# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS WINDHOEK 26 MARCH 2019

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON SPEAKER took the Chair and read the Prayer and Affirmation.

# ANNOUNCEMENT IN TERMS OF RULE 20(A) OF THE STANDING RULES AND ORDERS

**HON SPEAKER**: Welcome back. Honourable Members we have learned with shock the passing on of King Elifas Kauluma. You might have gathered by now that he passed on this morning. In his capacity as the Chairperson of the Traditional Council, I would like to request the Assembly to rise and to observe a minute of silence in his honor.

## MINUTE OF SILENCE OBSERVED

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you. Furthermore, I am aware that we do have a number of Members of Parliament who are born during the month of March. I recall learning from the social media the Honourable Hambyuka observed his birthday a day or two ago. We join the rest of your friends and colleagues to wish you well. Let there be a good year for you, good health, congratulations and today we have one more Colleague who was born on this day the  $26^{\text{th}}$  of March and that is the Honourable Doctor Albert Kawana our Attorney General. In his absence we wish him well and say happy birthday to him. Thank you.

#### NOTICE OF QUESTIONS HON VENAANI

Any petitions, reports of standing and select Committees, other reports and papers, notices of questions, Honourable Venaani.

#### **NOTICE OF QUESTIONS**

**HON VENAANI**: Honourable Speaker, I ask for your indulgence to ask an oral urgent question to the Right Honourable Sarah Kuugongelwa-Amadhila Prime Minister of the Republic.

HON SPEAKER: Can I have the gist of it?

#### **ORAL QUESTION**

**QUESTION 08:** 

**HON VENAANI**: Noting the fact that the Mozambican Republic has been hit by a serious calamity of the cyclone that has killed over a thousand people, there was an announcement made in the electronic media that Government intends to give a package of fish to that sister Republic. I want to know from the Right Honourable Prime Minister as a person entrusted with emergency response in the country whether Government has already budgeted an amount that you wants to give to those victims.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

### **RESPONSE TO ORAL QUESTION RT HON DR KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA**

**HON VENAANI**: That is the question and I want to wish Honourable Kawana a happy birthday.

HON SPEAKER: Can we finish? Oh, you wanted to.

HON VENAANI: Honourable Kawana listen, happy birthday.

**HON SPEAKER**: The Honourable Venaani wanted to make sure that an opportunity is not missed to inform the Honourable Doctor Kawana that in your absence we recall the day when you were born and we did extend our congratulations to him. I am just repeating what the Honourable Venaani was saying. Happy birthday, Right Honourable Prime Minister.

#### **RESPONSE TO ORAL QUESTION**

**<u>RT HON PRIME MINISTER</u>**: I thank Honourable MacHenry Venaani for that question and I would like to respond that indeed Namibia is a member of the SADC community has joined SADC firstly in expressing our solidarity with our brothers and sisters in that country and other countries that are affected by the same development and yes indeed, we have decided to provide relief in the form of fish. I want to give the assurance that that donation has been secured in kind because we also have Government companies that are in the sector and what remains really is just for us to make sure that it is delivered there. I want to encourage of course Namibian private citizen to also do whatever they can do to show their solidarity with our colleagues in those countries by sharing whatever

## RESPONSE TO ORAL QUESTION HON PROF KASINGO

little that they can. I understand that the Red Cross is doing that and we should try to compliment what they are doing. Thank you.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. Well done, yes, please Deputy Speaker.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Thank you for the question and thank you for the respond from Right Honourable Prime Minister. I was also thinking that apart from the Government as Members of Parliament we can also probably donate something, clothes. I do remember I belong to a certain Lutheran Church and our church has already committed itself to donate something for the citizen of Zimbabwe, clothes. We have so many suits. I was thinking. Actually I wanted to talk to you maybe we can debate on it tomorrow during the Standing Rules and Order.

We can open it the whole week. We have so many clothes and people in particular Mozambique they are suffering and they have suffered. There is no harm if we can donate. We have so many suits, so many clothes. We can donate there but I will follow it up Honourable Speaker. Thank you.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you. I think that is a kind of spirit and we explore that is possible and we would be able to act on that basis. Next is Honourable Kavekotora.

### **QUESTION 44:**

**HON KAVEKOTORA**: Thank you very much Honourable Speaker. Honourable Speaker I give notice that on Thursday the 4<sup>th</sup> of April 2019 I

## NOTICE OF QUESTIONS HON KAVEKOTORA

shall ask the Minister of Finance Honourable Calle Schlettwein the following questions.

The Pension Fund Act from the look of things seems to be having loopholes that are detrimental to the Pension Fund beneficiaries especially when it comes to the distribution of surplus funds. Let me demonstrate my point by sighting examples of the Rossing Pension Fund. Rossing Pension Fund has accumulated surplus of over N\$500 Million by 2010.

The Pension Fund Act, Act number 24 of 1956 the year that I was born does not contain any guidelines as to who surplus funds in the Pension Fund are to be distributed.

The rules of the Rossing Pension Fund were revised to include a rule that deal with the distribution of a surplus fund in the Fund. Out of close of half a billion of surplus the beneficiaries only ended up getting close to N\$120 Million of the N\$500 Million. Hence my question:

1. Is it not time for your Ministry to review the Pension Fund Act of 1956 with the objective to amend it so that it can benefit the beneficiaries.

I so Move.

#### **QUESTION 45:**

**HON KAVEKOTORA:** On the same day Honourable Speaker I give notice that on Thursday the 4<sup>th</sup> of April 2019 I shall ask the Deputy Prime Minister and Minister of International Relations and Cooperation, Honourable Netumbo Nandi Ndaitwah, the following question:

The Motion that led to the ongoing negotiations between the Namibian Government and the Government of Germany on the genocide issues came from this August House. The Namibian Government went out of their way and even spent millions and millions of Namibian Dollars

# NOTICE OF QUESTIONS HON DIENDA

preparing for this negotiation.

The nation was recently informed that the Motion tabled in the Germany Budestack by a member of the left party for an unequivocal public apology for the genocide Committee committed against the Ovaherero and the Namas was rejected and thrown out. Hence the following question.

- 1. How far are you Honourable Minister in the negotiation process and what milestones have you reached to date?
- 2. Does the progress made so far justify the resources both human and financial deployed on this matter to date?
- 3. Is the Germany Parliament Budestack aware of the ongoing negotiations between the Namibian Government and the German Government?
- 4. What are your views Honourable Minister on the move by the Budestack rejecting the apology Motion and how does that affect the negotiation process? And lastly
- 5. How does the Government address the continuous request by some leaders of the affected communities who feel left out from the negotiating process

I so Move.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you. Next on my list is Honourable Dienda.

**QUESTION 46:** 

HON DIENDA: Honourable Speaker I give notice that on Thursday the

4<sup>th</sup> of April 2019 I shall ask the Minister of Works and Transport the following.

In a report on the front page of the Namibia on Friday 22<sup>nd</sup> of March 2019 it is stated that renovations to former President Sam Nujoma Government sponsored house has cost this country's taxpayer the sum of N\$70 Million instead of the original N\$20 Million mentioned in 2014.

Can the Honourable Minister please tell this August House the following?

- 1. What renovations were done that cost N\$70 Million? It seem that we are building a hotel?
- 2. Was the first amount of N\$20 Million approved and budgeted for in 2014?
- 3. How did this amount escalate to N\$70 Million in four years?
- 4. Was this new and inflated amount approved and budgeted for?
- 5. Is it true that Cabinet decided to renovate the former President House for an amount of N\$70 Million despite his cash payout in 2005 and that Cabinet have the legal right to make such a decision?
- 6. Does the Honourable Minister agree with me that this whole matter strongly reminds us of the Nkandhla scandal related to the former South African President Jacob Zuma and when will this money be paid back by the former President Sam Nujoma.

I so Move.

HON SPEAKER: Next is Honourable Muharukua.

HON MUHARUKUA: Thank you Honourable Speaker.

# NOTICE OF QUESTIONS HON MUHARUKUA

HON SPEAKER: Let us hear him.

**QUESTION 47:** 

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Thank you Honourable Speaker. Honourable Speaker and Honourable Member I hereby give notice that on Thursday the 4<sup>th</sup> of April 2019 I shall ask the Right Honourable Prime Minister, Honourable Sarah Kuugongelwa-Amadhila, the following.

The National Health Training Centre operates under the Ministry of Health and Social Services training health personnel to deliver adequate pharmaceutical care. The pharmacist assistant training program is among the training it conducts offering a two year certificate as a pharmacist Assistant NQA level 5.

Complains have been made to the PDM or Popular Democratic Movement probing the following question:

- 1. Is it correct that the students training was financed by NASFAF in the amount of N\$34 000 per student?
- 2. Is it correct that 120 students comprising the 2016 and 2017 intakes have not been given employment as promised to them by the Ministry when they took up the opportunity to study this particular course?

These 120 students petitioned your office on December  $14^{th}$ , 2018. Yes the reason why the question is directed to you is that on December  $14^{th}$  2018 these students seeking an amicable and an urgent solution.

3. Why has your office done nothing towards the plight of these unemployed Namibian youths to date?

It is not rumour mongering. The students are there. Some of the students are up there. It is not rumour.

### NOTICE OF QUESTIONS HON MUHARUKUA

**HON SPEAKER**: Please, please we cannot all be speaking. Please continue.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Thank you. NASFAF spend N\$4 080 000 on these students that the Government is currently refusing to employ not only this investment in the people standing idle without utilization, these young people cannot now feed their families as Government promised them when they were offered the program of study. Finally or close to finally:

- 4. Are you aware that some of these students cannot even seek private employment as Pharmacist Assistants because those who completed the training last year will only be evaluated by the Pharmacy Council in June this year after which they can be employed in a private sector?
- 5. What is the reason for the delay in evaluating these students and locking these students or Namibian youths in poverty?

**HON MUHARUKUA:** Honourable Speaker I give further notice that on the  $4^{th}$  of April 2019 I shall ask the Minister of Defence, Honourable Penda Ya Ndakolo, the following:

The PDM is reliably informed that the Ministry of Defence trucks have been time and time again spotted ferrying army clothing and specifically combat boots to remote areas of Namibia especially the northern part of Namibia. These goods carried are then traded for small stock with members of our rural community.

Honourable Minister this is a clear corrupt activity for which national security can never be used as a veil. Hence, the following question.

1. Who is the person selling army boots and all using defence force

## NOTICE OF MOTIONS HON HAMBYUKA

vehicle for personal gain?

- 2. Were any steps taken against such individuals?
- 3. Should you not be aware of such conduct now that it has come to your attention, will your Ministry launch an investigation into these activities?
- 4. Is it even worth giving you more informant given that you are closing your ears to these corrupt activities?

I so Move, Honourable Speaker.

**HON SPEAKER**: That is a very difficult question I must say. We move on. Notice of Motions. Next is Honourable Hambyuka.

### **NOTICE OF MOTIONS**

### **LEAVE OF ABSENCE**

**<u>HON HAMBYUKA</u>**: Honourable Speaker I move without notice that leave of absence due to ill health be granted to Honourable Immanuel Ngatjizeko until further notice.

I so Move, Honourable Speaker.

## NOTICE OF MOTIONS HON SIMATAA

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Next is Honourable Simataa.

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY: Honourable Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: Please, please, please, no.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: He said the Honourable Van Den Walt is a KUFTU is not here. He must withdraw that.

**HON SPEAKER**: Now you see the difficult I did not give a floor to anybody actually, yes, Honourable Stanley Simataa you have the floor. Please, please let us have order.

# ELECTRONIC TRANSACTIONS BILL

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY: Thank you very much Honourable Speaker. There is a lot of commotion you know on the side. I wonder what is happening.

I give notice that on Thursday 28<sup>th</sup> March 2019, I shall move that leave be given to introduce a Bill to provide for a general framework for the promotion of the use of the electronic transactions in the Republic of Namibia and to also provide for the legal recognition of electronic

# PRECARIOUS SITUATION PREVAILING AT THE PUBLIC SERVICE MEDICAL AID SCHEME HON VENAANI

transactions to provide for the admission of electronic evidence, to provide for consumer protection in electronic commerce, to regulate the liability of service providers for actions of their clients and to provide for matters incidental thereto.

I so Move Honourable Speaker.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you, messages from the Head of State, Ministerial Statements. So we are done. Just a small reminder to the Honourable Members. Actually we have been having our meetings almost on a daily basis without any tea break and I think we should restore the old system. Do you agree? Alright, thank you very much because I think it is only human and let me not elaborate. I think it goes without saying particularly for the Speaker.

The first notice of a Motion is the one of the Honourable Venaani. When the Assembly adjourned on Wednesday the 13<sup>th</sup> March 2019 the Honourable Venaani had a floor motivating his Motion. I therefore give him the floor to continue.

# PRECARIOUS SITUATION PREVAILING AT THE PUBLIC SERVICE MEDICAL AID SCHEME

**HON VENAANI**: I also want to join the chorus of leaders of our country in paying our homage and tribute to the fallen lion of the Ondonga King Kauluma who reign as a Chairperson of the Council of Traditional Leaders. We have only not lost a traditional leader but we have lost a

# PRECARIOUS SITUATION PREVAILING AT THE PUBLIC SERVICE MEDICAL AID SCHEME HON VENAANI

foremost senior traditional leader who chaired the Council of Traditional Leaders for many, many years. May his soul rest in eternal peace and he join the ancestral realm.

Honourable Speaker I move this Motion and I was nearing conclusion on the 13<sup>th</sup>. I move this Motion informed by a report that made the suggested figures that were very worrisome due to the fact that the figures was not actually making sense due to the amount of money the fund uses.

But be that as it may, it triggered an inquiry from my end that what is happening with the Fund and we know what is really happening with the Fund. As I was concluding I was saying that there is a moral duty of the current beneficiaries and especially main members because sometimes in our society we are the ones perpetrating these illegal activities with our own decisions. You would be sitting with a cousin who comes to you or a young child of the family member and you are putting that person as if he or she is the person that is on that Fund. So those that are milking the Fund especially from the professional medical side most of the time are doing it with an acromora sort of a concurrence with some beneficiaries in some instances.

Sometimes it is the Medical Practitioners that have this system and perhaps I am trying to look for a middle way because when you come to get medical services, your bill is never known. You leave getting your prescription paying the one third that you have to pay but what you are charged for that consultation is never known to you and I think that create the laxity for a person who wants to use this Fund for his own gain to be able to over claim and sometimes members of societies that have chronic diseases and most of us are suffering from various chronic diseases whether high blood pressure, diabetes and many others and every time I do not know Ebola whether Ebola is a chronic disease but I doubt and most of the time people that are suffering from chronic diseases come for consultation for check- ups and most of the time those that are busy never have the time to come for consultation. You will only come to come and

# PRECARIOUS SITUATION PREVAILING AT THE PUBLIC SERVICE MEDICAL AID SCHEME HON VENAANI

collect your prescription but then the Doctors would claim that so and so came for consultation and you are charged. So perhaps the billing system in the medical fraternity should also change that before now that we have gone really electronic that even if you are leaving a Doctor's consultation room, at least your invoice must be in your phone through an sms saying that Honourable Katjavivi you visited us for a foot ache.

We have charged you N\$400 so that you know because that person you would come for a gout problem and he is now charging you for the biggest consultation and if you came with, I did not hear that. So that should be improved and in conclusion and Minister of Finance you know my view on this matter. I am lamenting the issue of administrators. We cannot explain nor justify for a fund of so few people to be administered that is the correct English for nearly N\$100 Million per year and that needs to be relooked and I think if we really bring technical people staff in the Ministry can be able to administer this program because if you are spending N\$100 Million, your system cannot lose money. It should not lose money yet you are paying the administrators and yet you are losing money. So therefore these are issues on this Motion. Let us protect the Fund. Without protecting it, it cannot have a longevity. So the members of society must protect the Fund. It is probably one of the best medical aid fund because we are paying so little in relation to the services that we are getting from the Fund and I think we should protect it but we should protect it in such a way that we do not allow some of these laxities to rule.

I so move Honourable Speaker.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you. Any further discussion, yes, Honourable Kavetuna.

# PRECARIOUS SITUATION PREVAILING AT THE PUBLIC SERVICE MEDICAL AID SCHEME HON KAVETUNA / HON SCHLETTWEIN

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES**: I would like to ask the indulgence of the House to postpone the Motion to Thursday.

HON SPEAKER: To.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES**: Thursday the 28<sup>th</sup>.

HON SPEAKER: Alright, Honourable Schlettwein.

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Thank you Honourable Speaker. I was intending to do the same to postpone to Thursday.

HON SPEAKER: And I think I saw a hand there.

HON MINISTER OF LABOUR, INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS AND EMPLOYMENT CREEATION: It is the same.

15

<u>26 March 2019</u>

# APPOINTMENT OF MEMBER TO THE EMPLOYMENT EQUITY COMMISSION HON NGHIMTINA

**HON SPEAKER**: So the discussion will then be taken up on Thursday so decided. It is the 28<sup>th</sup>. Thank you very much, so decided. Thank you. The second notice of a Motion is the one of the Honourable Minister of Labour, Industrial Relations and Employment Creation. Does the Honourable Minister move the Motion?

# HON MINISTER OF LABOUR, INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS AND EMPLOYMENT CREATION: I move so Honourable Speaker.

**HON SPEAKER**: Who seconds the Motion, any objection, none, agreed to. The Honourable you have the floor.

# APPOINTMENT OF MEMBER TO THE EMPLOYMENT EQUITY COMMISSION

**HON MINISTER OF LABOUR, INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS AND** <u>EMPLOYMENT CREATION</u>: Thank you Honourable Speaker. Honourable Speaker the National Assembly, Honourable Members of the Parliament I rise to table a Motion on the approval of the appointment of the Employment Equity Commissioner. Section 6(1) of the Affirmative Action Employment Act, Act 29 of 1998 provides that the Commissions are comprised the following members appointed by the Minister with the approval of the National Assembly the Commissioner who shall be the Chairperson.

The term of office of the current Employment Equity Commissioner Mr Wilbard Usiku somes to an end on the 31<sup>st</sup> March 2019 and has reached

# APPOINTMENT OF MEMBER TO THE EMPLOYMENT EQUITY COMMISSION HON NGHIMTINA

the age of retirement.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members as we are well aware the Employment Equity Commission has statutory body established in terms of section 3 of the Affirmative Action Employment Act, Act 29 of 1998. The mandate of the Commission is to oversee function of Affirmative Action in employment that seeks to ensure work place transformation. Employers are required by the Act to eliminate employment barriers against persons in designated groups

The ultimate objective of the Affirmative Act law is to ensure that no person shall be denied any employment opportunity for reasons unrelated to ability. It is my considered opinion that retiring Employment Equity Commissioner Wilbard Usiku is provided in the professional and effective stewardship both as fellow Commission members and is staff since the inception of the Commission in 1999. It is therefore my wish that his successor is a person who possess a similar leadership qualities and he is suitably qualified in order to be able to take our national program of affirmation action to the next level.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members in light of the importance of our national programs of Affirmative Action and the strong and capacity leadership that is required, I have therefore the honor to nominate Otiniel Kondwick for your approval as the Employment Equity Commissioner for a five year term effective from this April 2019 to 31<sup>st</sup> March 2024.

This appointment is in terms of the section that I sighted in my earlier remarks. I am confident Mr Kondwick will serve as a Deputy Director in the office of Employment Equity Commission for four years from 2004 to 2008 and distinguished himself as diligent, committed and has proportion of disqualifications as his experience and knowledge in the field of employment equity law and other labour laws makes him more suitable for this position. His CV was circulated last week in the Parliament.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Member with these few words, I submit

# APPOINTMENT OF MEMBER TO THE EMPLOYMENT EQUITY COMMISSION HON VENAANI

the nomination of Mr Kockwick for your favourable consideration and approval as Employment Equity Commissioner and I count on your kind support. I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you, Honourable Venaani.

**HON VENAANI**: Honourable Speaker before I rise to raise a few issues because it is general debate on Affirmative Action, one, the intent and purpose of the reason the three of Affirmative Action is to try to redress wrong of the past but you want to do that in a very systematic way that you also do not discriminate against those that are holding those positions through meritocracy or your merit or through owing but when you look at this Commission's work. I doubt whether it has shown any success rates in them equating their task.

I ask this question every day in my mind. There are company's close corporation that exist in our country today where you see from the beginning since the inception up to today no tangible affirmative action has taken place in those companies.

Now I am not speaking about companies owned by an owner or a family business. I am talking about Close Corporation in this country. For example many of us farmers are contributors to buying and financing Agra as a company. Every end of the month when you go to Agra very few of us buy less than N\$10 000 as we are going to the farm. Every time that you just reverse your bakkie is over N\$10 000, N\$15 000 as farmers are struggling to keep this economy alive but if you look at pardon me Speaker.

I have not seen the leadership of Agra changing. For example a big Close Corporation that is financed by Namibians the MD structures of Agra are

# APPOINTMENT OF MEMBER TO THE EMPLOYMENT EQUITY COMMISSION HON VENAANI

the same people. If you look them Managerial level throughout the whole country from Otavi, Grootfontein, everywhere are the same people. No, you can also ask me in front of me. I do not want to make these things as a matter of racism. I am talking about what do we mean. What is the purpose and intent of affirming? I am not saying because affirming bring a cousin of my brother Shixwameni who is not capable of running Agra to become a Manager. That is not what I am prorogating.

I am not talking about less merit to get jobs because of a black face. That is no my understanding of affirmative action but I get worried when I see an institution such as Agra to remain white as it is today. I also get worried when I see some of the banks meeting artificial positioning of two or three people but the rest of the bank remains one colour. So changing Directors or leaders at the helm of this institution is good and well but what is it that we are doing to make sure that these bodies are doing their work effectively?

I do not want to punish a service owner who happens to be white or a farmer or a family business of the Vantoners that they must change their company to include a black MD because it is a family business but I get worried when I see big Close Corporation that are funded by the nationals of this country to remain in one colour and then one wants to ask a question if those companies are not meeting the obligations of the Equity Commission are we really moving ahead?

I can name a plethora of companies. I have them by head even private companies. The other day I saw a company called Trustco and I look at their managing positions. Probably one non-Namibia was non-white in the whole structurer of such a big company. Then you want, point of order, those who want a point of order yes, please?

HON SPEAKER: I miss that, yes, on a point of order.

# APPOINTMENT OF MEMBER TO THE EMPLOYMENT EQUITY COMMISSION HON VENAANI

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Honourable Speaker I beg the indulgence of the leader of the opposition Honourable Venaani just want to recall that every year the Affirmative Action Commissioner submits a report where these questions, the very relevant questions that you are raising are deliberated on whether Affirmative Action is happening. Whether any of the Act of affirming is being meaningful and so on. Now I am just in your hands whether that would not be the better occasion to discuss these questions rather than when we nominate a member of the Affirmation Action. We are not having any bad intention.

**HON SPEAKER**: Absolutely, I was also begin to wonder because that would be the appropriate forum, yes, Honourable Venaani.

**HON VENAANI**: No, no, you see the problem is this generally when reports are tabled here, they are tabled for note taking. We are receiving plethora reports that we never discussed here. Now this matter was raised to appoint a new Commissioner but it is general debate. The issue is not about the Commissioner. That is the intent of the debate but we must first discuss the generality of the debate to arrive at appointing at somebody new. We must question. Now we are questioning the body, the usefulness of the body or the effectiveness not the usefulness, it is the effectiveness that is the correct one, the effectiveness of the body and I was about to conclude.

So I am trying to say that yes, we have send people to become Commissioners. We have appointed people. We have given them money but these big Corporations are not changing, have not changed so far. How effective is the body? I do not want to discuss the colleague Otiniel Pottlevitz my other colleague will discuss it but all I am saying is that I have some questions in relation to the work of the Equity Commission.

# APPOINTMENT OF MEMBER TO THE EMPLOYMENT EQUITY COMMISSION HON MUHARUKUA

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you. Next is Honourable Muharukua. Do we want to stick to the tea break? Yes, you got me now. Forgive me Honourable Muharukua.

HON MUHARUKUA: Yes, thank you Honourable Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: Can we do it after tea break?

HON MUHARUKUA: Yes.

**HON SPEAKER**: Because having actually introduced a subject, we are reviving the whole system. Let us stick to that, thank you. Tea break back at 3 o'clock sharp. Thank you.

# **HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 15:10**

# **HOUSE RESUMES AT 16:12**

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you back. We were at the point where we were just about to listen to the Honourable Muharukua. Honourable Member you may, Honourable Deputy Minister of Finance Honourable Ithete you are down on my list.

# APPOINTMENT OF MEMBER TO THE EMPLOYMENT EQUITY COMMISSION HON ITHETE

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Yes, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members I want to contribute in actual fact to contribute through answering some of the questions that were raised by Honourable Venaani regarding the Employment Equity Commission. Yes, the Commission is there and the Commission is trying to do its best or in fact is doing the best but what is hampering the Commission to look as if they are not effective is the current law. Perhaps we can propose that the law should be amended. When one visit a company that has Irish copy that looks more white and more blacks at the bottom, when one visit such a company and you fine them in order to correct the situation that fine it is a very, very low amount. It is an amount of N\$2 000.

**HON SPEAKER**: Is that a point of order. You want to raise a question, yes.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Comrade Speaker could I just ask Honourable Ithete small question? My question is could you possibly consider that an institution such as the Employment Equity Commission have the obligation to submit any potential amendment in the Act if they feel that that particular clause in the Act is the one that is hampering for them to fulfil the mandate. They do not have that obligation.

**HON SPEAKER**: You are saying that if a particular member has a question that they should prepare to raise those issues directly with the line Ministry. Is that it?

# APPOINTMENT OF MEMBER TO THE EMPLOYMENT EQUITY COMMISSION HON ITHETE

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: What I am trying to say Comrade Speaker is that my question is the Employment Equity Commission have Commissioners who are mandated to ensure for the fulfillment of that mandate of that institution and the mandate is stipulated in the Act. Now my question then is if they then realized that the content or the provisions within that particular Act is the one that is preventing them to fulfil the wishes of the nation in which it was established for, is it their obligation a Commissioner to advice the line Minister to submit amendment? Is it not their obligation? If that so, what have they done to ensure or to advice the relevant Minister to submit such amendment? That is my question.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you very much.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Thank you once again Honourable Speaker. Honourable Member, Honourable Nekundi to answer your question is that yes, that obligation lies with all of us as Members of Parliament, as Commissioners, as citizens of this country to come up with proposals of laws that are not in favourable within our situation as a nation and as Government actually we thought that the citizen of this country especially the white community with those soft laws they will also they should not only be driven by law. The law does not have to be too strict for them to act. If the law is soft, why are you capitalizing on the soft law simply because for you to keep on Irish copying your company and the law if you are find guilty of such an act, you are only punished by paying N\$2 000.

Why are you capitalizing on that and those people are not patriotic Namibians. For them to be patriotic Namibians, then whether there is a punishment or not out of their own conscience, they should at least (interrupted).

# APPOINTMENT OF MEMBER TO THE EMPLOYMENT EQUITY COMMISSION HON ITHETE

HON SPEAKER: On a point of order.

**HON SHIXWAMENI**: Thank you Honourable Speaker. Just on the point of procedure we are actually opening second debate on a non-issue that does not have a second debate. I thought we are approving the appointment of the person to the Commission and it would have just been good. I think the Speaker made an error by allowing the leader of the official opposition to actually make second reading tied up debate statement. I think we should confine ourselves to the approval of the nominated person and if we have issues with the Commission and the Act, let us bring it up as a Motion so that we can be able to grant anybody an opportunity to debate the pros and cons of the Equity Commission but also to make recommendations that would be valid in terms of amending the Equity Commission Act. That is my point of correction.

**HON SPEAKER**: I cannot thank you enough honestly speaking because the Honourable you seem to be dwelling on the overall Commission's work and mandate. That is not what is on the agenda. What is on the agenda is a nominee whom we have to approve or disapprove. Honourable Member please continue.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Thank you Honourable Speaker. Having listened to the advice of the senior Member of this House and equally your last conclusion, I support the nomination of the colleague and I rest my case.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Honourable Nambahu, no, no,

### APPOINTMENT OF MEMBER TO THE EMPLOYMENT EQUITY COMMISSION HON MAKGONE / HON SHIXWAMENI

Deputy Minister of Fisheries.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FISHERIES AND MARINE RESOURCES: Thank you Honourable Speaker. Honourable Speaker I rise to support.

HON SPEAKER: Wait for the microphone.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FISHERIES AND MARINE RESOURCES: Thank you. I rise to support the appointment of Otiniel Pottervitz to the Commission. The CV in front of us speaks volume, the experience everything. I support.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. In the absence of any further, yes, Honourable Shixwameni.

**HON SHIXWAMENI**: I rise also to support the nomination and at the same time to wish Wilbard Usiku as he is facing retirement a good riddance in his retirement and hope that he will do more things than he has done to the Commission but I support the secondment.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. There you have it. In the absence of further contribution, does the Honourable Minister of Labour, Industrial Relations and Employment Creation wishes to reply?

# APPOINTMENT OF MEMBER TO THE EMPLOYMENT EQUITY COMMISSION HON NGHIMTINA

**HON MINISTER OF LABOUR, INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS AND EMPLOYMENT CREATION:** Thank you Honourable Speaker. I have to thank the Honourable Members in support the nomination but I have got a point which is very clear for me is from Honourable Shixwameni that we may have a discussion in this House of ours which is very good for us also.

It is an advice even Honourable Venaani had gone a little bit far but it was very good for us to know which company big Corporations who are not complying with the Affirmative Action but that one I think we have to arrange it so that we can have it in Parliament, we discuss, we talk and then we get some order from there which we can give to our Commissioners and I thank you very much for that.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you. I now put the question that the Motion be agreed to. Are there any objections, then it is agreed to, so decided.

The third notice of the Motion is the one of Honourable Minister of Finance. Does the Honourable Minister move that the Bill be now introduced?

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: I do move Honourable Speaker.

**HON SPEAKER**: Who seconds the Motion, is there any objection, then it is agreed to. Will the Honourable Minister please table the Bill? The Secretary will now read the Bill a first time.

# BANK OF NAMIBIA BILL HON SCHLETTWEIN

**HON SPEAKER**: Does the Honourable Minister of Finance move that the Bill be now read a second time?

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: I do move so Honourable Speaker.

**<u>HON SPEAKER</u>**: Any objection, who seconds, agreed to. The Honourable Minister you have the floor.

#### BANK OF NAMIBIA BILL [B. 1 – 2019]

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Thank you Honourable Speaker for the floor. Honourable Members I have the honour to table the Bank of Namibia Bill of 2019. The existing Bank of Namibia Act that is Act of 1997 was reviewed in its entirety and with a view of adapting it to the SADC model central law or the Model Act, modernized it in line with some of the best international banking system lining it with the Constitutional Amendment Act 8 of 2014 and strengthening the financial stability supervision and provisions. Inspite of the amendment made on the Bank of Namibia Act in 2004 internationally, regionally and domestic developments in the Central Bank landscape necessitated the bank to perform an extensive review of the Bank of Namibia Act that is Act number 15 of 1997 as amended.

The Bank of Namibia Bill was drafted to be in line with the Southern African development community that is SADC model central bank law which embodies and promotes key principles which ensures the operational independence of the bank with the financial policy determination vested in the Minister of Finance, create clear standards of

## BANK OF NAMIBIA BILL HON SCHLETTWEIN

accountability and transparency and harmonization of the legal and operational frameworks of the Central Bank. These key principles are also essential for the achievement of harmonized legislation with in the SADC region. The SADC model central bank law however will modify wherever necessary to meet this specific needs of Namibia.

Honourable Speaker the Model Act was the basis of the Bill and most of the provisions included therein as far as this was constitutionally agreed possible and I as far as the new provisions are relevant to the Namibian Central Bank Law were adopted. In addition new development took place after the model law was drafted that also had to be considered including issues pertaining to financial stability. Honourable Speaker let me now go to the highlights of the main provisions of the Bill.

The main provisions in the Bill Chapter 1 deals with key principles in the development of the Central Bank legislation. These principles include operational independence, transparency and accountability provisions aimed at improving efficiency. The Chapter also outlined the basic tenancy of good corporate governance in a modern central bank and international best practices. Independence of the Central Bank a new section that strengthen the independence of the Central Bank was introduced in line with the SADC model law which states that the bank involve members and staff shall execute their function without the independence from any person for the institution. I think it means without the interfered of any person.

Capital and ownership of the bank, the Bill also made provision for the increase in authorized share capital of the bank from N\$100 Million to N\$500 Million. This increase lies with the time value of money as well as with the growth and responsibilities of the bank as the existing of the bank was too low. Monetary policy Committee, under the existing Act this Bill provides a clearly framework for the monetary policy Committee, its composition, application of its decisions and clear mandate to formulate its own rules of procedures to be followed at the meetings.

Institutional arrangements, with regard to the institutional arrangement of

#### BANK OF NAMIBIA BILL HON SCHLETTWEIN .

the Central Bank, the Bill makes provision for the banks Boards and the Boards functions and powers. The appointment of the Bank Governor and the Deputy Governors, the appointment, qualification, disqualification and terms of the Board including the Governor and the Deputy Governors and the establishment and operations of all Committees. The provisions of this Chapter seeks to ensure the clarity of roles and responsibilities of the various key central bank players.

Also in terms of the Board composition unlike in the current Act, the Bill introduced flexibility and is less prescriptive on additional Board members besides the Deputy Governors and the Permanent Secretary or Executive Director in the Ministry of Finance and is stated in section 10(4) which states not less than five and not more than six non-Executive Board members.

Financial stability, this part on financial stability empowers the bank to deal effectively with risks and vulnerabilities which in the opinion of the bank are likely to disrupt the financial intermediation process including the only function of the money market and foreign exchange markets or affects or likely to affect public confidence in the financial system. Moreover it also facilitate exchanges of information on financial institutions, their holding companies and subsidiaries between the Bank of Namibia and other financial institutions supervisory authorities within Namibia and beyond for the purpose of contributing to financial stability.

Central Bank lending to Government, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members excessive lending by Central Bank to Government is a discouraged practice. This was due to high and hyperinflation experienced in Latin America and Sub Saharan Africa in the 70s or 80s because of the practice.

Nowadays the number of Central Banks do not led to Governments. However those that continue to lend limits are severely cut. The current Act of the Bank of Namibia however makes a provision for unnecessarily higher lending limits which have not been utilized. These limits were for normal lending kept and not exceeding 25% of the Government average

## BANK OF NAMIBIA BILL HON SCHLETTWEIN

annual ordinary revenue for the three year Financial Years immediately preceding while in exceptional circumstances it was not acceding to the 5%.

It is therefore against this background that this Bill is proposing a reduction in Government lending to bring it in line with best practices as well as with more or less the current deterioration of the overdraft facility by Government from time to time.

The Bill proposes to reducing lending to Government not to exceeding 5% of the Government average annual ordinary revenue for the three years mere to preceding while in the exceptional circumstances, the bank can be allowed to led up to an amount not exceeding 10% of the average annual ordinary revenue for short periods. The provision in the Bill is well in line with best international standards and with best practice.

Adequate for the national reserves, the Bank need to maintain and hold sufficient levels of reserves. It is important to note that international reserves serve as a caution from the national economy against external shocks such as submersed import prices, subsistence expenses.

Given the importance of the following reserves for a country, this new Bill unlike the existing Act makes provision for the bank and the Minister of Finance to agree on measures to grow and build reserves to an adequate level. The cost of those reserves following measures agreed by the bank and with the Ministry of Finance would be covered by the Government.

Paying clearing and supplement system, a Chapter on payments, clearing and supplements system were introduced with the provision to explicitly empower the bank to oversee, regulate, operate and supervise payments, clearing and supplement systems and are comprehensive, efficient, modern, sound and safe in Namibia.

Urgent for the administration of exchange control again unlike in the current Act the Bill makes a provision that a bank with approval of the Minister may delegate or assign any of its powers and functions under the

#### BANK OF NAMIBIA BILL HON SMIT

regulation mentioned under the subsection in the Bill to an authorized dealer and foreign exchange appointed for that purpose of the regulation.

This change will facilitate and bring about efficiency and effectiveness on the implementation of exchange control. General provisions and assistance, in this part amongst others the Bill broadens the counterfeiting of currency to effectively deal with offenders related to counterfeiting of foreign currencies produced or found in Namibia which is not the case in the current Act.

In conclusion Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members when passed the Bank of Namibia Bill will strengthen the bank in its mandate to promote sound financial systems in Namibia. Development key stakeholders including the International Monetary Fund has been consulted during the formulation process of the Bill and all the inputs have been considered in this final Bill. With these final remarks to realize the expressed policy intentions underpinning this legislation that I table the Bank of Namibia Bill in the National Assembly and beg for your favourable consideration and approval. I thank you.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you. Any further discussions, yes, Honourable Nico Smit.

**HON SMIT**: Thank you Honourable Speaker. I would like to postpone this Bill to the  $10^{th}$  of April.

**HON SPEAKER**: 10<sup>th</sup> of April, can I hear from the Minister of Finance whether that postponement might create some problems.

# BANK OF NAMIBIA BILL HON SCHLETTWEIN / HON SMIT

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Honourable Speaker if I have my dates correct, the 10<sup>th</sup> of April will be in the middle of the either the general or the Committee Stage of the budget so it will be pretty senseless to postpone it until then because we will not be able to discuss it then. Next week is probably a better time to.

**HON SPEAKER**: Can we for next week?

HON SMIT: We will receive the budget tomorrow.

HON SPEAKER: Yes.

**HON SMIT**: I plan to postpone the budget for next Thursday. So there would be no time for me to go through this Bill because I have to study the budget. I have to prepare my speech on the budget so I was just (incomplete).

HON SPEAKER: So are you proposing next Thursday.

**HON SMIT**: The 10<sup>th</sup> of April.

# BANK OF NAMIBIA BILL HON SCHLETTWEIN

**HON SPEAKER**: The Minister have got the difficulty with the 10<sup>th</sup>. Can you meet each other halfway? I do not have a calendar here Tuesday next week, other week. So what about at the end of next week? The Minister will find a solution.

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Honourable Speaker I agree with Honourable Smit that after the tabling of the budget normally this House postpones the Appropriation Bill with a week. Therefore that week will still be available to discuss this Act?

HON SPEAKER: This is what I am thinking.

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: And I do believe that if others want to take the floor would be (incomplete).

**HON SPEAKER**: Can you put the date to it? Can you suggest a specific date?

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: I believe that if there is any postponement of this it should be up to Thursday this week and then we can see how we progress with the discussions and others coming later.

### BANK OF NAMIBIA BILL HON HINDA

**HON SPEAKER**: Can we try Thursday and if there are other people who wish to contribute, we take them and then we see how it goes, Honourable Nico Smit?

**HON SMIT**: Honourable Speaker I do not have a proble if other people come in. I do not but at the end of the day I will postpone until I have time to study it properly.

**HON SPEAKER**: Alright, anyway we will discuss next Thursday. We postpone until next Thursday and then we see how it goes, yes, Honourable Hinda.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS: Until Thursday.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thursday, thank you, so decided, Thursday a day after tomorrow and then we see how it goes, so decided. Thank you. Tomorrow is Wednesday a day after tomorrow.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS**: We can postpone it to Tuesday.

HON SPEAKER: Yes.

# BANK OF NAMIBIA BILL HON SHANGHALA

**HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE**: I would like to postpone it to Thursday the day after tomorrow.

HON SPEAKER: Alright, fine.

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Thank you.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. We will continute the discussion anyway.

The Secretary will read the first order of the day.

# COMMITTEE STAGE – ARMS AND AMMUNITION AMENDMENT BILL [B.12 – 2018]

**SECRETARY:** Committee Stage – Arms and Ammunition Amendment Bill [B.12 – 2018].

**HON SPEAKER**: Does the Deputy Minister of Safety and Security move that the Assembly goes into Committee?

# 26 March 2019 RECONSIDERATION PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON JOOSTE

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY**: Honourable Speaker I seek the indulgence of the House to defer a discussion on this Bill until further notice.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you, so decided. We move on. The Secretary will read the second order of the day.

### **RESUMPTION OF RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL [B.15 – 2018]**

**<u>SECRETARY</u>**: Resumption of Reconsideration – *Public Enterprises Governance Bill* [B.15 – 2018].

**HON SPEAKER**: Does the Honourable Minister of Public Enterprises move that the Assembly now goes to reconsider the Bill?

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Comrade Speaker you may recall during the debate last week there was a slight diference in opinion on certain terminology and we agreed at the time to postepone to consult on those. Well, the consultation was held yesterday afternoon only with the applicable members present and we needed to get a time to the legal drafter to draft those amendments and the Attorney General to certify so with that, I wish to postpone until Thursday.

#### PLIGHT OF FOREIGN-TRAINED MEDICAL DOCTORS WHO HAVE GRADUATED FROM CERTAIN UNIVERSITIES HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much until Thursday, so decided. Let us move on.

The Secretary will read the third order of the day.

## RESUMPTION OF DEBATE ON THE PLIGHT OF FOREIGN-TRAINED MEDICAL DOCTORS WHO HAVE GRADUATED FROM CERTAIN UNIVERSITIES

**<u>SECRETARY</u>**: Resumption of Debate on the plight of foreign-trained medical doctors who have graduated from certain universities.

**HON SPEAKER**: When this Assembly adjourn on Wednesday the 13<sup>th</sup> March 2019, the question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Venaani that then Motion be adopted. The Honourable Minister of Higher Education, Training and Innovation adjourned the debate and I now had the pleasure to give her the floor.

**HON MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, TRAINING AND INNOVATION:** Thank you Honourable Speaker. Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members I rise to make a contribution to this long drawn motivation on foreign trained doctors by the Honourable Venaani. In this motivaton the mover appeared to imply that:

1. There is no effective system to properly handle the foreign trained doctors matter

## PLIGHT OF FOREIGN-TRAINED MEDICAL DOCTORS WHO HAVE GRADUATED FROM CERTAIN UNIVERSITIES HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

- 2. In his remarks he seemed to also wonder why and how Namibia could ever have problems with graduates from South African Universities.
- 3. Again in his motivation he questioned why NASFAF paid for some of these students.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members Namibia has invested in reputable quality local public Universities to train and develop human capital. Furthermore, other important institutions exist in the country to examine the authenticity and quality of foreign qualifications. Also there are professional bodies that ascertain the relevance, the depth and the competency of graduates and practiconers in specialized fields. A nation sovereignty is deinfed by a ultiplicity of factors independence being one, the constitution, a Government with effecteive functional sector systems one of which I believe is the country's education system among many.

Honourable Venaani Namibia's education system has evolved and we have seen many transformations as well as beign benchmarked on many of the world best education system. Namibia's education system is different and has distinct features that are aimed at fulfilling Namibia's goals, interest expectations and address the country's challenges. Our education system incapsulates the needs and aspirations of the local industry, the local economy and those of the Namibian people. We have established standards, structures systems and institution to uphold quality assurance, integrity and comparability of this system.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members success will not lower its standards to accommodate Namibia. We have to raise our standards to achieve it. To have the best Doctors, we must do what it takes to have them. Shortcuts through formal education, playing victim upon graudation and defending the indefensible Honourable Venaani will only dilute the quality of professional service delivered to the general public and indeed compromise Namibia's competitiveness. The youths are the future of our country. Their empowerment through quality education and

# PLIGHT OF FOREIGN-TRAINED MEDICAL DOCTORS WHO HAVE GRADUATED FROM CERTAIN UNIVERSITIES HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

training is an imperative. The Government efforts, the public's efforts, the students and graduates efforts and indeed the efforts of yours as well as mine Honourable Venanai should be aimed at bringing out the best in our youths and students and set them apart as truly competent professionals in their respective fields of specialization.

We should expose them to the best institutions and guide them towards achieveing the best qualifications in order for them to deliver quality service to Namibia and to the world. Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members when UNAM introduced the VAC Engieering program as Jose Eduwardo Dos Santos Campus in Ongwediva some years back, the theoretical content was easy to impact but the laboratory work could not be done in Namibia due to some challenges then.

That actually led to the establishment of a program between UNAM, Kwazulu Natal and these Universities to accommodate our engineering students for the laboratory work. Immediatley in addition those VAC engineering students still had to come back home for their practical attachment work. Again, when the first cohot of our medical students at the Hage Geingob Campus here in Windhoek the then new medical program was found to have major deficiency by the very healty professonals Council of Namibia.

As a result one full academic year was recommended to be added and today the medical program at UNAM is six years. All these were effected as a result of relevant professionals and stakeholders consultation and actual assessment of the programs through put and output. It is therefore critical that would-be professionals in whatever field should know and follow the rules, procedures and indeed the laws that govern such a profession in Namibia.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members if we could go to that extent to ensure compliance by Namibia's Universities academic programs, why should we relent or lower standards when it comes to foreign acquired

# PLIGHT OF FOREIGN-TRAINED MEDICAL DOCTORS WHO HAVE GRADUATED FROM CERTAIN UNIVERSITIES HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

qualifications? The establishment of foreign qalifications, vetting and assessment structures, national accreditation institutios, specialized professional bodied evaluation, academic programs, in-build monitoring and evaluation for professional compliance all these are not only active in Namibia but also they are seen to be active in other parts of the world and they exist primarily to protect and safeguard students in terms of the quality of education they receive.

They also exist to safeguard and protect the public regarding the delivery of quality of service and also to embede public safety and security measures. They also exist to prevent destructions in the national qualification framework when it comes to progression in local programs and finally they exist to protect and safeguard employers against half-date graduates and fake qualifications.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members in many of the specialized fields the attainment of a qualification does not imply competency or give one a license to practice professionally. In specialized fields, graduation nearly ushers one into a robust internship program where monitoring and evaluation to verify the existence of demonstrable requisite professional and practicel knowledge, skills and competencies is done Our youths and students who are interested in pursuing studies in many of the specalised fields should educate themselves well about the requirements of such professions and be prepared to fulfill them to the latter.

Wherever you are studying familiarize yourself with the different steps here at home that lead to your professional recognition and licensing within your chose field of study before graduation. The NQA Act number 29 of 1996 was established among other things to develop and administer Namibia's national qualifications framework. The services of this institution are at the public's disposal particularly prospective students. As part of their information dissemination right, NQA annual distribute a booklet of locally registered and accredited Universities and Colleges and over the years through assessment of foreign qualification, NQA has

#### PLIGHT OF FOREIGN-TRAINED MEDICAL DOCTORS WHO HAVE GRADUATED FROM CERTAIN UNIVERSITIES HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

developed a database of internationally recognized Universities. In addition, NQA has also developed a database of internationally accrediting bodies to which it refers queries related to higher education and training institutions that are not in their existing database. Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members the assessment done by NQA centres around verification of authenticity and comparability and compatability to our national qualification framework to determine and assess knowledge, skills, competences required for quality service delivery in a specific specialized profession.

NQA works closely in collaboration with the professional bodies. The different professional bodies such as the Health Profession Councils of Namibia, the Namibia Engineering Council and others are responsible for the indepth evaluation and assessment of foreign qualifications to determine compliance as well as the curriculum content is concerned. The leading question in these bodies in terms of the evaluation is do the skills, competences and knowledge gained meet the said professional standards to at least start with internship and or finally or want to be licensed that render professional service to the general public in a given specialized field.

The safety, security of the public in the provision of specialized professional services is of paramount importance. Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members the Government of the Republic of Namibia has made good and comendable strives towards improving higher education and training.

Our higher education system is comparable to any in the world. Graduates from our public Universities readily access post-graduate programs anywhere in the world without problems. We therefore expect and urge Namibians who choose to study abroad to go to recognized institutions with accredited programs by internationally recognized accrediting bodies in those countries.

# PLIGHT OF FOREIGN-TRAINED MEDICAL DOCTORS WHO HAVE GRADUATED FROM CERTAIN UNIVERSITIES HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members with regard to Honourable Venaani's concern as to whether NQA assess the qualification of this group of foreign trained medical Doctors. I wish to confirm that many have submitted their qualifications to NQA and have been evaluated for the following, authenticity, the status of the awarding institution, comparability and the value of qualification in line with our national qualification framework. I must say that in some areas the foreign qualification met the standards. However in some graduates, they are real identified serious shortcomings which have manifested through the pre-evaluations, others through the internship program arranged through UNAM.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members let me assure our youths also the affected graduates and the public out there that the Government is seized with this matter. As a matter of fact the Ministry of Higher Education, Training and Innovation, the Ministry of Health as well as the professional body which is the Health Professional Councils of Namibia, UNAM and NQA have been working round the clock to ensure that whatever knowledge gaps, skills or competencies that exist they are addressed through a well-monitored and run program.

A remedial program at UNAM and an internship program overseen by the professional body in the Ministry of Health are actually in place. However the onus lies on the affected graduates to commit whatever program they are assigned to improve and learn whatever is found to be lacking from their earlier training.

The youth are the pride of our nation. Their professional integrity must be guaranteed through quality education and training at all times. Education is for service. Therefore where deficiencies are evident, such as in some of these cases relevant and competent stakeholders should do their level best to immediately identify and redress them as it is currently being done by the relevant Ministries and relevant Agencies.

## PLIGHT OF FOREIGN-TRAINED MEDICAL DOCTORS WHO HAVE GRADUATED FROM CERTAIN UNIVERSITIES HON DR IYAMBO

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members in conclusion the foreign trained doctors qualification issue is currently receiving Government attention through relevant Ministries and Agencies as I said. The preevaluatio remedial work as well as the internship are inevitable and real imperative that we can only sidestep at the peril of all of us and the public. I so submit.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. Honourable Members I now have a particular pleasure in inviting and calling upon the Honourable Doctor Iyambo to make his maiden speech. Honourable Member you have the floor.

**HON IYAMBO**: Thank you Honourable Speaker. Before I give my maiden speech, I was made to understand that a maiden speech is to be based on a particular Motion or something but in any case, it has relevancy to what was said now that ther are many other issues so if I maybe allowed to go on. Honourable Speaker, fellow Parliamentarians, Comrades, my fellow countrymen and women I thnk you for granting me an opportunity to put forward the views and policies of SWANU of Namibia. SWANU of Namibia is the oldest political party in Namibia and we have the long history of struggle and resistance on the side of th oppressed and down broaden.

My name is Tangeni Iyambo. I am honoured to serve my country as a Parliamentarian. I give my maiden speech as a Parliamentarian at a time when our country is in crisis. The majority of our people are experiencing hardships and uncertainty. We can no longer ignore the anxieties fellow Namibians have about the future. We want to discuss it and SWANU of Namibia will offer well-considered solutions to get out of our crisis. Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members our crisis economic, social

# PLIGHT OF FOREIGN-TRAINED MEDICAL DOCTORS WHO HAVE GRADUATED FROM CERTAIN UNIVERSITIES HON DR IYAMBO

and political, the rising levels of unemployment prevents many good men and women and especially our youths from putting food on the table. Our education system has resulted in high failure rates particularly at Grade 10 and 12 levels.

Tertianry level funding through NAFAF has virtually collapsed and we are returning to a time where higher education was a privilege of the elits. SWANU of Namibia stands for social justice and we want quality, free and compulsory education.

HON SPEAKER: This is the time. You are free from being interrupted.

**HON IYAMBO**: I am protected. I appreciate your protection. We need to give our youths a future. They are the hope of the nation. The unemployment and the lack of educational opportunities is a loss to the whole nation. Through changing budgetary allocations and eliminating wastage, we believe we can turn this situation around. Our land reform process is far too slow and has not sufficiently address past injustices hence the dissatisfaction expressed at the second land conference. We are still selling large tracks of land and other natural resources cheaply to foreigners instead of empowering our own people.

The willing seller willing buyer policy has distorted and landmark and resulted in a rapid escalation in land prices placing it beyond the reach of the vast majority of Namibians. Those few who have been resettled lack resettlement support. In our communal areas large tracks of land are being illegally fenced off and effectively privatized by reviewing elit who already have high incomes. This is illegal and unjust. However law enforcement agencies and our courst have left them to do so with impunitive.

# PLIGHT OF FOREIGN-TRAINED MEDICAL DOCTORS WHO HAVE GRADUATED FROM CERTAIN UNIVERSITIES HON DR IYAMBO

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members we also have a crisis in our public health system. Our citizens who voted for us and who have put their trust in us to use our reosurces to their benefit have been led down. They face long queues, overwork staff, broken equipment and shortage of drugs at health care facilities. SWANU of Namibia says as long as we are in Parliament, we will hold the Executive to account for this neglect. Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members the youths have drawn our attention to the housing crisis in our country and we commend them for being so courageous.

SWANU of Namibia has listened. It is unacceptable that over 40% of Namibians are living in shacks. At the same time the media report that some houses build with taxpayer's money under the mass housing project remains unoccupied. We heard complains of poor workmship on these houses and high land servicing cost. Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members housing is a basic need. We can no longer leave it to tender enterprenuers and allow the looting of state resources to continue in the name of black economic empowerment.

We can do better. The economic crisis is directly linked to a social crisis of violence partiacularly violence against women and children, mugging and senseless killings. It is the duty of the state to provide citizens with protection and security. Our police service has not been able to provide its satisfactorily due to a lack of resources. Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members as an opposition party, our job is not simply to criticize but also to find solutions to the nation most pressing problems that I have just outlined. We will support Government in its effort to deal with the triple challenges of overcoming inequality, unemployment and poverty through redistributive measures.

We cannot continue to be seen as a country that cares only about elites. SWANU of Namibia therefore proposes the following policy directions in support of just, inclusive and sustainable development for the country.

# PLIGHT OF FOREIGN-TRAINED MEDICAL DOCTORS WHO HAVE GRADUATED FROM CERTAIN UNIVERSITIES HON DR IYAMBO

I start with unemployment. Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members since our independence we have not been able to change the structure of our economy. We are still locked in a system of global capitalism that exploits our raw materials without significant value addition. Since independence our primary development strategy was to attract foreign direct investment. This investment however perpetuated the extraction without adding value. We just extract and it goes. We did not store. We do not add value. We do not produce. It has goen primarily to mining and finance.

We have neglected our agricultural sector and manufacturing. It is her where a greatest number of jobs can be created. SWANU of Namibia therefore would like to see that domestic resources are mobilized towards agriculture, agri-industry and manufacturing. In SWANU we are very capable most of us. So it is not Maamberua only. We must increase our trade with our fellow Africans particularly the SADC region. We want to create a sovereigh wealth fund so that we can direct our own resources towards our own development to break the reliance of foreign capital and on education maybe appropriately with the Bill that is supposed to go on and I hope I am not trading on toes but trying to be realistic about this fragile nation.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members the 2018 first demographic dividend report that was published by National Planning Commission and United Nations Population Fund calls for a total overall of our education system if we are to reap the benefits of demographic dividends of the youths vouch. Our education system must respond to our development objectives. Our expenditure on education in 2018 was 28.5% of the total national budget. We have to tackle the quality and relevance of that education. This will start with specialized teacher training.

We need in-service training. We also need capable and competent leadership to ensure quality teaching and learning. We want to see an introduction of community service by tertiary students who benefit from

# PLIGHT OF FOREIGN-TRAINED MEDICAL DOCTORS WHO HAVE GRADUATED FROM CERTAIN UNIVERSITIES HON DR IYAMBO

the state fund so that they can provide homework, supervision and extramural activities that enhance the social and intellectual development of our learners. Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members no child can learn on a hungry stomach. SWANU of Namibia will therefore propose the expansion of the school feeding scheme. I think we have learned from the rest of the world that for the past more than twenty years Finland has had the best education system in the world and it is because they have an effective feeding system because people cannot function on empty stomachs.

SWANU of Namibia will therefore propose the expansion of the school feeding scheme. This scheme should also serve local employment and economic opportunity for local farmers and small-scale businesses. We feel morally compelled to ensure that the school feeding scheme does not become an opportunity for looting state resources. On land and h housing Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members SWANU of Namibia came into existence to fight for our land and we will not give up that fight. We want to see an end to the willing seller, willing buyer policy.

There must ge just compensation for improvement brought to the land but the land itself must revert to the state. Let me repeat that one. There must be just compensation for improvement brought to the land by whoever but the land have to revert to the state. SWANU of Namibia wants to see clear and just criteria for land redistribution. We must take into account the historical injustices, genocide and land disposession. We will enforce the law and ensure that all communal land that have been fenced or privatize be retained to the communities that are the rightful owners.

We therefore call on traditional leaders and the state to put an end to this injustice. Justice can be done within our parameters in this small population. Our sovereign wealth fund should be used to develop the agricultural infrastructure that will make the communal and commercial farms more productive. This should include irrigation, water harvesting, seed management, protection of bio diversity, training and extension

# PLIGHT OF FOREIGN-TRAINED MEDICAL DOCTORS WHO HAVE GRADUATED FROM CERTAIN UNIVERSITIES HON SHIXWAMENI

services, value addition to particular produce and cooperative marketing.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members land servicing has escalated housing costs. We want Municipalities to once again insource land servicing to reduce cost. The main objective of housing provision should be decent shelter and not profit. We therefore want to introduce a sporatic model that is used so effectively in many countries around the world in Namibia. Workers would be able to borrow against their pensions to purchases houses and service land.

Finally Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members SWANU of Namibia is committed to a just and equitable society in which we care for all and share with each other. We need to care for every Namibian and share with all of them and not just a handful that would be enriched within the common economy. We want to see an end to exploitation not only through our words but also our deeds. I therefore stand here. I can do that and I hope you will do it too. I therefore stand here in Parliament not for my own benefit but for those who are downtrodden and neglected Namibians who have not been able to share in the fruits of our hard earned independence, give the land and wealth back to the people. I thank you Honourable Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Next is Honourable Shixwameni.

**HON SHIXWAMENI**: Thank you Honourable Speaker. Congratulations Comrade Tangeni for such an energizing maiden speech. I would just like basically to take some three footnotes to the debate on the plight of foreign graduates. I understand well what the Minister of Higher Education was just articulating now but there are two things that I would like to caution.

## PLIGHT OF FOREIGN-TRAINED MEDICAL DOCTORS WHO HAVE GRADUATED FROM CERTAIN UNIVERSITIES HON SHIXWAMENI

One is the protectionism of the professional Council. We must guard because what is happening here the professional Council whether it is engineering Council, whether it is the health Council, whether it is all the architectural Council there is rampart protectionism trying to exclude others and only maintaining those ones that are there. As Government address this matter of foreign graduates please let us look at the Professional Council.

Are they doing justice to all foreign qualified students or not? That is one. The other thing is work's permit to stand. NASFAF cannot escape the blame for work's permit and I hope the Minister shall hold the NASFAF leadership and the Board accountable having spend millions and millions of dollars for students who were studying at Universities whom they were cautious of that they were studying at Universities that would not be recognized around in the country.

The third and the last thing just also another word of caution. We cannot say that students that come from Cuba, students that come from Russia or the former eastern low countries that they are sub-standard. Cuba, Russia and some of these countries I know that there are private Universities that might be taking chances. They have among the best education in the world unless if you want to say that our former friends produce substandards qualified graduates but we should also be cautious and we should be able to advice our students when they go abroad as to which Universities they should be going. So that is just a word of caution. Otherwise, I support the Motion. Thank you.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you. Any further contributions? In the absence of none, does the Honourable Venaani wish to reply?

# PLIGHT OF FOREIGN-TRAINED MEDICAL DOCTORS WHO HAVE GRADUATED FROM CERTAIN UNIVERSITIES HON VENAANI

**HON VENAANI**: I want to thank all the Members who have participated in this debate. Clearly we are sinking from two different inbox. When the Minister of Health immediately replied to my Motion without reading it but fine he just replied immediately without even getting a copy from me, fine. I respect that too. He is a man with a big brain and he does that. The Honourable Sacky Shanghala all the names starting with an S. I did not want to make that joke. It is in Parliament but be that as it may, spoke of a sanitized debate but the Minister of Health sanitized the debate and sterilized.

Honourable Uutoni Nujoma went further sterilized incurrent with the health technology they contaminated. The Minister of Higher Education preceded by her own Deputy when she replied on this matter when a question was raised, they are raising a fundamental question of standard. Higher Education is talking about standards that are not met. The Minister is talking about standards that are met and that is why Honourable Kandji-Murangi Doctor my mission with the Motion and I said it in my introduction that my mission is not to impose sub-standard Doctors on Namibian society. That is not the object of the Motion.

The object of the Motion intend to question various institutions as they acted while these students were studying and I think Honourable Shixwameni you are hitting the nail on the head by saying protectionism. I question the lack thereof of a curriculum in the health professional Council. In law whe you study a law degree you are not a lawyer. If you have not qualified for a JTC examination that gives you the right for you are a lawyer yourself. You studied law but JTC examinations are having a curriculum together with study materials.

You are not coming to a class, a test without having studies a developed curriculum plus study material. Now Health Professional Council students are saying they are not given materials. There is no curriculum and there is no materials given to them and it was proven that some of the questions were coming from various jurisdictions. Now I am not an expert to

# PLIGHT OF FOREIGN-TRAINED MEDICAL DOCTORS WHO HAVE GRADUATED FROM CERTAIN UNIVERSITIES HON VENAANI

medicine but it is said by those who know that people that study in the western hemisphere, the diseases that are in the western hemisphere are not the same diseases that we have here. Now given the fact that there is no malaria in Ukraine or Russia and there is malaria here so when you are testing that student, now if these students are being tested on diseases that are in India but that are not here or that are known and diseases tha are in India are not the same diseases that are in the westeran hemisphere. Then we must bring a synergy. It is not rumour mongering.

We must bring synergy to the Professional Health Council. The Minister in his speech said Minister of Health that the Professional Health Council does not have the requisite time to really do what they are supposed to do. He said that. That is why Parliament need to go and interrogate the Health Professional Council to say what are you doing? That is you can hold the Motion out I do not mind but we can go to the vote. That is your problem but the contious.

Now the Health Professional Council said something very fundamental. The Engineering Council and I used to own and engineering company. The Engineering Council was chaired, well, I decided to do politics. I am not like you who does business while you are in politics. I have left business for business people not like you. Honourable Speaker protect us please.

HON SPEAKER: Let us have order please.

**HON VENAANI**: I was talking about the Engineering Council. It was chaired by someone who did not even have an engineering qualification excluding a lot of Namibians that were supposed to be engineers but he himself who was sharing the body did not even have qualification to chair

## PLIGHT OF FOREIGN-TRAINED MEDICAL DOCTORS WHO HAVE GRADUATED FROM CERTAIN UNIVERSITIES HON VENAANI

the body. You cannot ask me a question. I am replying.

HON SPEAKER: Is that a point of order.

**HON VENAANI**: I am replying. So the Health Professional Council need to be engaged. Again if and I believe the Higher Education Ministry is talking the truth given the fact that they are having the mandate to supervise and accredit institutions. If it is true that some of these students were found to be sub-standards in certain areas, we as Parliamentarians cautiously need to know and ascertain the facts that is it the students that are sub-standard or the institution where they are coming from. What makes this particular student sub-standard? Is it the institution or their behavior towards learning? Listen , you did not even listen to the Minister of Higher Education but now you are replying. You just came now. So we are saying that if it is true that these students are sub-standard we need to have academic vetting.

**HON SPEAKER**: Can I just come in here? Honourable I really think this argument Honourable Venaani that was part of the motivation you made. Now the reply is to the issue raised. If you could deal with that and then we can move as quickly as possible.

**HON VENAANI**: Honourable Speaker Honourable Venaani is replying to ascertions made by Members on the issues that I raised. As a right of reply Honourable Speaker I am talking about the very reason the Honourable Minister of Higher Education is claiming saying that I am

#### PLIGHT OF FOREIGN-TRAINED MEDICAL DOCTORS WHO HAVE GRADUATED FROM CERTAIN UNIVERSITIES HON VENAANI

trying to impose sub-standard on Namibian society. I need to, yes, you said that in your speech. You never want to get the truth.

HON SPEAKER: Is that a point of order, yes.

**HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE**: Honourable Speaker I apologises for interrupting. I think the Honourable Members he means well to say that the content of the responses in the examination of the students did not meet the requirements not to say that the students are sub-standard. The students themselves cannot be sub-standard. It is perhaps the context of the responses in the examination which they said. I think that is the context Otherwise, the people feel that these people themselves are sub-standard. I do not think that is what you mean to say.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you for that clarity, Honourable Venaani please continue.

**HON VENAANI**: You can theorise as much as you want, it borders down to the same thing. Whatever brought this content what is it that brought the sub-standard content? Is it the institution we come from or is it the students themselves? One or the other must be examined to arrive at that judgement of saying that these people's content is sub-standard, you need to arrive at exactly whether you have vetted those institutions and if those institutions were vetted and are correct, why are they training sub-standard. We need to come sub-standard content we need to come at that disatification through a process the content.

# PLIGHT OF FOREIGN-TRAINED MEDICAL DOCTORS WHO HAVE GRADUATED FROM CERTAIN UNIVERSITIES HON VENAANI

Let us not just play with words here. We should not be mandatious with truth either. Let us continue. NASFAF, you are the one talking down on people. That is why this Motion was moved.

HON SPEAKER: Please not the dialogue.

**HON VENAANI**: NASFAF gave loans to students and yes, I am reply to Honourable Uutoni Nujoma. I am replying. Is it because he is not here. I am replying to what he said. It is my right to reply. You just do not want to hear the story. You want to hide it under the carpet.

HON SPEAKER: Please let us continue please.

**HON VENAANI**: I will continue by saying that NASFAF gave close to N\$300 Million to students of whose content is sub-standard. If it is the content of the students are sub-standad the N\$300 Million was given, then one has to ask a particular institution such as NASFAF how did you vet these students before you gave them the loans and it was said that there was no policy in place? Therefore the loans were given. Now who has agreed in the absence of a policy to give the loans? Parliament in its cautious must address this matter. So Honourable Members I think as legislatures to arrive at the bottom of this problem Parliament through a Parliamentary inquiry should inquire these matters.

I so move Honourable Speaker.

### PLIGHT OF FOREIGN-TRAINED MEDICAL DOCTORS WHO HAVE GRADUATED FROM CERTAIN UNIVERSITIES HON IYAMBO / HON SHIXWAMENI

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you. Now Honourable Kavetuna that is a reply to that. Now our rules are that we have, please let us not have a dialogue please. Alright, I now put the question that the Motion be referred to a Parliamentary Standing Committee as proposed by the mover, any objection, alright?

There is an objection? So is there a need for us to divide the House, yes because basically there is an objection. Alright, I have the tools here. The House is divided.

So I will then go through the Motion because it is very important that we have clarity. Will those Members in favour please rise? Thank you. Will those Members against please rise? No, no, please order, order. Thank you. Will those Members abstaining please rise? Anybody abstaining, none? So I will announce the results. The results are in favour 12, against 47, no abstention.

The Motion is not adopted. Thank you very much. So Honourable Members can we just have order? Honourable Doctor Iyambo you want to explain your vote.

**HON IYAMBO**: Thank you Honourable Speaker. I would just like to remind this august House that the majority are not always right. Thank you.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you Right Honourable Prime Minister. Can you get the microphone.

HON SHIXWAMENI: The procedure, once a vote has been cast. There

### ADJOURNMENT RT HON DR KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

cannot be any person trying to re-explain the Motion. The Speaker must adjourn the House because there is no business now.

**HON SPEAKER**: I was not sure. Being a newcomer I was not sure what exactly thought something so he got my eye but I think we should leave it at that. I agree. The rules are rules. Let us leave it at that. There is no urgency why we should rush into any contribution. So in any case it is time and we concluded and we should leave it at that. My God, I will put my hammer on the floor. This persistent dialogue please hold it do not persist. There are rules that can be deployed to ask Members to leave the House. Do not force the Speaker to do that. So can we agree we have concluded the business of the day and I will ask the Right Honourable Prime Minister to adjourn the House.

**<u>RT HON PRIME MINISTER</u>**: Is it until tomorrow?

HON SPEAKER: Until tomorrow.

**<u>RT HON PRIME MINISTER</u>**: Yes, alright thank you Honourable Speaker. I move that the House adjourn until tomorrow as usual time 14:30.

