

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS
WINDHOEK
23 APRIL 2018**

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON SPEAKER took the Chair and read the Prayer and Affirmation.

**ANNOUNCEMENT IN TERMS OF RULE
(98) OF THE STANDING RULES AND ORDERS**

HON SPEAKER: welcome back. We just have a number of Parliamentarians in the House, just enough to get on with the job of law making. Honourable Tweya is just walking in, Honourable Kaapala is just walking in so we are growing upwards in terms of numbers. So let us keep it that way because we have to get on to the business of finalising the Budget.

Honourable Members, sticky little problems are emerging around the premises right here that will compromise the security of Parliament as a whole. I came to work this morning driving as usual through the gate out there, and what I am going to say I want to signal to everybody. There is no way we will allow the security of Parliament building to be compromised. That is number one.

Number two, we need to up the arrangements that are in place that are supposed to protect this place so that we monitor the movements in and around surrounding the building, absolutely. Now it has come to my attention that in some areas there CCTV tools are not operational. I am appealing to those who are responsible to get them up again to make sure that we maintain 100% protection of the building, and lastly and more importantly,

Members of Parliament are not permitted to request the Secretary or people, functionaries to occupy their parking places in their absence.

23 April 2018

**ANNOUNCEMENTS
HON NAUYOMA**

There has never been a rule of that kind and there will be no rule of that kind. If you are away you are away, you do not ask someone who is associated with you or with your office, to come and occupy your parking place. I came across that this morning, and the lady was actually defiant. My security people said, "Who is this person? Why are you entering the premises that are actually reserved for Parliamentarians? Whether you are a Member of the National Assembly or the National Council no one is allowed to authorise an additional person who happens to be attached to your office or your department to come and park there.

The courtyard is already crowded. It compromises the security in terms of fire, security whatever, we are going to be absolutely facing a challenge, so we are already overcrowded in the courtyard, and how much more do we have to permit additional people to come and park there?

I am basically asking for your full support and cooperation to adhere to existing rules. It is not too much to ask. Now back, (*Interjection*) yes Honourable Madala Nauyoma?

HON NAUYOMA: Honourable Speaker, whilst you are there at the parking issue. We are also experiencing a problem with our colleagues from Cabinet who are being dropped off because they do not have parking here. Now what happens when they are dropped off, their drivers occupy our spaces? When you come you do not have a place to park. I think maybe the arrangements are supposed to be dropped off and they drive off, I do not know what the arrangement is, but when they take our parking when they come, sometimes you do not find anybody in the car, you can even block them and just park there and block the car in because you do not have anywhere to go anymore, what could that be?

HON SPEAKER: No that is illegal. It should never happen. It should never happen we cannot legitimise that. So our security should also do

23 April 2018

**ANNOUNCEMENTS
HON SANKWASA**

something. So you are not permitted to park there, this is the parking spot for Honourable XY so it should be like that. They should also be observant, they are here constantly and should know who is expected to park where, it is as simple as that. So we will look into that. The colleagues are also hearing you. I did not want to generalise. I do not want to accuse people who are innocent. The drivers of some of the Honourable Ministers and Deputy Minister are innocent as it is, unless if it is actually proven you cannot accuse each and everybody. Okay (*Interjection*) yes, we leave it at that. Yes?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT:

Honourable Speaker, Members of the Executive are also Members of Parliament and we do not have parking space here. When is it going to be provided because we cannot be excluded if the parking is for Members of Parliament and we are equally Members of Parliament?

Thank you.

HON SPEAKER: No, I think there is no Debate there. We are only saying the Honourable Nauyoma who raised the question has got a parking place, so someone somehow interfered with that but in the normal circumstances the Honourable Minister, Deputy Minister have your drivers as far as I know. They are actually disciplined people who park their cars in the places where they are expected to park while they are waiting to come and collect you. So we leave it at that. There is a convention that exists. They are not being accused and I do not want to generalise.

Thank you very much.

We say there is that old African proverb that say, "*In order for you to look ahead with confidence, sometimes you look back for inspiration, for*

23 April 2018

**ANNOUNCEMENTS
HON PROF KATJAVIVI**

guidance to understand the path you have traversed in a couple of years to enable you to see better and comprehend the way forward”.

So in that particular spirit I wish to announce basically it is a reminder that, UNESCO in collaboration with the Ministry of Arts and Culture are having a very important workshop tomorrow, that will be held here in our premises from 09:00, so that important event we will be looking at the history of SADC Region.

Looking at the documentation, information relating to the liberation struggle that has taken place in the Region and the idea essentially is to analyse those documentations with a view to make use of the information, and contribute towards the teaching of the history relating to our recent history of the liberation struggle.

In other words utilising the shared history relating immediately to the Liberation struggle, and identify elements in that that could not be identified to teach that aspect of history, and looking into how this will be utilised with the view to contribute towards regional integration.

We work together, we struggle together during the course of the liberation struggle. Now we want that aspect of history to form the basis of the contribution to regional integration in terms of the teaching of that aspect of our history that is not really anywhere to be found in textbooks, and UNESCO is coming along to partake in this particular exercise as part of the series of events that we want to help to assist, and I am very happy that they are doing so in collaboration with our Ministry of Education, Arts and Culture.

So Members of Parliament those who are able to spare the time you will be most welcome to partake in the opening of this event, attended by colleagues, researchers, academics from the whole of the SADC Region from Tanzania all the way to South Africa, Zimbabwe, Angola they will be here. Yours truly, will be partaking in that event to offer our contribution in terms of where we are and what we are doing. So it is an open invitation to come and share and help us to shape something that

23 April 2018

**TABLING OF REPORTS
HON KATOMA**

could be utilised in partnership with the rest of the SADC Region. You will be hearing a lot of stories about what transpired during those years and some of us will be sharing some of those stories tomorrow.

HON SPEAKER: So that said and done. Any Petitions? Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Yes Honourable Katoma.

TABLING OF REPORTS

**TABLING – REPORT OF PARLIAMENTARY
STANDING COMMITTEE ON FOREIGN AFFAIRS
DEFENCE AND SECURITY ON INSPECTION VISITS
OF CAPITAL PROJECTS FROM 16 TO 22 JULY 2017**

HON KATOMA: Honourable Speaker, I lay upon the Table for note taking, Report of the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Security, on the inspection visits of Capital Projects in Omusati Region, Oshana Region, Ohangwena Region and Oshikoto Region from 16 to 22nd July 2017.

I so Move Honourable Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Other Reports and Papers? Notice of Questions? Notice of Motions? Yes Honourable Kavekatora.

23 April 2018

**NOTICE OF MOTIONS
HON KAVEKOTORA**

NOTICE OF MOTIONS

**TABLING OF MOTION – REPORTS OF THE
AUDITOR GENERAL TO THE NATIONAL COUNCIL**

HON KAVEKOTORA: Thank you Honourable Speaker. I Move that in terms of Rule 27 (i) read with Rule 119 of the Standing Rules and Orders-

This House concur that the Notice is dispensed with, to Table a Motion to refer the following Reports of the Auditor General for various years of the Local Authorities, Regional Councils and National Councils for review to the National Council. They are as follows:

- i. Municipality of Okahandja for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2015 and 2016;
- ii. Municipality of Omaruru for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2015/2016;
- iii. Municipality of Otjiwarongo for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2015/2016;
- iv. Municipality of Swakopmund for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2015;
- v. Municipality of Windhoek for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2016;
- vi. Municipality of Walvis Bay for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2016;

23 April 2018

**NOTICE OF MOTIONS
HON KAVEKOTORA**

- vii. Municipality of Keetmanshoop for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2016;
- viii. Municipality of Tsumeb for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2016;
- ix. Municipality of Henties Bay for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2016;
- x. Municipality of Mariental for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2016’
- xi. Regional Council of the Oshana Region for the Financial Year ended 31st of March 2016;
- xii. Regional Council of //Karas Region for the Financial Year ended 30th of March 2016;
- xiii. Regional Council of the Kunene Region for the Financial Years ended 30th of March 2014 and 2015;
- xiv. Regional Council for the Omaheke Region for the Financial Year ended 30th of March 2016;
- xv. Regional Council of the Kavango East Region for the Financial Year ended 31st of March 2015;
- xvi. Regional Council of the Erongo Region for the Financial Years ended 31st of March 2015 and 2016;
- xvii. Regional Council of the Omusati Region for the Financial Years ended 31st of March 2015, 2016 and 2017;
- xviii. Regional Council of the Otjozondjupa Region for the Financial Years ended 31st of March 2014/2015;

23 April 2018

**NOTICE OF MOTIONS
HON KAVEKOTORA**

- xix. Town Council of //Karas for the Financial Years ended 30th of June 2011 and 2012;
- xx. Town Council of Rehoboth for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2014 and 2015;
- xxi. Town Council of Karibib for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2014, 2015 and 2016;
- xxii. The Town Council of Aranos for the Financial Years ended 30th of June 2015 and 2016;
- xxiii. Town Council of Luderitz for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2015;
- xxiv. Town Council of Okakarara for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2015;
- xxv. Town Council of Oranjemund for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2016 and 2017;
- xxvi. Town Council of Ondangwa for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2016;
- xxvii. Town Council of Nkurenkuru for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2016;
- xxviii. Town Council of Helao Nafidi for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2016;
- xxix. Town Council of Ongwediva for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2016;
- xxx. Town Council of Otavi for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2016;

23 April 2018

**NOTICE OF MOTIONS
HON KAVEKOTORA**

- xxx. Town Council of Oshakati for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2016;
- xxxii. Village Council of Maltahohe for the Financial Years ended 30th of June 2013, 2014, 2015 and 2016. I hope the Minister of Housing is listening;
- xxxiii. Village Council of Tses for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2014 and 2015;
- xxxiv. Village Council of Gibeon for the Financial Years ended 30th of June 2014 and 2015;
- xxxv. Village Council of Koes for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2015;
- xxxvi. Village Council of Aroab for the Financial Years ended 30th of June 2015 and 2016;
- xxxvii. Village Council of Bethanie for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2015 and 2016;
- xxxviii. Village Council of Kamanjab for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2015 and 2016;
- xxxix. Village Council of Kalkrand for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2016;
- xl. Village Council of Berseba for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2016; and
- xli. Village Council of Leonardville for the Financial Year ended 30th of June 2016.

Honourable Speaker I so Move.

23 April 2018

**NOTICE OF MOTIONS
HON KAVEKOTORA**

I want to make a very slight comment. This is the pile of Reports that I have just highlighted. The bulk that is 70% if not 80% of these Reports have got a negative audit opinion. It is either a disclaimer, or an adverse opinion. It is because in this instance Honourable Speaker, I do not think that it is due to their own making. These Local Authorities and Regional Councils and Village Councils, ever since their establishments have never been fully capacitated to keep books of records, to do proper bookkeeping, and that is why year in and year out the auditors are just going there to do a routine job, but the outcome is always the same.

I think it is really up to us as lawmakers, and specifically the Executive and specifically the Ministry of Urban and Rural Development, to seriously look into the capacitating of these sub national governments, to capacitate them with proper manpower to be able to do and to account for the money that is being allocated to them. Otherwise we will be sitting here reading about adverse opinion every now and then, but the people do not have the capacity to do proper bookkeeping, they do not have the capacity to do a proper accounting and to keep proper accounting records, and I think it is something that we need to do. We need to do something about it if we want to change the situation otherwise it is going to be an adverse opinion and a disclaimer all the time. *(Intervention)*

HON SPEAKER: While you are there I am assuming that is a kind of a recommendation that your Committee could forward to the line Ministry. Capacity building absolutely is a must.

Thank you very much.

HON KAVEKOTORA: Thank you.

23 April 2018

**NOTICE OF MOTIONS
HON HAMBYUKA**

HON SPEAKER: It is quite heavy is it not? Yes Assistant Deputy Chief Whip.

MOTION ON BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

HON HAMBYUKA: Honourable Speaker, I Move without Notice that the proceedings on Votes, 13, 17, 18, 19,20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28 and 32 of the *Appropriation Bill* be in terms of Rule 99(c) of the Standing Rules and Orders not be interrupted if still under consideration at 17:45.

I so Move Honourable Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you, submit the Motion. Any messages from the Head of State? Ministerial Statements? So we are done. The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

**RESUMPTION OF COMMITTEE
STAGE - APPROPRIATION BILL [B.2 – 2018]**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Committee Stage – *Appropriation Bill* [B.2 – 2018]

HON SPEAKER: Does the Deputy Minister of Finance move that the Assembly now goes into Committee?

23 April 2018

**COMMITTEE STAGE - APPROPRIATION BILL
HON ITHETE**

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: I so Move Honourable Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: It is so moved that I leave the Chair. Any objection? Who seconds? Agreed to.

I now call on the Chairperson of the Whole House Committee to take the Chair.

ASSEMBLY IN COMMITTEE

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
The Whole House Committee is called to order, but before I proceed Honourable Members please be advised that we have a number of Votes which stood over due to a lack of voting quorum. I have been informed that we are just about 50 and we know the quorum is 49. I urge where possible, to maintain that otherwise if two people go it will be the same.

Thank you.

The Committee has to consider the *Appropriation Bill* [B.2 – 2018]. When progress was reported on Friday, the 20th 2018, Votes 23, 24, 26 had been introduced, while Votes 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22 and 25 stood over to be endorsed today as there was no voting quorum. So I will now start with the adaption of the following votes.

I put Vote 17, - “**URBAN AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT**”. Any objection? Agreed to.

23 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 13
HON DR HAUFIKU

I put Vote 18, - **“ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM”**. Any objection?
Then agreed to.

I put Vote 19, - **“INDUSTRIALISATION, TRADE AND SME DEVELOPMENT”**. Any objection? Agreed to.

I put Vote 20, **“AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY”**. Any objection? Agreed to.

I put Vote 21, **“JUDICIARY”**. Any objection? Agreed to.

I put Vote 22, **“FISHERIES AND MARINE RESOURCES”**. Any objection? Then agreed.

I put Vote 25, **“LAND REFORM”**. Any objection? Then agreed to.

Now, the introduction of the following Votes. We start with Vote 13, - **“HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES”** - **NS\$6,537,102,000** for the introduction by the Minister of Health and Social Services or Deputy Minister. Minister you have the Floor.

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES:
Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members, allow me first of all to thank the Minister of Finance Honourable Calle Schlettwein as well as Honourable Obeth Kandjoze Minister in the Presidency for Economic Planning, for a well-articulated Budget that focuses on the aspirations of shared prosperity making an impact where it matters. *(Intervention)*

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Sorry.

23 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 13
HON DR HAUFIKU

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: It is noteworthy that there is in the past the thrust of the Budget allocation for the Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEEF) focuses on priority areas such as Education and Health. The Government, thus far, continues to spend appropriately on social sectors, translating its commitment from the SWAPO Manifesto into concrete actions aimed at eliminating existing social deficits. Needless to say we will only reach the intended objectives of Vision 2030 and the Harambee Prosperity Plan when we have a nation which is educated, able bodied and in good health.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee,

For the Financial Year 2018/2019, the Ministry of Health and Social Services has been allocated an amount of **six billion, five hundred and thirty seven million, one hundred and two thousand Namibian dollars (NS6,537,102,000)** of which:

- **Six billion, thirty-seven million, one hundred and two thousand (NS 6,037,102,000 or 92.4%) of total allocation** is for operational expenditure; and
- Five hundred million (NS500,000,000) representing 7.6% of total allocation is for development expenditure.
- The Ministry's total allocation represents 11.29% of the overall government Budget. The Budget allocation will, amongst others, address the emerging challenges of communicable and non-communicable diseases, mother and child health, developmental social welfare, human resource development and management, supply of pharmaceutical and related medical products, infrastructure development and management as well as medical equipment. And more crucially, our move towards Universal Health Coverage as highlighted in Goal 3 of the Sustainable Development Goals.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 13**
HON DR HAUFIKU

During the FY 2017/18, the Ministry faced some major challenges some of which I wish to highlight as follows:

i. Staffing norms for public health facilities

The Ministry has been working on the restructuring of its staff establishment within the ambit of the policy of compensatory reduction as directed by the Office of the Prime Minister. Towards the end of 2017 and early 2018, the Ministry received 169 applications for employment of recently graduated registered nurses from local academic institutions, in addition to the 174 registered nurses trained under the Ministry's Project 2013 in response to the recommendations of the Presidential Commission. But the Ministry could not absorb these graduate nurses. Not that we do not need them or do not want to employ them, but simply because the Ministry did not have positions for these nurses then but subsequently created positions through compensatory reduction by converting managerial and administrative posts into professional posts. Now that we have the positions, we do not have funds to employ them. This is not particular to nurses but cuts across all the professional cadres.

If this august house, which is the law-making house, agrees that more funds be allocated to health, we shall, in the shortest possible period employ these graduate nurses, dentists, pharmacists and many others.

I personally believe that as long as the Ministry remained faced with critical shortage of staff, lack appropriate and basic medical equipment and physical infrastructures that are dilapidated or critically lacking, such as the Renal Dialysis units, for which Namibia is paying so much both in monetary and importantly, in human lives, this Ministry in particular and the government in general will always be making headline news and always for the wrong reasons.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 13**
HON DR HAUFIKU

- ii. **The sharp reduction in development partner** funding in particular the Global Fund to fight AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria (GFATM) to the health sector will have an additional negative impact on programmatic service delivery areas such as HIV/AIDS, TB and Malaria elimination by 2020.
- iii. **Shortage of medical equipment** for diagnosis, and monitoring the treatment and recovery of patients is another challenge faced by the Ministry. We are of the view that only partnership with private manufacturing or supplying companies on the principles of Public Private Partnership may lift us out of this perpetual deficiencies and lack of equipment in the Ministry. We are saying this while fully aware that PPP in itself is not necessarily a panacea to public health problems. But if well managed, it can go a long way in providing leverage for healthcare issues in Namibia is proven elsewhere.
- iv. The Central Medical Store (CMS) has been struggling to fulfil its mandate of ensuring that **adequate medicines** are available in all health facilities. A turn-around strategy is being implemented for the supply and distribution chain management as well as provision of a safer storage facility to replace the existing storage facility.
- v. There is a **lack of space at health facilities** taking into account new and additional services introduced for emerging needs, as well as a shortage of staff accommodation at all health facilities. In trying to improve accessibility to health care services, the Ministry continues to build new clinics as well as the renovation and upgrading of clinics, health centres, district hospitals and referral hospitals.

Although some resources were allocated for infrastructure development, many projects could not be completed on time due to the lack of financial and technical capacity of some contractors, poor management of projects by consultants which rendered projects difficult to determine or conclude as well as the slow

23 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 13
HON DR HAUFIKU

response from the Ministry of Works and Transport on issues such as the approval of variation orders; extension of time claims; requests for determination of projects and related technical issues. We hope these hurdles shall be soon things of the past as we continue to engage the Ministry of Work and Transport in this regard.

- vi. **Disease outbreaks:** Since 2015, many regions experienced a rise in Malaria cases and in early 2017, a malaria outbreak was declared by the Ministry, with Kavango East and West, Ohangwena and Zambezi regions being the most affected. The most affected regions are bordering neighboring Angola whose malaria transmission is very high compared to Namibia.

A total of 13 909 Malaria cases were reported this year for the past three months (January - March) with Kavango East and West regions contributing (77.3 %) out of the total cases reported so far; followed by Zambezi at 11.1% and Ohangwena at 7.6% . A total of 22 deaths were reported from January-March 2018, less than 37 deaths reported in the same period in 2017.

The **Hepatitis E** outbreak was another challenge we faced in the last five months. This occurred mainly in informal settlements in Windhoek for obvious reasons such as poor sanitation, poor hygiene and lack of running water. So far 1186 cases of Hepatitis E have been reported in Namibia with 12 lives lost at the time of getting the information.

Crimean Congo Hemorrhagic Fever is another deadly disease outbreak we faced over the last few months. So far two lives have been lost to this tick borne disease in Namibia: one from Gobabis in 2017 and recently one from Keetmanshoop. Infections due to **Listeria Monocytogenes** bacteria was also reported in Namibia and I am pleased to inform the house that, thanks to the great efforts by our health personnel, no life was lost due to Listeriosis

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 13**
HON DR HAUFIKU

The Anthrax and Cholera outbreaks further put a strain on our resources but loss of life was averted. Much of the successes in controlling these outbreaks and limiting its impacts are attributable to the effective and efficient coordination of stakeholders, through a multi-sectoral approach in tackling the outbreaks. Our appreciation therefore goes to all stakeholders who were involved, directly or through other means, such as the Office of Prime Minister; Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry; Ministry of Environment and Tourism; Ministry of Defense; City of Windhoek; local and regional authorities and our development partners (WHO, UNICEF, UNFPA and others) and some private sector entities.

On disease outbreaks, Honourable Members, only a stronger and resilient national disease surveillance system will solve or at least mitigate our future problems. This is why I call upon his august house to support our efforts to establish, without delay, the Namibia Institute of Public Health (NIPH). This will be the agent (not parastatal) to be tasked with the long outstanding implementation of the International Health Regulations in Namibia.

The Namibia Institute of Pathology (NIP) should be transformed and changed from its current status of being a parastatal to a Department providing laboratory services under the auspices of the Namibia Institute of Public Health. NIPH itself shall not be an SOE. It will be an agency tasked with Disease Surveillance; Outbreak Prevention and Preparedness; Medical Disaster Management; Research and Development and Training of public health experts including field epidemiologists. I believe the training of public health experts component of the NIPH could suitably be placed at the UNAM School of Public Health. The technical consultations that are currently ongoing will determine the modalities and scope

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 13**
HON DR HAUFIKU

Despite the challenges alluded to above, important milestones have been achieved during the 2017/18 FY. To mention but a few:

- i. Implementation of the Human Capital Management System continued and the situation of the Ministry's staffing has been monitored through monthly human resources data collection and analysis. The Ministry had 90% posts filled rate at the end of the third quarter. I want to clarify that this is not to say that we do not need more cadres, this 90% filling is in relation to the current operating structure of the Ministry.
- ii. One hundred and fifty-six (156) graduates from the Ministry' nursing Diploma project, and 51 Medical interns completed internship and are appointed as registered nurses and medical officers respectively while 106 medical interns have been appointed during January-February 2018. Three medical doctors completed their medical specialisation successfully and are serving in the Ministry in the specific area of specialisation.
- iii. The TB program incorporated the use of the newly recommended optimal paediatric fixed dose combination of first line anti-TB medication to replace the current sub-optimal formulation used in paediatrics. In the previous year 98% of TB patients were tested for HIV, 94% of TB/HIV, co-infected patients were on antiretroviral therapy (ART) and 99% were put on cotrimoxazole preventive therapy.
- iv. The coverage for PMTCT services stands at 96% and the rate of mother-to-child transmission has declined from 12% in 2010/11 FY to 4% in 2017/18 FY
- v. The percentage of persons living with HIV receiving ART increased from 70% in FY 2016/17 to 76% in FY 2017/18.
- vi. On infrastructure development, the Ministry achieved practical completions for Usakos Hospital Out-Patients Department (OPD);

23 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 13
HON DR HAUFIKU

Muyako and Ehafo Primary Health Care Staff accommodation, extension of Engela OPD and Maternity Shelters at Opuwo and Gobabis as well as renovation to the Oncology Department at Oshakati Hospital. Maternity Shelters at Opuwo, Engela and Gobabis are also completed while construction of the one in Katima Mulilo is about to start. Here we must thank the EU, WHO and Social Security Commission for their support.

- vii. Namibia currently has more than 1 500 nurse outreach posts in all regions; 284 clinics; 44 Health Centres; 31 District hospitals and only one Academic Referral Hospital in Windhoek. Financial resource allocations currently follows this skewed pathway in favour of secondary and tertiary care with 64% of all public health expenditures going for these levels of care . This is in contrast to Alma Ata declaration of 1978 and WHO declaration of 1948 as well as section 95 of the Namibian Constitution.

To rectify this anomaly, the Ministry has embarked upon the training and deployment of Community Health Workers (CHWs) who will be our first line of defense in healthcare. So far, 1640 CHWs have been trained and deployed. Another 649 graduated in 2017 and our intention is to deploy all of them in different regions but Budget constraints have not permitted the Ministry to effect this.

- viii. Medical outreach services have been provided to reduce the waiting times for specialized services as well as referrals to the national hospital. Outreach will therefore continue until district hospitals are capacitated in all aspects of service delivery. Allow me at this point Honourable Members to express my heartfelt appreciation to may dedicated health professionals, both in the private and public sector, who selflessly dedicated their time and resources to travel all over the country to bring much needed medical services to our people. They do so on a voluntary basis without any payment and for that we are very grateful. *(Applause)*

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 13**
HON DR HAUFIKU

- ix. To further strengthen access to quality healthcare services at district level, the Ministry has a draft MoU currently under negotiation with private Medical Practitioners and Institutions to help the Ministry with provisions of critical services at some of our district hospitals in areas such as Anaesthetics, Obstetrics and Gynecology, General and Orthopedic Surgery.

We will be endeavouring to undertake the following projects under Private Public Partnerships:

- Medical Equipment leasing to replace the old and obsolete medical equipment at an agreed or negotiated rate and time period.
- Establishment of Renal Dialysis Centres at Windhoek Central Hospital, Rundu State Hospital and Oshakati State Hospital;
- We also need to migrate from manual patient record keeping to the so called eHealth or electronic patient record system or eHealth Project,
- Level 2 Trauma Centre at Windhoek Central Hospital
- Paediatric ICU Unit and Bum Unit as well as a Snakebite ward for Windhoek Central Hospital.

The process of implementation of the PPP projects are under various stages of development and are being undertaken in consultation with the Ministry of Finance PPP Unit.

Although the PPP legislation is in place, the requirements do not provide for speedy procurement of the services so as for the health sector to provide cost effective services. For example, the Ministry is sourcing for dialysis service from private service providers and annually we spent an amount of N\$ 44,180,052.03 for FY 2017/18 on 278 patients. The ministry is therefore determined to turn this situation around so that we spend our limited resources in such a manner that we achieve the greatest impact. The initial cost for the renovation of available space at the

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 13**
HON DR HAUFIKU

Windhoek Central Hospital was estimated at N\$ 16,425,164 in FY 2014/15. This state of affairs cannot be allowed to continue.

