliefs? What we are now doing is denying them that right.

Besides now joining the Debate in my capacity of the Chairman of the Constituent Assembly, I think we have a practice here in this House that nothing that militates against the Constitution must be allowed. Therefore, I want the Speaker to make a ruling because according to Article 1 we have a secular State. We praise this Constitution as one of the best in the world and it suits us, but then we turn around and try to violate it. That Constitution guarantees all the religious groups their right and by secularity we should not choose one religion over another one, they are all equal. That is what secularism means.

Therefore, Comrade Speaker, I would like you to rule. I am just seeking advice from the Speaker of this House because there is a constitutional question here, that the Constitution is very clear, it is talking about a secular State, which does not recognise or favour any one religion over the other one. They all enjoy the freedoms, which we do. We used to like to go to school and pray and so on. I am now talking not as born-again Christian, of course, I cannot be, but at least I go to church again.

I am not saying he as a Christian does not have that right, but why do you deny others, the minorities, the right that you are enjoying politically? That is the point.

The Constitution is very clear that it is a secular state and I would like that issue to be clarified by the Speaker. Thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. I have on the list Honourable Kawana, Honourable Tjiriange, Honourable Riruako, Honourable Moongo. I do not want to deny the Honourable Members an opportunity to speak, but if nobody else speaks after them, I will proceed, but for now I will give the floor to Honourable Kawana.

HON MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS: Honourable Speaker, my points have been taken up by Honourable Iyambo here and the Vice-President of SWAPO, so I am really covered. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Tjiriange.

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: Thank you, Comrade Speaker. Basically, in the same vein, but I would like to emphasise: Although Honourable Viljoen wants to deny, I want to quote him.

He says and I quote: "We claim that 90% of the Namibian population are Christians and many of the remaining 10% were brought up in Christian homes. Christians are the majority in this country, why is it necessary to compromise with a small minority?" This is what he said. (Interjections) If that logic is extended to other categories of people in this country... (Intervention)

HON SPEAKER: I thought this is a matter of constitutional seriousness about which the Speaker was called upon to give a Ruling, but it does not sound like it.

.____

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: Within this minority there are many people who cannot be regarded as Christians, those who believe in the Holy Fire who have their children in schools. Can they also

be subjected to what the Honourable Member is saying – Muslims and other people such as atheists, etcetera?

I think, essentially, the Motion is Out of Order in the sense that I do not believe that this House, which has passed the Constitution of this country could indulge in issues that are meant to violate the same Constitution that we have adopted in this House, unless we are discussing an Amendment to the Constitution.

I do not say that issues cannot be raised to amend the Constitution, but it must be raised within the context of amending the Constitution after all these years. (Intervention)

HON RIRUAKO: We have to believe in God, our ancestors died but they are still alive in God, we communicate and it is our religion that we know in which our forefathers have died, but they are still alive in God, we communicate. What we ask them they are going to deliver to us. No Christian can get what you pray for. We believe in a very highly respected religion. Even the Roman Catholics uphold this, you had better go to the Roman Catholics and ask what is the holy Sacred Fire and there you can get the answer, not from us.

We pray every day once we open our Parliament here. Are you not satisfied with that?

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: Finally, what I was saying is that I have no problem with a Member of this House bringing a Motion for the Amendment of the Constitution and then to discuss the Constitution in that sense, that we are amending the Constitution here and there. (Intervention)

HON TJIHUIKO: I am sorry to disrupt the Honourable Minister, but I wanted to ask him a question as I believe he is a lawyer and he will be able to help me. If the Constitution says: "Whereas recognition of the inherent dignity and of the equal and inalienable rights of all members of the human family is indispensable for freedom, justice and peace; Whereas the said rights include the right of the individual to life, liberty and the pursuit of happiness, regardless of race, colour, ethnic origin, sex, religion, creed or social or economic status", what does it really mean in legal terms? I just want the Honourable Minister to explain what this means. Do we really need to change the Constitution or perhaps the Motion was brought in the context of what is stated here?

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: I do not know whether I understood the question, but I think the emphasis is on the creed, since we are talking about religion here. However, the fact is that, that particularly preamble strengthens Article 1 in the sense that it gives the right to everybody to believe or not to believe, not to impose your creed onto others. That is what it is. (Intervention)

HON DIENDA: Honourable Speaker, may I ask the Honourable Member a question? Honourable Speaker, what does 'secular State' mean? On a daily basis we pray in this Chamber . The people that he is talking about is also represented in this Parliament. Are we not also imposing other beliefs on them? We are praying, but what about the other 10% that he is talking about?

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: Let me come to that one. Comrade Speaker, when we started this Parliament in 1990, Reverend Kameeta and others composed that particular Prayer here and it was brought here. It was only the Prayer which was adopted here. Some of said that is not good enough, there must be something that will cover the others. Hence the addition of the Affirmation. (Intervention)

HON MINISTER OF REGIONAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT, HOUSING AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: Comrade Minister, does it mean that because the Honourable Member wants to discriminate against some of us, that while others are praying I must come with my bones and throw my bones up and down? Does the Honourable Member want to force me to bring my bones here so that I pray through my bones? Is that what he wants?