**HON SPEAKER**: The House stands adjourn until tomorrow the usual time, so decided.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:35 UNTIL 27.03.2019 AT 14:30

# NATIONAL ASSEMBLY ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS WINDHOEK 27 MARCH, 2019

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

**HON SPEAKER** took the Chair and read the Prayer and Affirmation.

## ANNOUNCEMENTS IN TERMS OF RULE 20(A) OF THE STANDING RULES AND ORDERS

**HON SPEAKER**: Honourable Members, I know today is a special day but let me take you through some housekeeping matters and we will start by acknowledging that someone in this House was born on this day and that someone is the Honourable Pohamba Shifeta. Happy Birthday! Happy wonderful return, congratulations!

Furthermore I have a special announcement to make and the announcement is simply to inform you that Namibia has had opportunity to be selected as the host for the Africa Millimeter Telescope project otherwise known as AMT. This astronomical project aimed at realizing at fifteen metres single dish radio telescope on the Gamsberg Mountain.

Those of you who are familiar with this should see it as further reinforcement of the existing facilities that we have in that part of our country. The design for the purpose of Astronomy and Scientific Research is something that we all value and very much welcome. Its main objective is to provide the essential missing link, missing link to the network of telescopes around the globe known as the event or resented telescope EHT.

The AMT will be the only radio telescope in the millimeter wavelength regime in Africa thereby providing unique scientific opportunities for Namibia. The AMT project is visioned as highly visible and unique

## ANNOUNCEMENT HON PROF KATJAVIVI

enabler of science education and outreach capacity enriching sustainable energy and social economic development for our country.

So we have guests who are associated with this important initiative and they are currently visiting our country and I have got a particular pleasure to introduce them to you and I will start with someone who is not a stranger to our country Mrs Cornelia Wanwangene an Honorary Consol of Namibia in the Netherlands. She was here at the time of the birth of the nation and she was the first person who was in charge of the Dutch Mission in our country as a Charge de Affairs of the Embassy of the Netherlands in Namibia from 1991 to 1995 and she is the one who is instrumental in bringing the academic and scientists who are associated with this particular project. Next to her is Dr Mark Clien Hoch, he is the Project Director and he is the one who is instrumental and part of the team that is visiting us.

Next to him, I hope I got my bearing right. Then is Ms Marjory Vermilion, she is the core leader and head of the external affairs part of the team and she is the one who has been hectically involved in coordinating the activities. They are visiting various parts of the country to make sure that they pinpoint those areas that could be linked to the overall project.

Last but not least, Professor Heino Bakel the Principal Investigator and Science Chair of the EHT consortium. There you are, that is the team and of course they are not operating in a vacuum they are working with the two national Universities as important partners in terms of the research, in terms of the exchanges, the University of Namibia and Namibia University of Science and Technology and if you see them walking out the work is not yet done they are busy with their colleagues. There will be more moving back and forth to complete the overall arrangements before they return to the Netherlands and to Germany so welcome dear guests, feel at home and we are very much looking forward to hearing the results of these huge investments both in material as well as the human capacity building as we envisage it to happen. Thank you very much, welcome.

# SADC SOLIDARITY CONFERENCE WITH WESTERN SAHARA HON !NAWASES-TAEYELE

As we are about to embark upon this important event of the National Budget the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Economics and Public Administration in collaboration with the Friedrich Ebert Stiftung will host a National Budget Analysis breakfast meeting tomorrow to help analyze and unpack the budget for the public and for those who are interested and understanding and appreciating what this budget is all about. This event will take place tomorrow morning at 08:30 at Avani Hotel along Independence Avenue. All of you are invited and the public is invited to attend this important event.

**HON SPEAKER:** That said and done any Petitions? Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Notice of Questions? Notices of Motion and therefore I call on the Chief Whip.

**HON !NAWASES-TAEYELE**: Thank you Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I hereby stand to move an unopposed Motion calling for the independence of and self determination of the people of Western Sahara. Our National Assembly joined other National Parliaments within the SADC Region and Africa in general in expressing our solidarity and support towards the self determination, freedom and independence of the people of Western Sahara.

Honourable Members, that this Motion shall give brief Assembly on behalf of the Parliament of the Republic of Namibia record the solidarity shown by the SADC Region in convening the SADC Solidarity Conference with Western Sahara in Pretoria, South Africa and the call of His Excellency Dr Hage G Geingob the President of the Republic of Namibia.

"That in the spirit of PAN Africanism we can only move forward as a union when freedom on this continent is guaranteed to all its citizens".

# SADC SOLIDARITY CONFERENCE WITH WESTERN SAHARA HON !NAWASES-TAEYELE

We believe the continued denial of the right of self determination for the people of Western Sahara has become a matter of urgency for the region, the continent and the international community. We can no longer ignore the call by the people of Western Sahara of the right to self determination.

We insist as a people with the people of Western Sahara if in line with the aspirations of Africa we desire Africa to be one and Africa united and integrated. Therefore freedom cannot only be granted to some but to all of this beautiful continent. We recognize the laws, bond and friendship and growing excellent relations between Namibia and the plight of the people of the Western Sahara in their quest to ascertain an independent Saharawi Republic as well as recalling Namibia's own sacrifice during their own struggle for freedom and independence from the yoke of colonialism, apartheid and education under more or less similar circumstances.

Support the solidarity offered by the rest of the international community. Given the long history of suffering by the people of Western Sahara under Spanish colonial rule as well as subsequent dictation by Morocco and successive consequent aggression by Moroccan Armed Forces against the people of Western Sahara, we are convinced that Morocco is deliberately occupying Western Sahara so as to exploit the natural resources of the region without caring about the economic development of Western Sahara and social welfare of its citizens and further more that Morocco is doing this with the backing of some western countries who are jointly benefitting from the natural resources of Western Sahara in this unholy alliance.

Conscious of the fact that the people of Western Sahara are fighting for their inherence rights to self determination and nationhood. We are aware that the United Nations General Assembly adopted a compromised resolution on Western Sahara in 2003 which called for a referendum that will allow the Saharawi people to progressively exercise their rights to self determination and that although Morocco took note of the UN Resolution it has deliberately subjected Western Sahara to circumstances that cannot permit this referendum to take place. Also aware that International Court

# SADC SOLIDARITY CONFERENCE WITH WESTERN SAHARA HON !NAWASES-TAEYELE

of Justice was asked to deliver an advisory opinion as to whether Western Sahara belong to Morocco or Mauritania at the time of Spanish colonization and that the International Court of Justice ruled in October 1975 that while as (indistinct) have shown allegiance to the Moroccan soldiers there were no historical legal types that desired western Sahara from de-colonization and self determination and that Morocco deliberately misinterpreted the verdict of Court.

Also aware that in 2014 the African Union reaffirmed Western Sahara's claims to self determination although Morocco ironically claimed that Africa Union (AU) had no legal jurisdiction over the people of Saharawi. Further, we are aware of the fact that Western Sahara is suffering from the bonds of the effects of drought and desertification and yet another current circumstances of Moroccan occupation. The Saharawi Republic has not fully utilized the natural resources and Western Sahara to adopt to climate change and to improve basic services plus education, health, descend housing, food security and fresh water security amongst others for its people.

Taking note of the fact that Morocco has no little place or any territory of Western Sahara and the rest of the African countries have long achieved their freedom and independence and further that they observed respect of the sovereignty of their neighbours in the spirit of brotherliness whereas it is shameful for an African country to illegally occupy another African country and go against the ethos of African solidarity and regional integration reaffirms the mandate of the United Nations Special Committee on the situation with regards to the implementation of the declaration on the granting of independence to colonial countries and its people.

We echo the responsibility of the United Nations Security Council to implement all these resolutions and decisions urgently and unconditionally in order to uphold the dignity of the people of Western Sahara. We maintain full and un-equivalent support for the democratic rights of the people of Western Sahara to self determination and national

# SADC SOLIDARITY CONFERENCE WITH WESTERN SAHARA HON !NAWASES-TAEYELE

independence. We prolong continuous determination by all parties involved to take all peaceful steps necessary to bring about the complete and quick eradication of colonialism on the African continue.

Therefore and wherefore we call for the immediate and unconditional and to illegal occupation by Morocco of Western Sahara and the immediate and unconditional withdrawal of the Moroccan armed forces from Western Sahara. We demand the lifting of the inhuman and unjustifiable resistance of Moroccan authoritarian rule over the Saharawi. We therefore, demand the African Union to take a firm stand on Morocco's conduct over Western Sahara and that both the African Union and the PAN African Parliament listens to and reflect the wishes and the aspirations of the people of Western Sahara.

We declare that the existence of colonialism in any form of manifestation including economic exploitation incompatible with the Charter of the United Nations, the declaration on the granting of independence to colonial countries and people and the universal declaration of human rights. We accept that International Humanitarian Law must be respected and humanitarian assistance must be provided to Saharawians refuges in a predictable, sustainable and timely fashion.

We affirm lastly, once again our support and solidarity for the quest for freedom, independence and self determination of the Saharawi Republic and its entire population of the Western Sahara like all the rest of the citizens of Africa they deserve to be emancipated and empowered. Give them a word and let them be heard, let their aspirations prevail in determining their future. I so submit Honourable Speaker.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. That being an expression of support and solidarity to the struggling people of Western Sahara representing the views and the position of Parliament of the Republic of Namibia as represented by the National Assembly voiced by the Chief

## SADC SOLIDARITY CONFERENCE WITH WESTERN SAHARA HON SHIXWAMENI

Whip of this House. Can you table the Motion?

Thank you. We all heard that this is an unopposed Motion in the usual tradition we normally do not venture into a debate. Is that acceptable or there is an expression or support? The support is there, yes Honourable Shixwameni. Wait for the microphone. Did you press?

**HON SHIXWAMENI**: Thank you Honourable Speaker. I rise in support of the Motion unreservedly but I also want to make some footnotes in that particular Motion. I think the Motion has fallen short of one simple thing, an outside and total condemnation of colonial Morocco towards the people of Western Sahara. I think we should not quote our language when we talk about the independence of a country. The right to independence is un-negotiable and that should be our firm stand and we should not sugar quote it.

Secondly, formerly the African Unity, I am shocked that an African country while people are attending the meeting in Pretoria some standard countries went to Malabo for a meeting. The ancestors of African Unity must be turning in their graves and in shape. I mean there is no way, what is African Unity and what is the union, African Union for? If you can plead on a simple question of colonialism I think we need to really work hard because even the ancestors the Nkwame Nkrumah, the Nyerere surely some of them must be ashamed at this new colonialist lead that ruling some of the African countries that are colliding with colonialism.

I think we have to find a way of how to get ourselves together so that we can demand the independence of Western Sahara unconditionally, referendum or not, independence or dead Western Sahara must be free like all African countries have been free and we must directly condemn Morocco for what it is perpetuating colonialism of a fellow African country.

# SADC SOLIDARITY CONFERENCE WITH WESTERN SAHARA HON NAMOLOH

I would even go further in conclusion that if it has to be if we are truly in African Unity and the African Union we should start demanding the expulsion of a colonial power such as Morocco from the African Union because I cannot even understand *(applauding)* how Morocco in the first instances was readmitted to the African Union. With those few footnotes I thank you.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. We can understand and appreciate the sentiments you just expressed. Honourable Charles Namoloh.

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Thank you Comrade Speaker, thank you very much. I would not stand idle to support the Motion having been in the same trenches with the Saharawian people during the struggle and I feel still the same as we were together. So I think also for us as a country we must also understand the Motion mentioned about the economic exploitation of the Saharawi resources and we do not know also what these resources are. Morocco is in the dominance of the production and export of phosphate and that is the main resource in Saharawi. We have also Namibia has got phosphate deposits very big and most is a most qualitative one but when we want to exploit it Morocco is heavily involved in prohibiting Namibia exploiting its phosphate and we now use this animal, the environmental and we do not know whether it is Morocco who is behind all this. Yes we must study it, it is Morocco because it wants to challenge on the phosphate. So if we want to fight all of you have been also against, all of us as Parliamentarians must understand our geo political strategies how to fight not only political as the statement has said but we must use also this in order for us to bring Morocco to its knees also. We must use this. I thank you I will support this Motion Honourable Speaker.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. I think the House is united in support of the Motion. That is the conclusion, I now put the Motion that the Motion be accepted, approved. So decided? Thank you.

Messages from the Head of State? Ministerial Statements? There being none, I now move on to the subject before us.

The Notice of a Motion is the one of the Honourable Minister of Finance. Does the Honourable Minister move that the Bill now be introduced?

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: I so move Honourable Speaker.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you. Who seconds the Motion? Is there any objection? Then it is agreed to. Will the Honourable Minister please table the Bill?

The Secretary will read the Bill a First Time.

# FIRST READING – APPROPRIATION BILL [B.3 – 2019]

**SECRETARY:** Appropriation Bill [B.3 – 2019].

**HON SPEAKER**: Doe the Honourable Minister of Finance move that te Bill be now read a Second Time?

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: I move so Honourable Speaker.

**HON SPEAKER**: Any objection? Who seconds? Agreed to. Honourable Minister you have the floor.

# SECOND READING – APPROPRIATION BILL [B.3 – 2019]

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Honourable Speaker; Honourable Members of the National Assembly; Fellow Namibians:

I have the honour to table the Budget for the 2019/20 financial year, a fifth under the administration of His Excellency President Dr Hage Geingob.

I table this budget knowing that the current economic situation in our country has caused hardship for many citizens and I thank you all for your forbearance during these difficult times.

I am equally aware that the situation would have been much worse, if we had not implemented fiscal consolidation and austerity measures.

This budget sets out the developmental outcomes we aspire to achieve this year and beyond, and, securing a new pattern of sustainable economic growth that is broadly shared by all Namibians. As masters of our own destiny, this budget summons the collective energy of all Namibians; and, implementing Offices Ministries and Agencies to rally together for broad-based economic growth activities; timely and efficient implementation of funded programs; and, taking the steps required to implement the complementary reforms designed to deliver improved developmental outcomes.

It is a budget targeted at stimulating economic growth and bringing about decent jobs and, further adjusting the public fiscal stance to sustainable and stable levels. In pursuit of these material policy objectives, we remain agile to guard against excess reversals on gains in the social sectors. The budget I lay before you is thus as much about ensuring macroeconomic stability as it is about supporting economic recovery with jobs.

Beyond the budget, the economy is greatly enabled by private sector investment, expansion of final value of exports, speedy implementation of intervention measures and a conducive policy environment.

#### What does this Budget offer?

Honourable Speaker, Honourable members, the Financial Year 2019/2020 budget provides and reinforces the three-linked and interconnected fiscal policy actions.

First, the budget provides for a growth stimulus package, centred on increased magnitude of the development budget, enhanced resource allocation to the agricultural sector, youth and SME support.

Second, its policy stance proposes a continued reduction in the budget deficit, consistent with the medium-term fiscal consolidation policy stance.

Third, it proposes timely implementation of enabling structural policy reforms to optimize outcomes through improved ease of doing business, business confidence and increased policy certainty. This also includes tax policy and tax administration reforms which balance between promoting investment and revenue generation to support the successful implementation of the fiscal consolidation program.

This budget:-

• Increases the development budget allocation by 42.0 percent, with greater emphasis on economic growth enhancing infrastructure

investment and crowding in private sector participation,

- Reduces the proportion of non-core expenditure to curb wastage and enhance allocative efficiency,
- Provides increasing budgetary allocations to social sectors to guard against reversals and enhance access to affordable and reliable public services, and
- Further strengthens allocations to social safety nets to improve coverage of qualifying beneficiaries and maintaining the grants in real terms.

Honourable Speaker, in this context, and in terms of Article 126(1) of the Namibian Constitution, I table, for the favourable consideration and approval of this House:-

- a. the FY2019/20 Budget, FY2019/20-2021/22 Medium-Term Expenditure Framework and the accompanying Development Budget,
- b. the Estimates of Revenue and Expenditure for the MTEF,
- c. the FY2019/20 Appropriation Bill,
- d. the Fiscal Strategy for the 2019/20 -2021/22 MTEF, and
- e. the Government Accountability Report for Financial Year 2017/2018

To resuscitate growth and jobs, this budget makes the following explicit provisions;-

- The development budget is increased to N\$7.9 billion, from N\$5.5 billion this financial year. This allocation must be protected against frequent reallocation and virements during the financial year,
- Deploys project financing amounting to N\$1.1 billion under the

African Development Bank arrangement within the budget year, with own budget funding of N\$831.9 million for logistics infrastructure mainly rail and road, agricultural mechanisation and school infrastructure renovation.

- The remaining N\$2.9 billion under AfDB funding will be utilized over the next two years.
- In collaboration with AfDB, and to encourage local participation, construction projects will provide the option for 25 percent of the contract value to local entities through a competitive bidding process.
- A total allocation of N\$290 million is allocated to the crop and horticulture programme under the Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry of which N\$96 million is targeted for the Green Scheme Programme. An amount of N\$469 million is allocated for water generation and infrastructure refurbishment programme. This is for the purpose of increased productive capacity, increased efficiency and job creation in partnership with the private sector and to enhance water security in the country.
- An additional allocation of N\$15 million is allocated for youth entrepreneurship projects on top of N\$9.5 million to support youth employment and self-employment under the National Youth Council. This is in addition to youth related projects under the Ministry of Sports, Youth and National Service as well as the support facilities at the Development Bank of Namibia and the Ministry of Industrialization, Trade and SME Development.
- Noting the severe effects of climate change and the ensuing drought, a total of N\$100 million is allocated to the Emergency Fund, bringing the total balance of N\$304 million. In addition, a total of N\$204 million is provided for contingencies.
- Public Procurement Act to enable local economic development and participation in mainstream economic activity:-

- Last month, I issued a Procurement Directive under the Procurement Act for all public entities north of the cordon fence to procure meat, fresh produce, mahangu (pearl millet), beans, cereal and their by-products to levels and quality available locally. Through partnerships, I call on the private sector to replicate. this gesture,
- The Development Bank of Namibia, in collaboration with the Chamber of Mines and Industry is developing a database of locally produced goods and services and benchmark cost prices to support local procurement activity across the public and private sector,
- The Regulations on exclusive bidding to support local participation will be finalized in the Second Quarter of this year to provide for thresholds for local sourcing under the Procurement Act and for enforcement by the Central Procurement Board. Utilization of this policy space will enable optimal participation of the domestic producers of goods and services and for stimulate domestic productive capacity,
- The Central Procurement Board of Namibia will improve its turnaround time for tender and bid evaluation and prioritize the finalization of high-value tender awards within a minimum prescribed time frame.
- A total of N\$110 million is earmarked for SME Financing Strategy activities under the Development Bank of Namibia. N\$60 million is already transferred and an additional N\$50 million is provided for in the budget for the implementation of the following financing activities under the Strategy:
  - The Training and Mentorship Programme:
  - The Credit Guarantee Scheme; and,
  - o The eventual roll-out of the Venture Capital Fund and a skills-

based loan facility for young graduates and vocational professionals,

- Harness the PPP legal framework, which is now fully operationalized since December 2018 to unlock opportunities for private capital:-
  - Public infrastructure investments, starting with the office complex of the Ministry of Justice in downtown Windhoek,
  - Land servicing and construction of housing units,
  - Water and energy generation through investments in desalination plants and renewable energy, and
  - Provision and servicing of specialized service units in the health sector.
- Reversing some of the previously announced tax rate increases and non-deductibility of some categories of income tax to enable domestic economic agents to invest and produce,

Honourable Speaker, our President, HE Dr Hage Geingob declared the ultimate year of his first term as the year of accountability. Four years have passed since we took the necessary but difficult decisions to address the complex set domestic and external shocks to our economy. The effects of these shocks continue to linger:-

- domestically, the extended period of mainly debt funded expansionary fiscal policy, which allowed us to support high cyclical growth prior to 2015 could not continue without compromising future sustainability. At 42 percent of GDP by FY2014/15, expenditure levels were unsustainably high,
- the gradual adjustment in the budget deficit threshold from 3 percent, 5 percent and 7 percent of GDP led to a faster increase in expenditure relative to income and this needed to be reversed,

public wage bill doubled between 2012/13 -2017/18, on the back of job re-grading and notch improvements above inflationary adjustments. Disposable incomes were also ramped up by substantial tax rate cuts in FY2013/14, which provided relief to virtually all income brackets,

- externally, the commodity price crash arising from weak demand in export markets resulted in sluggish domestic production outputs, exports and earnings,
- recurring El Nino conditions manifested themselves in bouts of severe drought, affecting agricultural output and industrial activity that's highly dependent on water utility,
- GDP growth declined to 0.6 in 2016, from 6.1 percent in 2015 and became negative in subsequent years. This required the deployment of a complex set adjustments,
- GDP estimates and, therefore, revenue had to be adjusted downwards by a factor of 9 percent,
- With economic growth adjusting to lower levels, revenue growth receded, with a decline of 2.6 percent in 2016/17 and averaged 3.8 percent growth thereafter, relative to the average growth rate of 18 percent during the boom years
- The boom-bust cyclical adjustments generated a steep rise in public debt stock and debt serving obligations, underpinning the necessity for rather steep expenditure correction.
- The high-public debt stock and associated debt servicing increased the pressure on our investment grade credit rating leading to a downgrade for foreign denominated bonds.
- Expenditure adjustments of 7.9 percent of GDP were made to align public spending to revenue to stabilise growth in public debt through a

gradual reduction in the budget deficit and achieving a positive primary balance anchor.

- Currency volatility resulted in the South African Rand and, thus, the Namibia Dollar depreciating by some 12 percent over 2015 and 2016. This resulted in adverse effects on the servicing costs for the foreign debt portfolio,
- Tight liquidity conditions in the domestic market ensued, with consequent tightness in cash flow due to under-subscription in Government bonds and bills.
- A build-up of accumulated spending arrears arose from a combination of expenditure over-commitments, sharp reduction in expenditure and cash flow tightness.

The materialization of these macro-fiscal risks and subsequent corrective measures weighed heavily on our ambitions of high quality economic growth and developmental goals. The corrective measures have, however, prevented a certain slide into macroeconomic instability and unsustainable fiscal operations.

Honourable Speaker, three years since the implementation of the fiscal stabilization measures, we can together account tangible progress points:-

- Public expenditure is aligned to revenue. Over the past three years, revenue grew by 3.8 percent, relative to 0.4 percent growth in expenditure.
- Expenditure as a proportion of GDP reduced from 42 percent to 34.9 percent in FY2018/19. Relaxation of expenditure containment hold high fiscal risks of slippage into unsustainable operations.
- The budget deficit narrowed from 8.1 percent in 2015/16 to 4.0 percent in FY2018/19, narrowing it by half over the last three years. Revenue generation through growth is a necessary condition going forward.

- Growth in the public debt stock slowed to an annual average of 11.2 percent in the past two years, compared to an average of 30.1 percent the previous three years. The moderate increase in debt relative to previous years has averted a severe contraction on the domestic economy and the provision of social services.
- The current account deficit narrowed significantly, from 14.1 percent of GDP in 2016 to 2.1 percent in 2018/19.
- The international reserves stock has strengthened from 2.1 months of import cover in 2016 to 4.2 months by February this year.
- The intensity of the recession has eased from -0.9 percent in 2017, to an estimate of between -0.5 to -0.2 percent in 2018. This would indicate that the recession has almost bottomed out and points to the economy recovering to positive GDP growth territory this year and over the MTEF.

These inherent fiscal risks and subsequent corrective measures impacted significantly on our ambitions for economic growth and developmental goals. However, these measures prevented us from certain macro-economic instability and loss of fiscal sustainability.

Over the past four years, we have also utilized domestic policy space and brought about structural policy reforms to strengthen resilience and enhance domestic productive and institutional capacity. Key structural policy reforms have become operational in broad areas of the economy:-

- The Mid-Year Budget Review was introduced since FY2015/16 as an added tool to improve budget transparency, allocative efficiency and provide for advanced announcement of medium-term budgetary framework,
- The Public, Private Partnership legislative framework and institutional arrangements are implemented, providing opportunities for private capital investment in the domestic economy and alternative means for

financing infrastructure and services,

- The Public Procurement law and institutional arrangements are in place, creating enhanced objectivity and transparency in the procurement process. Notably, implementation and capacity challenges arose in the implementation of the procurement law. We are committed to a national stakeholder workshop to assess and address the emerging challenges. In the meantime, the Procurement Act provides for directives to be issued to achieve improved local sourcing.
- In December last year, an Integrated Tax Administration System was rolled out, delivering solutions for online filing and online self-assessment,
- The recruitment process for the Namibia Revenue Agency will commence over the coming months in advance of its launch on 1 October 2019. The Board of Directors was inaugurated in December last year and is currently developing internal policies and operational readiness activities,
- In the financial sector, policies to expand the depth and frontiers of financial inclusion have been advanced.
- Domestic Asset Requirements have also been increased from 35 percent to 45 percent by December last year through amendments to Regulation 15 and 28, potentially releasing substantial amount of money in the economy available for investment locally. Investment in unlisted entities are expected to be within the 5 percent limit.
- In the energy sector, the proposed Energy Regulatory Authority Bill and amendments to the Electricity Act will, among others, encourage Independent Power Producers to invest in commercial energy generation activity. The IPP Policy is approved and the Government aims to liberalize the supply of electricity in Namibia, through the introduction of the Modified Single Buyer Market Model which will replace the current single buyer model where electricity suppliers can

only sell to NamPower foster competition in the market.

- Over 49 percent of the budget continues to be allocated to the social sectors. The new curriculum for the basic education sector is implemented and, support to the Student Financial Assistance Fund continues to promote to tertiary and vocational education.
- In the infrastructure sector, major investments have been made in infrastructure including in the port, road and water sectors.
- In the public administration sector, Namibia continues to rank well on the governance, transparency and the rule of law ratings, including the fight against corruption as evidenced by independent assessments.
- We continue to make steady progress in reducing poverty and wealth inequalities
  - Absolute poverty has declined from 41 percent in 1990s to 17.4 percent by 2015/16. Extreme poverty has reduced to 10.7 percent.
  - The Gini Coefficient ratio is estimated at 0.56, compared to 0.70 in the 1990s. However, we acknowledge that inequalities remain high relative to aggregate income levels.
- The Public Enterprises Governance Bill was approved by the National Assembly and reviewed by the National Council. Its passing will enable a wholesale review of many of the current Public Enterprises, with the objective of making them into economically viable enterprises.
- The Witness Protection Act and the Whistle Blowers Act have been passed and the supporting institutional structures are being created. These will strengthen governance and anti-corruption measures through improved transparency and accountability.
- A successful second Land Conference was held. The resolutions

address fundamental land reform issues and lay the foundation to peacefully resolving political, economic and emotive challenges.

Constitutional Court judge Kate O'Regan said, "The deep inequalities that persist are visible reminders of the effects of apartheid and colonialism. Until these scars are healed, the vision of our Constitution will not have been achieved." -

Our society and the structure of our economy are a product of past political economy, shaped by apartheid and colonialism. The outcome is that Namibia is still the second most unequal society in the world. The only way to become a prosperous nation is to "heal these scars"; enable us to live up to the vision of our Constitution; and, develop into a society where prosperity is more equitably shared.

For this reason, we have chosen to build a fair and equitable society where socio-economic opportunities are available to all Namibians. We must, therefore, upgrade and deploy policy permutations that will reform the structure of our economy to achieve eroding inequality and eradicate extreme poverty during our lifetime.

Substantial stakeholder input has been sought in the development of the New Equitable Economic Empowerment Bill. These have resulted in compromises that should allay investor concerns whilst retaining the spirit of the intended policy objectives.

With the same motive of creating an environment of policy certainty, amendments to the Investment Promotion Act will be tabled in the House in this calendar year.

#### Macro-fiscal Developments and Medium Term Outlook

Honourable Speaker, this budget is presented against the backdrop of slowing momentum in the global economy, elevated trade tensions and climatic induced disasters.

This is largely due to the risk factors which have materialised in the latter part of 2018. These include the ensuing emergence of unilateralism and resulting trade wars between and among the United States of America and China and the European Union and the impending process of the United Kingdom exiting the European Union later this year or earlier with or without a deal.

The repercussions from these developments for global trade and financial market sentiment are increasingly significant,

- Global output growth is projected at 3.5 percent this year and 3.6 in 2020, a slowdown from 3.7 percent for 2018. This reflects the economic slowdown in Advanced Economies, mainly the waning effects of the stimulus package in the United States.
- for China, a key source of demand for mineral commodities, growth is projected to decelerate from 6.6 percent in 2018 to 6.2 over the next two years as the effects of the on-going trade war takes their toll.
- Non-fuel commodity prices are projected to decline on average by 2.7 percent this year due to weakening demand.
- Global trade is projected to be static over the next two years.
- Financial market conditions are tightening due to trade tension repercussions.
- Net capital outflows from Emerging Markets have become elevated, owing to changing sentiments and prospects for monetary policy tightening in some of the advanced economies,

The growth outlook for the Sub-Saharan African Region is projected to firm up to 3.3 percent in 2019, from 2.7 and 1.4 percent in 2017 and 2016 respectively.

The outlook for our main neighbouring trading partners is generally weak.

- growth for South Africa could improve to 1.5 percent in 2019 and 2.1 by 2021,
- For Angola, the growth rate is estimated at 2.4 percent for 2019, strengthening to 3.2 percent next year as the pass-through effects of oil price take hold.
- However, the current climatic catastrophes, the most severe flooding in recent times in one part of Southern Africa and the most severe drought in other parts of Southern Africa present a significant emerging risk to the economy.

#### **Domestic Economy**

Honourable Speaker, the domestic economy is projected to emerge from recession this year. The pace and quality of the recovery is dependent on the speed and scale of implementation of pro-growth policy interventions, but may also be influenced by external factors.

GDP growth for 2019 could reach up to 1.0 percent, from a contraction of between 0.2 and 0.5 in 2018.

In a baseline scenario, if no policy measures are implemented, GDP growth is estimated at 0.2 percent in 2019 and improve to approximately 1 percent by 2021. However, the outlook could improve to approximately 1.2 percent this year and reach 2.2 percent in 2020 if it is supported by timely implementation of supportive policy measures.

At this economic recovery rate, the imperative to speed-up implementation capacity and eliminate bureaucratic delays for the outlook to translate into per capita income expansion is critical.

On the demand side, the recovery is expected to be led by increased exports from the mining sector, increased investment in public infrastructure and a soft recovery in aggregate consumption expenditure.

With aggregate public spending generally flat, private investment inflows are necessary to lift the growth potential of the economy.

After a peak of foreign direct investment in the mining sector, investment flows have been declining, contracting by 28.6 percent and 24.4 percent by 2016 and 2017 respectively. Government has facilitated for the establishment of the Peugeot Car Assembly Plant which commenced operations in Walvis Bay in 2018. Domestic Asset Requirements have also been increased. In the spirit of partnerships and closing domestic savings-investment gap, elevated private sector participation is required to drive economic growth and job creation.

From the sectors of industry, recovery is expected to be anchored by increased output from the mining sector, especially the uptick in uranium output. The primary industry is estimated to grow by 3.1 percent in 2019 and average around 2 percent over the MTEF. The growth outlook for primary industries is significantly discounted by the expected contraction of the agricultural sector by 5.2 percent this year as the severe drought takes its toll on the crop and livestock subsectors as well as continued contraction in the fisheries subsector.

Secondary industries are projected to remain under pressure for the year, with an estimated contraction of 5.9 percent in 2018 and easing to -1.8 percent this year. At the epicentre of this contraction are the construction and the manufacturing sectors. Measures to support activity in the construction sector, the implementation of the Growth at Home Strategy and attraction of private sector investment are important policy domains to yield long-term and, sustainable growth in these sectors.

Recessionary pressures on the tertiary industries are expected to ease this year, on the back of public sector investment in the social sectors and the effects of a moderate recovery in consumption demand.

#### **Monetary Policy and External Sector**

Honourable Speaker, Monetary Policy has remained largely

accommodative, with the Repo remaining at 6.75 since August 2017, in line with the currency peg and to support domestic economic conditions.

Inflation remains benign at 4.4 percent in February this year, after averaging 4.3 percent over 2018,

On account of relative increase of exports over imports, the merchandise trade balance has reduced to 10.6 percent of GDP by the end of 2018, compared to 13.1 percent the previous year.

As such, the current account deficit has narrowed to 2.1 percent in 2018, compared to 5.1 percent last year.

The international reserves have firmed up to 4.5 months of import cover at the end of 2018.

#### **Fiscal Policy Developments**

Honourable Speaker, let me now turn to fiscal policy developments:-

The 2018 Mid-Year Budget Review provided an account of fiscal outturns for the 2017/18 fiscal year. The details on outcomes are provided in the Accountability Report,

- Revenue for FY2017/18 of N\$58.8 billion, was 4.3 percent better than the budget and 3.7 percent better than the revised budget. For FY2018/19, revenue outturn is projected at N\$56.7 billion, consistent with the Budget Review estimates,
- By Mid-March 2019, revenue outturn was N\$55.0 billion, 97.1 percent of the collection target.
- at this rate, no revenue shortfalls are anticipated, on account of better outturn on Personal Income Tax, mining company taxes and other categories of non-tax revenues.

• however, collection pressures remain for non-mining company tax and value-added tax due to subdued economic activities,

For FY2019/20, total revenue is estimated at N\$58.4 billion, 3.0 percent better than the estimated outturn for 2018/19 and 29.7 percent of GDP. This is in anticipation of 16 percent better SACU receipts, which is largely offset by the downward revisions in annual estimates for non-mining company tax and Value-Added Tax owing to a low growth and depressed consumption demand.

Over the MTEF, revenue is projected to increase on average by 3.0 percent, at N\$59.9 billion in FY2020/21 to reach N\$61.8 billion by FY2021/22. As a proportion of GDP, total revenue is estimated to moderate from 29.7 percent of GDP in FY2019/20 to about 29.2 percent over the remainder of the MTEF, mainly on account of the expected slackness in the growth of SACU receipts and domestic revenue streams.

The low growth environment impacts on the revenue outlook in respect of both domestic and SACU receipts. In this situation, realising significant and sustainable economic growth addressing tax planning opportunities; and, increased tax administration efficiency are prerequisites to maintain revenue buoyancy over the medium-term.

#### Expenditure, budget deficit and debt

Honourable Speaker, the 2018 Budget Review and the Government Accountability Report for FY2017/18 provide details of the expenditure and fiscal outturns in respect of the previous year.

- During FY2017/18, Government resolved the incidence of accumulated spending arrears arising from the previous year.
- By the last week of March 2019, total expenditure including expenditure commitments stood at N\$64.8 billion, 99.6 percent of the budgeted spending.

- This comprises of operational spending, including statutory commitments, at 99.8 percent and 79.4 percent of development budget execution rate.
- the budget deficit for FY2018/19, is estimated at 4.4 percent,
- Public debt is approximately N\$87.5 billion or 46.3 percent of GDP by the end of FY2018/19,
- Debt servicing interest payments is 10.2 percent of revenue, and contingent liabilities for Government are approximately 5.8 percent of GDP below the 10 percent maximum cap.

While discernible progress to reduce the growth in public debt stabilisation, further progress is required to achieve the positive primary balance anchor necessary to stabilise debt and ensure that public debt is on a downward trajectory. A balanced fiscal consolidation policy stance therefore remains necessary over the medium term.

# FY2019/20 Budget, Medium-term Expenditure Outlook and Fiscal Policy Stance for the MTEF

Honourable Speaker; Honourable Members; let me now turn to the FY2019/20 budget and the Medium Term Expenditure Framework.

Policy space for rapid adjustments in the economy are limited and the fiscal stance is constrained on all fronts. At 49.2 % of GDP, total debt will not allow for further aggressive debt financing as this is not a sustainable option. Equally, significant increases in domestic revenue through higher and additional taxes will do more harm than good to the economy. Therefore, we are restricted in our ability to increase expenditure.

Implementing enabling policy reforms and departing from business as usual to a more speedy implementation of interventions is within the scope of each implementing Offices/Ministry and Agencies.

The private sector, as the envisaged engine of growth and job creation is called upon to play an elevated role in the economy. The Ministry of Finance will continue to spearhead consultations with the private sector, professional bodies and the newly formed High-level Panel on the Economy for effective partnerships.

Against this backdrop of prevailing pressures in the economy, and the triple socio-economic challenges of high inequalities, high unemployment and perpetual poverty levels for an Upper Middle Income Country, I table before you the FY2019/20 budget, totaling N\$66.5 billion.

- this is 2.0 percent increase from the previous year,
- Expenditure is growing at 1.3 percent on average over the MTEF. Revenue is growing at an average of 3.0 percent and improved alignment of expenditure to revenue is achieved,
- non-interest operational expenditure is budgeted at N\$52.2 billion, 1.8 percent less than the previous year, reflecting realignment of spending to priorities, from non-core to core goods and services and to capital expenditure,
- The development budget is increased by 42.2 percent, to N\$7.9 billion from the revised N\$5.6 billion the previous year, to give greater impetus to economic growth.
- This increases the development budget as a share of total non-interest expenditure from 9.4 percent in FY2018/19 to an average of 13.6 percent over the MTEF.
- Offices/Ministries and Agencies must live within their means and the implementation rate for the development budget must be timely to deliver the intended outcomes,
- Transfers to commercial Public Enterprises is budgeted at N\$836.5 million, reducing to N\$ 815.6 million in FY2020/21 and reach about

N\$838.3 million by FY2021/22. This reflects a reduction from historical levels.

- The budget deficit is estimated at N\$8.2 billion or 4.1 percent of GDP and averaging 3.4 percent over the MTEF, compared to 4.4 percent in FY2018/19. Faster reduction in the budget deficit would require deep expenditure cuts, that would hurt growth and service delivery,
- The deficit will be financed through a combination of domestic, multilateral and bilateral borrowing. The leveraging of state assets in the telecommunication sector is expected to ease financing obligations and mitigate against increases in the debt stock,
- taking into account the total financing requirements, the debt stock is estimated at N\$96.3 billion, 46.3 percent of GDP and 50.8 percent over the MTEF and peaking at 52.3 percent by FY2021/22, with appreciable reduction in public debt expected by FY2021/22 when about N\$8.6 billion of debt is expected to be redeemed.
- Sinking fund investments are made for debt redemption for which 70 percent is reserved for redeeming maturing debt. The sinking fund will be further build up quarterly.
- Interest payments, averages N\$6.7 billion or 11.2 percent of revenue over the MTEF. This is above the 10 percent cap, reflecting the increasing burden of debt servicing obligations.

Taking into account the weak growth and a volatile revenue outlook and the national objective to contain growth of the public debt, total expenditure is only projected to increase by approximately 1.3 percent over the MTEF, from N\$66.5 billion in FY2019/20 to N\$67.1billion in FY2020/21 and, N\$67.8 billion by FY2021/22, averaging 33 percent of GDP over the MTEF.

Containing expenditure at an average of 33 percent of GDP over the MTEF will require domestic revenue generation founded on economic

growth and efficiency of tax administration to achieve successful progrowth fiscal consolidation.

To encourage achieving the primary objective of reigniting economic growth within a constrained fiscal space, targeted infrastructure financing will be done through bilateral and multilateral financing arrangements and budgetary transfers to Public Enterprises in economic sectors for targeted capital investments.

Honourable Speaker, while reviving broad-based economic growth is imperative, debt stabilization through revenue generation and non-core expenditure containment is a critical objective which cannot be abandoned. Therefore, the pro-growth fiscal consolidation policy remains the appropriate and timely policy stance to safeguard long-term macroeconomic stability and fiscal sustainability.

Significant reductions in non-core expenditure has been achieved since the adoption of targeted consolidation measures in FY2015/16. Total spending on Subsistence and Travel Allowance, for instance, has reduced by a cumulative about 62.3 percent over the past three years, from N\$634.3 million in FY2015/16 to N\$221.8 million allocation in FY2018/19.

However, there is a systematic erosion of Subsistence and Travel Allowance from Divisions which render key services to administrative offices within Budget Votes across the board, thus constraining the provision of essential goods and services. Such emerging trend must be curtailed.

We would expect that all Accounting Officers continue to prevent public spending that is non-core and, non-compliant with the cost-saving measures issued by the Office of the Prime Minister.

The policy stance over the next MTEF is to:-

• maintain a pro-growth fiscal consolidation stance, with the objective of

- stabilizing the growth in public debt, while maintaining the growthfriendly and social development objectives of fiscal policy,
- reduce the budget deficit from 4.1 percent of GDP in FY2019/20 to approximately 3.5 percent in FY2020/21 and average at this rate over the MTEF,
- stabilize the growth of Government debt at 52.3 percent of GDP through a gradual reduction in the budget deficit and debt amortization program, and
- implement effective expenditure containment measures, mainly through public sector wage bill reduction, revenue-raising tax policy and tax administration reforms as well as structural policy reforms to support the implementation of the fiscal consolidation program,

Honourable Speaker, in respect of expenditure-based measures,

- Expenditure containment measures are centred on the wage bill management within the entire public sector, managing transfers to Public Enterprises and containing the growth of non-core expenditure.
- At 51 percent of non-interest operational expenditure, and 15.5 percent of GDP, the Central Government wage bill has increased by 110 percent over the past five years preceding FY2018/19. The Government appreciates the common understanding and commitment of the civil service and organized labour for the contribution to the policy efforts to exercise restraint on remuneration increases and to restore long-term sustainability,
- Hiring restraint in the public sector calls for job creation in the private sector,
- Thomas Piketty said, "I don't think there is any serious evidence that we need to be paying people more than 100 times the average wage in order to get high-performing managers". We concur with him and empirical evidence on public sector remuneration in Namibia equally shows that there is no correlation between high salaries and productivity.

- Restraint on the wage bill applies also to all Public Enterprises. The Ministry of Public Enterprises will issue a directive in this regard. The spiralling wage bill in Public Enterprises and Sub-national governments is partly financed by budgetary transfers from Central Government or, such increases reduce the potential dividends to the State. Public Enterprises need to demonstrate that they are delivering value for money in the delivery of good and services to the public who are, effectively paying taxes to subsidies these organisation,
- a total of N\$650 million is reallocated from non-core expenditure and transfers to Public Enterprises to support the provision of core goods and services, financing for SMEs support facilities as well as development budget expenditure

#### Tax Policy, Revenue enhancement and Tax Administration Reforms

Honourable Speaker, let me now turn to tax policy, customs and excise and tax administration changes.

As earlier stated aggressive tax policy during economic downturns is mostly seen as counterproductive. However, to concentrate all corrective fiscal measures on expenditure also has a down-side.

The Government has facilitated wide stakeholder consultation on a set of tax policy proposals. Some of these proposals could have had unintended negative consequences and therefore, to avoid the risk in slowing the economic recovery through additional taxes, the Government has decided to reverse the proposed tax rate increases and non-deductibility criteria for some of the headline tax categories.

However tax proposals to achieve equity and fairness in the tax regime by taxing economic agents generating the same level of income and plugging tax planning and avoidance opportunities will be finalised for tabling in the FY2019/20 fiscal year.

In particular, the following tax proposals will be finalised for tabling:

- phasing out the current tax incentive for manufacturers and exporters of manufactured goods, repealing the Export Processing Zone and introducing the Special Economic Zones, with a sunset clause for current operators with the EPZ status,
- introducing a 10 percent dividend tax for dividends paid to residents. This is to enhance the fairness and equity of the tax regime,
- abolishing the current practice of a conduit principle in the taxation of trusts to harmonize the taxation of trusts,
- subjecting income derived from commercial activities of charitable, religious, educational and other types of institutions under Section 16 of the Income Tax Act to normal corporate tax requirements,
- Deepening the current hybrid tax system by taxing all income earned from foreign sources. Namibian residents will have to declare such income in their annual tax returns,
- as a tax incentive for saving and improved domestic investment capability, increase the tax deductibility of retirement fund contributions from the current N\$40,000 per annum to 27.5 percent of income with a maximum of N\$150,000 to encourage savings and provisions for retirement,
- Disallow deductibility of fees and interest paid to non-residents for calculating taxable income until payment of withholding tax paid is proven.
- introduce VAT on income of listed asset managers and on proceeds of the sale of shares or membership in a company owning commercial immovable property, and
- Remove VAT zero-rating on sugar.

• disallow deductibility of royalties for non-diamond mining entities,

The following excise levies and duties will also be introduced for domestic revenue purposes:-

- increase the fuel levy by 25 cents per litre for all levied fuel products in terms of the Section 54 of the Customs and Excise Act,
- expand coverage of export levy to include other specific agricultural, forestry and game products and other mining products currently not covered,
- increase the export levy for dimension stones from the current 2 % maximum to 15 %,
- introduce an export levy of 15 % for timber,

Honourable Speaker, in terms of the SACU Agreement and taking into account sales volumes and targets set for the total tax burdens on respective excisable commodities, the following increases, effective from 21 February 2018 and as agreed in terms of the SACU Agreement, have been adjusted as follows:

- Excise duty on beer goes up by 12 cents to N\$ 1.74
- Excise duty on a 750ml bottle of wine goes up by 22 cents to N\$ 3.15
- Excise duty on a 750ml bottle of Sparkling wine goes up by 84 cents to N\$ 10.16
- Excise duty on a bottle of whiskey will go up by N\$4.54 to N\$65.84
- A pack of 20 cigarettes goes up by N\$1.14 cents to N\$16.66

• Excise duty on a typical cigar will go up by about 64 cents to N\$7.80 These amended rates of excise duty are set out in more detail in the Government Notice which I will table in the National Assembly, in terms of section 54(1) of the Customs and Excise Act, 1998 at a later stage. The Government Notice referred above will be deemed to have come into operation as from midnight 21st February 2019.

New Environmental Levy items will be introduced under Schedule 1 to Customs and Excise Act, 1998 (Act No. 20 of 1998) on the importation of Lubricant oils,

Plastic carrier bags and disposable batteries including car/truck batteries. These levies are as follows:

- a levy on Lubricant oil of N\$ 1.80 per litre;
- an environmental levy of 5% of the cost of Primary cells and primary batteries;

The tax proposals for domestic revenue purposes are anticipated to generate approximately N\$400 million. Income tax changes will come into effect in 2020 after drafting and tabling of the specific tax proposals. Excise duties will become effective upon the tabling and gazetting of the schedules.

Complementary to these tax policy changes; key tax administration reforms will be implemented during the FY2019/20 and over the MTEF. These are principally:

- continued rolling-out of the Integrated Tax System to leverage service innovation embedded in the new system
- transitional arrangements for the establishment of the Namibia Revenue Agency by 1 October 2019 including the commencement of recruitment,

- improving the tax administration to ensure compliance with tax laws and, improving the efficiency of domestic tax collection,
- leveraging regional and international tax cooperation as a mechanism to enhance national technical capacity in various areas of tax administration, such as transfer pricing and illicit financial flows, and
- scaling-up the programme for targeted recovery of tax arrears for different categories of tax and non-tax revenues,

#### The FY2019/20 Appropriation Bill

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, let me now turn to the FY2019/20 Appropriation Bill and the resource allocations per sector.

#### Social Sectors

Investment in the social sector remains central to long-term productive capacity and shielding the social strata against vulnerability. As such, amidst limited fiscal space, allocations to social sectors are maintained or scaled up to mitigate against reversals.

The share of social sector allocation is maintained at 49.3 percent of the budget and over the MTEF. This is N\$29.6 billion in FY2019/20 or N\$88.9 billion over the MTEF.

- Basic Education receives N\$13.8 billion, and N\$ 41.4 billion over the MTEF,
- Higher Education, Training and Innovation receives N\$3.1 billion and about N\$9.4 billion over the MTEF, of which N\$911.9 million is for UNAM, N\$500 million for NUST and N\$1.1 billion for NSFAF in the budget year and N\$3.4 billion over the MTEF.

- Such resource outlay reflects the Government's commitment to invest in the youth and human capital development as the central driver for sustainable development and poverty reduction over time.
- In order to realize better quality of outcomes, internal efficiency gains must be pursued with in the sector.
- Health and Social Services is allocated N\$6.9 billion, 2.3 percent better than the previous year and about N\$20.6 billion over the MTEF. Incremental increase in the allocation to the health sector is to support procurement of pharmaceuticals, recruitment of additional health personnel, combating public health outbreaks and maintaining health infrastructure.
- The Members contribution to PSEMAS, which have been static from now, will be doubled to bring the total contribution from the current N\$410 million to N\$820 million effective April 2019.
- A few remarks on PSEMAS, the medical aid scheme which covers 95 % of medical expenses for public servants. It receives an allocation of 2.8 billion for 2019/20 and covers 130,000 members, 155,000 dependants totaling to 285,000 persons being covered. The introduction of this scheme equalizes medical service provision in the public service. To reduce cost and improve efficiency a peer review mechanism was introduced. The outcome is revealing. During the first round, 82 service providers, including general health practitioners, dentist hospitals, pharmacists, dental technicians and the medical aid administrator were flagged for suspicious transactions. Also. membership and member card fraud were highlighted as a significant cost driver. As a follow up, a forensic investigation was launched to verify the findings of the peer review and the outcomes were by and large confirmed. These findings indicate that PSEMAS suffered from a fraudulent assault launched by stakeholders across the board, service providers, members, administrators, civil servants, everyone had a hand in the till. This investigation is now coming to finality and the culprits are brought to books. Recovery of N\$23 million is envisaged of which N\$13 million has been recovered.
- Poverty Eradication and Social Welfare is allocated N\$3.6 billion, 4.5 percent more than the previous year and approximately N\$10.8 billion

over the MTEF to maintain and improve the coverage of existing programs.

- The social safety nets form the first line of defence against poverty for the vulnerable and the veterans of our liberation struggle, with allocations maintained in real terms to guard against inflationary creep.
- Given the high dependence ratio and the challenging effects of the cost of living at household level, the Old Age Pension is increased by N\$50.00 to N\$1,250.00 per month.

#### Economic and infrastructure sectors

Honourable Speaker, Economic and infrastructure Sectors take up the third largest share of the budgetary allocations, after the Public Safety and Social Sectors. This share rises to the second highest in FY2020/21 and over the remainder of the MTEF to give greater impetus to economic growth objectives. A total of N\$12.8 billion is allocated to the Economic and Infrastructure Sectors in FY2019/20, summing to about N\$39.6 billion over the MTEF. This is further supported by investment outlay of the Public Enterprises in their areas of mandate.

- Transport receives N\$3.4 billion, and N\$10.2 over the MTEF, for the completion of on-going phases of road capital projects with contractual awards. This allocation is supported by N\$1.4 billion from the Road Fund in FY2019/20 or about N\$ 7.0 billion over the MTEF as well as N\$644.94 million for road project financing under the AfDB loan arrangement during the budget year, with remainder of N\$1.69 billion to be disbursed over the next two years for transport road and rail infrastructure financing under the AfDB-funded Economic Governance and Competitiveness Program.
- The Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry receives N\$1.9 billion, of which N\$469 million is earmarked for commencement of the water infrastructure refurbishment and development program. Over the MTEF, the sectoral allocation amounts to about N\$6.1 billion,

- The Ministry of Finance is allocated N\$4.4 billion and about N\$13.2 billion over the MTEF. Out of this amount N\$2.4 billion or 58.0 percent is allocated for PSEMAS. N\$73.5 million is allocated to AgriBank, totaling N\$241.4 million to support investment in horticulture and AgriBank's loan book. Similarly, a total of N\$50.9 million is allocated to DBN for SME support facilities with the MTEF allocation totaling N\$165.9 million. A total of N\$150 million is earmarked for the transitional arrangements for the establishment of NAMRA in the budget year, to be scaled up over the MTEF on top of the allocations made for the Departments of Inland Revenue and Customs and Excise, while N\$2 million is allocated annually for the Financial Literacy Initiative.
- Vote Industrialization, Trade and SME Development is allocated N\$295.0 million and about N\$926.3 million over the MTEF.

## Public Safety and Order

Honourable Speaker, at 21.7 of the budget in FY2019/20, the Public Safety Sector take up the second largest share of the budget allocations, totaling N\$13.1 billion and about N\$39.1 billion over the MTEF, representing investment in maintenance of law and order, peace and stability.

Among others:-

- Defence is allocated N\$5.9 billion, and N\$17.9 billion over the MTEF,
- Safety and Security receives N\$5.6 billion, 6.3 percent more than the previous year for basic goods and services and recruitment of core personnel needs. Over the MTEF, the allocation stands at N\$16.7 billion,
- The Ministry of Home Affairs and Immigration is allocated N\$677.1 million, 11.2 percent more than the previous year to among others, complete its Head Office building and its Regional Office in Kunene

Region. Over the MTEF, the allocations amount to about N\$1.7 billion,

- The Judiciary receives N\$368.4 million, and a total of about N\$1.11 billion over the MTEF,
- The Anti-Corruption Commission receives N\$61.6 million, 1.4 percent more than the previous year and totaling about N\$184.8 million over the MTEF to support activities to fight against corruption.
- Corruption is prevalent in both the developed and developing worlds. Corruption is the evil that touches almost every aspect in an economy. It is one of the most immoral causes for inequality as it disproportionally benefits the few and, harms the many. It creates, elites or cliques. When self-interest reigns supreme, with no ethics a society without humanitarian values and compassion is formed, the principles of social justice, equality and peace are lost.
- Namibia has been considered for several years by several reputable . rating agents as being a relatively stable environment for investors. We are consistently in the top five least corrupt countries on the African continent. The question however is whether that is good enough. The answer is IT IS NOT, because in as much as this is an achievement, it falls short of us being free of corruption. On face value the cost of corruption is immense. For instance, the customs case in court currently produced figures, where through suspected collusion between clearing agents, importers and customs officials the State was allegedly defrauded in a scam involving the trade volume of N\$ 3.1 billion. Large infrastructure projects such as the Hosea Kutako Airport Project, which was stopped because cost escalated by more than double for no viable reason. Tenderpreneuring and accompanying overpricing is possible only when private operators connive with officials and put personal gain above the common good.

### Administrative Sectors

The Administrative Sector receives the lowest share of the budget allocations, averaging 7.6 percent over the MTEF. For the budget, a total allocation of N\$4.6 billion is made and approximately N\$13.7 billion over the MTEF.

- Urban and Rural Development receives N\$1.98 billion, 6.5 percent more than the previous year and a total of about N\$5.8 billion over the MTEF, to support increasing provision of sanitation, serviced urban land and bulk services for water, sewage and electricity,
- International Relations and Cooperation is allocated N\$941.3 million in and totaling about N\$2.89 billion over the MTEF,
- The National Assembly receives N\$126.8 million for FY2019/20, 14.4 percent better than the previous year for increased outreach activity and a total of about N\$360.5 million over the MTEF, while the National Council is allocated N\$94.8 million and N\$284.3 million over the MTEF.
- An amount of N\$204 million is allocated to the Contingency Fund in the budget year and about some N\$616.77 million for the MTEF to cater for unforeseen emergencies.
- For the FY2018/19, a total of N\$317 million was allocated to the Contingency Fund. I have distributed the corresponding information regarding the utilization of the Contingency Fund.

The Appropriation Bill and the Estimate of Revenue and Expenditure for the MTEF provide details of expenditure allocations per Vote and programmes. The Government Accountability Report provides an account of achievements and outcomes for the 2017/18 fiscal year.

#### Public Finance and Financial Sector Reforms over the MTEF

Honourable Speaker, in addition to the structural policy reforms I emphasized, domestic resources mobilization, improving national

institutional capacity and financial sector reforms are other important components in the process of national development.

In the Public Finance management space;

- We have brought about reforms in public procurement, PPPs and a range of tax policy and administration reforms,
- We will continue to deepen and broaden the tax base and improve capacity in the specialized areas of profit shifting and illicit financial flows,
- Implement administrative measures to enhance the functioning of public procurement structures and the new integrated tax system to facilitate the ease of paying tax and tax compliance across the board and realizing the establishment of NamRA,
- Spearhead activities to finalize the drafting process for the Public Finance Management Bill.

In the financial sector, the reform agenda is to safeguarding financial stability and foster financial inclusion and access to finance.

- We have proceeded to implement the provisions of the Financial Sector Strategy for expanded access to finance and the protection of consumers of financial products and services,
- the Bank of Namibia Bill harmonizes the regulatory framework with central banking law within the SADC and provides mandate for financial stability and overall macro-prudential supervision,
- Amendment to the Banking Institutions Act will further advance bring Second Tier banking institutions under the regulatory ambit, provide for microfinance institutions and increased local participation in banking institutions.

• the comprehensive legislative framework for the non-banking financial sector under NAMFISA is finalized for tabling in the House, providing for the roll-out of the much needed risk-based supervision in the financial sector,

Seen together, the fast-tracking policy reforms and implementing internal operational efficiency initiatives in each sector holds promise to unlock developmental opportunities and improve the ease of doing business. The impact of fiscal policy, through the budget, is most optimized if and when implemented under supportive sectoral policies, institutional capacity and administrative frameworks.

The imperative for supportive policies and administrative efficiencies is even more important in times when fiscal policy has assumed a consolidation stance.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, we must admit that we cannot do everything with a budget, but we have over the past three years put the country on a sounder financial footing. When delivered, our economy will be in better shape. The future will be more secure and promising.

It proposes to continue placing the budget deficit on a declining path and to stabilize growth in public debt.

It fosters private sector partnerships and engenders policy certainty, through a balanced structural policy reform agenda.

It calls for coordination and timely implementation of critical policy reforms across all sectors. It offers opportunity for increased private sector participation in the economy.

Internal efficiencies and a more supportive policy environment are necessary conditions for doing more with less.

I wish to express my gratitude to His Excellency President Hage Geingob for his leadership, guidance and support and for entrusting me as a steward

of our public finance management and financial sector as we chart our course from the prevailing economic environment.

I equally wish to thank, His Excellency Vice President Nangolo Mbumba, Right Honourable Prime Minister Kuugongelwa-Amadhila, the Hon. Deputy Prime Minister Netumbo Nandi Ndaitwah for their guidance for continuous policy support.

I thank my Cabinet Colleagues for walking together on this right but tight path to long-term gains which far outweigh short-term pains.

I thank Honourable Obeth Kandjoze, Minister of Economic Planning and Director General of the National Planning Commission and his entire staff for the joint work and usual support.

I express my appreciation to the Bank of Namibia and the staff at NAMFISA for all-round technical support.

My gratitude also extends to my Deputy Minister, Honourable Natangue Ithete, the Executive Director, Madam Ericah Shafudah and my officials who always persevere in preparing the budget documentation. I thank all senior officials in all O/M/As for their hard work.

Indeed, my sincere appreciation is extended to the various political parties and Parliamentary Committees for their contribution to the improvement of the budget allocative efficiency.

I thank the business community, organized labour, Development Partners, the financial services industry players such as the Bankers Association of Namibia, Asset Managers, Insurance industry, Economic Association of Namibia and NASIA for consultation, collaboration and support.

I extend my appreciation to our Development Partners for all-round support in various fields of national development. I extend my sincere appreciation to the multilateral financial institutions and bilateral partners for technical and sometimes grant support for the implementation of

## 27 March 2019 SECOND READING – APPROPRIATION BILL HON VENAANI

national development programmes.

This budget translates our collective development aspirations into resource allocation proposals. Its medium-term outlook provides opportunity to improve and further prioritize such proposals.

We must not only approve the proposals. We must implement then prudently and timely.

Let me end with a quote from George Horace Lorimer, an American journalist and author of the previous century. He wrote, "It's good to have money and the things money can buy, but it's good, too, to check up once in a while and make sure that you haven't lost the things that money can't buy." This budget proposes to make money available to buy things and these things should improve all our lives. However, we must do that honestly, diligently, with the common good as our only objective in mind.

I now appeal for your support.

I thank you.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you Honourable Minister for your budget speech. There you are, we have it. Any further discussions? Yes Honourable Venaani.

**HON VENAANI**: Honourable Speaker, I want to thank the Honourable Minister for tabling a budget that we anticipated but we did not get nothing and thus a political arrogance has brought us where we are and I shall adjourn the debate until next week Tuesday to take this Government on (laughter).

27 March 2019

#### ADJOURNMENT RT HON DR KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

**HON SPEAKER**: Yes, the request by the Honourable Member, I need some order. Can I have some order please? I know we have been energized by the Budget Speech but as a customary of course, after such a long Budget Speech we do permit the opportunity for the Official Opposition to reply. That request is requested and we will do so in accordance with our arrangements in the House. So decided. All what is left is for me to ask the Prime Minister to adjourn the House.

**<u>RT HON PRIME MINISTER</u>**: We adjourn to when?

HON SPEAKER: To tomorrow.

**<u>RT HON PRIME MINISTER</u>**: To tomorrow, okay thank you Honourable Speaker, I move that the House adjourns until tomorrow at 14:30 the usual time.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you. The House stands adjourned until tomorrow the usual time.

## HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 16:45 UNTIL 28.03.2019 AT 14:30

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS WINDHOEK 28 MARCH, 2019

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON SPEAKER took the Chair and read the Prayer and Affirmation.

## ANNOUNCEMENTS IN TERMS OF RULE 20(A) OF THE STANDING RULES AND ORDERS:

**HON SPEAKER**: Welcome back after the historic day, the day usually associated with the National Budget. Now we are glad to get to work and we need to be guided by a timetable and of course I will be sharing that information with the House by the way.

Honourable Members, the budget programme has been distributed or just about to be distributed and is on your desk hopefully by now for your careful review. On the programme Members will notice that next week from the  $2^{nd}$  to the  $9^{th}$  of April the House is going to debate the Appropriation Bill in the Second Reading Stage as what we normally do. Kindly take note about the dates that have been allocated to your Party, the Party you represent in this House in order to prepare accordingly.

Also take note that the State of the Nation Address by His Excellency the President has been confirmed for Wednesday 17<sup>th</sup> April 2019. On that day His Excellency the President will come to address Parliament on the future policies of the Government and thereafter shall be available to respond to specific questions. Again I want to repeat the timetable the allocation of Party in terms of the days that are allocated to your individual Parties and so on. It is very important that we adhere as much as possible to the timetable so that we can, as smoothly as possible go through the budget and of course in the usual manner. If there are some difficulties the staff

#### 28 March 2019

#### COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL

of the National Assembly are available to assist where it is possible so that we can all be on the same page in terms of adhering to the timetable.

**HON SPEAKER:** Any Petitions? Reports of Standing and Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Notices of Questions? Notices of Motions? Messages from the Head of State? Yes, Honourable Muharukua. *(Laughter)*. I know you are teasing me. I know. Ministerial Statements?

Yes I think we are done. I just want to acknowledge the fact that I do not have the technology that usually assists me with the names of the people who are taking the floor I am going to be improvising as we go and forgive me if I miss anybody. Just please put up your hand and I will take note.

Now can I request for your cooperation in, we are going to spend a great deal on the number of questions that we have but we have an item that I would like to take so that once we have done away with that we will revert back to question time and it is the first order of the day that I want to deal with so that we can dispose of that particular items. It has been coming and going and I would like to do justice to the item.

The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

# **RESUMPTION OF RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL [B. 15 – 2018]**

**SECRETARY:** Resumption of Reconsideration – *Public Enterprises Governance Bill* [B. 15 – 2018].

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON JOOSTE

**HON SPEAKER**: Does the Honourable Minister of Public Enterprises move that the Assembly now reconsiders the Bill?

HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: I so move, Comrade Speaker.

**HON SPEAKER**: It is moved that the Assembly now goes into Committee and I leave the Chair accordingly.

#### **ASSEMBLY IN COMMITTEE**

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: the Whole House Committee is called to order. The Committee has to reconsider Public Enterprises Governance Bill.

I put Clause 02. Any discussions? I recognize Honourable Minister.

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Thank you Comrade Chairperson so in Clause 02(a) substitute the words preceding paragraph (a) of Sub Clause 01 with the following words, "*The Minister may, in consultation with Cabinet declare*".

Then (b) substitute Clause 04 in the following Sub Clause, as follows, for the Minister may, in consultation with Cabinet declare that the body

#### 28 March 2019

## COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON JOOSTE

ceases to be a Public Enterprise and after such declaration any determination under Section 4:2 is deemed to have been withdrawn and the provisions of establishing law for documents apply and (c) following Sub Clause after Sub Clause 4, 5: A declaration in terms of Sub Section 1 and a declaration in terms of Sub Section 4 must be made known by notice in the Gazette.

I so submit.

<u>**CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE**</u>: Please table the amendment. Any discussions on the amendment Vote? Any objections? Agreed to. I put Clause 03. Any discussions? I recognize Honourable Minister.

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIIC ENTERPRISES**: Substitute Clause 03 with the following Clause: Application of actual bodies that are not Public Enterprises, 3.

The Minister may with the concurrence of the Minister responsible for Finance by notice in the gazette declare any provision of this Act to apply to any Board, Committee, Fund, Trust or any other institution purporting to perform any function under any law if such institution has acquired or administered money appropriated by Parliament or acquired from a levy imposed by or under a law provided that this Section does not apply to a Local Authority or Regional Council.

I so submit.

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON SANKWASA / HON SCHLETTWEIN

<u>**CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE**</u>: Submit the amendments please. Any discussions on the amendments forwarded? Any objection? Agreed to.

I put Clause 04, oh sorry pardon. I recognize Honourable Deputy Minister of Works and Transport.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT**: I just want to draw the same Clause, question posed by or under a law. Normally when I read the law, I am not a Drafts person but when I read the law it says, under any other law or any law not just a law. I do not know how the legal people will look at that but that is what I read in most of the laws. It says any law not a law, thank you.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Yes but it is supposed to be any law. Is it okay Honourable Minister of Finance?

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Honourable Chairperson, I do believe it is okay and my understanding on this phrase is that it is imposed by a law that is in the statute or under the law and that will be a regulation or in the statute itself that is what there would 'under a law' mean.

**<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>**: So you are saying a law is fine? Okay, I hope, let us agree to that. any further discussions to

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON HINDA-MBUENDE

that? Any objection? Agreed to. I put Clause, oh, Honourable Mbuende.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION**: I just wanted us to look at the first one that was there and I think maybe put the (indistinct) in Section 1.

#### CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Ha?

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION**: Because the previous one, my understanding is that the amendment was, the earlier mention was talking about, 'may by notice' and the new one is to say, 'not concurrence' so that was the reasons of the amendment. So I just want confirmation from the Secretariat that imposed by was meant to be like that I think maybe that is the reason it had to be verified, it is just like that?

**<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>**: Are you looking at the old amendment?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: I am looking at the old amendment.

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON HINDA-MBUENDE

**CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE**: And the new one? They are rising now on the new one?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Yes so agreed.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Yes can you make yourself clear again.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND <u>IMMIGRATION</u>: What I am saying is that the amendment was, according to my notes was to look at the first paragraph, the first line, the first sentence that that second sentence I have not marked it so I guess we have confirmation that it was intentional or it is by error.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Which Clause?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Clause 03.

109

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON JOOSTE

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Clause 03, Honourable Minister can you clarify on that or any one or Attorney General?

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: I think Comrade Chair if I may, the latest amendments that were distributed today and that we are discussing now are the ones that are on the table so not the previous ones and those came after I, as I said yesterday the meeting with the Honourable Attorney General and Minister of Justice to agree on the terminology. So we should only consider this latest version. Thank you Comrade Chairperson.

**<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>**: Okay so agreed. Any objection? Agreed to.

I put Clause 04. Any discussions? Honourable Minister?

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: In Clause 04 substitute the words receiving paragraph (a) and Sub Clause 02 with the following words, 'despite the provisions of any other law the Minister has the power to determine'.

<u>**CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE**</u>: Yes table the amendment. Any discussions on the amendments put forward? I recognize Honourable Hinda-Mbuende.

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON HINDA-MBUENDE

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION**: Thank you. I think I have the same points. I really need confirmation if these are the amendments because the earlier version said, 'despite the provisions of any other law the Minister has the power to determine after consultations with the Cabinet, that is what it was saying. Whether the intention of these amendments is to further empower the Minister in taking out the consultation part I do not want to, I have the perception that, I need a confirmation that I am wrong, that we do not allow errors to come in through that amendment. The earlier version was giving the mandate for further consultation.