- All these long-standing projects are crucial for the health and well-being of the broader masses of Namibians of all ages and in all regions. Renal Dialysis services and a Paediatric Intensive Care Unit are particularly crucial as Namibia continue to export funds to South Africa for services that Namibia can have on its soil at a lesser financial and human cost.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

I now have the honour and privilege to present before you Vote 13 for FY 2018/2019 for your consideration and approval.

An amount of **six billion, five hundred and thirty-seven million, one hundred and two thousand dollars (N\$6,537,102,000)** has been allocated to the Ministry of Health and Social Services.

The above mentioned allocation reflects a reduction of **Four hundred and twenty-four million, five hundred and ninety-six thousand Namibian Dollars (N\$ 424 596 000)** which represents **6.10%** reduction in comparison with the 2017/2018 Financial Year Budget allocation

The allocation for salaries and related expenditure for the 2018/2019 financial year represents **57.89%** of total allocation translating to an amount of **three billion four hundred and ninety-four million and nine hundred and ninety-two thousand Namibian Dollars (N\$3 494 992 000-00)** for the **13,651** employees on the payroll. Unfortunately, no provision is made for the filling of critical vacancies in the 2018/2019 financial year. We have to follow what I have mentioned earlier, compensatory reduction of admin and managerial positions.

With regard to revenue collection for the 2018/2019 FY, the Ministry estimates to collect an amount of **seventy-two million and two hundred**

23 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 13
HON DR HAUFIKU

and thirty-nine thousand and seven hundred Namibian Dollars (NS 72 239 700). The details of the revenues to be collected can be seen on page 4 of the Estimates of Revenue, Income and Expenditure 01 April 2018 to 31 March 2019.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

Let me outline for you, individual programmes for which this money is allocated.

Programme 1: Health system planning and management: An amount of thirty million, **five and hundred and forty-nine thousand (NS30,549,000)** is allocated. The preliminary expenditure for the 2017/2018 FY was **six hundred and fifty five million, one hundred and forty seven thousand Namibia Dollars (NS655, 147,000.00)** you can clearly see the close difference between the 30 million and six hundred. This is because there has been a change in terms of the restructuring of the Ministry, so the 600 million is not allocated to the same work or programmes as the 30 million I just wish to clarify that one.

This programme intends to develop the capacity for planning and management of health and social services in order to optimally and efficiently utilise the available resource dedicated to the sector. Particular attention is to be given to Financial and Resource Management, Human Resources and Performance Management, Policy Planning, Infrastructure development and maintenance

Programme 2: Curative and clinical health care: An amount of **five billion, eight hundred and twenty-five million and seventeen thousand (NS 5,825,017,000)** is allocated

This programme aims to provide services for in-patient and outpatient health care services by referral hospitals, regional and district hospitals as well as clinical services (diagnostic radiology services, laboratory services and pharmaceutical services).

23 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 13
HON DR HAUFIKU

Programme 3: Public Health: An amount of **seventy-six million and two hundred and ninety-four thousand (NS\$ 76,294,000)** is allocated. The equivalent allocation of last year was **eighty six million and one hundred and twenty six Namibia Dollars (NS\$86, 126, 000)**

The programme is to ensure that Namibia has an efficient public health system with programs aimed at reducing the incidences of disease and disability; improvement of maternal and child health; food and nutrition; prevent non-communicable and communicable diseases; promote environmental and occupational health as well as the reduction/control of mortalities.

Programme 4: Developmental Social Welfare: An **amount of twenty five million and two hundred and fifteen thousand (NS\$ 25,215,000)** is allocated, the equivalent of last year was, **eighty million eight hundred and seventy four Namibia Dollars (NS\$80, 874, 000)**

The programme aims to ensure quality delivery of social welfare services equally for all while enabling people to retain their independence, control and dignity. This programme include activities such as the promotion of family wellbeing; substance abuse treatment and prevention; administering policies and legislation for the registration and operations of welfare organisations and institutions for the care, protection of the vulnerable and rehabilitation of those in need.

Programme 5: Policy Coordination and Support Services: An amount of **five hundred and eighty million and twenty-seven thousand (NS\$ 580,027,000)** is allocated. Last year an amount of **five hundred and thirty seven million, one hundred and ninety six (NS\$537,196,000)** was allocated to this programme.

The objective of this program is to provide administrative support to all other programs of the Ministry in the development of relevant policies in accordance with legislative requirements and national objectives and to facilitate the implementation of the operations of the Ministry.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 13**
HON DR HAUFIKU

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

Our development partners continue committing resources through various mechanisms such as bilateral, multilateral and project agreements towards programmes in the health sector which are funded outside the State Revenue Fund. The funds committed by the development partners are targeted towards the prevention of communicable diseases in particular mv/AIDS, TB and Malaria, human resource development, strengthening of health systems management mechanisms and family health services. These contributions will therefore continue to make a significant contribution to the development of the health and social welfare sector.

In this regard, I wish to acknowledge the financial and technical support from the Government of the United States of America through the President's Emergency Programme for AIDS Relief (PEPFAR). We are also grateful for the substantial resources received from the Global Fund to fight AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria (GFATM). Our appreciation goes to the European Union for availing resources in the implementation of the Programme for Accelerating the Reduction of Maternal and Child Mortality (PARMaCM) where the interventions were aimed at addressing the health of our mothers and children.

Furthermore, I acknowledge the support received from the United Nations partners, in particular the World Health Organisation (WHO), UNICEF, UNFPA, and UNAIDS for their ongoing support in child health, reproductive health, HIV/AIDS, health systems strengthening as well as disease outbreaks. Similarly, my appreciation goes to all our bilateral partners for their ongoing financial and technical support in various projects.

Honourable Chairperson of the whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

I also wish to thank members of my team; the Honourable Deputy Minister Honourable Juliet Kavetuna, the Acting Permanent Secretary,

23 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 27
HON UUTONI

Mrs Petronella Masabane, and the entire staff of the Ministry of Health and Social Services for their tireless efforts towards the realisation and the provision of an integrated, affordable, accessible, quality health and social welfare services that is responsive to the needs of the population despite the many challenges we are facing especially in these difficult economic times

I now have the honour and privilege to ask you Honourable Members to give approve me **Six billion, five hundred and thirty-seven million, one hundred and two thousand Namibia Dollars (NS\$6,537,102,000)** for Vote 13.

I thank you for your attention. (*Applause*)

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Thank you. There are certain Ministries by their nature that because they cover a lot of fields and when you say you can summaries maybe Health and Social Services is one of those and I should think also the Basic Education but you can improve on it to summarise (*laughter*).

Last week we got a good example by the Minister of Works and Transport who finalised his motivation in ten minutes, but because of the nature of your work I could not say that you have to summarise.

The next is Vote 27, - **“SPORT, YOUTH AND NATIONAL SERVICES” - NS\$258,287,000**” for the introduction by the Honourable Minister of Sport, Youth and National Services. I trust that you will also summarise. Of course you are new I understand you if it is long because you are new in the field

HON MINISTER OF SPORT, YOUTH AND NATIONAL SERVICE: Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, it

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 27**
HON UUTONI

is not easy to summarise because it is already printed. Yes okay thank you,

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

Allow me to join others in congratulating Honourable Calle Schlettwein Minister of Finance and the Minister of Economic Planning and Director General of National Planning Committee Honourable Moses Kandjoze, and the staff of this institution for having made an impossible task possible. The economic challenges our country is going through requires us to take tough decisions that sometimes look very unpopular but necessary.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

Our Ministry has been mandated to develop and empower the youth and promote sport in all its facets.

The proposed allocated budget for our Ministry in this financial year 2018/19, amounts to **Two Hundred & Eighty Eight Million, Two Hundred and Eighty Seven Thousand Namibia Dollars Only (N\$288 287 000.00)**, which represents a drastic reduction of 67.1 % in comparison with the 2017/18 allocation of **Four Hundred Twenty Nine Million, Five Hundred and Twenty Four Thousand Namibia Dollars (N\$ 429 524 000)**

This allocation represents:

Two Hundred And Sixty Two Million, Five Hundred and Seventy Three Thousand Namibia Dollars (N\$ 262 573000.00) for the Operational Budget and **Twenty Five Million, Seven Hundred and Fourteen Thousand Namibia Dollars (N\$ 25 714000.00)** for the Development Budget

23 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 27
HON UUTONI

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

My predecessor during his address to this august House during 2017/2018, while motivating the allocation to this Ministry, made reference to doing more with less. In this year's motivation, I want to clearly state here that, there has been a steady decline with steep cuts to Budget allocations to this Ministry, both on the operational and development components, to such an extent that we can hardly execute our mandate. This has really created serious challenges to both the Youth and Sporting communities in our country.

The Ministry is perceived as not fully delivering on its mandate and failing to bring about creative youth programmes and growth of sport in our country. However, we believe as a Ministry, that we can create hope for a better future for our youth through sport promotion as an enabler, and youth development to contribute to the reduction of youth unemployment and alleviation of poverty.

Honourable Members;

The Ministerial Strategic Plan of 2017-2022, is aligned to the Harambee Prosperity Plan (HPP) and the NDP 5. This plan serves as a guide to ensure that the Ministry achieves its set objective and deliverables namely: *To Develop and Empower Youth and Promote Sport at all levels*. In order for the plan to be successfully implemented, adequate resources are required.

Honourable Members;

After the 2017/2018 Mid-Term Review our Ministry's Development Budget was reduced from **Thirty Seven Million, Five Hundred and Forty Four Thousand Namibia Dollars (NS37 544 000-00)** to **Twenty One Million, One Hundred and Twenty One Thousand Namibia Dollars (NS21,121,000.00)**

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 27**
HON UUTONI

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

With regards to Youth Development,

Youth constitute a big part of the Namibian population and are in fact current and future leaders and it is therefore critical to empower them. Our Ministry is continuously investing in youth skills development for the betterment of their future. However, inadequate funding is an impediment to be responsive to the needs of the youth holistically.

Despite the prevailing economic challenges, the Youth Development Directorate in collaboration with the State-Owned Enterprises (SOEs) achieved the following during the 2017/2018 financial year:

Our skills training centres produced two hundred and thirty-five (235) youth graduates from the semester courses, while two hundred and sixty (260) youth graduated from the one (1) year skills training programmes at the various centres.

Honourable Members, allow me to share with you that seven hundred and ninety-three (793) Children of the Liberation Struggle (CLS) completed civic and skills training at Berg Aukas Rural Youth Development Centre, at Simon Mutumba Police Training College and at the Namibia Institute of Mining and Technology (NIMT). Of the total referred to above, seven hundred and thirty-two (732) are employed in various O/M/As

Currently, two hundred and ninety-nine (299) CLS who commenced training at Berg Aukas during February 2018 are undergoing civic training and they will proceed to skills training upon completion of the civic training.

The Ministry has a Database System in place that captures data on registered CLS, including training received and employment offered. The Ministry intends to expand the database on its functionality in capturing information on general youth

23 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 27
HON UUTONI

With reference to establishment of the 121 Rural Youth Enterprises in terms of the Harambee Prosperity Plan, the following six (6) constituency based youth enterprises received **Three Hundred And Sixty Two Thousand, Nine Hundred and Fifty Namibia Dollars (N\$362 950.00)** from the Ministry: Ruacana, Opuwo, Daures, Tsumkwe, Mariental Urban and Eenhana.

Furthermore, we are pleased to report that a concept note and a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) on a joint initiative between our Ministry and Ministry of Higher Education, Training and Innovation to transform and expand Kai//Ganaxab (*Laughter*) Thank you very much Comrade Minister, yes that word. Youth Skills Training Centre into a fully-fledged vocational education and training centre was developed. Upon the signing of the MOU, the construction and transformation of the centre will commence.

Honourable Members,

Further achievements include vocational training at Rietfontein Training Center, where six hundred and sixty-nine (669) trainees enrolled in various vocational occupational trades at various levels under the National Youth Service of Namibia (NYS).

Through the NYS/NTA Service Level Agreement, NYS sustained the operations of the Training Centre while the Namibia Training Authority (NTA) covered training related expenses.

NYS further offered Heavy Duty and Heavy Plant Operator Short Courses, where one hundred and sixty four (164) trainees were awarded operating licenses. The NTA conducted National External Assessments and four hundred and forty three (443) trainees were assessed in various trades with an overall pass rate of 79%.

Youth undergoing training at NYS training centres commit to Voluntary Community Service as a means of instilling patriotism, nationhood and

23 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 27
HON UUTONI

pride. One hundred and sixteen (116) trainees rendered voluntary services at both the Walvis Bay and Luderitz Ports resorting under NAMPORT

The NYS through the *National Youth Service Act, 2005 (Act. 6 of 2005)* provides for income generating activities through the sale of livestock. The income generated supplements the government's subsidy and it amounted to **Nine Hundred Eighty Nine Thousand, Nine Hundred and Fifty One Namibia Dollars and Twenty Five Cents (NS989 951-25)**.

NYS furthermore completed the Water Supply and Reticulation System at Rietfontein Training Centre. Additionally, the unveiling of the construction of Phase IT of the Nahas Angula Training College at Rietfontein Training Centre took place and the contractors are on-site.

Honourable Members of this august House,

The NYS assisted in securing employment for one hundred and ninety-six (196) graduates in both Public and Private sector.

NYS further facilitated the employment of thirty-six (36) graduates who are employed as drivers by the Global Fund under the Ministry of Health and Social Services.

Furthermore, fifty (50) NYS graduates were recruited for the construction project of the road from Windhoek to Hosea Kutako International Airport. Fifteen (15) bricklayers with level three (3) were also dispatched to AMTA to participate in the building programme in Rundu.

The National Youth Council (NYC) fully promoted youth participation and development through the Credit For Youth in Business programme facilitated the process of securing of bank loans to the value of **Three Hundred and Twenty Thousand Namibia Dollars (NS 320 000.00)** to THIRTY TWO (32) youth businesses. The NYC further assisted with the realization of the #Eseb Bakery Youth Project in Erongo Region, employing seven (7) young people.

23 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 27
HON UTONI

Thirty (30) young leaders were empowered and groomed during the 2017/2018 financial year through the Youth Leadership Development Programme (YLDP) offered under a tripartite agreement between the Ministry, NYC and Friedrich Ebert Stiftung.

Honourable Members of this august House,

Youth Development programmes have faced challenges.

The Budget cuts negatively affected Youth Development programmes, so much that the regional outreach programmes came to a standstill. Similarly, the training programme offered at the National Youth Service halted, to the extent that the Office of the President had to intervene, and subsequently, the bailing out by Namibia Training Authority (NTA)

The NYS Agriculture and Aquaculture Department envisaged to invest in appropriate agricultural technologies for food production towards self-feeding of NYS trainees and to trade, but could not due to budgetary constraints. In addition to this, the situation is further aggravated by the drought that had negatively affected dry land crop (cereal) production at NYS farms.

Another major challenge is the pending approval of the proposed Ministerial Structure that hinders the filling of critical positions, especially at our training centre.

In terms of the planned programmes and activities for 2018/19 financial year:

Honourable Members of this August House,

I am pleased to announce that we have recently signed an MoU with the Ministry of Higher Education, Training and Innovation which will transform our centre into a fully-fledged vocational training institution. Equally through the collaboration, the Ministry intends to develop a standardised curriculum for skills development programmes as well as the

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 27**
HON UUTONI

Administrative and Management Guideline for our centres/hostels and Offices.

The Ministry commits to establish and commission seventy (70) constituency rural youth enterprises in all 14 Regions, in response to the targets set in the Harambee Prosperity Plan (HPP) of establishing 121 Rural Youth Enterprises. At this point, I would like to inform the house that this is in addition to the six (6) that are already established.

A task force will be established spearheaded by our Ministry and the Ministry of Labour, Industrial Relations & Employment Creation to tackle youth unemployment.

Furthermore, the Namibia Youth Credit Scheme (NYCS) will continue to offer training, appraisals and disbursement of non-collateral loans to the youth in an effort to address youth unemployment and poverty alleviation.

The Ministry in collaboration with the National Youth Council, National Youth Service, UN Agencies and other key stakeholders will review and finalise the National Youth Policy. In addition to this, the drafting of an Action Plan on the realisation of the UN 2030 Agenda and the AU 2063 Agenda focusing on youth, will be developed.

The Ministry intends to make the Farm du Plessis Training Centre in Omaheke Region operational in light of the increasing demand for skills and vocational training programmes, yes Omaheke clap your hands (*Applause*)

National Youth Service (NYS) will recruit and train six hundred (600) youth at NYS Henties Bay Training Centre, while two hundred and fifty-two (252) trainees from the previous financial year 2017/18, will undergo vocational training in this current financial year. Furthermore, NYS intends to recruit four (4) Instructors to offer training on Clothing Production and Hairdressing & Cosmetology.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 27**
HON UUTONI

The National Youth Council will continue to ensure voice representation of the youth by the following strategic interventions:

- professionalising youth work
- supporting youth organisations,
- supporting youth to implement development projects
- empowering young people in education, economic, health, political & civic participation.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

With reference to Sporting Promotion and Support

The Ministry continues to promote sport and avail opportunities for all Namibians to realise their sporting aspirations, despite limited resources. Although Namibian sport is faced by many challenges, such as budgetary constraints, dilapidated sport facilities and unqualified sport administrators, the country is performing satisfactory. The following are some of the major achievements:

The Brave Warriors Senior Soccer Team made history, by having participated in the 2018 Total African Nations Championship (CHAN), in Morocco, where they reached the quarterfinals and made us proud as a nation. *(Applause)*

Two Paralympians participated in the 2017 **World Para Athletics Championships** in August 2017 and won three medals (two silvers and a bronze). *(Applause)* This competition serves as preparation for the 2020 **Tokyo Paralympic Games**.

A Para Swimmer participated in the World Para Swimming Championship in Mexico during December 2017 and set a new African record of 49.4

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 27**
HON UUTONI

seconds in the 50 meters freestyle (*Applause*). Furthermore, the same Para Swimmer participated in the Kenya Open and Para Swimming Championship in February 2018 and won bronze in the 100 meters backstroke. He now holds two African records in 100 meters freestyle and 100 meters backstroke, do you understand this Muharukua? (*Laughter*)

The Ministry facilitates the participation of the Para-athletes ID the International Paralympic Committee (IPC) sanctioned events. This enhances their chances to be invited to other IPC sanctioned sport competitions and further assists the nation with preparations towards the qualification and participation in the **2020 Tokyo Paralympic Games**

During December 2017, Namibia Indoor Hockey beat South Africa and qualified for the **2018 Indoor Hockey World Cup** in Germany of which Team Namibia is ranked 14th on the world ranking.

The Namibian Senior Rugby team participated and won the African Gold Cup tournament where they played against teams such as Senegal, Zimbabwe and Kenya in preparation for **2019 Rugby World Cup** slotted for Japan.

Netball Namibia managed to secure a three-year sponsorship from DEBMARINE Namibia in June 2017. As part of the sponsorship Netball Namibia hosted a successful **Pet Series** Netball Tournament and Team Namibia ended third (3rd) out of six (6) countries (Botswana, Lesotho, Swaziland, Zambia, Zimbabwe and Namibia). As a result Namibia is now ranked 35th in the world.

Honourable Members

The Ministry in collaboration with the Ministry of Gender Equality and Child Welfare is running a wrestling project at the **After School Centre**, in Grysblock. The project objective is to assist the children from the community with their schoolwork while enhancing their skills in wrestling. As a result, six (6) wrestlers from the centre participated in African Wrestling Championship in Nigeria during February 2018.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 27**
HON UUTONI

The team comprised of young athletes ranging from the ages of sixteen (16) to eighteen (18) years and they won three (3) medals (two silvers and bronze).

Professional Boxers continue to impress in the world rankings of international boxing bodies such as World Boxing Organisation (WEO), World Boxing Associations (WBA), International Boxing Federation (IBF) and International Boxing Organisation (IBO). Six (6) boxers are ranked on various international boxing bodies.

Namibia continues to be favourable for hosting international sport competitions. We have successfully hosted the following sport competitions during the 2017/18 financial year:

- Hockey Indoor Test Series (Swakopmund)
- Volleyball Zone IV (Four) Club Championship (Swakopmund)
- Tennis Junior African Championship (Windhoek)
- Archery African Championship (Windhoek)
- COSSASA Athletics Championship (Swakopmund)
- Rugby Sevens International Tournament (Swakopmund)
- AUSC Region 5 Marathon (Swakopmund)

The Ministry has concluded the drafting of the following national documents in support of its mandate of creating an enabling environment and good governance: *the Sport Bill*, *the Professional Boxing Bill*, the Draft National Sport and Recreation Policy and the Draft Sport Reward Policy.

It is our anticipation that these national documents will be presented to the Cabinet before the end of the 2018/19 financial year.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 27**
HON UUTONI

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee. Honourable Members,

Sport Development has faced challenges too

The limited Budget allocation to sports hinders the implementation of sports development programs in the country. Non-participation in mandatory international events results in penalties, which are more costly than actual participation. The inadequate Budget further restricts the procurement of sporting equipment.

Furthermore, deplorable sport facilities makes the practice of sport a challenge. As a result, we have many young Namibians leaving the country in search of better sporting opportunities, talent appreciation and to make a worthwhile living from sporting careers. This is because, in other countries and continents, sport is perceived as a lucrative industry; hence, both Government and the Private Sector make huge investments into sport development. The lack of sports curriculum in institutions of higher learning in the country is a challenge that impacts the production of local physical education experts and teachers.

Current economic circumstances tied to the fluctuation of the US\$ makes the sport industry unpredictable in terms of budgeting for membership fees, participation, procurement of sport equipment and goods.

Honourable members

The planned programmes and activities for 2018/19 financial year in terms of sport development are as follows

ASSOCIATION OF NATIONAL OLYMPIC COMMITTEES OF AFRICA (ANOCA) GAMES

Namibia intends to send a team to the abovementioned games that are initiated by ANOCA, to provide sport opportunities for the athletes of our continent. The games will be held in Algeria in July 2018.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 27**
HON UUTONI

YOUTH OLYMPIC GAMES

Namibia also intends to send a team of young athletes to the Youth Olympic Games to be hosted by Buenos Aires, Argentina, in October 2018. The games serve as qualifiers for the 2020 Tokyo Olympic Games

AFRICA UNION SPORT COUNCIL REGION 5 U/20 YOUTH GAMES

Namibia, being a member of AUSC Region 5, is mandated to participate in the under 20 games, and to this effect, a team of two hundred and fifty-four (254) delegates will participate in the Youth Games, in Gaborone, Botswana, during December 2018.

NATIONAL YOUTH GAMES

To ensure inclusive representation of all 14 regions at the upcoming Africa Union Sport Council REGION 5 U120 GAMES, National Youth Games are slotted for 10-12 May 2018, in Windhoek to select the team for Botswana games.

ALL AFRICA GAMES

The All Africa Games will take place during the next financial year. However, Namibian athletes need to prepare during this financial year in order for them to qualify to be part of Team Namibia.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee; Honourable members

With regards to the Development Budget;

The Ministry has a number of projects running at different phases of progress, however, due to the limited Budget allocation of **Twenty Five Million Seven Hundred and Fourteen Thousand Namibia Dollars**

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 27**
HON UTONI

(**NS\$25 714 000-00**), the only projects that will be implemented in the 2018/19 financial year are as follows:

- Construction of the sewerage treatment plant at Frans Dimbare Rural Youth Development Centre (**NS\$10 million**);
- Feasibility study, documentation and fencing off of the plot earmarked for the Nkurenkuru Multi-Purpose Youth Resource Centre (**NS\$5 Million**)
- Continuation of Phase four (4) of the construction of Eenhana Sport Complex (**NS\$10Million**)
- Retention Fees for Outapi Sport Complex: **Seven Hundred and Fourteen Thousand Namibia Dollars (NS\$14 000)**

Honourable Members;

In summary, the 2018/19 Budget allocation for our Ministry will go to support the programmes of the Ministry as follows:

Sporting Promotion

Sport directorate is allocated **Thirty Four Million, Seven Hundred and Ninety Three Thousand Namibia Dollars (NS 34793 000)** to cater for all Sports related activities including subsidies to the Namibia Sports Commission, amounting to **Seven Million Two Hundred Thousand Namibia Dollars (NS 7200000)**, of which **Five (5) Million** is earmarked for personnel expenditure.

This then leaves the Directorate of Sport with **Twenty Seven Million Five Hundred and Ninety Three Thousand Namibia Dollars (NS\$27593000)** for its operations including Personnel expenditure and the development of grassroots sports and international participation.

23 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 27
HON UUTONI

Youth Development

Youth Development directorate IS allocated **One Hundred Forty Two Million, Four Hundred and Sixty Three Thousand Namibia Dollars (NS 142 463 000-00)** to cater for all Youth related activities, including subsidies to National Youth Service amounting to **Forty Three Million and Eight Hundred Thousand Namibia Dollars (NS 43800000)** which places the Ministry in a position not to honour our obligation for salaries, including the operational expenses. The same applies to the National Youth Council as the **Ten Million Namibia Dollars (NS10 000 000)** allocated is equally insufficient.

Supervision and Support Services

This program is allocated **Eighty Five Million, Three Hundred and Seventeen Thousand Namibia Dollars (NS 85 317000-00)** to cater for all the support services within the Ministry and it includes the allocation for the Office of the Minister.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee; Honourable Members

Development Budget

A total of **Twenty Five Million Seven Hundred and Fourteen Thousand Namibia Dollars (NS25 714 000-00)** has been allocated to cater for all the projects under the Ministry.

During the tabling of our 2017/18 Budget, my predecessor reiterated the fears of the Ministry particularly with regards to our international obligations. In this regard, I similarly appeal that if sufficient resources are not allocated, we may face sanctions that will adversely affect Namibia from participating both regionally and internationally.

Taking cognisance of the many challenges as a country, I want to re-emphasise that the plight of the youth development and sports promotion

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 27**
HON UUTONI

is evident that we need to reprioritise Budget allocation to this Ministry, as Youth and Sports development is a critical component of nation building.

Honourable Members;

I would like to take this opportunity to thank my Deputy Minister, Hon. Agnes Tjongarero, my Special Advisor, Reverend Ludwig Hausiku, the Permanent Secretary and the entire staff members for their hard work, dedication and professionalism displayed during the difficult economic times we had to endure in the 2017/18 financial year.

In conclusion, our Ministry, despite these challenges remains committed to deliver on its mandate and by doing so, contribute significantly to youth empowerment and promotion of sport.

I therefore request the indulgence of the Honourable members to approve the amount of **Two Hundred Eighty Eight Million, Two Hundred and Eighty Seven Thousand Namibia Dollars (NS\$288 287 000.00)**.