HON MINISTER OF VETERANS AFFAIRS: The late Speaker, Comrade Tjitendero, understood and the Affirmation was also composed. Therefore, whatever religious background you come from, you are covered in that opening ceremony that takes place here. If you are a Christian, you are covered; if you are not, you are covered by the Affirmation. There is no harm in that one.

I was saying that if a Member comes with a Motion to amend a certain clause in the Constitution, that is acceptable. Then we discuss the Constitution in that particular context, but to come with a Motion which does not intend to amend the Constitution, but intends to violate the Constitution, that is not acceptable. Therefore, the Motion is Out of Order.

24 June 2008 MOTION ON BIBLICAL STUDIES AS SUBJECT HON MOONGO

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Moongo.

<u>HON MOONGO</u>: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. (Intervention)

HON ULENGA: Honourable Speaker, on a Point of Order. I think there is a matter that needs to be resolved before the Debate can continue, because listening to the two, three previous speakers in this House, they really seemed to be talking about the question of Order, how we are to proceed.

HON SPEAKER: You are Out of Order, Honourable Ulenga.

HON MOONGO: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. I would like to sympathise with the Colleague because maybe he did not understand what 'secular' means. That Article 1 was put there deliberately to allow freedom of all religions. That means that all religions may use NBC and nobody was discriminated against. If he could maybe amend the Motion in order to be in line with Article 1. Of course, the majority of us are believers but we do not want to discriminate against the minority who do not believe in God.

Therefore, I hope the Colleague could have understanding and probably come up with an Amendment to suit all, but if the Motion says the

24 June 2008 MOTION ON BIBLICAL STUDIES AS SUBJECT RT HON N ANGULA

Christians should play a major role, we will discriminate against the minorities. Thank you very much.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Prime Minister.

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: Thank you, I just want to correct a few misconceptions.

Honourable Viljoen claimed that religion and moral education were put there by advisers. That is a blatant untruth because... (Interjection)

HON P MUSHELENGA: A lie.

<u>HON SPEAKER:</u> No, withdraw Honourable Mushelenga. Did Honourable Mushelenga say '*lies?*'

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: I am saying that is an untruth. Religion and moral education was put there to meet the requirement of the Constitution. However, that does not prevent Christians in schools to form Christian clubs and learn and discuss the Bible so that they can practise their religion. Similarly, it does not prevent Hindus and Muslims

24 June 2008 MOTION ON BIBLICAL STUDIES AS SUBJECT RT HON N ANGULA

and others of the Holy Fire to form their clubs and discuss their faith and religion.

Secondly, schools which practise morning prayer do so and nobody interferes with them. I know that that there is a feeling in the population that we have crime because religion is not being taught in schools. I am not quite sure that that is the case, but I know there is that feeling. People think that since religion is not being taught in schools, people do not respect other people's lives and property, they do not respect elders, like myself – as Honourable Venaani normally does despite the difference of 50 years. (Intervention)

HON VENAANI: May the Right Honourable Prime Minister withdraw 'the difference of 50 years?'

RT HON PRIME MINISTER: I withdraw. Really, this is the problem, that as a State we have difficulty in funding the teaching of a particular faith because of the Constitution. We do however recognise the feeling in the population that perhaps there is something missing in the lives of their children. My only advice is that church people should encourage young people to form clubs if they are Christian or any other religious club so that you can proclaim your faith in that way, rather than putting that to the State, because according to the Constitution the State is not allowed to do that and I do not think the citizens want to see their own Government violating the Constitution.

I am just appealing for that understanding. You can use classrooms, you can use schools to teach your Bible if you so wish, with the permission of the principal, but please, do not force the Government to violate the Constitution of the Republic. Thank you.

24 June 2008

HON SPEAKER: I thank the Right Honourable Prime Minister. I am ready to give the Ruling but I will further bedevil the discussion. At the United Nations, for example, because of all these things and more, at the ceremonial openings of the United Nations the presiding officer – I tried to be one of them once – asks the Honourable Members to rise and observe a minute in silent prayer or meditation.

Taking into consideration what some of the Honourable Members have said and more, the Prayer that we read out, in spite of what Honourable Tjiriange has said, is a Christian-biased Prayer. It discriminates against Muslims and Jews and Hindus and Buddhists and atheists, animists and the rest. In spite of the fact that we have attached the Affirmation to it, what we are discussing has more to do with religion. Affirmation is a neutral declaration.

Thus, in this Prayer as it stands, there is a minority in this country that is being discriminated against. Honourable Dienda is correct in that sense. We are practising and have been practising since 1990 what we are now advocating as being wrong as being proposed by Honourable Viljoen. Not being a legal man, that is what I think but I will consult lawyers and give you my Ruling at an appropriate time.

On that note, the House shall adjourn until tomorrow at 14:30.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:45 UNTIL 2008.06.25 AT 14:30