Maybe the point I am trying to make is I have an objection of us just reading these new amendments not looking at it into context and if there is something omitted or added that should not have been like that we may just admit by default. So I am reading from the first half Clause 04 Sub A2. No, it says here paragraph (a) Sub Clause 2. So paragraph (a) Sub Clause 2 was saying, 'despite the provision of any other law' which is the same the Minister has the power to determine. The new version ends there. The previous version was saying, 'after consultation with Cabinet' which in my opinion, after consultation with Cabinet is the one that should hold or that should be the case.

In the understanding during the debate we had issues with the Minister being giving absolute power and in the amendment that is recommended that power is now back again to the Minister. I want the House to consciously decide, is that the intention because I do not want it to enter by mistake.

I can recall because I took serious issue with the matter of the Minister having absolute power and the amendment was mainly focusing on putting *'after consultation or in consultation'* actually that is what should have been there, in consultation and not after consultations because at the time was arguing that after consultation could be interpreted as you could disregard the consultation and still decide what you want to decide but in

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON DR KAWANA

consultation was a preferred term. The amendment of the draft what is presented now totally ignores that provision. I want to be reassured that that was the intention. Thank you very much and if it is the intention I am not in this agreement then I would recommend that we put the Clause *'in consultation with Cabinet there'*. Thank you.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Yes I should think it makes sense, your intervention. Anyone who can clarify the dilemma in which we are Honourable Attorney General Dr Kawana?

**HON ATTORNEY GENERAL**: Comrade Chairperson, the reason why the omission *'in consultation or with the approval of Cabinet'* was removed is this that currently now Cabinet has already decided that members of the Board minimum is five, maximum is seven and the Minister was directed to put that in the guidelines which I think the guidelines have already been gazetted.

So the Minister will work within that framework because initially in the original law there was a board called Tehakanasi Council which was given that mandate and it was a Committee of Cabinet that time and that Committee recommended to Cabinet the number of board members because in terms of the previous laws there were varying numbers. Some of them used to go more than ten/twelve so in order to be consistent that is why we said minimum five maximum seven and that one was approved by Cabinet and now I believe in terms of the guidelines that is really the background.

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON HINDA-MBUENDE / HON SANKWASA

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: I recognized again Honourable Madam Mbuende.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION**: I do not want us to have a dialogue on the point. The point I am saying is, currently are we saying that the board appointments are going because of numbers to Cabinet or is it strictly appointment that Cabinet is looking at? Are we saying that this Bill is now giving the Minister the absolute power to decide who to appoint? I am not talking about the numbers. The numbers issue was long time there and it was long been reduced to five or to seven.

The provision is the appointment of the individual and currently the Cabinet or the line Ministers in concurrent with Cabinet present to Cabinet and the Cabinet concurs, then appointments are done. That is the operational procedure in place. Are we taking that authority away from the Cabinet and bestow it in the Minister to decide for all Parastatals whom he wants to put there as Director? If that is the intention if the Prime Minister can give me input on that. If that is the intention then we agree on that.

<u>**CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>**: Before the Minister I recognized the Deputy Minister of Works and Transport.</u>

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT**: Thank you very much Comrade Deputy Speaker. I do not know why we are spending so much time on this issue because the first time this Bill came here we dealt with the issue of, which one should it be the consultation or

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON SIMATAA

after consultation, that took a lot of time in these Chambers and we all agreed it should be in consultation. Why was it removed now that this amendment is coming, without it this should be explained to this House because that is what was agreed? It was agreed that way. Why is it removed this time again we must go back and debate the same thing? Thank you.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: No, he will be the last. Honourable Minister of Information and Communication Technology.

## HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION

**TECHNOLOGY**: Comrade Chair, we do not need to split heads on this. I think let us go back to the Bill itself and determine whether indeed this provision here and the Attorney General has explained, refers to the determination of the number of board members or whether it makes reference to the appointment because I think we might be mixing issues here. My understanding appreciating what the Attorney General has explained is that this particular provision refers to the number of the board, the minimum five the maximum seven which has already been determined by Cabinet.

Is there still any need for the Minister to still consult Cabinet after the principal has already been determined? I think that is the distinction that we need to make. So refer first of all to the provision that this amendment is speaking to and then we will have more clarity.

## CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Can

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON MUHARUKUA

you get us, sorry, okay I recognize Honourable Muharukua.

**HON MUHARUKWA**: Honourable Deputy Speaker, it is just a question to the Honourable Minister of not Trade but Information. Having regard to what you have said and what the Attorney General has said, the Attorney General is saying there is no need for consultation because Parliament has already decided (intervention).

# <u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: No Cabinet.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Yes Parliament does not decide on anything, Cabinet has decided. Now by implication and I would ask for your pardon because I am actually asking at the cuff from what I am hearing and this is genuinely trying to seek clarity and trying to seek intention, what the intention is. If the issue is or if the provision is saying it does not need to consult because the guidelines have already been set is it not then the fact that the Minister can then go and disregard those guidelines of Cabinet that he according to law does not have to consult even if it is just relating to numbers, it is just a question that I want to ask?

What I am bending down to say is if there is consensus that indeed the Minister cannot do it alone and in this instance the guidelines are already there. What time does he do to have to say 'in consultation' because if you do not say that, but just by hearing the arguments from both sides you are in essence saying that the Minister can even disregard that very guideline that you are talking about? Just clarify to me that.

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON TWEYA

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: In other words what are we going to lose if we insert 'in consultation'? Honourable Minister, okay before that Honourable Minister of Trade.

# HON MINISTER OF TRADE, INDUSTRIALIZATION AND SME DEVELOPMENT: Comrade Speaker (intervention).

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Chairperson of the Whole House Committee.

## HON MINISTER OF TRADE, INDUSTRIALIZATION AND SME

**DEVELOPMENT**: Oh, sorry thank you for this. Madam Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, this particular amendment if we read it slowly and listen to it, it unfortunately undermines our earlier commitment towards consultation. If hypothetically the guidelines which is only a policy says five to seven, the line Minister proposes seven in terms of that guideline and this Minister says no it must only be defined we cannot argue against it because that is exactly what it addresses that despite the provisions of any other law even if the law says seven, ten or so but if this Minister says, this is it.

This is what it says and this is where the difficulty comes in because we are now giving an absolute power to one individual to disregard because that is what it says, despite any other law the Minister has the power to determine, fullstop, if we can just appreciate exactly the spirit in which this particular submission why the consultation has been removed. I want us to read exactly what it says. English is not my mother tongue but the little that I know this is very dangerous.

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON SHIXWAMENI

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: I recognize without putting, yes Honourable Shixwameni.

**HON SHIXWAMENI**: It is just a question. I hope we are all on the same page, page 5?

**<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>**: Page 5 yes is page.

HON SHIXWAMENI: Page 5 of the amendment.

HON MEMBER: Page 4.

CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Uhu 4.

HON SHIXWAMENI: Okay it is okay.

<u>**CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE**</u>: Yes I should think Honourable Maureen Hinda-Mbuende do you still want to repeat what you said?

117

### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON JOOSTE

# HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Yes.

**<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>**: I should think you have been supported by some people for the sake of time let me allow the Minister to explain.

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Thank you Comrade Chairperson. I will make it short. First of all as Honourable Simataa had said this particular Section does not be always the appointment of boards at all it is only the size and composition of boards that is the first one.

The second one is that this particular provision is from the old existing legislation. It is not new at all. so the Minister of Public Enterprises before that the Governance Council always had exactly these powers and in those cases there was never any weapons to consulting and getting approval from Cabinet. So those are the two issues.

So in our discussion with the Minister of Justice and Honourable the Attorney General it was found that this particular provision since it does not deal with the actual appointment but purely on what I said would not or should not require the approval of Cabinet as such.

In all the other provisions you will see and as we go through the other amendments we have included the words, *'in consultation with Cabinet'* where any of these powers will have a deep effect but the consensus was that in this particular case that it is not of such an extent that it should require the approval of Cabinet and that was the consensus in that discussion Comrade Chairperson. So those are the only explanations I have. If we were, I do not want to, we cannot be bogged down for ever on

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON DR KAWANA

the same issues, if there is insistence that in this regard that it should be the words 'in consultation with Cabinet' should be added the Ministry would not have objection to that. That was the original proposal from National Council. If this House feels more comfortable that on this matter that the approval of Cabinet should also be sought then from the Ministry side we would not object to that. so I think just to make this particular debate on that point easier we will not content that. I agree with the Attorney General and the Minister of Justice that I do not think it is required but if you feel more comfortable with that then we will accept that as such.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: It is a bone of contention, this is now from myself, what are we going to lose if we keep the old, *'in consultation with the Cabinet'* is there any problem with it? Ha, Attorney General?

**HON ATTORNEY-GENERAL**: Chairperson, that is what the Minister said. Normally we are guided by the Line Ministry on issue like that. So the Minister is saying he has no problem to put there, 'in consultation with Cabinet' he has no problem. So what we do we just insert that and then we move forward.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: So agreed that we should insert *'in consultation with the Cabinet'*. I put Clause, we were just to reconsider those Clauses which needs to be amended. I put Clause 08 Sub Clause 05. Any discussions? I recognize Honourable Minister.

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON JOOSTE

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: In Clause 08 Sub Section the words preceding paragraph (a) of Sub Clause 05 with the following words, 5. The relevant Minister has a power to appoint in consultation with Cabinet, and I so submit.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Please submit the amendment. Any discussions? Any objection? Agreed to.

I put Clause 09. Any discussions? I recognize Honourable Minister.

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: In Clause 09, substitute Sub Clause 03 with the following Sub Clause 03, after the Minister has studied the report prepared in terms of Sub Section 1, he/she must appoint the board members in question in consultation with Cabinet.

<u>**CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE**</u>: Please submit the amendment. Any discussions on Clause 09 as submitted by the Minister? Any objection? Agreed to.

I put Clause 10 Sub Clause 3. Any discussion Honourable Minister Clause 10 Sub 3?

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Thank you Comrade Chairperson, Clause 10 Sub 3 we are not accepting from the National Council so we are rejecting that particular recommendation proposed.

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON HINDA-MBUENDE

<u>**CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE**</u>: Any objection to that? We retain the original. Any, yes Honourable?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Yes I just want to know (indistinct) not accommodated?

CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Come again?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND <u>IMMIGRATION</u>: What was the recommendation that we are not accepting because we do not have it in front of us? Thank you.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Do you have the amendment?

HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Yes.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Okay you can (intervention) that.

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON JOOSTE

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: If I may Comrade Chair. So the National Council was recommending deleting 10 Sub Section 3 which we do not agree with and I will read that for you.

I quote, "If in the circumstances contemplated in Sub Section 1 a decision of the board is so urgently required that appointment under that Sub Section is not possible the Minister may make a decision on behalf of the board and such decision is deemed to have been taken by the board". Can I explain quickly?

## CHAIRPERSONOF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Yes.

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: So that provision will only be and we discussed this in fact with the National Council. Should only be necessary under highly abnormal circumstances, So an example of that would be if for a particular point in time an entire board of a Public Enterprise were to decide to dissolve or to quit or something happens to them or whatever the case may be then you may have a very short period where certain decisions have to be taken in the absence of an existing board.

So for instance in the delegation of the Authority Framework in a company of Public Enterprise it may for instance say that an amount beyond a certain threshold should require the approval of the board before the Chief Executive Officer may effect such payment. So in an example like that if there is no board to approve something like that the Minister would have to, for that particular point be able to have that authority to mitigate the effects of that.

### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON DR KAWANA / HON HINDA-MBUENDE

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Yes further clarification Attorney General Dr Kawana?

**HON ATTORNEY GENERAL**: Further clarification, it has also been decided by our Courts, High Court and Supreme Court that there must be division of power for purposes of good corporate governance. The duties of the Minister separate from the duties of the board. The duties of the board separated from management and that is really why in terms of the later and spirit of good corporate governance is always good to leave the power and functions where they belong.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: I recognize, no there is somebody who likes, Honourable Hinda-Mbuende.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: The Honourable Attorney General did not complete his sentence. So I want to understand that he is saying that that Clause cannot just be standing at ease.

## CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Ha?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFIARS AND IMMIGRATION: My argument is saying afore as was read by the Minister and it goes back so in the event that there is no board, authority,

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON HINDA-MBUENDE

the fiduciary responsibility is of the board and it becomes rested in the Minister, I do not know what happens if the Minister decide he is dismissing all the board members and then he wants to takethe decision and then he has the power to take that decision and there is no room for consultation with Cabinet.

I think there needs to be a quote and what it then means is that, because the board has got fiduciary responsibilities. If these decisions or the responsibilities meaning the liabilities as well is rested in the Minister and let us say if the Minister in that capacity as a temporary board member gets sued is that sue then for the Government if he takes a decision that will end up in Court?

All I am trying to say is that I think this Clause needs to be relooked at because the Minister would commit the whole Cabinet if he takes all responsibility of the board and he will be a board member, single board member in the absence of the board. I think it needs second look on it. Thank you.

<u>**CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE**</u>: Yes any clarification? You are of the opinion that still the element, ha?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND <u>IMMIGRATION</u>: I am of the opinion that this thing is expressing us maybe the lawyers and the House can tell us something because it is expressing the whole Cabinet. Number 3, that Council has recommended I am just reading the Sub Clause 03 saying, "If in the circumstances", in fact the heading of the Sub Section is temporary board member.

Now in Sub Section 3 it says, if in the second sentence contemplated in

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON MUHARUKUA

Sub Section 1, now I must read Sub Section 1 first. Sub Section 1 says, "If any time during the term of office the board of the Public Enterprises the offices of all the members of the board becomes vacant or the number of the members of the board is reduced to less than a number of members required for a quorum of the board and a decision of the board is still urgently required that the appointment under the Sub Section is not possible and that possibility is still with the Minister". That is where the Minister will decide it is not possible to appoint board members. Then it goes on and say, "The Minister may take a decision on behalf of the board".

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Very good. Uhu.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Yes thank you very much Honourable Deputy Chairperson, I just want to, I think the Honourable (intervention).

<u>**CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE**</u>: Yes you have now the floor.

HON MUHARUKWA: Do I?

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: You have now the floor.

125

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON MUHARUKUA

HON MUHARUKUA: Myself?

# <u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Yes you.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Yes I think the Honourable Hinda made it very clear. I do not know I just want to ask whether I understand you correct. Out of your concern came two questions.

The one question, 1. When the Minister acts as the Board we must remember that board member can be sued in a personal capacity a a result of the fiduciary duty they have. When the Minister so acts are we then saying that he can be sued in his personal capacity because he is now a single person, that is one question?

Two, we give all this power to one person and now he has, of course who can by the way dissolve the board, so he dissolves the board and then takes a decision on behalf of the board. So is second question is it not? Is it really what we want to do?

My addition to it is this, I have a three million dollar contract that I want it to be given to a specific company as a Minister. So in my unfettered discretion in consultation in consultation with whoever I dissolve this board and then I act as a board as Minister and grant that contract to X Company for three hundred million dollars that is the results of that particular Clause, that is what I understand the Member to say and I completely agree with her.

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON JOOSTE

<u>**CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE**</u>: So it should go back again, ha? So which one are we saying because the proposal by the National Council has been rejected to retain the original version but we also have a problem with the original version as it was clarified by the others? I will give you the floor Honourable Attorney General. Honourable Minister?

Honourable Prime Minister would you like (laughter)? No it is okay it is a joke, Honourable Minister.

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Can I once again make it easy Comrade Chairperson. As I said earlier that provision will only ever be required under very extreme strange circumstances. Having said that I would equally and we discuss this internally because what I am saying this may only be required once in twenty years if at all but I want to alert to us that such an unnatural circumstance may arise but what I am saying is once again if we feel that we agree with the National Council that that must be deleted entirely for us it would not be a problem because of what I am saying that it will only occur under very strange particular circumstances. It is not a provision that Minister should be utilizing often at all. so these are discussions and by the way a board cannot be dissolved by this Minister without consulting the Cabinet in any case. So in this case (intervention).

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: But it should be reflected.

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON JOOSTE / HON SANKWASA

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: So in this case like I said it will only be when an entire board has and it makes it clear here it says that in cases where there is (intervention).

# <u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COIMMITTEE</u>: Can we listen to one another?

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: In cases where there is no existing board and where the relevant Minister could not appoint and it might actually be for one day, the relevant Minister may be travelling somewhere, the board has all immediately quit their positions and there is no board and the CEO needs to make payment to the bank on an overdraft or whatever as an example and then if there is no one to authorize that CEO in that small window of time then there will be a default and then maybe further action on that Enterprise. Again if we are consensus that we are uncomfortable with that provision and if we thus agree with the proposal of the National Council to believe that provision for the Ministry we would not have a problem with that for the sake of progress.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Do we agree with the National Council or are we saying that we can defer this so that it can be relooked against the background of what was discussed here? Honourable Deputy Minister?

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT**: Comrade Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, when you look at

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

this legislation it is dealing with parastatals and parastatals operate in the private sector. We should therefore, my feeling is that we do not look at it in its own form but in comparative terms with the Companies Act. What does the Companies Act of Namibia say about these issues that we are debating here? Therefore becusae we have to compare these two legislations without putting them in conflict with one another, can we defer this issue. Thank you.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: The issue is this Clause?

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT**: Yes that Clause yes so that we start it in relation to the Companies Act.

<u>CHAIRPERSONOF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Honourable Minister of Higher Education and then Honourable Tom Alweendo you will follow.

**HON MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, TRAINING AND INNOVATION:** Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee I think as already alluded to by my sister Honourable Hinda-Mbuende it is only prudent that to avoid further delays on this important Bill we actually concur with the National Council. Thank you.

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON VENAANI

**<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>**: Are you sure that the National Council one is clear?

# HON MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, TRAINING AND INNOVATION: Yes (indistinct).

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Honourable Venaani and then Honourable Minister.

**HON VENAANI**: I think there is consensus developing in the House that we cannot allow this legislation to pass the way it is because I want to disagree with my brother that legislation in nature are instruments that are meant to pass the test of time. That is why even in our country we have legislations of 1921 still in our books. So even if that would occur in one in ten years or one in twenty years would be wrong because it would put a Minister in conflict of interest with the responsibility of fiduciary duty because the Minister must look after the board.

It is not the board that must look after the Minister. So the minute that the board is not there then the Minister becomes the board and that cannot be allowed. So I would suggest either we defer the Clause or support National Council's provision and move forward but for us to defer a Clause and to come back again then we will have to adjourn probably the whole Bill so that we go and consult much broader because now I realize, thanks to my sister here (intervention).

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON ALWEENDO

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Was it Mbuende?

**HON VENAANI**: Mrs Hinda-Mbuende who has opened our eyes that we need to revisit this thing in context because it is assets that we are talking about for countries and if we allow this Bill just to go haphazardly it could create problems futuristically, my take.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Honourable Minister Alweendo.

**HON MINISTER OF MINES NAD ENERGY**: Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, I would probably want to argue or agree with the ones who say let us not postpone this discussion. The Minister has explained why this Clause was put in there just to say there are cases where for some reasons there is no board and you might then have reason to actually have a decision taken and then we disagree with that. I also probably say maybe we should not allow that. So let us just agree with the National Council to say they leave this and then the Minister is also quite happy with that and therefore he is not actually in disagreement with that and then we take it out and then we continue.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Finally I do agree. So Honourable Minister.

### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON JOOSTE

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Comrade Chairperson and then to the House I just want to confirm that for the many reasons we tabled this Bill we are perfectly happy with that. So on that consensus let us accept the proposal from National Council.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: By the National Council?

HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Yes so completely.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: You delete Sub Paragraph 3 you delete it?

## HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Yes.

<u>**CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE**</u>: It is okay, so agreed. Ha, no she is right. Are you tabling the proposal, it should be certified this. Attorney General, Do you agree that by next week you will legally bring these things with the Attorney General?

HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Yes.

### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON SCHLETTWEIN / HON JOOSTE

<u>**CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE**</u>: So that we can, yes Honourable Minister of Finance.

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Comrade Chairperson, I think we have a problem that we are trying to draft and certify in the House, so if we have agreement to delete it means, in my understanding that we defer and that agreement must then be brought in another amendment to formally do that.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: It is what I was saying, legally otherwise we will be in trouble. So this Sub Clause, it is fine by Tuesday it is okay, it is better to it(indistinct) rather than to quickly do things and we will regret later.

I put Clause, so the Clause 10 Sub Clause 03 is deferred.

I put Clause 17 Sub Clause 01. Any, as proposed by Council, Honourable Minister listen very carefully.

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Comrade Chairperson, may I and if very much procedurally from the Secretariat amongst the amendments the two proposals from the National Council which we are rejecting have not been included in these. So Clause 17 Sub 1 is the second one which we are not agreeing to. So I think procedurally that one will also have to be certified then by the Attorney General for tabling together with the other one on Tuesday.

### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON SCHLETTWEIN / HON DR KAWANA

<u>**CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE**</u>: Okay this one is also deferred till Tuesday. Clause 17 Sub Clause 01, Honourable Minister of Finance?

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Comrade Chairperson, I do not want to make the process difficult but I for one gets now confused which amendments we are talking about and which ones not. Should we not defer the whole lot and ask for a fresh set of amendments so that we know that we have the Bill that we can look at. That is the reverse that I would have, thank you.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Let us how far we can go maybe the others are okay. Let us see how far we can go. Okay Attorney General?

**HON ATTORNEY GENERAL**: Comrade Deputy Chairperson, this is maybe the first time in the history of this Chamber to go to and fro, to and fro, if we defer the whole thing to come (indistinct).

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: We will defeat.

**HON ATTORNEY GENERAL**: And then again both provisions which we have not considered there will be other queries then we defer again.

## 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL RT HON DR KUUGONGENLWA-AMADHILA / HON JOOSTE

My proposal is why do we not go through and then we see which ones we have difficulties which require further consultations so that we just zero in on those ones so that when we come here we just deal with those ones otherwise (intervention).

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: I should think prudently we should do that.

**HON ATTORNEY GENERAL**: It is the second time now that this Bill is deferred.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Yes prudently we should do that. I will now put Clause 21 Sub (b). Honourable Minister, just read it even (intervention).

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: In Clause 21 substitute paragraph (b) with the following paragraph (b) declare and paying such dividends Sub 1 As it agreed to between the board and the Minister or,

2. If no agreement has been reached as is directed in writing by the Minister with the concurrence of the Minister responsible for Finance.

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL RT HON DR KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

<u>**CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE**</u>: Please submit the amendments. Any discussions on this? Yes the Right Honourable Prime Minister.

**<u>RT HON PRIME MINISTER</u>**: I thought there was an agreement between the Minister of Finance and the Minister of Public Enterprises because it is an editorial issue, it is not a substantive issue. But that editorial issue can affect the interpretation of the provision because the current formulation says, "A dividend can be declared based on an agreement between the board and the Minister and only where such agreement cannot be reached would the Minister when he has to give director to the board instead of seeking the agreement, it is only then that the Minister can get the concurrence, is required to get the concurrence of the Minister of Finance. I just want to get the understanding of the lawyers whether I can actually understand, I as already binding the Minister to get the concurrency of the Minister of Finance because that is of critical importance.

That dividend agreement the Government as a shareholder in the company and the Minister of Finance responsible for Treasury which sometimes in that huge amount to capitalize this company, we should somehow be in agreement when this company decides on dividends. So I am happy if Attorney General says actually every time the board and the Minister must agree, the Minister of Finance must concur. But if we are saying it is only when the Minister has to override the board and direct them instead of seeking the agreement that that Minister has to consult the Minister of Finance. I think that formulation may create a problem for us. Yes but maybe to formulate.

### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON SCHLETTWEIN / HON DR KAWANA

## <u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Honourable Minister of Finance.

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Comrade Chairperson, I think the issue that the Right Honourable Prime Minister raised is correct and it may have been slipped through when we were drafting it. The principle behind consulting really is not only relevant when there is no agreement between the board and the Minister but it should always be there because the principle function of perjury is the custodian of all the essence and also make sure that dividends from State Owned Enterprises are commensurate with the needs of the Government. So the proposal would be to shift the concurrency of the Minister of Finance into the Sub (b) declare and pay any dividends with the concurrency of the Minister of Finance as agreed so that we have it in both cases for upfront.

<u>**CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:</u>** Yes, what do you have? Do you have amendment? What does your amendment seek? Because he has, when was this instructed? It should be deferred for, yes Honourable Attorney General.</u>

**HON ATTORNEY GENERAL**: Comrade Chairperson, I agree with my Honourable Colleague but this must be deferred because (ii) will have to be deleted. Yes (ii) has to be deleted so we defer this so that we bring upfront concurrency with the Minister responsible for Finance in the (b) there. So we require piece of, yes, so if we can defer it better then (ii) will become redundant.

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON HINDA-MBUENDE

<u>**CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:**</u> Okay I will follow the flicking. I recognize your Deputy before you, Honourable?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Yes Chairperson of the Whole House Committee I think it is important that we look at the original Bill and look at the amendments.

The original Bill that was there also was saying 21 Sub Section (b), there is a whole paragraph that is totally omitted on this page of amendments. It says, "Declared and pay such dividends as is agreed to between the board and the Minister subject to the approval by Cabinet or as in direction by Cabinet or pending agreements as the Minister directs in writing".

Now all that I do not know what is meant by this dash and then the two Roman things that are added whether the Cabinet is totally disregarded or is that different English? Thank you.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: And henceforth the need to, yes?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOIME AFFAIRS AND <u>IMMIGRATION</u>: Thank you, I agree with the deferment but all I am saying is the deferment but still look into what was already there and not just what is formulated on this paper. Thank you.

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON KAPOFI

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Yes Honourable Minister Kapofi.

**HON MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION**: I just want to understand the principle of concurrency by the Minister of Finance because is there a likelihood that the Minister of Finance is likely not to agree on the dividends? Now if he does not agree meaning that he is likely to agree to demand or what? Is that the purpose of the concurrence?

HON MEMBER: (Not on microphone).

HON MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION:

Because you see, no I understand that but I suppose the Minister responsible for the enterprises is just a Minister like the Minister of Finance and are we saying that other Minister is not as a Minister of Finance or he is not able to judge? As we defer I want us to look at that principle because the Minister of Finance, there is a Minister who started the responses of these enterprises and now we are linking that Minister and we are subjecting that to the other, why are we doing that?

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Because of the custodian of money, okay I will finalise it before you come in but we agree that let us discuss it and we defer it. Okay Honourable Shixwameni.

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON SHIXWAMENI

**HON SHIXWAMENI**: Thank you, Honourable Deputy Speaker. I think three differences are too much. Let us just simply propose to think that there is disagreement even amongst Cabinet Ministers. Let us just propose that the rest of the remaining amendments that we stop discharging these amendments. There are only three amendments that are there, let us stop really discussing these amendments so that the Attorney General, the Minister of Finance could agree because there seems to be I mean the amendments were certified in the first instance. I would blame the Attorney General because the amendments were certified by the Attorney General.

HON MEMBER: (Not on microphone).

**HON SHIXWAMENI**: What? So they were 35 by the Attorney General and now the Attorney General stands up and both of these agree on the floor. So I am puzzled now as to what is what. So for me in the true sense of your work we are to be honest, these further amendments would have to be adjourned to the time that the Minister proposes Tuesday so that they can have tomorrow and the whole weekend to consult and bring back this amendments. The ones that are passed have been passed but I think we are wasting time that the Cabinet and the Attorney General are to (interrupted) here together.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Yes, yes it is okay but there is a saying in my mother tongue (Oshiwambo) when you have lice on your body you will not be able to pick it up with one finger. It means that although the Minister of Justice, Attorney General and the concerned Minister have agreed. There is a possibility when they

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON MUHARUKUA

agree, when it comes here 1, 2 and 3 Members will pinpoint some of the elements (intervention).

HON SHIXWAMENI: (Not on microphone).

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: No it I okay this time they will take into consideration what we are bringing on the floor and when they go and come back they have to take into consideration what was discussed. It is not a lot. So we defer Clause 21. Clause 29?

HON MUHARUKUA: What is wrong with that?

**<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>**: Come again?

HON MUHARUKUA: What is wrong with that on display?

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: No, I am saying I put Clause 29? I thought, okay we can hear if you have got a different view or additional view and you will be the last also Honourable Minister.

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON MUHARUKUA

**HON MUHARUKWA**: Chairperson, I totally agree with you, I was of the opinion that the whole thing must be deferred but I do agree with the Honourable Attorney General and what you have just said and this is what we have been trying to tell (indistinct). Please do not arrest me.

## CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Yes?

**HON MUHARUKWA**: This is what we have been trying to tell Government all the time (Herero). Since that the Prime Minister, what this particular amendment is doing it actually takes boards out of the decision making in terms of preparing dividends because the two Ministers agreed in Cabinet already that this is the dividend that will accrue to Government because we need the revenue. It goes to the board, the board does not agree because it will maybe collapse the parastatal and then it says well I will just get the concurrence of the Minister of Finance.

So that is one problem. However, I will also agree with the argument that the Right Honourable Prime Minister has taken. Government should always have an input and perhaps through the person who is the custodian of the State coffers, how is the economic outlook. So I agree with that but I am seeing another problem and maybe this is actually the reason why I rose and it is the use of the word 'concurrence'. If we are saying the board, the Minister responsible and the Minister of Finance must concur that is to say that there must be a unanimous decision of these three office bearers or institutions.

How I saw this Clause is quite the problem that I said is there. It was sort of, that the Ministry of Finance was sort of the Trump cart in that where the two cannot decide he is the sort of referee between the two. Now in the event that we are saying that maybe we go and change, yes he or she in the

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON ALWEENDO

event that we are saying that the three must now concur that will bring us another problem. What if one of them does not concur? I am just foreseeing that problem so that when it is going to be drafted we have that in mind because that is why we are discussing although we agree that you are going to defend. So that when the drafters are going to draft they must also have in mind that there is a possibility that maybe the three one of them might disagree then we sit because now the Minister of Finance and the Minister agrees but the board does not agree but the law requires concurrence. If you are using the word 'concurrence' bluntly then you are saying there must be unanimous decision. So we must have that in mind when we are going to have amendments.

<u>**CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE**</u>: You will be the last. I recognize Honourable Tommy Alweendo and then Honourable Kavekotora will be the last.

**HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY**: Honourable Chairperson, I have lost my line of thoughts so I (incomplete). You hear so many things but I think what I agree with to defer the Clause I think it is important really to have the principle because companies only declare dividends when they make profits and you have got the Minister of Public Enterprises who actually run this who represent Government on this as the shareholder.

Now when we say there must be concurrence between the two Ministers is now of course probably when the company says yes we made profits but we cannot declare dividends or we only declare so much and not so much. Now we want Finance to be able to say no, this is not enough and therefore declare this right. I do not really think that is really right thought. I really think the Minister of Public Enterprises should be the

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON DR KAWANA

one to determine with the board to say no this is the dividend we are going to pay to the shareholder, after all he is the shareholder.

So are we not actually saying it is right to say the Minister of Finance can bind the Minister of Public Enterprise in terms of how much money to be paid? But I agree that let us go and consult but we might have been confused with the principles of what we are talking about.

# <u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Okay Attorney General.

**HON ATTORNEY GENERAL**: Comrade Chairperson, my friend has left the Chamber I wanted to explain. Some of these things have nothing to do with whether this issue is unconstitutional or it is in conflict with law, it is an issue of policy. In fact this exercise when this document will be retained my Learned Colleagues here has passed off that consultation. I want to clarify that but obviously sometimes people reflect which is normal but I wanted to clarify something.

You know if you check in most of our laws this expression my Learned Colleague with the concurrence of the Minister responsible for Finance you will find this in most of our legislation. When it comes for example fees, sitting fees of boards whatever this is the standard language we use. Chair, you will see that it is standard language.

I wanted really to clarify that so much so that on issues of finance the Minister responsible for Finance has if you like, veto powers that is what it means with the concurrence. If he does not concur nothing will go through and this is already in various of our laws particularly when it comes to fees and whatever some of what we call now sitting allowances,

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON KAVEKOTORA

remuneration of some, you will see a number of these provisions are in our laws so unless we want to change now to say but otherwise I just wanted to assure you that this expression 'with the concurrence of the Minister responsible for Finance' is already part of our law. But for me really this discussion is very useful so that when we defer then we take into account the consensus of this House. That is why really we go Clause by Clause, we take into account which one and maybe the consensus and so forth otherwise we go, come back the same colleagues will rise again on some of these things.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: I recognize Honourable Kavekotora and then Honourable Minister of Information and Communication Technology (ICT) and then we must finalise ha, yes.

**HON KAVEKOTORA**: Thank you Honourable Deputy Chair of the Whole House Committee thank you very much I just want to make a few comments on this particular Clause and I wanted to relate to what Honourable Alweendo was saying. The issue of dividend declaration the way it stands here it becomes something for negotiation and I think if we listen very carefully to what Honourable Sankwasa was saying there are some governance issues when it comes to the declaration of dividends.

First of all dividends can only be declared when a profit is made, one. Two, the board has to indicate the project that they are busy with that they need money for and one point the first contact point will be the dividend the excess amount of money that the company has made. Now if it becomes an issue where the Minister and the Minister responsible for Finance now negotiates as to what is the amount to be paid and so on I think we are actually breaching some corporate governance issues. I

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON SANKWASA

think it is important for us not to do that because if we do that that will put us in a much difficult situation. I really think that this Clause (ii) should not be there under this Clause 21 (ii), should not be there because that is basically making the whole issue of dividend declaration something to be negotiated on. But unless you say the Minister responsible for Public Enterprises will have to look at the justification as to why dividends are to be declared or why dividends cannot be declared as the board make a submission, that will make for me a better sense than to say it becomes an issue between the three parties to negotiate and the Minister of Finance says no I have to cut the budget deficit therefore you must increase the dividend that you declared that to me does not make any sense. Thank you.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: I recognize, I said who is next? Okay for the sake of time let us not repeat ourselves. Let us bring new proposals, new ideas.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT**: Thank you Comrade Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, you see the reason why I wanted you to come to me first was to avoid Honourable Kavekotora stealing the issues that I wanted to raise *(laughter)*. He did that digitally anyway.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Then you agree?

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON HINDA-MBUENDE

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT**: That stealing is not Parliamentarian so I will modify that, borrowing you know what I wanted to say. Now Comrade Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Kavekotora is right. Declaration of dividends is not a decision that any company makes arbitrary. First of all that decision is supposed to be grounded in what is supposed to be a place called a Dividend Policy that is the starting point for any company operating as a company, it is supposed to have a Dividend Policy.

So on the basis of that policy the company would say I am declaring a dividend therefore I also tend to agree that that (ii) should be struck out. So that we simply remain with (i).

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Okay thank you for the sake of time, thank you very much. If a certain Member of Parliament says this and you agree you just stand up and say I agree and I support, so that is all. Honourable Mareen Hinda-Mbuende.

HON MEMBER: Is there one or two?

CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: One.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Hinda-Mbuende I thank you.

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON HINDA-MBUENDE

# CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Oh two neh?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND <u>IMMIGRATION</u>: Chairperson of the Whole House Committee (interruptions).

<u>CHAIRPEROSN OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: No, please ignore and proceed.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION**: I think I have the advantage of sitting with the Draft Bill itself. If I follow the arguments what we are actually referring to it is in Clause (a) and with the permission of the Chairperson of the Whole House Committee if I can just read quickly the Clause 21 Sub Section (a) says, "Annually at such time as the Minister may determine submit to the Minister a proposal on the distribution of its profits for the five Financial Year and the declaration of dividends" and then it comes to Sub Section (b).

So I just want to submit to say that the discussions we just had suggest a whole relook at the whole Sub Section 21 because the aspect of the decision in terms of what has to be declared as dividends, at what time is to be proposed by the Minister to the Minister and then the Sub Section (b). So I think I want to submit to say that the Drafting needs to look at the whole Clause 21 instead of only Sub Section (b) I thank you.

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON JOOSTE

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: I should think we all agree to defer this Clause 21. What do you want to say Honourable Minister? Please go ahead and then we (incomplete). Do you still want to say something?

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Thank you Comrade Chair, I probably am going to say with the Minister of Finance will be touching on as well and I agree formally once again that we defer this and bring it back on Tuesday. Why you are correct in saying what you are saying, remember that according to the progression of the State Finance Act, Treasury is responsible in the State Finance Act for all State assets. Now State assets include the assets of Public Enterprises so that is why it is applicable and relevant and this is where the difference between normal companies and Public Enterprises or State Owned Companies come in that the Minister of Finance should form part of that consultation and decision making. It is completely normal. So I concur let us defer this and bring it back on Tuesday.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Okay agreed. Very good, I put (interruptions). Yes so Clause 21 turned over. I put Clause 29. Any discussions Honourable Minister?

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Yes please. Comrade Chair, before I read it please in this (intervention).

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON JOOSTE / HON HIND-MBUENDE

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Sorry before you proceed. Please you go and come back because there is a likelihood that the quorum is being threatened. You go and come back. Okay proceed.

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Okay Comrade Chairperson, so please listen to me before I read this Clause the only difference is capital letters nothing letters. So please do not make it more difficult than it is already. Your colleague, I first stand grey and I have lost most of my hair, there is not much left so please preserve your colleague, in Clause 29 substitute paragraph (a) of Sub Clause 04 with the following paragraph, exactly the same as it was. So it is (a), there is reason to suspect that any corrupt activity has occurred he or she must refer the report to the Anti Corruption Commission with capital letters established by Section 2 of the Anti Corruption Act 2003, Act No.8 of 2003. I so submit.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Yes submit the amendment. Any discussion? I recognize Honourable Hinda-Mbuende.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION:** Thank you Chairperson of the Whole House Committee. If I could call the attention of the Minister in terms of the amendment on what he has read and what is on the paper. Initially it was referred to as Anti Corruption Act, yes the corruption in small letters, Act 2003, Act No.28 of 2003. The amendment reads Anti Corruption with a capital A of 2003, Act No.8 of 2003. Is it 28 or is it 8, the Anti Corruption

# 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON JOOSTE / RT HON DR KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

Act, is it Act 8 or is it Act 28? I thank you.

<u>**CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:</u>** Honourable Minister is it 28? Attorney General, yes Honourable Minister.</u>

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Comrade Chair, the Attorney General certified I would like for that to come from the Attorney General.

<u>**CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE**</u>: It is 28 because there is a 2, who put the 2 there Honourable Minister? Yes Right Honourable Prime Minister.

**<u>RT HON PRIME MINISTER</u>**: It is 28 yes (intervention).

<u>CHAIRPERSONOF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: It is just a typing error.

**<u>RT HON PRIME MINISTER</u>**: I believe that it would help us to just take note of what Honourable Maureen Hinda has said and then you go and check because it may be an editorial that needs to be checked so that we do not end up with a situation where then have been several versions

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON DR KAWANA / HON NEKUNDI

and now you are referring to one and I believe really that if it is 28 then that can even fall under editorial they should be able to correct it but I think we should thank her that she was able to detect that.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Yes thank you, Honourable Attorney General Dr Kawana.

**HON ATTORNEY GENERAL**: Comrade Chairperson, I think it is 8 here but normally the procedure is this once this Bill is passed in terms of the rules that we have been using for the past 29 years then the actual drafter will still have to go through. (Interruptions)

It is 8, yes, now we have to go through to correct those typos before that Bill is sent to State House for the President to assent it. Normally that is the procedure but I recognize the inputs of my colleagues.

**<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>**: There is no harm also to do that when it comes on Tuesday. Any new, I should think your neighbour Honourable Nekundi, you have something to say?

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Yes very small. The Act what is right, the Act is 8, that is the right one and I think that should be the one which must be accepted and not 28 there is nothing like that.

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON SCHLETTWEIN

# CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Ha?

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Act 8 of 2003 that is the right Act.

<u>**CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE**</u>: We will see the right version and terminology on Tuesday. So this Clause is also deferred to next Tuesday. Ys Clause 29, Honourable Minister of Finance.

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Comrade Chairperson, I think now that we are certain that it is Act No.8 it can be agreed.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Yes because that is the correct one.

CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Ha?

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: It is Act No.8.

CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Yes.

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON JOOSTE / HON HINDA-MBUENDE

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: So the amendment can be agreed for it has to be deferred.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: I put Clause 37. Any discussions? Honourable Minister?

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Thank you Comrade Chairperson. The only amendment yes after Clause 37 substitute the heading Chapter 7 with the heading Chapter 6. I hope that is not complicated.

<u>**CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE**</u>: Submit the amendment. Yes any discussions on the amendment put forward. Ha, sorry?

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION**: ...please allow to air and highlight the discussions and whether the Minister is allowed to make the suggestic additions that he makes (indistinct). It gives me the feeling, I need to be educated whether it is wrong to highlight what we want to discuss. When we discuss, the Minister said I hope it is not complicated. I want to understand (intervention).

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON HINDA-MBUENDE / HON JOOSTE

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Which Minister of Deputy Minister?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Minister of Public Enterprises, I want to understand from procedure, the Chairperson of the Whole House Committee to make the ruling whether those utterances are allowed because it is intimidating.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: We take note of your fruitful contribution and as I said (Oshiwambo), when you have lies on your body you will not be able to pick it up with one finger but two fingers. All the opinions and correction is allowed. It is allowed.

Okay I put Clause, did we say 37? Yes 37 is agreed to.

I put Clause 40, any discussions?

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Substitute Clause 40 with the following Clause, exemptions 40 upon application by Public Enterprises and on good cause shown the Minister may, in consultation with Cabinet by Notice in the Gazette exempt the Public Enterprises from any of the provisions of this Act. I so submit.

**<u>CHAIRPERSON</u>**: Okay Honourable Minister submit the amendment. Any discussion? Honourable Chief Whip. You may have something to say on Clause 4 0. I recognize Honourable Minister of Finance.

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON SCHLETTWEIN / HON MUHARUKUA

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Chairperson, I do appreciate that I was part of the discussions but the Attorney General said we can reflect. Now I have a question here, if we have a provision that a member of the Executive can exempt (a) entity of any of the provisions of the Act, is that tantamount to stay in the Act and would that not be problematic in terms of the provision that follow where an Act of Parliament is stayed or suspended by an Executive? It maybe sound absurd because the attempt is not the whole Act but if the words and the Act says 'any' then it can be the whole Act. I think the attempt is, any one of the provisions instead of all and maybe the lawyers can help me with an answer. Thank you.

# <u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Yes Honourable.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I agree with the Minister of Finance. This thing is actually problematic and we have other examples and I am going to come to it now I do not want to mention it before I make a point of this and even if we are to say any one of the provisions, I think that is a problem.

The Minister can decide that, say for instance as a Clause, I do not have the full Bill in front of me that talks about any corrupt activities must be reported to the Anti Corruption Commission (ACC). The Minister can then decide that except for, when that refers to maybe TransNamib hypothetically but that is just a loose gamble I am using for lack of better examples. So I think we must express State things that will mean should be in the powers of the Minister.

I will give you an example, currently we have an Electoral Act. We have Parties that agreed to have the EVMs based on the fact that the verifiable

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON MUHARUKUA

paper trails will come. Parliament goes ahead and gives the power to the Minister the power to invoke the Act as at various times as he sees fit. The Minister goes and circumvent the part that talks about the verifiable paper trail and takes that out defeating completely the intention of the agreement of all the Parties to do what, to want an EVM reaching a completely unintended results.

Now we have an EVM without verifiable paper trail. So when we give the Minister such powers I think we must define the confines within which such Minister can exercise that power because this is a blanket unfettered power. Basically he can say look we were now talking, of course there is no consensus on whether the Ministry of Finance has veto power or whether the Government must now deploy and share the dividends at the AGM Corporate Government, that the Minister basically this Clause makes that whole conversation whether we amended it or did not amend it makes that whole conversation redundant.

The Minister can go and say good as far as the dividends of TransNamib or Air Namibia if they were to make money at some point in life, as far as those dividends are concerned the Minister of Finance has no say in it. So basically what we have said here of course in consultation with Cabinet we understand it takes it completely irrelevant and it is quite a fusion of power. So we must really define what we are giving the Minister power to circumvent the Act in terms of.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Okay who is next? Attorney General, maybe you can be the last ha after hearing, I recognize Honourable Kapofi followed by Honourable Fleermuys.

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON KAPOFI / RT HON KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

# **HON MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION**: Comrade Chairperson, thank you again for the floor. I took note that we want some that Cabinet is fully informed and is involved that is why we are insisting on the words 'in consultation' with the Cabinet. I want to ask a question maybe it might not be answered today but maybe later on by Honourable Attorney General.

The Constitution says Ministers are personally accountable to the President in Parliament. Now when you say the Minister is compelled because when you say 'in consultation', he/she is compelled to consult. Should that go wrong who is accountable, is it the Cabinet or the Minister, her or himself because that Minister is necessarily not independent to take that decision. When accountability then comes who is accountable?

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: In consultation I should think it will protect the Minister to be wholly alone held accountable but it is how I think. But you said it is food for thought, Honourable Minister Kapofi, you said it is food for thought you do not need, yes.

**RT HON PRIME MINISTER**: Can I also ask?

CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Follow up?

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON FLEERMUYS

**<u>RT HON PRIME MINISTER</u>**: Yes and it is a response but I think it should also be understood in full context that that constitutional provision also says Cabinet, the Minister are also collectively accountable for the work of Cabinet. So we need to strike a balance between the powers and responsibilities of Ministers and also the powers of the Cabinet because one can also ask a question, if you have up to, let me say 50% or 60% of the State assets in companies that are administered by twenty different Ministers but you are responsible when the State goes bankrupt let me say for example, as a Minister of Finance where do you strike the balance if every Minister now decides to say this Clause?

So it is an important point he is raising and we have to think about it but I believe that eventually when Ministers are held accountable they are for the most part held accountable in their official capacity and until they have acted either negligently or corruptly, in that case they will then be held individually accountable personally.

**CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE**: Who, okay I recognize Honourable Fleermuys.

**HON FLEERMUYS**: Thank you Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee. This one reminds me of something which is going around in our country side and inside Windhoek when children have to be transported by Government vehicles (intervention).

# <u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: When who?

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON FLEERMUYS

**HON FLEERMUYS**: When children are transported with Government vehicles from whether it is going somewhere for sports or whatsoever the parents are subjected by the teachers to exempt the Government whatever happens alongside the road to have responsibilities to whatever could have happened there. So this one reminds me to that issue that if the Minister is allowed to do that then all of a sudden it will happen like those people what happens with our children and parents who are demanded they must sign a form to exempt the Government for paying for the losses which parents have got from maybe motor vehicle accidents. So it is already in the Government structure that people are forced to sign forms for exemption. So if we allow this one what would happen? Thank you Honourable Chairperson.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Honourable Minister of Finance.

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Honourable Chairperson, I do believe that Honourable Member may be confusing indemnities with exemptions *(laughter)* and I think just to put him (indistinct) address what you are asked to sign by parents is a declaration that you indemnify the State or the car that the driver of the car that drives your children from any liability that may be caused but it is not exempting anyone from any provision of law.

HON FLEERMUYS: That is what is written on the paper?

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON DR KAWANA

**HON MINISTER**: No it does not again, it is just an indemnity but it is not an exemption for (intervention).

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Yes thank you for that clarification. Honourable Attorney General, let us go back.

**HON ATTORNEY GENERAL**: Yes thank you very much Comrade Chairperson. My Learned Colleague can listen because he raised some issues which I want to respond to. In law there is nothing that prevents Parliament from delegating certain legislative powers to an Executive.

HON MUHARUKWA: Delegating the Executive?

**HON ATTORNEY GENERAL**: Yes there are what we call numerous cases in South Africa also in Namibia. For example even a number of our laws say the Minister can still by regulations do that to the law even to impose fines. That is delegated power. Yes that is delegated power from Parliament to a Member of the Executive and that is lawful. It has been decided as such. Now my Learned Colleague raised one issue regarding the provision of the Electoral Act of 2014.

HON MEMBER: (Not on microphone).

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON DR KAWANA

**HON ATTORNEY GENERAL**: No I want to refer my learned Colleague to the High Court case because that case resolved that issue once and for all, RDP and others, no I want to give you the case. I am giving you the case the High Court case, RDP and Others versus the Electoral Commission of Namibia and Others. Read that case of 2014 where RDP even lost with costs precisely on that point of paper trail, yes. Read that case.

HON KAVEKOTORA: (Not on microphone).

**HON ATTORNEY GENERAL**: In fact the Presidential candidate of RDP, I can even give you a copy of that High Court what we call judgment but I do not know since you lost with costs I have to go and check whether you paid those costs *(laughter)*.

So in short those cases are settled. If the Parliament delegates there are nothing wrong with that. For example in this particular provision let me give you one example. Maybe it is a Trust that is established for good cause, for charitable purposes and the Minister in his wisdom feels that should this draft really pay dividends. When it is for example involved in what we call case citation and so forth so the Minister will say let me check with Cabinet and the Cabinet will say go ahead exempt this Trust from paying dividends.

That is the purpose of this law. So we need not to say everything no, there will be genuine cases which will warrant the Minister to exempt certain provisions of the law. The example I have given the example because this covers both Parastatals, Trusts and so there will be those legitimate cases which we have to take into account.

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON MUHARUKUA

Then there was an issue of the role of Cabinet. I refer Honourable Members to Article 40 of the Namibian Constitution whereby Cabinet has a role to play in terms of the running policies pertaining to Parastatals, that is contained in Article 40 of the Supreme Law of our land the Constitution. I so submit.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Yes, we were still commenting on Clause 40 as submitted can we concentrate on that Clause. You briefly said what you want to say, what you want to amend and what you do not agree with and you made your proposal here in a very brief summary. I recognize Honourable Muharukua.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Thank you Honourable Deputy Speaker. Honourable Attorney General, I completely agree that *(intervention)*.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE CHOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: I hope the people will be *(incomplete)*.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Parliament can never foresee all the circumstances that will happen after a Bill has become law that is why that definition is there. But it is also trite and I believe we will confirm that when we give regulations, at times we say go make regulations. At times we say regulations with regards to a, b, c, d and e. Now the example I used was not for us to be bogged down into the example of, into the EVM discussion that is maybe there is the case between Sheehapo and RDP as the word goes. But the Prime Minister is now catching but the principal

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON MUHARUKUA

that they want to address is and it is when Court eventually is to decide on whether Cabinet and the Minister got delegated by Parliament unfettered discretion, unfettered power, unchecked to circumvent this Act in relation to specific Parastatals.

That is where I raised that point that we must be able to say and define things and say as far as, with the exception of yes Section A, B, C and D the Minister in consultation with Cabinet can exempt specific Parastatals to do what, to abuse, to advert or prevent the abuse of this Clause, to circumvent the intention of this very Bill and perhaps certain principals of good corporate governance. Like the example I used for example the example where the verifiable paper trail was used to circumvent the whole intention of the introduction of the EVMs so that Court tomorrow does not go and say yes but Parliament actually just gave that hope out to the Minister (*intervention*).

HON ATTORNEY GENERAL: Yes concerning that paper.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: No the High Court said that. The High Court said that because it did not do what I am proposing and that is the problem. Today some Parties are crying others are laughing because they did not foresee what I am foreseeing here.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Okay Deputy Minister of Public Enterprises yes.

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON NEKUNDI

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Thank you very much Comrade Chairperson. I did take note of what Comrade Kawana is saying. However, as my mind was running *(interruptions)*.

HON MUHARUKUA: What is (not on microphone).

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Yes please continue. Yes 40?

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Yes 40, my understanding to it I think it is providing a difficulty *(intervention)* 

## CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Who?

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: It is providing a difficulty.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: That Clause that when you look at even under 38 it also clearly gives the guidance on what should regulations be based on. That means that Parliament because Parliament is approving the law, the Act or the Bills, it exactly knows that the regulations will be covering area A, B up to there,

# COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON NEKUNDI

it is known. So to the principals of what should be exempted, Parliament as a lawmaking institution must exactly know which area should the Minister in consultation with Cabinet in which areas are given delegated authority to exempt. Otherwise then there will be no need for you to have the Act or the Bill at all because then the Minister and the Cabinet will then do change the whole Act unknowingly so that it implies that the whole Parliament is approving a Bill and that Bill when it is approved can be added without Parliament knowing what can be added. I think from that principle understanding it would be in the right thinking prescribe what the Clauses are that could be exempted upon. I think it should be the right approach.

<u>**CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE**</u>: Okay I hope as a Deputy Minister of the Ministry concerned when they sit you must also be there to assist (intervention).

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Are you directing Comrade Chairperson?

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: No I am proposing. Come again?

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: No I am asking, is the Chairperson directing?

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON JOOSTE / HON HINDA-MBUENDE

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: No it is a prudent advice. Very prudent advice I should think. I recognize Honourable, you finished, okay so we agree that this Clause should also be, ha? Should be deferred, neh, okay.

I put Clause 42, any discussions?

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: In Clause 42 substitute paragraph (b) of Sub Clause 06 with the following paragraph: (b) The Public Enterprise performs a public function and is substantially funded from any money appropriated by Parliament or from levies imposed by law.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Please submit the amendment. Any comment? Any comment on the proposal, I recognize Honourable Maureen Hinda-Mbuende.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: It is just a capital letter.

CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Yes?

#### 28 March 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE – RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON HINDA-MBUENDE

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: No I was trying now to say the capital letter of Parliament.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: Of Parliament yes so you agree with it?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Thank you.

<u>CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE</u>: So agreed. I will report, this is the last amendment we are going to consider. I am going to report progress and ask leave to sit again.

## **ASSEMBLY RESUMES**

Progress reported and leave granted to sit again.

CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:

Honourable Speaker, I am going to report progress and ask leave to sit again.

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON KAVEKOTORA HON DR MUSHELENGA

# **RESPONSE TO QUESTION**

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you. I am sure you agree with me, that is as far as we can go and for the time left we should revert back to question time. Can we have a go? Thank you.

Question 05 from the Honourable Mike Kavekotora. Do you put the question?

**HON KAVEKOTORA**: I put the question (indistinct).

**HON SPEAKER**: And the question is directed to the Minister of Urban and Rural Development. Honourable Minister you have the floor.

**HON MINISTER OF URBAN AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:** Honourable Speaker, I beg the indulgence of the Honourable Member for this question to stand over to next week.

**HON SPEAKER**: Can we (laughter), well Minister would like the question to stand over. We will accept and move on to the next question. Question number 16 from the Honourable Venaani, do you put the question?

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON VENAANI RT HON DR KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

HON VENAANI: Yes I put the question.

**HON SPEAKER**: The question is directed to the Right Honourable Prime Minister.

**QUESTION 16:** 

**<u>RT HON PRIME MINISTER</u>**: Honourable Speaker, this question first and foremost I must prelude my response by saying that the Honourable Venaani had published an open letter in the newspapers addressed to me with regards to the matter of the appointment of the Deputy Executive Director at the Ministry of Finance and he made a number of references that questions the integrity of the senior Government officials and those references were unfortunately not correct that is first and foremost.

Secondly the prelude to these questions reads as follows: "It was reported a few months ago that Government has appointed a Deputy Executive Director in the Ministry of Finance to a tune of N\$1,100,000 per annum". I would say that is incorrect. That is incorrect and therefore all the other questions that follow because the next statement says, hence the following: "Because the Government has appointed a Deputy Executive Director at N\$1,100,000 hence the following question". So my information is there is no such appointment at this remuneration package. As far as I know the Deputy Executive Director at that Ministry is appointed on a package that is approved for other Deputy Executive Directors and if the Honourable has any evidence to the contrary I will be happy to do that.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Honourable Venaani.

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON KAVEKOTORA HON VENAANI

**HON VENAANI**: Honourable Speaker, the Right Honourable Prime Minister is confusing the leader of Official Opposition with any other person's open letter. I have never written any open letter to you in the Press. So that is also not true.

**<u>RT HON PRIME MINISTER</u>**: You wrote (indistinct).

**HON VENAANI**: That is not true. Maybe it is just imaginary it can never be true. Secondly, there is a fundamental question that the Prime Minister is conveniently, what is that word?

HON MEMBER: Conveniently.

**HON VENAANI**: *(Herero)* Conveniently studying because she is not answering to the question what is the current, are the Executive Director taking the same salaries or not? Answer that fundamental question?

HON SPEAKER: I thought (intervention).

**<u>RT HON PRIME MINISTER</u>**: (Not on microphone).

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON KAVEKOTORA HON VENAANI

HON VENAANI: (Not on microphone).

**HON SPEAKER**: No this is not a dialogue. It is not a dialogue let me come back?

HON VENAANI: It is a fundamental question.

**HON SPEAKER**: Let me come back. I heard the Prime Minister saying the person in question is being emulated at the same level as other similar cases and unless if I missed that I thought that is what I heard. Ha?

HON VENAANI: Read question one?

**<u>RT HON PRIME MINISTER</u>**: Let me read the question.

(HON VENAANI AND PRIME MINISTER HAVING DIALOGUE)

**HON SPEAKER**: Okay I was trying to be helpful but I will leave it at that. Question number 22 is the question from the Honourable Agnes Limbo. Do you put the question?

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON VAN DEN HEEVER HON DR MUSHELENGA

**<u>RT HON PRIME MINISTER</u>**: Last question (not on microphone).

**HON SPEAKER**: No I am over. Do you put the question and the question is directed to the Minister of Health and Social Services. Both colleagues are not in the House so we move on.

Question number 23 from the Honourable Van Den Heever. Do you put the question? The question from the Honourable Van Den Heever?

HON MUHARUKWA: Yes.

**HON SPEAKER**: Do you put the question? The question is directed to the Minister of Urban and Rural Development. Minister you have the floor.

**QUESTION 23:** 

**HON MINISTER OF URBAN AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT**: Yes Honourable Speaker, the question was, how does my Ministry deal with individuals who operate in certain areas without clearance certificates? I wish to respond as follows:

In terms of Section 30 Sub Section 1 of the Local Authorities Act of 1992 as amended, read together with the general head regulations of 1969 as amended and specifically Section 8 of the Hawker Regulation and Section 29 of Section 2 of the Trees Regulation, Local Authorities are empowered to issue fitness certificates. In terms of these regulations Local Authorities

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON VAN DEN HEEVER HON DR MUSHELENGA

may allow in a regulated manner activities such as street vendors or hawkers which are mobile units to operate with prior approval of a Local Authority. Their business activities on a temporary basis and from or using structures that have to be removed at the end of the day.

From my enquiries with Rehoboth Town Council, Council has admitted to the uncontrolled activities as stated by the Honourable Members and that Council is taking remedial measures. I am informed that Council under the leadership of my appointed representative at the town Mr Talie /Ogases has already among others engaged street vendors and visited owners who are involved and aggrieved by the current situation with a view to correct the situation. I would want the Honourable two Members to pay attention because the question came from their Party, the two Members having (indistinct). I want you to draw attention to my answers so that you can inform the Honourable Member.

You can chat later. As a result of these consultative meetings the parties have agreed to establish a Technical Committee consisting of the hawkers, vendors, business owners and officials of Rehoboth Town Council which committee starts to come up with amicable solutions to the identified problems taking due regard of the applicable legislations and bylaws in place. In short, the problem is being addressed through a collaborative process involving all stakeholders.

Question 2: What mechanisms have you put in place to address issues such as the one in Rehoboth where shop owners undertake light or heavy industrial activities in the central business district which cause traffic and create chaos on the roads? I would like to answer as follows:

From my enquiries on Rehoboth Town Council, Council has noted that it is taking corrective action against businesses that are operating contrary to the approved or applicable town planning skills. An example of this is a business that has applied to operate a retail shop but ended up engaging in heavy industrial activities which are not provided for in the planning scheme for the said area. Town Council has assured me that it is taking

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON !AUXAB HON BOOIS

corrective action and in one of such noted cases Town Council has already issued the company with a notice to redirect storage facilities to another site since the activities of that company has been pending traffic flow as well as free pedestrian movements in the streets. I thank you Honourable Speaker.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much and I hope a copy will be made available to the Honourable Member.

Question number 27 from the Honourable Auchab. Do you put the question?

HON !AUXAB: Yes, I put the question.

**HON SPEAKER:** The question is directed to the Minister of Lands Reform. The Deputy Minister is here. Deputy Minister you have the floor.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LAND REFORM**: Thank you very much Honourable Speaker. Honourable Speaker and the Members of the House I want to ask for the indulgence of you that this question be postponed until the 4<sup>th</sup> of April due to certain issues.

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON DIENDA HON DR MUSHELENGA

**HON SPEAKER**: The question stands over Honourable Auchab. Thank you very much. We move to question number 29 and the question is from the Honourable Dienda. Honourable Muharukua, do you put the question?

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you. The question is directed not to the President but the Minister of Urban and Rural Development.

**HON MINISTER OF URBAN AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT**: Honourable Speaker, I beg for the indulgence of the Honourable Member for this question to stand over till next week.

**HON SPEAKER**: The question stands over. Question number 30 from the same Honourable Member. Honourable Muharukua do you put the question on behalf of your colleague.

HON MUHARUKUA: I put the question.

**HON SPEAKER**: The question is directed to the Minister of Information and Communication Technology Honourable Simaata you have the floor.

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON DIENDA HON SIMATAA

## **QUESTION 30:**

**HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY**: Thank you very much Honourable Speaker. Let me start by thanking Honourable Dienda for having raised these questions to which I now have the pleasure to respond as follows. I will not be repeating the questions. I will go straight to the answer for question 1. I would like to state that the NAMPA Board of Directors we appointed in 2015.

The Board of Directors commenced with their duties during the time when the then Chief Executive Officer was preparing to go on retirement. This therefore necessitated the board to initiate the process of hiring a new CEO. The number of meetings was therefore unusually high in the reporting year as a result of the task that the board has to perform.

Additionally two of the board members were residing outside Namibia and had to travel to Namibia to attend board engagements. The two board members in question were the Chairperson of the NAMPA Board of Directors Mr Rector Mutelo who is the spouse of Ambassador Anne Mutelo who is based in Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia. Mr Mutelo at times had to travel to and fro Malaysia to attend NAMPA Board meetings. Similarly another board member the late Ms Florence Awala, may her soul rest in peace, was based in Cape Town and also flew to Windhoek to attend MAMPA Board meetings of course all this at the expense of the urgency.

This contributed to the high expenditures in question. I however, hasten to state that in 2018 I engaged the Chair of the Board and persuaded him to schedule board meetings during times when he is in Namibia as a way to reduce the expenditures that were very high. The rest of the expenses under other expenses relate to board refreshments, business cards and secretariat services provided.

Question 2: The following amounts were paid out to board members for

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON DIENDA HON SIMATAA

the period under review. For the Chair Mr Mutele N\$119,586,17. The Deputy Chairperson Ms Erestine Tuneko N\$89,007,74. Ms Christian Maketo, member N\$78,976,24. Mr Brian Eiseb, member N\$70,897,75 and lastly Ms Florence Awala since late member, N\$60,516,25. The following are the numbers and types of board meetings with dates for the period that has been questioned and they are so many Comrade Speaker so probably the Member will settle for getting the reply if they did not refuse the iPeds I could do it now digitally but they will get it in hardcopies and the information is there.

Question 3: Broadly consultation was done in the following areas:

- Review of existing internal policies and development of new ones,
- •
- Implementation of the D Byte Fixed Asset Management System
- Consultation on PASTEL Accounting system,
- .
- Consulting on search VIP Pay Roll,
- •
- Introduction of employee self service module on such VIP,
- •
- Addition of performance management system on such VIP which included installation and training of staff,
- Payment of annual PASTEL licence fees
- Recruitment of the Chief Human Resources Officer and PA to the CEO
- Remuneration benchmarking study.
- Development of website for EU/ACP in Namibia.

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON DIENDA HON SIMATAA

- Development of NAMPA Public Relations Website
- Consultations on possible amendment of NAMPA Act.
- Contracting independent producers to assist with audio visual production
- Training and coaching of NAMPA Editorial Staff and Sub Editors.

Then what follows Comrade Speaker is a list of all these and the financial expenses incurred for each that the Honourable Member will be able to appreciate once she has a copy of the reply.

Question 4: During the period under review which is 2016/2017 NAMPA acquired a loan facility of N\$40,000,000 from a local commercial bank for its head office development. The loan facility availed to NAMPA was structured in such a manner that during the draw down period interest shall be calculated on a daily balance on the amount of the loan used.

This meant that as progress payments were being made or as money was being drawn against the loan facility to pay the contractor for the work completed the interest payable also increased. As a result the interest on the loan increased to N\$1,063,678,00 due to the full loan disbursement to NAMPA. That means interest was now being charged on the full N\$14,000,000,00 that NAMPA borrowed from the Commercial Bank.

Question 5: Subsequent to receiving the audit observation there were constant engagements between NAMPA Management Team and the Office of the Auditor General and most of the issues raised by the Auditor General were clarified during such engagements.

Question 6: The N\$8,222,923,00 is not physical money or case rather it is a journal entry worth that amount. During the period in question and at the recommendations of its internal auditors NAMPA migrated from the old manual Assets Register to a new computerized one known as debit

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON NAUYOMA HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

asset register. During the process of migration thesystem generated journal entries to that amount. Again after consultation with the auditor general's office a lot of work was done to address the challenges and to ensure that all NAMPA assets and their correct values were reflected accurately on the new system.

Honourable Speaker, I trust that I have adequately addressed the questions raised by Honourable Dienda and I thank you very much for your attention.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you. we move on to question number 31 from the Honourable Nauyoma. Do you put the question?

HON NAUYOMA: Yes I put the question.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you the question is directed to the Minister of Higher Education.

HON MINISTER OF HIGH EDUCATION, TRAINING AND INNOVATION: Thank you Honourable Speaker. I wish to ask the indulgence of the Honourable Member to actually defer this question to next Thursday. Thank you.

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON KAVEKOTORA HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you, the question is deferred. Question number 31, is from the Honourable Jennifer Van Den Heever. Do you put the question Honourable Muharukua.

HON MUHARUKUA: I put the question Honourable Speaker.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you, the question is directed to the Minister of Industrialization, Trade and SME Development. So it stands over. Question number 33 from the Honourable Kavekotora. Do you put the question?

HON KAVEKOTORA: Yes, I put the question.

**HON SPEAKER:** The question is directed to the Minister of Higher Education, Training and innovation.

**HON MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, TRAINING AND INNOVATION:** Thank you Honourable Speaker, I will certainly request for a postponement of the response to this question to next Thursday.

**HON SPEAKER**: Okay the question is deferred, thank you. Question number 34 from the Honourable Kavekotora, do you put the question?

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON DIENDA HON NGHIPONDOKA

HON KAVEKOTORA: Yes I put the question.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you and the question is directed to the Minister of Finance. Minister you have the floor.

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Thank you Comrade Speaker. When I received the question, on the question it was said that that question will be put o the  $4^{th}$  of April so I unfortunately have not prepared my answer but I will do that on the  $4^{th}$ .

**HON SPEAKER**: The question will be responded to on the 4<sup>th</sup>. I forgot that was actually the request from the Honourable Minister, no. Okay anyway we will deal with that on the 4<sup>th</sup>. Question number 35 from the Honourable Dienda, put the question and directed to the Minister of Education, Arts and Culture. Deputy Minister you have the floor.

**QUESTION 35:** 

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF EDUCATION, ARTS AND** <u>**CULTURE**</u>: Thank you so much Honourable Speaker. I will answer the questions in the order of numbering without repeating them. Firstly, the one on Ndama. Ndama Combined School was established in 1978 to cater for a small number of children, namely the San Learners who live in that area but the town expanded, the area became a settlement for many people across the country. To date the Ministry split the school into two schools Ndama Junior Primary and Ndama Combined School. The Junior Primary School is over 1,600 learners and the Combines School has a total number

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON DIENDA HON NGHIPONDOKA

of 2,449 learners with 49 teachers. The school does not have enough classroom and teachers to accommodate all learners hence the platoon system is being applied at that school but as for the 114 learners which was a concern which are in one class the school has constructed two temporary classrooms structures to accommodate the learners from that class and this shall have this last resort. Although one could always say the two new classrooms also does not really answer the issues of learner ratio. Honourable Speaker, I am not protected because the same Honourable Member who put the question is not listening.