I Thank You (*Applause*)

CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you. Although the motivation was a bit long you made us proud for getting two gold medals, (*Interjections*) ha? During the recently concluded Commonwealth Games we got two gold medals, congratulations.

I put Vote 29, - **“INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY” - NS\$345,897,000** for the introduction by the Minister of Information and Communication Technology. Honourable Minister you have the Floor.

23 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 29
HON SIMATAA

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY: Thank you very much Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

It is indeed a privilege for me too present Vote 29 for the very first time in this Chamber. In doing so I would like to take this moment to thank His Excellency Dr Hage Geingob, President of the Republic of Namibia, for the trust and confidence shown in taking me with such honourous responsibilities. In the same vein let me thank the Honourable Ministers of Finance and Economic Planning and Director General of the National Planning Commission and their Deputies and of course members of their very able teams for crafting a balanced Budget under very challenging national and global economic conditions.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

I have deliberately chosen to present Vote 29 under the theme “*Leveraging ICT*” to once again locate the pivotal role ICT plays in the social, economic and political advancement of our country. In his State of the Nation address, H.E President Geingob spoke about the need for Namibia to leverage the digital economy. For us to be able to do so, we need to leverage today's globally interconnected technologies to deliver services both in the public and private sectors. To achieve this, we must improve existing interconnectedness of people, institutions and of course the internet of things (IoT). It is for this reason that concerted efforts are being made to populate broadband throughout the country and improve existing networks while expanding the network to many underserved and un-served rural areas.

We must take advantage of the digital youth dividend and place the youth at the centre of digital economic activities. This implies that we should create economic and innovation ecosystems that will not frustrate but facilitate the youths to fully utilise their digital skills.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 29**
HON SIMATAA

The youth job landscape has evolved and continues to change. New job opportunities should be explored not only in traditional sectors but in emerging sectors such as ICT.

Hon. Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Hon Ministers,

I am heartened to note that both the public and private sector have embraced ICT as an appropriate conduit to offer virtual and efficient services to their clients. Accounts given in this chamber by the President during the SONA on the ongoing migration to electronic services in the public sector, in particular the implementation of the E-passport by the Ministry of Home Affairs and Immigration, heightened focus on smart towns and cities by the Ministry of Safety and Security and some Municipalities which bodes well with our desire to create a Smart Namibia – all point to the realisation that while initial costs associated with ICT solutions may be high, there are enormous efficiency and cost benefits to be derived from such investments.

Two weeks ago, I had the privilege to launch the mobile application that will allow viewers to have virtual access to an array of NBC programs such as news, current affairs, sport and entertainment. With this innovation, our diplomatic missions abroad as well as Namibians in the diaspora, will now be in sync with national developments back home. In actual fact with this development there is no reason for any one of us wanting to leave Parliament, go back home so that we can have access to the eight o'clock news, you can focus on your engagements here and be able to catch up, off course you will have to pay Honourable Muharukua, for the services that are offered. In actual fact, I encourage all Members of Parliament to lead by example and please register so that you can have access to these services. Right Honourable Prime Minister, I am sure will lead us in this crusade to register, she has indicated that to me.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, we have also seen the print media gravitating towards providing news online - a development that is not only beneficial to the readers but one which reduces the grossly inhibitive operational costs associated with the

23 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 29
HON SIMATAA

printing and distribution of papers. These positive digital developments should be nurtured and consolidated.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Ministers,

On the legislative front, efforts are being made to expedite the finalisation of pending priority legislation in the areas of electronic transactions and cyber security, access to information and of course data protection. The withdrawal of the *electronic transactions and cyber security Bill* from this chamber last year though having given us an opportunity to further consult with stakeholders, unfortunately prolonged our vulnerability to opportunistic cyber-attacks.

Given the primacy of the security of our country, this gap will be closed as a matter of urgency. Having concluded the consultations on this Bill, and further given the realisation that further refinement of the Cybersecurity component is needed, it has been deemed appropriate to separate the two Bills. The separation will allow for the finalisation of the Electronic Transactions component whose realisation will provide the much needed legal framework to amongst other things:

- a) Cater for the prosecution of offences committed through electronic means.
- b) Trigger the introduction of the National Single Window.

Equally, the *Access to Information Bill* is being concluded and should also find its way to the Chamber before the end of the year. The passage of the bill will cement Namibia's position as one of the leading nations continentally and globally in terms of having a truly empowered citizenry. However, I hasten to point out that having access to information legislation should not be regarded as a panacea to existing bottlenecks in providing information to citizens. We need to create a culture where those of us who are custodians of public information, are keen to provide such information on time, and without being forced by a piece of legislation,

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 29**
HON SIMATAA

It must be a culture, because we hold the information in custody on behalf of the Namibian citizens. It is for this reason that government will soon identify statistical information that need to be published regularly. For example information on the number of permits issued, there is nothing security about that, information on the number of passports issued, there is nothing security about that, information on the number of farms for example, those resettled, we can provide that information in advance in advance, it is possible, so we are looking into that (*Interjection*) leave Oropoko anyways.

Notwithstanding that however, it is imperative for citizens to exercise restraint in seeking and divulging information. We should at all times resist the temptation to divulge personal and my emphasis and deliberately so security related information. Your information in terms of your health, no individual should divulge that, your HIV status, nobody should divulge that information, that is the same for personal information.

As I have pointed out on several occasions, our rights and freedoms as individuals will be severely impaired when the security of our nation state is compromised! Let us keep that in mind. We can claim access to information now, because Namibia is secured, the moment the security of this State called Namibia is compromised, forget about aserting your rights as provided for in the Namibian Constitution in as far as accessing information is concerned.

We can only enjoy unfettered access to information when the security of our nation state is guaranteed. This is the delicate balance citizens are called upon to maintain at all times.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Ministers

In our desire to consolidate Namibia's position as one of the countries with the freest press on this planet, we will continue to engage the Editor's Forum on a regular basis to benefit from their views and to also afford us the opportunity to sound our concerns where appropriate.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 29**
HON SIMATAA

Of late, we have seen a creeping tendency of prejudiced and inaccurate reporting on some issues.

While members of the Media should not be muzzled in carrying out their tasks, it is incumbent upon them as powerful entities to uphold ethics that govern their profession more so given the emergence of multiple credible and not so credible online sources. This is so because as Malcom X once said "*Media is the most powerful entity on earth. They have the power to make the innocent guilty and to make the guilty innocent. And that is the power because it controls the minds of the masses*". That is a very instructive reminder borrowed from the late Malcom X. Once you have done damage to the integrity of the individual, you can publish apology after apology, avalanche of apology after apology that will never rectify the indelible damage that you have done. This is why it is important for the media not to exercise armed chair journalism, and make sure that before they write, they engage with the facts, they make sure that their reporting is actual so that we do not damage deliberately the good integrity of others.

Therefore, Media is called upon to exercise their powerful role responsibly! I know they do not want to be regulated, so self-regulation comes with ability to observe ethics.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee Honourable Ministers

For our country to forge ahead in unity, we must consistently shun all the vices that pose great danger to the unity of our state. For this reason, isolated agitation emerging from certain quarters for our country to revert back to the previous apartheid system of Bantustans, should be rejected.

The Nationhood and National Pride campaign – in particular the operationalisation of the 14 Regional Forums, will be heightened to provide platforms to consolidate key messages of building a caring, dignified and united Namibia!

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 29**
HON SIMATAA

By design, Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Namibia is and will continue to be a unitary state as provided for in Article 1(1) of our Constitution, and as such, and I want to invoke the words of the late Andimba Toivo ya Toivo “*shall not now, nor in future be partitioned into Bantustans.*”

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Ministers

Namibia has potential to become one of the preferred locations for the production of blockbuster films. This can be attested by several Hollywood A-listed actors who have graced our country over the years. In order to maximise on this unexploited potential, concerted efforts will be made to conclude the development of the long overdue incentives Comrade Tweya that will give our country the edge in this globally competitive market.

Let me now briefly present the programmes for which the different allocations are being sought:

Programme 1: Information Communications Development

An amount of **Eight Million, Thirty Thousand Namibia Dollars (NS\$ 030 000.00)** is allocated to cater for the creation of a conducive regulatory framework for a thriving ICT sector and for the advancement of an inclusive ICT Smart Namibia.

Programme 2: Print Media Affairs

An amount of **Twenty Million, Four Hundred and Eighty Five Thousand Namibia Dollars (NS\$20 485 000.00)** has been allocated to this Programme to amongst other things ensure access to information by the citizenry.

This programme also includes allocations to New Era to the amount of **Fifteen Million Namibia Dollars (15 000 000.00)** and Namzim to the

23 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 29
HON SIMATAA

amount of **Ten Million Namibia Dollars (NS10 000 000.00)** to enable these entities to execute their mandates.

Programme 3: Audio Visual Media and Regional Offices

An amount of **Forty Eight Million, Seven Hundred and Twenty Eight Thousand Namibia Dollars (NS48 728 000.00)** has been allocated to provide for the implementation of ICT roll-out as well as the production, management and dissemination of audiovisual information to the public.

This programme includes an allocation of **Three Million Namibia Dollars (NS3 000 000.00)** only, to the undervalued Namibia Film Development Fund to cater for the development of a vibrant film industry in our country, including the development of local content, because we are tired of being exposed to foreign content, but what can you do Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee with three million. That is the salary of somebody, I do not want to mention no names anyways *(Laughter)*

This paltry allocation can hardly sustain our desire to propel Namibia to the global bouquet of preferred film locations, and we are competing with many countries Morocco, South Africa to mention but a few, but what can we do with such an allocation

The programme also includes an allocation of **One Hundred and Forty Million Namibia Dollars (140 000 000.00)** to the NBC which I hasten to add, is grossly inadequate to meet its public broadcaster obligations. Given the huge reductions in allocations to the NBC over the past two financial years, key programs such as the migration from Analogue to DTT where Namibia was regarded as a leader in SADC, is at great risk of being stalled. In actual fact many countries will be overtaking us and leaving us where we were, because of inadequate allocation.

Inherent in this Programme is an allocation of **Fifteen Million Namibia Dollars (NS15 000 000.00)** to the Namibia Press Agency to execute its mandate.

23 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 29
HON SIMATAA

Programme 4: Coordination and Support

An allocation of **Fifty Two Million, Nine Hundred and Eighty Seven Thousand Namibia Dollars (N\$52 987 000)** has been made to cater for the provision of logistics administrative support services, organisational procedures, the provision of logistic, transport services, development of relevant policies in accordance with legislative requirements and national objectives.

The programme also includes an allocation of **Thirty- Two Million, Six hundred and Sixty Seven Thousand Namibia Dollars (N\$ 32 667,000. 00)** to cater for the ongoing construction of modern and ICT compliant Ministerial Regional Offices in Nkurenkuru, Kavango West and Katima Mulilo, Zambezi Region respectively.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Hon. Members

In concluding, let me thank my colleagues, the Deputy Minister, Honourable Engel Nawatiseb, the Permanent Secretary, Members of the Ministry's Management and the entire staff for their diligence in executing the Ministry's mandate.

Before I conclude, Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, I have got good news for this Parliament. Not only for the National Assembly, but also for the National Council, but there are very strict conditions attached. That is in the coming days, I will deliver to each and every member of this National Assembly and the National Council, and the Table Office, probably the back room, one i-pad (*Applause*) to each one of us.

The reason is I want us to lead the crusade for us to operate an e-Parliament, (*Applause*) and Honourable Chair, the moment we renege on that promise I will do the honourable thing and respectfully request each one of you to surrender those i-pads to me, so that we can redirect the i-pads to the Ministry of Education, Arts and Culture. We will register them as stock items, so that there is no affirmative action that you will be

23 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 29
HON SIMATAA

applying. The first experiment, and I am requesting, we need to do away with the Order Papers, we also need to do away with the minutes, those are the first to that will start. The rest I will leave that to the Speaker, and the Chairperson of the National Council to see what will follow.
(Interjection)

HON MUHARUKUA: NBC plus, must be there as well

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY: NBC plus by the way. If you do not register for that, the offer will be withdrawn (Laughter)

On that very good note Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, It is now my distinct pleasure to submit for your consideration, subsequently support Vote 29 to the amount of **Three Hundred and Forty Five Million, Eight Hundred and Ninety Seven Thousand Namibia Dollars (N\$345 897 000.00)** only for your support and also passing. Let me conclude by saying “*luitumezi*”, “*Tangi unene*”, “*Pandu*”, “*Okuhepa*” “*Kaise Ai-os* (Laughter).

Thank you very much indeed.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Thank you very much Honourable Minister for your promise, your eloquence in which you motivated your Vote as well as your layout and the design, thank you so much, congratulations.

Now the last Vote is Vote 32, - “**HIGHER EDUCATION, TRAINING AND INNOVATION**” - **N\$3,232,858,000** for the introduction by the Honourable Minister of Higher Education, Training

23 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 32
HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

and Innovation. Before she stands up I would like to ask the Chief Whip to ensure that we maintain a quorum please. All the Chief Whips from different Political Parties.

Honourable Minister Doctor you have the Floor.

HON MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, TRAINING AND INNOVATION: Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

It is an honour to rise in this august House to motivate the Budget request for Vote 32, Ministry of Higher Education, Training and Innovation (MHETI) for the 2018/2019 Financial Year. At this point I wish to recognise and commend the efforts of the Minister of Finance and his Deputy for drawing up this Budget under the prevailing economic hardships.

Notwithstanding the Current challenges, the Government of the Republic of Namibia remains the primary provider of basic goods and services to the public and the main protector of the citizens' rights. This commitment is entrenched in Chapter 3 of the Namibian Constitution and further encapsulated in the many programs of the Executive, Legislature and the Judiciary.

Contemporary education literature and research point to some generic objects of National Education Systems, the world over, as being to:

- i) Provide quality education that is transformative and linked to the immediate labor market(s);
- ii) Uphold set education standards of each phase of formal education;
- iii) Empower with requisite knowledge, competences, skills and attitude to engender growth and sustainable development;

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 32**
HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

- iv) Cultivate a sense of citizenship that invokes a passion to actively contribute to the betterment of humanity; and
- v) Instill the realisation that lifelong learning is mandatory for quality life.

Efforts are ongoing under MHETI to align the two streams of tertiary education: TVET and Academic Education.

In line with its mandate, MHETI wishes to highlight the following achievements in the past financial year (2017/18):

- Allocation loans and grants to 34,849 beneficiaries to pursue tertiary education at local and foreign institutions;
- Increased enrolment number of VET trainees in the system from 28,571 in 2016/17 to 32,120 in 2017/18;
- Increased number of tertiary institutions graduates from 5,042 in 2016/17 to 6,258 in 2017/18.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members

Premised on the outcomes of the situational analysis, a Strategic Plan (2017- 2021) has been developed. This Strategic Plan provides direction and strategic choices to the higher education, training and innovation sub-sectors over the next five years. In line with Vision 2030, Harambee Prosperity Plan and NDP5, the Ministry's Strategic Plan focuses on, but not limited to, the following strategic goals, **to:**

- i) Align and better **articulate** tertiary education levels;
- ii) Expand **access** to tertiary education and thereby minimise the plight of Grade 10 and 12 school leavers;

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 32**
HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

- iii) Consolidate and upgrade the **TVET Instructors' Unit** at NUST into a fully – fledged Faculty of TVET Education for quality pre and in-service instructors' education and training;
- iv) **Review ACTS** of the Public Enterprises under MHETI to reduce duplications and improve the governance of the ministry's public enterprises;
- v) Narrow the gap between tertiary education course offerings and industry demands, through actively engaging industry in programme development and apprenticeship programmes;
- vi) Identify, nurture and **develop business-oriented students** through provision of practical entrepreneurship education and training, aiming at mainly mind-set change;
- vii) Strengthen Namibia's research capacity and stimulate innovation; and,
- viii) Modernise tertiary education, by integrating technology and creativity in education and training to optimize benefits to students, communities and the nation at large.

In the next five years, MHETI under the *Higher Education* pillar aims to establish and maintain a quality and responsive tertiary education that ensures equitable access and funding, to meet the demands of making Namibia a knowledge- based economy. Also, efforts are underway to effect programs' audit and streamlining academic program offerings, with a view to reducing unnecessary costly duplications at public university level. This means, going forward, the introduction of new (academic) campuses, centers, faculties and or programs by the two public universities would be preceded by proper and adequate consultations with the MHETI, prior to commencement of any such new academic venture.

Under the **TVET pillar**, the immediate focus of MHETI and NTA is to transform and expand the TVET system to the Regions.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 32**
HON DR KANDJIL-MURANGI

There is a major imperative of integrating the different TVET curricula in Namibia into a one properly bench marked, comprehensive quality National TVET System, with clear standards on TVET Instructor Education; TVET entry requirements; Instruction materials development; progression through TVET Levels, Examinations and Assessment System and TVET qualifications and certification. A TVET standards setting, enforcement and TVET/Industry research center, under the Ministry, will be established in the third part of 2018.

While with the ***Innovation pillar***, MHETI seeks to:

- a) Align Science, Technology & Innovation (STI) policies and strengthen linkages between public and private sectors; and
- b) Increase stakeholders participation in STI programmes.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

Higher Education, Training and Innovation constitute one of the key cornerstones of realising the goals of Vision 2030 and Harambee Prosperity Plan, which is to transform Namibia into a knowledge-based nation and this hinges on the availability of:

- High level technical and professional human capital within our higher education sector;
- A vibrant National System of Innovation, underpinned by strong technological, research and scientific capacities to propel industrialisation, and
- A broad base of highly skilled and experienced artisans, technicians, technologists and engineers to run industry operations.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 32**
HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

In keeping with its mandate of educating, training and equitably funding eligible Namibians to achieve the set national goals as outlined in the strategic documents (Vision 2030, NDP 5 and HPP), MHETI wishes to highlight the following achievements for the past financial year, and this will lead me to the different Programmes.

PROGRAMME 1: COORDINATION AND SUPPORT SERVICES

This programme focuses on providing policy direction and developing national strategy for the Ministry as well as for its administration.

During this financial year, the Ministry will increase its monitoring and evaluation aspects to ensure that tasks are executed with a greater sense of urgency.

The requested funding of **Twenty Nine Million Four Hundred and Forty One Thousand (N\$29,411,000)** is requested to support the Ministry's Programme # 1 activities

PROGRAMME 2: HIGHER EDUCATION

The higher education programme's core focus, is to provide affordable and equitable, quality higher education through teaching, research and advisory services, all which are responsive to national development needs. Under the pillar of higher education, it is worth noting that the following key achievements were accomplished in the year under review:

- i) The total enrolment at our two public universities (UNAM and NUST), during the 2017 academic year, stood at 35,820 students. At UNAM, the number of enrolled students was 25,684 while at NUST the number of enrolled students was 11,230. For the 2018 academic year, UNAM enrolled 26,645 students while NUST registered 11,424 students.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 32**
HON DR KANDJIL-MURANGI

- ii) In recognition of the critical role of international partnerships, the University of Namibia (UNAM) and the National Council for Higher Education (NCHE) co-hosted the Commonwealth Education Conference. The conference that was held in September 2017, and was attended by international delegates, mainly from Europe and the African Region;
- iii) Furthermore, in our drive to ensure quality, a total of **20** programmes offered by the University of Namibia and Namibia University of Science and Technology were reviewed and benchmarked for accreditation purpose with the help of experts from SADC and beyond
- iv) A tracer study for graduates, who completed studies in 2012 and 2013 at UNAM, NUST and IUM, was finalised in the 2017/18 financial year. Most graduates (69 per cent) rated Course/Programme content "high" in terms of the usefulness of the study programme to their current employment. This observation suggests that the universities are offering useful programmes in terms of quality and content thus, enhancing employability of graduates. The majority of the graduates, 81 per cent were employed, and an additional 2 per cent, were self-employed at the time of the survey. This is 3 to 4 years after studies. Almost all employed graduates were working fulltime (92 per cent) or had permanent contracts (83 per cent). Although 17 per cent of the graduates in the survey indicated unemployed, about one third (28 per cent) were pursuing further studies. A high percentage of graduates (71 per cent) was working in areas that are appropriate to their education level and reported a close relationship between the field of study and the area of work.

In the 2018/19 financial year, the following activities will be conducted under the higher education programme:

- Review of the national quality assurance system in higher education;

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 32**
HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

- Undertaking of the employer survey to examine the degree to which training at higher education institutions is responsive to the labour market requirements;
- Increase enrolment at the public universities; and
- Audit of academic programs at the two public universities

Despite the economic hardships faced by government, the MHTEI through the Namibia Student Financial Assistance Fund (NSFAF), will continue to commit to providing financial support to needy students.

In 2017/18, to enhance equity in accessing higher education, loans and grants were provided to **16 529** tertiary education students. The breakdown is as follows: **4 683 TVET** trainees benefited from the loans/grants awarded, while **10685** under-graduate students at higher education institutions and **1161** post graduate students at tertiary institutions benefited.

It should be noted that this is in addition to the **19478** continuing students. This figure represents an increase of **18%** compared to the 2016/17 financial year.

Therefore, an amount of **Three Billion, thirty nine million Eight Hundred and Ninety Eight Thousand Namibia Dollars (N\$3,039,898,000)** is requested for this programme

This translates to an allocation of :

- Nine Hundred and Sixty Million Namibia Dollars (N\$960 000 000.00)** for the University of Namibia;
- Four Hundred and Twenty Two Thousand (N\$422 000.00)** of the Namibia National Student Organisation (NANSO);

23 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 32
HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

- iii. **Six Hundred Million Namibia Dollars (NS600 000 000.00)** for the Namibia University of Science and Technology; and
- iv. Namibian Students Financial Assistance Fund is allocated **One Billion Four Hundred and Fifty Million Namibia Dollars (NS1,450,000,000.00)**.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

There is a steady reduction of direct subventions to the two public higher education institutions. And if it persists, it will severely erode Namibia's quality of university education. Our public universities are operating under heavy and severe financial constraints. This might lead to termination of critical programmes and reduction of new student intakes.

Equally important, is for our public universities to be proactive and aggressive in exploring collaborative projects, joint research, and self-initiated projects that add value and help to augment and diversify their revenue base. Legal and realistic strategies that do not interfere with the mandate of our public universities, should be explored and agreed to by key stakeholders, to gradually reduce the over dependence of Higher Education Institutions on government subvention.

PROGRAMME 3: VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING

This programme seeks to establish and manage a demand-driven Technical, Vocational Education and Training (TVET) system. The key policy objective of this programme is to ensure access, quality and equity in the delivery of technical and vocational skills required for productive work and accelerated social and economic development. TVET is considered to be one of the key drivers of industrialisation, and an effective tool for imparting employability skills to the youth. TVET is an important engine for job creation and self-employment.

23 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 32
HON DR KANDJIL-MURANGI

During the year under review, 2017/2018 the following accomplishments were realised under the TVET Sector

- **Increased TVET Enrolment:**

The Namibian Government's vision for the TVET sector, is one under which, aggressive investment is required in growing the local training market and freeing up more opportunities for quality training. It is a vision that appreciates the importance of quality TVET services as the most important possible driver of Namibia's economic growth. Enrolment in TVET is on the increase as more equitable and quality training opportunities are being generated. In the previous financial year, altogether **24,937** trainees were enrolled for VET programmes at both public and private training institutions, countrywide. This figure now stands a **27,132** exceeding the enrolment target as articulated in the Harambee Prosperity Plan (HPP

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

- **Capital Projects:**

Further traction has been gained in expanding the public vocational training centre footprint to all 14 regions. Ground-breaking ceremonies were staged for the construction of the Nkurenkuru Vocational Training Centre at Nkurenkuru in Kavango-West in October 2017, and for the construction of the Kunene Vocational Training Centre at Khorixas, in December 2017. Furthermore, plans are on track to break ground for the construction of the Omuthiya Vocational Training Centre in Oshikoto and the Keetmanshoop Vocational Training Centre in //Karas, in the next few months. Construction work to remodel existing infrastructure as it was stated by my counterpart at youth, at the Kai//Ganaxab Training Centre (Mariental) into a fully-fledged public vocational training centre for the Hardap Region, is expected to commence in the 3rd quarter of the 2018/19 financial year.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 32**
HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

- **Implementation of Recognition of Prior Learning (RPL):**

RPL assigns value to prior learning. Its important role in certifying competent, skilled and experienced technical and vocational practitioners is recognised and leveraged in the technical and vocational skills development objectives of the HPP, which had set a target of 2000 candidates to be certified during the first year of the HPP period. A total of **3,631** RPL assessment applications in 29 different occupational areas were received, of which altogether **1,514** candidates were assessed, and of which 852 candidates (56%), were certified.

- **Capacity Building of TVET Trainers:**

A total of **600 trainers** from public vocational training centres, Public Enterprises and private training institutions attended short further and upskilling training locally and in countries such as Germany, Spain and India, as part of a comprehensive capacity-building programme. While these are welcome, a TVET instructors education program with recognised qualifications and certification is needed locally, hence the new Faculty of TVET Education at NUST

- **Registration of Training Institutions:**

In line with its mandate to regulate the provision of high quality TVET services to Namibians countrywide and protect the public against unscrupulous service providers, the NTA, through its Standards, Assessment and Certification Council (SACC) continues to register local training institutions. Currently, **70 institutions** have acquired official registration status.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

- **Improving the Image of TVET:**

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 32**
HON DR KANDJIL-MURANGI

Promoting and leveraging TVET career paths and fighting the societal perception, under which TVET career options are stereotyped as low status with limited potential for career growth, will remain a priority for the considerable future. The year under review saw the conclusion of a very successful national advocacy campaign, under which **24 TVET graduates** were profiled as 'ambassadors' or 'champions' of the TVET Sector. Weekly television programmes and print content advertorials were broadcast on NBC television and published in the New Era newspaper, respectively. The same content was also shared on a variety of social media platforms. Very soon, campaign material will be distributed to primary and secondary schools across the country, to ensure learners can access this information. Planning towards a second advocacy season has started in earnest. On the international front, Namibia took a team of seven competitors, to partake at the World Skills Competition in Abu Dhabi, United Arab Emirates from 14 to 17 October 2017. Preparations are already underway for the staging of the second National Skills Competition in September 2018, at which competitors are to be selected to represent our country at the 2019 World Skills Competition, in Kazan, Russia

- **Entrepreneurship Support:**

The year under review saw the implementation of a programme under which entrepreneurship training is offered for Level 3 TVET graduates. A total of **128 trainees** from five participating VTCs took part in this programme, which also included coaching, mentoring and incubation support.