HON SPEAKER: Let us listen to the Member please.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF EDUCATION, ARTS AND** <u>**CULTURE**</u>: He is on. The Ministry constructed classrooms at the school unfortunately the ever growing number of learners makes it difficult for the ablution facilities to function properly so if funds permit the Ministry will address some of the challenges at the school including chairs and desks for the learners. The regional plan is to construct another school in that vicinity due to ever growing number of the learners. That was questions 1 and 2 together.

Number 3, Honourable Speaker, this is on infrastructural development and sanitation facilities. An infrastructure development is just to inform the House that the number of classrooms has increased. I am now comparing immediately after independence and now. Has increased from 8,416 in 1992 to 25,050 in 2017 academy here, this does not include those that are still under construction representing a significant development in this aspect. There are currently a total of 388 projects under Basic Education facilities under this MTEF which includes classrooms, laboratories, sanitation facilities and teachers' houses which are at different stages of construction.

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON DIENDA HON NGHIPONDOKA

In additional to those ones we have got 312 facilities that are being renovated as most of these facilities are in a state where learners are exposed to inhuman conditions. It is our policy in the Ministry that funds for constructing classrooms include furniture also. Thus, for each new classroom there will be furniture also. It is anyhow true that due to tear and wear we still experience a backlog of chairs and desks and one fast and cheapest way which we are using now to repair our furniture is to use our Vocational Training Centres (VTC) and Eenhana Vocational Training Centre is one of that example and I know many of them are doing it.

On question number 4 Honourable Speaker, Honourable Dienda only just to indicate when we will be able to show the positive results. Looking at the statistics I gave above I should rather say that educational facilities upgrading and expansion is a lifelong ongoing exercise due to many demographic factors and thus it will be unrealistic to be expected to provide a once off result but what I am saying is these results are visible and observable with those or the progress is positivity and objectivity. A lot has been achieved and further action towards improved consesivity of educational activities are clear.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, what should be taken into account if that education of the country cannot only be left in the hands of Government and that is a call for all stakeholders to come on board and contribute to especially infrastructure development at our schools. Having said this I want to sincerely thank stakeholders who came on board and invested their money in education by constructing classrooms, toilets and hostel blocks and when I talk of hostel blocks I can have a specific example of our former President.

At some of our schools our concerns should thus not only end with pointing out challenges from practises but appreciate such things and come on board to alleviate challenges. I thank you.

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON DIENDA HON SCHLETTWEIN

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you, I move on to question number 36 from the Honourable Van Den Heever directed to the Minister of Safety and Security and both Members are not in the House so we will defer that question. Question number 37, from the Honourable Nauyoma directed to the Minister of Urban and Rural Development. Honourable Nauyoma do you put the question?

HON NAUYOMA: Yes I put the question.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you. Minister Dr Mushelenga you have the floor.

**HON MINISTER OF URBAN AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT**: Yes Honourable Speaker on question 37 I beg for the indulgence that the question stands over to next week.

**HON SPEAKER**: We defer the question until next week. Question number 38 from the Honourable Dienda directed to the Minister of Finance.

## **QUESTION 38:**

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Thank you Honourable Speaker. The question that the Honourable Dienda put concerns CIMAS. The first question was, who are the Directors? If there are (indistinct) company and what is the name of the company? The answer is the following:

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON DIENDA HON SCHLETTWEIN

The public of CIMAS, the Public Service Diploma in Medical Aid Scheme is administered by Metaille Namibia Administrators (Pty) Limited and the task was awarded by a tender. Metaille Namibia Administrators (Pty) Limited has the following Directors, it is Madam J B Guriras Chairperson, Ms Jane Nandago Deputy Chairperson, J A Ndifindaka, R M Nghetjia and D H Botha.

If the Administrator is a Closed Corporation what is the name of the Closed Corporation?

It is not a Closed Corporation it is certainly (Pty Limited so it is a public company.

Again who are the Directors and Shareholders of the company?

The directors are the persons that I mentioned before, J B Guriras, J Nandago, J N Ndifindaka, R M Nghetjia and G M Botha and the shareholders of that company are the following: They are M & I Namibia Holdings 51%, Prime Health 23% and Bomax 26%. That goes up to question 4.

Question 5 is, who are the members of the Closed Corporation and that is not relevant it is a (Pty) Limited. Thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Are you on the same question?

HON MUHARUKUA: (Not on microphone).

HON SPEAKER: I wonder that you are on behalf of the Member who is

RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON DIENDA HON MUHARUKUA

not in the House?

HON MUHARUKUA: Yes just like I put the question on.

HON SPEAKER: It is very unusual. It is very unusual.

**HON MUHARUKWA**: No, I am the one, Honourable Speaker I am the one who put this question. She gave notice I put it therefore as a person who put it, if I am empowered to put it I am empowered to follow up.

HON SPEAKER: No, no.

HON MUHARUKUA: It goes without saying, yes.

**HON SPEAKER**: No the follow up is by the Member of the question. They put the question more of a courtesy to facilitate the absent Member.

HON MUHARUKUA: And the follow up is more of a courtesy.

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON DIENDA HON MUHARUKUA

**HON SPEAKER**: And the follow up is by the (intervention).

HON VENAANI: (Not on microphone).

**HON SPEAKER**: No the follow up really is the Member directly.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Honourable Speaker I beg to differ. I beg to differ, it is just a brief comment, briefly, Honourable Minister thank you very much for the answers. The only problem that I have here probably stands from yesterday that these are the strangers are being paid so much. Today we have to pay double or we are being required to pay double the premium that is all the civil servants including us now have to pay double for our medical aid because you are wasting money on these (intervention).

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you Honourable. Honourable Muharukwa let us leave it there. I am not going to ask the Minister to because he responded and it is up to the Member to come back. Question number 40 and question number 39 stands over. Question number 41 from the Honourable Nico Smit. Do you put the question Honourable Muharukwa.

HON MUHARUKUA: (Not on microphone).

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON SMIT HON JOOSTE

HON SPEAKER: Directed to the Minister of Public Enterprises.

**QUESTION 40:** 

**HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Thank you Comrade Speaker. In response to the question posed by Honourable Nico Smit in relation to Air Namibia and its performance on the regional and international routes and allow me to respond as follows.

A new Board of Directors for Air Namibia was appointed at the end of December 2018. In the past three months this board has taken the necessary steps to gain in a very short time a deep understanding of Air Namibia its business model and performance financial status, operations, status and business culture. This board found underway a consultant that will review and advise on the optimal Air Namibia Business model and subsequent to integrate its strategic business plan for Air Namibia. The findings of the business model analysis are currently with the board for consideration and now as shareholder we expect the board to express itself on the preferred business model.

This may involved for Air Namibia to continue flying international, regional and domestic routes or to fly only regional and domestic routes and/or to fly only domestic routes in the very near future. We are paying fully aware of the continuous loss making by Air Namibia on the international Frankfurt routes in particular and are equally concerned about the non performing regional routes.

At the same time we are cognisant of the fact that more structural changes in the Air Namibia business model will have a terminal effect on the Air Namibia fleet and we must be cognisant of the long term lease agreements and related Government guarantees. Any such changes will obviously also impart on the Air Namibia organizational structure and staff compliments and other components of the company's operations.

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON SMIT HON JOOSTE

The boarders indicated that the well advised assets as shareholding in the very near future and with the urgency on the recommended strategy towards the self sustaining in Namibia have the least possible transition costs. Based on the selected business models the consultancy will then proceed to craft a five year integrated strategic business plan for Air Namibia which clearly define the measurable key performance indicators for the organization as a whole and for the executive management individuals. We cannot and will not tolerate continued loss making and believe that driven by a new business model competent management and the focus professional board Air Namibia can break even in three years time.

This will not be an easy journey and the restructuring process may still require financial support that it is durable. We do not want to see Air Namibia disappear altogether by any means. I trust that this explanation puts Honourable Smit at ease to some extent and probably the others too I the House while noting that we share your concerns about this long time ailing commercial public enterprises. I thank you Comrade Speaker.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. We will question number 41 from the same Honourable Member Nice Smit and directed this time to the Minister of Urban and Rural Development. Minister you have the floor question number 41.

HON MINISTER OF URBAN AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: Honourable Speaker, again I plead for the indulgence of the House for this question to stand over until next week.

HON SPEAKER: The question is deferred until next week. Question

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON HAMBYUKA HON DR MUSHELENGA

number 42. From the Honourable Nico Smit, oh, both the Minister and the Deputy Minister are not here.

HON SMIT: (Not on microphone).

**HON SPEAKER**: Yes we have taken note of that. question number 43 from the Honourable Hambyuka do you put the question?

HON HAMBYUKA: Yes I put the question.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much and the question is directed to the Minister of Urban and Rural Development.

**QUESTION 43:** 

**HON MINISTER OF URBAN AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT**: Yes thank you very much Honourable Speaker. I rise to respond to questions that have been posed by Honourable Hamunyela Hambyuka Deputy Whip of SWAPO Party. Question 1, is whether I can inform this House and the public out there as to what happened with the City of Windhoek to serve residence with the inconsistencies and inaccuracies in bills.

I would like to answer as follows. Following my enquiry with the Windhoek Municipality I have been informed that on an annual basis on a monetary visits and revives all water tariffs, based on water availability in

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON HAMBYUKA HON DR MUSHELENGA

the central area and such evaluation is done by all water stakeholders in the central areas of Namibia lying with the City of Windhoek's water management plan.

The previous rain system for 2018 ended towards the end of April 2018. NamWater announced is applying to look for the following three years being 2018 to 2020 but in particular ahead before the next rain season, in July 2018 the Municipality announced the outcome of the water supply outlook in the central area of Namibia and the water scarcity was declared as of the 1<sup>st</sup> of August 2018. The declaration of water scarcity means that Windhoek should reduce its water consumption and set as a target to serve at least 10% savings on water consumption. It implies that high water supply tariffs as gazetted in the Government Gazette dated 15<sup>th</sup> of June 2018 page 93 to page 94 for times of limited water supply will be charged and not the standard charge meaning the unlimited water supply that is now from the 1<sup>st</sup> of July 2018.

However, the oversight was detected only in December 2018 that high single household consumers were under charged for consumption. Under charged because from the 1<sup>st</sup> of July there was now special tariffs that were supposed to be charged during water scarcity, up to December this was never charged so people were under charged. Instead of charging the said consumer rate applicable at times of limited water supply they were charged unlimited water supply tariffs that are charged during normal water supplies. The decision to implement the correct charge for these consumers from the 1<sup>st</sup> of January 2019 going forward was implemented but instead the charges were backdated from the 1<sup>st</sup> of July 2018 and the impact was more severe for clients whose readings were estimated for an extended period prior to December 2018 and which has now resulted in high bills affecting this segment of the clientele.

Question 2: Did the City of Windhoek increase the Municipality tariffs if so how can they increase by more than 150%?

Answer: As per the above explanations the City of Windhoek only

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON HAMBYUKA HON DR MUSHELENGA

implemented its revised annual tariffs that also make provision for tariffs to be charged to times of limited water supply. It was an increase from 2018 to 2019 with 11%. If domestic consumers keep their water consumption below 0.73 kilo litres that is 730 litres of water per day or less than 22,000 litres of water per month they will only be charged N\$21,40 per 1,000 litres of water consumed that is if they are below 730 litres consumption.

However, if consumers like some Honourable Members here whose names I will not mention if they exceed the above threshold they are automatically liable to be charged N\$61,00 per kilo litre and when exceeding 30,000 litres per month they will be charged at the rate of N\$141 in excess of over 1,000 litres per day consumed.

Question 3: May I please have attention as condition for me to proceed.

**HON SPEAKER**: Let us listen to the Member. We need this information it is very important.

**HON MINISTER OF URBAN AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT**: Question 3: For how long will it take for the City of Windhoek to rectify such an error?

The answer is, the backdated charge of the (indistinct) to household consumers were rectified by reversing the backdated charge from the 1<sup>st</sup> of July 2018. A decision was also taken to suspend a draw tariff from the 1<sup>st</sup> of July 2019 to allow for a media campaign for the next three months and to sensitize the residence.

Question 4: Lastly, what will happen with the amount overcharged with the affected residence?

# RESPONSE TO QUESTION BY HON HAMBYUKA HON DR MUSHELENGA

The answer is as I said they were not overcharged, they were just charged what they were undercharged. The charges were correct only that they were backdated from the  $1^{st}$  of July 2018. For those with an estimation and due to the drawn tariff implementation the affected clients will receive the credit on their next statement that will be available from the  $28^{th}$  of March that is today 2019. The Windhoek Municipality has thus revived the high domestic water bill for the 46 powers and affected <u>high consumers.</u>

A media release was issued to the public on the 7<sup>th</sup> of March 2019 and the same statement was subsequently published in a local newspaper and other media. I thank you and I put my case to rest.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Honourable Hambyuka.

**HON HAMBYUKA**: Honourable Speaker, thank you very much and I am happy that the Minister provided that information to the Honourable Members here and the public out there. Even though the information the Minister provided and I am happy that the information is on our table, if I can have a copy. After having a copy then I will consult further because what the Minister has said and what the officials of the City of Windhoek is different. When you go there they can reduce that amount. The way they are reducing nobody knows it is only them who know. I went there mine was the bill for February which was N\$10,000,00 but when I went to the debt collector, they worked it out and without my knowledge I am behind the computer there on this side they reduced it to N\$3,000,00. From N\$10,000 it came to N\$3,000 and now what the Minister is saying and that is why I said it is better to have the copy of the reports. Thank you.

### ADJOURNMENT RT HON DR KUUNGONGELWA-AMADHILA

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. This is very important topic. It is an important subject matter and the question is when I go by what the Minister has just informed the House and what we are hearing from the Honourable Hambyuka, you are likely or you are forced to conclude that sometimes the Municipality charge on the basis of an estimate. Estimating that a particular household might have used water so much and they charge. So I think this is something that requires careful analysis. Without making a judgement but at least we need to arrive at a very conclusive basis make sure that justice is done because otherwise there will be lots of accusations back and forth. Can we leave it at that?

Honourable Minister thank you very much for providing the information we will look into this obviously with the Honourable Hambyuka who will do his home work. Thank you. We have come to the end of this particular session of the House and since we are slightly not yet over the hour, Prime Minister may you adjourn the House?

**<u>RT HON PRIME MINISTER</u>**: (Not on microphone).

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. The House stands adjourned until next week the usual time. Thank you.

# HOUSE ADJOURNED AT 17:45 UNTIL 2019.2.4 AT 14:30

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS WINDHOEK 02APRIL 2019

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON SPEAKER took the Chair and read the Prayer and Affirmation.

**HON SPEAKER**: Welcome back. Any petitions, reports of standing and select Committees, other reports and papers, notices of, yes, Minister of Finance.

# TABLING: REPORTS OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Honourable Speaker I lay upon the table reports of the Auditor General on the accounts of the following.

- (i) National Youth Council for the financial year ended 31 March 2018;
- (ii) Fisheries Observer Fund for the financial year ended 31 March 2018;
- (iii) Town Council of Helao Nafidi for the financial year ended 30 June 2018;
- (iv) Village Council of Kamanjab for the financial year ended 30 June 2018; and
- (v) Regional Council of the Omusati Region for the financial year ended 31 March 2018.

I so move Honourable Speaker.

#### 02 April 2019

## MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON YA NDAKOLO

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you. Notices of questions, notices of Motions, messages from the Head of State, Ministerial Statements. You are the two neighbours. Who would like to have a go, Minister of Defence?

## MINISTERIAL STATEMENTS IN TERMS OF RULE 98 OF THE STANDING RULES AND ORDERS

## **DEPLOYMENT OF THE DEFENCE FORCE**

**HON MINISTER OF DEFENCE**: Thank you very much Comrade Speaker. Comrade Speaker the mission of the Namibian Defence Force is enshrined in the Namibian Constitution Chapter 5, Article 115 is to defend the territorial integrity and the national interest of the Republic of Namibia and to render assistance to civil power. Since 2017 Comrade Speaker the Namibian Defence Force acted on the Cabinet decision number 10/04.07.17/011 that committed troops and resources to join the antipoaching operations in support of anti-poaching unit of the Ministry of Environment and Tourism, the Namibian Police Force and other stakeholders in combating poaching activities in the national game parks and conservancy areas.

Comrade Speaker since the deployment of defence force in support of the anti-poaching unit, members of the Namibian Defence Force have been making considerable effort and have positively contributed to the reduction of poaching activities in our national parks. That is Etosha and Bagwata national parks as well as private parks and game conservancies. Since the involvement of the Namibian Defence Force in anti-poaching operations a number of rhino horns and elephants task were also received and more than 100 suspected poachers were also arrested and the possession of ammunition and weapons of different kinds were

#### MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON YA NDAKOLO

confiscated.

On this positive note Comrade Speaker I am delighted to inform that the involvement of the Namibian Defence Force in anti-poaching operations that began in November 2017 has so far been successful and the poaching activities has been reduced drastically. Despite the positive achievement recorded thus far Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members poaching activities have certainly not stopped as poachers continue to target rhinos, elephants and other endangered species in our national parks. Since December last year poachers appear to have adopted new tactics and operating methods that escalated poaching activities in the national parks.

The situation in the national parks has now deteriorated as we noted with sadness the increasing incidents of exchange fire between poachers and our members of anti-poaching units including the Namibian Defence Force. This situation clearly indicates that poachers have now declared war on members of the Namibian Defence Force. The Namibian Police, the anti-poaching unit and all the process involved in anti-poaching operations as evidenced by shooting incidents recorded thus far.

It can now be concluded that the poachers have become more aggressive and violence towards the combined anti-poaching process including members of the Namibian Defence Force. For example Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members in December last year there was exchange fire between members of the Namibian Defence Force and poachers in Bagwata national park but no fatalities sustained and on 16<sup>th</sup> March this year 2019 the Namibian Force helicopter conducted air patrol in pursuit a poacher was shot in the Etosha national park and fortunately it was missed and there were not casualties.

On this Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members 16<sup>th</sup> March this year 2019 the Namibian Defence Force sadly loss a member who shot by poachers in Bagwata national park. May his soul rest in eternal peace. The Ministry of Defence want to make it categorically clear that this hostile actions targeting members of the Namibian Defence Force will not be tolerated under whatever circumstances. All these incidents Comrade

## COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS ON MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON MUHARUKUA

Speaker coupled with sophisticated methods and tactics currently adopted by poachers to destroy our drive are sending a clear message to the Government of the Republic of Namibia that poaches have now declared war against the anti-poaching unit and the Namibian Defence Force in particular.

In this regard Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members the Ministry of Defence want to warn poachers and individuals with intention to attack soldiers that Namibian Defence Force will respond appropriately with necessary action against any act of hostility or aggression especially from poachers and their masters. Comrade Speaker our Ministry that is Ministry of Defence appeals to all individuals and the general public to support and cooperate with the members of anti-poaching unit in order to protect our wildlife which is important economy of our motherland Namibia. Having to say this Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members I thank you very much.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you. I have got one more Ministerial Statement. Can I take them both? You want to put a question a quick one please.

#### COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS ON MINISTERIAL STATEMENT

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Thank you Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, Honourable Minister I think it is good for us to keep law and order and the agencies responsible for that should do so whilst observing the very law and order that intend to deserve in our populace society. Now it is also common cause that increasingly there are allegations of torture against people who are arrested and who are alleged to have been

## COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS ON MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON MUHARUKUA

poachers and the dichotomy here is when the Ministry of Safety is confronted with it, they blame the Minister of Defence i.e. no, it is not our people who are doing this and therefore it is the Ministry of Defence Force members who are doing this.

So the question here is what is in terms of the working relations, does the Ministry of Defence conduct its own operations and the Ministry of Safety its own in terms of this or do they conduct them jointly because the training of these two specific entities are different in terms of reserving evidence. The Safety Ministry their training is different and that of the Ministry of Defence is differently and lastly there are allegations of six of the Ovahimba young people who were allegedly shot under shoot to kill orders in 2015 or 2016. To date these people are lost. Their whereabouts are not known and one day the Minister of Environment just hinted that there was an exchange of fire and people were shot and then he retracted. So does the Ministry of Defence know where our people are? Did you shoot them and kill them or what is going on?

**HON SPEAKER**: Honourable Muharukua it is your question actually raises a number of issues. Now the question of allegations obviously you do not expect the Minister when the allegations are not on the table or clearly stated or presented, there is no way the Minister would actually talk in general terms about allegations. So that one I would have thought if you have got documentation is far better to present them to the Minister and then you expect an answer.

No, I am just simply saying the Ministerial Statement could not cover all those issues joint operations. I would like the Minister to comment on that but all the other people, allegations who have been shot and so on, I think make sure that you really present all the necessary information so that we could do a follow up. We cannot afford to have people being killed in random without proper cause of action being taken. So can we leave it at that?

02 April 2019

# RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS ON MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON YA NDAKOLO

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Yes, I think you are right. Maybe I elaborated too much but the crux of the question is this, are there shoot to kill orders in terms of these poachers, extra judicial killing that is the question.

**HON SPEAKER**: Alright, that is the question. Thank you for clarifying. Honourable Minister a brief comment please your microphone?

**HON VENAANI**: ... into the debate but since the Minister who just spoke is a Minister of Defence, did I hear him correctly saying that he has declared war? He cannot do that. The Minister cannot declare war and especially when he is a Minister of Defence.

**HON SPEAKER**: Alright, you know, order, order, order. I will leave the Minister to explain but I thought I understood what he said to imply like what we normally. It is a question of language declaring war on poverty. Honourable Minister could you, yes, please.

## **RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS ON MINISTERIAL STATEMENT**

**HON MINISTER OF DEFENCE**: Comrade Speaker thank you very much. I have also to thank my brother for his question but I have also maybe to make it clear that all allegations those allegations we do not have any time to discuss allegations. Maybe what he has to do is just only to write to put it in black and white and come back to me. I think I will prepare for that. Another thing again on operations when we are conducting operations I do not think if it also a time it is not public consumption to hear our operation, how to operate, no, no. My brother it

02 April 2019

## MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON SHANGHALA

is not, not happen even. Maybe one of the day we will be advisor if your advice is like that to reveal everything on security issues, you are wrong person.

HON SPEAKER: Alright. Let us have some order please.

**HON MINISTER OF DEFENCE**: Comrade Speaker when it comes to declaration of war, I did not say that alright, on our side as the Minister of Defence or Namibian Defence Force we declare war against them but indicating that alright, now they declare war, that is why they are trying to exchange fire with members of the Namibian Defence. We have to exchange fire. That is the thing. Thank you very much.

**HON SPEAKER**: So there is no formal declaration of war. Thank you. Honourable Minister of Justice.

## PUBLIC SERVICE CHARTERS FOR THE MINISTRY OF JUSTICE

**HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE**: Mr Speaker thank you for the opportunity to make the following short Ministerial Statement. On 20<sup>th</sup> March 2019 in accordance with the prescripts of the Right Honourable Prime Minister Doctor Sarah Kuugongelwa-Amadhila the Attorney General and I launched the Public Service Charters for the Ministry of Justice and the office of Attorney General. These Charters although printed on simple brochures clear sets out timelines for the provision of

#### MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON SHANGHALA

quality legal services. At the launch of Charters the Honourable Attorney General made important points that these timelines can be adhered even to these ostia economic times.

The living quality service with a smile does not cost anything. I fully agree with him sometimes we pour money behind problems without solving the problems and in the end we are left with nothing more than an expensive problem. I have read somewhere that the simple details of success is starting off your day by making your bed. By making your bed you have started your day with an achievement and continue on that trend. I use this analogy because this is how he intend on implementing our Public Service Charter. If we are able to consistently do small tasks correctly and on time, we can easily deliver service within our targets.

The Ministry of Justice Vote 16's mandate is to provide legal service and access to justice. We provide these services to render stakeholders such as the office of the judiciary and the courts, Anti-Corruption Commission, all the other offices, Ministries and Agencies of Government and the general public. Under Vote 16, we have the following Directorates that directly deal with the public and the stakeholders, Ministries and other stakeholders. We have the Law Reform, legislative drafting, office of the Ombudsman, Legal Aid, Legal Services and Master of the High Court.

Each Directorate carries out its work differently. What is done at the Directorate of Law Reform is completely different from the service offered at the Directorate of Legal Aid. In the end, we all struck to compliment and fulfil the common mandate vision and mission. However despite the divergent done in each Directorate there are overlapping service delivery timelines that I want to highlight and then commit to adhering to. I am making this public statement as a promise to the public and as a requirement of my staff members' performance *vis a vis* members of the public.

Every Directorate promises to answer your call with three rings, acknowledge receipt of all e-mail within the same day, reply to correspondence between two and five working days and provide you with

## MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON SHANGHALA

an explanation of how we are handling your case and inform you of when to expect an answer. These targets are set in terms of our guiding values which are integrity, transparency, service excellence, accountability, professionalism and synergy. By making these promises, do not take me naïve instead perhaps you could think of me as being a pioneer in taking a very great step.

I am not saying that we have reached these targets instead I am committing to striving to reach these ideals and I urge our stakeholders to keep us accountable. If we are not meeting our targets, send us an e-mail to suggest improvement or otherwise let us know. In return for excellent service delivery we ask of our clients to be honest, polite, patient, be timely in providing required and accurate information, comply with existing legislation and regulations and treat our staff members with the necessary courtesy and respect even if they are put to serve them. These Charters represent a relationship between the Ministry and its stakeholders. We promise to answer the phone, call back and make an effort. Failure to comply will call the same type of thing as experienced in a failed relationship.

Let us not enter into thickly teenage like relationships but rather commit your lifelong relationship on mutual respect and cooperation as stakeholders, service providers and public. In conclusion I want to remind you my opening analogy let us make the small things count, make a bed and then sleep in it. I thank you.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you so we are done. We now revert back to the order of the day.

The Secretary will read the first order of the day.

## **RESUMPTION OF DEBATE ON SECOND READING – APPROPRIATION BILL [B.3 – 2019]**

**<u>SECRETARY</u>**: Resumption of Debate on Second Reading – *Appropriation Bill* [B. 3 – 2019].

**HON SPEAKER**: When the Assembly adjourn on Wednesday the 27<sup>th</sup> March 2019 the question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Minister of Finance that the Bill be read a second time. Honourable Venaani adjourned the debate and I now have the pleasure to call on him.

**HON VENAANI**: Thank you very much Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members I rise to reply the budget but I want to state that the technical aspects of the budget would be addressed by our competent schedule Minister of Finance but I shall continue to raise the important matters and providing solutions to our development trajectory. Honourable Speaker we have just celebrated the 29<sup>th</sup> year of our independence and yet Namibia is unable to cut the apron string of economic dependency. We continue as therest of Africa remain to be in some respects upon in a battle between external forces that are held on extracting our nation's natural resources to quill other bigger economies.

We can decide to listen to budget speeches day in, day out, year in, year out but the fundamental truth remain the same. We are a nation that continues to fuel the growth of others while our people are in an abated joblessness, starvation and hunger. As we leaders are jetting the world from this end to the other going to seek more loans but where are the tangible results jobs and economic growth that we can equip to the generations that follow us. We are failing our country and the status quo cannot continue.

205

Honourable Speaker while the politically connected few pick up bolt screen we are being lowered by vest in that plane of the fundamental of our country is being run remains unchanged. We are a country and a nation in which your proximity to power determines your so-called success. Tenders are dished out to few individuals while the majority and the sweat from the brows means nothing to those in power. Namibians must claim their own economic freedom those that are benefiting are already talking and they know and it start with leaving behind the scourge of tribal politics, backward politics and talk about the politics of the battle of ideas that will drive our nation tomorrow. Some of Harambe leaders sit with grisly palms while deals are being struck left, right and centre without taking into account ordinary Namibians the few better individuals and many are in agony.

As we are speaking a lot of over 5 000 hardworking toiling Namibians have applied for fishing concessions whereas the Minister has announced that the fishing concession will not be given out this year. There are already people sitting at posh restaurant re-fixing their own application how while they have already submitted them. This is the Namibia that we are living in today. Honourable Speaker Honourable Minister of Finance I was surprised that in your Ministerial budget speech there was nearly not tangible mention of the Government freshly program Harambe or the Vision 2030. The pillars and efforts of Vision 2030 should or ought to be the reference point to judge where we are today or what direction we need to take.

Although I will give minimum credit that I can be given in some areas but the general lapses and failures are significant and they have undermine our nation's zeal to their livelihood potential. Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members I commend the Minister for having a budget that explain budget processes, expenditure, the accountability report but I think we should move a step ahead as other progressive nations are doing to have a value for money audited statements from the Auditor General because most of the time the greatest being that is in our country is the fact that when projects are going to implementation, there is hidden cost, escalation cost merely every project is escalated three fold than the initial cost that was estimated whether it is the oil storage facility.

Of recent the house of the Founding President that was supposed to cost N\$20 Million, it is said to be escalating and for that matter we need to be able to have a value for money audited system in our system so that we can be able to track all our expenditure on all the capital projects and I want to urge the Minister to avail enough resources to the Auditor General to consistently conduct the vital value for money audit on major Government expenditure projects and I think the result of this or pertness in accounting for public expenditures shows evidence of shifting most of the time the goal post in our previous budgets and Government pronouncements on various policy issues where plans are announced to commence or complete only to be told that those plans never actually gotten off the ground.

A case in point is the youth venture capital. I remember three years ago this project was part of a budget debate that we are going to roll out new venture capital. Only now later on we are hearing the same project is about to be implemented. What happened to the previous storms? Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members unemployment. The Ministry of Industrialization, Trade and SME Development has now become the announcer of job losses giving quarterly account of why thousands of Namibians breadwinners have lost their jobs and just last month the latest data from the Minister of Labour, Industrial Relations and Employment Creation that during the second half of 2018 close to 2 500 people were retrenched from 128 locally based companies. These companies according to the media reports sights economic reasons for letting their workers go while others are mentioning restructuring and business closure as explanations as per domestic economic struggle to recover from a recession.

Honourable Members of this August House according to the economic association of Namibia between the year 2014 and 2017 a total number of 129 644 Namibians lost their jobs. This sums up the following. 74 074 people losing their jobs in the agriculture and fishing sector during the period, 3 672 in wholesale and retail trade, 11 629 in public administration, 7 944 in the private sector and 4 319 in the transport and storage sector. These are just not statistics. These are real Namibians with real hopes, with dreams and aspirations, with children they need to

raise and nature.

During my daily interaction I see their faces downcast unable to explain to their children why their parents cannot pay food, why the rent is not paid, why their relationship is strained by financial issues. As we speak today unemployment inequality stands at 37% while youths unemployment is hovering around 44% yet Ministries in the 2018 budget, the Ministries of Poverty Eradication, Social Welfare and Gender Equality and Child Welfare returning a combined N\$205 Million to the Treasury despite the worsening poverty crisis in the country.

This kind of decision is needs further interrogations. These are the real Namibian uncaptured by budget speeches. The real trauma of being a Namibia in a time of apathy spell. The Government must stop paying lip service to the notion of industrialization while Namibia is continually exposed to external shocks like commodity prices. During the tabling of budget last week the Honourable Minister Schlettwein did not take this nation into confidence by giving us the exact figures of our how many jobs were created in the last three Financial Years due to unemployment. This is the biggest challenge in our country today as more than 45-46% of our youths are unemployed.

The ulterior motive Government will make it mandatory as part of our youth empowerment a law that every Government procurement should have 30% set aside for youths and women that is how jobs are created. Without a tangible plan to create jobs, the effects of youth unemployment will persist for decades. Many who begin their careers without work are more likely to have lower wages and suffer joblessness again later in life. Part of these loses maybe due to missing out on training and experience accumulation that typically occurs with young workers.

We believe that there is a need to address the mismatch between skills and jobs, create apprentice with companies in our country. We need to invest in those who were not able to succeed in the academic mainstream. The unforgotten trades opportunities need to be opened to the domestic workers, to the tailors in shops, the security guards, those who till the garden, taxi drivers, hawkers and those who are at home. Significant

resources must go to them to re-tool, re-train for them to pursue and excel in new trade that offer them better paying process. Companies will only be willing to invest more in our youths and revamp their training programs if Government links every procurement with skills development for the young.

Education and training, Honourable Speaker although the Ministry of Education is the highest recipient of a large chunk of the budget year in, year out over thirteen point something N\$7 Billion to the Education Ministry yet the output has never been commensurate to the input that we put in the Education sector says Venaani and says PDM and says the country and says the joblessness in this country and says the 60 000 graduates, says everybody that is alive. One the biggest failure and this is very important to all of us, one of the biggest failures in nation has been our inability to provide quality education and skills development to our young.

The system currently leaves our young not only unemployed but in many instances unemployable. The purpose of our development trajectory lies herein and we must address these challenges with the sense of honesty, friendliness and urgent. Our society can be able to transform through a transactional currency that is radical and different in approach and a strategy that approaches education at all stages with a strong emphasis on technical skills and a magnificent application of technology. We should develop a learning system that align with the new international learning model that has changed significantly worldwide with the advent of quality courses available through online colleges.

How we finance the scholarship systems through NASFAF should all take this into account but in some instances and cases students need not to attend brick and mortar classrooms but can follow classes through online, laptops, access to study groups and supervisors. This way more and more students could be accommodated for training for less the price. A good education system Colleagues depends on the moral and quality of its teachers. We need to start taking the teaching profession very seriously and create a thorough incentive reward system and accord them the facilities they deserve. Many of our teachers in the rural parts of our

country are lots in Ombashu.

Nearly all the teachers that are teaching our children in the rural areas do not have decent lodging facilities. I do go there. You do not go there. That is why you do not know and if many of our teachers are living in this poor lodging facilities, the rural schools are failing to attract good teachers because the good teachers want to be in urban centres where they can be able to have better facilities on their lives. So we need to address. They are not bad ones but good ones do not go. Teachers with Masters Degrees, teachers that have better education qualifications ought to be in urban centres as opposed to rural areas because we are not doing enough to help our teachers on the ground.

We need to do it all of us. Housing and sanitation, also not in existence Honourable Schlettwein your allocation and motivation. There was no firm plans on how Government plan to address rapid release of land and housing service delivery in order for Namibians to effectively deal with the thousands of housing backlog that confronts our citizenry. Prosperity should be broad base and if prosperity is not broad base with thousands of our citizenry, far too many cannot afford a decent shelter. Housing and sanitation is the basic necessity of life like food and water, like clothing, like companion.

Now than ever before housing is beyond reach for the majority of the population in particular the working people of our country. Besides the fact that the leaders of this country have declared the shanty towns in Ombashu as a humanitarian crisis. I was eagerly anticipating and hopeful that by declaring those areas as a humanitarian crisis, our budget will address the problem head on but this budget does not do that.

The alternative view that we hold and position is to provide for the urban poor with free ervens through a one Namibian one plot policy. How can we promise homes to people if we cannot give them plots to build their homes on? The urban poor need to be given free plots and many can struggle can put up decent shelters for themselves and I want to hold this matter that the housing prices in our country happens to be one of the

highest in Sub-Saharan Africa due to the economies of supply and demand. When the Municipality a lot erven around Academia in Kleinne Khippe, you would always have more than 14 000 applicants fighting for 300 ervens. That is why we end up paying for 400 square meter erf empty N\$1.8 Million, N\$1.5 Million.

If you retro feed and give the urban poor a piece of 140 square meter plot where he is living after all for the last 29 years he or she, thank you very much. I must be very gender sensitive. The demand will go down and the housing prices would be addressed. Partly we need to unlock the potential that is in our rural areas. We have a number of Namibians living in semiurban areas such as Khois, such as Aruab, such as Anker, Otjinene, Mbeno and many other places around this country where people have built homes that are living in proper houses but the current property regimes that we have in this country does not value property rights of semi-urban areas in our country.

We need to unlock the potential of our country by accelerating property regimes in rural areas so that when Kandjove built the house in a village that has cost the same amount of cement, the same amount of roofing should be given the same value as the house in the urban centres so that we unlock the potential of our rural poor in our country. We should launch a people sanitation supply program where the toiling people, the young can voluntarily dig piping trenches and get youth plumbers for vocational training be given opportunities to lay pipes as a job stimulant for the youth to supply toilets in our lifetime. I want to address this issue of sanitation.

It is probably the sixth time that I lament this story. I remember many years ago I went to Kenya in Nairobi and I went to Kibera slumps and I met a woman who had two beautiful daughters and as I was passing Kibera they were daughters and when I was told the story I was not married. Do not worry. They were daughters and that is now the joke, she had beautiful daughters and I said can I marry one of them jokingly to the lady in Kibera. This lady says this to me and I will never forget. I said to Ms Karuwa Kibera slumps I told the story many times here in this House and this is what she says to me. My young son you

can get married. So the joke was how many cattle will I pay for your daughters and this is what she says to me? My son you do not need to pay me cattle but for as long as you can guarantee me one thing and I said what is that. Guarantee me that if you marry my daughter you will be able to give her a running toilet. Well, I was just joking of course but it tells a stacking story of the urban poor wherever they manifest themselves in the worlds that sanitation is a key to your human right. You cannot afford to have a society where you have over 40% of your population living without toilets, 50% of your population without electricity, 30% of your population. The poor majority in the budget remains only step-children. How do we address sanitation?

Sometimes sanitation does not need to be the toilets that the tenders are making that one person is putting up a tender of N\$35 000 per single toilet. You can even make a makeshift congregated iron toilet that a person can have and it can be decent. I have seen it in South Africa and elsewhere. You are the National Planning Commission Minister you should have seen this thing. Honourable Speaker the last time Government embarked on a grant to create jobs. We ended up with a pillaging and looting associated with the TEEPEG billion that has brought our country where it is today.

Today many areas in the northern part of our country that I have just visited are still waiting for unfinished infrastructures such as school and clinics that were supposed to be built under this project and most of the tenders have gotten away with the money after all the projects are incomplete. So when this Governmenttalks about jobs for you the young people of this country know that there are talking about perhaps for connected young people and not the ordinary Namibians. That is what the history have taught us. So let us not point rosy picture for our young in our country.

The N\$66 Billion budget tabled last week by the Finance Minister is like a plate. Is there a guarantee that money will indeed be available throughout the year? On top of that the country expects to be drawn in over N\$7.5 Million debts by the end of this Financial Year. This literally translate that

nearly every Namibian even born today owes N\$23 Million each if you look at the debt that we have in this country. We talk less but simply wants to entrench platonic network and that is the reality. I would like to challenge the Minister of Finance Honourable Schlettwein to release the statistics on the actual investment for economic stimulation that our loaded international investment conference brought through foreign direct investment.

I was one of those people that thank the Government and praise the Government that you have brought an international investment conference but now we have to review the investment or the money that we put in the conference and the work. What have we re-profited and benefited from the international investment conference? How much are we benefiting from round about international sessions that we are having looking for this, that and the other for the benefit of our country? We need to be able to get statistic as to how much are we investing in this projects and what is the return on our investment.

The budget estimates further that Government total debt is again projected to increase to N\$96.2 Billion during 49% of GDP during 2019-2020 Financial Year N\$108 Billion in the year thereafter and N\$112, 51% of GDP and the year thereafter N\$112 Billion which is 2.3% of GDP but what exactly does this say about our borrowing ethics? It is not fair to say that we are friend to all and enemy to none if our economies are remaining ponds of the international arena and our economics are remaining collateral damage between western powers and rising powers that is China.

If there is no improvement on our national debt issue and methods of borrowing are still worryingly very high knowing that the set target was 35% and we are hovering already over 51% in the next two years. An American Economist with the name Paul Krukman says and I want to quote. 'We know that advance economies with stable Governments that borrowing their own currency are capable of running a very high level of debts without crises.'

Honourable Minister we propose as we propose last year that we need to start and African economies need to start robust negotiations with foreign lenders that we know and borrow money in our own currency to escape currency volatility that punishes us through interest and actual cost of loans. Why can we negotiate in Namibian Dollar and borrow on the premise of the Namibian Dollar? Why should we pose to borrow in US Dollar or the Yuan if we cannot borrow in our own currency? Why do not the lenders have respect for our currency?

An overview conducted by the World Bank on March 2018-2019 revealed that economic recession still continues with really economic activities contracted by 0.4% in 2018 from a deeper contraction of 0.9% in 2017. The deepest economic activity reflects the continuation of the fiscal consolidation process that added as a major drop on the economy and the turbot grown performance of the neighboring countries that have additional adverse effect on the demand on Namibian exports. This overview further says that medium term grown recovery will be expected only if it is driven by the mining activity especially uranium like the Usab Mine if it rims up its production as uranium prices are expected to rise and the trade will improve.

The economy recovery will also be facilitated by further revival of the construction sector which I doubt for now supported by the plan infrastructural projects finance through the African Development Bank but how does the current top Minister of selling the Usab Mine impact on this would-be recovery? Furthermore as our domestic demand and national trading partners recover, services sector activity should contribute the resumption of economic growth. The Minister of Finance in my view has not clearly stated how the country would be saved from the technical recession it has faced over the past two years.

Let me also say the following that it is true and well that our measure trading partners across the region are suffering recession but they are also good performers on the African continent and especially in Sub-Saharan Africa. There are economies on the African continent that are expected to grow between 7% to 9% this year and I am talking about the

big A, Senegal, Mauritius, Ghana, Ethiopia, Kenya and a number of them and we should copy what is it that they are doing right that they are also growing financially in their own economies because we should not only talk about the adverse effect that affect us. What are the other countries and other politics doing right in order for us to be able to see whether we can copy their trajectory and be able to grow our own economy? Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members state own enterprises.

We once again receive a total one billion. I give you credit my friend Minister but the figures is going down but not financially. With merely half of that N\$500 Million less than for Air Namibia. Now for a moment I want to address and lament Air Namibia. The Airline industry is a very complex industry but I have listened to many turnaround strategies that never have turn around.

I have listened to many CEOs and Board Members of Air Namibia that have never turn around Air Namibia. The question that need to be asked is will Air Namibia ever tur around because if you look at the missing of Embraer. The money that Air Namibia is losing from the leasing of the Embraer and the profit that those companied are making brings the question to the fore whether the leasing of those aero planes are sustainable but as we are moving to the technical debate of the budget we will address SOEs one by one.

Coupled with that is that we have created a public enterprise Ministry and I wish to well this Minister when you were appointed that things will improve but the erosion of corporate governance at the state own enterprises, the illegal firing or legal firing of Board Members, of CEOs continues unabated. Now one ask the question we have expanded money, taken staff to the Ministry for state own enterprises to improve but this improvement has just become minimal so the question should be put there whether the creation of the Ministry would really give us the intended results. I will come to the creation of this mammoth Ministry.

Our Government in our view remain stubborn on loss making entities like Air Namibia where global and international best practices prove that it is

completely unsustainable for countries such as ours to continue bailing out with money which is supposed to go to critical services for the poor while neighboring countries like big brother South Africa have already waken up to the fact that state airlines are above all into which more bottomless bail out of billions disappear even through continue looting and pillaging. It seems like this Government remains somehow in a dreamland and innovative plans to address this saga in the interest of our country.

Where in the word can cash strap Government continue to throw away billions while coming up with no plans to address these scores? Another worrying factor is that our state owned enterprises remains a contentious issue in Namibia as many of them have over the last years fail to deliver basic financial reports required by law in most instances to the providers of these funds and the taxpayers. Many of our SOEs fail to report back on the actual use in a highly undesirable lack of accountability in the use of public funds. That says improvement in budget and ongoing efforts by the Ministry of Public Enterprises to provide oversight should be conducted frequently.

Although we established the Ministry of Public Enterprises, the constant erosion of corporate governance remains the key burning functions of Boards and CEOs suspension remains the order of the day. Honourable Minister of Finance I have the borne to chew with you. I was surprised my dear friend and perturbed to hear the Minister during an interview turning away from the public private partnership framework and it is with regard to the Hosia Kutako International Airport. You were the front runner of IMF has recommended to us that Namibia you do not have PPP. resources to expand your own airport. We recommend in good faith that you must use the Public Private Partnership model of which we have brought a legal framework here in our country but then the Minister who was the frontrunner of the PPP and I was so hopeful about this PPPs says something to the contrary and says why should be build the airport with such a strategic asset with Public Private Partnership if we can borrow money from China?

Now the Minister the question that I want to chew, you are the bone that I

want to chew I want to know from you during your reply why would a man like yourself who is highly loaded to be a man that is putting his head out for fiscal consolidation in this country together with some of your Colleagues, very few of you that you would want to opt against and advice from a body such as IMF while you brought this PPP framework? Now borrowing money from China you said something very fundamental in one hand as a politician. You said the airport is a strategic asset that Namibians must control themselves but part of the package with the deals that are signed in China and we are seeing them in other politics in other countries, our jurisdictions that China is signing deals with nations with a silent clause saying that failure of paying, your strategic assets could be taken by them.

Shrilanka is one country. Zambia is one and there are a number of countries in the Pacific that have handed over strategic assets. So does it make a big difference? So what I am trying to tell you is that we want to take, can we find consensus on what we want to do and what is the correct way of implementing the expansion of the airport. Minister of Tourism we shall also chew a bone. The statistics that we are getting that we are getting over a million tourists in the country is correct in one sense and wrong in the other sense. Correct says Venaani. I will tell you the basis, on the basis that the real tourists that really spend money in the country are around 450 000 and that is what the industry is confirming but the other 600 000 tourists are tourists that are just passing through other ports either Kasane, either the Victoria Falls and so forth.

So I think we also when we are talking about the thrust, it is true that the tourism industry is booming but even if it is booming, we should not give ourselves statistics that are deceiving us making as if one million, I have spoken to industries, tourists that are coming here that are sleeping in lodges, that are spending money in the correct sense are only half a million. So we should do more to really sell our country. The other day I was in Montreal at the airports of the world, we are seeing smaller countries such as Botswana like ours advertising their countries as a tourism destination and I tell you Namibia has more to offer than any other country. What is it that we can do to advertise more?

**HON SPEAKER**: I just want to draw your attention you have five minutes left, yes, indeed, laterally five honestly.

**HON VENAANI**: Honourable Speaker we are the only Parliament in the world that has not stop watch and please buy a stop watch because I am calculating my time. I have 15 minutes to go. I have rarely speak three times at home just to calculate from the stop watch how many minutes.

**HON SPEAKER**: No, no, no, Honourable Venaani I am not the only one. Please hang on? I want to us to be, please. I am not the only one. It is three of us actually.

**HON VENAANI**: I have started at half past. It is already 4 o'clock now. You cannot cheat my time. Get a stop watch.

**HON SPEAKER**: Please continue. Make use of the time but by 16:05 it is up.

**HON VENAANI**: It is autocratic and not fair but let it be. Honourable Speaker taxpayers are once again expected to put a wage bill. I will not take your question.

**HON SPEAKER**: Is that a point of order? Is it a question or point of order?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR, INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS AND EMPLOYMENT CREATION: I just wanted before you continue with rumours, we produce what we call tourists time sheets and these are recorded and all the tourists that are coming living here they are recorded as to how many days they spend here, where and these 600 you are talking about, I do not know where you got that from. Go and read from the book.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Please continue.

**HON VENAANI**: I am a leader who consult the industries. These are figures from the industries and I am not lying. These are industry statistics. Honourable Speaker we are about to increase the Presidency's budget because some of you have pressures the man to appoint you and that is the wrong way of budgeting in the country that the President it agreeing at least once with Venaani that the Cabinet is too large. I said it in 2013 during the consultation. The two of you were there. I am saying it now and I am right. I am vindicated by history. I want to end with the following.

I want to propose alternative ideas to change our country. We need to introduce a deliberate unit that requires our ability to deliver projects on time and on budget. This unit must be manned by highly skilled team that has experience in managing large complex projects in public and private sector. Its mission to be to coordination and planning processes for the economic clusters, communicate progress with Government and the people identify risk of escalation and to deploy top talent to debottleneck implementation challenges as they arise. There are myriad of international best practices of national deliberate units that have helped billions of savings in nations where they are successfully implemented.

The French direction General Dilatart is one. The Malaysian performance

management and deliberate unit is one Pemandim. Partisa is one. Honourable Speaker we propose a Parliamentary budget office here which would be able to play a neutral role of providing economic focus and impact study from any legislation proposed and create an enabling and efficient budget process. This proposal will mean the public will enjoy the benefit of neutral focus on the impact on the welfare on proposed Bills. We propose that Government publish on a monthly basis statistics that show expenditure, efficiency and progress in implementation of projects to better track projects. We should manage contractors for efficiency. Numerous initiatives could be launched.

We should invest in capabilities, upskill middle and senior management level across our Ministry to improve to develop operationalize and review budget. Further training in the areas of commercial capabilities and functional leadership. In the UK Government achieved savings over 300 million pounds through robust negotiations of contracts for provision. We recognize the pain and stress on state owned enterprises and we want strategic alliances to be brought in. We recognize the power of power and water utility sector. We should exist in regulatory framework of manage competition where private players also play a role.

What if we put solar energy to be able to sell solar energy to the grid? We need a society that need to rethink universal health care as envisaged in a Social Security Act for all our people to access reliable high quality health care. We propose an end to the procuring of pharmaceutical medicine that allows tenderers to buy cheap products from pharmaceutical companies for patients in our country so that they profiteer on the lives of the needy community. We propose housing loan guarantee fund to assist low and middle income, first time home buyers to access loans to decent shelter. We should set up a fund for SEM to offer grants for technology.

We propose a bigger investment in agriculture to support mechanization, irrigation projects, ham production, charcoal production and many others. In conclusion we propose to create a much more bearer healthier business echo systems that provide taxing incentives to SME for them to hire more and catapults our economy to greater heights. We propose to open

#### 02 April 2019 SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL HON SWARTZ-FISCHER

NAMFISA regulation 13 and be seen to make sure close corporation benefit from pension funds to liberalize the playing field. We propose a review of farmers and restructuring of loans with Agribank to ease the burdens on industry. Reform the large civil service. Thank you very much. I am rushing unkind.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. You know I have taken note of that fact that Honourable Venaani you move so faster in the final stages but can I just underline one thing your reference to the budget Committee or budget office this is a discussion that is ongoing and I appreciate that very much. It is part of the discussion that we are having with other Parliaments in the context of agenda for change. So I am happy to get your support as well, Honourable Swartz.

**HON SWARTZ**: Thank you Honourable Speaker. Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members I would like to thank the Honourable Minister of Finance and his team for a budget statement. I want to congratulate you as a team because it was hard work. Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members a lot was said about tax. We saw some increments to cover up but today I want to talk about illicit financial flows out of Africa. We must track it, get it and stop it. This is a serious concern. This is money that we can use for development. The Inspectors contribute to this illicit financial flow. The first one is tax evasion whereby companied deliberately hide their profits or income.

Tax invasion cause Namibia billions. Avoiding tax rob the state coffer of about 9% Namibia growth domestic product. Government relies on taxes for nearly 90% of its total spending every year. Honourable Speaker tax avoidance is number two including the value added tax, VAT, evasion of custom duties through smuggling and mispricing and corporate tax evasion shut as misuse of special zero percent VAT rate. Tax evasion and tax avoidance are generally considered critically problems for domestic

#### 02 April 2019 SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL HON SWARTZ-FISCHER

resources, mobilization in developing countries. There is a general lack of awareness of tax obligation by business owners and it is clearly a challenge for authority.

This money that we need in our country the GDP get increased if we can strengthen our existing policy. Tax avoidance whereby companies minimizes the liability. Tax avoidance scheme is a practice of depositing money into separate accounts for the purpose of avoiding tax which is due on you income often. This traction is made in foreign banks accounts and as an offshore scheme. We need that money that is going out of this country. Illicit financial flows causes huge challenges for social and economic development as well as political security on the continent.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members keep in mind as Members of Parliament and business owners out there Africa is our home. If we mess up with our home, there is no other places there where we will go. We will stay here with our problems. So illicit financial flows is very serious. If I talk about our resources that we do have but specific do we have minerals. Do we have source data of our minerals in this country? If an investor arrives in this country and he want to go to that certain area, we as a country must know what is our source? What is our value that is in that certain area and make our prices according to that?

It is why it is important that we have to capacitate and get funds for students that study to take care of our minerals in our country. Tax incentive, we must not give away our tax incentives to Europe and Asia because they do not have a diamond or any other thing. It belongs to us. Tax incentive is a Government measure that is intended to encourage individuals and business people to engage in a behavior that is a social responsibility. This helps the Government at least that we can build houses, that we can build clinics and more schools and more hospitals.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members there is many contributing factors to this illicit financial flows. We do have corruption, bribery, abusive transfer, pricing, mis-invoicing of services, trade mispricing and money laundering. There is still one that I want to talk about and that one

# 02 April 2019 SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL HON SWARTZ-FISCHER

is digital economy refers to an economy that is based on digital computing technology for example internet and so on. We increasingly perceive this as conducting through market based and the internet and worldwide web. Digital economy is also sometimes called new economy. How well we go? The law must guide us on taxing these companies.

Digital economy money is going out through different systems that they use to transfer money and it is not being taxed. You can earn money through a corrupt transaction but transfer it illegal and use it legal. We as a country can raise domestic resources through digital economy. This is to tax it. Digital economy do have disadvantages and also its advantages. Why should we tax digital economy? This is to tax me and to tax you. What will we do? In Asia Middle East, they are taxing companies. We must also amend our laws.

Honourable Minister we can tax business and service providers. If you see advertisement, who must be taxed? Laws must be clear on this issue. A policy framework must be in place to guide us how to go and not to lose out on this digital economy. Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members we have to identify the loopholes. Money must be transferred legal. Does digital economy provide any opportunity for illicit financial flows if the system is abused by those who have access of it, it is possible. Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members how will we control and how will we identify a company is legal?

If we have the law in place, we can receive revenue from these many transactions. We need infrastructure. We need to capacitate human being. We need to understand the technical set up of digital economy as it led to the creation of underground economy. The right between digital, technology and illicit financial flows is a crime. To conclude Honourable Speaker, we also have pressure groups financing who want to price each and every day the Government but do not come and say come let us sit together and do this thing.

Youths young students or boys that is vulnerable to turn the money on cell phones is how the money is going out of the different countries.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members digital economy has led to shift from value change to value network. We need to have indicative to identify the fraud. We need legal and regulatory framework for digital economy, monitoring and detection of movement of wealth. Accountable and transparency system to trade movement of digital economy Honourable Members it must not be for one day. It must be on a daily. Honourable Members of this August House we had to work together, advice Government. This is for our future and for our generation there to come. Thank you so much for listening to me. I support the Bill.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you very much, Honourable Jerry Ekandjo.

**HON EKANDJO**: Thank you Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members. Comrade Speaker the population of Africa is plus minus two to three billion more or less. The population of Africa is more or less equal to the one of China more or less the same continent meaning that Africa is a continent less with all kinds of minerals you would find on this earth. There is not a single mineral outside somewhere which we do not have as Africans and we are surrounded by the sea. On the 25<sup>th</sup> of May I think so when the Founding Father 1963 after the various attempt peacemaker and many other regional organization, regional grouping and then on the 25<sup>th</sup> of May I think it is May, Arica went and met Ethiopia.

They decided to establish an organization called OAU, Organization of African Unity and the aim of that organization was to ensure first of all for Africa to achieve political independence. This was achieved with the independence of Namibia and the democratic version in South Africa. From thereon, the next generation of leaders who were there now transformed this body into AU, African Union with the aim to embark on the second struggle which is the economic struggle for Africa. This is where we are now here now. That is why I just noted something here. I did not prepare. I just when I come I noted something.

Now when we fail to achieve this in Africa in these first countries have to research if need be restructure their economy and I am going to focus on the mineral resources of Namibia. Namibia is endowed with rich mineral resources beneath the soil and even beneath the sea. We are rich but people are poor meaning poverty are mix riches. Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members we have many mines here in Namibia. During the struggle we have said we have got copper. We are going to find copper in Okawe and Nongoporo our mineral resources. Even now we talk about our resources but do we really own it.

If one go through the various UN documents during the struggle, the United Nation especially spearheaded by the Council of Namibia they have produced many, many documents regarding the mineral, illegal exploitation of mineral resources. There was even a time when they produced this yellow reflect of uranium to boycott those countries to bring South Africa to their knees even to lease those countries who were illegally exploiting Namibian resources. Now we are independent. We have got various Mines for instance NAMDEF the former CDN.

NAMDEF, De Beers own 50% and the Government own 50% and that is very excellent. The Government can be pat on the shoulder. Then we have got Langer Heinrich Mine.

Langer Heinrich is a uranium Mine where they own 100% and the Government zero percent Rossing Mine I do not know there were talk of selling Rossing Mine now. There some talks. Whether it is sold or not yet but Rossing Mine Rio Tinto own 69%, Government 3%, Iranians 15% and South Africa 10% and others 3%. Tsumeb Smelter 100% owned and Government zero percent. Scorpion Zinc Mine Vendapa 100% owned, Government zero percent. Nawakab Gold Mine own 92.5%, Government 7.5%. Oshikoto Gold Mine B2 Gold 90% and Early Mining 10%. I am sure maybe these are some Namibia locals and others 10% and Government zero percent.

Usab Mine Swakop Uranium 90%, Government 10%. Etango Uranium Mine 100% owned, Government zero percent. Tracopia Mine Areva

100% owned, Government zero percent. Norasa Uranium 100%, Government zero percent. Roshipinah Zinc Mine 80%, Government zero percent and others 20%. Oshihafe Matelas here 95%, Government 2.6% and others 1.6%. So it can go on and go on. These I mean Comrade Speaker why I bring this and I am still convinced we can do anything. I have been saying it on many occasions that if you work whether you are a Minister or a Member of Parliament or a General Manager in a Mining or a Bank Manager or whatever, the salary you get, the monthly salary, this salary you just work to pay Municipality bills, water, electricity, send your children to school etc.

Those money will never bring you up unless you have got a business somewhere, then you can survive the same also with the Government and I am still to be convinced the tax I said on many times. The tax these many companies where we have got zero percent, this tax we get from those companies these tax will never build construct infrastructure. That is why we are borrowing. Africa is borrowing. This tax will only buy school books, medicine in the hospitals and pay civil servants and that is finished. They will only end there. If we are to develop this country, we cannot rely on tax especially Africa so the same while Africa and those with mineral resources we go and borrow. Where does those countries get money from?

Those countries get money from their mineral resources and some of them we have got more mineral resources than them. It is just like you are having a mahangu field, it is raining, you go to your neighbor and say please can you give me some mahangu and you get it but what are you doing. Why can you not work on your land? I think it is time that we should restructure we stood now think. I do not know whether we are now at 21 or 22<sup>nd</sup> century. We should now think that there is a next step. What are we going to do? I said it on many times why I say tax, I am still to convince that the tax will build the country. Why can we not for instance every month when we have got zero percent 50-50% like we do with De Beers. Why can we not do that?

The other day when we had a consultation her with the Bank of Namibia

those Members of Parliament were here. I was asking the Director of the Banks, Governor and said why instead of relying on this tax because this tax they will mine, NAMDEB will mine in the sea, Uranium and we are the fourth country in Africa, no, on the continent in the whole world. In the whole world Namibia is the fourth uranium producing country and I asked him and say why can we not for instance instead of this uranium Mines that pay tax, we said for these three years we exempt you for tax. What you should do in five regions we give you three or five, five years maximum build hospitals in five regions.

That is what we want and Mining B build a road, car road from here to point B. We give them. If we do that those within five years if they are to build hospitals, they are to build house, they are to build schools, they will spend more money I Namibia if you calculate the five motels that they build rather than the taxes they give us because the tax they will just say no, this time it is not good this yellow cake, 20 drums yellow cake. That is what they will tell you, why now because the sale at the uranium whatever but these people take uranium and they stock pile it in their countries.

They stoke pile it. If we really are to develop, we are just 2.2 million Namibians. If we continue like this 2004 we adopted Vision 2030. From 2004 up to now it is 15 years we are busy with Vision 2030. If you look that document we talk of prosperity, housing etc, etc and now there are only 11 years left before we reach Vision 2030. 11 years if you count 11 years from 2008 up to now is 11 years. If from 2008 the 11 years we could not eliminate these squatters and unemployment, are we going to do more in the remaining 11 years before 2030? That is why Comrade Speaker it is our Government not you the opposition. You remain there. Swapo will win.

That is why I am convinced that if we strategize including Africa instead of us send Africa our mineral resources somewhere with the end of the first especially the Second World War, America when they defeated Germany, they took most of the Germany Scientists to America. They took them and give them citizenship. That is why they are producing. I

think it is high time for Africa to come now to say what do we need instead of us sending our mineral resource outside, let those scientists who are there we said we just recruit to come and work in Africa and manufacture here and transfer that knowledge to the generation because Africa is more or less 50 years now independence.

If you count from 1996 up to now is it plus minus 50 years and we are just at the same but countries like Singapore, Indonesia they are surpassing us. We were in the same boat even Vietnam 1975 when they defeated America. Today Vietnam is progressing and that country was at war was born by America, was born flat but we are progressing but Africa I think it is high time.

HON SPEAKER: Point of order.

**HON VENAANI**: Sorry I think what you are addressing is a very important point. You are talking about a progressive Africa. I just want to ask you a question. Do you not think the real problem in Africa is that the people who have to decide on Africa's future and policies that affect Africa's future are actually people who if ballot is truly and correctly what it is, who are not going to be part of that future and therefore for them it is about eating today without thinking about tomorrow i.e. what I am saying is the problem with Africa is actually old leadership as opposed to having people in leadership who would be part of that future.

**HON EKANDJO**: Let me give you the problem in Namibia. 435 was adapted in 1978 and the DTA delayed it deliberately and it took ten years before we implement 435. So the problem in Namibia is DTA.

**HON SPEAKER**: Is that a point of order?

**HON VENAANI**: I think the Honourable Member should not be advised by me but the resolution 435 is as a result of the labour of DTA. He must remember that.

HON SPEAKER: You still have the floor.

**HON EKANDJO**: Comrade Speaker if Jesus Christ was alive today on earth, he would have been 2019 old today meaning that if someone speaks about the Bible that time I was not there. I will even hug and say what, what. So it is a pity the time the DTA from 1975 when they met here some of us were not there. I am a pity some of when the DTA making a Tenhale some of you were not there. So you want to know the history of the DTA. I can teach DTA but not you.

HON SPEAKER: Please continue are you done? Please continue.

**HON EKANDJO**: Yes, it is because Comrade Speaker some Honourable Members when I was sometimes I went to West Africa and there was, I think we went to Geneva, there was UN. When I was the Minister of Home Affairs UN conference on crime and drugs and whatever, we were in Geneva and one lady from EU was saying Honourable Minister when did you decide to join politics? I decided to join politics etc, etc and I was looking at the lady. Maybe you are the one who decided politics. Some people are product of the situation that created delegation of. So I am saying this that when it comes to the DTA do not speak because I said the problem in Namibia is DTA so you do not know so do not come and judge because you do not know.

Maybe you only join DTA seven years ago but not the past from 1975 up to now 1978. So let me continue. The other issue Comrade Speaker is the timber. Comrade was driving I think is yesterday or the day before yesterday on Sunday to Windhoek and he come across the truck full of timber. I think it is the time that our Government just put a moratorium on this cutting of timber. We have got students in VTC training joinery, carpentry, woodwork and some years, we had Katima Saw Meal and Kavango Saw Meal.

They were producing chairs and whatever instead of us sending this timber outside and buy furniture, we can it ourselves. I think it is high time for the moratorium really those tricks yes and we do not need an Act of Parliament to bring this to stop. We just put a moratorium like we did with others. The Minister of Fisheries put a moratorium on fishery at some time. The Minister of Mines also put a moratorium on dealing this diamond dealing. Why can we not put a moratorium starting from now? We just say from now on no timber travelling transportation. It is just a suggestion.

Now road carnage. I am speaking about road carnage I have been speaking here many times about this road and train etc. I have been speaking but this time I am not speaking because oi the 11<sup>th</sup> of this month I lost two family members by death between Windhoek and Okahandja on the 11<sup>th</sup> of March. One is a son he is a soldier NDF born by my sister who follow the one after me. He has got a house in Okahandja. He is NDF. Every weekend he goes to his home in Okahandja and Monday he came to Windhoek. He was travelling in that car with his sister-in-law because his brother's wife is also a soldier. They work in NDF and between Windhoek and Okahandja somewhere there get a collision and they burnt to ashes up today. Four people died but I am not talking about because of that accident.

Up to now the DNA and forensic are still been done because when I conducted because those people want to bury, they say apparently they have now to test the DNA because the smallest bone is the fingers and the toes and they must put all these they must collect it and then put the

bodies in the coffin exactly from head to the foot and a finger a small piece of finger must not need to be put to another body or the toes to the other. Each one must put in each other. That is who it takes long up to now. They said they will only bring the results after 120 days meaning after four months but I am not going to speak on that.

I have been speaking on this Namibia is one of the few countries that rely on road transportation and they said once you are in a car whether you drive or somebody drive, you are a candidate for accident. Once you are in a car you are a candidate. You might end up in a coffin in a mortuary. You might end up in a wheelchair. You might end up without a head and just walking like a chicken without a head. So now Comrade Speaker we have got trains. I said it many times we have got trains here. I was watching a film in Kenya. In Kenya they have got trains. The Chinese constructed trains there, bullets trains and they run from 200 to 300 kilometers per hour.

Our trains the fastest speed is 80 kilometers an hour. Now if you go to Khorixas, to Kamanjab, to Katima Mulilo, to Keetmanshoop you cannot go on a train. Comrade Speaker you remember in the 50s when we were going with this chuku, chuku, chuku from Karasburg when you go to Omaruru the train has to climb and then we used to walk out from the train and walk on foot because the train was slow. You remember those days. So nowadays even if you go on a train, you want to go to Oshakati to Walvis Bay, today is Tuesday, you will arrive in Walvis Bay Friday and you go to Oshakati you will arrive end of April. Then are you arriving in Oshakati.

That is why people opted for cars and there is a road carnage on the road. I was saying why can we not every year the Government put N\$10 Billion if our budget is N\$60-70 Billion every year we put N\$10 Billion aside. This N\$10 Billion is to build pillars just for the road, pillars and then maybe the height of that and then the trains are on pillars, the cars and the donkeys and the people can walk beneath because if we introduce a bullet train now, it is accidents. In the rural areas if the train pass there you look no train is coming. While you cross here it comes. The kudus, the cattle

and in the road is accident. Let us put aside N\$10 Billion every year.

If we put N\$10 Billion every year, within 20 years we will complete the rail network and by that we can travel faster on a bullet train and minimize the road accident because now we only rely on roads. We only rely on roads and the other issue Comrade is tendering. I also mention when we met with the Bank of Namibia tendering. Comrade I admire the Ministry of Mines and the Ministry of Fisheries. The Ministry of Fisheries when they give fisher quarters they do not give to foreign nationals. They give fish quarters to Namibians. You got a fish quarter and then you look now for somebody. You team up with somebody having who is having all these boats and whatever. You team up with him, then you team up, then you can get it.

The Ministry of Mines if they give EPL, they reserve the EPL to Namibians and it is only you Namibians and then you team up with investors to look for Mines. Tendering we open up tendering to international community. You build a dam, hospital or a dam or a road. We open up and the result is here comes ordinary poor Johannes. He tender and then Johannes is only having a wheelbarrow and this is a person in Europe. He tender. He comes with machinery even in his tendering there, I within finish that bridge within three months. Automatically it will be given to him not to the one with, why cannot the tendering be limited to Namibians and then it is upon this particular Namibian who got the tender who can now go out and say I got a tender, can we team up.