- **Development/Review of New/Existing National VET Qualifications for Registration on the National Qualifications Framework (NQF):**

Of significance is the development of new national qualifications and unit standards for the Agriculture sector. The Rundu Vocational Training Centre in Kavango-East and the Zambezi Vocational Training Centre at Katima Mulilo have registered first trainee intakes in this very important national growth area.

23 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 32
HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

Major Undertakings for MTEF Period of 2018/2019 - 2020/21

• Continued TVET Transformation & Expansion Project Implementation:

A comprehensive TVET Transformation & Expansion Strategy has been developed with a 15-year implementation timeline, which includes the expansion of infrastructure/facilities at existing VTCs, establishing a footprint of public VTCs in all 14 political Regions, and improving quality of training (through up-skilled and qualified trainers, fit-for-purpose tools and equipment, industry response programme offerings, etcetera). Implementation of this initiative has commenced at the beginning of 2017. It is anticipated that the number of trainees in the TVET system will increase from the current level of 25,000 to well over 100,000 at full implementation by 2031/32.

Key projects to be embarked upon, include:

- Further expansion of the Okakarara VTC (Otjozondjupa); Nakayale VTC (Omusati) and Valombola VTC (Oshana);
- Construction of the Omuthiya VTC (Oshikoto);
- Construction of Keetmanshoop VTC (//Karas)
- Construction work to re-purpose existing infrastructure at the Kai//Ganaxab Training Centre at Mariental into a public vocational training centre for the Hardap region;
- Procurement of fit-for-purpose training equipment and tools;
- Rendering of technical and financial support to government and State-owned enterprise TVET partners, e.g. Ministry of Sport, Youth

**23 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 32
HON DR KANDJIL-MURANGI**

and National Service; National Youth Service (NYS); and the Namibia Marine and Fisheries Institute (NAMFI), to expand access to TVET services provision

- **Sector Skills Development Plan (SDP) 1 (2016-2020):**

Further rollout of this plan, which prioritises trades/occupations in high demand as agreed with industry that will guide investments into skills development over the next five years. Funding is to be provided under the VET Levy's 35% Key Priority Grant Funding Window. Approximately N\$200 million has been spent to date in support of implementation of this plan. A further N\$300million is expected to be spent over the remainder of the MTEF period.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

- **Improve Quality of TVET Services Provision:**

In line with ongoing strategic efforts, to improve the quality of TVET services provision, the following activities are to be implemented over the short- to medium term:

- A Work Integrated Learning (WIL) programme, which facilitates the coordination of apprenticeship and industrial attachment, as well as implementation of an associated incentive scheme;
- The continuous capacity building of TVET trainers;
- Introduction of a programme leading to a standards setting and TVET body, similar to NIED; and
- The development of industry-driven training programmes.

23 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 32
HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

An amount of **One Hundred and Thirty Six Million Eight Hundred and Fifty Two Thousand Namibia Dollars (NS 136,852,000)** is requested for this programme.

PROGRAMME 4: RESEARCH, TECHNOLOGY, AND INNOVATION

The main objective of this programme is to coordinate, promote and develop research, science, technology and innovation for social and economic benefits of the country.

The key outputs of this programme are a strengthened National Research and Innovation System, underpinned by an enabling Science, Technology and Innovation (STI) policy and legislative framework.

Notable achievements were also realised in this programme.

1. During the reporting period the National Commission on Research Science and Technology has launched the National Biotechnology, Testing, Training and Research Laboratory, the Genetically Modified Organisms (GMO) reference laboratory will provide testing services for GMOs and GMO products which will ensure the full implementation of the *Biosafety Act, 2006 (Act. 7 of 2006)*

GMO testing is crucial to ensuring that only GMOs and GMO products that are approved for use in Namibia are indeed the ones in the local market, to ensure safety of Products. The lab is also designed for research and training in the field of biotechnology. Thus, the lab will play a big role in building local capacity in terms of producing a cadre of professionals and researchers in the field of Biotechnology

2. Completion of the Monitoring & Evaluation Report for the Implementation of research initiatives and programme of the first National Programme on Research, Science, Technology and Innovation (NPRSTI). This report summarises the output of work of

23 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 32
HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

diverse stakeholders and it will serve as a main vehicle to provide wider audiences with information about the implementation of the NPRSTI initiatives

Key priority spending programmes to be implemented in the coming Budget year (2018/19) and the expected outputs are:

- 1) Implementation of the *Biosafety Act* to ensure comprehensive regulation of GMOs which will ensure food safety and security;
- 2) Funding of innovation programmes that show potential to result in new products and services;
- 3) Implementation of the STI policy and review of the RST Act, 2004 to ensure optimum collection of revenue from research permits and introduce levies that can fund research in key priority areas that are identified to facilitate economic development
- 4) Establishment of the Namibia Journal for Research, Science and Technology to allow researchers and decision makers to keep up to date of developments in the different scientific fields and in so doing direct the countries resources in terms of research towards national priorities;
- 5) Implementation of the second National Programme on Research, Science, Technology and Innovation. The Programme identifies Namibia's priority areas for investment in research, science, technology and innovation and responds to research priority areas, which address and contribute to solving the primary social and economic challenges of Namibia.
- 6) Implementation of a National Science, Technology and Innovation Portal, which will serve as a source and repository of information, that is relevant to the making of policies and decisions on S&T related matters. The portal will provide an interface between three major groups of players in the S&T system; namely, the policymaking and

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 32**
HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

research funding organisations, researchers, innovators and research & innovation product users.

- 7) Conducting the second R&D survey to produce STI indicators. The indicators are very important in understanding the size and shape of the Namibia R&D landscape and their use in system-level planning, monitoring and evaluation.

An amount of Twenty Six Million Six Hundred and Ninety Seven Thousand **Namibia Dollars (N\$26,697,000)** is requested for this programme.

PROGRAMME 5: NAMIBIA NATIONAL COMMISSION FOR UNESCO

The Namibia National Commission for UNESCO manages relations between UNESCO Member States and UNESCO, by providing advice on all UNESCO-related matters, on areas such as Education, Natural Sciences, Social and Human Sciences, Culture and Information and Communication. The key objective is to access the rich knowledge and technical resources of UNESCO, for the betterment of Namibia. Other strategic activities include technically supporting and enabling Namibia's representation on the UNESCO governing bodies, namely the UNESCO General Conference, UNESCO Executive Board and other UNESCO conferences, meetings and workshops.

The following achievements were noticeable during the period under review:

1. Financial and technical support provided to the UNESCO Scoping mission on the transformation and expansion of TVET in Namibia.
2. Management of the Office of the Deputy Permanent Delegate to UNESCO.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 32**
HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

3. Continued financial support to the office of the President of the 38th session of the UNESCO General Conference, Hon. Stanley Simataa.
4. Appointment and inauguration of ten (10) new members of the Executive Committee of the Namibia National Commission for UNESCO, and fifty-three (53) new members of the Programme Committees.
5. Orientation session held for sixty-three (63) new members of the Namibia National Commission.
6. Attendance of the 39th session of the UNESCO General Conference and UNESCO Executive Board.
7. Secretarial support provided during the Africa mission of the President of the 38th session of the UNESCO General Conference.
8. Facilitation and hosting of the Namibia National Consultation on Sustainable Development Goal 4 for eighty (80) participants.
9. National Consultation on Education, Sciences and Culture.
10. Hosting of the Annual General Assembly of the National Commission.

An amount of Ni ne Million Eight Hundred and Twenty Six Thousand **Namibia Dollars (NS9 82 6 000.00)** is requested for this programme.

It is mainly for participation in the session of the UNESCO General Conference and observance of the UNESCO Executive Board; to provide support to the Office of the Namibian Deputy Permanent Delegate to UNESCO; to pay Namibia's contribution to the Regular Programme of UNESCO and other UNESCO activities.

It is critical that the positions of key staff vacancies be filled as soon as possible to execute the mandate of the National Commission effectively.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 32**
HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

This is a prerequisite for interacting with the UNESCO Secretariat and other professionals in UNESCO Member States, and for efficient and effective participation in the activities of UNESCO to derive maximum benefits from the UNESCO resources.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

As I move towards concluding, I would like to commend our public higher education, training and research institutions for striving to do/be the best, and produce the best results under severe funding limitations.

Finally, I wish to thank my Deputy, Hon Dr. Becky Ndjoze-Ojo, the Permanent Secretary and the entire team, for their dedication and sense of purpose and urgency as we, together work hard to achieve the different goals that underpin our Ministry's mandate.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

I therefore now, humbly request this august House to support and approve the total Budget of Vote 32 of **Three Billion Two hundred thirty two million Eight hundred Fifty Eight thousand Namibia Dollars (NS3,232,858,000)** for the Ministry of Higher Education, Training and Innovation for 2017/2018 financial year.

I thank you (*Applause*)

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:

Thank you. Very informative paper indeed. We are now going to go for discussions of the following Votes, and we should at least be forty nine (49). In the meantime we are going to discuss while we are waiting for the other people to come, probably to make a quorum.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 23**
HON DIENDA

That is why I put Vote 23, - **“WORKS”**. Any discussions? Any objections? Agreed to. (*Interjection*) Oh I did not see you. I recognise Honourable Dienda.

HON DIENDA: Thank you Honourable Chairperson. Honourable Chairperson, I would like to take the attention of my Minister to page 344 of the Estimates of Revenue and Income, Honourable Mutorwa.

Honourable I just want to know, I have noticed that you did not Budget for **property rentals** but in this for this Financial Year you have a rental Budget of N\$3,500,000. Can you just indicate to this House where these properties are that you want to rent now?

My second question, Honourable Chairperson, is on page 346 Honourable Minister of the Estimates of Revenue and Income page 346 Honourable Minister. Honourable Minister here I have noticed that the property rental last year it was only N\$4,000,000 for the financial book of last year, but all of a sudden it becomes N\$169,000,000. Somewhere, somehow something is wrong here, so if you can indicate to this House, where does this increase come from.

Also Honourable Minister on **utilities** I wanted to establish what is meant with these utilities. It was N\$13,000,000 and now it is N\$35,000,000 all of a sudden, from N\$13,000,000 to N\$35,000,000?

Honourable Minister I will continue on page 348 under Main Division, **Maintenance**. Honourable Minister I have a concern when it comes to Works, and the maintenance of our Government buildings and properties. I just want to know, is there no way that we can give petty cash to Government Institutions instead of running to your office, submit a document which will lie on somebody's table for three months just to come and do small maintenance projects especially at our schools? Is there no other means of addressing this problem?

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 23**
HON NAUYOMA

My concern is also the use of **cheap materials** these plastic toilet things that they are putting in our toilets. We must consider we are in Africa, we are not in China where the people are small. We are big here so these plastic things do not work in Namibia?

I will continue Honourable Minister, on page 352 under **Garden Services**. Honourable Minister I have to thank you for the Parliament Gardens which you are busy with to do maintenance, to beautify it, but for how long will this Garden not be available for the public to come and do their wedding pictures? (*Interjection*) Come again Honourable?

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: It will take two years.

HON DIENDA: Two years okay, so if the Honourable can also enlighten us because every time people are asking me when will it be open for them to take their wedding pictures here. Honourable Minister with these few words, although you have confessed and said the Budget is low, if it is low I will support it, if it is high I will also support it.

Thank you.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: I recognise Honourable Nauyoma.

HON NAUYOMA: Thank you Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee. Mine is I think three queries to the Honourable Minister with regards to his submission on his motivation statement.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 23**
HON NAUYOMA

1. Is with regards to the **Government Houses** that are really in deplorable conditions countrywide, because I know there was a decision to sell these houses to the tenants that are there. How far are you with this process of selling some of these houses off to the people that are living there?
2. Those houses are not sold to the people that are there, why has it now become a responsibility of the tenants to take care of the property which is not their own? Anything that breaks they must repair, they must do all the small maintenance, small that arises there, meanwhile it is not their own properties?
3. Is a question that I have persistently posed with regards to **Government garage**? I know Honourable Minister you have described this really, here in your statement that the Government Garage has like turned into a scrap yard (*Intervention*).

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: It is at transport. Government Garage is under Transport I should think?

HON NAUYOMA: Yes, oh now we are on Works sorry.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: You can ask both.

HON NAUYOMA: No I can ask both. Okay let me repeat this one for now. The other one is the question of **horticulture**, horticulture at the

Government facilities. (*Interjection*) You are late just sit down you do not know what we are talking about.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Come again, what is that?

HON NAUYOMA: Horticulture activities or services, decorations at the Government Facilities, I know they are always budgeted for in this Vote, for such activity, but when we move around the country we do not see this beauty. We do not see offices being properly decorated, being properly taken care of like we see in other countries. What is this Budget really doing? We can only see an example like the Parliament Gardens that my sister has just talked about, but in other places, in other towns, other Offices we do not see these services really being carried out on a serious note. I think I must stop there now.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Thank you. I recognise Honourable Ekandjo.

HON EKANDJO: Thank you Comrade Chair. Mine is not a question maybe it is only for consideration of the Minister and his staff.

Comrade Minister, it is regarding the **tendering the multi-Purpose Youth National Training facility at Opuwo**, it is half built and the contractor ran away. Also the **Police Station at Okongo Constituency** was half built, and now shrubs are growing. In both cases I am told the contractors who got the tenders also got another tender somewhere in Oshakati in the country. Is there no way to blacklist those companies

because what they do is they build half, they run away and get another tender, so they continue. I think maybe if a company got a tender, I am saying this because at the Technical document page 5, 3.1 on top Programmes, Construction and Building Regulations GRN. Sometimes I hear people saying GRN they also say the GRN of Zambia, GRN of Angola (*Laughter*), GRN of Zimbabwe, GRN of Sierra Leone. GRN stands for Government of the Republic of Namibia, not Governments. Some Members understands this as inter Governments.

3.1.2, same page, page 5, 3.1.2 Main Activities under this programme is to supervise the design, tendering of the construction, renovation and upgrading of all functional and institutional buildings and construction work for Government Buildings including approving drawings and specifications to supervise. I think because like the Youth Multipurpose Centre at Opuwo it is half built, and it is falling apart, the same also with the Police Station at Okongo. The Engineers, Quantity Surveyors and Architects of the Ministry, I think they should just start monitoring from the beginning, and if the person just builds, then they can stop, rather than at the end the building is build halfway and only the roof is remaining and then they disappear but all along it is just sand. I think such a company must be blacklisted and they must not get any tender in Namibia, then they will learn. It is just for advice.

Secondly, is with the **tendering of Government projects** especially the construction of Government Works, and also rail, roads and everything. I think here the Namibians compete against multinational international companies which are supported by their Governments. Can we not do this for instance, if I have a licence to run a taxi I have got a car and then I register applying to run a taxi, I have got a licence but I cannot drive, then you find that the owner of the taxi makes an agreement with the driver a partner, is it maybe not possible in the future, because currently you hear the people complaining all the construction tenders are going to multinational companies. Is there no way where tendering must only be done by Namibians, even the construction of road, even if you have only got a wheelbarrow then you the Namibian who got the tender you can now

partner with any person in the world, (*Laughter*) you can partner because maybe you have got a wheelbarrow you must build a bridge (*Interjection*).

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: What are you laughing at?

HON EKANDJO: That other person has got machinery he can build within five months, then you can partner. In that case there will be no outcry and say Government you are giving tenders to foreigners or whatever, it is you the Namibian who loses, because currently you find a Namibian tendering and the multinational companies tendering. This person comes he gets a tender here, he got a tender in Botswana, he got a tender in South Africa, and if he cannot fund here he will take all the moneys here even if he loses there. Is there nowhere maybe where we can?

Lastly Comrade Minister, I do not know **the construction of the harbour** I do not know whether it is Transport or Works. We have got more than a 1,000 kilometre coastline from the Kunene to Orange River, but we cramp Walvis Bay. It is congested. Everything Walvis Bay/Walvis Bay, it is the ship coming there and vessels come there with oil, with containers, with passengers everything and we have got a long coastline, I am saying this in relation to Cape Fria, we must not lose that idea. I do not know whether it is now Works or Transport to construct it.

The idea for Cape Fria was for heavy industries, copper, the mines everything so that Walvis Bay can always be for light industries, but if we cramp everything there Walvis Bay is too congested and we have got a long harbour. Countries like Zaire, now Congo, they are the people who have that small island to the sea they can cramp there, but we have got more than 1,000 coastline, so I think this is just for consideration by the

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 23**
HON VAN DEN HEEVER

Minister and his staff and I wholeheartedly more than 1000% not 100% but more than 1000% I wholeheartedly support the Vote.

Thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Jerry Ekandjo. I recognise Honourable Van Den Heever.

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: Van Den Heever.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Van Den Heever.

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: Thank you Honourable Deputy Chairperson.

Mine is a very short intervention here. I refer to the technical document on page 8, Honourable Minister the second bullet, the sale of **non-assigned Government houses** is ongoing. I would just like to find out how were these houses sold? Was it by tender or did the tenants get preference? Just for information sake.

Then referring to the development programmes on page 480 there is a project **upgrading of network infrastructure and expansion of IT Services to Regional Offices**. The starting date is 21 August 2014 and the concluding date is 31st March of 2018, but when we look at the funding expenditure it rolls over even up to 2020/2021 and then there is

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 23**
HON MUTORWA

still a balance to complete? I just need clarification on that one if the project was supposed to conclude already at the end of March, why are there still figures allocated to the estimates for 2020/2021?

Then on page 486 of the same development programme, there is a programme it is just the dates I to query there. The starting date is 31st March of 2020 and the concluding date is 31st March 2015. So I do not know whether it is, it should be or it might be a spelling error, but it is incorrectly stipulated here.

Thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable. I think we have concluded the contributions. Can I now request the Honourable Minister to reply?

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Thank you Comrade Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee for giving me the Floor to respond. I would like to thank the colleagues who have raised issues. I will try to the best of my ability to provide the information as required now, and some of them we will provide maybe at a later stage if need be. I am only 74 days now as Minister of Works, i think it is long enough, it is not an excuse.

Honourable Dienda, the issue of property rentals and the amounts there as indicated and as highlighted by yourselves, big increases, the issue of utilities, I may not have the exact statistics, but I can tell you one thing. If you look around you will find there is still quite a number of Government Offices, Ministries and Agencies, operating from private properties and therefore the paying of rentals, the amount of money to make use of those facilities which are privately owned is budgeted under this Ministry the Ministry of Works and Transport.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 23**
HON MUTORWA

Where are these properties? We can compile a list with my officials who are sitting in front of me, we cannot provide the list now, we will definitely undertake to provide that list of where these rentals are, what their names are. I can for example if we just take the Ministry of Public Enterprises they operate from the Old FNB Building along Independence Avenue, so that is also quite a number of them but we would be able to compile that list at an appropriate time, complete list and then I will present it here for the Honourable Members to look at. That will also explain the big increases why as you said last time it was Four Million now a hundred and sixty nine, even I would have that type of question but I do not want to be so presumptuous too, I will have to get the full list from my officials and I can undertake that even before we adjourn just to distribute that particular list. The same applies to utilities also big increases I would also like to undertake to do exactly the same.

Now maintenance, very important. If you carefully look at the motivation statement, I did make reference to two Cabinet decisions first and foremost, and then I also made reference that one of the functions within the Ministry of Works and Transport that was already decentralised to Regions under the able leadership of my neighbour who is now sitting on my left, normally he sits on my right but I do not know why he is sitting there, he will come later, is the maintenance Budget. Now let us look at what it means and I have seen quite a number of colleagues who rightly so have queried the inefficiencies of the Ministry of Works *“In terms of effecting maintenance at Government buildings and so forth and so on”*.

Yes we can take some of the punches like in boxing but for sure, we are also able to distribute some of those very same punches to other people. The Cabinet decisions that were taken state that Offices, Ministries, Agencies, and it was taken a long time ago when Comrade Errki Nghimtina was the Minister of Works. Offices, Ministries and Agencies must Budget themselves for routine minor maintenance. I know that some Offices, Ministries and Agencies are doing it but there is also a large number of them who are not doing it, hence you hear about complains *“We were waiting for the Ministry of Works to fix a bulb and something”*

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 23**
HON MUTORWA

That one I am going to distribute the punch back and say we are reminding Offices, Ministries and Agencies exactly to do that in as far as minor maintenance and renovations are concerned.

Two – The maintenance Budget has been decentralised to Regions. What does it mean? It simply means that the amount of money budgeted for within the Ministry of Works and Transport is annually sent to the Regional Councils, for them to utilise that money and effect again some renovations and maintenance. I know money is never enough because even the Ministry of Fisheries when I asked but now tell me this money that is decentralized for example for 2017/2018 Financial Year, do we have the accountability Reports that tell us that so much was sent to this region and this is how this money was utilised? I have my file here I have got the Region of Zambezi has already submitted. I am not accusing anybody in the Regions, I am just talking about the principle, because it is important for us to know how much was utilised and for what, and what is the outstanding balance where now the Ministry can come in and for a bigger thing?

The other day my colleague the Principal of Eros Girls High School out of desperateness, and I have shared it with my colleagues, I sent that very same fax to her the colleague the Minister of Education saying that there were some renovations done at Eros Girls High School some time ago but the work was not completed, and some of the work that was done was also not properly done, it is falling apart. Then we launched some investigation and I received a Report from the Khomas Regional Council and the Directorate of Education, because even from the Ministry of Education, education is decentralised to Regions, and surely they got some money from us, maybe that is what was used by we are still waiting for how was that money spent for that?

I am simply saying I do not deny. I do not deny that in terms of renovations and maintenance, I think we still need to improve and when I say we I mean all of us as Government across the board, starting with the Ministry itself and the respective individual Ministries, Offices and Agencies, because as I said in my motivation statement if we do not take

care of what we have, but aspire to construct new expensive buildings I think we will fail in our work. That is what I can say about maintenance but I am still saying that because the Budget for maintenance has been decentralised, it is important that we get the accountability Reports from the Regions via the Line Ministry which is the Ministry of Urban and Rural Development to ourselves, through the Permanent Secretary from the Regional Offices to the Permanent Secretary of Urban and Rural Development to the Permanent Secretary of Works and Transport so that when I am asked questions I can table these types of things here. I hope we will do some improvement there.

The Parliament Garden, thank you very much for the thank you, but in as far as to when the public will start to have access to this Parliament Gardens it is now up to the Parliament because they are in charge. Our responsibility was to assist in beautifying, effecting some upgrades, but when the authority of the Parliament now decides maybe through the Permanent Secretary of the National Assembly, decides that everything is okay now and people can start to make use of it, it is fine it is up to them now, it is no more from us.

Honourable Nauyoma, dilapidated Government Houses, selling of Government Houses I think somebody else also asked about this. First is to confirm that indeed Cabinet did make a decision a few years ago now to offer, some of the houses for buying to the legally sitting tenants. I also made reference in my statement if you read there how much was generated from the selling of these houses and that process is to the best of my knowledge is still continuing, Government has not stopped it but I see also from the Ministry itself, I do get a lot of enquiries exactly like the question that you have just put. Many tenants who are in these Government Houses have been waiting, are still waiting to be offered to buy those houses, so that maybe is an administrative kind of delay, but I am making use of this august House, to send out this message clearly that Government is offer, decision of Cabinet to offer some of the identified houses for buying by the sitting tenants is still on.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 23**
HON MUTORWA

Normally as I said in my statement, the Ministry of Land Reform through their evaluators will be the ones to go and evaluate the value of these houses and then that particular amount is then offered to the sitting tenants, that one is still on it is ongoing. But now you spoke like a desperate person, but desperateness if I am sitting and I am waiting to be offered but now I just do not take care because I am frustrated I do not think that is something that we should. I understand the frustrations but still, we must insist as leaders that when we make use of a particular property whether it is Government property or maybe property from your brother please take care of it, it is just good manners I think to do so.

One day when I, let us say now this tenant decided not to take care and the thing has dilapidated, do you know what is going to happen, when the evaluation is done maybe and we know that this person has not taken care of this, we will not offer you. We will not make an offer to you. We will chase you out of that house and somebody else who is taking care then the offer is made to him or her, but again I am appealing to you I am appealing to everybody as leaders we must, we appreciate the frustrations but nevertheless we do not go to the extent of saying because I am frustrated I just demolish this, I do not think that is what Namibia and Namibians want from us.

Why should tenants take care? I have answered that one.

The issue of the Government Garage here again I must be clear. I have toured some of the Government Garages, after this Parliament as from next week I will start with my regional tours. I am not accusing the employees of the Government Garage. They are there but what I have discovered is that the Application of the *Public Procurement Act*, with particular reference to purchasing of spare parts and so on, again there is nothing wrong with the *Public Procurement Act*, but the bureaucracy, how is it done?

You know somebody sits in Katima Mulilo or in Opuwo or in Gobabis or in Ondangwa that is now the person in charge of the Government Garage. Here are the vehicles brought to the Government Garage, now they must

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 23**
HON MUTORWA

fill in forms. It is fine I have no problem control is important, then all these forms are now sent to Windhoek to the Head Office here, and when they arrive in Windhoek then the Procurement Committee within the Ministry must go through them, and then thereafter eventually all of them must be signed by the Permanent Secretary, and when, what are these people that you take the Purchase Order to them for them to provide you with the spare parts, you have to get three quotations, again no problem. But just the time it takes, by the everything else is done and the Permanent Secretary has to sign and send back, then the Garage becomes a scrap yard.

But I have already, on a good note I was already in touch with my colleagues, the colleagues from the Ministry of Finance. The Minister/Deputy Minister is sitting here, because we have discovered people are quick to blame the law, but I have been explaining that the *Public Procurement Act*, when we debated it here if you go to the Hansard. That particular Act has got many good characteristics as compared to the Tender Board, because what we did actually with the *Public Procurement Act* is to effect some improvements on the Tender Board, even in terms of Comrade Jerry Ekandjo to take care of, what is the word now, people who are coming in, using the law lawfully, also to make sure the tenders do not just go to big multinationals in terms of the specifications there, and in terms of making sure that the Board because previously people were complaining and rightly so, that the Tender Board was composed only of high senior officials here in Windhoek, Permanent Secretaries, but now if you look at the composition of the Procurement Board it is from private sector mainly actually, and so forth and so on.

So as far as the Government Garage is concerned why now this congestion of vehicles, take your vehicle there three months the thing is just standing there, the grass is growing. I think it is how some people have understood the *Procurement Act*, but I was in touch again with the Minister of Finance, Deputy Minister of Finance and they sent us the procurement, what do you call that, not the big board the one, the Procurement Unit, the officials there to get in touch with our officials, to ensure how to make the process much smoother without compromising on the provisions of the

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 23**
HON MUTORWA

law. We are now busy with that particular exercise and hopefully things will improve but for now I still maintain that we have to do something. The Government Garage I use the word and I am repeating it here, is like a hospital. When we go to the hospital we are there, we are sick, you rush there, the nurse, the doctor will fix you. When you want to take your car to the Government Garage it is to be fixed, so that that car must run and make the economy provide the services. But the current situation where you see vehicles are just parked there. It is not something that we would like to see, all of us I suppose, not only the Minister of Works and Transport.

You also talked about beautifying of Government premises. Again there, the provision Honourable Members it is good for that question, the provision through the Ministry of Works in terms of budgetary allocations, and I am sure when you go to specific Ministries they also have got something to make their terrain beautiful and the same to the Regional Councils, the same to the Local Authority Councils, but here and I am speaking now just as John Mutorwa the person, it is an attitudinal problem Comrades. It is an attitudinal problem.

People steal things that even somebody must come and tell me to make sure that the space where I operate from is cleaned. You have beautiful trees that were planted there, almost everywhere where you go, but go to our Regions, even here at the Head Offices of various Ministries beautiful trees, the lawn is there, no pruning, no cutting, so that the thing is attractive, who are you waiting for? No, no it is wrong Comrades. It is wrong so I am just as a Minister of Works now I am saying, you know what we do in our own houses is what we should also do in our work places, in our public places. But maybe some people do not even clean at their own houses, it is a problem, ha? I mean when you go to my house, I try on a Saturday I should not look like now. I must get out and clean a little bit here and there so that the environment is attractive. Now the trees are just hanging like this. You can go to some places, I mean the roof of the houses the trees are (*Laughter*), yes the gutters are blocked when the rain comes and then when there is a strong wind the big trees fall on

the house and now emergency here, “emergency please come and help us” we must change our attitude, it is exactly for that reason that His Excellency the President has decided for a clean-up of our own environment, the same applies here. *(Interjection)* some of the things, no that side, sorry. Some of the things even Comrade it does not require money. It is simply to clean. It is a culture, it is an attitude. Ha, here also where we sit I must be proud of my place where I am sitting, it must be clean. I do not know whether all these places are clean. Somebody was saying that some people even Honourable Members, they chew gum there, there they leave something, so I am now provoking you, and I also have to. It starts here cleanliness. I must remove my books so that the place is clean. So the same there Comrades.

Comrade Jerry Ekandjo, the tendering Multipurpose, Youth Centre that is abandoned by contractors and so forth, blacklisting of contractors, supervision: You have raised a very important issue Comrade Jerry Ekandjo but again there in answering this question we must start at the start. Tenders are advertised first and foremost. People are invited we are constructing a Multipurpose Youth Centre in Opuwo, and then the specifications are given there publicly in newspapers. Then those that read this and think that they have got a chance they put in their bids, and at the deadline, all those that received tender applications are scrutinised, shortlisted and all that, evaluated and then at the end of the day that is through again an independent body.

Of course it starts first in the particular Ministry itself and once they are done then they submit this now to the Procurement Board. When the successful tenderer is decided upon on the basis of his or her applications having fulfilled all the specifications, what happens? A contract agreement is signed. A contract agreement is signed, we are going to execute this work within the specified period, so and so are appointed and are the consulting engineers. This one and that one will be the architects for his project. This one and the other one Quantity Surveyor and these things are also not secretly done. Any project that is being implemented we see this big billboard there all the names are put there.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 23**
HON MUTORWA

So it is not only, of course the Ministry of Works also have got an important role to play in following up that the right things are done but also the consulting engineers and other people. So also the owner of the project that is now the Line Ministry, they must also check what is happening. So at the end of the day what I am saying without defending any malpractice at all the thing is transparency, checking and checking. Now if for example during the process you see that this particular contractor has already deviated from what we have agreed upon what was signed, then steps must be corrected, steps must be taken and there are always regular site meetings jointly to evaluate that you know we are now here in terms of this project. Then normally those that are entrusted with the responsibility see that this particular contractor will not be able to fulfil or to complete this, there are also procedures to follow in terms of termination of the contract and so forth and so on.

So all that I am saying is that and I agree with you, we have just to appeal because the complaints are just getting too many. We just have to appeal when there is a project all those that are assigned specific responsibilities in making sure that this project is completed successfully, legally, everything they should do their responsibilities, so that at the end of the day because now we say the contractor has run away and has abandoned, but how did the contractor do so without those who are supposed to supervise the contractor has done so? So I am simply appealing. I am simply appealing follow the agreements.

It is good that you have asked this question I mean if I can show you the many complains that have come to me as the Minister now and I am sure my predecessor has also dealt with the same. The Ministers, no he only came late he could not go in front. The Ministers and all these things that I have explained there is no way that the Minister is involved in these things, in the contract awards, what have you, evaluations, no but now when things go wrong (*Interjection*)

HON MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY: Now they are blaming you (*Laughter*).

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Now everybody is coming “Minister so and so in 20 what and what, I was awarded a contract but now they have not paid me yet”, and, and, all that and all this. Fine of course I cannot run away from that Minister in terms of Article 41 of the Constitution, is finally accountable, but we can only appeal and appeal everybody who has got specific responsibilities must make sure that all these responsibilities are carried out. Of course finally when all these are done Comrade Jerry Ekandjo you are right and there are also procedures to say now we have done all this, consulting Engineers have done this, Surveyors I mean the Quantity Surveyors, the Architects, the Ministry officials, therefore on the basis of all these facts we are going to blacklist this person then you are making a point. You cannot just stand up and say blacklist, and when it is investigated maybe the problem starts with the supervisor. So I heard you and I agree with you but that is the explanation that we should send out publicly here concerning this issue.

With regards to the additional harbour how do I respond to this one? You see we have a long coastline and Namibia is the gateway to many landlocked SADC countries and Comrade Jerry you are right, today we have Walvis Bay but maybe not during our time, when we are no more here, when our children will be occupying this, maybe Walvis Bay will be completely congested. So the idea of checking, doing studies we have Luderitz in the South, we have Walvis Bay in the centre, let us look north there as the Founding President used to say, ‘you must have vision’ somewhere whether it is Cape Fria wherever, that idea for us to envision that is not dead it must be there, because when you look also at the road infrastructure look at this, is it Trans Caprivi Highway, now with the completion, maybe Trans Zambezi but it is the same thing. Trans Caprivi that is fine no problem, please, please. But that road is so important now as you will see during the Budget Vote of Transport, there is also now Henties Bay via Kamanjab that particular road is also been upgraded so

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 23**
HON VAN DEN HEEVER / HON MUTORWA

that it links up with the existing road to Opuwo. Now can you imagine trucks maybe coming from Zambia, Angola or wherever if they can use just that straight road from Katima Mulilo, via Rundu, via Nkurenkuru, via Okongo, Eenhana straight up to Opuwo there, and link up at the coast is much better rather than coming here. So you are 100% correct Comrade Jerry we should not fail to plan. We should plan for the future we have 2030 and these are some of the things that we should keep in mind I agree with you.

Honourable Van Den Heever, technical documents to non-assigned houses, I must admit that (*Interjection*). Page 8 what does it say? And ICT? You asked specific technical questions, I must confess I have forgotten the gist but (*Interjection*).

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: On page 8, your technical document

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Maybe through the Chairperson maybe if she can just repeat that? I am sorry.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Yes Honourable you can repeat that.

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: Honourable Minister on page 8, your technical document of yours which talks about the non-assigned Government houses. I just wanted to know how those houses were sold. Was it by tender or the tenants, but I think you explained it when you said that tenants first got priority, maybe just for clarification.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON KARUPU

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: That was the response, the ICT story rolled over and the date sometimes you reverse back I think we just have to look at that and correct whatever the figures and the dates that are wrong.

Thank you Honourable Members.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Minister for the reply. Any objection? Agreed to.

I put Vote 24, “**TRANSPORT**” any discussion? I recognise Honourable Karupu.

HON KARUPU: Thank you very much Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members.

I rise to support this very important Vote and of course there are some few queries on behalf of the public out there, being a mouthpiece of the electorates. I am in agreement with the motivation, I strongly agree with the motivation of the Honourable Minister in which is that this sector contributes to the promotion of the country’s economic development, the social upliftment towards the gross national product as per our NDP5, and indeed the sector is the backbone or the realisation of other sectors targets. I think this is referring to transport infrastructure, more specifically to roads that are being used by most of our public out there. I understand the rail, the sea, the air, but I am concentrating on the roads that are being used by most of our public.

We have been following the good development in this Ministry whereby roads are being constructed at the basis of gravel roads and later on the

Ministry comes back and develops it to a business standard which is tarring it.

HON MURORUA: What standard?

HON KARUPU: Tarring these roads. Listen Murorua Dudu? Honourable Dudu listen you are very close to me. What I am trying to say is that with the slow pace in which our economy is performing if we concentrate on tarring the roads that we have gravelled, while other parts of the country has waited, some communities in the other parts of the country have waited for 28 years and are still patiently waiting to also be given gravel roads. They are now using paths, the tracks maybe animals pass there, elephants and whatever and people are also driving around the trees and so on, these are not roads. We want to see these communities also being accorded roads, because roads are very much important for them to reach. I am coming to the question I just want to clarify first (*Interjections*).

HON MURORUA: You are not clarifying you are you are coming from the Regions where the roads are (*Intervention*).

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE
COMMITTEE: Order in the House.

HON KARUPU: Can I be protected?

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON KARUPU

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Honourable you have the Floor you are protected. Can you continue? Order in the House.

HON KARUPU: Yes we have got a road master plan and that is where the Ministry is going to take the stock from, as to which part of this country is not really properly attended to in terms of road constructions. My question is, (*Interjection*).

HON MEMBER: Page what?

HON KARUPU: Oh, my neighbour is asking which page. It is page 3 of the Minister's motivation book. It is page 3.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Honourable Karupu you have the Floor. Just leave your neighbours can you continue.

HON KARUPU: My question is how is the Ministry going to come and meet these communities halfway that have waited for so long if the Ministry is still tarring roads that are already in good conditions? We have travelled this country during the assessment of projects, some gravel roads are up to standard. They do not need to be tarred and I wanted to know as to how long these people are going to wait.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON KARUPU

HON MEMBER: Which ones?

HON KARUPU: The other communities.

HON MEMBER: Like where?

HON KARUPU: The road master plan I do not want to mention communities here. The Ministry knows as the roadmap.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Can we have order, Honourable Muharukua.

HON KARUPU: They have to take stock of the master road (*Intervention*).

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Can you finish if he wants to come in then he can come in. Can I have order in the House? Comrade Karupu continue. Do not answer the questions on the Floor, you have the Floor continue.

HON KARUPU: We have roads that needs to be upgraded or to be constructed not even upgraded, I said these are just paths. Yes there are many roads that I know at (*Interjection*).

HON MEMBER: Okangwati?

HON KARUPU: No, not Okangwati. There is a gravel road in Okangwati. There is the Omboto Roads, there are also roads in the other regions yes that are like Omboto. The same road like Omboto in other Regions, and they are many if I need to mention them they are many I cannot mention those roads. They need to be constructed. Thank you very much I think the question is very clear to the Ministry of Works.

Thank you very much.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE

COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Karupu can I recognize Honourable Lucia Iipumbu? Can I have order in the House please? Honourable Karupu, Honourable Norah Munsu, please can I have order in the House. Honourable Lucia Iipumbu you have the Floor.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF NATIONAL ECONOMIC PLANNING: Thank you Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee.

I want to thank the Minister for a brief and comprehensive motivation that he presented. I perused through (*Indistinct*) presented to three hundred and seventy. I have seen allocation to State Owned Enterprises,

and I have seen provision made for Roads Authority, Roads Construction Commission (RCC), Air Namibia, TransNamib, NamPort and others but I did not spot any **allocation to the Road Fund Administration**. I just want to find out if they are self-sufficient or perhaps they are catered for under other allocations?

The second point, can I have your attention Honourable Members? The second point is all of us by now know that the weather prospects are very good in terms of the rainy season. At some point the Meteorological Office indicated that our rainy season can go up to end of May or sometimes beginning of June, and I have taken note with concern of the excuses if I should call them so, by maybe Roads Authority and Local Authorities in terms of maintaining our roads.

They keep saying that all the time they tell us that we must wait for the rainy season to be over for some terrible potholes to be taken care of. I have spotted especially in the towns of Tsumeb, Oshakati, Katima Mulilo and Windhoek, not only inside the Local Authorities but on the main roads as well of which I know Roads Authority is responsible for, and maybe through the Ministry is an extension in terms of appeals to the Local Authorities and Road Authority can be made that road maintenance should be a continuous exercise.

We should not hide behind the rainy season because even during the rainy season the damage that is caused to the vehicles in terms of their wheels and tyres and some other parts of the cars is very huge especially that it is caused by the potholes that we are experiencing in some of these roads. So it is just an appeal that the Local Authorities together with the Roads Authority to make budgetary provisions and put money aside for road maintenance especially during the rainy season.

My third and last point is a point that I raised in this august House I believe two years ago. I said I made the discovery then that we have **weighbridges** across the country, where the trucks are passing through and are measured in terms of the mass volume of the capacity of what they transport and our intention to put up those weighbridges was for us to

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON MWANINGANGE

measure those mass volumes and then charge a specific amount that we can use in return to maintain our roads, and at that point in time which was 2016 I kind of made a discovery that we were still not charging. I have attempted Honourable Minister at a different platform, where I have engaged the Road Fund Administration specifically and I still is not get feedback if we are charging or not because as of now we all know that the Budget cuts that we are experiencing and how hard they are hitting us and we need to collect more revenue and this is one source of revenue collection that I believe would add little coins in the pockets of the Ministry in terms of the transport for road maintenance.

I thank you and I support the Vote. *(Applause)*

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you. I recognise Honourable Billy Mwaningange.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF DEFENCE: Thank you very much the Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, I would like to contribute to the Vote 24 on Transport.

In doing so I would just like to give a kind of suggestion or advice. At page 4 under programme 1. It is said that the purpose or the aim of this programme is to develop the world class transportation infrastructures and to maintain them. It is really a great idea that Namibians are proud of that. The Ministry is aiming to do so.

Now there are real visible problems especially on the main trunk roads in our country along the tarred roads. There is high risk of accidents happening there, arising from bush encroachments, animals moving around the roads, pedestrians crossing the roads, so all of those are posing

a danger on those roads especially on highways when you are driving at the speed of 120 kilometres per hour.

HON MEMBER: 180?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF DEFENCE: No, not 180 kilometres it is not allowed, 120 kilometres per hour and that, with these modern vehicles which are speeding 120 is the speed, I am talking from experience. Two years ago I survived on one of the roads whereby our vehicles hit in a kudu and we were only three as occupants, we survived but the vehicle was written off, maybe because all three of us were trained you know nature, we survived and the vehicle is written off but the kudu also was cut in between.

It came from the bush encroachment within a distance of 50 metres. We saw it jumping into the road, leaping over the road. So now, let us perhaps, I know money is the question but manpower, human power is there, why do we not as a Ministry decentralise kinds of activities to the Regional Councils, Traditional Authorities so that communities can volunteer. They can volunteer. In fact they are not volunteering that they are reducing deaths on roads. They are the ones who are crossing the roads, their animals, it is this and that, so if the Ministry discusses with the Regional Councils, Local Authorities, and Traditional Authorities then ach Kilometre before you reach the “*Omukunda*” (Village) in community areas there are communities who are volunteering to clear the road, to uproot the shrubs and bushes. They may not use lots of money and so on, but if the people the community are involved in that one it will make great impact as far as the clearing of the roads is concerned.

Lastly are the **people who are building along the roads**, the infrastructures along the roads some are doing it purposely so that they can be compensated if the Government wants to extend the road.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON DIENDA

So some of things can be overcome by empowering the Local Authorities, Regional Councils, Traditional Authorities then we will do better or we meet the Government halfway, as the Government constructs these very beautiful modern roads. With this Comrade Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee I support the Vote.

I thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you and I recognise Honourable Dienda.

HON DIENDA: Honourable Deputy Chairperson thank you very much. Honourable Minister, page 357 Estimates of Revenue. Honourable Minister, **Namibia Airports Company**, I did not see a Budget here, but I am actually glad. I have a concern about Namibia Airports Company. Seven years ago we bought buses for the Airport Company to transport passengers from the Airport to the planes especially when it is the rainy season. I saw those buses parked there, they do not move since they were bought, was never used so what was the use. Just go there. What was the use of buying all those buses? Now you two are consulting so I cannot answer?

Honourable Minister I just want to know those buses can they not give them to schools if they do not want to use them (*Interjection*) or to the Municipality. They are just standing there, Honourable Saki Shanghala those buses will disappear, you know we are even stealing the milk from the coffee in this country so that is my concern. The buses will disappear if you do not use them. (*Laughter*)

My second concern Honourable Minister still on page 357, I have noticed that **Air Namibia** got the N\$740,000,000. I read in one of the local newspapers last week that Air Namibia has been classified under the top

five State Owned Enterprises whereby the CEO are getting the top of the salaries. So I just want to know, we are bailing them out N\$740,000,000, come the Mid Term Budget we must bail them out again which criteria was used to say that you deserve this salary? That is my second question.

Then under **TransNamib** N\$171,000,000. Honourable Minister, I heard in your speech that you are talking about the upgrading of our rail services, but so far the only railway services which are open and which is being used by passengers is the one from the South and the one moving from Windhoek to Walvis Bay, what about the others? You know to make use of the train for me it is better, it is safer and, yes it is safer who wants these minibus taxis I will come there now, there are always accidents. It is slower, but some of us like it we do not want to fly to our next destination, we want it.

So Honourable and my second question is on page 360 under Transportation Policies and Regulations. Honourable Minister the **taxis**. There is no proper regulation for our taxis. Tomorrow there will be a strike here in Windhoek of all the taxis here because of an increment, so if we do not come up with guidelines regarding our taxi industry things will get out of hand, it is already there. Just in today's newspaper there was a student from University of Namibia (UNAM) who was stabbed by taxi drivers, so if there is no database no nothing, even the taxi drivers I know they are changing on a weekly and monthly basis but the information the data must be there. Who is the driver, who is the owner who is 'the everything' of that taxi so that we can have follow ups of our taxi industry?

Another concern also with the taxis Honourable Minister, all the **taxi licences** are being issued here in Windhoek so there is no control in the Region over who this taxi belongs to and so. So M170 is in Windhoek, M172 is in Grootfontein, M173 is in Keetmanshoop, this is how the numbering of the taxis are. So Honourable, yes can we please regulate our taxi industry so that we cannot be confused and if possible if the Government can come up on a way to get rid of the "*sikorokoro*" (beat up) taxis and help these taxi drivers so that they can have loans for proper

taxi services. Yes the dankie Botswana or whatever they are if we can help them financially to come up to have proper taxis for transportation.

So Honourable my last question is on page 363. I just want to know these **State Owned Enterprises** that we are budgeting for N\$121,000,000 on page 363, which State Owned Enterprises are we talking about? It is just State Owned Enterprises but you did not list to us which ones they are, that this Budget makes up from which ones.

Thank you Honourable.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Dienda. I recognise Honourable Van Wyk.

HON VAN WYK: Thank you Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee. First let me appreciate the work done by the Ministry of Works with regards to road infrastructure.

Honourable Minister I do have two points for consideration, and then also concern and then a question. But before that let me air my disappointment, with the little that is going the way of the //Karas and Hardap Regions. Currently we only have one project running that is the Aminuis, Aranos upgrading. We know that Rosh Pinah/Oranjemund Road was just completed, but we would like to see more in the Hardap and //Karas Regions so therefore my two points from possible considerations Honourable Minister.

The first one is about the **C14 from Maltahohe to Walvis Bay**. I posed a question to the former Minister of Works and Transport last year, and I was hoping to see something in this year's books for that road. If we look at the load of heavy vehicles on our national B2 and B1 going down south,

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON VAN WYK

I think that road if it is upgraded it is going to take a lot of pressure from our B1 and B2. So I really would like the Minister to consider that at least the upgrading of that road.

Then Honourable Minister another point is the **upgrading or the maintenance of bridges** and I would like to mention here the Oanob Bridge just south of Rehoboth. That bridge is very narrow and I think last year we had about three accidents on the bridge. Every time the rails are being repaired as I said it is very narrow. You will notice the good work done at the Tsumes River and Bilas Drift and Rooi Dam so if you can also attend to Oanob Bridge those are just the two proposals.

Then Honourable Minister, another concern last year I also praised the Ministry on the maintenance on some of the **gravel roads** maybe it was a little bit too early. Some of the gravel roads Honourable Minister I noticed that maintenance groups are on the roads, but the way how they maintain, the way how the grader is operating is actually destroying some parts of the road. Maybe the D125 is a good example, and also the C24 those two roads.

Then the other concern Honourable Minister is I noticed that especially now during the rainy season the **graders** are travelling on some of these gravel roads attending to riverbeds only, and now my question is when they sent the claims to the Ministry for payment how does it work? Are the claims only for work done on the river beds or are they claiming by kilometres? If they claim by kilometres then something is wrong somewhere, because nothing is done on the roads only at riverbeds?

Then the question Honourable Minister on your technical document on page 12 it is mentioned about the **commuter train services** and there is one mention of commuter train services Windhoek to Rehoboth, now this is a project some time ago motivated by SWANU and we fully support it. I however, Honourable Minister have a concern that this project will not realise in our lifetime (*Interjection*) on page 12 of your technical document.

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: But on which topic?

HON VAN WYK: Commuter train services Windhoek to Rehoboth. Now Honourable Minister in the previous MTEF there was a project 18787 the upgrading of B1 from Windhoek to Rehoboth. I would like to find out what happened to this programmed because it is not in the current MTEF. In the previous MTEF there was N\$100,000,000 budgeted for, the feasibility study was done and I think last year some of the money was viremented to another project, and now the programme has totally disappeared from the Budget book. I just want to find out what is the situation there, will it come back because I believe that for now that is a short-term solution to attend to the transport problem between Rehoboth and Windhoek. That is my short contribution.

Thank you very much.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Van Wyk. I recognise the Deputy Speaker.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you very much for the Floor Deputy Chairperson. I also need to congratulate the Minister for his new portfolio, complicated, difficult but I should think he will bring the change.

Now my comment briefly is on Programme 02, **the provision and upgrading of railway network**. Perhaps I will just take over where the other colleague has commented on, and I would like to ask through you the question of **TransNamib**.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON PROF KASINGO

What kind of diversification have they introduced, more than 20 years since Independence? I know that TransNamib changed Chief Executive Officers, from one to another, and one of the Members of Parliament here was also working for that institution (*Interjections*) Honourable Kavekatora. Now I would like to know what kind of diversifications the other Member of Parliament has commented on how dangerous the taxis are now within the capital city?

I would also like to add to say that at least TransNamib must also think in terms of introducing a tram. A tram coming from Goreangab Dam there, because it is where the majority of University of Namibia (UNAM) students and Namibia University of Science and Technology (NUST) students are staying, and those are the students who are really victims. Young girls are victims of their boyfriends, taxi drivers, and all of a sudden today in newspaper there was also a male student who was attacked in the taxi.

Can you imagine, suppose now if TransNamib introduces a tram from there, and it drops students to NUST and UNAM I should think there could really be assistance to these people. We are talking of Vision 2030, and that vision is just near the door. Somebody has also talked of the bullet train from Windhoek to Rehoboth and also from Okahandja, what are these people doing? These Chief Executive Officers from one to another what kind of innovation are they introducing to TransNamib? That is that.

I would also like to know Honourable Minister, some of us took part in the railway to the North to work, I would like to know how many and how frequent is that railway being used by the ordinary passengers? For example during the December holiday, it is public knowledge that a lot of passengers are just waiting for buses and that, what kind of mechanisms are they using to market their services because after you introduce a product you must market it? I would like to know how many people are using this railway from Windhoek to Ondangwa, Oshakati to Oshikango.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON EKANDJO

The other one is on the programme of 07 Centralised support Services administration, Honourable Minister you have already commended on that and the other people, to me I just want clarity. Whenever I pass **Government Garage** to Pick'n'Pay to buy, I just see a lot of these cars, are they being used or what are they waiting for? I should think I would like to propose that before such type of car reach their life span they should be auctioned, so that at least the Government can get something, now they are just standing there and I do not know, I would like to know “kutcha” (whether) are they from the Region or what are they doing?

Finally all of us, we should ensure that we cut costs. I would like to humbly, Honourable Minister to gradually reduce the assigned transport to the Government officials so that we can save something I would like to explain more on one on one. With this I support the Vote.

DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Deputy Speaker. May I recognise Honourable Jerry Ekandjo.

HON EKANDJO: Thank you Comrade Deputy Chairperson. Comrade mine is just a few remarks.

First of all I just want to talk about because here, if one reads at page 3 of the technical document 4.1, **Construction of 120 kilometre road**, okay 4.5 No new railway line to be constructed in line with the SADC axle load recommendation of 18.5, except to commence with the construction of Oshakati Railway. Let me just first say that, the current locomotives we have run at 80 kilometres per hour. It is 80 kilometres, so it means even if I have to go to Walvis Bay or to Oshakati or to Keetmanshoop, I have to prepare myself for two days in between, between Windhoek and Walvis Bay. That is why people make use of road transportation. Namibia is one of the few countries in the world that makes use of road transportation and

as such, we have got a high number of road accidents because that is the only road transportation we have in the country. The only transportation is road. Now to make use of trains can we not maybe think of electrifying trains so that it can run up to 200 to 300 kilometres per hour, and also if it runs at the current situation if we introduce those trains (*Interjection*).

HON MEMBER: Bullet trains.

HON EKANDJO: Bullet trains it will also cause accidents especially in the communal areas because we have got cattle, people, while you are looking you want to cross, you do not see anything, and if you cross the next moment you just hear ‘whoosh’, the train has passed. In other countries, I even saw it recently in Kenya, they have railway on pillars up there, and the cars and the cattle and the goats can pass under. If maybe the Government can do through the Ministry per year, we Budget Ten billion, (N\$10,000,000,000) just to build, to start from Karasberg. (*Intervention*)

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Honourable Members can we listen?