At least the Namibians you own the tendering. Then they pass now. It is just like I am having a car. My neighbor here is having a taxi license driving and taxi license. We team up. She is having a license, I am having a car then we team up. Why can we not just limit the tendering to Namibians but if we give all tendering these companies, these companies will take the money. Where are you going to invest the money? Besides employing Namibians and pay their salaries but the big chunk of the money will take to their countries but if we give the tendering to the Namibians and (incomplete).

HON SPEAKER: On a point of order.

**HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY**: Comrade with all due, I think I rise on the point of information. You are hammering on the tenders being given to Namibians and they team up with foreigners also. The experience we have when they team up with the foreigners, immediately they sell their percentage to the foreigner and he is given the briefcase full of cash and we are not interested in creating companies and we have seen it. We have seen it. It is the same with fisheries quarters and so forth unless Comrade we put up the law that if you are given a tender and you team up with somebody, we expect you in the next three or five years to report that what you have how many people have you recruited and so forth. In the absence of that, it would be business as usual. Thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you.

**HON EKANDJO**: Thank you General. Your idea is very good. You see Kennedy when John Kennedy in the 60s when he was the President of America he said if you hope the Americans America will one day reach the moon. He just throw it open and then the person on the moon and then the scientists and whatever worked on it. So I mean if the idea comes, those who are being implanting must now see to it because they have got experiences of Namibians who got the tender, once they get the tender they run away. Now we have got experience. So before we put it into Motion, we must now put stop all these loopholes like we have got these youth office half building in Opuwo to today and there are also some damage infrastructure somewhere. When the people get money, they build half and they run away.

I think this experience of 20 years or more we must stop the loopholes and put strict measures to see that once you have got a tender, I think this mechanism can be put. We can put mechanism. That is a very good idea Comrade General and I think also on the question of land especially with the auctioning of land. Maybe we can take auctioning of land. Maybe this but not auction. In Cuba they say land is the only heritage of the Cuban people. That is their only heritage. I think we must also have the same structure that we must not sell or auction our land because I think at one of the resolutions in our Congress, we also took such.

No selling of land but lease. We can even Botswana the state owned but now the DTA sell the whole land. The other thing is (incomplete).

HON SPEAKER: Is that a point of order.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Honourable Member I want to ask you a question. It is common cause, now that you lost your Presidential beat not that you would have had a much better prospects of progression in any event but I want to ask you this question. You as a member of the ruling party, a ruling party that is known.

HON SPEAKER: Please no dialogue.

HON MUHARUKUA: Honourable Speaker the point of order.

HON EKANDJO: Because I am listening and he is not addressing the

02 April 2019

#### SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL HON EKANDJO

point of order.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Let me address it sorry, sorry. As a member of the ruling party, a ruling party that is currently busy selling off Namibian land to foreigners whether through the pretext of a lease hold whatever the case maybe, what do you have to say as a senior member of such party about deals where a Russian that have four farms in Namibia, five farms is now getting four further farms and we are standing on a brink of 78 000 worth of land in the form of Erindi that this Government wants to sell to foreigners. What do you have to say as a senior member of that party?

**HON EKANDJO**: Comrade Speaker, whenever I speak to the DTA he stand up. Are you a DTA or PDM?

HON SPEAKER: That is a question.

**HON EKANDJO**: Are you a DTA or because I mentioned DTA not PDM?

**HON SPEAKER**: Already Prime Minister you want to answer the question. Wait for the microphone.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Thank you Honourable. You see we are the PDM. The reason why we are the PDM is this, is because we realize all

those who were DTA walk over to Swapo and they did not just walk into anything. They walked into leadership position. So the whole of DTA and the people that committed those things that you alleged the DTA has committed most of them are actually in Swapo. In actual fact they are doing what they were doing in DTA within Swapo. That is why Swapo is in shumble today.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Are you done?

**HON EKANDJO**: No, no, not done but Prime Minister wanted to put a question.

HON SPEAKER: Continue please.

**HON EKANDJO**: Alright, Prime Minister you wanted to say something. Let me continue Comrade Speaker. The other issue is I think alright, this is for veteran. I will come to the veteran vote. I will speak to the Veterans Vote.

**HON SPEAKER**: You are disturbing the Honourable Member. Please continue.

**HON EKANDJO**: The other issue is Comrade Speaker when I was in the Local Government I received a copy of the constitution of Omeya this

township on the road to Rehoboth. This copy what I received state that and they have got such many what do you call it Golf SA in South Africa with a democratization in South Africa, many farmers those who wanted to back date apartheid they transformed their farms into golf estate and there they are now wanted to have a house and you must apply and decided depending on them whether they will be allowed to have the house there and mostly golf estate in South Africa is only white people who are there.

I received a copy and that copy was stating that if you are in there, first of all if you are to apply to get a plot or there has to be a resident of Omeya, you must first join the Omeya this association of Omeya whatever. You must be a member and this is now there are prerogatives whether they accept you or not and there were rules. If you have got domestic workers after 6, they must not be around. They must be at their area a kind of apartheid something like that. They must be there and even of visit if somebody from Katutura come and visit you, you must first apply and then they will say who is coming to visit. They can say yes, let her come or not. There are many apartheid rules.

So then I decided that if they are to do practicing that let us extend the boundary of Windhoek because before that the boundary of Windhoek and at the roadblock here on the way to Rehoboth this roadblock even Heroes Acre was outside the boundary of Windhoek. On the way to Gobabis to the airport, the boundaries of Windhoek was up to the roadblocks and to Okahandja where it was at Yanga Pan Motors. That is where the boundary was and on the west to roadblock from Dan Viljoen to Dan Viljoen but when we received this we say no, if they want break it, let us extend the boundaries and we extend the boundaries of Windhoek that even Sears is part of Windhoek.

Even the airport and Omeya between Windhoek and Rehoboth that is where the boundary is so that Municipal by-laws can apply to Omeya and from here to Okahandja up to where the roadblock is now but in doing so now the aim was because the City of Windhoek when they extend when they build, they just building from Katutura in the mountain. That is where

Windhoek extend and the idea was so that the Municipality of Windhoek if they have got money they can buy all this flat area to the airport to Okahandja. It is a flat area. Then they built townships there rather than in the mountains but now the farmers in that are now since they are part of the Municipality, the prices also went up.

The value of the farms up and the value is now up but unfortunately, Groet Aub also became a victim. Groet Aub is now part of the city and we were not consulted and this is a rural area. I think it is high time for the Ministry of Urban and Rural Development to de-proclaim Groet Aub so that it can be a settlement within the Windhoek rural constituency instead of Municipal by-law applying to Groet Aub. Those are village people. They have got cattle. They have got goats and chicken and they slaughter the goats there. Now that the Municipality will come and say no, no, you cannot have a chicken. You cannot have what, what. I think it is really high time for the Ministry to de-proclaim Groet Aub within the city so that it must not be part of the City of Windhoek.

With this in mind Comrade I thank you very much and Swapo is there to remain forever and forever and ever and ever for generation to come. Swapo will rule this country. Thank you very much Comrade Speaker.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. For the time left I think we should move on, Honourable Doctor Ankama you still want to make a contribution on the budget, alright. Yes, you have the floor.

#### HON DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE PRIME MINISTER OFFICE:

Thank you. Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members I support the Bill fully but then I have got some few things just to outline. The important thing is that usually when we meet at this particular time, I would like to talk about many, many things. Much of it was like the Public Service Act of which is now on the way. I am not going to talk about that anymore,

#### SECOND READING: APPROPRIATION BILL HON DR ANKAMA

things like the airport, Air Namibia and all that. I am not going to talk about that. What I want to highlight this time Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members I wanted to see Namibia in particular looking at budgeting for capital projects.

When I talk about capital projects like in the past, I would like to see capital projects that would run over 15 to 20, 25 years. This would be capital projects that when we do budget, we budget continuously. So at this point in time you would want to see a contribution being made to a project that would stay for 25 years under construction. At the end of the day we will definitely say yes, if we started years back we would be very happy for example I would think of like we always have this current drought and floods. Why can we not turn these things to something profitable for the country?

Angola is right high. Namibia is down. Whenever it rains up there in Angola the water runs down to the sea. Northern Namibia with the Kuvela Delta it stretches so what we could do is to be practical, practical to create the harvesting of water that would definitely create or come with additional activities, water spot surrounding for example planting of foods like irrigation schemes. You could create things like lodges and hotels around there and many, many activities so that at the end of the day we feel we have got something that we can be proud of as a nation.

Now we keep on crying to the world it is flooding system. We are flooded. Then you hear some people yes, we have got tents and we have got all these foods and tents. I mean until when can we have this? Until when do you want to play I have it all and then you want also the world to contribute continuously on the same thing that could create a positive outcome out of that?

Now the capital projects could be anything else other than that but all what I want to say is that when we budget this time, I would time around this for example next year Financial Year and others years let us think of the capital project even if we contribute the minimal of N\$10-N\$25 Million. It is the beginning. It is going. After 25 years, 30 years you have got

something substantial and then I would like to walk away from there and then talk about the training. You see as a country Namibia is getting now maturing 29 years and 30 years is a big base, yes, please.

HON SPEAKER: Point of order.

**HON DINGARA**: I want to ask a very small question to Doctor. Ankama. Thank you very much. I am very interesting. I feel I think that is a good point that you have started with the one of the capital projects. I want to have a proper understanding. Do you mean like the State House. It was budgeted as a capital project and it was constructed over years but when the Founding President proposed it people did not want it. It means if we could say no it is true what the people are saying that we must not build it. We were going to have this as a State House and not to have a pride the old State House. I can remember the political parties some of the DTA I do not like to mention the name because some of them they are now here. They are not here now. So they were completely against construction of the new State House and now that it was finished, every Namibian is very proud about to have it. Do you mean projects like that one and so on and so on?

HON SPEAKER: Wait a minute is that a question?

**HON MUHARUKUA**: It is a point of order procedurally it is Honourable Speaker.

**HON SPEAKER**: Hang on, hang on, let me have some order. The question was directed to whom?

HON MUHARUKUA: But it is a procedural issue.

**HON SPEAKER**: No, no, but let him answer first and you deal with it, Honourable Doctor Ankama please.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE PRIME MINISTER OFFICE:

Thank you, thank you very much Honourable Speaker. I would like to thank the Honourable Comrade for the question. Definitely a capital project is any capital project that would make the nation proud. So it should be a capital project that would make us proud to feel we have achieved something sub-standard. State House is one but if you come up with capital projects that would definitely speak to the minds of the people to the benefit of the people, it would create in a way a positive image within the heart of the people. So it is something that will create employment opportunities, skills transfer and all that.

HON SPEAKER: Can you finish answering?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE PRIME MINISTER OFFICE:

So I am talking of I am proposing a capital project that is ongoing that would eventually benefit our generations, the next generation to come. So that is what I am referring to as a capital project. Comrade Speaker.

**HON SPEAKER**: Did you object to that yes, but I mean I want to come back to you? There was a point of order from Honourable Muharukua. Do you still want to insist on the point of order?

**HON MUHARUKUA:** Honourable Speaker I do not have as much to say. I think it has much to do with that so for fear of derailing him, I think he can complete and then I can come in after him or I can do it, I have no problem.

HON SPEAKER: Fine, I accept the explanation, Honourable Ankama please.

## HON DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE PRIME MINISTER OFFICE:

Thank you Comrade Speaker. The second point I wanted to make reference to is you know we have got a shortage of skills training. You know skills training is a problem in Namibia and self-employment. All what we want to do is to send our children to schools and eventually they should go and look for good jobs, go and look for good jobs from where? I thought when you go to school basically, you are going there to be impacted with knowledge and skills so that when you come back you create this self-employment and for others or maybe you join the labour market with the necessary tools at the end so that you create something practical out of your knowledge.

Skills training is a shortage in Namibia in particular. I can attest to that because you can employ individual with papers. Papers alone do not make any impact on practical application. So I think it is high time that we review or revisit our curriculum not necessarily because others are doing the same in other countries but we should look at what we need as a country. For us to be able to equip our learners or our people with the

necessary tools, we need to understand what the labour market requires. Talking alone does not help first and emulating what the others are doing in some other countries does not solve our problems. So I think we should come back to the drawing table and you know ask ourselves are we doing the right thing. Do our people have the necessary skills that would help the economy to grow? For example when you are at school from primary school you train learners to understand.

Let me give you an example. Health education is no longer being perceived as such like the way we used to have it, health education. Now you will be because other economic situation you would be confronted with things like hepatitis A and B and all the likes why, because people are not paid illegal to poverty because poverty is as a result of economic situation but regardless of that you needed somebody to understand what to do first to prevent one from getting this very nasty disease. So health education help us from the early beginning as children. You want to train those as young individuals so that as they grow it is part of their thinking on a daily basis.

As people grow I want to give you another example those who have gone up to high school. Usually if you have got science you would go to the lab and be shown how to do for example distillation. I am just giving you one distillation process how it happens from fermentation process to distillation process so until you distilled something liquid that is either usable, creatable or whatever it is. Now when we do these things, we do not use local products. Even if we have samples that we get from other countries to show very nice, we should convert these two local products so that people learn how to know as Okanjama that you are talking about. This is illegal that is distilled even if you go right now in many parts of the country, you will see these people doing.

They have got no formal education but they know yes, these products are ready for production. I should start producing them now. They know exactly from A to Z. If you have to teach these people to train these people at school level, you are going to train people to understand how they make medicines for example, how they make spirits of different types

for example. So you equip the people with the necessary skills. I have seen something just recently that I also enjoy. It is lukia. It is called Embe. Embe is what you call Bethlambs right, they are the Embe.

If you look at the Embe bottle is more like the Omarura bottle even the taste. This is the typical Embe but it is somebody else from one somewhere from I do not know European who have to come to Namibia and do this. I have seen Embe products being sold in China. I have got pictures and they cost about nine hundred something meaning that the Chinese have come here. They harvested Embe, they distilled it. Now school the essence of schooling I know about what we call home schooling but the essence of schooling what we call community school was created as a result of you know need of impacting knowledge to individuals so that they can help in production of this or the other.

The problem we have is we are too westernized in terms of following everything that we get from the western world yet we have got a lot of products that we can use here. We do not make use of this. So I would want to see education being funded in this way. After graduation, alright, during the training they should be trained specifically on things from the unknown to the known from those things that we buy from somewhere else to those things that we produce here that we have access to it and then after completion of maybe high school or mid high school, then they branch out to what we call vocational training for example and the vocational training should make use of our local products, all sorts of local products we have got here in this country should be made use of it.

People practice and when they come with practice, the product they use we sell on a special price because these are done as demonstration. These are products that are done for people to sharpen their skills so that is where I feel education should be funded towards that realization. Something else I want to talk about is perhaps food production. Food production in this country can be done. Number one we have got a lot of able bodied youths. We have got money. We can buy three-four, five farms. You can create structures there like hostels. They can work there for five weeks or ten weeks or maybe six months continuously with

irrigation, being supervised then produce food.

They go for three months back home or five months back home. The other team goes there so we address that situation of unemployment. That is number one and we create sufficient food for the country. Food bank for example but when you have got such a vast country, you have got prerenal rivers as well. When you have got such and you have got money, what makes it so difficult to identify four farms just to start with or maybe two just two? You have got people in vocational training. When they finish what you do, you take a couple of them, right you have done mechanical, engineering or whatever it is, yes, you go here. You only take care of the practice or the machinery.

You, you know how to drive, yes, you drive the machines and you are just there to do the cleaning and the mending of the fencing. So what they say is you group these people, you give them to competent groups of people to manage them. Five months later you take another group the other group goes home for a rest. When they go home believe me or not, they are going to start what they have been doing at the farm at their homes. Definitely you address the issue of unemployment that is number one. You address the issue of food scarcity and then you address the issue of sharpening of skills or skills transfer because you may bring in other people from somewhere else around the world.

The last one I want to address is the construction of projects or construction project. Rehoboth is just here. I know people from Rehoboth. These are the best. People from Rehoboth are the best when it comes to construction be it now building or be now road construction. Now with this in mind we say fine, we have got vocational training, we can just take about say for example every region has got a vocational training centre. You take about maybe two per each vocational training centre just for that specific area of construction you know carpentry, whatever you have it, brick laying and all that so that when they graduate, they go literally. You take with the funded project. You take them literally. You go and build these houses. We monitor you, we give you somebody to check on you until you finish and then you go on bridges.

We want bridges where you pass the bridge you stop and check who is behind this thing. Now at this moment you just have got things that you do not know whether to test who, design this whether he was going or sitting or he was coming. So we need people to get skills so that whenever they doing somewhere, they do something proper in such a way that when you look at it you want to stand and admire the work of the person. Comrade Speaker I would like to thank you for the opportunity.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. I think we have gone as far as possible on the budget. We should for the little time we have, let us turn our attention to the next item. The next item the Secretary will read, yes, in fact we have gone as far as possible on the budget and we have three political parties that are due to speak on the budget tomorrow and that is Swapo, APP and UPM. I would like a Member from any of those three Colleagues to adjourn the debate on the discussion of the budget, yes, Honourable Nauyoma.

**<u>HON NAUYOMA</u>**: Thank you Speaker. I adjourn the debate until tomorrow at the usual time 14:30

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. So we have done away with that.

The Secretary will read the second order of the day.

**RESUMPTION OF RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL [B.15 – 2018]** 

# PRECARIOUS SITUATION PREVAILING AT THE PUBLIC SERVICE MEDICAL AID SCHEME HON KAVETUNA

**<u>SECRETARY</u>**: Resumption of Reconsideration – *Public Enterprises Governance Bill* [B. 15 – 2018].

**HON SPEAKER**: Now I will not go into details. All I know is that this issue is deferred until tomorrow to allow the consultation to be completed so we will skip that item, so decided and we move to the third item.

The Secretary will read the third order of the day.

# RESUMPTION OF DEBATE ON THE PRECARIOUS SITUATION PREVAILING AT THE PUBLIC SERVICE MEDICAL AID SCHEME

**SECRETARY:** Resumption of Debate on the precarious situation prevailing at the Public Service Medical Aid Scheme.

**HON SPEAKER**: When the Assembly adjourn on Tuesday the 26<sup>th</sup> March 2019 the question before the Assembly was the Motion by Honourable Venaani that the Motion be adopted. Honourable Deputy Minister of Health and Social Services adjourned the debate and I now have a pleasure to call on her.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES**: Honourable Speaker I would like to ask the indulgence of the House.

# PRECARIOUS SITUATION PREVAILING AT THE PUBLIC SERVICE MEDICAL AID SCHEME HON HINDA-MBUENDE

**HON SPEAKER**: Is there anyone who would like to take the floor? Otherwise, I will respectfully follow the Deputy Minister and adjourn the discussion on the matter. That is until next week. If there are no taker, until tomorrow.

# HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Next month.

HON SPEAKER: You mean until next week I am assuming?

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES**: I actually want to forfeit the chance because I would like to contribute in regard to the budget rather than discussing the topic as such.

**HON SPEAKER**: I mean until for the budget? That is the request. Thank you very much. Since there are no other people who are willing to contribute, so decided until after the budget.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS**: I think Honourable Speaker my Colleague is saying she is forfeiting the opportunity for taking it on because she want to include it in her budget statement. I would want to take it on but I wanted to find out because next week with this budget thing when is the most possible date after the sonar.

# PRECARIOUS SITUATION PREVAILING AT THE PUBLIC SERVICE MEDICAL AID SCHEME HON HINDA-MBUENDE

**HON SPEAKER**: I think honestly that is why we are saying to be safe it might be better to have actually slot immediately after the budget. Well, there is a space between the  $10^{\text{th}}$  and the  $11^{\text{th}}$  so we go. I thought we have resolved the issue but you are reopening it. Are you listening Honourable?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS: I am listening.

**HON SPEAKER**: Are you in agreement? Can we find a space between the  $10^{\text{th}}$  and the  $11^{\text{th}}$ ? Are you comfortable with that?

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS**: On the Thursday I do not have a calendar.

HON SPEAKER: You have this piece of paper.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS: Tuesday, yes I agree.

**HON SPEAKER**: Alright so we will conveniently put it in there and then you have your chance to contribute, so decided. Thank you very much.

So the Secretary will read the third order of the day.

# BANK OF NAMIBIA BILL HON SHANGHALA

#### **RESUMPTION OF DEBATE ON SECOND READING – BANK OF NAMIBIA BILL [B.1 – 2019]**

**<u>SECRETARY</u>**: Resumption of Debate on Second Reading – *Bank of Namibia Bill* [B.1 – 2019].

**HON SPEAKER**: No, no, that is the one we have done is it not? The third so we are on the fourth, thank you very much. When the Assembly adjourn on Tuesday  $26^{th}$  March 2019 the question before the Assembly was the Motion by the Honourable Finance Minister that the Bill be read a second time. The Honourable Minister of Justice adjourned the debate and I now give him the floor.

**HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE**: Thank you Honourable Speaker. The Bank of Namibia is a crucial institution central to the economic functioning of our economic system. This body together with the other bodies that regulates the non-banking sector are custodians of our economy. The important instruments in that particularly first it is a constitutional body but being Government's bank, it plays a central role in advising the fiscas and Government on fiscal matters. Now the Bill at hand is improving the existing legislation which have been improved once or twice before and the fashion in which it is being improved is that the instrument is wholesale being replaced by the Bank of Namibia Bill 2019.

I support this move because it centrality and amendments being made to such a central instrument which you have to read and cross reference are difficult. The instrument will house all the amendments in one new instrument moving and hopefully into the new regulatory framework which would be ushered to buttress the system the non-banking sector by the other instruments hopefully the Fin Bill and the non-banking sector

# BANK OF NAMIBIA BILL HON SHANGHALA

regulatory, I cannot recall the name but it would be I am sure the Minister will cover it in his response. I think Honourable Speaker the opportunity is now for us to ask if it has been set time and again that the structure of the economy has not much changed since pre-independence. What are those institutions fundamental suggestions into the reform of the structure of the economy now that we are moving into regulatory environment to an instrument that allows it a little bit more flexibility and powers, it is up to date with the rest of the world. What will it be proposing? Will it be proposing fundamental restructuring of the economy because we hardly interact with this institution, hardly hear Honourable Kavekotora in his Committee saying that they have engaged with the Central Bank, you do?

If you do, could you be so kind as to request them to advice this House how it can play a role in its vision of how it can restructure the economy in making it modern and prudent well, given the situation that we are in. The reason I am asking this is that one of the tools that we have is the budget. The Minister of Finance use that policy to try and impact. There are an institution that regulate on their own so they also have a role to play I think if their powers and insulant. How can we cross utilize and how can this House facilitate that whether through this particular legislation or other forthcoming legislation. There is also a very important reason if I talk of the twin pics regulation because nowadays you have a bank it has an insurance arm. It has a financial investment arm but the bank regulates the banking part of it Central Bank and the others are regulated by NAMFISA.

How do we see and maybe this is a question to the Minister to consider the role that would be played by these two institutions advising the Minister in a more a coherent manner because the restriping regulation is beneficial that you have a separation but the treatment of the financial the market is one and we have two players that are regulating. Is there a need for, well to keep the vital toilet system or do we allow them and what are the benefits and disadvantages that perhaps the Minister can enlighten but I am also looking to the Honourable Kavekotora because I think he has been long in this game now with the Committee and through your engagement, you could also want to enlighten us on how this institution

#### BANK OF NAMIBIA BILL HON HINDA-MBUENDE

could be empowered and the landscape could be made much more convenient in that respect.

Lastly, finances have now permeated every aspect of our lives through the cell phones and through the instruments that we have gadgets all over but the electronic transactions they are capable of being hacked because they are on line. I know the Honourable Kavekotora is looking at me. It is not EVM and they are not on line. EVMs are different but how are we protected as consumers in that respect in this instrument. These are the few additions and contributions I wanted to make Honourable Speaker. These are the few comments I wanted to make. Thank you very much.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. Yes, my system is not indicating the Honourable Hinda-Mbuende.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS**: Honourable Speaker I am also in the same dilemma that I will not be in the House next week but I wanted to find out first of all in terms of procedure how do it work when like the infrastructures has eloquently explained what is repeal that it is repealing two Acts to be replaced but I wanted to understand is it not procedurally necessary in circumstances such as this where you talk about very important institution that we have the information presented of what the former Bills entails, the former Act so that we know what is it that we are amending and what is new and what is old. I also want to proceed to say that there are other pertinent issues that I found lacking and I would really want to contribute but unfortunately, I am out on a mission until Wednesday so I would be here Thursday that I want to rise on the point to say one, that the Members to be presented with the other Act.

How do you try to get one from internet and I am only getting someone with one with I think it is probably still a working document and not the final one that it has highlighted parts of that the amendment. So what I am

#### BANK OF NAMIBIA BILL HON NEKUNDI

trying to say is that if we can be given the other repealed Act if it is procedurally allowed and secondly if this can also be on the order paper on Thursday the 11<sup>th</sup> for my contribution because it is like (incomplete).

**HON SPEAKER**: You are putting the Chairperson I a very difficult position. You are on the floor. You had your say. It is a question so the Minister will be able to respond, yes, Honourable Nekundi please.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Thank you very much Comrade Speaker. Mine is basically to ask the indulgence of the House if it can be postponed to next week Tuesday.

HON SPEAKER: Next week Tuesday.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Yes, please if nobody is going for tomorrow.

**HON SPEAKER**: I do not see any hand. I do not see anybody who would like to contribute. Yes, in the absence of further contribution, the request is that we take up the subject next Tuesday.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Yes, please

### BANK OF NAMIBIA BILL HON SCHLETTWEIN

**HON SPEAKER**: Honourable Minister is that going to inconvenience you?

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Honourable Speaker I do recall that there are postponements until the  $10^{th}$  by Honourable Nico Smit already so if we can start with the discussion on Tuesday no problem.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you.

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: The Act under which the Bank is operating now is available on the internet so Members can offload it. It is there. So I do not think we have ot provide it. It is available.

**HON SPEAKER**: Very good, thank you very much. With that understanding, we will take up the subject next Tuesday, so decided. Well, we have gone as far as possible but I am using every opportunity of the time.

The notice of a Motion is the one of the Honourable Minister of Information and Communication Technology. Does the Honourable Minister move that the Bill be now introduced.

**HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY**: Honourable Speaker having appreciated the agenda that we have in terms of the budget, the little time that would be left after we conclude the budget and the fact that I do not want to put the Members here under any undue pressure in terms of considering this Bill, I am

### BANK OF NAMIBIA BILL HON SHANGHALA

moving that the notice that I gave be withdrawn and then resubmitted in the next session of this Assembly.

I so move Comrade Speaker.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. Eloquently presented and fully appreciated by Members of the House. Is that accepted? Thank you very much. Now that is a very constructive way of managing our time. Thank you very much indeed, yes, Honourable Minister of Justice.

**HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE**: I rise on a point of information Honourable Speaker. Honourable Speaker I rise on a point of information which perhaps I could ask the table office tomorrow to provide further information on. I find that a lot of Members have difficulty finding the laws that were promulgated and passed with this Parliament and the information I have is that the National Assembly website has not only the legislation passed after independence. It has pre-independence legislation and regulations. So if a Member were to research any law that is being introduced here, I would provide information to the effect that the first point of call should be the National Assembly website failing which you could go to the Law Reform and Development Commission website failing which you could go to the Legal Assitance Centre website. All these laws are in an anatated format and they are also available in period format whole document format so it would then be hold a Member who wants to contribute on an issue to start there and research.

Secondly, when legislation repeals legislation prior enacted by this House or before this House came into be, that legislation would be listed in the schedule to the legislation proposed so it is easy for you to identify the number of the year and the year and if you should fail in that aspect, there is a way I think we can assist you. The point of information is brought so that we may make it easier also for Colleagues who are bringing matters assuming that we have all used the gadgets that the Honourable Stanley

#### ADJOURNMENT HON PROF KATJAVIVI

Simataa has given us to utilize them to record and have acces to these documents.

There are those wh surrendered. I am not talking about those ones. Those ones can effect for themselves. The table office is then requested through you Honourable Speaker to perhaps provide the specific address that one can go and click onto even if it is just put on the tables for Honourable Members to have. You can access it whether you are in the House or you are not in the House or whetehr you travellign so it can help you prepare. Thank you Speaker.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. That would be very kind and very, very helpful. That information as outlined by the Minister of Justice is available on website and other sources as indicated by the Minister and I also believe that our own legal division are also accessible. They could also assist any Member who wishes to have access to such information but I also want to endorse your request to the table office to provide that those details to be readily available to Members of Parliament for their own immediate use in case if any of you do not have access to such information. So thank you very much. We have a good run. We are over the time. The House stands adjourn until tomorrow the usual time, so decided. Thank you very much.

#### HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:46 UNTIL 03.04.2019 AT 14:30

## NATIONAL ASSEMBLY ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS WINDHOEK 03 APRIL, 2019

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER** took the Chair and read the Prayer and Affirmation.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Are there maybe any petitions? Reports of Standing and Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Reports and Papers I recognize Honourable Deputy Minister of Finance.

# **TABLING – REPORTS OF AUDITOR-GENERAL**

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, I lay upon the Table, Reports of the Auditor-General on the account of:

- (i) National Planning Commission for the Financial Year ended 31 March 2018.
- (ii) Office of the Attorney-General for the Financial Year ended 31 March 2018.
- (iii) And finally Ministry of Justice equally for the Financial Year ended 31 March 2018.

I so move Honourable Deputy Speaker.

## TABLING OF REPORTS HON NDJOZE-OJO

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Please Table the Report. Any other Reports and Papers? I recognize Honourable Deputy Minister of Higher Education, Training and Innovation Dr Ndjoze-Ojo.

# TABLING – ANNUAL REPORT OF NAMIBIA TRAINIG AUTHORITY

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, TRAINING AND INNOVATION: Actually yes, most important. Honourable Deputy I lay upon the Table the annual report of the Namibia Training Authority for the years 2017 to 2018.

I so move Honourable Deputy Speaker.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Please Table the report. Thank you, any other Reports and Papers? I recognize Honourable Kavetuna the Deputy Minister of Health and Social Services. Oh, okay, any other Reports and Papers? Notices of Questions? Notices of Motions? None. Message from the Head of State? Ministerial Statements? Then we go to the Order Papers. I was thinking that we can shift the Order Paper but somebody said it can jut remain as is to start with Committee Stage. Okay let us honour the Order Paper as it is then.

The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

# **RESUMPTION OF DEBATE ON SECOND READING – APPROPRIATION BILL [B.3 – 2019]**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Debate on Second Reading -

## CONDUCT OF BUSINESS OF ASSEMBLY HON VENAANI

Appropriation Bill [B.3 – 2019].

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: When this Assembly adjourned yesterday the  $2^{nd}$  of April 2019 the question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Minister of Finance that the Bill be read a second time. Honourable Nauyoma adjourned the debate and he now has the floor, Honourable Nauyoma.

HON VENAANI: On a Point of Order?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes, Honourable McHenry Venaani.

HON VENAANI: Honourable Speaker?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Deputy Speaker.

**HON VENAANI**: Honourable Deputy Speaker, this is a statement of regret.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Come again.

HON VENAANI: That it makes it difficult for us to conduct business in

### CONDUCT OF BUSINESS OF ASSEMBLY HON VENAANI

this House when the presidium is telling half truths and they are biased.

We demand, we are the only legislature I the world that does not have a Stop Watch. In fact it is a standard that in any Legislature when we are giving people time to speak there must be a Stop Watch. It is not the Speaker nor the Deputy Speaker who should say your time is up, the Stop Watch must be able to do that thing. In fact what it does is it closes off your microphone if you time is up. Yesterday I spoke for 26.7 minutes on the Stop Watch and I was told I spoke for 45 minutes. Yes that is the Stop Watch that we have up there. Yes that is the Stop Watch that we So we are demanding that when time is allocated to have there. Opposition Parties that there is a Stop Watch in this House because these things you are ruling and saying that the Table Office has said, I have just confronted the Table Office, yesterday they did not say something like that to the Speaker but the Speaker was saying that the Table Office even confirmed. We will not be in this House to be bullied by the presiding, nonsense (interruptions and noise).

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Honourable Venaani you said that yesterday and I should think we take note of that and we will bite but yesterday was just yesterday (intervention).

HON !NAWASES-TAEYELE: (Not on microphone).

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: No I am coming there. I am coming there. Honourable Venaani let us respect one another.

HON VENAANI: You must also respect others.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: No, I respect you. Can we listen to one another. Respect is not equivalent to call us nonsense. Who is nonsense now? Can you withdraw that thing, the leader of the Official Opposition can you stand up and withdraw that statement. If you are not going to do it you will live with it. Okay Honourable Nauyoma you have the floor.

HON NAUYOMA: Thank you Honourable Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes you have the floor.

**<u>HON NAUYOMA</u>**: Deputy Speaker, I cannot continue in an environment like this one.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: What does this mean now?

# (HON MEMBERS SPEAKING OFF MICROPHONE)

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Honourable Nauyoma can you stand up and take the floor please?

HON MEMBER: Adjourn the House.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Oh, adjourn the House for what now *(laughter)?* Yes you have the floor.

**<u>HON NAUYOMA</u>**: Thank you Honourable Deputy Speaker, that is something of the day. Honourable Deputy Speaker, I stand to make my contribution to the Appropriation Bill of 2019/2020 *(intervention)*.

HON MEMBER: Member must withdraw.

**HON !NAWASES-TAEYELE**: The Leader of the Official Opposition must withdraw the statement it is a rude utterance *(noise and no order)*.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Can I come in? To them the word nonsense is okay maybe if somebody also says nonsense to them it is okay. You have the floor. Honourable Nauyoma you have the floor. *(Noise)* 

Ah, sit down! No, sit down! You sit down. Honourable Nauyoma you have the floor. Nauyoma stand up and talk.

HON NAUYOMA: I cannot operate (intervention).

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order! Order!

## PARLIAMENTARY PROCEDURES HON NANDI-NDAITWAH

HON NAUYOMA: I cannot operate in a congested environment like this.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Honourable Chief Whip, let us have some order. you have the floor?

**HON NAUYOMA**: No I think you are giving to your Chief Whip the floor.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Chief Whip?

**<u>HON NAUYOMA</u>**: Then you cannot take the Chief Whip out. Can you not remove your Chief Whip Deputy Speaker to allow me to speak *(indistinct).* 

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: You have the floor now, yes Honourable Deputy Prime Minister?

### (NO ORDER AND NOISE)

# HON DEPUTY PRIME MINISTER AND MINISTER OF INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS AND COOPERATION:

Honourable Deputy Speaker, we are here as lawmakers ha and we are making records which is going to be referenced by the generations that are

### PARLIAMENTARY PROCEDURES HON NANDI-NDAITWAH

coming after us. I also know that we have what we consider Parliamentary language and as lawmakers once you create a precedence it will become a reference point sometimes which can even be used in the Court of Law it does not matter it is in Parliament. Are we really saying that if you put those two words together they become Parliamentary? It is known the issue is a none friendly, can that become a Parliamentary word? It is just read to understand and to underline it because you are making history and it is going to be in our Hansard that that word now in Namibia is established whether you are talking across the floor, whether you are talking formally we are making this a Parliamentarian language in the Namibian Parliament.

#### HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes thank you.

**HON DEPUTY PRIME MINISTER AND MINISTER OF INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS AND COOPERATION:** And now we are directing to the Presiding Officer and we know that according to our Rules the Presiding Officer is representing this House and there to be respected. Unless if there is anything that the Presiding Officer has done wrong our procedure says it should go to the Committee of Rules but otherwise in the Chamber the Presiding Officer, you would not even argue with the Presiding Officer. I just want to make this for records purposes to say you should avoid to create precedence that will replace when the generation coming is going to review our work in the Chamber. Thank you Comrade Deputy Speaker.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Thank you. I am responding to what she said now. I did not give you the floor. Yes I agree with you. Nonsense is a non Parliamentarian language and I humbly ask the Honourable Leader of Official Opposition to withdraw. He said he will never withdraw it.

۰,

## 03 April 2019

## PARLIAMENTARY PROCEDURES HON VENAANI

HON !NAWASES-TAEYELE: (Not on microphone).

**HON VENAANI**: Yeah, the word nonsense as a noun means, 'spoken already words that have no meaning or make no sense'. It is an ordinary Parliamentary language used across the world. I am leaving now.

HON !NAWASES-TAEYELE: That will not be accepted.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: No it is not accepted.

HON VENAANI: And I am leaving.

HON MEMBER: Ah have some order (intervention).

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Let him go.

HON MEMBER: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I said I want the floor.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: No you will be given a chance because you have already spoken, after she speaks you will be given a chance. Yes

## 03 April 2019

# PARLIAMENTARY PROCEDURES HON NDJOZE-OJO

Honourable?

# HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, TRAINING

**AND INNOVATION**: I would have liked to appeal to the leader of the Opposition to have stayed in because I wanted to talk to him directly and personally but the microphone would not come on. So maybe he is also listening. It is extremely important that we cannot all stand up at the same time and scream in this House. Sometimes you have three, four standing people and the people are staying on a point of order and he is talking at the same time and he has not been given authority to speak by the Presiding Officer. So that is something that we should fix across the board and if there is a disagreement between the speaker and the Presiding Officer for any reason it is expected that you sit down. You do not stand and speak to the Presiding Officer standing. Those are some of the rules that we just have to observe. Those are general rules if we are to keep order in this House.

Another thing I wanted to talk to is that respect begets respect. Respect begets respect, so if you want to be respected you should respect other people and your respect you will get is just as far back as you can respect other people. So this is a House that is why it is called an Honourable House because it is a House of assumed respect and there are certain words that are just not acceptable that are not Parliamentary in nature and in sound it does not matter what the word means the context detects the meaning of the word.

So we were listening very carefully to the Leader of the Opposition raising his objections and he has reasons for raising that objection and we were to take into consideration his objection then he punctuated it with 'nonsense' and then it just watered down the credible complaint that he has had. So please subsequently let us mind the words we use if we want to be respected so that this House remains a respectable House it is. I thank you.

## PARLIAMENTARY PROCEDURES HON MUHARUKUA

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Thank you for that prudent intervention, very prudent. With that can we now give the floor to *(intervention)*. You have the floor. Very brief so that we proceed to the agenda point.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Yes Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Deputy Prime Minister said what we do here creates precedence. What is happening or what led to this denigration is something I have said before. More than often or perhaps always fingers are pointed at opposition if things go wrong in the House but the first point of departure in the wrong path starts with the Presidium when the Chairperson and the Speaker and the Deputy Speaker are biased towards the Ruling Party *(intervention)*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: We are not biased.

HON MUHARUKUA: No do not defend.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: No we are not biased.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: The fact, if you identify yourself as the Chairperson or a Speaker of the House with the Ruling Party, the current Deputy Speaker today has said, "Maybe it is fine if nonsense is said to them". Who is them?

## PARLIAMENTARY PROCEDURES HON MUHARUKUA

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Because you refused to apologize, what should I do now?

**HON MUHARUKUA**: No, the question is who is them and who is *(intervention).* 

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: You the person who said that.

HON MUHARUKUA: Are we having a dialogue now?

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: No, no you cannot blame me it is your leaders. It is your leader, it is you to apologize.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: No I am saying, I have the floor, can I have protection from you?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes you so.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Okay thank you, what we do and what we say indeed sets precedence so the conduct of the Members especially the senior Members is also creating the precedence as to how the activities of this House is conducted. More than often Cabinet, the Presiding Officers,

## PARLIAMENTARY PROCEDURES HON MUHARUKUA

today the Ruling Party Chief Whip stood up, it is not her time to speak, she is not given the floor, she starts hailing but what is happening is when the other side *(intervention)*.

HON !NAWASES-TAEYELE: On a point of order?

HON MUHARUKUA: No I am on a point of order.

HON !NAWASES-TAEYELE: (Not on microphone).

HON MUHARUKUA: No you do not have the floor.

HON **!NAWASES-TAEYELE**: Honourable Deputy Speaker, nobody *(intervention)*.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Yes Chief Whip he can talk and you follow up. I will give you the floor.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Yes she did not have the floor. The Speaker does not stop her, it would have to take an Opposition Member in the person of me to stand up admittedly being unruly to get her to keep quiet and to get the Speaker to realize that she is being unruly but who would be the villa?

The villa is the other side, so the Speaker's biasness (intervention).

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: No we are not biased.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: So the Speaker, the Deputy Speaker and the Speaker in this House you are an extension of the Ruling Party you are not Presiding Officers you are an extension of the Ruling Party.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: I am not, as I am here I am Deputy Speaker presiding now. Yes your leader of the Official Opposition has started with a dilemma in which we find ourselves, very eloquently. At the end he insulted who and he ends up with 'nonsense'. Suppose now you are here how do you react?

HON MUHARUKUA: (Not on microphone).

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: No, no we proceed now. I am pointing to end up the debate on this issue. We are going to proceed with the debate of the Order Paper. Honourable Nauyoma please you have the floor.

**HON NAUYOMA**: Thank you very much Honourable Deputy Speaker. Honourable Deputy Speaker, let me check my time first. No it is fine yes. Honourable Speaker, I stand to contribute to the Appropriation Bill of 2019/2020. Of course this budget comes at a time when our country is

fighting economic crisis. Nevertheless there must always be hope that things might get better. The budget is supposed to speak to development and provide some stimulus to the development of the economy but given the nature of the budget when we look at the moneys allocated to sectors like agriculture, youth and SMEs it leaves a lot of uncertainty whether we are going to make some progress in this part.

The sad part is that the economy continues to go down and we are not picking up at all. We are hoping that it might be picking up for the 0% something which is really a very sorry state of affairs. One would wish to see a budget collapsing in a way that gives an opportunity for business to flourish for the economy to grow but as matters stand at present you can see most of the budget at 49% of the budget goes to social sector which is not that bad. Of course we know it is election year people should be fed to realize it but my worry is that how long are we going to sustain the social sectors if the businesses are not growing, if the economy is not growing, we are unlikely not to sustain this kind of arrangements in the future.

But nevertheless be that as it may the domestic economy continues to contrast and the fact that one would wish to see is not really coming through. When we look at the situation of schools today where we have a lot of our youngsters living in shacks across the country that are built by themselves or by the parents next to schools because of the arrangements that is made to change curriculum which is not in my view well thought of, it creates a lot of questions than answers that how long are we going to sustain an education system that has been in this order like this because you do not know what is what anymore at our schools. Our commercial *(intervention)* 

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point of order?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Thank you

very much Comrade Deputy Speaker. could I ask the Honourable an important question?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Do you accept the question?

HON NAUYOMA: No.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: He does not.

**<u>HON NAUYOMA</u>**: No. Yes or no, it is yes or no on the question. Let me continue. Comrade Speaker, our Public Enterprises continue to *(intervention)*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes Point of order. You are standing on?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Information.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes proceed.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: I do not need his approval. The Honourable Member spoke of the social progress that is in the budget. These are important to our people. It will possibly be very much of importance to the electorate there to understand from APP what programmes must be removed from the budget in order for our people to suffer?

**HON NAUYOMA**: I think you got it wrong my brother. I did not say remove the social programmes, I said how long are we going to sustain them if the other side where money is supposed to come from is not taken care of, that is my argument. When we look at our public commercial enterprises they continue to remain dependant on the bail out from the State where we expected them to be of help to the development of the economy. Now one wonders how long we are going to continue putting money where there is no profit. Most of these companies are not making any profits and we continue to give them money.

HON MEMBER: Which 'them'?

**HON NAUYOMA**: The Air Namibia are them, the TransNamib are them. How long are we going to sustain such a situation given the situation that the economy is not growing it is going down. Very soon we will hear we are not even able to bail them out, that is one worry one would want to see.

The standard of living of our people continues to go down. As you move around the country shacks are becoming more everywhere, yes everywhere it is just shacks. That gives a meaning that the standards of lives continue to go down which to me is a worrying trend. I am happy that taxing has gone up a bit. I think that one is a welcomed development

because this (intervention).

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes point of order.

**HON MINISTER OF LAND REFORM**: Honourable Nauyoma a small question, my brother I just want to know *(intervention)*.

HON NAUYOMA: No, I refuse questions today.

HON MINISTER OF LAND REFORM: Okay.

HON NAUYOMA: Sorry my cousin. I was saying (intervention).

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes point of order?

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Comrade Deputy Speaker just a point of information. The Honourable Member said the living standard has been going down. The most recent at least statistics report indicates that January poverty has been reduced from 28% to 17% and extreme poverty has been reduced to 10%. That is a direct reflection of living standards which indicates that that statement is actually not evidenced by the statistics.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is the information at hand.

**HON NAUYOMA**: No, statistics is one thing but reality is another but when we get there the reality will tell you what is happening on the ground. That is why we are not improving our performance because we rely more on statistics but the reality on the ground will tell you a completely different picture altogether. We were just complaining of late that we are rated a middle income State, that our Government has been complaining oh no it cannot be rated to a middle income State it is because of the statistics ha, then we are complaining that this is not true reflection of what we are.

Honourable Speaker let me continue where I left off (intervention).

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point of order.

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Honourable Deputy Speaker, again on a point of information, the Honourable Member says that the measure of statistics is not reflecting reality. It is something different than the real life outside there. My information is that the measure of statistics is in fact measuring exactly that it is versus what people spend their money on and how much they spend on each of the items. The poorer you are the more you spend on food, the more wealth you are the more you spend on none food items. That is exactly what the statistics are measuring. So to say that it is not measuring the facts on the ground is again wrong, I am afraid to say. Thank you.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Yes statistics, what kind of research *(intervention)*.

HON NAUYOMA: No that is your line of argument of course.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: You have used to come to the conclusion that poverty is increasing the other people are saying those are in terms of statistics, okay.

**HON SHIXWAMENI**: Just on a point of information around quality of lives, poverty and all these kinds of things I think we must differentiate between lifting people out of poverty and people's quality of lives remaining stagnant or having dropped because if you were earning N\$10,000 and over the years both inflation the cost of things has gone up and you can no longer afford what you used to afford you could as well say that the quality or the standard of my life has dropped and you can no longer afford what I used to afford you could as well say that the quality of the standard of my life has dropped because I can no longer afford what I used to afford. So I think the whole thing of living standards have to be defined accordingly and we live to actually adjust the concept now and then. Just as a point of information Comrade Deputy Speaker, thank you.

**HON NAUYOMA**: No I was saying the taxes have gone up which I think is a good thing because I know alcohol is one of the problems that is engulfing our nation, all over the place every second day you see if not buying at the bottle store yes I think the type of interventions might held to reduce the consumption of these substances that are really destroying our communities.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order there. Thank you, proceed.

**<u>HON NAUYOMA</u>**: Honourable Speaker, I want also to speak on the issue of Medical Aid Scheme contributions.

#### HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The?

**HON NAUYOMA**: The medical aid that is projected to double and I know most of our civil servants, public officials are already finding it very difficult to survive on the meager salaries that are there. Now if you are to double the contribution of the public servants on this medical aid, I know you are again adding more burdens to an income that is already burdened. Therefore I think to me this is not really a well thought idea that can really put thousands of people in a burden that they will not be able to afford. Say you are contributing N\$600 per month now you are expected to contribute N\$1,200 on the same salary if you are to double, just for argument sake, are you going really to make ends meet in that process?

Therefore I think it is about time really that the Honourable Minister of Finance to go back and rethink about these arrangements. I think we have problems we know but we cannot solve problems with another. Therefore with these two words I really repeal the budget with real mixed feelings therefore I hand over to my President to continue where I have left off. I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I recognize Honourable Mushelenga.

## 03 April 2019 SECOND READING – APPROPRIATION BILL HON DR MUSHELENGA

#### HON MINISTER OF URBAN AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:

Honourable Deputy Speaker Honourable Members, I rise to contribute to the general debate on the Appropriation Bill,  $\{B3 - 2019\}$ . The ministry of Finance should be commended for the efforts that it has been making in collecting revenue over the past years. Generally revenue collection in developing countries is low due to inefficiencies and malpractices in tax administration. For example in the publication titled 'Why Do Developing Countries take so Little' published in the journal of Economic Perspective, Timothy Basle and Tyson Beson state that on average the tax to gross domestic that is GDP ratio among developing countries stands at between 10% to 20% where as for developed countries it stands at about 40%.

It is pleasing to note that trends in Namibia of revenue collection illustrates at 27.4% tax to GDP ratio for the 2019 to 2020 fiscal year with a previous fiscal year tax to GDP ratio standing at 28.3%. It is a fact that tax revenue represents 89.73% of the budget in the current fiscal year and 91% in the previous fiscal year. Given the tax significant effect on the overall budget I support proposed increases in taxes and the broadening of tax base by way of collective revenue from all income and from foreign sources and from business entities of charitable and regional institutions. There is logic in taxing these business entities as they are shifting to legal personalities but pay dividends to their shareholders who are then exempted from tax payment.

Honourable Deputy Speaker some Honourable Members in this august House criticize the budget giving an impress that there is no light at the end of the tunnel.

However their arguments are not based on a statistical data or empirical evidence from research. I would like to submit that with the downturn on the economy it is important that the capital injection into the economy by giving lifeline to economic sectors accordingly, I support the annotation of N\$12,000,000 for the economic and infrastructure sectors as the amounts includes railway network rehabilitation which I believe will facilitate easing the burden of psycho transport on the road network. Wilnaude and

## 03 April 2019 SECOND READING – APPROPRIATION BILL HON DR MUSHELENGA

Marianne Matte put forth in their paper titled, 'The Significance of Transport Cost in Africa' published in the United Nations University Policy brief that transport costs paid by African countries are almost trite and high at the world average. They maintain that and I quote, "Lack of adequate transport infrastructure makes it difficult for firms to distribute their products and to obtain economies of scale. The type of goods produced also affects the country's ability to reap economies of scales that are sheer reduction in per unit transport costs".

Accordingly, I applaud provisions in the current budget for the allocation of N\$116,000,000 in the current Financial Year and a total of N\$319,000,000 in the Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF) period for the upgrading of roads between Gobabis to Otjinene and from Gobabis to Aminos and from Aminos to Aranos to bitumen standards. The fees will enhance the transportation of goods and thus increases economic activities within Omaheke and Hardap Regions.

Similarly I support the allocation of N\$319,000,000 in the current Financial Year and a total allocation of N\$468,000,000 in the current Medium Term Expenditure Framework period for the upgrading of Swakopmund to Kamanjab road which will eventually facilitate trading between Namibia and her northern neighbour Angola. These projects will boost the construction industry and provide employment during the construction phase. This industry is too important to fail as most of our SMEs from the previously disadvantaged groups are found in these sectors. It is further important to mention that a number of entrepreneurs in this category are the youths the backbone of our nation.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, urbanization has been on the increase over the past years a trend that is not only common in Namibia but in Sub Saharan Africa. It makes it imperative for the parallel development of both urban and rural areas the sectors which yours truly is responsible for. Rapid urbanization places strain on the infrastructure in Local Authorities. Accordingly it is very important that Local Authorities should prioritize on their capital projects allocations to ensure that there is service delivery in the public. The importance of infrastructure to meet the needs of our

## 03 April 2019 SECOND READING – APPROPRIATION BILL HON DR MUSHELENGA

rapid growing population and ever involving technology cannot be understated. In this respect I support the allocation in the current Financial Year of N\$561,000,000 for construction services in urban areas and the allocation of N\$99,300,000 to rural infrastructure development and sanitation infrastructure development in rural areas. Infrastructure development cannot be realized to the full in the Local Authorities if there is no involvement of various stakeholders.

Accordingly, smart partnerships like Public Private Partnerships (PPPs) are necessary to address the infrastructure development projects. A study conducted in three Sub Saharan African countries by the Africa Capacity Building Foundation about three years ago to recommend the adoption of the strategy when it concluded that there are limitations on the capacity of Governments to mobilize resources for infrastructure development.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, let me now turn to my area of academic expertise international relations. Recently SADC convened a solidarity conference in support of the cause of the Saharan Arab Democratic Republic which Namibia attended. I commend the declaration of the conference which called for among others for Kingdom of Morocco to fully adhere to the principles and cause enshrined in the African Union Constitution Act especially the need to respect colonial borders as they existed at the time of independence. The delay in implementing the United Nations and African Union Resolutions on the question of Western Sahara is a deliberate and primitive disregard of international law that has no place in the world that applauds the principles or the rights of self determination and demonstrates political maturity that brings descends to human kind. Those that are folding their arms and turning blind eyes on the question of Western Sahara will be judged by history for committing sins of commission.

The same is applicable to the question of Palestine which for many years has remained unresolved despite numerous decisions taken at various forums in UN particularly the General Assembly. The double standard behaviours of none powerful forces, the international political system are not doing good to advancing our universe to great destiny. Instead they

are furthering the illegal occupation of the Palestinian territories. May a safe introspection and consciousness prevail among this process they eventually follow an appropriate cause in their world history of our contemporary side.

During the six years celebration of the Cuba revolution this year the leader of the Community Party Castro bemoan the confrontational posture that has been adopted in the current US/Cuba relations making a draw back in a programme that has been built in the past years. This is further confirmed by the US based independent institution the Council on Foreign Relations in its discourse about US/Cuba relations authored by Clare Felter Dan Herenvik and Rosie Kala Labureta, they highlighted the setbacks by the current administration following the adoption of the June 2017 Memorandum which prohibited different transactions with Cuban owned entities.

They further pointed out that Cuba is a country which has been subjected to embargoes by the Unites States of America for a longest period in the world history. I continue to express my unequivocal support to the people of Cuba and denounce any attempt by anyone to patronize them in their quest for obscuring the course that pursuits their aspirations. With these words Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members I support the Appropriation Bill Number 3 of 2019 and I put my case to rest, I thank you.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Thank you. I recognize Honourable Kavetuna.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Thank you very much Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, investing in health not only saves lives it is also a virtually investment in the wider economies. This is because ill health

entice productivity, industrial prospects and adversaries affect human capital development. There has been a strong political and historical commitment to treating health as a social bond either through legislation or mandating or prioritizing expenditure on health. A World Health Organization country profiles our Government allocations to allocate more than 13% of the national budget to health to make us the second highest spender on health care in Africa following South Africa with 14%.

The key question is why it is universally accepted that health is a noble and worthwhile investment. How can we demonstrate value for money especially in areas that complete with for funding, would you believe me if I tell you that investing in health is profitable for Government? We know that countries' expenditures on health are widely considered to be an economic risk as well as a debit for the broader economy and for economy growth.

Despite this popular notion and increasing numbers of trends and evidence turned in the reverse direction particularly with imaging economies like ours and for some key developed economies, investment in health care directly benefits the economy growth of each country. Health expenditure provides equal opportunities according to David Lipton the first Deputy Managing Director of the IMF. He said, "*Expenditure in health and education are the great equalizer*" a statement should not be political or ideological in character particularly for imaging economies where access to basic health care services often (indistinct) these allows for more solid basis and netting for them to pursue their economic and competitive goals.

Health expenditures translate into productive behave the most researched documentary part of the entire debate connecting health and economies is summed up with a praise by the first President of Tanzania Umze Julius Mwalimu Kamparange Nyerere who said, "A health nation is a developed nation. There will never be development if people are not health".

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, my footing with this kind of introduction is to remind this august House that health is a fundamental human right and should be treated as such. In this context I

would like to touch on very topical issues in the health domain which are core to the transformation of health care systems such as the burden of care on the Government, the super inflationary annual increases in private medical fund to contributions noting that private medical aid funds are not for profit by law and that the above inflationary increases in contribution are being driven by excessive increases in a cost of delivering health care and a cost of associated with administering the medical aid fund. The challenges facing the CIMAS our medical aid, the legislative flows and in some instances a sub optimal application of laws that is driving Namibians of care they deserve and lastly. The need to realize that universal has that coverage as a matter of urgency.

As you all know the Government of Namibia is dedicated to reduce poverty and balancing things in equities that exist within our country. The Ministry of Health and Social Services is challenged with providing health care to all Namibians in a manner that is accessible, equitable, across the population and affordable to the extent that it does not place an excessive financial burden on the people of Namibia particularly the vulnerable and the poor segment of our population. The National Health Account 2015 revealed an increase in the proportion of household expenditure on health care that which increased from 6.3% of the total health expenditure in 2008/2009 to 9% in 2014/2015. High proportion of disposable income trend on health care are inequitable and proved to be inefficient and generally unsustainable means of financing health care.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, it is a generally accepted fact that the financing of health care will take a lower priority than food or shelter in any household which means that the vulnerable segment of our population will not make provision or even worse have financial means to gain access to health care of their own accord. The results will be that especially those specimens for the population will have no access to care and become a burden on the State. With the current economic climate and the impact that it is having on a disposable household income the proportion of the population that is becoming dependant on the State for provision of their health care needs.

A further concern in relations to prevailing in equalities in health care relates to the fact that 36% of the total expenditure is paid through medical aid funds and CIMAS but that fund only cover for an expenditure of only 19% of the Namibian population. This implies that the 64% of the total health expenditure is used to cover the remaining 81% of the population which comprises mostly the informal workers, the unemployed and the other vulnerable segment of our community.

For example if one considers the health care financing which was available in 2018/2019 Financial Year the private Medical Aid Fund which caters for only 8% of the population had a budget of N\$4,100,000,000 whereas CIMAS received a budget allocation of N\$2,500,000,000 to cater for 10% of the Namibian population while the Ministry of Health and Social Services had a budget of N\$6,500,000,000 to cater for 82% in addition to none health care operational expenses. The trends that can be observed with respect to CIMAS or to a lesser expense with private medical aid funds points towards a system that is not going to be sustainable in the long run.

This suggests that along our journey towards building a more equitable and affordable health care system we will have to reflect on how these entities have been managed until now and how better we can improve. Efforts have been made to further investigate these issues to ensure that the health spending is sufficient and equitable across the population and to this end the Universal Health Care Coverage is the answer.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, Universal Health Care Coverage is defined as ensuring that all people have access to the needed health services. This includes the prevention, the promotion, the treatment, the rehabilitation and validation of sufficient quality to be expected while also ensuring that the use of these services does not expose the users to financial hardship. Universal Health Care Coverage has therefore become a major goal for health reform in many countries and a priority objective of the World Health Organization. It is important to realize that the notion of Universal Health Care Coverage does not only refer to the financing of the health care or brazing with the current or

former models of health insurance. It presence a completely new approach that indeed breaks with the past, changes the focus to all encompassing equity agenda and surely it is a marathon not a sprint.

Universal Health Care Coverage firstly addresses the country's current approach to health care where the quality and type of services people receive is informed to more by their socio economic status rather than their need for care. Instead it adopts the population based approach. This means that the budget will be allocated based on how many people live in that area and what their diseases profile and their health care needs are. If properly implemented this approach should result in lower health costs over time because diseases like diabetes and hypertension could be detected earlier and health conditions will be managed more efficiently.

The second major merit is that it looks at health services through previndication approaches that services are need, what, who needs the services and who will deliver the services? This means that it would separate who procures the health services, who has for those who deliver them. It also promotes reinvestment models that incentivize the provision of the quality of care as opposed to the volume of care. People in rural areas are largely depending on the early under resourced public settle. At the centre of this Universal Health Care system is a promise that everyone will have access in health care where they need it without incurring vast expenses. By consolidating their health market the Universal Health Care Coverage opened doors for more equitable allocations of resources.

It is easily successfully implemented. This approach offer a real opportunity to address the country's grossly unequal access to quality health care services.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, in conclusion Universal Health Care Coverage (UHCC) whether through an introduction of the National Health Insurance or other modalities should be seen as an opportunity to bring about much needed health care reports in Namibia but we need to wake up to the fact that implementing this highly complex new systems will be more like running a marathon rather than a sprit. We must

## 03 April 2019 SECOND READING – APPROPRIATION BILL HON IIVULA-ITHANA

identify and pursue the small gains that can be made towards the achievements of this greater objective. A good starting point towards the realizing this idea will be to consider the structure proposed in a preliminary report published by the Health Market Enquiries which was recently conducted in South Africa and we can learn from that. I thank you and I whole heartedly support the Bill. I thank you.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Thank you. I recognize Honourable Pendukeni livula Ithana.

**HON IIVULA-ITHANA**: Thank you Comrade Deputy Speaker. Comrade Speaker, allow me to quote from one of the Namibian comedians who said that, "*Namibia was created in anger*" Namibia was created in anger and I tend to agree with him. Everything in our country seems to be angry, from nature to human beings, from our wildlife to the weather. I rise to make a contribution to the debate for this year taking place in a year and a time when everything else seems to be angry. Heaven is angry with us, yes Heaven seems to be angry with us because in my many years on earth I have never witnessed a year like this one where in April and still in April there are farmers looking up to heaven to receive the first drop of rain in April and our rain season is supposed to start in October/November. April is supposed to be the last month of our rain season.

The debate is taking place at the time when our economy has suffered tremendously and this is not an issue of governance or individuals it is an issue that in all can realize that somewhere somehow nature is angry with Namibia. Yes nature seems to be angry with us and we seem to be angry ourselves as well because there is no single day that passes without hearing of someone who has lost a life unnaturally. There is no single day therefore really Namibia where our wildlife can terminate our lives whether it is lions, elephants, snakes and everything seems to be angry.

## 03 April 2019 SECOND READING – APPROPRIATION BILL HON IIVULA-ITHANA

In Asia elephants are termed to entertain. I do not know whether our elephants can be termed here. In other countries in other places snakes are not venomous but in Namibia but in Namibia you are bitten by a snake you are condemned to the mortuary, everything seems to be angry in Namibia. So Comrade Speaker, I am not saying this *(intervention)*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point of order.

HON SHIXWAMENI: (Not on microphone)... a little question.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Do you accept the question? Yes?

**HON SHIXWAMENI**: Honourable Iivula-Ithana, I just do not know in this anger where Namibia and all its animals and the people are angry where do you place and locate the issue of climate change around the happenings that is taking place around us in terms of the rain, in terms of the drought, in terms of so many things? I cannot comment on snakes and others.

**HON IIVULA-ITHANA**: Thank you Honourable Speaker, I do not know whether it is coincidence that the weather is conniving with climate change and whatever is influencing the other Namibia is suffering and I look at that as part of the anger. So Comrade Deputy Speaker, I was saying I am not saying what I am saying because of lack of sympathy. I have the greatest sympathy to the Minister of Finance because whatever we want done and whatever we had hoped for is not in a position to satisfy

# 03 April 2019 SECOND READING – APPROPRIATION BILL HON IIVULA-ITHANA

our wishes and our wants because realistically his resources are limited and are limited by the facts or factors that we all know.

So Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Minister of Finance I rise to support the budget inspite what I have said. Honourable Deputy Speaker, inspite of what I have said with the sympathy and support I think we need to sit down and look at what can be done what is doable under the circumstances because travelling elsewhere I have realized that maybe we need to remodel and prioritize our policy, priorities as we had them then when all things were in place. Last year we travelled with a group from Parliament to China. We visited various provinces, of course China is a continent by itself, a province is almost like a country but there is something that I learnt from their system that I think we can if we so wish we can have a look at it.

Our Regional Governments up to now are not capacitated, capacitated to take charge of the regional resources that is available and that is why possibly you find that in some regions the economic activities seem to have drifted into some unpalatable commodities it is alcohol, and alcohol. So if our Regional Governments could be capacitated so that they collect revenue from the business activities therein place in those areas. I do not think the tax collection by the Central Government gets really everything that it is the old get I do not think so and I think in that fashion also that the Regional Governments are capacitated to plan for regional activities economic activities. I think that can take us somewhere because *(intervention)*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point of order.

HON MUHARUKWA: Just a question for clarity?

### HON IIVULA-ITHANA: Yes.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: I initially understood you to mean that regions must collect to Central Government but given that you are now talking about planning is it to suggest that the Regional Governments collect their own revenue for the use in those respective regions or is it now collection for central portion taken not because if it is for the use of that particular locality *(intervention)*.

HON IIVULA-ITHANA: Are you asking or you are telling me?

**HON MUHARUKUA**: I am asking. Yes because I am just giving the reason why I am asking and it is just to understand because the idea initially I loved but when you are talking about planning I am starting to wonder. If you take some regions business is not really that good and if they are to use only that budget plus maybe a little addition that you have to struggle and might give us a bit of a problem so I just want to know.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes?

**HON IIVULA-ITHANA**: Yes Comrade Speaker, the collection of revenue is the responsibility of the fiscas but if Regional Governments could be given incentives in such a way that when they collect revenue within their regions of so much they will be entitled to a certain percentage of that revenue to remain in the regions. So that will encourage them to really do it because I do not think as it is currently the

Ministry of Finance is collecting everything that is due to it because they may not even know if somebody has not registered for tax collection or tax payment, who will know that such a business entity is not paying tax? But the Government closer to such establishment will know so I was coming from that angle. Planning in terms of for example this money that they will be given by the Ministry of Finance on account of them having collected so much they should be in a position to plan what to use it for within that particular region.

Comrade Deputy Speaker, we are sitting with young people who are unemployed and this has been going on for some time and if we can learn from others as well, Botswana has a system of helping young graduates get funding to do certain activities. Of course they go through certain training and then they are supported to set up their business and after some time they are allowed to move on on their own. So I am just saying there are certain things that we can look at and make them our priorities.

The other thing is we keep saying agriculture is the backbone of our economy which is true. A country without the capacity to produce its own food is doomed. To engage in agriculture in this country you must have resources of your own really or obviously in the rural areas you get seeds, fertilizers sometimes but it is not enough. The increase to work with in agriculture are all embodied without exception and the tax slapped on these implements coming from outside is so huge, so heavy and I am saying if we want to encourage many people to get involved in agriculture, why do we not give them incentives then they produce more?

Now you produce mahangu, you go and buy for yourself a tractor at an exorbitant price and you cultivate mahangu and mahangu production is labour intensive from ploughing to sawing, to weeding, to harvesting, to thrashing until you ha, no unending this somewhere have weight, it is labour intensive. But then you will not have a price. You look at the price offered by Government I am telling you, you feel like saying I am not going to cultivate any longer I would rather just go and buy from Government but does that encourage production? It does not definitely and I think Honourable Minister we should look at that. We want to grow

our economy. How do we grow it when we are not assisting, when we are not helping particularly those local investors? Some of us want to be local investors but the environment is not made conducive, it is not conducive really.

I want Namibia to become my wish before the sun sets in the area where I come from when you go there today you think that it has been a desert. The North was so afforested but if you go there today it is a desert. One of the years I raised the issue of the palm trees and I am going to talk about it today. I am happy some faces there who used not to like what I would say about palm trees are not here. Palm trees, Comrade Deputy Speaker *(intervention)*.

HON MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM: We are here generally.

**HON IIVULA-ITHANA**: You are here but yes you are my young brother, I am talking about some other faces. Palm trees Comrade Deputy Speaker are a vegetation that destroys other vegetations. Where palm trees grow you must forget about other trees. Omusati, Omuholo, the indigenous trees get destroyed but I think the Northern part of the country needs education, Comrade Shifeta that northern part of this country needs education in terms of what type of vegetation we should plant? Not palm trees. Some people were arguing that yes we get fruits. What fruits? Of course yes but can we just keep them for the sake of Ondonga and Okanyoka or some other indigenous trees are environmentally beneficial because the leaves are edible by *(intervention)*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point of order.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE OFFICE OF THE PRIME

**MINISTER**: I am very sorry to ask my neighbour a question whilst she is presenting a very good topical issue but Comrade Iivula-Ithana I know you know palm trees very well, their products and if need be their marketing in terms of what it is over other than what we are getting right now. From roots, stem, to leaves, to fruits, to choices of the types and all that I think you know and why do you not think palm trees are only in specific areas of jurisdiction and other vegetations are more in a very specific area of their own as well. Can we not keep them both multiplying where palm trees are growing more and leave the others in their area of jurisdiction in terms of growing, do you not think that that would help us?

**HON IIVULA-ITHANA**: Thank you for the question but yes I hope this is not eating into my time. Makalani trees or Omilunga I do not think there is anybody here who can tell me that someone is planting these Makalani trees, no, they are not planted they grow wild and therefore they prevent others from growing in the same area and this *(intervention)*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes point of order.

**HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY**: I want to ask Honourable Ithana a small question.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Do you accept the question Honourable?

HON IIVULA-ITHANA: Yes.

**HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY**: I want to know if this is proven beyond reasonable doubt scientifically because I also grew up in an area as you said many years you have lived in Namibia. I lived more years than the Honourable but I grew up in an area where there are also palm trees where they are grown even in our own yards and still there are other indigenous trees like Mwandi, Omive and the rest just there. Maybe it is in other areas where they eat the other indigenous trees possibly but is it proven I want to know scientifically? Thank you.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Yes from the Presiding Officer I just want to *(intervention)*.

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Practically?

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Yes practically because I just want to add to what the Honourable Minister of Safety and Security has stated because I am aware in particular certain areas in the north/west, yes you find these trees where it appears that there are no others. Btu I have notices that there is certain areas as you travel from Kavango Region there are some palm trees there and there are other vegetations. Am I the only one to notice that? if you can answer that.

**HON IIVULA-ITHANA**: Yes actually what I wanted to propose is that the Ministry of Environment and Tourism undertakes a study as to the effects and influence of these particular trees the palm trees. Some areas with better rain not heavy but better rain and others these trees survive or other trees survive but in other areas I am telling you immediately as those trees come up the other vegetation will start disappearing.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes point of order.

HON IIVULA-ITHANA: I have touched a wrong level (laughter).

**HON EKANDJO**: I would like to ask Honourable Member a small question?

HON IIVULA-ITHANA: Yes proceed.

**HON EKANDJO**: Thank you Comrade Deputy Speaker, you see some years early 90s Comrade Pendukeni during one of her many budget contributions you mentioned that in the northern area are many donkeys that cause accidents we must put reflections these yellow reflectors at night, *(intervention)*.

HON IIVULA-ITHANA: I was going to come to that.

**HON EKANDJO**: So that road accidents are minimized. Are you still of the opinion that donkeys in this part of the world the owners must put reflectors or whatever at night, are you still of that opinion *(laughter)*.

**HON IIVULA-ITHANA**: Yes he read my mind because those are two of my favourite topics, the palm trees and the donkeys. Yes because of the destructive nature of these two species I have not yet gone into the donkey nature and I hope that the Deputy Speaker, I do not know yes the Deputy Speaker will, then I have not even said anything at all.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes quickly yes.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF DEFENCE**: Honourable my dear sister Ithana, Comrade?

HON IIVULA-ITHANA: Yes.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF DEFENCE**: These trees Makalani/Omilunga do you not have any historical knowledge and up to now, historically it kills baskets, *(indistinct)* baskets which have been useful for centuries but now in our time it is baskets from Makalani from the Makalani is being weeded and sold commercially and the income is even more than some of the mahangu that you are talking about. Do you not think if we properly plan Makalani trees designated places/areas so that as we are not implying to destroy them but to encourage them for such kind of economy meaningfulness?

**HON IIVULA-ITHANA**: Yes Comrade Deputy Speaker, it was Honourable Sarah Kuugongelwa-Amadhila in one of the debates when she said if you do not plan you will plan to fail. Anything that is not planned

for will always have the positives and negatives and maybe the negatives will even be more. I am not saying Makalani trees should completely be destroyed I am saying it should be controlled. For example if you go to the North, I want you to go to Okahao then you will notice what I am talking about. Immediately you are in Oshikoto around Onyanya you will see no any other vegetation other than those Makalani trees. Then between *(intervention)*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is one from Onyanya, point of order.

**HON IIVULA-ITHANA**: Yes Onyanya is behind me but let me just tell you what it is. I am just telling you what it is. Makalani which are even growing on top of each other *(intervention)*.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Okay he has got the floor again for point of order.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR, INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS AND EMPLOYMENT CREATION:** Now that Onyanya is mentioned (laughter), I will not be able to go back without defending Onyanya. Really just point of information I think it is a very good suggestion that Comrade Ithana is making but the point I think should be can we not because the use of Makalani trees in futile times considered in a certain way, the capitalist stage in a communal way in the modern times can we not set up a centre to research in the use of this tree and come up with adopted uses that are in tandem of the development of the society like we are having now? There are needs in those areas where for example you need even go to Greiters but when the Makalani trees are growing

### SECOND READING – APPROPRIATION BILL HON IIVULA-ITHANA

randomly without them being actually grown in a planned way then they are not serving the purposes that they are supposed to be serving and also if you come across these there are many products that come out there and in the olden times they were even using that to produce but now there is ban and these things are now growing I think the Minister of Environment and Tourism could then research and say these things could be now harvested scientifically to actually contribute to bringing people where these things are out of poverty rather than having them just like decoration and symbolic because you will find now most of our towns that are coming up there these Makalani trees are used as a symbol but they uses and the berries that are coming out there are probably minimal and not attended to the modern times and for that you need a research centre to come up with proper recommendations in order to make more use of these things that are abundant in the areas where we come from.

**HON IIVULA-ITHANA**: Yes, is the floor back to me? Yes thank you. Comrade, all that I am saying is Makalani trees must be studied and controlled otherwise they are contributing to the desertification of where they are. I know their usage and because the usages were more even than today and probably that is why they are just mushrooming all over and people look at them as if it is a pride to have such trees around them and all these kinds of things but you will see how poor the soil then becomes around them.

The other thing I was going to talk about the donkeys. The donkey issue is no complex than the Makalani and I do not want to go deeper into that.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes you can now start to round up.

**HON IIVULA-ITHANA**: Yes I am about to round up Comrade Deputy Speaker. The planting of trees in Namibia has taken a back dinner and it is worrisome. Really Comrade Shifeta this issue is long overdue. I once travelled to Tanzania and in Tanzania they have a month of tree planting. Just imagine how forestry Tanzania is but when they declare a month of tree planting Parliament goes on recess particularly to go and participate in tree planting. Why do we not look at that really? The country is becoming a desert.

Comrade Deputy Speaker, lastly and this is a little bit heavier. I am an African woman and black by my complexion. I cannot spend here today and be in difference from what is happening in South Africa. When blacks are on blacks because of economic hardships I cannot. Those that are killing are my children, those that are being killed are my people therefore Comrade Speaker the violence going on in that country targeting certain foreign nationals is heartbreaking. Whatever the reasons are for what is called xenophobic attacks, only attracts negative comments and probably there are better ways of dealing with the influx of many foreign nationals in that country.

What is happening in South Africa should make us realize us politicians and leaders that the absence of peace and economic prosperity on the continent of Africa remains a push factors for nationals to leave their respective countries while we have been openly talking about many Africans drowning in the, ha, Mediterranean Ocean, what is happening currently in South Africa is not different. It is Africans who have run away from their countries because of various reasons being killed, the same way those others are drowning. Therefore, we, our leaders, ourselves must take cognizance of this and our brothers and sisters also who run away from their own countries because of hardships should also realize there in my language they say (Oshiwambo), where is General, Honourable Mushelenga is gone, I wanted him to translate what I have just said. You cannot be a visitor in somebody's house and you take over the leadership of that house, you cannot you should be a good visitor for your host to be hospitable, so having said that Comrade Deputy Speaker, I rest my case, thank you.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Thank you, now the last on this agenda is Honourable Shixwameni.

**HON SHIXWAMENI**: Thank you Honourable Deputy Speaker, I will be very short. I actually was hesitant whether I should participate in the debate. I have two requests to the Minister of Finance and a few comments to make. First question is, what political ideology underpins the budget? What is the overall political ideology underpinning the budget?

The second is, are we receiving advice dictates from the World Bank and the IMF or not? I will reserve more of my comments to the individual host. Why did I not want to participate in the debate? The budget debate is general for the past 29 years have actually been a waste of time because we talk and talk, the proposals and suggestions that are made are never accommodated. So that is why I regarded it actually as a waste of time. We actually need to review and revise the way forward with the budget debate because the budget has not been changed for the past 29 years.

No change has been effected on the floor of Parliament so that is why I regard it as actually all talk in this Chamber is like a cry in the Namib Desert. A people's budget must have the participation of the people and produce the budget for the people starting from the constituency to the regions but currently it is the National Planning Commission literally and Cabinet that does the budget.

The third point is that proposals that are made in this House are neither even accommodated in future budgets or in future political proposals by the Government so we spend a week and half debating here literally growing hot heads and I think the time that we review that and changed, this particular budget is proof that we are now admitting as a country that we are in problems, we are facing challenges and it is time that we address the challenges. The Minister I congratulate him for making our country tiding as this for future prosperity but we need to rethink of how do we do

### 03 April 2019 SECOND READING – APPROPRIATION BILL HON VAN DEN HEEVER

the budget.

So with those few remarks I truly think that let us debate, let the budget for one time be changed on the floor of Parliament and let all legislation come to this House but we debate thoroughly so that we make profound changes to legislation going forward. Thank you Honourable Deputy Speaker.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Thank you with this we proceed to Item No.2 on the agenda but I would want to ask the Chief Whip of different political parties to ensure that we have a 49 to enable us to pass the reconsideration of the next item. Are those people going for tea break or making calls that will be able to? Okay anyone who would like before that anyone who would like to adjourn the budget of the Appropriation Bill? Anyone who is prepared to talk tomorrow? Okay.

**HON VAN DEN HEEVER**: Honourable Deputy Speaker, yes I would like to postpone it in the name of Honourable Smit for tomorrow and in the time slot of the PDM?

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Okay fine to take that already. Okay the Secretary will read the item on the Appropriation Bill is adjourned to tomorrow.

The Secretary will read the Second Order of the Day.

Honourable Chief Whip of the PDM, Thursday, here there is no, anyone who can?

# 03 April 2019 RECONSIDERATION PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL

**<u>HON VAN DEN HEEVER</u>**: (Not on microphone).

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Next Tuesday? Okay the participants of tomorrow are *(intervention)*.

**<u>HON DEPUTY PRIME MINISTER</u>**: (Not on microphone).

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Okay thank you Deputy Prime Minister has adjourned the debate till tomorrow.

Okay now the Secretary will read the Second Order of the Day.

### **RESUMPTION OF RECONSIDERATION – PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL [B.15 – 2018]**

**<u>SECRETARY</u>**: Resumption of Reconsideration – *Public Enterprises Governance Bill* [B.15 – 2018]

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Does the Honourable Minister of Public Enterprises move that the Assembly now reconsider the Bill?

#### 03 April 2019 COMMITTEE STAGE - RECONSIDERATION PUBLIC ENTERPRISES GOVERNANCE BILL HON JOOSTE

HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: I so move Comrade Deputy Speaker.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: It is moved that the Assembly now goes into Committee and I will leave the Chair and ask the Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee to take over. So agreed. In the meantime while she is coming let everybody come. Currently I was told we are about 39 let us see maybe they are coming *(bell ringing)*.

#### **ASSEMBLY IN COMMITTEE**

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE <u>COMMITTEE</u>: Thank you Honourable Members, due to the lack of quorum. I shall report progress and ask leave to sit again.

#### **ASSEMBLY RESUMES:**

Progress reported and leave granted to sit again.

**HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE <u>COMMITTEE</u>: Honourable Deputy Speaker I report progress and ask leave to sit again.** 

### ADJOURNMENT RT HON DR KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Okay I hope we are not really doing justice to this Bill taking into consideration the number of times it has been adjourned left and right, left and right, I hope it should be the first item on the agenda tomorrow while there is a reasonable quorum and I hope colleague you will try to be here, Chief Whips of all different political parties. With this I will ask the Honourable Prime Minister to adjourn the House till tomorrow 14:30.

**<u>RT HON PRIME MINISTER</u>**: Yes Honourable Deputy Speaker, I move that the House adjourns until tomorrow at the usual time 14:30.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Adjourned till tomorrow.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:08 UNTIL 2019.04.04 AT 14:30

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS WINDHOEK 09 APRIL, 2019

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER** took the Chair and read the Prayer and Affirmation.

## ANNOUNCEMENT IN TERMS OF RULE 20(B) OF THE STANDING RULES AND ORDERS

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: I have announcement to make, a reminder of a series of workshops to be conducted by CPA, United Kingdom (UK) as from the 11<sup>th</sup> to the 16<sup>th</sup> of April 2019 both for staff as well as Members of Parliament. The whole programme I was told is distributed, it is on your tables. For further information you can contact the Office of the Speaker, Mr Tjihenuna or Mr Kisaka.

**HON SPEAKER:** Any Petitions? Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Notice of Questions? I recognize Honourable Venaani.

**HON VENAANI**: Honourable Speaker I wish to ask an oral *(intervention)*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Deputy Speaker?

### NOTICE OF QUESTIONS HON VENAANI

**HON VENAANI**: Deputy Speaker, Speaker in the Chair, I intent to ask an urgent oral question to the Right Honourable Prime Minister. Right Honourable Prime Minister I *(intervention)*.

#### HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Is it urgent, I hope?

#### **ORAL QUESTION**

#### **QUESTION 09:**

**HON VENAANI**: It is urgent. Quite a strange behaviour of Government, we are reading in the papers and noticing that the Secretary General of the Ruling Party is addressing Independence Celebrations throughout the whole country. Is that the Government funded process or is it Parliament or is it the Ruling Party doing it on its own because I tell you why, I tell you why if it is (Herero). A wrong will never be right even if you scream hundred times. If it is so that political leaders of parties are designated to address Independence Celebration besides Government then that invitation should be extended to all the political parties to address. If it is funded by Government, let the Prime Minister answer wait for your time you will become a Prime Minister, wait, she is now the Prime Minister.

Explain to us whether these celebrations especially the ones in Okangwati and the one in Oranjemund whether these processes are funded by Government money or the Ruling Party is financing its own Independence Celebration, just clarity Government position?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Okay Right Honourable Prime Minister.

### **RESPONSE TO ORAL QUESTION RT HON DR KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA**

**<u>RT</u> HON PRIME MINISTER:** First of all the question of the Honourable Member does not qualify as an urgent question that must be imposed orally, it is not. But in any case members, national leaders and leaders of political parties are free to address members of our communities. There is no prohibition from the Government for Members of the Opposition Parties to go and address communities in this country on special days or any other day on any issue that affects Namibians and there are no requirements to be invited by the Government. The Secretary General is not funded by the Government I can tell you that.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Notice of Questions? Notice of Motions? Order! Messages from the Head of State? Ministerial Statement? I understand, yes Honourable Minister Mutorwa. Can we have order?

### MINISTERIAL STATEMENT IN TERMS OF RULE 98 OF THE STANDING RULES AND ORDERS

#### **DEMOLITION OF THE BUILDING**

**HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT**: Thank you Comrade Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members of the National Assembly I am rising in accordance with Rule 98 of our Standing Rules and Orders to make a Ministerial Statement. The Namibian Newspaper of today 9 April 2019 on pages 1 and 2 carries an article under the heading *"Sankwasa calls Gueman incompetent"*. As the line Minister for this particular Ministry the issue that is articulated here in this Article that is the demolition of the old Government of the Republic of Namibia building, an old hotel in Okahandja came under my direct attention on the

## MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON MUTORWA

 $8^{th}$  of March 2019. Now subsequently to that I considered the issue the information that came under my attention and I took the decision to request for some more factual information from the responsible officials of the Ministry of Works and Transport particularly in the Department of Works with regards to the issue.

Honourable Members, Comrade Deputy Speaker, so far some of the requested information and reports have been availed to me and have been received by me and I am busy analyzing those reports, information verifying, checking but as I checking, as I am verifying there are also certain question that arise that I do subject and I did subject to the officials for further information. That is where we are. Now you may ask why the reports are necessary. Of course the reports are very necessary factual reports as they will be very helpful. They will be indispensable to eventually and fairly in the end determine whether the applicable laws of the country for example the State Finance Act, the Treasury Rules and Instructions and more importantly whether the procurement laws of the country have been scrupulously and rigorously followed and adhered to in all instances when dealing with this matter at the administrative level.

Now of course it is deeply regretted even though we are open societies, we are transparent, we do not have any problem, but it is deeply regretted and not much appreciated by me that the matter has become public in a biased, in a distorted and in a personalized form that is my only regret. I am not objecting that the matter cannot come public but it has come now public in what I characterize as biased form, as a distorted and as a personalized form. Of course I do not approve that at all and I am not referring to just this paper I am referring to those that maybe they thought they are clever but I think it is too premature to present this issue in the form that it was presented.

What is it that I am going to assure the Namibian public through this honest Honourable House, I am giving the assurance as the Minister that the matter is and will continue to be properly investigated and fairly concluded within the letter and spirit of especially Article 18 of the Namibian Constitution an Article that deals with administrative justice

### COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS ON MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON VENAANI

and it states that, I quote, "Administrative bodies and administrative officials shall act fairly and reasonably and comply with the requirements imposed upon such bodies and officials by common law and any relevant legislation and persons aggrieved by the exercise of such Acts and decision shall have the right to seek redress before a competent Court or a Tribunal". That assurance I can give that is how we are going to handle this particular issue and for now it is my honest advice then as the line Minister that the doctrine of the presumption of innocence until proven guilty in a competent Court of law should be adhered to and respected by us all particularly by those that are involved with regards this issue and people should not be judged through the Media and so on. Let us await the completion of the process.

If need be and at an appropriate time I shall account as the line Minister I shall account to this House and to the Namibian people on this issue and similar other issues as the Article 41 of the Namibian Constitution. Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members I thank you most gratefully and I rest now my case for now here, thank you.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Thank you, any very brief short comment, Honourable Venaani.

### COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS ON MINISTERIAL STATEMENT

**HON VENAANI**: Honourable Deputy Speaker, the Minister responsible for Works, Transport and tenders all those things *(intervention)*.

### COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS ON MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON VENAANI

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: What did you say? Can you repeat yourself?

HON VENAANI: The Minister (intervention).

HON MEMBER: Walk of what?

**HON VENAANI**: Work or wake, Work it is English it all depends which English you are speaking, if you are speaking village English you can say that but be that as it may, Honourable Minister you are saying you are talking about the Doctrine of the Presumptions of guilty?

HON MEMBER: Of what?

**HON VENAANI**: Of innocence but that is not what is in the paper this morning. Is the Minister confirming or denying that there is a company that got a demolishing tender to demolish a building and that the building was N\$1,000,000, the current worth of the building to be demolished is N\$1,000,000 and the tender that was given out was N\$2,400,000 and therefore the conundrum of incompetency and I agree with whoever said the incompetency that whoever gives a tender to a company that is to demolish something for a higher value than the value of the business of course is incompetent. I do not want to say that yes of course it is highly incompetent I agree with the Deputy Minister if he said that. it is even more than that. But is the Minister defending the attitude of the reporters,

### RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS ON MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON MUTORWA

the attitude of the internal cross accusations within the Ministry or are you defending whether somebody was said to be guilty in a public domain without a judicial process? If that is so I do not think the intent of the paper wrote about making somebody guilty but what we want to know from you is that, Is it true that a tender of N\$2,400,000 was given that the value of that building is N\$1,000,000 and if that is true so what because you have that consistent attitude of eating Government money because you do not care about Government money, we do care about Government money? So if that is true I agree with the notion that it is incompetency nothing else and nothing more.

### HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes Honourable.

**HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT**: The Honourable Leader of the Opposition has not asked a specific question but I value his comment and let me respond this way by reiterating on the 8<sup>th</sup> of March 2019 some information related to this particular issue reached my ears and my eyes and what is it what I did, what I said? Immediately I put a process in motion of requiring further factual information from the officials who have been alleged to have done something out of order and I said and I am repeating, some of the information that I requested has been provided and has been analyzed but there are others that are still outstanding and there are other new questions that are coming up that I need to satisfy myself with in terms of the facts and therefore now that the issue has come public, I am not defending anybody and it is not my style of depending anybody but I am a defender of the truth.

All that we are saying is that while this process is going on and for whatever millions and I must say that some of the issues that were raised here in terms of, except when they say that John Mutorwa and so on wanted this and that other thing, that is what is completed rejected with

## RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS ON MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON MUTORWA

the contempt that it deserves. But factually you do not judge a person before all the factors considered and I did give, my friend I did give the assurance here as long as all the facts are obtained and I am not a person who operates single handedly in the Ministry there. We will then consider and make final decision but that final decision will have to comply and that is what we are seeking. Will have to comply whether in this process tender or not tender whether the provisions of the relevant Act were followed or not and if not followed of course the law will take its course but for now we must be fair and not reach the conclusion in judging people, that is all that I said and this is important because when we are sworn in here in this Parliament for those who may forget, when we are sworn here as Members as Parliament or when we are sworn as Members I am speaking to the Honourable gentleman who is the leader of the Opposition and I want he is here.

When we are sworn here we take an oath for those that may forget and this oath is in the constitution among others we undertake I swear or I affirm that I will faithfully obey to the laws and what of Namibia and that we must do. We cannot make an oath here and then tomorrow as a responsible person even as a leader of the Opposition and he sees things that are happening in your party that are illegal and you close your eyes but otherwise I go to the essence of what we want. There is no incompetency that is being defended here but the presumption of innocence until proven guilty in a Court of Law is a doctrine that is worth defending by all of us. Thank you.

HON MEMBER: He should understand that.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Maybe you can just make a comment because he has read.

09 April 2019

### 2019 RESPONSE TO QUESTIONS ON MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON SHIXWAMENI / HON MUTORWA / HON VENAANI

**HON SHIXWAMENI**: I want to ask my old brother there *(laughter)*. My senior brother Mutorwa, I think it must be very statistic, my younger brother here McHenry Venaani not the leader of the Opposition, he is the leader of the Official Opposition and I think we must be specific about that because there are many other Opposition Parties that are around here and we must address that one as the leader of the Official Opposition. Thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes thank you.

**HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT**: I have to thank my dear young brother and I also appreciate the enthusiasm that I was missed almost the whole of last year and I am grateful the way that I am being welcomed through what I am saying, thank you very much.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Any Ministerial Statements, I should think we should not engage in debate.

**HON VENAANI**: I have asked my senior elder, teacher uteri, cousin a question, three questions. The text that you saw that came in front of your ears and eyes is the N\$2,400,000 tender in front of your eyes, is there any proof in that too? Is there any N\$1,000,000 of the value of the building? What is the fact on the ground? Do not try to say the investigations find the investigations. What have your eyes seen today so that we determine the veracity and the correctness of competence or the incompetence that those two questions must be asked then you are a competent Minister, you have been all the time.

now we were supposed to raise it during the Committee Stage, the dilemma in which we are. I repeat myself we are going to relook also in the Rules and Constitution because this is the first ever as I stated that we thoroughly debate during the Committee Stage the Bill and some new amendments have been proposed etcetera. It is a lesson to learn and we hope we are going to relook at both the Constitution and the Procedure. With this I will ask, yes I am not going to go back unfortunately.

I am going to ask the Secretary to read the Second Order of the Day on the paper.

## **RESUMPTION OF DEBATE ON SECOND READING – APPROPRIATION BILL [B.3 – 2019]**

**<u>SECRETARY</u>**: Resumption of Debate on Second Reading – *Appropriation Bill* [B. 3 – 2019].

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Where am I now? When the Assembly adjourned on Thursday the 4<sup>th</sup> of April 2019 the question before the Assembly was a Motion by Honourable Minister of Finance that the Bill be read. The Honourable Van Den Heever adjourned the debate and you have the floor on behalf of, I know it is Honourable Van Den Heever who adjourned the debate on behalf of Honourable Smit and Honourable Smit you now have the floor. The time allocation is thirty-five minutes.

HON SHIXWAMENI: (Not on microphone).

### HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry.

HON SHIXWAMENI: How are you counting the time with this watch?

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: If I am (indistinct) has been wrong in their counting. No you have made your point and when you come back from recess the watch will be here. There is no reason for you to say what you have said the other time. Proceed, please you have the floor.

**HON SMIT**: Thank you Honourable Deputy Speaker. Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members I find it ironic that the Honourable Minister of Finance has once again announced his intention to critically reform poverty and cross sectors calling for a larger participation by the private sector in the economy.

When in the first instances it seems to have been escaping that in a health economy based on some principles and some policies the private sector is the economy and not a coincidental take along. To say that the Government is the economy illustrates a deep sense of illusion, a fundamentally flawed way of thinking which displays a fatal hangover from the old socialist types. An economy that is centrally planned by all powerful politburo is due to stagnate and eventually to fail. The only thing that crops up such an economy is the Government's ability to borrow from the private sector.

The following Honourable Deputy Speaker is my view of our entire budget process. We have a strong handle on our economic data. The Ministry has a good grasp of the dynamics that introduce its income and how much the income will be but it has completely lost its grip on governance having forgotten that its role is to govern and not to micro

manage the economy down to the lowest level. Making statements that policy changes are critically needed to create opportunity for increase private sector participation is issuing a public acknowledgement that the Government is pointing to the end of its resources (intervention).

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Member point of order.

HON EKANDJO: Yes.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you accepting the question?

**HON SMIT**: No I am not prepared for the question Honourable Speaker I am here for my speech.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Okay the question declined.

**HON SMIT**: Making statements that policy changes are critically needed to create opportunity for increased private sector participation (intervention).

HON MEMBER: Point of order.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Yes on a point of order. On the point of order you are standing on?

HON EKANDJO: I am correcting.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ha?

HON EKANDJO: Information.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Information okay.

**HON EKANDJO**: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, Honourable Member mentioned that there is a hangover for socialist something like that, if you take countries like America, Britain, Germany, France, people still sleep in the streets I am sure those who went to those countries saw the people in streets but if you go to China with more than three billion people, Cuba, Vietnam, North Korea you will never see people sleeping in the streets because there every person has a simple life and has got a roof. I mean those communist countries which are pure socialists they have got (interruptions). It is a point of?

HON MUHARUKWA: Point of order.

HON EKANDJO: On what are you are pointing.

HON MUHARUKWA: Point of order.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: No you cannot.

HON MUHARUKUA: It is on a point of order.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ah, Honourable Muharukua!

**HON EKANDJO**: There is no order on a point of information, no. you cannot take a point of order on top of a point of information. Those people all of them are equal. They have got a roof over their heads, food everything is cheap, free education, free health services, everything whereas America, Britain, France, Germany and the rest you have to struggle to make a living. Hence, yes you are the one who brought it I took five minutes so it is just a correction to say there is a hangover. Socialist is a key to the future Honourable Member. Thank you Comrade Deputy Speaker (intervention).

HON MUHARUKUA: So therefore you want us to take over microphone.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Yes proceed, Honourable Smit has got the floor. Honourable Smit has got the floor.

**HON SMIT**: Thank you Honourable Deputy Speaker. It is heartening to see that the gross domestic projections for the coming years are now based on rational realistic assumptions reflecting the real impact of the three year recession, whereas last year's budget still assume phenomenal growth rate of 7.5% for 2018. The estimated outcome now stands at only 2.18%. Why the difference? Based on this very subdued performance growth for the 2019 is projected to come to 4.8% with 4.1% the here ouster and 4.9% in a final year of the MTEF. These are reasonable projections based on reasonable assumptions supported by historical performances of the last three years.

This budget will arguably then out to be the turning point in the economic circle. It is difficult to say at this point exactly how the fiscal year will develop and we are sensitive to the uncertainty that goes with any budget but to make sense where we are headed within the next three years it is important to review where we came from over the previous three years before we can make any assumptions.

As all the Members of this House should know the fiscas glue normally by around 18% per annum for the 2013 to 2015 while I specifically pointed out that the end of 2015 that we are headed for a calamity. These words were not heeded and the Honourable Minister still gave us a budget at the beginning of 2016 that assumed the hay days will continue.

Remember now that in October 2015 the Government was supposed to launch the first year of bond, if it had not been approved in time we would not have been paid at the end of that month. That bond bolster the Government's coffers and it helped the Treasury to reset Parliament reserves which at that point were precipitously low.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, we may argue that the bond was based on Namibia's good credit at that point but I have to remind you that the first year of bond was the trigger of the debt escalation that has not become one of our biggest medium term problems. Remember also that this happened just after three years ago implying that if we continued in this trajectory Namibia would have been in a much deeper crisis than that is the case at the moment.

However, may I also remind you Honourable Members that it was the end of 2016 with additional Appropriation Bill that the Honourable Minister slammed on the breaks abruptly cutting spending by N\$4,000,000 and sending a massive shock through the economy fundamentally destroying the construction sector and creating havoc in the auto industry.

It is not my intention to blot Honourable Members, the reparcations were far too serious but I found it slightly amusing when the Bank of Namibia constantly hammered on the point that Namibians are buying too many expensive imported goods meaning especially vehicles and that it turned out that the Government was the biggest culprit here by buying expensive vehicles. As I said the rest is history and indicate clearly to every Namibia that the Government was financially on its knees. If you disagree please go and try to convince any one of those thousands of people who were trenched I am sure they will have a different view of this.

Honourable Speaker, while the PDM acknowledge the painful three years we have just experienced we appreciate the new normal that was adopted for the new MTEF believing that now for the first time all the promises to the country we have a workable budget based on reasonable projections that will eventually lead us back to the level of growth be required to make a significant impact on the last social deficits that continue to plate all the Namibians. Sadly, those imbalances will not be corrected during this year nor during the next three years while the recoup from the calamities that must be laid squarely at the doors of the SWAPO Party.

I want to come to the income sectors. It is commendable that the fiscas performed exactly as budgeted last year. The initial 2018 budget expected

an income of N\$56,700,000,000 and as indicated in the revised budget it came exactly to that figure we must say. This immediately showed me that the fundamental problem in our budgeting is not the Ministry's ability to determine what the realistic level of income is but to contain its experience. We spend money that we do not have. It is no longer a case of wondering what the economy will do and what the Government will gain from it. It is essentially only a matter of how well it can align what it spends with what it earns, that is the thing. Yet I need to remind that the public income figures clearly demonstrates how skewed our economy is and how much it is still based on the misguided belief that the Government must control the economy.

I hope we have learnt that it cannot work. Let me state it clearly, the N\$58,400,000,000 total income, the Ministry expects to believe this year is in all likelihood a dependable projection. Our resent history attest to this but it is a futile undertaking when not balanced by expenditure. We have stated often that the fundamental principal that misguided every year's budget is the intention to have a surplus not a deficit we have to budget differently. We have to budget for a surplus and not a deficit.

Honourable Members, in a health economy the income from value added tax would be much bigger than income from International trade. In our case it is not. Pointing to a structural the fact that it is not, is pointing to a structural witness in a Namibian economy. These are issues with which the Government must concern itself not the mindset to continue financing its own inefficiency by borrowing more and more.

I want to come to the expenditure Honourable Deputy Speaker, let me state at the outset that the expense side of the budget is the only actual component over which the Government has full control. It decides how much it want to spend and on which items. Therefore, if public expending does not achieve the determinant results there is only one organization to blame and that is the governing party. Again a total expenditure of just over N\$60,000,000,000 excluding interests on paper is in all likely accurate figures.

However, the discrepancies around are enormous and continue to confront us despite several years of promises that the Government shall put its house in order. show us that you are doing what you are saying. We welcome the N\$28,000,000,000 spending on the social sectors realizing that in a developing country health and education are the two pillars of social advancement but we need to ask the critical question regarding value for money.

What we get back on our investment and most importantly, what do we do to rectify the pervasive wastage in these two sectors. Our education which is critical to our economy suffers under the same burden of central planning as thus the rest of the economy. The financing of our educational system is a need. Is a need of a complete overall and this will not happen by changing yet again the school curriculum?

The same applies to the health sector. Central planning must be abolished and every public health facility must be accountable to the voters it serves at local levels. Clinics are not elevated structures that patronize their patients. They are abidingly responsible for the wellbeing of the immediate consequences. As such they, that every staff member who works there must be accountable to its regional authority.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the glaring oversight expenditure on public safety is as much a concern now as it has been for many years. We need a small professional army and that is that. We do not need an army that is the last resort for employing the unemployed. We do not need an army to employ the unemployed, we need a professional army. Military expenditure must be aligned with the need for defence nothing else.

As a comparison the N\$327,000,000 allocation to the Judiciary is a standing joke really I cannot believe it. How can any law enforcement be expected to be functional with the final lack of justice is vastly underfunded. The allocation to the judiciary illustrates just how skewed our priorities are. I want to come to the deficit. Honourable Members, it cannot have escaped your attention that the primary deficit the difference between a revenue and expenditure is expected to be less than

N\$2,000,000,000 or less than 1% of the total economy. Why then does the Ministry have to adjust its deficit figures year after year? With the data currently available, indications are that 2018 deficit will be on target at about 4.5% of GDP and that this level will also be achieved during this year. On the service this seems commendable but it must be noted that last year's projection for this year was a deficit of 4%, so really there is 0.5% difference.

In the bigger picture the deviation does not upset the upper cut but it comes first a negative trend in the sense that the Ministry is always forced afterwards to make provisions for the bigger than focus deficits. Similarly in last year's budget the 2020/2021 deficit would have been 2.3% of GDP but unsurprisingly this has also been adjusted upwards to focusing. This budget marks the 6<sup>th</sup> budget in a row where deficit has been adjusted upwards.

For the years 2015 and 2016 the adjustment was dramatic costing Namibia its investment grading but it felt in the subsequent years to around 4.5%. It now appears we are stuck at this level and that deficit of that magnitude has become the new normal for the budget. From the history of the past six years it seems to me that the deficit level of less than 4% is not possible. The other day the leader of my Party was fought all over because he used the word nonsense but this is actually nonsense.

If the Minister is serious about the claim sustainability of the Namibian economy the circle would have to be broken if not we will continue indefinitely to spend money that could have gone into development. That money is now being used or will be used to pay interest.

To come to the debt Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, the Government's debt has become a major concern. We agree that a nominal debt level is lastly epidemic provided it does not exceed certain international determined levels. Thus, the only important metric is what percentage of revenue is taken up by debt servicing. Debt is not paid by the rest of the economic it is paid by the Government and to be able to do so it has to use its income. Interest payments on debt therefore

automatically reduce Government's income increasing the deficit. We have another *(interruptions)*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Proceed I mean this, not followed.

**HON SMIT**: As I pointed out earlier on the primary deficit is modest but when debt seems close of more than N\$6,500,000,000 are added it changes the ratio significantly then we have a different picture. As stated by the Honourable Minister this is more than 11% of revenue our debt substantially exceeding the 10% curb which is regarded as the maximum sustainable level we are 1% over that with the additional burden of Government guarantees the potential liabilities further increases.

This was one of the key issues raised by the Rating Agencies when Namibia's foreign debt was downgraded that is our problem. We borrow far more than we can afford. Arising some depth is not necessarily bad but it takes the question what has been achieved with this debt? What are you doing with the money that you are borrowing? It is in this regard that I fear we fail the test. The new debt of the past three years that is 2016 to 2018 has not been a fact to invest in development, that money did not go to development not at all for three years. It has been consumed without a measurable return on investments.

As you will all remember the Government experienced negative cashflow at the end of 2016 and the beginning of 2017. While we are all relieved tht this situation has been reversed I must remind you that Government debts in the local capital market is acquired almost entirely by institutional investors. This is largely in response to the just regulations for domestic assets requirements which were raised to 45% of total assets. This level can be raised again at the discretion of the Ministry of Finance but at some point that Government's ability to service its debt application will be scrutinized by the investors and then we are in trouble again.

Regardless of how we look at Government debt and guarantees it is obviously that these are unsustainable. Then the main reason we believe why the Minister has emphasized debt levels are debt servicing for several years. We have also noticed that despite various undertakings to curb wastage and unnecessary spending the Government has failed repeatedly to address the size of civil service. That not much has been achieved is clearly reflected in the expenditure figures.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, we are all familiar with this situation. What it boils down to is for every dollar spent by the Government on salaries and wages it only receives back 15 cents on the dollars through VAT only 15 cents. In a crippling economy the so called multiply the effect is very small so the argument that the Wage Bill contributes to the consumer side of the economy is not valid. At most it is just new dropping, just that.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, in conclusion the civil service remains a drain on the fiscas as we contain that unless a definite workable downsizing schemes is implemented *(intervention)*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point of order?

HON SMIT: I am finished, do you want to ask?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point of order?

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR, INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS AND SME DEVELOPMENT**: Yes point of information and order in one. One, I did not want really to disturb the Honourable Member but you made a statement at the beginning of your speech where you stated that the problems that you see here seems to be deriving from the socialist kind of economy that we are running. One, I want to really wish you longevity to live fifteen years more. Thank you to see where the world is going. Then the IMF has been here. World Bank has been here, *(interruptions)*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can we listen to the point of information?

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LABOUR, INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS AND SME DEVELOPMENT**: The IMF has been here, World Bank is here for consultations and I have never heard them accusing Namibia or attributing the problems of Namibia to socialist that is being practised here or communism.

Can you also tell me that why is it that you have the ILO investors in Paris, why is it that you have problems in IT? There was never socialism in IT, there was never socialism in all these problems that you are talking about. Just live longer and you will see where the world is going, thank you.

**HON SMIT**: Thank you Honourable Deputy Speaker, I think the Minister did not listen quite well so you can ask have my speech afterwards and then he can read it.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes can we listen.

**HON SMIT**: Honourable Deputy Speaker, in conclusion, the civil service, the General can also have my speech then he can keep quiet for a while.

**HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY**: I will go to the *(indistinct).* 

**HON SMIT**: But I hear you cannot read unfortunately *(laughter)*. Civil service remain a drain on the fiscas and we complaint that unless a definite possible downsizing scheme is implemented the drag on the economy will far outweigh its benefits. Thus, the Government through its civil service is not adding value but diminishing the growth potential of the Namibian economy. I thank you.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Okay before you, Honourable Smit can you stand up. Yes stand up please I just want to comment. *(Intervention)*.

**<u>RT HON PRIME MINISTER</u>**: (Not on microphone).

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Sorry, Right Honourable Prime Minister I am addressing just with respect just listen to what I am trying. You are one of the senior Members of Parliament although not in terms of the, here you have been here in Parliament. I felt sad *(intervention)*.

HON SMIT: Must I not sit down?

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: No just repeat, when you repeat again *(intervention)*.

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: (Not on microphone).

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: No I am talking to him now.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: No that is (noise and nothing heard).

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: No this time I want him to listen so that maybe when he *(interruptions)*. I feel sad actually did not want to(interruptions). I did not, can you listen please. I did not want to disrupt your intervention but I was uncomfortable when you repeated the phrase nonsense. Suppose now everybody who talks here says nonsense how are you going to feel?

HON MUHARUKUA: Make a ruling to that.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please sit down just keep in mind that.

HON SMIT: But please Honourable Deputy Speaker can I say something?

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Yes I think that it is not good.

**HON SMIT**: Honourable Deputy Speaker, if you look at the meaning of non, it is not nonsense it is no-sense, if somebody is saying something that does not make sense in its own sense (*noise*).

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Okay just keep in mind that, please can you put your microphone off. The next is the Honourable from WRP Honourable Fleermuys, forty-five minutes.

**HON FLEERMUYS**: Thank you Honourable Deputy Speaker. I am waiting for my time before I start with other people's pockets.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry?

**HON FLEERMUYS**: Honourable Deputy Speaker, thank you very much for the time so that I will say something with regards to the budget. I hope for this time around there will be enough money especially for the Police. I am talking of the Police I am not talking of (incomplete). I am not talking from the senior Police which is starting from Chief Inspector because he has been given by the Prime Minister as well as the

Government Service Commission salary adjustments. Now I am talking of those I hope they got money from this time around to give salary adjustments to junior Police which is starting from Inspector downwards, those who are physically working in dangerous areas. That is whenever we call Police they cannot come on time because there is no sense of being in hurry for going there because they are not in danger while the children, wife and family are crying and have hunger.

I am coming from the life side and tell them that young policemen please I will pay you this N\$5,000 just give me that file, that is what is on from paying Police less because the danger around that is you make them corrupt if you pay them less because they will have to accept that they be bribed because the criminals before he goes for bail he knows already that by going to the cash loan and unfortunate for him if he comes (indistinct). He has only change from his/her salary so I hope that if he/she has been given something it could have actually been better if they would get N\$5,000,000,000 and not the Army because the Army is not dealing so much in dangerous areas like Police. Why, there is no war. The war is every second of the day in our communities.

# **HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY**: What page are you now?

HON FLEERMUYS: Page 200 (laughter).

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes?

**HON FLEERMUYS**: Honourable Deputy Speaker, thank you for that part. I think that is a statutory obligation of the State go do justice to those who do entrust to deal with things which are supposed to be brought to justice because that is one of the reasons the Courts are always postponing and postponing because the Police are not interested in doing investigations as it is supposed to be because they are supposed to go from here to for instance Gobabis to go and do investigations. However, before he travels from here he does not even have money in his pocket.

The next one is again I am going to the Ministry of Urban and Rural Development. I am coming from Goreagab where I am staying. The street in which I do live has already existed 2002. However, the latest ones which have come just about five years ago have been tarred. It has got black tops and there is not even a single house alongside those roads and there is also electricity already there while those who are paying for so many years for the services of the Municipality they do not have even the luxury that Municipality will send a grader so that they will scrape that gravel road for them and so many times I have taken these issues up with the Minister, the relevant Ministers and Municipality but they do not care because there is no one.

That issue that I am talking about right now is also a health risk because dust cause dangerous problems for people who are living alongside those streets and those people do pay for services to Municipality everyday so that they will not be terrorized by Municipality because if you owe on water they are going and putting off people's electricity and that one is also illegal because never ever in the world where it is supposed to be everything done lawfully Municipality just comes and locks off the electricity not even at the house but on the poles (laughter).

Now those poor people do not have money to go to Courts to contest that issue. You can laugh because you are in a good comfortable zones but those people who have brought you here so that you will sit here and make jokes of serious issues *(intervention)*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point of order, official language.

**HON VENAANI**: Which official language? Whose official language? (Afrikaans).

**HON FLEERMUYS**: I know 100% is it being done every day because I am living among those people who are mostly subjected to inconvenienced by those whom they have entrusted to represent them at the level of Parliament.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Point of Order. Point of order, yes you can listen.

HON FLEERMUYS: I think (intervention).

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: No just listen first.

HON FLEERMUYS: I think I do not want to answer anything (laughter).

**HON EKANDJO**: Comrade Deputy Speaker, I could not understand what Honourable Venaani said so I would want Honourable Kawana or Honourable Sioka to interpret the Afrikaans McHenry was saying. I did

not understand. Maybe Honourable Kawana or Honourable Sioka or Comrade Limbo maybe they will help us explain what McHenry was saying in Afrikaans.

**HON FLEERMUYS**: Thank one is actually just wasting my time because it has not had anything to do with me.

#### HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Come again?

**HON FLEERMUYS**: Now I am going to the next one which I wanted to say is the Statutory obligation of the State has been failed hundred thousand times by the Namibian Government because Namibian Government has promised those who live in that areas, thus the areas like Goreagab, like Havana, Okahandja Park etcetera to do justice to them because those of the colonial have never ever had done justice to those people now that you know what, colonials have built houses and hired those houses to those people that is where Katutura is today.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Just stick to yours do not respond to informal interjections.

**HON FLEERMUYS**: Actually why I am referring to this issue is Hepatitis E because Government has got that statutory obligation so that health care would be number one because that one is not a privilege that is fundamental rights which is in short in Namibian constitution Chapter 3. These fundamental human rights is in Chapter if you do not read that one

it is your baby. Now the failure of that one is (incomplete). The sewerage system is actually most hazardous things like for instance just as you proceed to Goreagab through the Break Street and there is constantly water flowing over that and this water is sewerage and nobody (interruptions). This is not England. I have never ever gone to England so I am not interested in another colonial language to force to talk in this language and you would rather teach me and not sitting here and making jokes of that one because it is shameful to go on like street kids. Here you are acting like street kids.

Honourable Deputy Chair, why I am saying is (intervention).

## HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Deputy Speaker.

**HON FLEERMUYS**: Honourable Deputy Speaker, the issue of statutory obligation of the State has been failed so much that already up to 42 people have died because of that neglect.

HON EKANDJO: Where? Who are they?

**HON FLEERMUYS**: However, health is another issue in those areas where I am talking of because that one of housing is a high risk area.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point of order.

**HON MINISTER OF LAND REFORM**: On a point of information Honourable Fleermuys *(intervention).* 

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Can you sit down Honourable Fleermuys.

**HON MINISTER OF LAND REFORM**: On a point of information I just want to remind Honourable Fleermuys that Honourable Fleermuys do you remember that during the colonial times there was no freedom of movement. There were no human rights for black people. After independence your KOEVOET Police and the White Police the salaries were not equal. You started with salaries. Salaries were not equal the blacks were the lowest paid. Do you know that after independence as you say statutory obligation salaries were equalized, pensions were equalized? You do not appreciate those things? Let me tell you why we have problems other people were *(intervention)*.

**HON FLEERMUYS**: Honourable Minister you are wasting my time. Go and play *(intervention)*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry (intervention).

**HON MINISTER OF LAND REFORM**: Because it is the truth, DTA was supporting, PDM was supporting also the colonial authorities. Ha, the Boers of course, aah, Kaura.

**HON DPEUTY SPEAKER**: Honourable Minister make a mention to the factors.

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: DTA ah.

HON MINISTER OF LAND REFORM: After independence, Honourable Fleermuys people used to carry passports.

**HON FLEERMUYS**: Honourable Deputy Speaker, do you want actually without wasting of my time?

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Honourable Members, can we listen to one another?

**HON MINISTER OF LAND REFORM**: If you do not have a pass you are arrested. We used to carry *(interruptions)*.

**HON FLEERMUYS**: It is just wasting of my time, man the SWAPO Party.

HON MINISTER OF LAND REFORM: We removed the (indistinct).

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Utoni Nujoma.

HON MEMBER: He must step down.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can I say something?

HON MINISTER OF LAND REFORM: I just want to remind him of the things, thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can I say something.

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: You hit the nail on the head.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Are you going to conclude?

HON FLEERMUYS: I am still on Honourable Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Ha?

HON FLEERMUYS: I am still there because he was asking me also something.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Yes because I just want to make this very uncomfortable announcement to say this is the last day of the second day and looking at the unfortunately I am just going to give two Members of Parliament who belong to Opposition. I am going to name who belongs to RDP and SWANU just of the fact that although SWAPO has got forty, unfortunately because of time we cannot. You can also try to conclude you are frustrating the others.

**HON FLEERMUYS**: I am going to conclude right now Honourable Deputy Speaker, thank you. Honourable Deputy Chair *(intervention)*.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: I am the Deputy Speaker.

HON FLEERMUYS: Honourable Deputy Speaker sorry (intervention).

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: I am not even a Deputy Chair, I am the Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, here I am a Deputy Speaker, okay proceed. Yes proceed please, can we listen. Everybody please.

**HON FLEERMUYS**: Honourable Deputy Speaker the Minister (intervention).

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Why are you talking and the Deputy Speaker is saying keep quiet you people? Please keep quiet. Proceed, I look everywhere.

**HON FLEERMUYS**: I hope the Ministry of Works has also had his half money so that they will rehabilitate roads south of Mariental.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Honourable Muharukwa honestly you could at least *(intervention)*.

**HON FLEERMUYS**: I hope it will because the road from there (intervention).

HON MEMBER: Where?

**HON FLEERMUYS**: From Mariental southwards whether it looks like there was rehabilitation but that one is like driving on a gravel road which is going through mountainous areas and another two is the one between Keetmanshoop and Kuis. A very dangerous one is the one between Keetmanshoop and Aroeb because many people have died on that road so I hope that one has also received some money so that we will stop going every week for funerals because in the north the roads are tarred. I know I am driving around there, thank you very much Deputy Speaker.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Yes thank you. Honourable Member of Parliament from SWANU you have the floor and then Kavekotora.

**HON IIYAMBO**: Thank you very much Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members of the Assembly, fellow Namibians I rise to give my modest contribution on behalf of our Party SWANU of Namibia to the Appropriation Bill. It is good to shout but reality will never be subdued. Let me start by thanking the Honourable Minister of Finance Calle Schlettwein for having tabled the 2019/2020 which some quarters referred to as pro-growth or developmental budget. This budget is tabled at the time when the country is in a crisis which now needs to be described as depression.

Having mentioned depression for those of you who saw the paper today and looked at the cartoon and that check and whatever, the cartoon anyway in the paper, it says, "Depression is the most effective poison that can kill a person slowly, very slowly, depression" and we are now in that state. The economy gradually declines especially from 2015 onwards and Namibia experienced economic decline in 2017 and 2018.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, fellow Namibians it is therefore time for business unusual. Being aware of our country's socio economic conditions as well as the harsh if not unpredictable climatic conditions we ought to have prepared for dealing with challenges challenging circumstances including the need to harvest every drop of water that falls on our soil. Consequently the water seething through from the Kuvelai Water System deserves to be properly harvested and stored for alternative usage.

Even if it is not raining you will go to Okalongue and the Shanas are full. Yes some may be not called as to how water is connected or linked to the budget, water is fundamentally crucial factor to any development and we are talking of development. As one presenter during a recent budget review meeting remarked, the budget was expected to be more on water,

electricity, oil and gas. Several countries were desert climate desalinated the ocean and turn their deserts by greening them. Any budget must therefore be geared towards the better usage of water resources to eventually benefit the Namibian people.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, fellow Namibians, the 2019/2020 Development Budget was increased by 42% to boost economic growth. Since the country is in a depression and remember I said depression not Irk Jacks the cartoonist said, depression is the poison that kills human beings slowly and if we continue with it be you on the other side or the other side we will all just slowly perish. The perhaps pivotal question to ask is, which capital projects the Government envisages to reignite socio economic development? Not all infrastructure developments automatically have positive spinoff and thus I want to ask the Honourable Minister of Finance to elaborate on the development projects that are envisaged during the budget period.

Secondly, how can all the budget rhetoric be translated into changeable realities? It is worth knowing what our country's specific priorities are and to direct expenditure accordingly. That way the budget should systematically ensure that its allocation support the greatest possible development impact. Meeting the basic needs of the population needs to be central focus of all our interventions and this should be based on well informed research.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, fellow Namibians, it is high time that we consume what we produce and produce what we need or want to consume. The national budget should direct development along those lines, each important item into our country I enriching other economies while devaluing our own.

Our young people and this is actually very crucial, our young people need jobs. They are the majority of the population and they are the ones hardest hit by unemployment. The entire population is hungry for job creation. On page 5 the Honourable Minister of Finance assets that the budget is and I quote, "As much about ensuring micro economic stability as it is

*about supporting economic recovery with jobs*". There is nevertheless a visible mismatch between the budget allocation and experiences of the Namibian youth. The youth is marginalized in terms of affirmative action, entry into labour markets due to the requirement of work experience and other huddles. There needs to be a concrete intervention to create a large number of additional jobs in the public and private sector if the Honourable Minister's objectives are to be realized.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, fellow Namibians, the unsustainable Public Sector Wage Bill is partly the result of our blotted Government structures. Countries with higher population than ours have fewer Ministries compared to ours and some of our *(intervention)*. Say that again *(laughter)*. I am ready to answer you maybe if you just ask the Honourable to give you the chance.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Honourable Dr Iiyambo. No Honourable Dr Iiyambo ignore it is informal interjections.

**HON DR IIYAMBO**: Yes I thought that we are a little mature in this House and should act accordingly but anyway my paper will be availed to you and hopefully you will go through and we will have time for me to answer you.

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: No I do not need your paper.

**HON DR IIYAMBO**: Well that is your making. The Public Wage Bill is, where was I now, okay let me go back here? Countries with higher

population than ours have fewer Ministries compared to ours and some of our many Ministries could be converted into Directorates within Ministries. The Public Wage Bill is the elephant in the room and the top heavy structures of many Ministries and State Owned Enterprises are consuming valuable resources, chatting the top heavy structures in the Public Sector can significantly reduce the Wage Bill without having to resort to the large scale retrenchments.

Our Government the how is the right people in the right places. We are suffering from wrong people in the right places. Our Government's refusal to downsize the top levels of Public Institution creates the danger of driving Namibia towards the structural adjustment programmes of the present institutions namely the International Monetary Fund and the World Bank. This must be avoided at all cost and by all means. We know what the World Bank or the blatant rules institutions we know what they recommended to the rest of Africa that got independence way before us and we know what transpired thereafter.

As for the gene for efficiency Namibia remains the second most unequal society in the world. The inequalities of opportunity in education, income, health and in fact talking of health and my brother Honourable Fleermuys also alluded to a few discrepancies in Katutura and beyond. Right when you travel on Independence Avenue and you turn at Woermann Brooke the street to Dolam before I left the country and up to today that water is flowing constantly, sewerage water and that means Hepatitis of course, malaria because it is standing water also and all the other diseases that comes with the sewerage water.

I think we really need to look well after our people. Up to now it is flowing. Just right there now you will see it and the people who are living around there because you do not worry yourself, you do not care your pocket is lined those people cannot afford to even do it themselves. No I am calm I just want us to respect each other and lead our country forward so that our country also is respected by many other countries.

#### HON MEMBER: Where were you

**HON DR IIYAMBO**: I will repeat this, as per the gene for efficiency Namibia remains the second most unequal society in the world. The inequalities of opportunities in education, income, health, employment and housing to mention a few are rampant and deserve redress. This crisis calls for serious intervention which will require political wheel.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, fellow Namibians the wide expectation was that the three national development agendas namely Vision 2030, National Development Plan NDP5 and Harambe Prosperity Plan, HPP would synchronize with the developmental budget. Ironically however, by design or by default none of them features anywhere in the budget.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, fellow Namibians, corruption does a lot of harm and damage to the nation. The Finance Minister indicated that and I quote, "Corruption is an evil that touches almost every aspect in the economy. It is one of the most immoral causes of inequality as it disproportionally benefits the few and harm many. Namibia has lost billions of dollars through corruption in various realms. Despite the institution of the Anti Corruption Commission we must have allowed looters of the State with impunity to determine our fate.

Some of the countries' moneys are stashed in offshore accounts or the elite hence does not circulate in the country causing more poverty, social injustice and inequality. The actual remedy is to strengthen the mandate of the Anti Corruption Commission. However, that can only succeed if the ACC does and this note is not both highlighted and capitalized. That will only succeed if that entity does not owe allegiance to the powers that be". The Minister of Finance concluded his budget speech by stating that, we must not only approve the proposals, we must implement them prudently and timely. We must do that honestly diligently with the common good as our only objective in mind". That is what the Minister said.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, fellow Namibians, my final contribution hinges on self reliance and we know very well that countries like 'Tanganyika' Tanzania that got independence I think it was in 1963 had this Honourable leader called Julius Kambarange Nyerere who came up with a concept of self reliance. We have to stop the dependence on former colonizers and the metropolitans. Once more without strong political wheel we are bound to be dependent on former colonizers, on foreign investors and on emerging new super powers.

The rhetoric of a mixed economic in Namibia is very misleading. The fundamental political ideology of capitalism underpins our economy and our package without providing for other forms of economic activities such as workers, cooperatives and communal ventures in rural areas. The moment we strengthen our rural areas the concept of constraint brief to town will be eliminated. So let us look after our rural areas. After all not all the people in the rural areas want to drift to town but they are forced by their socio economic circumstances.

Recently the European Union passed a motion and unanimously supported a resolution to recognize and redress the atrocities done on Africa yet our leaders on the continent have not yet managed to concretely utilize such admissions and turn them into concrete initiatives because we are still characterized by sometimes fake and divisive sovereignties. I am Namibian and I have nothing to do with Angola but half of Okwanyama is in Angola half/half Okwanyama in Namibia. My own people by the way those of you who do not know me that well from another side I am Omuvumbi. Only less than a quarter of Ovangumbiz were cut into Namibia by the colonial borders the rest are in Angola and it is the same when you go to Kenya and Tanzania half of the Masai is *(intervention)*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point of order.

HON DR IIYAMBO: I am talking about Africa.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point of order.

**HON DR IIYAMBO**: I am about to conclude because the order will infringe on my time.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Make it short.

**HON DR IIYAMBO**: The order will infringe on my time. If I can just conclude and then maybe you can ask the question that way.

**<u>HON DEPUTY SPEAKER</u>**: Doctor, yes very short intervention because the time for the *(intervention)*.

**HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT**: No but I mean point of order is, Honourable Colleague has made a very important statement that I as a Member of this House would like to properly understand. Hence the statement was that and I am not quoting verbatim now, that is where I want you to clarify. The way I listened to you that the European Parliament or has recently made a very important resolution statement concerning admitting the atrocities in Africa but it is not Africa that is not capitalizing on that admission to achieve, I want you to properly tell me because this is a very serious statement? Calmly and just so that

we understand and we do not misquote you.

**HON DR IIYAMBO**: Thank you very much Honourable Member, it is only that we are not all at par information wise but recently I received it on Whatsapp yes it is true *(intervention)*.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: No, I just want to state that I just wanted to clarify for the others.

**HON DR IIYAMBO**: Yes I am trying to clarify, I am in the process of clarifying because I am starting with saying we do not get information at the same time, it will get to him also through whatever media he uses *(intervention)*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Proceed.

HON DR IIYAMBO: But I got it through the internet, Whatsapp and so on.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can you proceed?

HON DR IIYAMBO: Yes the European Parliament passed a Motion and

it was unanimously supported and adopted by all the European countries to do something about the harm that the injustices, the divisions, the plunder that Europe caused to Africa and indeed things in the near future will move in that direction for them to even be able to pay reparations to Africa because what they did is they destabilized our growth, taking young people from the continent, what would the Continent have become if they did not take our people through slavery and plundering our economy? But what I am saying is we talk of African unity apparently sovereign States who should not intervene in another African country's affair and we leave is it 10,000 Rwandans and Hutus are killing each other yet we call them our fellow Africans, that is unacceptable. We in the continent should get away from apparently respecting the borders that are existing because these borders were decided in 1884 by the Berlin Conference. Did I explain properly?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes proceed.

HON DR IIYAMBO: Thank you very much.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: As you conclude.

**HON DR IIYAMBO**: It is therefore time to place our national development strategies in a regional and continental context to overcome the legacies of colonialism which still characterize our economic structure and our state of mind. All in all we received the budget with mixed feelings. There are undoubtedly some good intentions but there is no concrete indication of which it will redress our burning socio economic challenges in the years to come. We need to rethink our approach towards

development based on research, innovation and commitments to achieve social and economic justice. I thank you.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Thank you. Honourable Kavekotora, because of time and we did not, can we listen, I just want to ask if the processes of the House would allow him to finish because they did not contribute and this is the first time to contribute. You can proceed. No maybe shorter, so five/ten minutes, can you proceed. Proceed please.

**HON KAVEKOTORA**: So we should not allow point or orders. Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members allow me once more to congratulate Honourable Minister of Finance for tabling this appropriation Bill and the National Budget in this august House. The Honourable Minister of Finance indicated that this budget sets out the developmental outcome we aspired to achieve this year and beyond and securing a new pattern of sustainable economic growth that is broadly shared by all Namibians. Deducing from a strong statement one expects outcomes that would lead this country to prosperity and that will not only be felt by a few but the wealth of this country from now on will be shared equally by all Namibians.

It goes without saying Honourable Deputy Speaker that for wealth to be shared wealth will be created. Honourable Deputy Speaker, I am on record and has been consistently saying that poverty in this country in Namibia is man-made. Poverty is not due to lack of natural resources, unemployment in this country is not due to a lack of employment opportunities, lack of sustainable economic growth is not exclusively as a result of external economic factors.

I attribute some of these negative factors to poor planning by Government, not understanding the implications of these plans, focusing on wrong priorities, focusing more attention on input and not conducting a proper

#### <u>09 April 2019</u>

#### SECOND READING – APPROPRIATION BILL HON KAVEKOTORA

impact assessment on Government policies and implementation strategies. I would even dare to say that this country suffered economically because of Government's consistent reliance on political decision. A lot of resources has gone to waste and continue to be wasted. The question that I want to pose is, why is Government inclined to favour political pronouncements over economic realities? What type of economic system is the Government propagating? I think it came very clearly today that we have a problem. We have a definition of problems that we need to address at a point of time as which economic system are we going to adapt?

Honourable Deputy Speaker, for the past three years our economy faces many challenges and endured its most precautious face yet our Government failed to mitigate wastages and the outflow of funds, these administrative hiccups that the country is experiencing higher and expected liquidity challenges.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, let me now quantify some of my observations with regards to this budget. The Development Budget was increased 42% from N\$5,500,000,000 allocation by to N\$7,900,000,000. On a face value this is indeed a positive move that might contribute to the growth of our economy. I am using the word might deliberately because not every allocation to the Development Budget ends up in Namibia. I can assure you that under the currently administrative flaws 75% if not more of the N\$7,900,000,000 Development Budget will end up in China. This applies to other Development projects or construction projects given to foreign entities.

The construction of the State then resulted in an outflow of money to North Korea. The construction of the Army facility by North Korea again resulted in an outflow of money to North Korea. The money spent on the Heroes Acre went to North Korea. The N\$4,000,000,000 spend on the deepening of Harbour of Walvis Bay resulted in the outflow of money to China. All the construction tenders awarded to Chinese and North Korean companies resulted in a positive outflow of money that creates jobs in those respective countries. In other words what I am saying effectively Namibia is a net exporter of jobs to other countries.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, the construction industry (intervention).

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes point of information.

**HON MINISTER OF LAND REFORM**: All the investments that the Development Budget is said to other countries is because there is the local supplies here, those are local sub contractors so we must tell the truth. Where do they find the materials from, those companies that have won the tenders? They buy from local suppliers here. It is part and they are also sub contractors. We must tell the truth. It is not possible that all the money that was spend here went to China.

So what about those sub contractors who have built the roads in Namibia here? It is South African companies, South African companies that have built all the roads here. Where did that money go, ha? Where did that money go? You must tell the truth, do not hide the truth. There are sub contractors here. Those are the people who benefit. Pupkewitz, the Mega Build and what do you call them in the North there all those suppliers and yourself also? Some people here and we know who have tendered, ha. You know. Ah, your brother there *(intervention)*.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Honourable Kavekotora can you listen, Honourable Venaani can you listen to the colleague?

**HON KAVEKOTORA**: Honourable Deputy Speaker, it is very humble to say that the Honourable Minister does not understand the inner working of what we just said. I can assure you and I think you can come to me I can give you quantitative information on how the Chinese work. The

Chinese when they come to a country they create their own economy, in case you do not know that. the Chinese create their own economy.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Kavekotora has the floor.

**HON KAVEKOTORA**: The Chinese eat their own food. They have their own burning system, they have effectively their own is a closed economy and the money has been transported to China, one.

Two, I also want you to understand, just let then, you do not have the floor. I want you to understand one thing, the sub contractors and I can take you to sub contractors, they are being loans by the Chinese to cover for those expenses and effectively the net impact of that is for the money that is coming to the sub contractors also finding their way to China. So in case you do not understand that come to me I will tell you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Go to your (intervention).

HON MEMBER: Point of information?

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Time is up can you check the watch. Is that point of order?

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members, on a point order I just want *(intervention)*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can you listen.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE**: I do not want the nation out there to have incorrect information that all signs that came from the billions of the Development that took place in our country be it the State House, be it the Heroes Acre, the Oil Storage, the nation out there should have the information that those are infrastructure currently now standing in Namibia and are now currently assets in our country. So it is not activities that are not there, these are tangible infrastructure. Thank you very much.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you for that.

**HON KAVEKOTORA**: I am surprised that the Honourable Deputy Minister of Finance for that matter does not understand the difference between the balance sheet item and an income statement income, I am really surprised. Maybe the President must look at the employment and try to do something because there is a serious difference between a balance sheet item and an income statement item. I am talking about an income statement item. I did not dispute the fact that assets have not been produced in Namibia. No or you do not understand that that is why you are saying that. You are making that statement because you do not understand and I am not going to blame you for that.

HON MINISTER OF LAND REFORM: Honourable Kavekotora?

HON KAVEKOTORA: Did you allow him? You were not allowed.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Sorry, sorry, wait, Honourable Minister to whom are you talking to? Your microphone is not even on.

**HON MINISTER OF LAND REFORM**: The former President Pohamba said if you cannot see with your eyes, if you are blind you can take your tongue and go and leak the road from Windhoek to Okahandja. Those are the things we have now. You can go to State house, it is there, people are admiring what Namibia has achieved. As in a short time we have all those assets they can translate into billions of dollars. It adds to the balance sheet, what are you talking about? When you have nothing you are poor but if you have roads, you have bridges, you have courts those are things that count towards your balance sheets. Guys use your brains *man*.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Yes, just wait for him to answer and then you come back again. No wait for him to respond and then you can stand again. *(Interruptions)* Yes proceed Honourable Kavekotora.

HON KAVEKOTORA: Once again (intervention).

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable?

HON KAVEKOTORA: Yes?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can you go back to your paper please.

HON KAVEKOTORA: Yes I just want to respond.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please finalise your contribution.

**HON KAVEKOTORA**: When you suffer from lack of understanding it is better for you to understand first before you talk. Honourable Deputy Speaker, the construction industry was well functioning and well development before China, North Korea and many other foreign countries came on board. The Namibian construction industry was dominated by the Baster Community of Rehoboth and did an excellent job for your information. Assets were created in this country before those people came on board. The houses they constructed many decades ago still stand. In addition they kept money. The money in Namibia and that money contributed to the growth of this economy because money was in circulation the economy was stimulated for your own information.

Honourable Minister of Finance if one quantifies this financial outflows that some of our colleagues do not understand coupled with *(intervention)*.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: (Not on microphone).

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Proceed please.

**HON KAVEKOTORA**: Okay there is a brown envelop maybe it is an issue of brown envelop that is what you are defining.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Honourable Kavekotora please do not respond to unauthorized *(intervention)*.

**HON KAVEKOTORA**: Coupled with elicit financial flaws one would understand in a free State that our economy dilemma cannot be attributed entirely to external factors. The Government must start by putting a stop on politically motivated projects and run this country and the economy on solid economic principles. Stop initiating projects to win elections and rather focus on long term economic policies that will stimulate economic growth.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, allow me to amplify my argument with development in recent years just to demonstrate one thing in and around Walvis Bay. NamPort our port at Walvis Bay is positioned by Government as a logistic hub. Honourable Nekundi *praaten (intervention)*.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can we listen?

<u>09 April 2019</u>

## SECOND READING – APPROPRIATION BILL HON KAVEKOTORA

**HON KAVEKOTORA**: It is a logistic hub and that hub is commonly termed as a SADC Gateway. The Port of Walvis Bay was recently deepened. A new container terminal will soon be functional and a few facilities is about to be operational. The total cost of these economic activities is about N\$10,000,000,000 I do not know whether we can count that one. The assumption is that with all these huge investments the Port of Walvis Bay will become more competitive when compared to other transport routes in the SADC Region.

The reality however, differs drastically from that assumption. According to the NamPort annual report there is a declining trend in vessel visits in Namibia Port. In 2002 vessels visits a pity at the annual total of 3,559 vessels while in 2017 only 2,079 vessels visited the port. That amounts to a decline of 1,418 vessels. I am sure that the Government would blindly blame this decline to global economic recession and at all ignoring the material increase in a course of doing business at the port.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, are you about to?

**HON KAVEKOTORA**: Again, according to NamPort container landed, listen Honourable Venaani.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes just proceed.

**HON KAVEKOTORA**: Yes you must listen. Container landed and shift tariffs. In 2002 it was costing *(intervention)*.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Sorry, order, you are given three minutes to round up.

**HON KAVEKOTORA**: The tariff was N\$300 per six meter container, N\$300 and N\$390 per twelve meter container. In 2017 those figures jumped Honourable Nekundi to N\$5,454 per six meter container and N\$7,269 for a twelve meter container.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: (Not on microphone).

**HON KAVEKOTORA**: I just want you to have the understanding why I am saying that you do not conduct an impact assessment.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Honourable Kavekotora, try to finish only one minute for you to round up.

**HON KAVEKOTORA**: Honourable Deputy Speaker, according to NamPort the total cargo handled, the macro is the derogative of micro that you must understand yes.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Honourable Kavekotora you are wasting time.