HON EKANDJO: Every year we Budget N\$10,000,000,000 to build pillars within 20 years (*Intervention*).

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Honourable Shanghala please can we listen.

Yes please you do not have the Floor.

HON EKANDJO: Within 20 years we could have covered the whole country. I think we must think about that, or to build at the crossing road over the rail bridge, so that we build roads over and people, cars and whatever can cross over the bridge something like that maybe, because the current now Christmas is coming, people will be left there all over Namibia. We make use of road transport. We can build these dual carriage highways, but dual carriage highways will only minimise head-on collisions but not overturning. Nice cars, nice roads, nice new cars, I will drive 160 to 200 kilometres per hour, because if we are to rely on dual these dual carriages between Windhoek up to Okahandja this was started in 2015, and should reach Otavi, but is still at Dobra. I do not know when it will reach Otavi. So the only solution to minimise road accidents is by making use of trains. Let us improve, so that the train we can have even 200 kilometres per hour or 100 kilometres per an hour, you will see when we make use of trains and we must just, if countries have it why not Namibia? We must really think how we can.

Also here we talk of wide gauge railway, for more than ten years we have been talking about the Trans Kalahari Railway to bring coal from Botswana to the harbour, and that we have to build wide gauge railway lines because ours is narrow, so I think we must also think about that so that we can match with the rest of SADC, it is for ten years that plan is on the idea these wide gauge. I think we should now.

Coming to the commuter rail, I just want to correct Honourable Van Wyk. This idea of constructing Windhoek/Okahandja commuter train, Windhoek/Hosea Kutako, Windhoek/Rehoboth and Windhoek/Khomasdal and Katutura it started late when late Hampie Plichta was a Minister, not SWANU now now, Maamberua came now. The first Minister of Works was Comrade Marco Hausiku, and then followed by late Richard Kabajani, the two never got time, when Comrade Marco Hausiku was Minister of Works and late Kabajani, there was no such an idea. When

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON EKANDJO

the late Hampi Plichta was Minister of Works that where this idea originated, and then after him it was Honourable Moses Amweelo, Honourable Nickey Iyambo, the idea was still on the table. Honourable Errki Nghimtina it was still on the table. Honourable Katali it was still on the table, and with Comrade !Naruseb I do not know, that is now when SWANU brought it up. But it does not mean SWANU, Honourable Maamberua came now. If you come today in the Parliament and something is brought up, do not think it started there, first go to the Hansard and make a research. It started with late Hampi Plichta these commuter trains not SWANU, do not try to come and score political points here it started with SWAPO (*Applause*) It started with SWAPO not SWANU just take it that way. I think you got my point.

We are talking here about roads and railway lines. I think if we are to really construct railway lines all over the country, from Katima Mulilo to Cape Fria to Opuwo all over the country, including the tarring of roads, the issue of taxes, VAT, licence fees, royalties, we will never, we must just think of proper utilisation of our mineral resources. Let these companies who are mining instead of their social obligations they just donate two computers there, one computer, three computers, let us give them, instead of a computer, let them construct we give them years, railway, let them contribute railway and tarred road then we will, but I will say much (*Intervention*).

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Is it a Point of Order?

HON NAUYOMA: On a Point of Order, Honourable Ekandjo, let me ask you a small question?

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON EKANDJO

HON EKANDJO: Yes.

HON NAUYOMA: My question is with regards to all these nice ideas that you are talking about, are you telling me or us that all these people when they move around the countries because every time our people are out there. Are they not learning how these things are done? How electrified trains are running up and down in other countries. In China they have even gone up to mechanised trains. I think our people do not know about these things or we do not have money for this?

HON EKANDJO: I do not think you must come and make political points here (*Interjections*) you are making a political whatever for RDP, or what is it?

HON MEMBER: APP, it is what it is called.

HON EKANDJO: Okay APP. (*Interjections*)

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Honourable Jerry continue.

HON EKANDJO: I think we must just make use of (*Indistinct*) because countries like Japan, do not have minerals but they are progressing.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON EKANDJO

The other thing is *Western Bypass* I have been saying this on many occasions. Currently the Western Bypass starting from where the dual carriage highway started at Brakwater up to the roadblock in the south. That highway belongs to the Ministry of Works and as a result there are *(Interjections) (Intervention)*.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: No can we have order and listen to Honourable Jerry Ekandjo.

HON EKANDJO: There are many road accidents because there are no lights. I have said it on many occasions even here that maybe, the Ministry of Works and the Local Authority, the City of Windhoek maybe with the Ministry of Urban and Rural Development must come together to hand over that Western Bypass to the City of Windhoek. Once the City of Windhoek takes charge they will put lights, because currently there are no lights. A lot of accidents especially if you cross there at Concordia and this side of IUM people are dying. You just drive there and you see somebody wearing dark clothes even the other day I almost ran over a person, so I think *(Intervention)*.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Can we avoid mini meetings for Honourable Jerry to conclude.

HON MEMBER: Are you talking to me?

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON KATOMA

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: No I am not talking to you I am saying can we avoid mini meetings. Why are you responding? Please. Yes Honourable? Honourable Muharukua please?

HON EKANDJO: So I think the Ministry of Works and Local Authority must come together and see how they can hand over that Western Bypass to the City of Windhoek they will take charge, and then they will minimise the accidents they will put lights there. Currently they said they cannot put lights there because it does not belong to them, but the people are dying.

Lastly coming to the **Hosea Kutako International Airport**, I think our Chairperson of the Parliamentary Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs, Defence and Security, once they table the Motion, we will discuss only the issue of buses and whatever because the Report is coming. I wholeheartedly support. I know that the Minister is hardworking, he will definitely improve on something so I thank you Comrade Mutorwa I support your Vote more than 100%.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you. Can I recognise Honourable Katoma?

HON KATOMA: Thank you Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee. (*Interjections*)

HON MEMBER: Honourable Katoma, come here.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON KATOMA

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Yes, it is ready now.

HON KATOMA: Okay thank you for the Floor. I rise to support Vote 24 Transport, and I would like to commend the Ministry of Works and Transport for good work done through this Vote thus far. However, I only have one small question. That small question Honourable Minister is about the issue of the road between *(Interjection)* *(Intervention)*.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: No you have the Floor please.

HON KATOMA: Between Tsandi, Onesi and Epalela to bitumen standard. I have posed this question even last year. The Honourable Minister !Naruseb responded to me that, in as far as he was remembering there was some money allocated to this project, but then maybe in the process it was diverted to some other project.

Now I would like to know as to whether this project is still on cut or it has fallen out completely because, I was perusing through I cannot find it indicated in any documents and as the road stands now it is a very bad road, slippery with a lot of potholes and it is not accessible during the rainy season.

Honourable Minister I would like to know the status of this project whether it is still on cut or it has fallen out completely?

Thank you.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON SIOKA

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you. I recognise Honourable Sioka.

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: Thank you very much.

HON MEMBER: Microphone?

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: The microphone is on. Thank you very much Honourable Deputy Chairperson. (*Interjections*) Yes thank you very much Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, I am really very much proud of you Comrade Minister starting from the list I had who works in the Ministry of Works, they have done a lot and really everybody now is talking about infrastructure, roads we need it to be this way, we need it to be that way. You know since Independence it is when we have started talking. Before we could not say anything we had no road.

I remember 1989 when I came from exile when I went to Ibbu there was no road, they had to stop because they were carrying these things from exile, and they had to cut trees to make a road for me with the cars they took me in to the area. So really colleagues sometimes we should appreciate what is coming on, blaming will not serve us anything but advice will help us, because all the blaming we are shifting on the Ministry of Works, really it will not help. There are lots of plans the in pipelines where we are going to do something as Government led by SWAPO. Do not be frustrated colleagues, I know that now you are buying your cars in good conditions and it will be driven in good roads which the SWAPO Led Government has introduced. So the infrastructure

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON BEZUIDENHOUT

of Namibia to tell you the truth is one of the best in Africa. It is one of the best we should appreciate that. (*Applause*) With this I support the Vote.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you I recognise Honourable Steve Bezuidenhout. Honourable Steve Bezuidenhout you have the Floor.

HON MEMBER: Is the light still on? (*Laughter*)

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Honourable Steve Bezuidenhout, you have the Floor.

HON BEZUIDENHOUT: Thank you very much Honourable Deputy Chairperson. I have got only one simple question on **air transport administration** page 7 Programme 4. Are there any plans to regulate joined air transport regulations and the Civil Aviation? Joined transport.

Thank you very much?

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: May I recognise Honourable Kavekatora.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON KAVEKOTORA

HON KAVEKOTORA: Thank you very much Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee. Thank you very much for the opportunity. I am glad that I can make a contribution to this very important Vote. I just want to make a few comments if the Honourable Minister is going to pay some attention to me. I think I am glad that Honourable Ekanjio has become a backbencher, because the ideas are very fruitful.

Now Honourable Minister, I just have a few questions and remarks to make. One is about the whole **planning process of some of the projects** that are being run by the Ministry of Works and Transport. There was a situation in Kunene Region at a river called Oute. All these years that river is a very strong river between Opuwo and Etanga, and they have been supplying culverts on that river, and every time the rain comes and the water flows through that river those culverts could not stand the strength of the water and they just washed away all the time and that to me is a problem with the planning aspect that is one, and I think something needs to be done about that. The last investigation that I did, I was informed that that is now getting a proper bridge that is what I was told, but I am not too sure whether that is actually what has happened.

Secondly, we, as a Member of the Economic Committee, there was a point where we interrogated RCC on a road that was supposed to have been constructed 21 kilometres and the contractor completed only two kilometres of the 21 kilometres, and the contractor ended up getting more than 50% of the N\$47,000,000 that was allocated for that particular project. Now when we interrogated the manager of RCC, she made the following comment, "*Honourable Members you must understand that sometimes we are being told to give projects to our people*" and I wanted to go into interrogating this, 'our people'. Who are these our people (*Intervention*).

HON MEMBER: I need to respond.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON KAVEKOTORA

HON KAVEKOTORA: Now I am getting an answer from the Minister on the other side, but I did not get the same answer from the manager that I was interrogating. The point that I am trying to make is that that is where the Honourable Minister will have to look into because, sometimes we give projects knowingly to people whom we know do not have the capacity to complete that project because they are ‘our people’ and something like ‘our people’ sometimes reminds me to some of the phrases that we used to know like ‘they are jobs for Comrades’ and all these types of things. I think from that perspective I just want to as a new Minister I just want to, and I also want the Minister to succeed. I just want to alert the Honourable Minister about some of these developments.

My third remark is about the **allocation to State Owned Enterprises**. I am glad to read in the Minister’s speech that there is a material allocation to the upgrading of the railway network. That is why you find Honourable Members asking questions about the utilisation of the railway from Tsumeb to Ondangwa, because that railway rightly so, is a relatively new railway but it is hooked to a totally dilapidated railway, and the Honourable Ekindjo spoke about a Cape gauge and a standard gauge and just as a reminder, I want to make the following comments. When we talk about some of these things we are talk in order to also assist the Minister to save money.

There was a scenario where a SWAPO Government went to China to buy locomotives, and those locomotives that they bought from China the first five that were bought could not fit on our railway system. They collected dust here, so I think we just have to, I remember Honourable Katjiongua was saying when you live in a glass house do not throw stones. So do not throw stones.

On the State Owned Enterprises Honourable Minister on page 357 of the Estimates of Revenue and Income and Expenditure there is an allocation to two State Owned Enterprises that I want to make a comment on. It is N\$740,000,000 as my colleague has said allocated to Air Namibia, and then N\$171,000,000 allocated to TransNamib. What I do not know is whether a business case was made out of these two allocations, and when I

am saying business case I want to help you not to throw money around because you are not an economist by tribe, you are a lawyer by tribe. I intuitively find these two allocations very problematic in the following sense. Air Namibia over the years has been a bottomless pit, with turnaround strategies left, right and centre. In recent years Air Namibia was facing, and is still facing a very tough competition from some of the most competitive airlines in this world, and that they were allowed to fly in similar routes, in the same routes as Air Namibia.

So effectively what that meant from an economic financial perspective was that, the competitiveness of Air Namibia has dropped significantly because of introduction of competition within the market in which Air Namibia is operating. So it is becoming more of a bottomless pit. Now to put in N\$740,000,000 in a dying airline, dying in the sense that sometimes you find five people flying from here to Johannesburg on Air Namibia, while all the other Airlines are fully booked so I think from that perspective that is where my question really comes in because it was the Government decision that took (*Interjection*).

HON MEMBER: There is a Point of Order there?

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE
COMMITTEE: Point of Order, yes?

HON KAVEKOTORA: What order? He is a lawyer by tribe.

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: May I ask a small question?

HON KAVEKOTORA: No ask a big one.

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Okay let me ask a big question. The question is that why is money being put in a bottomless pit? I am wondering, year in year out political parties are campaigning and they are never winning elections, should we stop putting money in those political parties (*Laughter*)?

HON KAVEKOTORA: I would have given you a proper answer but you do not want to get it but the answer is very simple as far as I am concerned, when you talk about ‘we’ when you are referring to money and you say ‘we’ that is a myth because that is not your money, that you must know from the word go. So my question really is related to that too. Should it not be proper to spend money that will have a return on investment in the long term, more into TransNamib as opposed to Air Namibia, because the return on investment will be higher with TransNamib in the long term compared to spending money with Air Namibia? Then there is also a value for money question because money for Air Namibia does not generate the value that one would expect. That is on page 357.

Now this question Honourable Minister I am asking you this question because I know that you are one of those people who really tries to provide with quantitative and qualitative information all along comparatively speaking. (*Interjection*)

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: “*Okuhepa mundu wandje*” (thank you my friend)

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON //GOWASES

HON KAVEKOTORA: This is an ongoing problem and some of the Minister did not even bother to answer this question. It is on page 353 of the Estimates of Revenue and Income Expenditure.

Last year when we had the Budget of last year, there was an amount that was allocated to an account called ‘Others’, like ‘other people’, other political party like the South West African People’s Organisation. That amount has now skyrocketed to N\$406,000,000.

Honourable Minister I do not think that you would be able to itemise it now, but a humble request to you is that could you please itemise that amount for us to know, because ‘Others’ like any miscellaneous account is an account where you cannot have such a huge amount of money, and not only that, it is because of the fact that before the revised Budget the amount under ‘Others’ was not that significant with the Ministry of Transport and especially the Vote 24. Can you please do me a favour and itemise that amount for me and with these few remarks I support the Vote.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you. May I recognise Honourable Clara //Gowases.

HON //GOWASES: Yes it is your Vote Deputy Minister you must answer us.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: It is your Vote

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON //GOWASES

HON //GOWASES: Thank you Honourable Deputy, what is that? Chairperson of the Whole House Committee. I almost switched my light off but I think this is very important this is why I ask. Honourable Minister thank you very much for the well informative motivation statement of Vote 24, Transport.

My intervention is on page 4, Programme 01. In the development Budget Book the previous year on page 650, Project Code 18253 in Ohangwena Region, it is **construction of gravel road** from Oupili to Onkumbula (*Laughter*). Yes it is a village.

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: Is that a village?

HON //GOWASES: Yes, which was appearing in 2016/2017 and 2017/2018 Budget. Money was allocated for 2018/2019 Budget, and the periods Development Budget Book, but it is not appearing in the latest Development Budget Book.

Can the Minister explain what happened to this project? There is not even evidence of previous work done for previous Budget allocation?

I thank you, I support your Vote.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you and I now recognise Honourable John Sankwasa.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Thank you Deputy Speaker of the Whole House Committee. I am speaking as a Member of Parliament, not answering the questions read because I leave that to my able Minister. What I want to share with this House on general issues concerning transport infrastructure.

The first point is, let me even start with the issue of air transport in the country. First of all a plane or any airline does not make money from selling tickets. An economist will understand that when a person buys a ticket, he/she pays the to the airline and when he/she lands in a country or town he/she pays for the accommodation, and he/she goes for shopping therefore flying on the Airline has got a ripple effect on the economy and to say that Air Namibia therefore is a bottomless pit is an issue of lack of economic understanding and analysis because why, we need to look at what is the size of the population of Namibia.

Two – Do we have a flying culture in this country, or we have a road usage culture because people prefer more to drive than to fly because time has not become of essence to many citizens. Even to Cape Town even Members of Parliament drive to Cape Town than flying. Cabinet took a decision, a deliberate decision that all Government institutions should make Air Namibia a priority, but we have not done that because why? We prefer to drive than to fly. I am talking as an economist, because someone talked as an economist. *(Interjection)* So I respect Muharukua you are a lawyer and not an economist. You are just there to deal with cases that are presented to you so I appreciate your concern.

The issue of roads this country has already adopted like my Honourable Jerry Ekandjo has said, the country has already adopted what is called road to rail strategy. Where we have to reduce our road usage so that we reduce road maintenance that strategy is coming on board *(Interjection)*.

HON MUHARUKUA: It is only on paper it is not in practise.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: I am coming to that. Even you before you were there, there was a word. (*Laughter*) Before you were there, there was a word if you understand what I mean. The word became a human being.

HON MUHARUKUA: Yes a human being (*Indistinct*) let us think about it.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: O therefore, the issue of continuous annual Budget allocation comes in handy as a proposal that as a country, we must really go for what is called corporate planning than individual Ministry planning because why, if we have to say for example we have to revamp all the road infrastructure in this country it simply means the money will remain minimal, but then we must do a high Budget cut for certain Ministries which is going to be again a cry in this Parliament. Therefore jointly as a country and as a Government we must say which aspects are we prepared to sacrifice for the next five years, for the next ten years, so that we go for proper sectoral planning and implementation. We plan and develop per sector that will make sense.

HON MUHARUKUA: You are (*Indistinct*) right things with the wrong things.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: To everybody? Giving projects to our people started with the Budget of Works now with Transport. As Namibians for the last three years I have been in the Ministry of Works and Transport, this Government has given

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON SANKWASA

tenders to Namibians but what did the Namibians do with those tenders? They go into joint ventures including Muharukua.

HON MUHARUKUA: Aah! (*Laughter*).

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Then when they go into joint ventures they never even report on site. They are paid off by the foreign companies. To them out of a Budget for example a contract of N\$50,000,000 when they are given N\$5,000,000 which they have not worked for they go home happily with the briefcase, they never report on site. As a result this country has trouble with skills transfer because our people are not involved in the actual construction. So we have to blame ourselves as Namibians.

We are not patriotic enough to stand as Namibians, we would rather pay off this tender to a foreign company and we need to address that culture all of us. It is all of us as Namibians to realise that without patriotism we shall never get this economy right. We shall not get it right because why? I believe we are accusing Chinese, Chinese are not members of the Tender Board, now they are there members of the Ministerial Tender Committees, but how are they getting it right that they are on the tenders? That is the point it is you. It is Namibians themselves that come to the Ministries to have joint ventures but again as I said they never report on site where they are given these tenders. Therefore we must develop a patriotic nature.

HON MUHARUKUA: (*Indistinct*) in Cabinet.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: But do you sit in Cabinet, how do you know it, because you do not sit in Cabinet yourself? How do you know because why, your own contribution should come, you must speak, when we speak about sectoral planning you should not speak because you are DTA or whatever you call yourselves, but you must speak as a Namibian that every corner or economic development in this country affects us equally as citizens.

Thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you we have concluded the list. Now may I request the Honourable Minister of Works and Transport to reply?

HON MUHARUKUA: He will come for two hours.

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Thank you Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members.

Let me start with the Honourable last speaker, you see we planned before we came to Parliament strategy, so do not be surprised why he took the floor. We already planned we said if this one comes, if this question comes you come in (*Laughter*) so I thank you. I thank you more sincerely Honourable Colleague Honourable James Sankwasa for having taken the Floor to clarify some of the issues. You were there before me.

Now coming back now to the *Honourable Karupu*, your message was absolutely clear and let me respond this way, ours is a huge contrasting beautiful Namibia.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON MUTORWA

The inequalities, unequal distribution particularly dating back from before independence is still an issue that we have to deal with. The issue here to come now specific you are right, we have the Road Master Plan but we also have Regional Roads Boards. These Regional Roads Boards very important institutions from their regional perspective, to submit on an annual basis what they in their Regions regards as projects to be attended to in terms of roads construction, money being available. I am not saying that all the submissions from the Roads Boards will definitely get the funding that they require.

Sometimes the B1 like if you take some of the Regions maybe this year nothing and so forth, but your message of fairness and equity is very important. Those are principles to which this Government is committed. The President talks about the Namibian House, the President talks about inclusivity spells harmony, exclusivity spells disharmony, so those are the principles and therefore when we plan, when we Budget we must take those principles into consideration, and I am sure they are being taken into consideration and I am sure even those Regions that do not have now simple gravel roads yes it is true, and I like your analysis of saying if some have got tarred roads, maybe in terms of maintaining those tarred roads and good gravel roads the maintenance should be very firm as somebody was saying so that we go and provide to those that do not have even what you may call a gravel road.

So there I support you and as I said as from next week I will be travelling to Regions, I will also then listen to the various regional Boards, Roads Boards because sometimes these Boards do not do their work too. Sometimes you go there and say what submission did you receive from this Region, nothing, I am not going to mention any Regions for now but your message of fairness and equity is very important it is part and parcel of the Government policy.

Honourable Iipumbu, the Road Fund Administration is a State Owned Enterprise also established through an Act of Parliament but you queried what allocations are given to the Road Fund Administration, which is a justifiable query I must say,

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON MUTORWA

but the Roads Fund Administration is one of those State Owned Enterprises that has got the mandate to generate funds and then through weighbridges as some people have said, and then some of the money in actual fact all the money that is generated through them are then further distributed including to the Roads Authority the road contractor company to actually construct. Probably it is because of that that you will not see an allocation to them. Actually we expect normally, and they do so we get something from them and it is a State Owned Enterprise whose law is administered by the Ministry of Finance but we work closely together.

Yes you are 100% correct particularly with the gravel roads, but sometimes we have also seen even tarred roads, the road is finished, the rain comes and then everything is washed away. Sometimes it is poor workmanship. Sometimes with the gravel, like the recent floods we had in Kunene really there nature was just too powerful too strong, but I agree with you, maintenance of roads because we use roads daily. It must be whether the money is enough or not enough, it must be a regular activity that Board, the Local Authority Level, Regional Council level, at the national level because these are infrastructures that we use on a daily basis, actually seven days a week, 24 hours cars and trucks are running so I agree with you that we have to pay attention to regular maintenance, and not only wait until the rain has come and potholes are now too big and all of a sudden we run around, there I fully agree with you that we need to do regular maintenance. Even when there is a small damage, fix it and do not wait until it comes a big hole.

Whether vehicles are being measured at weighbridges the information available to me is this, yes but let me go and find out more details here from the Roads Authority, the people who are at task so that I can maybe later, maybe through a Ministerial Statement then disseminate the actual statistics, the physical information how many weighbridges we have, how much was generated at this one and that one particularly during the 2017/2018 Financial Year, and then that will be verifiable, concrete information that I would be able to provide then. The colleagues who are taking notes up there please make notes so that we can follow up with this

undertaking that I am now making here, I see Meme Nasheya up there and your colleague.

Honourable Mwaningange, accidents, bushes, animals, pedestrians, I do follow your logic but let me respond to this question as follows. For me as far as I am concern it is a question of obeying and respecting rules and laws. Again here it is an attitude. It is an attitude. Yes sometimes there are genuine accidents you cannot prevent accidents 100% accidents will take place, but what we are seeing nowadays sometimes is just a flagrant not obeying the rules and regulations. The other day I saw somebody and luckily he was apprehended, it is a 'he' driving in the middle of the road between Okahandja and Otjiwarongo, you know facing and he is not the only one they are so many.

If you look how some drivers are driving today, four cars in front or two or three and in front you cannot see, then here comes this fast vehicle just overtaking not even indicating, what is that? So really I think we should appeal through this Chamber rules, laws are there to regulate human conduct and human activities, but if we disobey them it is troublesome whether the roads are good.

You have a good point in terms of cleaning. I know that there are regular tenders to clean the bushes and so on, but maybe there are not all over and therefore your very patriotic advice and sometimes if we organise ourselves at regional level and say let us cut these bushes I think it will go a long way, there is absolutely no quarrel as far as that is concerned.

Then again the last point that you made is also very important. I know, maybe not in detail but I know that, between the tarred road here or the gravel road there is a certain space that is State Land, I do not know how to say it, where you are not allowed to construct anything but as you have said you are only one of those few honest people. People know I am not supposed to construct anything here, but I also know the Government will come when they evict me, no that is surely not something that we should encourage. Again I would like to say yes compensation Government has a compensation policy in justifiable instances, maybe there is a new road,

there is a school to be constructed here, a green scheme, now people have been having the mahangu fields there and therefore they have to move or the town is expanding and therefore they have to move rightly so those people have to be compensated, at least to make their burden lighter to go and construct but to just deliberately say, I am going to construct here come what as far as I am concerned, yet again we say it is greediness of human beings. It is greediness you cannot justify it. The time will come when those people who do so will not be compensated even.

Honourable Dienda, the buses at the Airport, yes there were some buses bought and those buses as you have correctly pointed out were bought with the good reason to assist passengers sometimes when it rains to access the terminals and so on, but now the information available is that some of the Airlines are not so eager because they are the ones to pay, it is part of their cost. They are not so eager to make use of the buses because they look at it that it will increase their cost. On Wednesday I am going to meet the leadership of the Namibia Airports Company, it is my familiarisation visit it is not to go and query them on this, but apart from what I have just said maybe we will get other specific reasons why those buses are parked there, and then again I undertake when we get them then we can share it with the House here, and we can use them also to see, because I agree why do you buy the things and you park them and they are not being utilised but let me hear their side of the story also which is the Airports Company. I will be meeting them on Wednesday, then I will get all the details from both sides.

Now concerning the high salaries for the State Owned Enterprises, top people like Air Namibia, maybe I should not go into the specifics because I do not know the specifics, but what I know that I can state without any fear of contradiction is that if you read the *State Owned Enterprises Governance Act* of 2006 as Amended, the remuneration of the various senior top people of all State Owned Enterprises are categorised. They are categorised into what is called TIERS. Maybe my colleague the Minister of Public Enterprises when he motivates his Budget or when we discuss his Budget maybe he can. These categories TIER 1, TIER 2, TIER 3, that part I know. If any State Owned Enterprise will go beyond what is

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON MUTORWA

allowed in a particular band or TIER then for sure there is justifiable reasons to investigate and to find out exactly as to why you went beyond. Now in this particular case again the amount that was mentioned, I want to refrain from saying that anything was transgressed until and unless I have established exactly as to what is the current situation.

Yes upgrading of railways quite a number of people have spoken about that and I am going to not only respond on what the President in the State of the Nation address made specific reference to many things but including the issue of road infrastructures and railways, and also the harbour and I want to give this, not directive but request to the colleagues with whom I work with both in the Ministry and also in the Parastatals like TransNamib.

If you look at the Development Budget there we must as a sector say thank you very much under the current economic situation that the Government has really responded to the issue of infrastructure development. I think it is N\$2,000,000,000 and something there. So we as Parliamentarians are debating these Votes, you the implementers in the Ministry and in TransNamib must already get your plans in order, because the fact is this Budget is going to be approved here and then finally in the National Council. When the Budget is approved and the President has signed this Budget into law, the year already will be maybe around July or May/June, I will not accept accuses that only 1% of the budgeted amount and the allocated amount has been spent.

So already TransNamib, the Department of Transport in our Ministry already start, check the books that we are approving here so that already you can get your plans in order. Once the Budget is signed that you already can start advertising or tendering and what have you because next year, whether it is me who will be standing here to give account to the people or anybody else that at least what we can say as far as the money that was allocated this is how we have upgraded the railway for example. I should not come here and make a story again.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON MUTORWA

I should say with the money that was allocated and approved let us go Parliamentarians or any Standing Committee go from point so and so, from this town to that town go and check the railway what they have done because we must do something. We cannot just complaint, ‘no money, no money’ do with the little and show as the Bible says I have done with the little this and therefore give me more really, that is what I can say concerning this upgrade of the railway. There is no two ways about it, Government is serious the little that we are given let us make use of it and prove and say this is what we have done, not excuses. Then we can go back to the fiscus and say if you give us more we will accelerate and do more.

Taxis, no proper regulations: Maybe I should agree with you, not because I am the Minister of Transport now. I have been around for some time, but in terms of regulations and rules and laws we have them in the Ministry there. There is also a body called the Transportation Board. I would like to be understood that I have not yet engaged them because they are responsible for this thing of taxis together with the Ministry Department obviously. I want to get more details how we are enforcing the rules and regulations because people are concerned and people are not complaining for nothing, I mean the examples that you have shown and any town that you will go people will say the same, taxis and so on but taxis are very important public transport means, but it must be descend so that somebody will get in there you should not be afraid but I will check, I will still follow up to what extend the rules, the existing rules at least are being enforced and applied.

Page 363 which SOEs. At least I can say the SOEs that are currently so far under the mandate of the Ministry of Works in terms of their specific laws, is the Airports Company, Roads Authority, TransNamib, Air Namibia although Air Namibia does not have I think it is the Company Act still then which one, Roads Contractor Company (RCC) yes, the Namibia Civil Aviation Authority is also under us. Those that I can quickly remember those are the ones that are under us, and those are the ones, through that line that you have made reference to would give some mention to do work, because most of this work that they do were supposed

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON MUTORWA

to be work done by the whole Ministry but through them, because State Owned Enterprises after all are extensions of the State. Aminuis, Aranos, road, more roads, and Hardap I heard you, but as you have heard from your colleague the Honourable Karupu, there are areas that do not have anything but I heard you. I am going to open the Aminuis, Aranos road somewhere in May. Walvis Bay, Maltahohe also I have received also some queries about this, we will have to follow up and see what are the plans and probably maybe we should not wait until next year I will give you the proper information because currently I do not have it as to what are the plans. It is an important road, touristic road.

The Oanob Bridge take care there, the question here is apparently the Oanob Bridge is in a very dilapidated state Mr Kalomo and Madam Nasheya there let us go and follow up and establish the facts, and if the facts say that this place is dilapidated that we can device plans how to upgrade or renovate whatever.

Some of the contractors instead of maintaining the gravel roads they cause more damage. Again you heard that, let us just establish the facts. You did mention two specific roads maybe after this you can just write down the names and then after this you give it to me, then we will follow up and find out exactly what is happening there. We are not denying anything but we will go and see if it is true why are they doing it if that is true?

The commuter train Windhoek/Rehoboth, I think the plans are there I have just checked with my colleague here, the plans are there. To what extent they are going to be implemented, how far I can only make an undertaking but the plans I know are there, both Honourable Deputy Speaker, the issue of from Katutura to here tram and so on, all those plans are there, but plans are something, practical reality is different. So I will just have to go and find out exactly where we are and then I can give proper information to the Honourable Members but the plans I can confirm.

Windhoek/Rehoboth roads, no provision this year but there was money last year and were varimented, I do not know but again I will have to, pardon me I will to, I will not say no, but I will find out and then come

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON MUTORWA

back to you.

Upgrading railway network Comrade Deputy Speaker, I think I covered that.

What has TransNamib done for the past 28 years, is a question that we must put to them. I know why this question is being asked and it is one of those things that we should also avoid. Maybe it was also during the time when my Honourable Colleague the other side was Chief Executive Officer of TransNamib (*Laughter*). The problem is that some of the State Owned Enterprises have not been giving regular Annual Reports, which Reports must go through the Cabinet to here. Now if you do not give your Annual Reports you are actually allowing people to speculate and accuse you of anything, but I have already engaged TransNamib, Air Namibia and all those, they are busy working on their Annual Reports and Financial Statements.

There is no way that you know expect, this is public money. Whatever amount is given to you, you have to account and Article 41 says the Minister is accountable as an individual to the President, to the Cabinet and to Parliament. So I fully understand the essence of the question, because people will say but what have you been doing and you have been doing a lot of things, but you do not report.

My colleagues over there listen here it is not me speaking, the Parliamentarians are speaking. I urge you let us get our Annual Reports and Financial Statements up to date, so that they come to this House as per the Constitution then people will Debate on the basis of the facts as you have presented to them, and not people to speculate. People will speculate if you do not account. I was a little bit angry but it is okay, it is down now (*Laughter*).

Railway to the North how frequent? This is also a question that I will have to follow up. I am also interested myself to the frequency. This is a question that TransNamib will tell us, how frequent is that train between Tsumeb and Ondangwa being utilised?

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON MUTORWA

I think we need a Report on that and I will respond when I get that but not now.

Centralised support services many cars, you are right, I have seen, apart from the cars that we want to repair there are some cars there may be involved in accidents and they have been standing, not only in Windhoek here all over but I have also discovered that we need to do some improvements with regards to annual auctions. Annual auctions sometimes and there are many people who will buy these things so that Government at least can get something. So you are 100% correct. I have seen it even in Agriculture, my colleague, even these things that we confiscate from the foreign products. If you go to Mururani there, timber, they are confiscated, this is money for the State but these things rot there, in front there, no it is not good.

Reduce assigned vehicles maybe we need, as you said let us talk about it and then we follow it.

Comrade Jerry Ekandjo, old locomotives upgrading, electrical. I mean we have to move with time but we are not yet there. Thank you very much that you have answered when some people wanted to take credit for something that they have not done with regards to SWANU. No it was not SWANU it was our own, and Honourable Jerry Ekandjo has helped me. I also know. I knew it also.

Honourable Katoma, Tsandi, Onesi and Epalela, my Honourable Colleague let me go into this and find out because I have also checked as you have said in there, it is not there. Tsandi, Onesi and Epalela Roads, we will have to also follow up and get the facts and then come back.

Honourable Sioka, I have worked with you for many years. I like your motherly intervention as you always support. Thank you for the support, it is true what she said sometimes we have to even if it is a small thing, appreciate it. Say Government thank you for this but, and then you can continue with your but, yes.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON MUTORWA

Honourable Kavekatora, planning process yes, the Outes strong river between Opuwo and Etanga, culverts always washed away, we will have to investigate that. Yes we have to investigate that my colleagues there.

RCC 21 kilometres road only 2 kilometres completed but a high amount of money. I do not know you did not give the details when it happened, what happened so from my training as a historian we are always cautioned not to generalise so I want to get the specifics on this one, it is only then that I can open my mouth and say, because it is easy to make the allegations they are.

Then you said that this matter or it is a different matter, the one that served before your Standing Committee where somebody told you that we allocate to our people. You know sometimes there is a contextual understanding over what the person says and the contextual one I am sure the person did not mean to say, 'This is my brother I give him the tender'. I think maybe probably in view of the affirmative action and the specific laws that are made. But if for sure the person/s appears before the Standing Committee, and then you detected that something un-normal is here. Normally Standing Committees Reports are tabled here for Debate.

I do not know whether it was raised in that Report, what the discussion was, when it was tabled here or is it still coming, if it is still coming then I will spare my bullets until that Report comes and we will take it from there. But if it is hidden that maybe people are doing irregular things we can only encourage ourselves and we are the leaders, elected leaders here.

If you detect that somebody is doing something unlawfully as leaders, we have institutions here, Ombudsman, Anti-Corruption Commission, what and what even the Minister of a specific Ministry, why do you wait until we come to the Budget Debate to raise it? That is also a question that must go back to you and I know we mean well, and if we mean well then we must also assist in trying to stop the rot and then do the correct thing, and not wait until okay when the Budget comes then I will go and ask the question. Then you are not even going to get Votes as far as that is concerned because your people whom you think you will get Votes I am

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON MUTORWA

going to convince them that do not trust that man he does not act. That is now on a political level I am trying to disarm you.

HON MEMBER: But when you hear what the Vote is for, you try to
(Indistinct)

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: The locomotives from China, when I paid a visit to TransNamib together with my colleague there. I was briefed that is what happened, but I can also inform the general public through this House that there are some corrective measures that are to be done to deal with this issue, particularly now that we are looking at the upgrading of the railway and so on and so forth, but I do not want to venture into what happened and how did it happen, I was not there.

Allocations of Air Namibia, bottomless pit. *Honourable Sankwasa* did explain. Patriotism, but of course patriotism not at our expense, understand me correctly, when things are wrong are wrong then we have to come in, but generalisation also is not good.

Bottomless pit, whether you asked a specific question whether the business cases were made, what I know even in the preparation of the Budget is a lengthy process. Ministries, Offices will start with their own needs there inside, and then it is brought to the Treasury. Now at Treasury at both the technical level you are asked questions to justify why do you want these allocations, and it does not stop there even at the political level, Minister of Finance will convene meetings with Ministers so that you justify and explain so that eventually when an allocation is made that we are now debating here, they must have been preceded by specific arguments to justify and to convince the Treasury that yes let us allocate this amount there.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 24**
HON MUTORWA

So I would like to believe that cases were made and arguments were made that justified eventually that whether you agree with the argument is a different matter, is a different Debate. But I cannot see that an amount is just given just like that there must be. Treasury, Ministry of Finance expects Ministries to justify and motivate.

N\$406,000,000 you say on page 333, I will go and investigate that one, is it page 333 the one that we need to itemise?

HON KAVEKOTORA: 353.

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: 353, yes I will have to investigate I do not know but I will come back, 353 yes.

Gravel roads in Ohangwena, again Honourable Member let us go you are saying the verimentation, I would like to go and check. You see when you are new do not try to know everything, but my people are there we will go and find out. There must be reasons if the money was budgeted for, but now it does not appear there must be explanation. The explanation should be there and I will go and get those explanations and then we can take it from there.

So Honourable Members, thank you very much. Roads are important, trains and what have you.

Thank you for your support.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Minister. Any objection?

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 26**
HON DR ANKAMA

Agreed to. I put Vote 26 – “**NATIONAL PLANNING COMMISSION**”. Any discussions? I recognise Honourable Ankama.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE OFFICE OF THE PRIME MINISTER: Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee I have two points to make.

One is on page 2. The first one is to appreciate the National Planning Commission. I am one among those who have been making a lot of noise on research and data collection. Now the macro-economic research and data collection response to my question for all these past years. I have been making noise on these issues. One was on data collection so that we create a unity for the whole country, a centralised data unit for the whole country.

The other one was, I will not talk about it, and that is the one on Public Service, you know about that I have been making lots of noise, but this one I am very happy. I am happy because you know why I am having this little thing, I am showing you because there is on my i-pad, if you look I mean I do not know whether you people have done it. The data, the unit yes you have it on your i-pad, if you want, the Namibia Statistics Agency (*Intervention*).

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Honourable Ankama just present your case otherwise, we will not see you are far from us, please.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE OFFICE OF THE PRIME MINISTER: What I am trying to say is there is the Namibia Statistic Agency is now accessible, it is centralised and you can, on the tip of your

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 26**
HON DIENDA

finger you can get all the information you want on the data. Now having all this we should appreciate the work that the National Planning Commission has done. I would then question because when we have got all the necessary information on your fingertips, what is needed is with all the reagents that we have do we have at least one or two Capital Projects that continuous in terms of funding so that after 20 years, after 40 years we can say yes we have got something significant that we have accomplished within the 20 years or within the 40 years because this was a continuous budgeting process. Do we have something like this or we just Budget for one year, two years, three years? I just want to see that there should be. You see each Region is unique, and the uniqueness of the Region presents some challenges there. It could be drought, it could be flood, it could be anything else.

Now with this if we identify specific regional challenges, and we identify among those challenges only one or two that is continuous in terms of funding, after a couple of years we will be able to accomplish but if we do have short term it may not necessarily become something significant and it will definitely haunt us in the long run?

So that is my question and I support the Commission.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you. I have, who is next? Honourable Dienda.

HON DIENDA: Honourable Deputy Chairperson, I think my thoughts are the same as of Honourable Ankama. I also wrote here that the **National Development Plans** we need feedback on it. We are moving from one plan to the other plan without knowing what the challenges were, where we failed and how far we are so that is something that we need.

Now Honourable Van der Walt page 389, just one question to you Honourable I do not know, your Office refreshments from N\$50,000 to

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 26**
HON SANKWASA

N\$101,000 what is your motive here? From N\$50,000, no, Honourable it is double we must save costs, and if we as Politicians are budgeting for refreshments in our Offices double it then something is wrong with us.

Thank you Honourable.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you the last one I am having on the list is Honourable James Sankwasa.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Thank you very much Honourable Deputy Speaker of the Whole House Committee. I looked at the motivation of the National Planning Commission, and as a citizen of this country I have observed in the past 28 years that Zambezi Region and Ohangwena, and other northern Regions are annually affected by floods. As a result we have been doing flood relief for three months. Then down the line after two months we come back again we talk about drought relief, how are we planning for this as a country? And how sustainable are these programmes of buying food for drought relief and for flood relief, how sustainable is this programme and for how long shall government continue with it?

Is it difficult to harvest water and use it during the dry season when we have plenty of it, because I believe that we can become a laughing stock in the international community that we take and say we have too much come and remove us because we are drowning? Two months down the line we are too dry bring water again, how are we planning National Planning Commission? Can you give direction to this country on this issue?

Thank you.

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 26**
HON KAVEKOTORA

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you and I invite now the Deputy Minister to reply.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF ECONOMIC PLANNING:
Honourable Deputy Chairperson, thank you. Can everybody hear me?

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Honourable Deputy Minister, can you just hold on for five minutes there is one Member who wanted to pose a question?

HON KAVEKOTORA: Thank you very much Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, mine is very simple question.

DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Yes?

HON KAVEKOTORA: The question, I just need to understand these two planning tools. We have the NDP5 and then we have Harambee Prosperity Plan. The Harambee Prosperity Plan and NDP5 are running concurrently in the same period, with the exception perhaps of one year. I just want to understand the relationship between two short-term plans that are running concurrently that is question number one, how do you manage that?

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 26**
HON VAN DER WALT

Number 2. The question, in view of the fact that Harambee Prosperity Plan is running concurrently with NDP5, which of the two planning tools are actually informing the performance agreements of the respective Ministers.

Thank you?

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Yes Honourable Deputy Minister you have the Floor.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF ECONOMIC PLANNING: I thank you Honourable Deputy Chairperson. I think I expected these type of questions before hand, so I prepared.

If I start with *Honourable Ankama*, the Namibia Statistics Agency (NSA) is a fairly new institution, entity on its own and we already can see the output of the Namibian Statistics Agency. We are busy improving a lot. To me and what I also want all the Members of Parliament to understand is, the sun goes down and it takes time for it to come up again. So we are busy moving forward progressively, with the money available, the Budget available.

Secondly, I want to inform the Members of Parliament that this Ministry is directly under the President, and our main objective is to exercise through monitoring and evaluation all the Ministries. We need as National Planning Commission to have all the Ministries working hand in hand with our Ministry, because we are the ones who need to deliver Reports to the President are our plans for this year and for the future, NDP5 to come back to *Honourable Kavekatora*, and the Harambee Plan you may say you do not understand, do they work together or not? Of course they work together. But what we need is we need as National Planning Commission, we need quarterly Reports from all our Ministries so that we can compile a Report which we can deliver to the Office of the

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 26**
HON VAN DER WALT

President which can enter into Cabinet. So what we need is a Report and we as National Planning Commission would like to see that all the Ministers whatever plans there are, and projects and developments that we want to take place in this country, needs to end up at National Planning Commission, tabled at the (*Indistinct*) meetings that is where they need to end up, and then we can sit down and discuss it and say what is the priorities? It does not help we take on new projects when we have not finished with the old ones, and we need to work together all of us.

So what I urge all the Ministries is to work together with the National Planning Commission, because my Minister is going to have problems if he does not report back to the President, what is going on in the Ministries, which developments are taking place. As Honourable Mutorwa said, it is not the Ministries who sit there and allocate the tenders to certain people around the tenders. So we do not know sometimes where there is corruption and where is not corruption (*Laughter*). Yes, but if we are working together and we receive the Reports which we need to receive in the (*Indistinct*) meetings, and we can discuss it properly and work through it, then we can come to the conclusion where our President leads a corruption free Namibia and that is where we will go forward. (*Interjections*)

Capital Projects, *Honourable Ankama*, you also talked about long-term and short-term developments (*Intervention*).

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Can we have order and listen?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF ECONOMIC PLANNING: There is nothing in life if we do not plan ahead to build the Neckartal Dam it would have been 80% complete by now. The harbour there are many projects. I am actually very proud of our Government, if I look at the road construction which is taking place at the

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 26**
HON VAN DER WALT

moment, the infrastructural buildings, it does not matter of the economic situation we are in, our Budget is cut for planning and development, it was N\$7,900,000,000 last year, it is now N\$7,300,000,000 but we must come right with less, and this will improve and if we can fight corruption and we work together for the nation in combination with each other then I can tell you we will lift up this economy of our country in the next five years that we do not believe.

The other thing which is very important which I just want to answer and then I am finished. If anyone else wants to question then to answer I will do but then I think I have said enough (*Laughter*).

We are now classified as an upper middle class income development country, so we do not receive donors so much anymore from different countries. They closed up their offices. So let us work together with those we have, hand in hand. Hand in hand talk and work together with these people and show them that we as the Namibian Government know and treat the money with respect into the right directions.

I thank you. (*Applause*)

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Deputy Minister of the National Planning Commission. Honourable Members any objection? Agreed to.

I shall report progress and ask leave to sit again.

ASSEMBLY RESUMED:

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Honourable Deputy Speaker, I report progress and ask

23 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 26**
HON DR ANKAMA

leave to sit again.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you. Order! We have come to the conclusion of today's deliberations so the House is adjourned till tomorrow 14:30.

HOUSE ADJOURNED AT 20:45 UNTIL 2018.04.24 AT 14:30

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS
WINDHOEK
24 APRIL 2018**

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON SPEAKER took the Chair and read the Prayer and Affirmation.

**ANNOUNCEMENT IN TERMS OF RULE 20
(B) OF THE STANDING RULES AND ORDERS**

HON SPEAKER: Welcome back. Honourable Members I wish to bring to the attention of the Honourable Members you might have taken note when you cast your eyes a little bit higher than the four walls of the Chamber in the public gallery. There I wish to acknowledge 33 of our students from the Ogongo Campus of the University of Namibia who are here. (*Applause*) They have time to come and visit us here in order to families themselves with the legislative processes at their Parliament. I think that is an important step. We very much welcome you. We value the fact that you have taken time to make it your business to get to know the law making process in your Parliament, our Parliament. So please fell welcome to Parliament of the Republic of Namibia. Take note of what we are doing. One of the many, many days to come who knows that you are going to lend up here, and you would be expected to do what is expected of you as a new Parliamentarian, work according to the rules of the House in terms of maintaining our hard won democracy. Thank you for being here welcome. (*Applause*).

HON SPEAKER: Any Petitions? Reports of Standing and Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Oh, Deputy Minister of Finance.

24 April 2018

**TABLING OF REPORTS
HON ITHETE**

TABLING - REPORTS OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE: Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members I lay upon the Table the Reports of the Auditor General in account of:

1. Municipality of Swakopmund for the Financial Year ended 20th June 2016;
2. Municipality of Otjiwarongo for the Financial Year ended 30th June 2017;
3. Municipality of Mariental for the Financial Year ended 30th June 2017;
4. Municipality of Henties Bay for the Financial Year ended 30th June 2017; and
5. Town Council of Helao Nafidi for the Financial Year ended 30th June 2017.

I so Move Honourable Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice of questions? Honourable Dienda, yes.

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS

QUESTION 48:

24 April 2018

**NOTICE OF QUESTIONS
HON DIENDA / HON VAN DEN HEEVER**

HON DIENDA: Thank you Honourable Speaker. Honourable Speaker I give Notice that on Thursday, the 7th of June 2018, I shall ask the Minister of Home Affairs and Immigration the following.

Honourable Minister I want to thank your Ministry Home Affairs for issuing birth certificates at hospitals job well done. Noticing Honourable Speaker that families have to attend to so many issues when death occurs, will the Ministry consider the issuing of death certificates at hospitals too. To save time and resources the family has to spend on trying to acquire birth certificates?

I so Move Honourable Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Next is Honourable Jennifer Van Den Heever.

ORAL QUESTION

QUESTION 16:

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: Thank you Honourable Speaker I would like to ask an oral question to Honourable Namoloh Minister of Safety and Security. It is little bit urgent. Honourable Minister I would like to know yesterday. I think the day before yesterday a video circulated on social media whereby three robbers during daylight, robbed three cars in front of butchery in Khomasdal. Crime is really escalating and it is increasing on a daily basis whereby even young children are involved.

I would like to know when the Minister will deploy police officers on these notorious corners.

24 April 2018

**NOTICE OF QUESTIONS
HON NAMOLOH**

Recently you also had a meeting apparently I am not really certain of the fact that, but it was a meeting between yourself as Ministry and these gangsters. So we think that the Ministry or the police force knows these people these guys who are committing these crimes and it is really worrisome. I intended to move back to Windhoek, but I think I will stay in Rehoboth. It is safer there. Windhoek is really, really becoming a city and the City Police I do not think they are efficient enough because they might have also crisis of resources and offices so I would really plead that the Minister should look. Maybe we should call in your Colleague and ask Honourable Ndakolo to assist you from the Defence Force so that these crime activities can be curbed. Somebody must do something. It is really worrying.

HON SPEAKER: Honourable Member you referred to notorious corners. In fact in the City of Windhoek in terms of our strategy of policing and maintaining law and order, there must be places that we can identify to say we need a police presence, and it is not just any police. People have to be trained to know how to deal with that. In some cases you do not need to have a uniform. You are invisible so that you can actually spot what is happening so Honourable Minister over to you.

RESPONSE TO ORAL QUESTION

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Thank you very much Comrade Speaker and also Honourable Jennifer for such a question. On a lighter note I think you will be safe if you also stay in Rehoboth. You will be safe in Windhoek. Criminals in all over the world they do not stay in one place. They go to this place, they strike at this place,

24 April 2018

**NOTICE OF QUESTIONS
HON NAMOLOH**

they strike at this place, they strike at this place. They have done that. Previously they were concentrated in town, inside the town here, in the city. So they were dealt with, now they have vacated to go to other places but we still follow them there. Also I think you have read, you were here listening to my speech on our Vote. I have mentioned the predicaments we have and you were here also. Some are those and I am saying it is not that we are not going to do, we are going to do the most with what we have.

We showed to you also on TV the so-called Bokoharam (*Laughter*) and other names also, Bokoharam as you said, very notorious. It is not themselves who have surrendered, they have been detected through our own means the police and all those.

It does not mean Comrade Speaker also policing, combating of crime, and you have seen we have more money on this. It does not mean only that those who are in uniform are the only police. Otherwise, we could not get these criminals. We have a lot of police and some you may think also they are criminals who are not. Some you may not know them, but they are there and they always. They are there as if they own "*kambashus*" (shebeens) as if they own what, what, they are also there, and that is why they help us to detect some of this.

We also have the women and men network. They are also working. We have also neighbourhood watches they are also working. We have also those individuals who inform those informers, who tell you this guy was here and he has run to where, he was wearing like that, like this. We have people who are helping us, but you cannot expect, there was a joke. Somebody said a policeman or a good journalist, is the one who suspects where the incident will be, and then lets the journalist to take the photo or policeman will arrest that person. It is just an anecdote. You cannot suspect where the incident will happen, but it is only through patrols and so forth, and also identifying these gangs, the way they move and so forth, so that we can follow them. It is only when you can get them, but to say (*Interjection*) there is no censorship, you see now (*Laughter*) police identification is also sensitive.

24 April 2018

**NOTICE OF MOTIONS
HON HAMBYUKA**

You want to blame it. Now what balancing is it, if you are asking that how can you combat crime here. Now when we detect these guys, these are criminals and then we have people who follow them to say they have gone in this direction. Probably there is this, there is this. We have a website City Police, the main police Windhoek Police Station and we always say and the neighbourhood watch. Watch a car, this number has gone there. We have seen these guys walking suspiciously. They may want to strike and then that is how we monitor. I asked also in our Budget that we want to buy more of the surveillance, so that if they are seen behaving suspiciously and then we can move in there so I think that I have answered your question.

Thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you very much but of course, we must give our police the full support and cooperation, be vigilant in order for us to assist with the relevant information in order to combat crimes. We leave the question there. The Minister responded (*Interjection*), yes of course.

HON SPEAKER: Notice of Motions. Deputy Chief Whip.

NOTICE OF MOTIONS

MOTION ON BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

HON HAMBYUKA: Honourable Speaker I Move without Notice that the proceedings on Votes 13, 27, 29, 32, 33, 34 and 35 of the

24 April 2018

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON SHANGHALA**

Appropriation Bill be in terms of Rule 99(c) of the Standing Rules and Orders not interrupted if still under consideration at 17:45.