**HON KAVEKOTORA**: Block him. Just block him off. According to NamPort the total cargo handled by NamPort picked at 6,500,000 tonnes in 2012 and dropped to 5,600,000 in 2017. The focus was that by 2017 the cargo volume would double to 13,000,000 tones. Why is that with all the capital injections targets were not met and volumes were dropping at accelerating rates.

That is a typical demonstration how scarce resources are being wasted in this country. This is the outcome of when Government fails to plan properly and fail to conduct a situation or analysis. In this instance Namibia failed to assess and listen carefully for you supporting China.

#### HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes thank you.

**HON KAVEKOTORA**: You failed to assess the real interests of China. The Government failed to realize that while China is deepening, was given a tender to deepen the port of Walvis Bay, China was pumping in millions and millions of United States dollars in the Lobito Corridor.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**L Okay thank you we have come to the conclusion of the Second Debate of the budget. Can I ask the Honourable Deputy Minister of Finance to adjourn on behalf of the Minister this time?

**HON KAVEKOTORA**: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I still have got the information to share.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can you?

HON KAVEKOTORA: I have information to share.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Yes you can give it to the others, because of time people are *(intervention)*.

**HON KAVEKOTORA**: No but then you can say I can postpone the budget until tomorrow.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Honourable Deputy Minister.

**HON KAVEKOTORA**: No, Honourable Deputy Speaker, you wasted the time.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: I am not wasting the time you people are the ones wasting the time.

**HON KAVEKOTORA**: You wasted the time with standing with this one while you knew that the budget needs to be concluded.

384

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: No I am not. It is people, if the interjections are coming left, right and centre what *(intervention)*. And you quite remember Honourable Kavekotora I know that it is very vital.

HON MUHARUKUA: On a point of order.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: No I did not give you the floor can you sit down. Sit down I am talking. Sit down. Can I have that paper? I will give you I just want to, no I just want to explain, no. I am saying I understand the dilemma in which you are, remember you did ask the Table Office to come from Tuesday hitherto and they gave you. Unfortunately forty-five minutes and you are saying let us go. Loide Kasingo can stay here up to 19:00 it is you people who said we must *(no order and noise)* 

But I did ask consensus to say can we allow him to finalise and I was hammering on saying can you conclude. Yes.

HON VENAANI: Honourable Deputy Speaker, we beg for fairness.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is fairness.

HON VENAANI: We dream of a presidium that would be fair.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: No he must accuse himself because he wanted to *(intervention)*. You are the one who was saying let us go, let us go.

HON VENAANI: Honourable (intervention).

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can you sit down?

**HON VENAANIL**: No I cannot sit down if I am on a point of order. I am on a point of order.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: On whom?

HON VENAANI: I am on a point of order.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: On whom?

HON VENAANI: With the presidium it is my right (intervention).

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: The point of order is on whom?

**HON VENAANI**: On you, I can rise on a point of order. On the rules I am rising on the rules not on someone on the floor.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: I want to say something.

**HON VENAANI**: I am addressing the applications of the rules. The Deputy Speaker cannot rule that it is the conclusion of the second debate while the Member has ample time to be able to speak. You must allow him to speak tomorrow, why are you saying he must conclude by force? You have allowed it *(intervention)*.

HON MEMBER: The time has lapsed?

**HON VENAANI**: No his time has not lapsed. He has forty-five minutes, you did it to me you want to do it to another person. Why is it only this side that you want to do it?

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: No, not you, not you do not include yourself. Not you. You were given forty-five minutes and you have used your forty-five minutes. Not him, okay can you conclude now. Conclude.

HON KAVEKOTORA: Honourable Deputy Speaker (intervention).

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Conclude, I am saying finalise your speech. Finalise. Finalise. Tomorrow is another issue. Do you have this, can you sort them those who have spoken tomorrow is another issue.

HON KAVEKOTORA: Am I allowed now to (intervention).

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Yes finalize.

HON KAVEKOTORA: I am allowed to finish?

HON DEPUTY SPEAKERL: Yes.

**HON KAVEKOTORA**: Honourable Deputy Speaker, according to NamPort the total cargo handled by NamPort picked at N\$6,500,000,000 in 2012 and dropped to N\$5,600,000,000 in 2017 so that one was done before I was interrupted.

Let me address the Public Wage Bill from a different angle Honourable Deputy Speaker. The Government has been raising concerns about a high Public Wage Bill but very little action has been taken. The Honourable Minister in your budget speech you mentioned that the private sector has been envisaged and that is where the contradiction comes, engine of growth and job creation and is called upon the private sector to play an elevated role in the economy.

I do not know whether the entire Cabinet has got a similar view and it has

been now demonstrated that they do not have a unilateral view on that matter. The total labour force Honourable Deputy Speaker is spent at N1,090,153 according to the Namibia Labour Force Survey of 2018. The public sector account for 26% of that employment. It therefore means that 26% of the employed labour force is merely consuming wealth that they do not create. That is a worrying part of the Public Wage Bill that spend 41% of the none interest operating expenditure and a whopping 15.5% of the GDP.

There are only two ways of forming this problem, one the Government must stimulate the economic growth through wealth creation and reduce the Wage Bill as a percentage of GDP or the Government must conduct a Human Resource Audit and I think it must also be conducted with a number of Ministers to cut jobs until you reach an optimal employment level.

Honourable Deputy Speaker, poverty eradication has never been and will never be a function of social safetiness. Poverty eradication is a function of wealth creation and the expansion of the economic cake. It really surprises me that the Government tends to have reduced poverty and in a high unemployment regime with a population growth without a significant increase in economic growth. Those statistics to me are questionable.

In conclusion Honourable Deputy Speaker, I want to make the following recommendations:

- 1. Create a benchmark ratio of budget reallocation per sector as a percentage of GDP and present it to Parliament for endorsement because we do not have a benchmark figure. How much money must go to Agriculture for instance? Agriculture is a key player and must precede any industrialization but if you give 1% to agriculture and you want to give 20% to Defence that then ratio must not be very well.
- 2. Ensure that at least 70% of the Development Budget remains in this country to stimulate economic growth with creation and

### 09 April 2019 SECOND READING – APPROPRIATION BILL HON SCHLETTWEIN

- 3. Make sure that we reduce our liquidity risk.
- 4. Identify each region, I said it before and created a commotion in this House.
- 5. Identify each region comparative and competitive advantage and diversify the economy based on regional competitiveness and lastly, loans denominated in foreign currencies exposing the country to currency fluctuation must be done away with.

With these few remarks and this is the qualification of the budget. I support the budget with those qualifications. I thank you.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Honourable Deputy Minister we have come to the conclusion now of the Second Debate. Can you adjourn?

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Thank you Honourable Deputy Speaker, I adjourn the House until next week.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: The Second Reading is up to Tuesday on behalf of your Minister to reply.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Yes until next week Tuesday the 16<sup>th</sup> on behalf of the Minister of Finance to come and reply.

<u>09 April 2019</u>

### ADJOURNMENT HON PROF KASINGO

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: In the meantime the House is adjourned till tomorrow at 14:30. Thank you very much for your interventions.

### HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 18:05 UNTIL 10.04.2019 AT 14:30

### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS WINDHOEK 10 APRIL 2019

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER** took the Chair and read the Prayer and Affirmation.

### ANNOUNCEMENT IN TERMS OF RULE 20(B) OF THE STANDING RULES AND ORDERS

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: I just want to say something in relation to when we pass the Public Enterprise Governance Bill you may recall that Honourable Shixwameni has taken it that we seems not to follow the right procedure because he was of the opinion that once the Bill is referred to us for reconsideration, we should just concentrate on the amendment by the National Council. If we happen to come up with the new amendment, then the procedure should start all over again meaning those new amendments we should refer them to the National Council but however his assessment is not correct for the following reasons. I read as follows.

Honourable Members you will recall that yesterday after the reconsideration of Public Enterprises Governance Bill by the Minister of Public Enterprise Honourable Shixwameni rose to indicate that the procedure that was followed to pass this Bill was not correct that the Assembly and reference was made to the Minister that and others that he was supposed not to table new amendments in addition to those proposed by the National Council. In his argument Honourable Shixwameni has indicated that the Assembly was only required to consider the amendment as proposed by the National Council by accepting or rejecting them and that it was not for the Minister for National Assembly to come with a new amendment as this will rule that such new amendment will have to be

<u>10 April 2019</u>

### ANNOUNCEMENT HON DR KAWANA

referred back again to the National Council for review.

This view by Honourable Shixwameni are indeed incorrect. I would like to refer Honourable Shixwameni and all of us to Article 75(4)(b) of the National Constitution. It read as follows. 'If a Bill is referred back to the National Assembly under sub-article (a) thereof that is now if the Bill is referred by the National Assembly with proposed amendment, the National Assembly may consider the Bill and may make any amendment thereto whether proposed by the National Council or not. If the Bill is again passed by the National Assembly whether in the form in which it was originally passed or amended for, the Bill shall not again be referred to the National Council but shall be referred by the Speaker to the President to enable it to deal with it under Article 56 and 64 thereof'.

In view of what I have quoted from the Namibian Constitution I would like to assure us and specific Honourable Shixwameni that the procedure were correctly followed in terms of Article 75(4)(b) of the National Constitution and I would like also to bring attention to the media to take note of this. This is our research backed by the Attorney General. You would like to say something AG. You have the floor.

**HON ATTORNEY-GENERAL**: Yes, Honourable Deputy Speaker indeed it is correct. I was also made to understand that my good friend Honourable Shixwameni was in fact pointing a finger at the line Minister, at the Attorney General, at the Minister of Justice alleging that we are misleading the House.

I was surprised by that because Honourable Shixwameni is one of the senior Members of this House. The Constitution is very clear and you said Article 75(4)(b) that whenever that consideration by the National Council making amendments, when those amendments come here, the National Assembly is not only restricted to the proposed amendment by the National Council. We can also in this House make some amendments. We can accept whatever is proposed by the National Council. We can even

#### 10 April 2019

#### TABLING OF REPERTS HON ITHETE

reject what is proposed by the National Council. In that instance after passing that Bill, it goes to the President for consideration in terms of Article 56 as you correctly said for the President to consider either to sign it as we say in terms of the Constitution to affirm meaning to sign Presidential signature or to reject. So this procedure that was done yesterday I can assure this House was done within the latter and spirit of the Namibian Constitution the supreme law of our land. I so submit.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Any petitions, reports of standing or select Committees, other reports and papers, notices of questions, other reports and papers I recognize Honourable Ithete Deputy Minister of Finance.

#### **TABLING: REPORTS OF THE AUDITOR-GENERAL**

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Thank you Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members. I lay upon the table report of the Auditor General on the account of:

- (i) Ministry of Safety and Security for the financial year ended 31 March 2018;
- Ministry of Home Affairs and Immigration for the financial year ended 31 March 2018;
- (iii) National Council for the financial year ended 31 March 2018; and
- (iv) Ministry of Public Enterprises for the financial year ended 31 March 2018.

I so Move, Honourable Deputy Speaker.

<u>10 April 2019</u>

### TABLING OF REPORTS HON NGHIPONDOKA

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Please table the report. I recognize other reports and papers by Honourable Anna Hipondoka the Deputy Minister of Education, Arts and Culture.

### ANNUAL REPORT OF NAMCOL

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF EDUCATION, ARTS AND** <u>**CULTURE**</u>: Honourable Deputy Speaker I lay upon the table annual report of Namcol for the year 2017-2018 and the annual financial statement of Namcol for the year ended 31<sup>st</sup> March 2018.

I so submit.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: I am just disturbed by this note. Please table the report. Sorry he is disturbing. I can share it with you. You do not want the people to know, alright.

Notice of Questions? Colleagues, none. Notice of Motions? I recognise Honourable Eunice Iipinge.

#### **NOTICE OF MOTIONS**

**HON IIPINGE**: Thank you very much, Honourable Deputy Speaker. I give Notice:

That this Assembly –

### 10 April 2019

### NOTICE OF MOTIONS HON IIPINGE

*Discusses* and *deliberates* the full implementation of the Protocol to the Africa Charter on Human and People's Rights of Women in Africa (2003).

Further, *discusses* whether or not an amendment to the Electoral Act, 2014 (Act No. 5 of 2014); to provide for political parties participating in the National Assembly and Local Authority elections, to submit their lists on a 50/50 gender basis, to be a fulfillment of envisaged objective of Article 9 of the said Protocol, as this would amount to an equal representation of men and women in electoral processes.

To resolve at the conclusion of the consideration of this Motion, that an amendment be tabled to provide for such gender equality in the Party list at National Assembly and Local Authority elections.

I so Move, Deputy Speaker.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Table the Motion. For when is this? When do you want us to debate this?

**HON IIPINGE**: I am intending to table it after the deliberations of the budget.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: In June?

HON IIPINGE: Yes.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: It is fine. We can revisit it I June. Table the Motion. Notice of Motions? None. Messages from the Head of State? Ministerial Statements? None.

The Secretary will read the First item on the agenda.

### RESUMPTION OF DEBATE ON SECOND READING – BANK OF NAMIBIA BILL [B. 1 – 2019]

**SECRETARY:** Resumption of Debate on Second Reading – *Bank of Namibia Bill* [B. 1 – 2019].

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: When the Assembly was adjourned on Tuesday the 2<sup>nd</sup> of April 2019 the question before the Assembly was a Motion by Honourable Minister of Finance that the Bill be read a second time.

The Honourable Deputy Minister of Public Enterprises adjourned the Dbate and Honourable Nekundi you have now the floor.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Thank you very much Comrade Deputy Speaker and Honourable Members. Thank you very much to allow me the floor in order to participate in a discussion on the Bank of Namibia Bill. From the onset Comrade Deputy Speaker I really appreciate the importance of this very important Bill. It is important because the stabilization of our economy can happen in life on the legal framework of the Bank of Namibia. However I have two or so aspects that I would like to have an understanding as reflected in the Bill.

The Bill made provision that the Bank of Namibia shall take the responsibility of the matter of prudential of the financial market. Now we are aware that there are two sectors within the financial market which is the banking and the non-banking. The banking is falling under the Bank of Namibia and the non-banking are falling under NAMFISA. Now it is of paramount to understand how the matter of element will have a dire consequences on the micro perspective of the non-banking sector. The difficulty sometimes to understand is that how is the law be implemented and to what extent will the law not destabilize the financial market where you have the NAMFISA is then given the mandate of the micro whereas the Bank of Namibia will then be given the micro over the institutions framework of the non-banking sector.

So it is a bit of a challenge because one that it means the non-banking sector will then be regulated by two institutions, one regulating the micro and one regulating the micro. So it is kind of saying take care of my child but you only take care of the leg. The other one takes care of the entire body of the child. So it will surely bring conflict within the supervisory role of these institutions and I was just checking with my Colleague how that conflict will be mitigated for me it is really of a difficulty to understand that element.

The other aspect Comrade Deputy Speaker is on number of occasion I think both in this House and out of this House we have discussed the items need of the banks to provide toilet facilities for the customer. We are aware that the people do spend a number of minutes if not hours in the queue especially during month-end and month-end are busy. Some people their month-end are the 15<sup>th</sup>, the month-end are 20<sup>th</sup>, the month-end are 25<sup>th</sup>, some are 30<sup>th</sup> and 31<sup>st</sup> wherever the day falls.

Now the payday *per se*. Now we are aware it is how that this August House have passed a law that make it mandatory that more businesses especially in the lower end the bars and shebeens*per se*, it is mandatory that you must have toilet facilities for your customers. Now I really find it a bit of a difficult why the same big institution such as the bank I understand in malls where there is possibly common facility of that nature

within a distance where a person can reach but where there is no public facility for that nature yet we allow them to operate without this important humanly required facility that we do not regulate that. I really find it difficult and I really want this House to implore that that must be mandatory that one need to understand that banks is mandatory because if you have money by law you are required to deposit money with the bank. So it is not by choice. Now if it is not by choice which is I support now we must equally make it mandatory that the basis amenities infrastructures must be made, must be provided and must be imposed by the legislation if this call is not being hinted for. So therefore I am calling upon that this particular element should be regulated by mean of a law.

Two, I think in Namibia we only have one bank that is Namibian owned not Namibian registered. Namibian registered they are four. I think they are five now. Now statistics have proven that the traditional banks operating in Namibia yet not Namibian owned is greater. We understand the small businesses owned by Namibian but as a greater value of these banks. They are foreign owned. The statistics say that they are profit margin not profit as a volume but the margin compared to other market which they are operating. Namibian market contribute a bigger profit margin to the entire groups yet all these profits are repatriated.

I am of the opinion Comrade Deputy Speaker that these institutions were for that matter it is mandatory that we must bank with them. Namibians are forced by legislation which is right to bank yet we are not regulating on the modalities of the percentage or the portion or the ratio to which the profit should be repatriated and I am of the opinion that this August House is the legal right instrument to regulate on that proportionate value of the profit that must be retained in the local market and it can even be regulated to say to what market should this retain dividend in the local market to what sector it should be utilized.

So it is very much important that we pass that. We cannot just allow profit just to be repatriated without being controlled. I really want that we consider that and the Bill consider such a perspective.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point of Order.

**HON MINISTER OF LAW REFORM**: ...important and valid arguments. I fully support that facilities, the banks, repatriation of profit.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Honourable Minister you want to ask a question or information.

**HON MINISTER OF LAW REFORM**: Yes, it is a question or just the question is coming.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: No.

**HON MINISTER OF LAW REFORM**: You are right. I just wanted to add that in addition to repatriation of profit do you think it will be a good thing to consider shareholding for Namibians in these banks? I think that is the most important because then you know they share the wealth with the country in which they make huge profits as you say and it is true. It is not secret Namibia they really make good profits here. In addition to facilities which they must create and also the profits the shareholding as well as the social responsibility. I do not see it here. You see in South Africa if you look Shoprite and the others they do some social responsibilities. Here in Namibia we are just at the receiving end. So those are some of the questions I wanted to ask. Thank you.

#### HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Thank you very much my senior for that. In fact that is the right thing to go and such call we must all at the August House and the public out there must support such a call that we must own shares in these multi-international corporations. So we need Namibians in totality. The element of the corporate social responsibility the CSR in fact that was the next point on my point of contribution to this important Bill. Comrade Deputy Speaker when you look at banks the banks that are in Namibia as I say the Standard Bank, the FNB, Nedbank these are three major banks in their hurdle. They primarily operate and primary owned in South Africa.

If you look at the corporate social responsibility the investment they are undertaking in South Africa is a serious insult to the Namibian market in which we are providing a conducive environment in which their operation is security, their profits are secured and their infrastructure is secured because of this investment the social stability that we are experiencing in this country is because of that yet they are minimally contributing to the corporate social responsibility.

Mind is the importance even the minimal they are contributing I do not want to be rational but the truth is even at the greatest the corporate social responsibility they are doing it is more to the sports and other activities that are predominantly by the previously advantaged community the white community. They are more funding these activities. If you see a marathon, they are funding but if you see a marathon that is spearheaded or that is organized by the previously disadvantaged which is now the black you do not see them. They are not these people.

So we need to control. This country's stability is about the cohesion but if we have the legal entities or legal personae who are not investing in the social stability of this country, it will not be good equally to them. So there must be a provision that they must contribute to the

social stability of this country and the welfare of our community. It must be informed. We cannot continue as business as usual 20 years down the line and they are not yet appreciating the value of the conducive environment to their participating. They are not value who the majority for that matter are the black community of this country. They are not appreciating that. So I think they need then to understand that perspective. You will take a floor for that. The other aspect Comrade Deputy Speaker I really want to understand yes, I know we have this institution the Head is MrSiku the Employment Equity Commission.

The truth is when you look at our banking institution the top management even the middle management it is an Irish. It is at most possibly 99% management and middle management it is one race of our society and we cannot as a country 20 years down the line of independence of which we have fought for this country to bring about equality yet these institutions does not appreciate for that. Some people have died for this country for that cause yet we are not embarking on a genuine course and they are not genuinely appreciating to bringing their part. Some of them I call it rent a Dutch, rent a black a black CEO, a black MD, a black Credit Manager. I do not want. You want to.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, no, just proceed.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: There are there some of them are there. The decisions they do not make decisions. They are only conveyer belts. They only convey decisions there in South Africa. We cannot continue as a sovereign state where we are still operating rent at person based on the colour to make it look like we are Namibians yet the policies are not domestic generated. The policies are not domestic imposed. The policies are not domestically covering the domestic environment. It cannot and I think this is the opportune time that this Bill must make it mandatory that time have come to an end where we

import decisions.

We cannot import decisions and I wonder even if the customs are charging this when they are delivering the decisions from South Africa. Are they charging any tax for importing the decision? Certainly not so therefore as a sovereign state, we cannot appreciate such a continuous trend which is not in favour of our country. It is undermining of our sovereignty and they must be told and the law must make it categorically clear that time has come to an end for such.

The other element that I wanted to discuss under the same Bill Comrade Deputy Speaker and Colleagues, over the years I have been thinking and up to today I have not yet find a reason that is justifiable. How is it possible that a white clerk afford to rent in Eros but a black clerk cannot afford? I just want to understand that. Is it that they have inherited this money they are paying rent from or they are paying houses they inherited and they are paying the rest from this inheritance?

What role did the Bank of Namibia ensure equality in terms of treatment of clients by the banks because I just find it absolutely difficult to understand that? 29 years down the line you will not find a single white skinned person renting or owning a property in Katutura. Some are also security guard. Some are cleaners. Some are just teachers but yet they live in mansions. We know the rentals. It is not less than N\$15 000 in those areas yet their salaries are on average they should be N\$4 000. Some are Clerks even in Government.

We are seeing Government is lowly paid apparently so now how do they afford and they are just saying it is business as usual? Are we continue to permit these type of abnormalities to prevail or there is some magic that is being performed that these colleagues are able to sustain their lives under the same under established same scale of salary yet a person of my colour have no magic to rent to have resources to rent with N\$15 000 on a N\$500 salary for a N\$10 000 salary.

Some of them have houses or they are renting yet they have a car. How do

they live? I just want to understand. How do they buy their food? I just want to understand Comrade Deputy Speaker. Comrade Colleagues I really want us to approach this topic without biases and under a circumstances where we need to correct the imbalances that continue to perpetuate so in an independent sovereign a democratic society which we have fought to liberate. We cannot continue under that premise Comrade Deputy Speaker. The other one I just want to understand Comrade Deputy Minister. I want to understand how does this Bill addresses the eminent onslaught of the inward movement of Fintech the financial technology system that is replacing people and at greater these technologies are furthering foreign market.

If you look at the system that are now implemented by the bank is replacing human being. In South Africa I think a week or two weeks ago there was serious reports on newspapers that it was Standard Bank or so they are replacing I think 40% or so of their offer. To what extend because we cannot, yes, development is good but you cannot. You must be ready for a certain time of development as a market, as a country we must be ready for a certain time of development because it has an effect on the economy. You discussed at your Congress we are going to lose.

#### HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Just proceed.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: This system is going to replace human beings. Is it going to dilute our economy? When a senior stand up you must sit. So it is really of concern to me and to what extend are the infrastructure of Bank of Namibia ready to control and mitigate the unwarranted and illegal activities that could be off spills of technology because technology can be good but can also be very bad? It can bring about money laundering and related other activities. It can be. So to what extend is this Bill ensuring that there is a guarantee of the stability of the economy both the financial and the entire economic

beyond the borders of the financial market. I really want to understand that.

Other aspect I want to understand how is it possible because then the Bill makes provision of we will continue to accept that South African rand is a legal and acceptable tender in Namibia but which is good. I have no problem. We are looking at about globalization and free trade and things like that. It is fine well and good but why it is so difficult that our Namibian dollar if you enter in Johannesburg and you enter a shop, same Shoprite you cannot use Namibian Dollar in South Africa. What is the understanding as a country to that? I just want to understand that.

We appreciate that it is legal tender here. If you enter in any shop, you use that currency yet when we cross the border ours are not legal and unacceptable as a legal tender instrument. So I am not comfortable with that and I think the Ministry of Finance and the Bank of Namibia should embark upon that there must be mutual recognition of this legal instrument. So for me it is very good. Then you talk of mutual understanding and mutual respect to others.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: On a point of order.

**HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY**: Thank you Comrade Deputy Speaker point of information.

Honourable Nekundi the only reason why we cannot buy with the Namibian Dollar in the Shoprite in South Africa is because the agreement that we have signed does not make the Namibian Dollar legal tender in South Africa so the next question is why not.

What is the difference between the rand being a legal tender here and not the Dollar being a legal tender on that side? The agreement stipulate the

fact that we have got to accept the rand as a legal tender here. The agreement says for each rand that circulates in our economy the South African Reserve Bank has to give us the equivalent money for that circulation gap because that means that the rand is actually replacing what the Bank of Namibia could have printed and circulated itself and therefore if we were to have Namibian Dollar also circulate in South Africa, it will mean that we have to compensate them for that Namibian Dollar circulating in their economy.

So it can but it means we are going to have to have that then we have to compensate them so just point of information. The other point of information Comrade Deputy Speaker I wanted to say earlier on is that the HonourableNekundi says the law compels people to put their money in the bank is actually not true. The law does not compels its people to money in the bank. It can actually keep in the mattress under your mattress if you wish to but obviously not preferably because it is not safe and also it will not earn you any interest but there is no law from telling people to keep their money in the bank. Thank you Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Thank you very much. On two aspects that Comrade Alweendo just said the issue of the rand in our market *vis a vis* our Nam Dollar in South African market. I understand your explanation but I believe that economic analysis was possibly done 29 years ago and there were statistical evidence that provide for that provision as a favourable hand at the time in terms of our market but it might be the right thing that possibly to ask how often do we review the benefit of the status quo *vis a vis* the revision possibly if you know possibly how often that is being done because the benefit of yesterday might not be the benefit of today neither benefit of tomorrow?

So that possibly is food for thought that you embark upon. The other aspect that you have brought up I find it very possibly strange and shocking that we are saying here that a person can have N\$2 Million cash in his house and is normal. I will tell you the truth. Put your N\$2 Million in your car now and go at the roadblock. Police found you, you will go to court. You must say how you get that N\$2 Million yes because if you can hid it under your mattress, you can also hid it under your car. You can also hid it under shoes. So you can have so then why get arrested hiding it in my car, at the boot of my car if nothing is wrong with me?

So possibly it is a customary law. I do not know if there is no rule that prescribe that but to stand here and me believe that it is legal yet we know people who are being prosecuted for found with money is something that possibly. It is possibly something that one need to ask how factual that could be. The next one (incomplete).

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: You have to round up in 30 minutes.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Promise thank you very much. I am just waiting for Comrade Chairperson to protect me on the floor. There is too much noise.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: No, round up if you want to round up.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: There is too much noise. The other one I want to appreciate Namclear. Namclear is a retail base transactional based infrastructure. Why is it important infrastructure not owned and managed by Bank of Namibia? My view is

that it has a potential for solution to create curtail. It can if you have curtail within a financial market, it can surely you cannot undoubtedly destabilize the market and it can collapse the market. Why is this important instrument not owned and managed by the Bank of Namibia because it is very important is the retail and to what extend is it? There is no manipulation in there to inflate the bank charges because we know that this infrastructure does not declare dividends so it could be that the inflow of this capital could be manipulated through variably including the capital appreciation within the same instrument yet accepting the end consumers affordability and the bottom line.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Can you conclude please?

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: In conclusion Comrade Deputy Speaker I will participate when we come on the Committee Stage on the particle clause and with your patient Comrade Deputy Speaker, I thank you very much.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Thank you. I recognize Honourable Kavekotora.

**HON KAVEKOTORA**: Thank you very much Honourable Deputy Speaker. In conclusion I actually just want to make a few remarks on this Bill. Some of the issues have been taken up by Honourable Nekundi. We are a franchise economy Honourable Deputy Speaker. We are a franchise economy.

Honourable Nekundi is talking about the banking system. The whole economy is it about 60% of our economic activities and our businesses are

franchises of businesses from South Africa and that also lead to the movement of money especially from Namibia to South Africa in this particular respect and I do not know to what degree have our banking laws and especially the Bank of Namibia that is the regulatory body have adjusted to that reality that we are a franchise economy because in a franchise economy you would find a high degree of money moving from the franchise to where the franchise came from and this is exactly what is happening at your Shoprite and Pick n Pay, your banking systems and everybody else.

So I would just want to the bank perhaps to interrogate our laws and even the amendments that we are making to our laws to be in line with a franchise economy. That is one, two I want to talk about the issue of outflow of money. Yesterday I touched upon it but from a different perspective. I do not know to what degree and I know there are laws in this country to try to prevent money laundering and that is where perhaps Honourable Nekundi is of the opinion that when one is found with money it is an illegal act. It is not an illegal act. Perhaps the people just want to try to prevent money laundering but you can still have your money under your mattress and you will not be arrested but the issue of, well, it depends of the source of the money.

Where did you get the money from? If you got it from the Chinese you might be arrested. The issue of the outflow of money in an illegal way Honourable Deputy Speaker is what I want to talk about. I do not know to what degree our laws are really geared up when it comes to Namibians who have laid the hands on huge money legally or illegally for that matter that has now taken that opportunity to take money outside of this country to avoid paying taxes and to deposit and invest these monies in tax ervens because that is also contributing to the illicit financial flows.

It is contributing to the liquidity problem that we are facing in this country and I do not know to what degree our laws are really sort of are ready to tackle that because I have not heard too many Namibians who have been you know taken to task by taking money out and deposit money in tax ervens because that is preventing our country from basically utilizing this

money for capital projects and for developmental purposes. I think there is a lot of our people who are in that situation. I have heard a story of somebody who went to Walvis Bay a young boy of 24 years old and this young boy of 24 years old went to an ATM and he had to sleep in there. When his friend come to pick the slip, the balance in that 24 years old boy's account was N\$7.5 Million and when his friend confronted him at your age like Nekundi, where did you get N\$7.5 Million?

The respond was my friend that to me is pocket money, 24, N\$7.5 Million and the surname is a Namoloh. The surname can only be a Namoloh to be able to have N\$7.5 Million as pocket money. All I am saying Honourable Deputy Speaker is that our laws must start dealing on these Namibians who are taking money out of the country and I think the Bank of Namibia is one of that instrument that could be able to curb this illegal and illicit financial flows. Thank you.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Thank you very short intervention. I now recognize Honourable Minister Tommy Alweendo.

**HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY**: Thank you Honourable Deputy Speaker. First let me just congratulate the Minister of Finance for tabling this Bank of Namibia Bill. This Bill seeks to repeal the current Bank of Namibia Act of 1997 in order to modernize it and also to bring it in line with the SADC model central banking law that was already adopted in 2009. Deputy Speaker Central Banks play an important role in stimulating social economic development. A Central Bank is entrusted with the responsibility of crafting monetary and financial systems policies that are conducive for enhancing economic growth and also employment which ultimately leads to an employment in the welfare of any society.

Central Banks sets suitable interest rates policies that likely will curb productivity in prices and exchange rates for the purposes of avoiding

major disruptions in the financial systems. Interest rates are also set in cognizance of encouraging investment in an economy while guarding against excessive credit extension that normally will lead to over indebtedness of households and businesses alike. Central Banks do also establish regulatory and supervisory policies that promotes a sounding banking system given that the banking system is central to the effective performance of any given economy and maybe here I also need to say some of the comments that were made earlier with regard how the Commercial Bank behave themselves.

Those are normally legislated within the Banking Institution Act whereas this is normal just about what the Central Banks do but of course they are relevant. Honourable Deputy Speaker in addition to the traditional functions I just mentioned of Central Banks, Central Banks particularly in developing countries like ours also perform numerous developmental functions. These may include collecting data and undertaking critical economic research to inform the formulation of the key macro-economic policies. They also encourage and support the expansion of the geographical and population coverage of banking activities in order to make adequate funds available to finance development programs and also to ensure financial inclusions.

To this end it is encouraging therefore to note that our Central Banking law is being modernized in order to ensure that the Central Bank is able to effect and deliver on this important macro-economic objectives. With regard to the proposed Bill Honourable Deputy Speaker I agree and support the main thrust of this Bill and the key provisions introduced therein including the formalization of the monetary policy Committee as well as the role of the Bank of Namibia on the financial stability function. With regards to the role of the Bank on the financial stability function, I would like to underscore that following the global financial crisis that began way back in 2007 there have been a serious rethink of the mandate of Central Banks with an increase emphasis on financial stabilities and not only on monetary policy.

In recent years there has also been increased inter-dependency across

economics as well as across different institutions within the global financial system. The cost of financial crisis is to different economies have been significant and are well documented for example the IMF estimated that the direct cost of banking and financial crisis in the past 15 years exceeded 15% of global GDP. Against this background Honourable Deputy Speaker a concerted effort through various international bodies has seen agreement on common standards and principles for financial regulators as a measure to strengthen the job of financial systems. This structured initiatives have resulted in Central Banks focusing more closely on financial stability and macro prudential analysis in addition to their traditional objective of maintaining price stabilities.

I am therefore delighted to note that the proposed Bill was drafted in the spirit of ensuring that Namibia is not left behind of this global trend. That way the Bill will ensure that the bank is appropriately empowered in order to carry out periodic assessment for the identification of accountabilities, monitoring and mitigating of system risk to financial stabilities. On the issue of the exchange of information Honourable Deputy Speaker given the interconnectedness between the banks and non-banks financial institutions sharing of information is of utmost importance in order to create confidence and to better coordinate events in the financial system.

In this regard I welcome the provision in the Bill that emphasizes on the arrangements for the Bank of Namibia to cooperate with other supervisory authorities and coordinate financial stability measures with these entities not only within Namibia but also beyond. In this process I understand the bank will obtain any information or documents from any other financial institutions or supervisory authorities which is considered by the bank as necessary to better deal with the risks and vulnerabilities within the whole financial system.

Honourable Deputy Speaker the third issue that I would like to comment on Honourable is the caps of lending by the Central Bank to the Government. In general monetizing the Government deficit is a bad practice that traditionally result in high inflation. There is ample evidence of high inflation experienced in some countries due in part to excessive

Central Bank lending to Government. That is why today there are several Central Banks that do not led to Governments at all. Those Central Bank that continue to lend to Governments have imposed strict limits to such lending. It is against this background that this Bill proposes further reduction in the allowable lending to the Government to align such provisions with international best practices as well as to current utilization of the overdraft facilities by the Government.

Honourable Deputy Speaker I am convinced that the Bank of Namibia Bill will strengthen the Bank in its mandate to promote sound financial system in Namibia. Furthermore, the Bill creates clear standards of accountability and transparency and harmonization of the legal and operational framework of the Central Bank. I believe this Bill contains key principles that are essential for the achievement of harmonized legislations within the SADC region while ensuring that the specific needs of the Namibian economy are also catered for. Honourable Deputy Speaker with these words I certainly support the Bank of Namibia Bill and I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Honourable Kawana.

**HON ATTORNEY-GENERAL**: Thank you very much Honourable Deputy Speaker. I rise to add my voice to the Honourable Members who have contributed to this very important Bill. Comrade Deputy Speaker I have since faced some difficulties that the former Governor of the Bank of Namibia has contributed before me and we need to investigate cybercrime and to bring that legislation as soon as possible because I have now abandoned my written speech because word by word what he was reading is what I had written. So I am now compelled to depart from that line of thought and construct my own thoughts.

When my nephew HonourableNekundi was talking he reminded me of the

colonial peril during the laws of what we call vagrancy laws for those who are familiar with the influx control laws whereby the laws were stating as follows terminative seen crossing a farm without any visible means of support is liable to be arrested by any police officer. Now that is where we came from. That was part of the law. Now as if you must carry loaves of bread on your head so that there is now what we call visible means of support, those laws were very notorious and hence those who fought to liberate this country were against those laws.

Where we came from you may recall apartheid sometimes you need to justify differentiated salary scale between whites and non-whites. By saying you see a white man, white woman they go to a butchery to buy meat, they need also ingredients like spices and what, what to put in the meat. Then they go to buy rice.

They also require some spices but for a non-white you go to a butchery, you buy meat. You just pour water there, you boil and you start eat with your pap and therefore the expenditure between white and a black is different and differentiated salary scales are justified on that basis as if blacks did not desire to have a better life. That is where we came from. Today in an independent Namibia all institutions including banks must comply with our policies, with our laws, with our aspirations.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point of Order.

**HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY**: Thank you very much Comrade Deputy Speaker. The point of order is to give information sort of to my student ACCA. We are talking about banks and all those things. I do not know if you are aware how did stocks came into being. When you talk about stock, stock exchange if you are aware how it came into being. Who was a stock when it started that time? Are you aware when it started or I can inform you? Stock started with slaves. A slave had

no name and you were only measured your height, your weight and all your colours and what a view that you are significant stock. When you are being sold in London and Washington to go to the Caribbean then the stock number is taken there and people are saying I want that stock, I want that stock, I want that stock. That is how it started because you had no name. The one who buys you gives you a name now. You are only transported as a stock. So we are talking about banks. You are saying salaries and what a view. You will not have anything because you were already downgraded. I thank you.

**HON ATTORNEY-GENERAL**: Thank you my General. Indeed it is correct to say during 300 years of slavery of slave trade, slave were black people from Africa, were commodities. They were part of the balance sheet. When they died, they master used to cry not because a human being has departed but because the balance sheet has been affected. That is where we came from. I agree with you General. Now I was saying (incomplete).

**HON MINISTER OF LAND REFORM**: I also want to add something just closer on a point of information closer to home. We have Okaholo where our fathers, grandfathers were just given a name tag, no name. You are just called in. No name is taken. You are given a number and it is covered in your neck. You have to carry that number. You do not know where you are going. We tend to forget who has built this country.

Those people who were never paid sometimes when the time comes to receive their salary, they are thrown in dungeons and burned and killed. That is where we are coming from, from slavery. It was practiced here Okaholo. You just go. You do not know. They just look at the number. He is already told Swanla. He is told there is number 4 is your boy. You can do whatever you want with him. It also happened here. When we are saying these things when we say we have to go and sacrifice our youths to take up arms like Doctor Kawana, like

Doreen, like Namoloh, like most of us here, we are being insulted here every day. Those are the things those chains we have broken them. Please accept and congratulate the people who have brought the democracy and we can sit and discuss here. Thank you.

#### HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Proceed.

**HON ATTORNEY-GENERAL**: Thank you Honourable Utoni Nujoma my good friend. I wholehearted concur with what you have said. When you say you remind me of one institution you forgot called Winera Witwatersrand Native Labour Association.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point of order.

**HON ITHANA**: May I ask Honourable Kawana question? Honourable Kawana the issue you are eloquently addressing is very, very important and explanation given by the General and since this House consist of various generations do you not think that issue is important as to warrant its own discussion so that the issue of the Bank of Namibia Bill is addressed in its own merit and this one of human beings used as a stock discussed at length also for us to educate the public and ourselves too? Do you not think that is necessary?

**HON ATTORNEY-GENERAL**: Honourable Meme Ithana you are right and we are waiting for your notice of Motion on this one and we will wholeheartedly support your Motion in this regard. Now I have given a

background where we came from as non-whites oppressed of Africa, oppressed people of Namibia. After independence we put in place systems and processes as our President is fond of saying policies of the Swapo party Government to make sure those things of the past are addressed. As a region we came up with certain policies within the framework of SADC. Our aspiration sis to come up with one Central Bank, one currency and I believe this Bill goes a long way to achieve that objective because during our lifetime we look forward to the day when SADC will have one Central Bank, will have one currency and eventually which is the aspiration of our leaders in Africa.

Within the African context we look forward to seeing one Central Bank of Africa, one currency of Africa so that we move forward as a continent, as a sub-continent, as a country towards the ideals of our forefathers where we emulated them to make sure that Namibia moves forward, SADC moves forward, Africa moves forward together with other nations of the world. Now Honourable Deputy Speaker one aspect which was alluded to by my nephew is the issue of discrimination in the Commercial Banks some. I must maybe emphasize some Commercial Banks in Namibia.

Every year for I do not know how many years 10, 15, 20 years at the counter you find the same face in all material times non-whites. The person from the advantages group three months you find that that person is no longer on the till. He is promoted. I think the issue really the Central Bank must be empowered to look into this matter because it cannot be left like this in an independent Namibia. Most of you Honourable Members maybe without knowing you are also victims if you do not know. Those people from the advantaged group they are told there are benefits in the bank. If you are part of that bank you had an account to be told everything but for you it is a top secret. You will only be told about your obligations not your rights.

You do not know even when you want to get overdraft, you do not know how to go about it but a person from the previously advantaged even before that bank account is opened, he knows all the rights. I think this is the time for the Central Bank to require that all those who maintain bank

account with Commercial Banks all the rights must be in black and white. They must be in writing so that people know their rights, know their obligations without discrimination and I think also the Commission which my cousin alluded to, we need really to give teeth to this Commission so that if there is transgression, there is a violation of Article 23 of the Namibian Constitution which requires this Government to implement affirmative action and those people who fail to do so, they must be taken to task.

That is why I want to congratulate also my dear sister Meme Ipinge for passing this or at least proposing the Motion on gender equality because to me and to most of you Honourable Members, to most of us including the policy of the Swapo party we do not tolerate discrimination on the basis of colour. We do not tolerate discrimination on the basis of gender. That is why we adopted 50-50 policy gender representation and we amended our Constitution of the party to make sure that there is gender representation because in the struggle for national liberation of this country, it was a struggle that our Meme sacrificed and died for. KurukazeMungunda is one of the best examples we always give.

Our fellow men in the trenches they died. General Namoloh you may recall as your student that time you arrived from Soviet Union you find me at the front and you were very handsome I can say very handsome although age is catching up. We were at the shooting range together with Meme Doreen and them. I recall the score I got 28 out of 30 because we were given three bullets each. So the struggle was for all of us. The benefits, the fruits of independence must be for all of us men and women and that is why we say in the banking sector they should not be discrimination not only our Meme to be found on the counters.

All the Managers are male or men so this aspect also must be considered by the Central Banks, by the Equity Commission so that all Namibians regardless of colour, regardless of gender must benefit, must reap the fruits of our independence. That is what Harambe Prosperity Plan says. With these few remarks Honourable Deputy Speaker I once again support this Bill.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Thank you. In the absence of anyone who would like to contribute, I recognize Honourable Maureen Hinda-Mbuende.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Honourable Deputy Speaker I want to propose that you postpone this discussion. I am looking at the timetable and it is difficult to see when is the next discussion. I rush back to just make sure I can still participate on this.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: 4<sup>th</sup> of June.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: To postpone until the 4<sup>th</sup> of June.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Thank you. The debate on this issue is postponed to the  $4^{th}$  of June. I just want to remind Honourable Members that although we are going to have a recess, the item on the agenda are not going to lapse. We will continue in June but from between now and  $7^{th}$  of May, we have no other place for other items rather than the Committee Stage of the budget.

I call the Secretary to read – okay, we will proceed with the Notice of the Motion by Honourable IIvula-Ithana. Does the Honourable Member Move the Motion?

10 April 2019

### THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON IIVULA-ITHANA

HON IIVULA-ITHANA: Yes, I do.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Who seconds, any objection, agreed to. Honourable Member you have now the floor to motivate.

### THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM

**HON IIVULA-ITHANA**: Thank you Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members. I rise to motivate a Motion I tabled some weeks ago on the news of yet another gruesome motor vehicle accident in which several people lost their lives while others got serious to severe injuries. I must at the same time confess that I am proceeding to motivate this Motion against the good advice the doing as I do Honourable Deputy Speaker I am running the risk of sounding like a broken record repeating the same line of a song several times. However, I opt to go ahead in good conscience and after consultations with some Colleagues who equally feel that the discussion should go ahead in the hope that on end to the road carnage may be found.

Honourable Deputy Speaker on either the 14<sup>th</sup> or 15<sup>th</sup> of March this year Namibia was gripped with yet another news of a horrific news of too many buses which collided head on, on the B1 road between Otavi and Tsumeb. A head on collision between two vehicles can only mean one thing that one of the vehicles for whatever reason left its authorized lane and drove on a wrong lane. The reason for driving on a wrong lane can be caused by many factors such as avoiding a collision with an object on the

#### <u>10 April 2019</u>

### THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON IIVULA-ITHANA

road or overtaking a slow moving vehicle or wrongly overtaking at an unauthorized spot. Comrade Deputy Speaker all of us in this Honourable House are frequent road users. For the past 28 years since our independence I have been a frequent road user that I can claim to have travelled most of the roads in Namibia be they gravel or tarred roads. The conditions of our roads particularly the tarred ones are very good with of course the Namibian characteristics.

The gravel roads in certain areas where the annual rainfall is low turn to be also in good condition on most of the time. Travelers on such roads sometimes get deceived by the smoothness of such roads that they overlook the warning signs on speed limits and other warning signs such as sharp turns and others. Tarred roads or bitumen standard roads are so good o potholes except animals. The good conditions of our roads which I described to have the Namibian characteristics that of contrasting duty as we sign in our national anthem can be treacherous and deceiving at times. Roads such as B1 is longest road in our country from Ariamslvei at the border with South Africa to Mahenene Border post to Angola. I am talking about a distance of over 1 000 kilometers.

That road is tarred, straight and smooth to drive on. The larger part of runs through uninhabited stretch of land and one can drive throughout without the need to make a stop for example when you drive from Okahandja to Otjiwarongo, from Tsumeb to now Omuthiya and other parts of the country. Generally the distances between places are so long tempting the drivers to either drive fast or drive slow with the consequence of falling asleep while on the wheels. Honourable Deputy Speaker our road network plays an invariable role of connecting our people to various points in their lives and facilitating connectivity to economic lifeline and social conducts.

While we pride ourselves for having created such good and efficient road network travelling by road has become so dangerous. The narrative of road accidents in Namibia have reached a proportion that even the

# THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON IIVULA-ITHANA

international community has taken note of it. In 2014 the World Health Organization ranked Namibia as a country with the most road deaths per annum actually making it number one in the world. Apparently road accidents is the third highest cause of death in Namibia following HIV Aids and malaria. This classification was done in 2016 or 2014 five or seven years ago.

I do not know what it would be today as the trend of road accidents continue unabated. Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members the Parliament book of record the Hansard is replete with deliberations and debates and resolutions on the same issue. In 2007 on the 20<sup>th</sup> of February Honourable Lucia Basson Member of Parliament as she was then tabled a Motion on road accidents on national roads. This Motion was as equal to a gruesome road accidents which took place between Grootfontein and Murarami Gate in which 13 lives were lost and I do not know how many were injured.

This Parliament expressed its revulsion and ill feelings at the happenings on our roads. This Parliament came up with recommendations as to what must be done. On the 28<sup>th</sup> of June 2016 HonourableVipaukuje Muharukua tabled yet another Motion entitled 'the establishment of the Central Bureau of surveillance to help reduce road accident facilities on Namibian roads'. The same procedure of debate and recommendations was followed. On the 14<sup>th</sup> or 15<sup>th</sup> March this year another serious road accident happened on the B1 road from Otavi to Tsumeb involving two minibuses as I said before which collided head on.

The nation was once again gripped with fear and hangs as to what could be done to reduce or eliminate road accidents that is depriving families and this nation the youths who are able bodied to build this nation. Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members I am fully aware that this topic has enjoyed the attention of this House before. I am fully aware also that what I am saying might be a repetition of what was said in 2007, 2016 and now 2019. If I sound like a broken record, please bear with me.

# THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON IIVULA-ITHANA

Losing human life almost on daily basis through road accidents disabling people who otherwise were born and breed as normal human being is just heartbreak death. Whenever it strikes in a family, you do not say it is alright because our family has mourn another two or three years ago. Death whenever it strikes more so due to unavoidable causes should require our attention.

It is the attention, the response to it back I am looking for Comrade Deputy Speaker one of the recommendations from the Honourable Lucia Basson Motion wants the removal of crosses and flowers placed at the accident site along the respective roads. That resolution was implemented but what effect did it bring about in terms of road accidents? I say nothing of course the road became clean because we removed all those stuff. One of the resolutions implemented from HonourableVipaukujeMuharukua's Motion is the establishment of the Central Bureau of road surveillance. I have noted that on some long distance road there are surveillance cameras whether they are functional or not I am not so sure.

The implementation of these two resolutions in my view did not address the fundamental causes of road accidents on our roads. Most of our road accidents are caused by human error. I say this from the reasons all of us know. I think so. The other day I said here in Parliament that Namibia seem to have been created in anger. We seem to be on angry nation with no respect of human life. I am one of the eye witnesses of bad driving on our roads. On many occasions the vehicle I used to driving in had to leave the road completely to allow on oncoming vehicle on the wrong side of the road to pass not doing so would cause a head on collision without doubt.

As Honourable Muharukua said in his motivation of that Motion Honourable Deputy Speaker 'I have witnessed driving at excessive speed overtaking dangerously, switching lands without due care, dangerous stopping on highways while driver on two opposite lanes converse to each other without due care whether there are oncoming vehicles or not'. At

# THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON IIVULA-ITHANA

one occasion I instructed my driver then to pursue a minibus which made the car I was driving in to leave the road realizing that the driver that driver overtook at a blind spot and was speeding with a bus full of passengers. Thank God Government drivers are police officers. I do not know whether they are still police officers. When we approached that driver he wanted to fight which he could not proceed it realizing that his counterpart was a police officer.

Honourable Deputy Speaker nowadays owners of public transport and haulage make use of the youths as drivers. The youths are said to be fast drivers and energetic and can resist fatigue particularly during rush hours or holidays. The unemployment in the country has pushed the youths into the driving occupation. The downside to this is that some of these young people do not have the required experience to drive haulage vehicles where human life is exposed to danger.

It has also been said that there has been raftering of driving license true or not I cannot vouch but the story is in the public view. That is why certain places in our country are known for issuing driving license easily. They are known those places are known. I believe that some people sitting behind the steering wheels have licenses obtained in dubious ways. That is why such drivers do not know traffic signs and can therefore overtake dangerously and violate traffic regulations very easily. Another factor attributing to road accident is driving under the influence of alcohol and substances.

I have heard that some drivers boast that alcohol helps them to keep awake when driving long distances. Honourable Deputy Speaker I said all that above to indicate that our road accidents are due to human error. It has absolutely nothing to do with our roads because our roads are in good conditions. This situation therefore requires the change of our mind sets as drivers and passengers as well. As drivers we must respect human life in the first place. We must be cautious to each other as drivers on our roads. We must respect traffic signs and the traffic laws. Owners of public

# THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON NAMOLOH

transport must bear the responsibility for the lives lost by their careless drivers.

In other countries owners of such vehicles are sued for the lives of the innocent passengers lost. Drivers of public transport must be required to have certain years of driving experience before they can be allowed to carry human beings. Comrade Deputy Speaker in some countries when a driver has contravened certain traffic regulations such as driving under the influence, the driving license of such a driver is either suspended or permanent withdrawn while such penalties are not used in our legal system here in Namibia.

I think time has come that the system that some bad drivers off the road so as to send a strong message that enough of carnage has taken place on our roads and enough is enough. Honourable Deputy Speaker having said the above, I look forward to a very enriching deliberations as this discussion can save our own lives as well. I thank you.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Thank you. I recognize Honourable Namoloh.

**HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY**: Thank you very much Comrade Deputy Speaker. I would want to thank Honourable Ithana for bringing up this Motion.

She has eloquently spoken on this issue and sighted all the deliberations which have taken place in Parliament and elsewhere. We also heard President Pohamba calling for a prayer day for us to pray so that accident do not happen. We can pray as much as can until most of us are no more living if we do not help ourselves to curb this carnage. We must find. We

# THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON NAMOLOH

must ask why always accidents on our roads. Sometimes we run to speed. Roads are long as it was said here but if you have a hospital and there are so many patients who are dying to blame the hospital or is something else to do with nurses and doctors and if there is something to do with the nurses and doctors, have we looked where they were trained to become nurses and doctors.

Probably they will not be qualified to treat patients in a hospital. Meme Ithana said it in another way that even have we looked at our driving schools. Are they qualified to teach drivers to drive on our national roads? Are they constituted to be a driving school that is a driving school? I have seen driving schools under trees and somebody outside. When you are teaching somebody to drive you sit in the car but these ones are outside the car. I have seen it. If you want go and see. Are these people qualified also to teach drivers they themselves? Are the cars also properly fitted to teach people to drive?

A teaching car to drive has got two steering wheels. It has got two brake pedals whatever you call them. It has got two clutch pedals also both the teacher and one who is being taught and that is a car to teach somebody to drive. It is not about only road signs and what a view. It is also the skill somebody how to handle a car and they are taught there. So we should look at these things also so that we can handle. We can now try to address the problem on our roads.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point of order.

HON MURORUA: General can I ask you a question?

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON NAMOLOH

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please proceed.

**HON MURORUA**: You put it very well about the driving schools but I just want to know who authorized these driving schools.

**HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY**: It is very difficult also for me to answer. Hopefully these are business entities. They are being given licenses to do businesses possibly from the Ministry which does that and then they go and do businesses. I hope it is not a police. Do not look at me. Maybe you are asking to say why are you putting it. It is the police. No, it is not the police. It is not the police who authorizes driving schools. It is not also the police who issue drivers licenses. It is not the police. We will come to that also.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Point of order. Maybe you can provide information.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION**: General I know that the police is also falling under the General. Are we saying, is General actually saying these driving schools that are send especially the bus when they are standing next to the car and directly. Then the person with the learners license is not supposed to be alone in the car. So are we saying the warning basically that the public that General's office will look into this matter and the other part of the wheels. I think it makes sense but I have not encountered in Africa. Is the General perhaps thinking in the light of bringing a Bill that will consider

# THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON NAMOLOH

those conditions, provisions? Thank you.

**HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY**: Honourable-Mbuende I am also contributing to the Motion not making policies as yet since the policy would be referred to the appropriate Committee but what I am telling you I think this Committee should look into that there are so many players in this also this issue so many players who is providing what and who is being asked to do what also. Something you do not provide and then you ask to check on it. So these are things we need to maybe to harmonize or one way or another somewhere. Every time and HonourableIthana said it every day, every week, every month, every year we bury our dead.

We mourn and bury them and we go home and we have not possibly seriously and vigorously carry a postmortem of why these accidents are happening. It is not only alright somebody swerved to the right but why they are swerving to the right? Why are they reckless in driving? We must ask these questions, why are they and I think it has got do with training. Look at the Inter Cape. You know the Inter Cape. Everybody wants to go to the Inter Cape. I want you to tell me how many accidents has the Inter Cape had? How many, none? It is between here and Cape Town. It is back here to the north and so forth but you never hear accident, why. You also mentioned it.

People recruit people who have got experience of driving for so many years without accidents. It is not about monitoring. It is about the person who is behind the wheel, the experience. Here and HonourableIthana also mentioned it the owners many of us who are here, the owners of the, to tell Muharukua he once brought a Motion also here and he does not want to listen now. How can we support you now if you do not want to listen to us and we talking what you brought here. So many of us who own minibuses and so forth because we want quick money she mentioned it,

# THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON NAMOLOH

we recruit young boy somebody who was taught under this tree to drive and after six months or so, he is given to drive a public transport. Please God save us then.

Had to drive six month, eight months is driving only here in Windhoek or in the north there and is given a bus to drive public transport driving lives especially Meme Ithana said during the festive seasons.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Point of order from your Colleague Tate Billy. He stood first. Who stood first, alright?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF DEFENCE: Comrade General.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: You have the floor. Provide a point of order.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF DEFENCE**: Point of question Comrade General if may ask a question as to perhaps at this time, this point in time we need to.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sound, we cannot hear you.

# THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON NAMOLOH

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF DEFENCE**: We need to have maybe categories of drivers who are driving the long distance vehicle particularly those who are transporting many people that to have a driving license once you drive for how many years and also maybe to have a requirement on that particular person as to which type of vehicle that goes long distances once you drive a bus, minibus, some cars. Maybe should we have that provision or law? Thank you.

**HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY**: Thank you HonourableMwaningange. I think we are discussing or contributing to this Motion to arrive at something. That is why we are being it now. So Meme Ithana mentioned it young guys driving and we recruit them when we want quick money during festive seasons and it is Easter coming and (interrupted).

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point of order.

**HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY**: Do not make me to lose my focus.

**HON NAUYOMA**: You will not lose your sight General just to ask the General whether he is aware that some of these boys that drive our minibuses they start just as assistant in the bus. Then when that one is tired, then you start driving. Are you aware of that?

# THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON NAMOLOH

**HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY**: I think this is what we are talking about, alright. We spoke about those you know as I said yearly, monthly and so forth and we also spend lots of money especially from our Ministry now. We are asked to deploy Nampol along the roads because it is festive season and we are pumping a lot of money so that we go on the roads. You find they are there checking the speed and what a view but the problem here is the man behind the vehicle. Speed, yes we can argue. You can say speed kills. Speed does not always kill.

If speed is the problem, then we will have had Ministers and Deputy Ministers in this Chamber dead long time ago. No, no, it is not a secret. Do not make a fussy about it. Our cars sometimes speed. It is not a secret. That is why I am saying it. Speed is not (incomplete).

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Once more point of order.

**HON MURORUA**: General I want your contribution to take us to a place where we should arrive at something for the Motion but when you talk the drivers of the Ministers these are trained people. They are trained and they know what they are doing so we cannot compare them with the ordinary drivers on the national roads.

**HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY**: What I want to tell you is the training of somebody behind the wheel. That is what I want to tell you. Anybody being experienced or whoever can be a good driver like the one driving the Ministers. In Germany there is what they call autoban 400 kilometers per hour and so forth but how many cars accidents in Germany. It is people who are trained to drive and that is what I was

# THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON NAMOLOH

driving to that it is not always only the speed which kills. It is the man behind the wheel.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Your Colleague point of order.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF GENDER EUQALITY AND CHILD WELFARE**: Thank you. Can I ask General a question? General you were saying that our drivers are speeding, good but as a lawmaker, are you not in a position to tell your driver now please come back to the normal speed that you are supposed to drive? As a lawmaker are you not allowed just a question?

**HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY**: I think I will not answer this because we are not here to talk about the drivers now. I am talking about the trend. You must understand that trend of accidents. That is why we lose focus on what topics we are discussing you see. We want to draw to that. It is not relevant now. This is the trend of accidents what causes the accidents is what I am trying to bring to. So drivers who are to drive I think this is what we are now arriving to. Drivers who should drive public transport must have accumulated so many years of driving at experience. That is why I spoke about Inter Cape.

In a nation you cannot be a pilot of a passenger plane if you have not accumulated some hours for you to be able to be a pilot of a passenger plane and I think this should apply to the drivers. People must be also they must be, we have to come to getting people if this person is qualified to drive passengers because you see a driver arguing with passengers. When they say your speed is too much. He say it is not your car. It is my

# THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON NAMOLOH

car. You see these things the responsibilities and we should look now driving schools are competent to teach people to drive. We should look at teacher driver.

Maybe this other person was not properly trained as he goes to train another driver. What do you expect? What do you expect there? The car also as I said they must be properly equipped to drive people. They are going to teach to drive. I think we must come to that also when this we must discuss all those issues.

### HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point of order.

**HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE**: You have been emphasizing on the driving schools but these people who are learning how to drive they go to NATIS for safety. These are the last people to test them. What I have observed Comrade really we should not overlook it. I am saying it now that NATIS some people in NATIS they are selling licenses. So how can you sell a license if somebody has failed and you give the license? That person is going to the public road. NATIS there is a big question in NATIS. I request the Minister of Works just to ambush, you will see how they are making money out of nothing. It is just information which I am giving. Thank you.

**HON MINISTER OF SAFETEY AND SECURITY**: I was coming to that also at the end that (incomplete).

# THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON NAMOLOH

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: You have less than ten minutes, seven minutes.

**HON MINISTER OF SAFETEY AND SECURITY**: I will finish now. I will finish less than seven minutes if nobody ask a question. You see some now learners when they have to be tested to pass they opt to go to other towns than in Windhoek or they say I am going to Opuwo or to Grootfontein to pass there. What if I am a great student and I want to write my exams in another school and not at the school where I attended classes? What does it give us? It means there is something there what you have said Meme Sioka. What you have said is what I am saying. People who now want to be tested to get their learners or their drivers' license, they opt to go to certain town where is possibly a loophole then they are given a license.

Those are some of the things we should look at. My neighbor here in front of me is responsible for all this issuance of licenses, NATIS and so forth. So we will work together to be able to do it and I think.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Meme Doreen allow him to finish because, alright point of order. From then you only have two minutes.

**HON MINISTER OF SPORT, YOUTH AND NATIONAL SERVICE**: You are talking about a driving school that the driving school maybe is where the problem is. Now in Namibia these driving schools have produced a big number of women driving in this country. It has produced a big number of women driving in this country but now when you compare the rate of accidents caused by women you hardly see that at

# THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON NEKUNDI

a higher rate but the accidents caused by us men it is very high. Now you are talking that driving school. How do you comment on that because they went through the same driving school?

**HON MINISTER OF SAFETEY AND SECURITY**: Comrade Minister I think I do not want you to get me confused. Listen here possibly women when they pass they go to the authentic passing of being a driver. They do not go to other places small places. So they are tested and qualify to be drivers. I think that should be and men possibly go, take a short cut. I think that should be the underlining.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: And they are considerate.

**HON MINISTER OF SAFETEY AND SECURITY**: They concentrate yes, so Comrade Deputy Speaker I think when we arrive now when it goes to the Committee, these are the fundamental issues we should address so that we do not come again, have another Motion, call to prayers and so forth and so forth. We must address these issues. I thank you.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, HonourableNekundi.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Thank you very much Comrade Deputy Speaker and I also thank my mother there for this very important Motion she presented in this Parliament. What runs

# THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON NEKUNDI

into my mind when she introduced the Motion I asked a fundamental question. Are we serious of what we are doing when we are on this floor discussing important Motions of this nature? The mother there indicated that a number of similar Motions were presented, discussed, send to Committees, brought back and nothing is done, how serious. Something must be wrong and we cannot continue to come here and think things are business as usual. Somebody must at one point must be held accountable.

We cannot waste time people discussing important issues, finding solutions, tend to institutions of which they ought to implement the recommendations of such deliberations and we continue only when more people dies. We remember of Motion and recommendation. It just cannot be right and we need to call a spade a spade. We cannot and it is not right. There are institutions in this country entrusted to ensure the implementation of resolutions or Motions adopted by this August House and we are saying about three or so Motions were discussed here and we are taking it as joke as lawmakers.

It cannot be right Comrade Deputy Speaker.

These persons must be called to this House and say what have you implemented? The recommendations we are just here to make noise to talk and it cannot be right. When we discus here we mean business. When things go to the Committees it mean business. We cannot discuss issues and they go there and collect dust. We will become a laughing stock of this nation and it cannot be right. That must be addressed. That being said on a serious note, we have an institution called the National Roads Safety Council of this country. We have people who are established by the Act of Parliament and I think when you go under Section 6 of that Act, it gives the function and it provided that what you must do to curb road accidents.

Are they doing it right? They are even the function even says they must carry out research. It even says they must advise the relevant Minister on policies that could enhance their function in curbing accidents. Are they

# THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON NEKUNDI

doing it for the past ten years, 29 years? Are they doing it right? Certainly not, I am one of those who believe they are not doing it right. I am one of those they are just collecting salaries. I am convinced for that fact. It cannot be that we have institutions established with a good intention but that good intention is put under the carpet. These colleagues must pick up their socks and carry out the functions so that when they go at the end of the month, the salaries they are receiving is exactly for a good what they have performed.

They are failing this nation at a greater extend. They are not doing it right. Car accidents in this country have become a daily bread. People are crying. People are losing their loved ones, their families, their friends. Some are gone under the ground. Some are paralyzed. Some have become no more economic active yet we have institutions in the first instance is supposed to be us see to establish to date with that function have the road accident increase or decrease. What have you done? They must present a report of their function in terms of their mandate. That must be addressed. There were recommendations on the prior Motions. There were recommendations have they implemented to date. It cannot be this of this country. It must be addressed.

Comrade Deputy Speaker another dimension I want to bring in is possibly also to ask a question. When I do my analysis of our behaviors as road drivers if you go to a function even at a rugby stadium in this country, point of order.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point of order.

HON MINISTER IN PRIME MINISTER OFFICE: Thank you Deputy Speaker. May I ask HonourableNekundi may I ask you a

# THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON NEKUNDI

question? You are speaking about institutions that are if I understand you correctly appointed or established to oversee the reduction of the road carnage. Are you suggesting that we call in these institutions or I mean these people responsible for or are you suggesting that we re-task them again? What are you suggesting please?

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Straightforward we must assess their competency in running that institution. They must be attest on their competency to carry out the functions as enshrined in the Act. If they are not found to be competent they must pack and go. It cannot be. The principle here is Comrade Deputy Speaker over the last ten years the statistics I have is that MVA Fund spend N\$2.1 Billion on the victims of car accidents. It is a serious loss to our economy yet the institution that must do that and money is being put on that action. It cannot be just like that N\$2.5 Billion in terms of the size of our economy.

It is a serious money of which it could be used for something productive for this country. We have statistics says that for the past ten years 4 847 people have died from road accident. That gives you 484 people who died every month on average per year 484 people who died. 40 people who died a month and every month on average a person dies. Every day look at our population how serious is that. How much it affects communities, how much it affects our economy. The serious injuries for the past ten years it is 4054, 405 serious injuries a year, 34 a month and one still a day. On average you lose people productivities of two persons. It cannot be regarded as business as usual.

That is why I am speaking with seriousness and I am calling those who are entrusted with this responsibility to pull up their socks. If they want to be assisted probably they call us to assist them. It cannot just be business as usual, pull up their socks. Alright, very good that English. I want to deal

# THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON NEKUNDI

with the issue of accidents. I want to say look at go to a rugby stadium known for white people how they are driving parking. They are passing and no traffic to control them, no security to control them the way they are parking. Go to a soccer match where there are blacks each car is parked left, right, centre, no base. Even some of them go over the base. Something is wrong. Is it the slavery mentality that we still have? What is wrong? The way we drive I am saying just go. When you hear there is even independence day where we know there are blessed how we park.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Sorry, in Katutura they are very careful the way they drive. I have noticed it is true. Not when they come from Katutura to town but inside Katutura they are very careful. I am saying, alright, proceed.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: I am saying let us do that analysis. It is very serious. I went to soccer matches. I went to rugby matches. I went to cricket matches. I went to tennis matches. You will see where this colour is with car, it is true. It is indisputable fact. Somebody who parked behind you that you cannot even reverse out. I must wave that person to come. It is just not right. These things are true. So we need to address it and see maybe we need a special training for our people to become drivers so that there is a paradigm shift in how they are as road drivers.

You will see somebody there is a donkey, you know a donkey does not behave when you hoot. A donkey is a fixed element on the road. Somebody driving 180 a donkey is standing. The person is hooting and when he is 20 meters is when he want to break and says I am witched. How can I bump a donkey but you were driving at 180. An element is on the road yet you are hooting and you are not even reducing the speed until

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON NEKUNDI

you hit. Something is just not right. Somebody just go on the road. You will see somebody getting on the road, another car is approaching, he does not even bother. He will go with his own speed and even go to 20.

Some of them make a joke nowadays in saying this is my area so if you are in a hurry, why did you come yesterday but you do not even look in your mirror. You have no regard to the speed of the approaching cars. These things are behavior. Look on the traffic lights some of them call them robots the traffic light, it is red. Somebody just drive through as if nothing is wrong and he does not bother and it is 1 o'clock. It is not even 12 midnight where you pass danger time. The way our attitude is just not right and it must be addressed accordingly. I move away from that. Now the last two things I have, three things I have.

#### HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: How many?

#### HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Three.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: It is alright. You have time but the other people also want to contribute.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: It is on over the past few years and of recent Comrade Jerry spoke the other day of my cousin his nephew who burned and sister-in-law between Okahandja and Windhoek. There is technology which I think at one time I shared. It is a fire extinguisher ball where it catches fire in the car. It

# THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON NEKUNDI

basically extinguish the fire. Why can the road safety Council together with the relevant authority make it a mandatory that every car must have those balls, why?

### HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Must have?

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: The fire extinguisher ball so why cannot it be done and I am recommending and I think Comrade Natangwe here he observed one of the accidents where the car burned out. He could not assist so but if we use technologies sometimes are also good. So are we saying the Road Safety Council is not aware of this new system that they could recommend to the Minister that a law, it is a law or a policy must be enacted and it is high time that we move with time too. So my recommendation on the onset that it must be mandatory that every car both private and public must have the fire extinguisher balls not this one because the other ones because there are two types.

This one is used normally in the houses. If it is a serious accident you may not even know how to use it. You are also confused but the ball once the fire catch the car, it automatically explode and it puts the fire off. It is going to assist these are technologies. Let us use technology for the good cause. The other one if you remember there is now what is called dash cameras. Dash cameras are important and will just be front and here that basically it tells you if somebody is driving recklessly in front of you, that camera automatic captures that that car in front of you and you can submit that to the police to the traffic and that could be used and it could even use it through the system technological system.

Even if you are driving from let us assume you are between Okahandja

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON NEKUNDI

and Otjiwarongo you can just forward to Otjiwarongo if the car is brought to the wrong side. That video can already reach Otjiwarongo. That car comes there, the video it is there. You pull that person off and that the next element is to say even your car is coming from behind and is driving recklessly from the behind, the rear camera can take that person. If the person is overtaking at a blind spot, the dash camera is able to take the picture or the video of that car. We would be able to address if we are serious. The problem sometimes we talk and talk but we do not want to implement things that are good for this country sometimes and these are the systems that could be used.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point of order.

**HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY**: My son this technology you are talking about it is true we have technology worth about N\$5 500. If it is fitted in every car, the police would be able to monitor whether the driver was on the phone or had no seat belt. It is there now. Of course people the first thing they will say no, it is a privacy. It would be the privacy. You want to capture voices. It will only be the driver not the passengers, only the driver. Whatever you want to do there are technologies which you are talking with this and so forth just to give information.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Thank you General. Those are the technologies which could be used for this country and the question should be is it better to spend N\$2.1 Billion through the MVA or to spend that N\$5 000 to save those N\$2.1 Billion? That is very important. At times we must make decisions that is good for the society

# THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON NEKUNDI

and I think technology of that nature is good for the society. My final one time have come that licenses be revoked. Time have come it is done in other countries. If they can do it, why can we not do it? So time have come that we do that so therefore I am still recommending that if Veiko is a reckless driver and is a danger to society, through that the license (incomplete).

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Point of order the owner of the Motion.

**HON IIVHULA-ITHANA**: Yes the owner of the Motion but I want to ask a small question for clarity sake. The licenses we have, have the time limit a time span of about five years. Can we not make it compulsory? Can it not be possible that compulsory when a license expires for it to be renewed, that person must go through vigorous test by NATIS? Is that not doable Honourable Member?

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Yes, I realize it is five years. Mine is expiring end of June. It is very true but there must be serious training because your abilities of five years ago will not be your abilities of today.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Respond.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: What I am

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON EKANDJO

saying is that at every five years there must be serious re-testing. It is important.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: How many years. After how many years?

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**: Five years, after five years what is currently happening is on the eye test. You only go for the eye test. When you go for renewal, you are only tested eyes. That is all. Maybe in this time you are now shivering. So there must be abilities. So I second that, that there must be re-assessing but my underlining recommendation to this Motion is that time have come that we use technology and that the license should be revoked. Therefore the paramount importance if need be that the laws must be amended to accommodate the technology and the revocations of the licenses that it must come here and we amend them accordingly. I so submit and support the Motion. Thank you very much.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Thank you. The next person is just to adjourn, Honourable Jerry Ekandjo maybe you can adjourn.

**HON EKANDJO**: Comrade Honourable Members I would like to adjourn this session until tomorrow.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Sorry, Sir it is highly possibility that

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON EKANDJO

tomorrow we are not going to sit.

HON EKANDJO: Until the next I do not know when.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: There is a likelihood that we are not, I am going to explain something.

**HON EKANDJO**: On this 11<sup>th</sup> Thursday are you not following me, alright until the next opportunity arises? I do not know when what the Parliament decide when.

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Honourable Members it is true that on the order paper it indicated that on the  $11^{th}$  we are supposed to have a sitting but I was informed by the Chief Whip that a number of Colleagues are not likely to be here which will likely to threaten a quorum even a sitting quorum.

It is on that basis that the absence of those people they are likely to threaten the quorum and henceforth I know that the Chief Whip of the official opposition was informed and the other Colleagues too. You are not informed. On that basis it appears that the number of the Colleagues I was informed by the Chief Whip of the ruling party that they are not likely to be here. They are likely to travel to the north to attend the funeral of the King of Ondonga.

So on that basis I ask the concurrence of the House not to have a sitting tomorrow. Therefore – Honourable Mutorwa.

# THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON EKANDJO

**HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT**: Honourable Deputy Speaker if I may I just want to have an understanding not about the sitting as you have explained is alright but when I look at this program today and tomorrow was if this issue did not come was scheduled to deal with all outstanding matters. Now I reckon that one of this outstanding items is this very important Motion because when I look next week we will now start with the business of the budget. The Minister will reply on Tuesday the  $16^{th}$  and on Wednesday the  $17^{th}$  is the State of the Nation.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Propose something.

**HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT**: Yes, I am coming to that. This is the understanding that a very important Motion like this one will find space for debate during the time when we will deal with the budget because I do not want this particular Motion to lapse. That is the only assurance that I just want to and I hope the mover will also support me in that.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Probably yes, I take note of that.

**<u>HON EKANDJO</u>**: On a Tuesday introduction and then a week pass and the  $6^{th}$  of May the week of Wednesday, Thursday the two days there in between.

#### ADJOURNMENT HON PROF KASINGO

**HON DEPUTY SPEAKER**: Those are Cassinga, Workers Day the  $1^{st}$  of May. I would like to propose to say probably Tuesday the  $16^{th}$  are we going to spend the whole day in listening to the reply probably that item can be postponed to the  $16^{th}$  Tuesday. Thank you very much.

With the concurrence the item on the debate on this Motion on road accidents is postponed by Honourable Jerry Ekandjo to the  $16^{th}$  of April which is Tuesday 14:30.

So on that basis, thank you for the concurrence of the whole House. The House is adjourned up to Tuesday 14:30, so adjourned.

#### HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:45 UNTIL 2019.04.16 AT 14:30

#### NATIONAL ASSEMBLY ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS WINDHOEK 16 APRIL 2019

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON SPEAKER took the Chair and read the Prayer and the Affirmation.

# ANNOUNCEMENTS IN TERMS OF RULE 20(B) OF THE STANDING RULES AND ORDERS

**HON SPEAKER**: Welcome back. Some few housekeeping announcements, Honourable Members, in view of the forthcoming Good Friday 19<sup>th</sup> April 2019 would like to consult you and to seek your support that we sit on Thursday 18 April 2019 in order to deal with some of the items on our agenda but I would like to keep it open for us to also consider the possibility of not sitting at all. Option 1 sitting? Option 2 not sitting at all until Tuesday, do I have your consensus, support? So decided. But I am looking at the Minister of Finance but he does not seem to agree with that. He is in agreement, thank you. So decided.

Furthermore Honourable Members, as you might now be aware we received a delegation from the United Kingdom, from the CPA/UK that is currently engaging us in a workshop on Management of Committees and Parliamentary Business. They have a delegation consisting of the following Honourable Members, Lopitevis of Twit from the United Kingdom House of Lords at the leader of the Delegation, the Honourable Kenneth Gibson a Member of the Scottish Parliament and the Honourable Maureen Vatt Members of the Scottish Parliament. The three of them are accompanied by three staff members who have been extremely energetic and inspiring in mobilizing the workshop covering a number of issues that I mentioned in my opening statement.

#### NOTICE OF QUESTIONS HON VAN WYK

So I would like to present them to you. Welcome to the Parliament of Namibia, welcome to the National Assembly and thank you very much for being here. We look forward to continue our interaction and the partnership that exists between the CPA/UK and the Namibian Parliament, welcome.

**HON SPEAKER:** Any Petitions? Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Notice of Questions? Honourable Jan Van Wyk.

#### **NOTICE OF QUESTIONS**

#### **QUESTION 49:**

**HON VAN WYK**: Thank you Honourable Speaker. Honourable Speaker I give Notice that on Thursday 25 April 2019 I shall ask the Honourable Minister of Urban and Rural Development Honourable Dr Peya Mushelenga the following:

Honourable Minister residence of Rehoboth were informed at a public meeting on Monday  $8^{th}$  of April 2019 by officials of the Rehoboth Town Council that the NamPower bill stands at N\$99,000,000 at the end of (interruptions). March 2019.

Information suggests that the outstanding bill to NamPower at the end of 2014 was just under N\$8,000,000. Just over 95% of households in Rehoboth for making use of the prepaid electricity system at the end of 2014 no new townships were established as then. Council officials at the very same meeting could not explain as to what has caused the huge rise in the NamPower bill. I shall therefore ask the following:

### NOTICE OF QUESTIONS HON KATOMA

1. Could the Honourable Minister inform this House and the residence of Rehoboth in particular in full details as to what has transpired at the Rehoboth Town Council with regards to the collection of revenue and the payment to NamPower?

I so Move, Honourable Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Next is Honourable Levy Katoma.

#### **QUESTION 50:**

**HON KATOMA**: Honourable Speaker, I give Notice that on Thursday 18<sup>th</sup> April 2019 I shall ask the Minister of Education Arts and Culture, Honourable Katrina Hanse-Himarwa, the following:

It has come to my attention that some principals are punishing learners who are coming to school late by way of sending them back home and completely miss out the classes of the entire day. Learners normally do not go back home in the fear of their parents but instead they opt to roam around the school vicinity waiting for the school to adjourn for them to be able to return home that they indeed attended the classes thus I ask?

- 1. Why do the principals not call in the parents of the affected learners and discuss the matter to find a solution instead of interrupting with the learners' precious learning time?
- 2. If the principals do not inform the parents how will the parents know the statuses of their children's punctuality and attendance of classes thereof?
- 3. What prevents the principals to use other friendly forces of disciplining learners?

4. What does the law say in this regard?

I so move Honourable Speaker.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you, Table the question. Notice of Motions? Messages from the Head of State? Ministerial Statements? So we are done.

The Secretary will read the First Order of the day.

# **RESUMPTION OF DEBATE ON SECOND READING – APPROPRIATION BILL [B.3 – 2019]**

**SECRETARY:** Resumption of Debate on Second Reading – *Appropriation Bill* [B.3 – 2019].

**HON SPEAKER**: When the Assembly adjourned on Tuesday the 9<sup>th</sup> April 2019 the question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Minister of Finance that the Bill be read a second time. The Deputy Minister of Finance adjourned the Debate on behalf of the Minister of Finance and I now give the floor to the Honourable Minister of Finance to reply.

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Thank you Honourable Speaker. Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, let me first also welcome the delegation from the UK Parliament. I am actually happy it is not the

Brexit (indistinct) but they are very welcomed.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, relevant questions and proposals made on the 2019/2020 Appropriation Bill and Budgetary Policy Framework are set out in the Medium Term Expenditure Framework and fiscal strategy. I am grateful for the considerations put forward and the broad support that the Appropriation Bill received in this House. The budget formulation and review continue to benefit from the inside by the Legislature as we seek to enhance the budget deficiency as a national priority.

Let me take this opportunity to thank the Honourable Members and Political Parties who took the floor to contribute to the debate and made proposals. In particular, I want to thank Honourable Deputy Prime Minister and Minister of International Relations and Cooperation Honourable Netumbo Ndaitwah and all the colleagues of this side for the contributions and support for the budget.

I want to thank the leader of the Opposition Party Honourable Venaani as well as the other Members of his Party Honourable Muharukwa and Honourable Smit for their contributions. My appreciation is also extended to members from other Opposition Parties namely Honourable Kavekotora, Honourable Dr Iijambo, Honourable Van Wyk, Honourable //Goagoses (intervention).

HON //GOWASES: //Gowases.

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: //Gowases thank you and Honourable Nauyoma for Honourable Nauyoma for raising pertinent issues that are supporting the Bill. I will now respond to questions and comments raised by Honourable in the Second Reading of 2019/2020 Appropriation Bill.

Honourable Speaker, I will address these matters raised within the demanding areas under which specific questions and contributions were made. Speaking as regards to the economy suddenly Budget Alignment and National Development Plans, Fiscal Consolidation Measures, Public Enterprises and Government Wage Bill Reforms, Private Sector Development and Investment Promotion I shall further touch on matters related to Public Procurement and Public Private Partnerships and as others related proposals which were put forward.

Honourable Speaker, my Cabinet colleagues will during the Committee Stage provide more details on sector specific programmes under their votes including the performance outcomes most of which are detailed in the Government Accountability Report for the 2017/2018 Financial Year.

Let me start with the state of the economy and growth outlook. *Honourable Venaani and Honourable Smit*, raised issues centred around economic growth based on the outlook as basis for policy interventions contained in the budget. Following the tabling of the budget the preliminary national accounts for 2018 were reached it was a day after the tabling. The outturn effects suggest a softer production of domestic economy at 0.1% as against the estimated 0.5% as presented in the budget. This outturn on the economic activity indicates that the recession had in fact picked at 0.9% in 2017 and that the economy is easing out of the construction into growth terraces.

Honourable Speaker, the place of domestic economic recovery has also impacted on by regional and global developments given that economic financial and trade sectors are closely to interlinked on inter connectors. It is these dynamics that dictates the medium term economic projections of any economy. In fact our projections are close of those of other institutions such as the Bank of Namibia, the African Development Bank and the IMF.

In the first five months of 2019 the global economy activity reduced from 0.3% and that is by a projection of International Monetary Funds this month from 3.7% projected in October 2018. The economic growth

outlook for our largest neighbouring trading partners of South Africa and Angola remains tight. The downside risks to growth particularly those arising when the China/United States of America trade and the effects of Brexity have emerged much faster its speed and impacts on growth and adversely effecting financial markets sentiments. At the same time the adverse effects of climate change have affected a number of economies including Namibia.

These are prevailing factors which we must content with without most of generalizing of course. As I stated in the budget statement the pace and scale of recovery is predicted on the timelines of the pro-growth measures announced in the budget. I concur therefore with the Honourable Members who urged for speedy implementation and I call upon all Offices, Ministries and Agencies to scale up the implementation capacity for this momentum to be enhanced.

In addition Comrade Speaker the 2018 National Labour Force Survey results points to an elevated need to address youth unemployment which is estimated to have increased from 43% in 2016 to 46% in 2018 while the net effect of the overall unemployment rate is assessed to have dropped by 1% point that is from 34% to 33%. So it is a mixed message. The budget before us seeks to strengthen macroeconomic stability, regained economic growth with jobs and fiscal sustainability. Intervention to support broad based economic growth and youth employment and self employment are of priority considerations in this budget.

Honourable Speaker, the structural challenges of poverty and inequalities at what they can lead to be man made as some Honourable Members have postulated have emerged. This is because the extent of their manifestation is a direct result of political economy of our country's historic policies of the old order.

However, it cannot be denied that we have made meaningful progress in addressing these challenges. We have reduced inequalities from a very high rate of "0.71%" in quotations ratio to the current estimate of 0.56%. Absolute poverty has also been reduced from levels above 40% to about

17.4% in 2016 with extreme poverty falling from about 30% of the population to 10.7% in recent years. Certainly these are high rates politically to national income levels and further targeted efforts are needed to address these structural challenges to inclusive economic growth and targeted programmes.

Honourable Speaker, observations were made about realignment of the budget to National Development Plan Vision 2030 and Harambe Plan. In this respect I wish to state that the National budget is an instrument of fiscal policy and a key tool for contributing to the achievement of national development objectives. Of interest therefore is how the budget advances the national development objectives. First the National Development Plan benchmarks are set within a dynamic environment and are affected by short to medium term developments nationally and globally. We have recalibrated the fiscal policy on a sustainable bar which is a fundamental condition to advanced private and objective set out in National Development Plan.

*Honourable Venaani*, I should indicate that all programmes that are proposed for funding under this budget are directly linked to aspirations of Vision 2030, NDP5 and the Harambe Prosperity Plan and specific evidence can be provided during the Committee Stage as I have said earlier.

Honourable Speaker, questions were raised with regards to the link between economic growth and public debt dynamics. The relationship between growth and Government debt is central to fiscal policy. The budget statement talks at length about the subject that has established the Medium Term Policy stance to achieve economic growth and stabilizing the increase in debt for public debt stock. I therefore call upon Honourable Members to familiarize themselves with the content of the fiscal strategy which is a document provided to the House.

*Honourable Smit,* also left now, I should indicate that our fiscal policy remains flexible and gross friendly and it face the right code between debt sustainability and supporting demand therefore the high economic growth

which we achieved between 2010 and 2015 was mostly funded through that capital resulting in an economic boom in some sectors of the economy due to public investments therein. At the end of the boom period and the onset of the perfect storm that increased due to a sharp decline and output in public revenue and a deduction in public expenditure which had to be done resulted in a severe drop in economic growth.

Discernable progress has been made in the desolation of growth in Government debt since we collectively adopted the targeted fiscal consolidation programme in 2018 as such the increase in Government debt over the fiscal year 2018/2019 stood at 70% year on year compared to the average increase of 32% between 2013/2014 and 2016/2017 a significant drop there over the 2019/2020 and 2021/2022 MTEF period the growth in debt was projected at an average of 9% had dropped yet again. Thanks to debt stabilization policy measures. This budget continues on this policy framework underscoring the Government's intentions to stay like the growth in Government debt and reduce debt over the medium and long term.

Notably Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, specific clarification as to why Government debt is still rising is specifically set out in the Medium Term Fiscal Policy stance, as much as the budget deficit could not be significantly reduced in the short term and positive primary budget balance should foster public debt would tend to rise. The specific fiscal sums that we have propagated is to mellow consolidation so as to improve our chances to enhance growth that is the trade that we have put forward and I am convinced that that is the right balance that we have found.

In the 2016/2017 budget review and Medium Term Policy statement we set out the fiscal stance that brings about faster closing of the budget deficit and debt stabilization. The stiffer consolidation generated unintended consequences on economic growth and expenditure over commitments and accumulation of spending arrears hence the recalibration of the policy framework with further balances between growth and fiscal sustainability. As a result the recession was prolonged has not deepened and stood at 0.1% last year.

Secondly, the budget deficit is reducing annually from high levels of 8.1% GDP in 2015/2016 to the budgeted 4.1% in 2019/2020 before it moderates to a 2.8% in 2021/2022. The economic growth is rebounding to positive rise currently which is a necessary condition for debt stabilization and revenue generation.

Honourable Speaker, revenue is growing faster than expenditure. Revenue is growing at 3% whereas the expenditure is growing at about 11/2% a necessary condition for budget deficit reduction going forward. We aim to achieve a positive primary balance by the year 2021/2022 which is a necessary condition for not only stabilizing debt but also reducing the portion of debt to income. The declining budget deficit reaffirms this Government's commitment towards the implementation of the fiscal consolidation policy. The performance indicators of the budget has always provided in the Mid Year Budget Review.

Honourable Speaker, Public Enterprises and the Wage Bill reforms to the next topic, Honourable Speaker, comments and proposals were also made on the Public Enterprises and the Wage Bill reforms. These two are elephants in the room that are not new and we were and so were the comments and proposals made we have heard them before. Of material importance is whether we are making meaningful full rest in these reforms and I wish to highlight a few milestones achieved as follows.

The Public Enterprise Governance Amendment Bill which is now passed setting the Government's framework to address governance celebration inefficiencies in State Owned Enterprises. Secondly, from a national budget point of view some space to Public Enterprises especially those in the commercial and revenue generated space has been market reduced in order to win them off from budget over reliance. For the first time Government proposes to share portion of its asset based MTC and utilize the sales of these shares to funding the capital projects without having to take up equivalent public debt. A principle stance is also put forward to have a uniformed approach to remuneration increases across the public sector during the fiscal adjustment phase for which the Ministry of Public Enterprises will issue a directive.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, reforms on the Civil Service Wage Bill has been instituted and produced results as far as containing net growth or size of the civil service without compromising service delivery in key sectors such as Education and Health. In my response to questions raised during the discussion for the 2018/2019 budget I indicated already that the Right Honourable Prime Minister had issued policy measures procedures to be implemented by Government to control personnel and other expenditures in the Public Service of Namibia. These measures and procedures are not only aimed at addressing the Wage Bill but also to announce efficiency in the management and use of public resources. They have by now implemented and they are yielding results. The specific measures being implemented include amongst others:

- Freezing and recreation of new positions in the Government.
- The punishment of old positions that you maintained for more than six months,
- The introduction of compensatory reduction for vacant positions and approval by the Secretary of Cabinet thereof,
- The filling of vacant positions.

The policy intentions are to reduce the Wage Bill as a portion of the GDP from the current 15.5% to about 12.5% over the medium to long term. Concerns on spending efficiencies and the quality of outcomes remain an important area of policy action in the sectors. Public expenditure reviews have been conducted in Education and the one in the Health sector is due for conclusion in the coming month. We have achieved that incorporation with the World Bank's technical assistance on and we will assess the cost consideration of and for a universal healthcare as proposed by Honourable Kavetuna.

Private sector development and support for SMEs Honourable Speaker, let me now respond to matters raised with regards to the private sector participation and SME Development. The flow of private sector

investment is necessary for due patterns of sustainable growth going forward. Three years ago Government has reduced the corporate tax, recoup income tax rates for non mining companies from the then 34% to the current 32%. I do concur that we need to implement the necessary tax administration measures to ensure that the tax system is equitable in terms of coverage and fairness as well as our ability to deal with due emerging financial issues.

One of the reasons investments which have benefited the domestic economy as a result of investment promotion efforts is the Peugeot Auto Car assembly plant in Walvis Bay. We have established a consultative platform to address the needs of the private sector and assessing measure to address concerns raised on policy administrative frameworks touching on the ease of doing business and business confidence. It is on this basis that some of the proposed tax policy amendments in fact have been reversed or put on hold.

With regards to the financing instrument to support SMEs we are now progressing with the implementation stage with the planning and mentoring workshop being front loaders. In the budget we have allocation provisions for the commencement of this programme as well as the ventured capital programme and the capacity based loan scheme.

Honourable Speaker, I am grateful for some of the conservation to better target budget interventions. Most of the proposals put forward lie in the areas already contained in the budget. For instance the scaled up interventions in the agriculture and water sector aim to improve domestic budget capacity, water security and an aimed opportunities for value addition and agro processing by the private sector. The developmental opportunities presented by the Public Procurement laws must be greatly enabled and implemented. To this effect I have issued exclusive bidding directives to designated provinces north of the country as regulations for the economy at large and they are being finalised.

**HON SPEAKER**: Can you please, we should not have our mobiles on while in the House please, thank you very much. You may continue Honourable Minister.

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Thank you Honourable Speaker, Public, Private Partnerships offers opportunities for again private sector participation in specific cases where national security considerations and fiscal risks loom large direct for the finances will be undertaken together with quality assurance arrangements to ensure value for money. This may be the case with the envisaged revamping of the Hosea Kutako International Airport.

*Honourable Nauyoma*, as regards the medical aid scheme contributions I wish to point out that the contributions by Members have remained unchanged at N\$60 during the period from independence to 2012/2013. The first change of the scheme was introduced of the two options namely a standard option at N\$120 for a month and a high option at N\$240 per month but that was now during 2013 that is for many members. It is important to note that this scheme is a voluntary scheme and is extremely generous when the benefits are compared to the actual costs of the scheme leading it to be significantly subsidized health care scheme for the Public Service.

It is also important to note that the Wage Bill has been more than doubled N\$13,925,000,000 during 2012/2013 from to the current N\$29,130,000,000. It is important to note that his increase has been risen by the regarding exercise implemented during the 2014 year and subsequent to that, salary increases granted to Public Service employees. At no point during these periods was there a contribution increase by the employees to the medical aid or either employers contributions had increased to read the actual cost of this. So to be commensurate with salary increases we believe it is fair to bring about the same equality in contribution between employer and employee. This is a non increase is not withstanding the annual increases of medical costs which have been

weighing about inflation leaving the scheme unchanged will lead the scheme to becoming unsustainable. If we do not address the sustainability issues of the scheme we run the risk to lose it and I think as I said it is fair that both the employer and employee contribute in a commensurate way. The target is that we go back to the agreed portion of 80% funded by the employer 20% is funded by the employee we have not reached that level as yet. Employees contribute less than 20% as I speak.

Finally, on the proposal by Honourable Venaani, it is a pity he is not here for the establishment of a delivery unit I have the following answer. First it is not a new idea, it has been done before and it was done actually by the Blair Government in the United Kingdom and it was done to resolve the problem of the way we account for national income with a devise in favour of the private over the public provisions of service. In 2001 Prime Minister Blair established a high level delivery units so even the name is a name that existed before and mandated the unit to take the lead and directly measuring Public Service efficiency.

The plan was that this would be done through setting targets for all activities across the Public Service. Public Service would be benchmarked and Civil Servants held accountable for the delivery or non delivery of the targets of the services. The initiative recognized that Government could not measure the Public Service provisions well and that simply pumping more money into health and education for example could be a waste of money with no measurable outcomes. Therefore the unit developed a wide range of measurable outcomes for example for how long you have to wait for a replacement, percentage of pupils passing exams, percentage of training arriving on time and so what.

The findings are that with delivery units was unfortunately not the silver bullet that was to solve the problems of effective and timely delivery of quality Public Service. However, as with those statistics based models they can be manipulated and so was this manipulated to suit the desired outcome, this yearning of measureable outcomes that for example hospitals treating minor hold past ratifications faster than more serious procedures thereby inflating the number of procedures and meeting the

#### targets.

Honourable Speaker, in conclusion these have been the main aspects arising from the second reading of the Bill. Before I conclude let me take this opportunity to thank the business community for hosting and defending the various post budget events held during the past weeks. The discussions were frank and fruitful. The conclusions were equally encouraging. From these discussions we took home that consultations and deeper debates about the issues facing our economy are the best approaches to meet these challenges.

We are comforted by the general support for budget and its underlined policies had received, we are convinced that with this budget we have found right balance to sustain macroeconomic and fiscal stability and sustainability. We have turned the economy back into positive growth albeit slow growth. We have policy measures in the pipeline to improve quality spending and quality growth and lastly, we are now Comrade Speaker in a better place than we were last year. We have secured our fiscal sovereignty.

Comrade Speaker, as I said my Cabinet Colleagues will clarify in more details sectoral functional issues during the Committee Stage and with these remarks I appeal to the House for the support for the 2019/2020 Appropriation Bill and the 2019/2020, 2021/2022 Medium Term Expenditure Framework. I thank you.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you. I now put the question that the Bill be read a second time. Any objection?

HON SHIXWAMENI: I have got a Motion.

# 16 April 2019SECOND READING - APPROPRIATION BILL<br/>HON SHIXWAMENI

**HON SPEAKER**: Can I go through the Motion or you want to put the question, yes?

**HON SHIXWAMENI**: Thank you Honourable Speaker, I just want for clarity sake. I know that this matter has happened over a couple of years.

This I guess is a Bill that is under discussion and I agree must pass as a House. It indicates N\$60,145,513,000. The statement by the Minister and what has been reported in the newspapers say we are passing a Bill of N\$66,000,000,000 something so I just want the Minister for the clarity of the public to actually follow and know what really is being passed is it this paper or is it a statement by the Honourable Minister?

The other thing that I just wanted to ask is this advisory that come from the IMF and the World Bank how serious do we take them and how do we follow them?

The last one which the Minister chose to actually ignore is that I asked a question of what political and ideological philosophy informs our budgeting processes. I mean what are we after? What are the issues that we need to solve? Thank you.

**HON SPEAKER**: I think for me the issue is the figure. You are disputing the figure and you want, or you want the Minister to confirm? Which is which?

HON SHIXWAMENI: (Not on microphone).

## <u>16 April 2019</u> SECO

### SECOND READING – APPROPRIATION BILL HON SCHLETTWEIN

**HON SPEAKER**: But I think the other questions you added to that, I will leave it to the discretion of the Minister whether he would like to respond. Honourable Minister?

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you Honourable Speaker. Well let me react to the first question which was posed last year also so that is again not a new question and the answer is the same. When we tabled the budget we have an Appropriation Bill that covers all the operational capital expenditure but the total budget includes what is deemed to be appropriate and that is the depth and the crux of it and the difference between the amount of N\$60,000,000,000 and N\$66,000,000,000 is the difference or it adds on the deemed appropriated provisions for that service. In the said Finance Clause called Statutory Provision is an amount that is calculated but it is not put in the Appropriation Bill because it is a provision that is deemed to be appropriated and it can be changed because of currency fluctuations and other issues. So that is the explanation.

The second one, do we take the advice of the Bank of Namibia, the IMF, the African Development Bank seriously? Of course we do otherwise we would not seek that advice. We are a member of these organizations. We are shareholders of both the African Development Bank and the IMF, we own the Bank of Namibia and let me say here that the Bank of Namibia establishment and mandate is one of a check and balance so that the State or Treasury alone is not having a free hand of how the economy is run and therefore, we take the advice of the Bank of Namibia very seriously. We have a number of Joint Committees where we work out the macroeconomic landscape in which we formulate budgets the fiscal stance, the bank is our partner in debt management. So it goes actually without saying that the advice from the bank must be statutorily followed and we do that.

Secondly, the IMF and the African Development Bank are institutions that have made a part of their mandates to make judgments of how global,

regional economies are performing what the issues are that influence and impact them and how they can be remedied and of course every year we have with the African Development Bank consultations on our strategic economic plan and with the IMF we have the so called Article 4 consultations which made a assessment of our economy and then makes recommendations of how we proceed. I cannot recall Article 4 consultation report which makes any mention that we are diverting from their recommendations actually all of them are recognizing that we are following their recommendations and maybe you can look through them.

The same with the African Development Bank if we would not follow their recommendations that would defacto excluded us from accessing funding through the African Development Bank. So we take their advice serious and I think it is good to know for everybody that that is the case. We are, in addition have Rating Agencies that take a bird eye view in our economy and inform us where the issues are where we are falling into difficulties and how we should remedy that. so we are trying very hard to not ignore the world outside there and the advice that is coming to us.

Now on the philosophy and I think we were several times on record in this House and somewhere else that our philosophy is that of a developmental state where and the private sector is recognized as the engine of growth but where the private sector that does not deliver that the State needs to intervene to take over the tools of the interventions that would then deliver on the targets that we as Government have set. So we have in the constitution a mixed economy model which does not mean anything else but you can and you should develop a developmental state with interventions past. We have done that through *(intervention)*.

HON SHIXWAMENI: (Not on microphone).

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: We have done that through an arm's

### 16 April 2019 SECOND READING – APPROPRIATION BILL

length approach and we need to recognize that that scenario is still the basics balances that we can find between a command economy type of economy and then completely free market. A completely free market economy is profits of steroids and it is for sure increasing in equality, it will increase poverty and it will widen the gap. That is in a very skewed economy not sustainable, so we have to follow the mixed economy model through an inter and developmental State model where the State must fill the gaps where the private sector cannot perform or does not want to perform. So I hope I answered your question.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. I am sure the question has been responded to adequately. I now put the question that the Bill be read a second time, any objection? Then it is agreed to. The Secretary will read the Bill the Second Time.

## SECOND READING – APPROPRIATION BILL [B.3 – 2019]

**SECRETARY:** Appropriation Bill [B. 3 – 2019].

**HON SPEAKER**: Good. The Secretary will read the Second Order of the Day.

RESUMPTION OF DEBATE ON THE PRECARIOUS SITUATION PREVAILING AT THE PUBLIC SERVICE MEDICAL AID SCHEME

466

<u>16 April 2019</u>

## PRECARIOUS SITUATION PREVAILING AT THE PUBLIC SERVICE MEDICAL AID SCHEME HON HINDA-MBUENDE

**SECRETARY:** Resumption of Debate on the precarious situation prevailing at the Public Service Medical Aid Scheme

**HON SPEAKER**: When this Assembly adjourned on Tuesday the  $2^{nd}$  of April 2019 the question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Venaani that the Motion be adopted.

The Honourable Deputy Minister of Home Affairs and Immigration adjourned the debate and I now give her the floor.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION**: Honourable Speaker, I want to call on the indulgence of the House to postpone this debate to the 5<sup>th</sup> of June.

**HON SPEAKER**: The  $5^{th}$  of June? There are no Members who would like to contribute in the meantime? None at all? is it so agreed? Thank you.

The Secretary will read the Third Order of the Day.

RESUMPTION OF DEBATE ON THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM AND MEASURES THAT CAN BE PUT IN PLACE TO AVOID LOSS OF LIVES

#### <u>16 April 2019</u>

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON EKANDJO

**HON SPEAKER**: When the Assembly adjourned on Wednesday the 10<sup>th</sup> of April 2019 the question before the Assembly was a Motion by the Honourable Iivula-Ithana that the Motion be adopted. The Honourable Jerry Ekandjo adjourned the debate and I now give him the floor.

**HON EKANDJO**: Comrade Speaker, thank you very much. The other day Comrade Speaker, before the Motion when I was speaking about car accidents a few days later I lost some relatives there. Now yesterday again I was driving this Otjomuise Road and I was driving myself and got involved in a car accident just across this Otjomuise Power Station there. So maybe I do not know whether it is a bad omen or whatever whenever I speak about something has to happen but nobody was injured yesterday. I bumped into a small car and I was having a big car and unfortunately the lady was pregnant but then she was taken to hospital but up to now everything is okay. She is okay she was just shocked. Yes she was just shocked.

Now Comrade this, I rise to speak and to support this Motion of Comrade Pendukeni because this carnage on our rods is increasing. We are now facing the long weekend *(interruptions)*.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Thank you very much I wanted to just ask my big brother a question because we are facing a long weekend and by his own admission when you talk you may spell some bad luck, is it not appropriate to have this discussion after the long weekend (*laughter*)?

HON EKANDJO: Now Comrade Speaker, we are facing the long

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON EKANDJO

weekend and now the question is who is next (laughter)? After the long weekend, we have got Workers' Day and Cassinga, after Cassinga Day will all of us be here or some of us will be absent is the question? I hope all of us will be here. Comrade Speaker, this road carnage is increasing. I think early 2015 Comrade Errk Nghimtina unfortunately he just left, when he was a Minister of Works and Transport he kicked off this dual highway carriage to Okahandja, this highway to Okahandja it was in 2015 and it was stated that time that the destination is Outavi this road.

But from 2015 very soon we will be in 2020 for five years we are still just here around not even at Okapuka and the purpose of that road was to ensure the road safety and the road congestion Windhoek/Okahandja, Windhoek/Airport, Windhoek/Rehoboth this is the congestion and there were also ideas that we should have a commuter train. This has been long for the past ten to fifteen years commuter train between Windhoek/Okahandja so that the people who work at least we can relief the pressure on the roads. Commuter trains from Windhoek to Airport, Windhoek to Rehoboth and also a commuter train around Windhoek up to Khomasdaal, Katutura etcetera that is the only way we can read. Comrade Speaker (intervention).

**<u>HON SHIXWAMENI</u>**: I just want to put a question to my uncle Honourable Jerry Ekandjo.

HON EKANDJO: Yes.

**HON SHIXWAMENI**: You are perfectly mentioning all these projects, what is the problem, where are we stuck? Why are the projects not getting

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON EKANDJO

finished? Can you explain what is happening with the project including the project what you call to the General's village?

**HON EKANDJO**: The project Comrade, the problem will only solved once coming the elections the APP is not in the Parliament and then we move faster after the next elections *(laughter)*. Once we sweep the whole House and then at the end we are just the majority Party here then everything will move smoothly.

Comrade Speaker, the issue of roads, the only solution, we can build highways, the only solution is to plan for the bullet train that is the only solution. Namibia is one of the few countries whose mode of transportation is only roads. The current train we have this train travel 80 kilometres per hour and if I am going to Oshakati or Walvis Bay I do not think I will go on this train because otherwise if I go today, next week, after two weekends then I will arrive in Oshakati. So I think the only plan really what we should do *(intervention)*.

HON SPEAKER: Is that a point of order?

**HON MUHARUKUA**: I think Honourable Jerry is having quite a number of ideas to alleviate the pressure of the roads system, just a question to weigh the option. Does not the Honourable Member think that it would be a more appropriate, more practicable way for Air Namibia to increase its flights to the various areas as opposed to that bullet train because if you look at our population that bullet train might travel with two people to Ondangwa and back, I am just wondering?

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON EKANDJO

**HON EKANDJO**: Yes the Honourable Member just read my mind. I have also here a point of Air Namibia because currently Air Namibia is almost on a daily basis between Windhoek and Ondangwa and then Katima/Rundu. I think also Air Namibia can also hip hop from Windhoek, Mariental, Keetmanshoop, Luderitz, Oranjemund, Walvis Bay and back, it must hip hop because between Windhoek and Ondangwa and Katima Mulilo/Windhoek, Rundu there is a regular flight and only the one that goes from Windhoek, Oranjemund, Walvis Bay and then between Mariental and Keetmanshoop is the road congestion, so I think we must also hip hop between Windhoek, Mariental, Keetmanshoop, Luderitz, Oranjemund, Luderitz, Walvis Bay and back I think by doing that we can also maybe *(interruptions)*.

HON MEMBER: Wait for the floor.

**HON EKANDJO**: But Comrade Speaker, the only solution for the current Namibia because in a month per region close to ten cars are bought in each region per month so if a week, a day how many cars are purchased in Namibia? It means the volume of cars increased but the roads just remained the same. That is why this congestion. At the end of the day within five years all the roads will be congested. Weekends if you go from here to Walvis Bay you cannot even drive. If you go from here to Gobabis because one day I was also having a donkey cart and a donkey cart was faster than cars to Gobabis because the road was congested *(laughter).* Yes otherwise we have to resort to old mode of transport which is dockets and horses.

So the only solution Comrade Speaker if at least every year we put aside N\$10,000,000,000 just for this railway construction for bullet train. Why bullet train? Bullet train is faster it goes up to 200 kilometres to 300

## <u>16 April 2019</u>

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON MUTORWA

kilometres per hour and we must construct because currently Kenya from Nairobi to Mombasa they have got a bullet train. From Kenya I think to, is it Uganda? Rwanda, one of the countries they also have got a bullet train. Bullet train is a solution to Namibia otherwise we rely on these road transportation we cannot dual roads but still the road accidents will not diminish because if you see now currently every Friday we have got memorial service and 80% of the memorial service the victims there are road accidents.

Only few people old people die and whatever. It is young people the productive people who die because of these roads carnage. So I think I support the move that the only solution for Namibia's road carnage is bullet trains, let us just put it that way. If every year we put N\$10,000,000,000 apart and then why bullet train, the other day I also said that bullet train must not be on the ground we must put poles because bullet trains are faster.

If we introduce bullet train now with the current rail on the ground it will cause accidents. Let us just save every year N\$10,000,000,000 within twenty years we will have bullet trains here and then we have less road accidents. So for this Comrade I support the idea wholeheartedly and I hope that once this Motion goes to a relevant Cabinet Committee they will come up with an idea of a bullet train as a solution, thank you Comrade Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Honourable John Mutorwa.

**HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT**: Thank you Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members of the National Assembly for giving me the floor to make a humble contribution to this very important

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON MUTORWA

Motion for the subject matter that we are discussing. I just want us to take note of what the objective of the Motion is motivated by the Honourable Pendukeni Iivula-Ithana. We are requested to discuss this Motion in order to come up with some measures that we may put in place or add to what we have already in place so that we prevent losses of lives and injuries as a consequence of roads accidents that is number one.

Then the mover is proposing that after we have completed the debate that the relevant Motion should be referred to a relevant Standing Committee of this Honourable House and that Committee will be expected to report back to us here with recommendations findings and as the line Minister responsible for transport I think these are quite reasonable requests. We should not as far as I am concerned when you look at the road accidents and the many factors that contribute to road accidents it is a subject matter that we cannot discuss enough and moreso when one looks at the situation that according to studies by experts the human factor, the human behaviour, the human attitude, a large percentage of accidents are as a result of human behaviours, human attitudes and also personalities.

Now the issue of human behaviour and human attitude and personality are not easy to control, they are not easy even to predict and hence I am one of those to believe that the study of human being social sciences it looks easy but I think it is more complex than the natural sciences because with human behaviour you cannot predict sciences you put this object you mix it with that one the result will always be predictable. So I am making this statement just to rest assure the mover that the more we debate the more recommendations we make probably the better.

I mean it is like I want us to go back to whether it is on Sunday whether it is on Saturday that the issue of religion, the issue of faith, the issue of praying now that book called the Bible for example, can be a Koran also if one asks you how many times a particular Chapter of that book has been read and preached about by the Priest, or the Reverend or the Pastor, it is many times. It is the same thing you go there and you are reminded please

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON MUTORWA

behave so that the Kingdom can belong to you and so forth and so on, that is the nature of human beings.

It is the same here but I like very much the objective that after we have debated this particular Motion because the issue of how the laws are applied, how the licences are issued, the vehicles are tested, those ones definitely we have to check whether those that are entrusted with the responsibility of issuing licences for example those that are entrusted to make sure that the vehicle once it runs on the public roads it is road worthy. Those were projected as the National Assembly, as Parliament it is part of our oversight responsibility to see and assist the Executive in carrying out these responsibilities.

That is why I do support after we have enriched this debate through our contributions here that it should be referred to the Standing Committee but the referral to the Standing Committee is also not just be for the sake of referral. The referral to the Standing Committee as it is proposed by the mover is for that Committee to and I am quoting now, to have consultations to check whether we are doing the right thing, whether the drivers that are driving our cars are all licensed properly and as the General Namoloh said the other day whether those schools that provide training, the driving schools whether they are doing the right thing, those we have to check.

Obviously we as the Executive we do our best but this thing is so wide, it is so broad the issue of somebody talked about maybe corruption. Corruption can be there. You know that somebody maybe who has not properly gone through the training is the one who is first in the road to get a licence. We have to check. We have to check all and that is what I want Comrade Speaker the Standing Committee to go and check not just to transfer the general debate that we are having here to the Standing Committee but to go and check physically, inspect even where it is necessary.

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON MUTORWA

Now some of the stakeholders that I would like to propose to be consulted obviously the Ministry but not the whole Ministry we have a Department of Transport who are responsible to ensure that the traffic laws at both the national level, at the municipal level are properly adhered to. The question is, are they doing the right things and doing their work properly both at the national level in the regions and at the Municipality we have to check there. I can tell you I have not been so long in this Ministry one year only so far but it is a very technical Ministry many things can go wrong. I mean for example if you issue a Driver's Licence to somebody who is not capable of driving, the other day and remember when we launched the Road Safety General Namoloh was saying it is like giving that person a gun.

Yes so Comrade Speaker, without taking too much time really as far as I am concerned as the line Minister consult the relevant stakeholders in the Ministry. Outside you have the operators for buses and taxis they need to be consulted. Maybe they have got their billing with the practical reality on a daily basis they may provide information to say this is what we are experiencing, buses and taxis.

Listen to them and then make recommendation. Transportation Commission, we have a Transportation Commission here in this country where the Transportation Board the new members were inaugurated on Friday. The Namibian Police, the Traffic Division we are working with them. Municipality as I said, National Roads Safety Council, I told Mr Tendekule to come he is sitting in front of me up there. They are for the awareness and education which we must continuously do.

So to cut the long story short it is good that we debate it is like what we read the Bible we should not get tired. We should not get tired. Every time you are reminded it is the same here. But also not only reminded, one thing that some people who spoke before me said and I agree with them, once you are the driver, recklessly as you are under the influence even, you drive cause an accident that tomorrow same driver accident,

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON MUTORWA

definitely that licence should be revoked and it is not happening in that particular sector alone. I mean if you are a medical doctor even a teacher you have your certificate to teach or to treat people but then you misbehave what happens? The regulatory body definitely will call you to order and if it is justified they will tell you that yes you were trained as a teacher, you were trained as a doctor, you were trained as a lawyer but you are now going the wrong way and therefore your licence is revoked until maybe you are rehabilitated, you are retrained that we must also enforce. I know it has been enforced but I think it is not strong enough. It is not strong enough therefore in conclusion really I do support that we debate this issue and we should not get tired of debating it and refer to that Committee.

Now the Committee Comrade Speaker, Committees also have got their terms of reference in this book and there are so many Committees but I take the Ministry of Works and Transport is under the Committee of Economics on page 52 the Standing Committee on Economics and Public Administration this is where the Ministry of Works is mentioned. Probably this will be the obvious Committee that should deal with this issue and I do not want us to get that report next you with your Comrade Speaker, probably the next station of this particular session that we get the report with their findings with their recommendations and I can undertake that. It is the duty of the Executive if that report comes and it makes recommendations or it advises us on issues that probably so far we are not doing very well. They have to do it as an Executive in order to improve or in order to do things better, to do the licensing better, to do the issuing of permits better and also then to continue with our education to warn the drivers and so forth and so on but folding our hands and sitting back I think is not an option, so I support the Motion to go to the Committee.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. Next is the Honourable Dr Shangula.

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON DR SHANGULA

**HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES**: Thank you very much Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I rise to render my support to the Motion on the state of driving on our roads by the Honourable Pendukeni Iivula-Ithana. I also support that this Motion be referred to the Parliamentary Standing Committee for further investigations and broader consultations. It is my belief that the source for resolution to this problem requires broader public engagement.

Honourable Speaker, in order for one to prescribe a solution one needs to establish the diagnosis and not treat the symptoms. More than often we tend to apply or to seek a solution to a symptom without addressing the underlying causes. This is bound to fail as the symptoms will always reoccur time and again.

According to the Road Accident Report in Namibia of 2013 the major causes of motor vehicle accidents are reckless and drunken driving, over speeding, driver fatigue, unsafe roads, slow moving vehicles and unsafe vehicle conditions those are the major ones. But the most disturbing feature on our roads Honourable Speaker is the attitude of drivers. Most of them have left the patience on the road and have little regard to the pedestrians. There have been incidences of road rage of which some have ended up in deaths.

The major contributing factor is that there is no standardized training of drivers. As we know individuals offer driving lessons conducted by private drivers who are charging fees per hour. This is already a limiting factor as when it is inclined to safe on costs by reducing the number of hours of train driving. Learners are taught how to drive a car mechanically, this is the break, this is the steering, etcetera but they hardly are taught how to conduct themselves on the road.

Law enforcement agencies have mostly focused on over speaking and drunken driving and pay little or no attention to the condition of the vehicles at all on slow moving vehicles. This is the root cause of the

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON DR SHANGULA

problem. I submit that the country needs to establish a training with a regulatory authority. You have never heard of a training which is not regulated but the training for drivers is not regulated. This regulatory authority should ensure that there are standards set for training of drivers. A driver to be trained must be trained according to the standards. There must be a curriculum for driving just like when you go to school you go through a curriculum that is a profession.

Driving is a profession. There must also be enforcement of a civic training by the trainers and also a civilized conduct on the road by all road users. I have observed on several occasions for example, if a pedestrian trying to cross the road and there is oncoming traffic the driver will even accelerate to harass this pedestrian and if has no reason whatsoever to be on the road. That is the attitude of the drivers. They have insistence condemnation of road drivers and the mourning of victims of road accidents will obviously not solve the problem. It is the mindset of drivers that needs to change. We need to instill a sense of safe regulations on the roads. This can only be achieved through service training which is part of the curriculum I mentioned before and which should be overseen by a regulatory authority on driving.

When this Motion was brought before this august House it certainly means that the nation is heard because of the carnage on the roads. It is therefore also time to take action which commensurate the level of that we are experiencing because of motor vehicle accidents. In the meantime law enforcement agencies should focus on the visibility of traffic officers on the road that is before we put this regulatory authority in place.

They must concentrate on excessive driving and excessive speeding, slow moving vehicles and vehicle road worthiness amongst others. I also believe that it may be time to review the speed limits of 120 kilometres per hour to commensurate the improved safety margins of modern vehicles. The current speed limits were set many years ago during the time of Bedford and Chevrolet. There must also be a minimum speed set

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON VENAANI

for vehicles on the highway because there are no such limits of speed the minimum on the highway. One can be on B1 road driving at 30 kilometres per hour, that should not be acceptable because the slow moving vehicles on highways contributes significantly to accidents.

Honourable Speaker, in conclusion I am mindful of the time and there are also other Members who would like to make a contribution. So in conclusion Honourable Speaker I would like to elevate at appropriate forum the measures which really contributes to the reduction of road accidents on our roads should be formalized and instituted. I thank you.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. I would like to share something with you. I sometimes observe and not call anybody to order but two things that are very important. As senior Members of this House most of you being here for much longer and I think we should observe our rules. Rule 116(a) if you check it out will remind you when an Honourable Member is speaking none of us should actually cross between the Chair and the person on the floor, that is very clear.

Secondly, I also notice, sometimes I do not say anything but maybe the time has come for me to remind Members, reading newspaper is not permissible. You prioritize the work of the House and not really consult in a very explicit way because then that draws my attention and the attention of everybody that you are not actually occupied with the work of the House but you are actually consulting newspaper. So please take note. Honourable Venaani.

**HON VENAANI**: Thank you very much Honourable speaker, Honourable Members, I rise to humbly contribute to this very important debate and I would like to urge Members and those most of the time have

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON VENAANI

a tendency of aborting Motions at this House for political expedience not to do the thing because this Motion was last year here. Honourable Muharukwa brought the very same Motion. It was aborted here under the guys that the Minister of Works will bring a debate urgently on road rules for expedience it was aborted but I want to thank the Honourable Ithana who brought this Motion again because the issue remains as relevant as it were a few months ago.

Now I also want to make a very brief remarks on this matter and let me from the onset start with the analogy and the story I have experienced one of the prominent Members of this House in the name of the late Chief Riruako always in my thoughts and always in my heart. He was a fun man. Fun in the sense that he never could drive a vehicle, those who have driven with him, Honourable Mbai, myself and many others who sometimes pledge your fear to him that when you drive with Chief Riruako he would tell you how to drive and he would instruct you how to do it but yet himself could not drive.

Now one day we were travelling to Aminos the two of us myself and him, I was taking him to his village that was at Okambeua I was ordered to take him to the village. He was not in a good mood day, no I was not in a good mood that day and he started from here in Klein Windhoek, "Ah the way you are driving is not proper" you know Chief until we reached the sand dunes of Aminos and we were going through farms. So as a young person I said okay I have had enough of the Chief it is only the two of us now I will show him.

So I got off the car and I said, "Chief drive the car". "Why, let us go". I said, "Drive you cannot be a person who does not know how to drive and you are ordering me, just drive". So he took his chance and he said no let me take it. So he jumped, that is the worst experience I have experienced from someone who has grown up in Old Location. The way he was pressuring the accelerator, the car was nearly on flames *u*-*r*-*r*-*r*, then I said you see you are a Chief I am your subject but your subject knows

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON VENAANI

better than you in this matter so jump on the other side and then he jumped. But the analogue that I want to come back to is that during the very difficult days of colonialism and apartheid in this country the drivers that we had and he told me a story and I asked him, "Chief how is it possible that a person of your generation that you do not know how to drive?" He said, "You know what, my father once beat me, beat me very badly while teaching me how to drive and I decided from today on I will never drive any car, that is why I do not drive but do not tell it to my subjects". So was the story. But I want to come back to one issue that is very difficult with today's drivers and yesterday's drivers and I am talking about the drivers that leant from the Bedford, the Chevrolet, Austen, the old cars.

The old drivers and moreso rural drivers today know how to better handle a vehicle as opposed to urban drivers. The urban drivers only know traffic rules they do not know how to manage the vehicle. A person who was growing with elders or who has been taught by elders how to drive will never shift a gear from the fourth gear to number one straight. I have experienced it with a driver one day who drove me in the hinder lands of Kavango. This guy was very excited he would drive me though he knows how to drive. So as we reached the dunes a person is changing a vehicle from the fourth gear to number one straight and I said who gave you a licence. Who gave, I passed I said no, no person can ever shift a vehicle from the fourth gear to the first gear.

HON MEMBER: Who was that?

**HON VENAANI**: The SWAPO Member *(interventions)*. Yes he is a PDA member no he is a young person, he has a licence now many of the accidents that we have in this country are not caused by car syndrome

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON VENAANI

behaviour towards rules of the roads but by the mere fact that our drivers do not know how to handle a vehicle. All the accidents, if you come to all the accidents scenery besides a head to head collision many of the accidents are caused by lack of experience of drivers to handle a vehicle. Do you know what happens and I do not want to point fingers to the other genders, *(interruptions)*.

Listen, listen, no you know how to drive a car high speed, automatic, comply to rules, when a vehicle tyre hits the sand whilst you are driving on a tarred road many people are causing accidents that is a reality. No let me talk about the problems. No I will. Some women drivers and the majority of them, some women drivers are making themselves guilty of not controlling vehicles. No the men and many of them that do not know how to drive are these boys that a person goes first to buy a car and then come and learn how to drive and that is the problems that we have in these rules. I tell you if you go to rural areas there are more cars without breaks. There are more cars in the rural areas without mirrors, without lights but if you look at the accident rates in rural villages and urban villages are not the same.

They have even worse roads than ours. It is obvious for a reason, people that are taught by people that were taught under colonialism how to drive are better drivers than our generation drivers, like it or not. Our generation drivers do not know how to drive. It is true this is why this country is having a problem with accidents. You are given a book to study traffic rules, you passed then you have a learner driving. Then the next thing the three things that you need to know about a car first and foremost you need to do reverse parking, any person who qualifies to have reverse parking will have a licence.

Any person who knows the rules will have a licence but yet that person even if you know reverse parking I have even told my own children that even if you know how to do reverse parking if you do not know how to change a car from speed number 120 and bring it down to 40 in a period

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON VENAANI

of 30 seconds you do not know how to drive. They say but dad I have a licence. I said your licence is just licensing you how to do reverse parking it is all you know.

Let me come to the other issue, tourist drivers just to elucidate my point. Put a tourist driver on our gravel roads, if you go on any gravel road behind a tourist there will be an accident or you will cause an accident, why? These people have never driven on a gravel and if you have not mastered a car on a gravel you are not a driver. You know how to move a car but you are not a driver because there are three types of roads in our country that one has to master to be able to qualify to be a driver.

The road from Kamanjab going to Anker going to Sesfontein not every driver who knows a gravel road can be able to drive on that road because the gravel on that road never stands still, the car forever moves on the road. So now if you put a driver who has driver who had driven in areas such as Otjinene and you put him on other roads one out of ten drivers will come back with an accident because you have never driven.

So I am trying to say that we have to really look at the rules of people passing the driver licence, what are we testing the people on? We cannot be able to continue testing people on reverse parking, indicator, indicating a car is not how to know how to drive. You need to control a vehicle. Control your speed. Control how you break when you hit something, how do you control a car? Most of the time these young drivers when they hit a turn they go three times. One the first time the car hits and then he comes back, the second time he wants to drive the third time he is out because we do not test our drivers to do curves.

The last thing with drivers is peer pressure and especially the opposite sex *(interruptions).* No especially in relation to the opposite sex when young men want to impress girls, you are not a man how could you say no? How could you

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON VENAANI

say no of things that we do? Yes all the road accidents are caused by trying to impress mum next to you especially for the young people and I am talking about let our young guys come from Oshivelo with his Golf 5 and Golf 6 coming towards Outavi, Otjiwarongo then you would see people with Golf all of them overtaking the same time coming in the same time, these are things that are happening here.

Now because we want to impress the ladies next to us most of the time we are driving 220 kilometres per hour on Namibian roads. Now can you imagine a Golf that is this the height of a Golf from the tarred road is this if that Golf just hits a warthog what happens to that Golf, it is fatal. So I am trying to say the following that in the olden days Honourable Mutorwa you will not say yes but your generation upwards, my grandfather, let me say my maternal grandfather has got fourteen driver's licences but he has never ever been in his life been in a truck.

So I was always asking, "Now grandfather how did you get this licence?" "I bought the licence from a goat. I had to pay a goat for the licence" but that person does not know how to drive in Windhoek. He has got fourteen licences he does not know how to drive in Windhoek but he will be able to tell you an engine when a car is ascending he will tell you that you have not shifted your gears correctly because what taught him was apartheid days you had to be slapped, your boss had to slap you twice in order for you to change the car correctly. Now these today's children even when you are teaching your own children how to drive the minute that you start screaming the mother will say do not scream on the child. So these people do not take these cars very seriously.

In the old days of !Naruseb time when they were taught how to drive it was war. For a person to concede to teach you how to drive you had to go under his tutorage and carry the blame and everything of how to drive. Our today's drivers go to the learners driving schools now what do you think what is the object of a person who runs a business to teach people how to drive? It is to make money. For as long as he is making ten

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON VENAANI

drivers a day he makes his N\$2,000 a day and that is good for him, now whether these drivers are going to cause accidents in the future that are not his business. He teaches you the bare minimum to move a vehicle. So I am saying fundamentally we must stop thinking by teaching people how to move vehicles we are teaching them how to drive vehicles. So the driving process must change too, the testing process must change. It should not be all about the reverse parking. Let us start testing our drivers on gravel roads. Can that person handle a vehicle on a gravel road that is very important?

Lastly, you copied it from me but nevertheless I agree with you of course it is a very key issue to me, it is the traffic fines. For as long as our Traffic Departments intent to make profit on fines we will never stop recasting drivers people that do not obey the rules because this is what happens. The Traffic Departments are driven to collect fines from people. They are not driven by correcting offenders to do the right thing on the roads. Now first and foremost what happens to the traffic fines especially between Usakos, no between Karibib and Swakopmund that stretch and we know a lot of people test their cars on that road that is why there are so many accidents.

When your car is hit by a fine you are driving at 180 kilometres per hour the traffic officer is there. Do you know what people do, I had a bottle of Conyers here my friend, I have your N\$4,000 in your pocket, let me pass, because the traffic fines are on the spot the traffic officers some of them take the money, put them in the pocket and the driver goes scot free. So we should rethink a system of a point licence like in Australia, New Zealand and this country.

In Australia for example when Venaani is continuously being charged on this offence you lose points on your licence to a point that your licence will be revoked if you have lost a lot of points on it that is a way to discipline the driver to want to retain their licences. Now in our country if you have N\$10,000 to pay traffic fines you will continue making fines

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON UUTONI

because you have the money but yet you will cause deaths on the lives of others. So I think it is a debate of whose time has come let us not abort it, let us think holistically and as we are now going into the past week and Easter weekend. We would know what the papers and in fact in anticipation we would know how the papers would write the next Tuesday on what will happen on our roads and really we need to do something. So I want this Parliament to be in unison in supporting this Motion to look for mechanisms and ways how we can ease the burden that is on our roads and the burden on the young lives that are lost on a daily basis on our roads because of our drivers that are not complying to simple rules of driving. Thank you very much.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Honourable Erastus Uutoni.

**HON MINISTER OF SPORT, YOUTH AND NATIONAL SERVICE**: Thank you very much Comrade Speaker. This topic under discussion is a very concern issue to all of us as a nation. It has been tabled here many times but it looks like the nation did not take it serious. As a result it is coming back repeatedly and it is good that it is always coming back and I want to agree with the first speakers when they mentioned about attitudes when it comes to driving our cars on the roads. Attitude is a concern, it is one of the contributing factors and patience. The attitude especially to us including myself men, this attitude of saying I know how to drive I have been driving for fifteen years and then when you look at a car in front of you and then you realize that it is being driven by a lady and say ah, this lady does not know how to drive. You speed and then you take over and then all of a sudden other car is coming in front and you hit. This attitude is really killing us.

The other thing many of us have observed when you drive on the many

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON UUTONI

roads and then you look alongside the road at the resting trees you find some people with cars or one car maybe three people in the car resting there under that tree, you find them putting beer or wine on top of their car driving enjoying and now you ask yourself these people who are driving here are they going to continue with the road or not? (*Intervention*).

4

HON MEMBER: (Not on microphone).

HON MINISTER OF SPORT, YOUTH AND NATIONAL SERVICE: Yes well so these people definitely are going to continue with the road under that influence of what they were driving. Again you look at many young people *(intervention)*.

HON SPEAKER: On a point of order, yes?

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Sorry you are doing very well but you talked about attitude. I read a statistic that was conducted in Germany when they wanted to take away, when they wanted to introduce speed limits and the statistics also questioned people about their belief of or whether they are skilled to drive a car and it came out that I think 97% of all drivers that were asked maintained that they are above average drivers, their skills are above average. So if that is relevant here I guess that is true the question is how would the Honourable believe that we can change that attitude that we believe we are all above average drivers?

•

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON UUTONI

HON SPEAKER: Thank you, Honourable Member continue.

**HON MINISTER OF SPORT, YOUTH AND NATIONAL** <u>SERVICE</u>: Yes I really do not have a good answer to you but it is a question of changing our mind. Yes maybe we can think how we can go about but it is a very good question. So I was saying you can also observe because I am also a driver. On the road there you look at some people especially middle aged people, the way they are driving even on the highway they are bending their chairs like resting but they are driving 140/150 kilometres per hour. This is also another contributing factor and I have also observed maybe this is what we call short sight, this is short sight ha when you cannot see far? Is it short sighted ha? I think it is also one of the contributing factors because some people cannot even see when they drive they see the back lights during the night. They see things like this yet they are driving and as a result they can cause accidents. It is like they see lights like this (*laughter*).

HON SPEAKER: Is that a point of order?

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Honourable Speaker, I want to confirm what he is saying and that is he must stop being on the road at night when you are driving because I did see something like that *(laughter)*, because he was there.

HON MINISTER OF SPORT, YOUTH AND NATIONAL <u>SERVICE</u>: Again perhaps just to add to those contributing factors the full

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON UUTONI

life of a car. As I was talking about attitude some people when they are on the highway they do not want to deem their lights, "it is just who I do not care he should do it first and the other one says do it first" then as a result they just put on the full lights and then there is something here in between and this is what creates problems to us as a nation. We have nice roads with small population but the death rate is very high. So this is so serious. Another thing apart from what I have said *(intervention)*.

HON SPEAKER: Is that a point of order?

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF ECONOMIC PLANNING**: Honourable Erastus it is just something to add on where you were talking about safety on our roads.

HON SPEAKER: Can you come a bit more closer to the microphone?

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF ECONOMIC PLANNING**: I just want to throw something in the basket while Honourable Minister Erastus is busy talking and it is something which we can implement very easily. One of the biggest problems on our roads is the heavy trucks. They piled up behind the other one and keep the traffic behind and then the people become irritated and and want to overtake *(intervention)*.

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON UUTONI

HON SPEAKER: I think, Honourable Member, Honourable Member (intervention).

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF ECONOMIC PLANNING**: I just want to give this information.

**HON SPEAKER**: No you can take the floor because that is, yah.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF ECONOMIC PLANNING**: I actually do not want to take the floor Honourable Speaker, I just want to throw it in for something to think about now, thank you.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you, Honourable Member can I ask for a minute. I just wanted to, we had communication, honourable Member can you just hold. We have communication going around and I just wanted to ask the Deputy Speaker and Chief Whip, there is pressure on our time and from what I gather, are you asking me to adjourn the House?

HON MEMBER: By 5 o'clock.

HON SPEAKER: By?

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON UUTONI

HON MEMBER: By 5. (No order)

**HON SPEAKER**: Please, we cannot be speaking at the same time. No, no I want clarity. I observed there is a particular time pressure that is why I wanted to seek the information that I am seeking but if we are now going to all jump in we are not helping the Chair either. So can we call for 17:15? What I was asking yes can we go for 17:15 because the time recorded is from 18:00?

HON MEMBER: No, to 5 o'clock.

HON SPEAKER: Okay, Minister please continue.

HON MINISTER OF SPORT, YOUTH AND NATIONAL SERVICE: Yes I am a bit out of focus now. But can I proceed Honourable Speaker?

**HON SPEAKER**: Yes there is a point of order behind you, Honourable livula-Ithana on a point of order?

**<u>HON IIVULA-ITHANA</u>**: Comrade Speaker, I am sorry Comrade Uutoni. I think let us also be considerate. Under normal circumstances when

#### <u>16 April 2019</u>

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON UUTONI

Parliament has to adjourn early for whatever reasons a Motion is tabled right at the beginning of the session then Members are put at that knowledge that because of a, b, c and d we are adjourning early or we even go over the adjournment time. I did not hear such a Motion and now I do not know whether it is being tabled or somebody is just interjecting while the session is going on, what is going on?

HON SPEAKER: No, let me explain?

**HON SPEAKER**: You are now forcing me to show my hand. We actually missed the opportunity to inform the House that as you know tomorrow 17 of April we are having the State of the Nation Address. So we have been requested to prepare the Chamber while this is a bit of before too late. That is the reason and I omitted sharing that piece of information that is the reason why. That is the reason why not because of anything else and for some reason we underestimated the fact that we are likely to run a bit longer than usual. So that is really the reason. (Noise).

Can you just wait for a little while?

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Now we are in a dilemma I know the Ruling Party had its caucuses here, the PDM was planning to have a caucus here tonight now what *(laughter)*.

**HON SPEAKER**: No there is nothing wrong in that, we will find each other. I think it is not a big deal honestly speaking. Let us continue with

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON UUTONI

the Honourable Minister to complete his intervention and I am extremely sorry about this, please continue.

#### HON MINISTER OF SPORT, YOUTH AND NATIONAL

**SERVICE**: Thank you very much Comrade Speaker, apart from what I have said there is something that I also want to get clarity from Minister of Works Honourable Mutorwa. Honourable Mutorwa there is something that I also want to get some clarity maybe from your Ministry. We know car accidents as we all know that it causes us a lot human rights, lots of injuries, lots of properties and many others but now there is something that is also another pain that comes after car accidents. That pain goes to the owner of the vehicle.

Now there are these what we call private towing cars, yes the cars that are towing when your car is involved in an accident. Now these towing cars come there in big numbers and now when they come there they pull your car or tow your car to their private garage. Now when they tow that car maybe your car is not insured and you perhaps maybe thereafter you have recovered from the accident you want to go and repair your car, now when you go to that private garage they will tell you no the kilometres where we tow your car is so and so and it will cost you so much and then the period the car has been parking at their garage is this much.

Now that amount they put it together it will go up to maybe N\$50,000 there around. Now you cannot afford any longer so it is now a burden to you the owner of the vehicle. So if you cannot afford then sell it. So what I want to find out from you as I said I want information, is this now a law that perhaps I am not aware of? We want to find out about that because it is also another burden and pain to the owners of the vehicle. With this I

## THE STATE OF DRIVING ON OUR ROADS AND THE CONSEQUENT CARNAGE AND INJURIES SUSTAINED THEREFROM HON DIENDA

support the Motion. Thank you.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. I notice that the list seems to be growing every minute even if we continue for another fifteen minutes we are not likely to exhaust the list. Maybe we should actually postpone rather defer the discussion and continue another day so we can do justice to all the people who have listed to speak on this important Motion. Is it agreeable to that so that we do not rush, ha? Yes indeed I was going to call on you, can you be so kind?

**HON DIENDA**: Thank you Honourable Speaker, I would love to postpone it until the  $6^{th}$  of June.

HON SPEAKER: June? 6 of May.

HON MEMBER: (Not on microphone).

HON DIENDA: Look here you came late. You came late.

#### <u>16 April 2019</u>

#### ADJOURNMENT HON PROF KATJAVIVI

**HON SPEAKER**: So is it agreeable that we postpone until the  $6^{th}$  of June? Thank you very much so decided. With that we have come to the end of our today session. The House adjourns until tomorrow the usual time and of course tomorrow being the State of the Nation we are all going to be here on time. Thank you we are all going to be here on time, thank you very much.

## HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 16:56 UNTIL 2019.04.17 AT 14:30