I so Move Honourable Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Table the Motion.

HON SPEAKER: Messages from the Head of State? Ministerial Statements? Minister of Justice.

MINISTERIAL STATEMENT

STATEMENTS REGARDING A JUDGE AND JUDICIARY

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Thank you Honourable Speaker. Honourable Members.

It usually is a pleasure to take the Floor in this august House. This time it is not a pleasure. In fact it pains me just to be the one to put on record what I am about to speak into the records of our deliberations.

Nonetheless, I expected that at the end of the statement, this House should speak with one voice unequivocally, in terms of Article 63(2)(c) of the Namibian Constitution.

Mr Speaker,

24 April 2018

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON SHANGHALA**

The function of adjudicating in a Court of law involves a litigant coming to Court, taking another to Court and in the end, Only one of them ends up a winner in the adversarial nature of litigation before the Courts. It is therefore an unenviable task to adjudicate as by design guaranteed, someone who will always be a loser and maybe unhappy, yet it is a function which the Namibian Constitution bestows upon Judges.

Judges exercise their functions to the best of their ability and keeping with the oath they take upon appointment, to administer justice to all persons without fear or favour. They do not have malice or improper motive when they perform their tasks. It is most inappropriate therefore that anyone should attribute improper motives to what they do. It is important that the nation hears me loud and clear in this regard.

It is against convention for Judges to defend themselves. Judges are supposed to speak to the judgements only.

There is no concern that people may proclaim or manifest disagreement with certain judgements of the Courts. Indeed Judges are not beyond criticism, when such criticism is founded. My concern is rather about personal attacks on members of the Judiciary which are clearly intended to lower the Judiciary's esteem in the eyes of the public. Scurrilous statements were recently made attacking the person of the Honourable Mr Justice Maphios Cheda of the High Court's Northern Local Division.

Had those statements been made in Court, the Judiciary could have dealt with them in an appropriate manner. However, all of them have been made in the public domain outside the Court, on social media platforms. Given its constitutional position referred to earlier, the Judiciary is unable to respond thereto. It has neither the means nor the power to investigate whether these statements do not constitutes a crime, and if so to institute prosecution and bring the perpetrators to justice.

Moreover it is inappropriate for the Judiciary to participate in public Debate and to challenge the veracity of these statements in the public

24 April 2018

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON SHANGHALA**

domain. The responsibility is left to the other organs of the State and their agencies in the fulfilment of their constitutional obligation to:

“accord such systems as the Court may require to protect their independence, dignity and the effectiveness” Article 78(2) of the Namibian Constitution.

In view of the increased frequency and escalation of the attacks, the public is perception may well be that there is substance in them and in failure to respond thereto or to act thereon is likely to be regarded as confirmation of these perceptions. Again, I would like the nation to hear me loud and clear. If any member of the judiciary has misconducted him or herself, any person feeling aggrieved is entitled to bring a substantiated complaint to that effect to the Judiciary Service Commission for investigation. This is the forum created by the Namibian Constitution where complaints against members of the judiciary must be addressed. Not Facebook, not Twitter, not WhatsApp or any other platform in denigrating fashion.

Public confidence in the integrity, independence, dignity and effectiveness of the Courts is the basis on which you respect for the Judiciary is premised. It is a necessary ingredient without which Namibia as a constitutional democracy cannot effectively function. Hence, I make this statement, to seek to inform particularly young Namibians, those that have been persuaded to join in unfortunate demonstrations at the High Court at Oshakati, that this a dangerous and perilous road.

I do not take issue with your rights and freedom to association and expression – not at all, and as long as your so doing is civil. No threats of violence, no need for teargas, convince your organisers to file a complaint with the Judiciary Service Commission if there are grounds for a complaint.

If you feel there was an infringement of law, go and report a police case. If there is corruption you suspect by anyone, report it to the Anti-Corruption Commission.

24 April 2018

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON SHANGHALA**

What you should not do, and which is the basis for my statement today, do not demonise and attack the *personae* of Judges. Disagree with the ruling, and write literature and you seek to outline your views of correctness. Yet as I say, do not attack the Judiciary as an institution. Wither down the respect for the Judiciary, and we start eroding from the pillars that hold our house up tall, this house up tall. This House the Namibian House was built on the blood, sweat, tears and other sacrifices. It is not to be easily forsaken and we will protect it.

Mr Speaker,

Lastly Mr Speaker, media reports suggesting that the Judge was removed need to be corrected. In terms of Section 10(3) of the *High Court Act, 1999* (Act. 16 of 1999) a Senior Judge may request that a full bench be constituted to hear matters, which in his or her opinion are of importance to warrant that a full bench, as opposed to a single bench Court, adjudicates the matters.

This is what has happened. The matters will now proceed for trial. There are some interlocutrices, but the matters are proceeding in terms of the *High Court Act, 1999* and the Rules of the Court. No Judge has been removed.

I urge all of us, whether Members of Parliament or common folk, to exercise some degree of maturity when dealing with these matters, and certainly we should ask ourselves twice if what we do as agents provocateurs can be reversed.

I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Honourable Muharukua it has to be brief please.

24 April 2018

**QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS ON
MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON MUHARUKUA**

QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS ON MINISTERIAL STATEMENT

HON MUHARUKUA: I would beg the Speaker's indulgence because of the very topic that the Minister of Justice has raised that perhaps it would not just be prudent for me to launch straight into questions for fear of being misunderstood, and myself also being an officer of Court in other life. So I would want to perhaps elaborate a little bit on the questions that I am going to pose to the Minister.

Honourable Minister I completely and totally and agree that any personal attack on any persons *persona* should not happen, and should be dealt with in terms of the relevant provisions of especially our common law.

The question that I have to pose in that regard I assume, and I read from between the lines that you are referring to, to perhaps the altercation that happened between Judge Cheda and Job Amupanda. The question that I want to ask is:

1. I have not followed the issue that closely but what about those comments you would deem to have been so personal, and to what extent can the law that we currently have not deal with that if at all it falls within the realm of an offence in terms of both delict and criminal law.
2. It is quite right that when it comes to legal matters we have procedures that an aggrieved party should follow, but it is also trite and quite common practice that for example, when you have a bail application, that the community or the public protests, airing their view on a specific issue and such is taken into account when a ruling is being made at the end of the day.

24 April 2018

**QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS ON
MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON MUHARUKUA**

I do not necessarily suggest or succumb to the thoughts that say in civil matters such pressure should necessarily form part of the adjudication process, but the question that I want to pose, is the warning that you extended to the would-be demonstrators. I did not quite fully get amidst the comments of the teargas, the blood that was shed for the freedom. What is it actually that Cabinet and you as a member thereof saying to these people?

Are you saying that the people should not go and demonstrate a view, or are you saying when they do so, they must do so in peace?

One last aspect and it is the following. You being the Minister of Justice and I think and for all of us, when the President of the Republic makes the comment that says when dialogue paraphrasing, ‘when dialogue seizes, it is the beginning of catastrophe.’

I think we must all take that seriously. When people do not have faith in systems, they resort to self-help. Now I do not know the ins and outs of the allegations, neither do I know how substantive they are, neither do I know how credible these allegations are. I may have my personal view based on my personal experiences of personalities, but the ins and outs I do not know, but it is perhaps prudent to answer the question.

When you say people must approach the ACC, when you say people must approach X entities, state entities that are there to curb certain activities like corruption? Please and I want to be understood correctly. I have appeared in front of the Judge Cheda. I have the highest esteem of him and I do not for once doubt his integrity. In fact I as a person has always held the integrity of one – the legal Profession and our Judiciary as being of the highest esteem. In fact I think even if we have to compare ourselves to America, I think our system is better than that of America because that of America is quite partisan, just making that comparison
(Intervention)

24 April 2018

**QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS ON
MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON MUHARUKUA**

HON SPEAKER: Can I?

HON MUHARUKUA: I am finalising Honourable Speaker. Be that as it may, could it not be that these individuals who are resorting to demonstrations, self-help whatever you want to call it, just do not have faith in bodies like the ACC that you are suggesting that they should approach, because the reputation of the ACC is not stellar. It is a reputation that the ACC does not follow the big guns enough
(Intervention)

HON SPEAKER: Can we confine ourselves *(Intervention)*

HON MUHARUKUA: I just want you to take that on board and the two questions that I have asked. Honourable Speaker I am done.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you very much. I honestly want to confine ourselves to the statement and then there are three elements that you highlighted that I would like to call on the Minister to respond to and we leave it at that.

RESPONSE ON MINISTERIAL STATEMENT

24 April 2018

**RESPONSE ON MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON SHANGHALA**

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Mr Speaker thank you and the Honourable Member has asked very pertinent questions. I just like to correct the Honourable Member is commencement statement. You see altercation is when you say and I say and we exchange words. There has been no altercation. If it is one way it is not an altercation. The Judge has been the victim of the denigrating attack on his *persona* throughout the social media. This individual you mentioned was not even a litigant and the individual in question, when this individual was now of the view that people must now demonstrate and this Judge must fall and all these allegations that they made circulating on the social media did not even approach the Judicial Service Commission to which Judges are accountable, to which members of the profession, you are represented.

The Attorney General sits on the Judicial Service Commission, and I can tell you that when I sat there, we do take Judges to task. No complaint has been made so where is the loss of faith in. This is simply unprincipled behaviour. You first say there is a body take the ACC. Somebody must go and say ACC you have failed. Why did you fail and understand that when we prosecute to win is not to succeed in the conviction. To win is to have judgement served, justice served. So I cannot just simply take Honourable Muharukua. I am going to prosecute Honourable Muharukua because I am the Prosecutor General because I must get the big guns and convict you. You are entitled to justice, justice must be served.

We hear you sometimes even when you make these statements repeating what is in the newspapers. It is damaging to our institutions. Big fish, big fish, big fish, take the evidence to the Court. In South Africa you will see that some of them have decided when the Prosecutor General or the DPP then in that case refuses to prosecute, they request for a certificate of *nole prosequi* and they go and conduct the prosecution, but then they will be able to stand for the damage in reputational harm they do when malicious prosecution charges come. So we have a due process in this country. It must stop this thing of big fish, big fish. Justice must be served.

Now on the issue you raised, we are taking legal advice and we will deal with the issue. Even Judges take legal advice, even the Minister of justice

24 April 2018

**RESPONSE ON MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON SHANGHALA**

takes legal advice because my job is not to be the lawyer. It is to be the Minister of Justice. Then advice would be given and we will act accordingly.

In fact I would have said in my statement it is your fundamental freedom of expression but when it becomes a demonstration of insults of rowdiness and it hinges on disturbing the peace, then General Namoloh is people will do what they are trained to do, and then do not come and complain. I am just saying an action has a reaction, and you know as an adult that you can come to Parliament and you can make your contribution or you can stand on the table and the Speaker will deal with you.

Lastly, I urge Namibians vigilantism, self-help can almost lead us to anarchy. We are a rule of law, a democratic state arista. There are procedures. Where there are gaps it is this House's duty to fill those gaps with law, regulation. Take the law in your hands and the long arm of the law will deal with you.

We are not in a dysfunctional Republic. There is no reason for you. I said here the other day, even when staff of the Magistracy have horrible accommodation, work in the most horrific of circumstances, they show up are professional and are able to render justice to the people of this country. It is absolutely unimaginable that somebody would take the approach that these people are taking, and this mentality if as political parties, as parents, community leaders if we do not stem it, we are as I said becoming agent provocateur, in a situation that we will not be able to control.

So Mr Speaker,

I think I have rounded it up. We are happy to engage further with the Honourable Member who I think may have a platform to take the matter forward in his professional capacity.

I thank you for your attention.

24 April 2018

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON TWEYA**

HON SPEAKER: Thank you very much. The two of you are Colleagues. Any additional information you can have it over a cup of tea. I now call on the Minister of Industrialisation, Trade and SME Development Honourable Tweya.

**UPDATE ON THE NEGOTIATIONS AT
THE AFRICAN UNION LEVEL ABOUT THE
ESTABLISHMENT OF AN AFRICAN FREE TRADE AREA**

HON MINISTER OF INDUSTRIALISATION, TRADE AND SME DEVELOPMENT: Honourable Speaker Sir, Honourable Members,

I rise to provide this August House an update on the negotiations at the African Union level, among the AU Member States for the establishment of an African Continental free trade area (AfCFTA).

The Honourable Members would recall that our Pan Africanist forefathers aspired for an economically and socially integrated Africa. Therefore, today those deep founded aspirations find their expression in the provision of the 1991 Treaty as publishing the African Economic Community - commonly referred to as the Abuja Treaty which seeks to achieve, to consolidate and sustain integration at regional and continental levels in all fields of trade and the broader African integration and development agenda known as Agenda - 2063.

Subsequently, the Assembly of Heads of State and Government of the African Union took a number of decisions aimed at achieving this noble objective. Notably among those in the Assembly Decision of January 2012 adopting the Action Plan for boosting Intra-African Trade (BIAT) and a road map for the establishment of a Continental Free Trade Area (CFTA); as well as the Assembly Decision of June 2015, effectively launching the negotiations for the establishment of the CFTA.

24 April 2018

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON TWEYA**

Therefore, from the beginning of 2016, all 55 AU Member States, including Namibia, have been involved in trade negotiations for the establishment of the African Continental Free Trade Area to be operationalised by an indicative date of 2017. However,

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members,

I am therefore pleased to inform this august House that the Agreement has publishing the African continental free trade area was finally concluded and signed and the African Continental Free Trade Area eventually launched by the AU Assembly at its extra ordinary Summit that was held on the 21st March 2018 in Kigali Ruanda.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members,

The key objectives of the African Continental Free Trade Area is to boost the Africa or Intra-Africa trade. The agreement establishing the AfCFTA is therefore designed to achieve this objective by forging a single continental market, with zero or lower trade tariffs, simplified rules of origin and custom procedures, harmonise regulations for trading services and trade remedies available to would-be affected private economic players.

The AfCFTA agreement signed on the 21st March 2018 in Kigali, is a framework Agreement with three of its six integral protocols - namely the Protocol on trade in Goods, the Protocol on Trade in Services, and the Protocol on Rules and Procedures on the Settlement of Disputes that were concluded.

The other three Protocols on Investment, Competition and Intellectual Property Rights are to come in phase-2 of the negotiations, which will kick off by the end of this year.

Other important elements of the agreements such as tariff offers, rules of origin for goods, services sectors to be liberalised and other technical aspects are yet to be concluded before the agreement can be

24 April 2018

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON TWEYA**

operationalised. This means the main Agreement is completed and sealed but its operative instruments are still subject of negotiations. The framework Agreement is not self-executing. It is set out the principles, rules, rights and obligations of the parties.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members,

I should further inform this august House that on the 21st March 2018, forty-four (44) countries signed the AfCFTA agreement in Kigali, while eleven (11) countries including Namibia did not sign. However, Namibia signed the Kigali declaration together with forty-six (46) other Member States. Namibia could not sign the AfCFTA agreement in Kigali because the national process of consultation, legal clearance and approval need to be undertaken first, in line with the requirements of our national Constitution.

This is the process the Ministry is currently engaged with. I have reported and consulted the Cabinet on this matter. As a lead Ministry in collaboration with our partner Offices, Ministries and Agencies in the national negotiating team, we have scheduled the first consultation workshop with national stakeholders which will start tomorrow here in Windhoek, and Members of this honourable House are hereby further invited to attend, and others will follow series of consultations on this very same topic. The agreement will also receive legal scrutiny and clearance. Once all that is finalised, Namibia will then sign the agreement. Thereafter, I will table it to this august House for ratification when all the requirements are met.

In terms of the way forward Honourable Speaker it is important to point out that Namibia as a negotiating Party will continue to be part of the engagements among the AU Member States on the AfCFTA. The AU Heads of State and Government have therefore endorsed an AfCFTA Work Programme which stretches up to year 2020. The Ministry will periodically provide updates on the outcome of these engagements in execution of that very same Work Program.

24 April 2018

**COMMITTEE STAGE – APPROPRIATION BILL
HON SCHLETTWEIN**

Finally Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members,

Allow me to thank my counterparts and their officials or technical experts in the national negotiating team, specifically Ministries of Finance, Agriculture, Water and Forestry, Fisheries and Marine Resources, Office of the Attorney General, as well as the representatives from the private sector, who provided important input into these negotiations, and who participated and supported this process to this end. I therefore count on your continuous cooperation and support.

I thank you Honourable Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you very much so noted and we move on. Thank you.

The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

**RESUMPTION OF COMMITTEE
STAGE - APPROPRIATION BILL [B. 2 – 2018]**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Committee Stage – *Appropriation Bill* [B. 2 – 2018]

HON SPEAKER: Does the Honourable Minister of Finance Move that the Assembly now goes into Committee?

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: I Move so Honourable Speaker.

24 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 33
HON BISHOP KAMEETA

HON SPEAKER: It is moved that I leave the chair. Any objection?
Who seconds? Agreed to.

I now call on the Chairperson of the Whole House Committee to take the
Chair.

ASSEMBLY IN COMMITTEE

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
The Whole House Committee is called to order. The Committee has to
consider the *Appropriation Bill* [B. 2 – 2018]. When progress was
reported yesterday, the 23rd of April 2018, Votes 13, 27, 29, 32 had been
introduced. I beg your pardon let me repeat again. Votes 13, 27, 29 and
32 have been introduced and Votes 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 14,
15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 28, 30 and 31 had been
agreed to. Now we are going to introduce the following Votes.

Before that I will just humbly request the Honourable Ministers who will
motivate their Votes to be brief. You will agree with me for the majority
of us who have been here almost two weeks, we are now exhausted the
same applies to the interventions very short and brief.

With that understanding, I would like to put Vote 33 – “**POVERTY
ERADICATION AND SOCIAL WELFARE**” – **NS3 439 013 000** for
the introduction by the Minister of Poverty Eradication and Social
Welfare. Honourable Minister you have the Floor.

**HON MINISTER OF POVERTY ERADICATION AND SOCIAL
WELFARE:** It is my honour and privilege that I rise this afternoon to
introduce to this august House the Budget for Vote 33, Ministry of

24 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 33
HON BISHOP KAMEETA

Poverty Eradication and Social Welfare for the 2018/19 Financial Year for support, consideration and approval.

Vote 33 Budget appropriation for 2018/19 Financial Year, amounts to **Three Billion, Four Hundred Thirty Nine Million, and Thirteen Thousand, Namibia Dollars (NS\$3,439,013,000)**; And over the four years, 2018/19 - 2020/21 MTEF period, the estimated allocation for Vote 33 amounts to **Ten Billion, Three Hundred Fifty Six Million, Four Hundred and Fifty Three Thousand Namibia Dollars (NS\$10,356,453,000)**.

Allow me at the onset to thank the Honourable Calle Schlettwein, Minister of Finance and Honourable Obeth Kandjoze, Minister of Economic Planning and Director General of the National Planning Commission; and your teams, for the preparation and presentation of the Budget, given the dire challenging fiscal circumstances.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

Given the adverse global economic environment that also has a negative bearing on the local economy, I believe we can continue to *"do more with less"* resources and focus on the effective implementation of programmes that are essential to lift our people out of extreme poverty.

The Budget allocations of the Ministry of Poverty Eradication and Social Welfare takes into consideration the national call to eradicate poverty in line with the National Development Plan 5 (NDP 5), the Harambee Prosperity Plan (HPP) and the Implementation Plan of the Blueprint on wealth redistribution and poverty eradication.

The Ministry of Poverty Eradication and Social Welfare remains committed to the effective execution of its mandate, which is *to initiate, implement and coordinate social development programmes aimed at eradicating poverty and promoting the well-being of all Namibians.*"

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 33**
HON BISHOP KAMEETA

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

The Budget of the Ministry of Poverty Eradication and Social Welfare is clustered under three MTEF programmes, as follows:

- Programme 1: Provision of Social Protection
- Programme 2: Strategy Formulation and Monitoring, and
- Programme 3: Policy Co-ordination and Support Services;

I will now present the 2018/19 Budget allocation to the Ministry of Poverty Eradication and Social Welfare, while elaborating on the activities, achievements attained during the 2017/18 financial year and the requested allocation for each of the above mentioned programmes.

Programme 1: Provision of Social Protection

Social protection is one of the core programmes of the Ministry of Poverty Eradication and Social Welfare. The main purpose of this programme is to administer social grants to eligible Namibians who have attained the age of 60 and Namibians with disabilities who are between the age of 16 and 59.

The Ministry is committed to increase the coverage for the social grants in order to reach all eligible beneficiaries. In this regard, the Ministry recorded an overall increase in the number of social grant recipients from 204,621 beneficiaries in 2016/17 to 211,447 during the 2017/18 financial year. The Old Age Grant beneficiaries increased from 165,376 to 170,386, and the Disability Grant beneficiaries, increased from 39,245 to 41,061 during the period under review. Furthermore, the Ministry has implemented the increment of the social grants from N\$1,100 to N\$1,200 per month, for the 2017/18 financial year.

As the result of the announced increase in the budgetary allocation for social assistance by the Minister of Finance, the social grants administered

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 33**
HON BISHOP KAMEETA

by the Ministry of Poverty Eradication and Social Welfare will be increased by N\$50 per month to reach N\$1,250 per month, during the 2018/19 financial year.

In order to effect the social grant payment to the eligible recipients, the Ministry utilises three different payment modes; through the banks, Nampost and cash distributor, which is Epupa Investment Technology. In our strive to bring services closer to our people, the number of pay-points for the cash payment mode were increased from 1,347 in 2016/2017 to reach 1,388 at the present. The Ministry has therefore allocated an amount of **Seventy Seven Million Namibian Dollars, NS77 million** for the 2018/19 financial year, to facilitate the provision of these services.

During this financial year, an amount of Three **billion, One Hundred and Seventy Million Namibian Dollars, (NS3,170,000,000)** is allocated to social assistance transfers to old age and disability grant beneficiaries. As a proportion of the Vote allocation, social grants make up **92 %** of the Ministry's total budget allocation. An amount of **Twenty Six Million Two Hundred and Twenty Seven Namibian Dollars (NS26,227,000)** is allocated to the administration of social grants.

The Ministry pays a maximum of **N\$3,200** funeral cover per beneficiary, to ensure that social grant beneficiaries are accorded a dignified burial. A total of 7,526 funeral claims were registered during the 2017/18 financial year.

The Ministry has previously contracted a service provider to administer the payment of funeral cover claims to the undertakers. As a cost saving measure, the Ministry will directly handle payments to the undertakers effective from the 01 August 2018, upon the expiry of the contract on the 31 July 2018. The Ministry has allocated an amount of **Fifty Six Million Namibian Dollars (NS56 million)** for funeral benefits.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 33**
HON BISHOP KAMEETA

The second main activity under Programme one (I) is poverty eradication programmes, which include the food bank management programme.

The Ministry continued with the provision of dry food parcels to identified beneficiaries in the Khomas region during the 2017/18 financial year. The number of food bank beneficiaries in the Khomas region reduced from an initial 22,354 households to 15,158 to date. The reduction was a result of the streamlining of eligibility criteria for the identification of food bank beneficiaries by the Ministry, in order to cater for the people who are most affected by hunger poverty. The Ministry through the Multi-Disciplinary Research Centre (MRC) of the University of Namibia (UNAM) conducted an assessment of the food bank pilot programme in the Khomas region. The results of the assessment confirmed the positive impact made by the food bank in the lives of many who could not afford food items previously.

The Ministry started with the process of rolling out the food bank programme to other regions of the country during the 2017/18 financial year. The training of street committee members and identification of eligible beneficiaries were started in the Hardap and //Kharas regions based on the refined and streamlined criteria. The Ministry has utilised an amount of **Seventy Nine Million and Seven Hundred Thousand Namibian Dollars (NS\$79, 7 million)** for the provision of food to identified beneficiaries during the period under review. For the 2018/19 financial year an amount of **Fifty Two Million Three Hundred and Nineteen Thousand Namibian Dollars (NSS2,319, 000 million)** is allocated to the acquisition of food parcels. An additional amount of **Fifteen Million Two Hundred Forty One Thousand Namibian Dollars (NS\$15,241,000)** is allocated to the administration of the food bank programme.

The Ministry will therefore continue with the cost cutting measures to ensure that only those in dire need of food are registered. This process has already started in the Khomas region, where the street committee members are re-registering beneficiaries using the new stringent criteria.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 33**
HON BISHOP KAMEETA

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members

The Ministry has received cash donations of **Two Million Nine Hundred Fifty Seven Thousand and Five Hundred Namibia Dollars (NS2,957,500)** and in-kind donations valued at **One Hundred and Twenty Thousand Namibian Dollars (NS120 000.00)** during the 2017/18 financial year. The in-kind donations, mainly food items, were channeled to needy people through existing soup kitchens, because we regard them also as participants in the whole programme of poverty eradication and especially hunger poverty, kindergartens and other charity organizations; as we value and recognise their contribution to poverty eradication efforts in the country.

During the 2017/18 Financial Year, the Ministry has donated food items to Twenty (20) Welfare Organizations and individuals valued at **One Hundred Ninety Two Thousand, Five Hundred and Thirty Four Namibia Dollars (NS192,534.00)**. I am determined to ensure that the cash donations will be made available to eligible beneficiaries to enable them to engage in sustainable socio-economic projects, during the current financial year.

The Ministry is requesting an amount of **Three Billion, Three Hundred Twenty Nine Million, Two Hundred and Twenty Seven Thousand Namibia Dollars (NS3,329,227,000)** to implement the activities under Programme one (1), during the 2018/19 Financial Year, and this off course includes the grants as I said.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

Programme 2: Strategy Formulation and Monitoring

Cause we have to monitor we have to make sure that people graduate and go further, they cannot just receive, but go further and assist themselves. So formulation, strategy and monitoring is part of our work.

**24 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 33
HON BISHOP KAMEETA**

Under this programme, the Ministry oversees the coordination of the implementation of activities under the Blueprint on wealth redistribution and poverty eradication and the Zero Hunger Strategy Roadmap.

The Ministry conducted popularization workshops for the Blueprint and its Implementation Plan, covering all the regions. The Ministry started with the implementation of the activities under the Blueprint as per the implementation plan. These activities are being implemented in collaboration, we are not working in isolation because aspects of poverty eradication is virtually in all the Ministries so this coordination is very much important. So these activities are being implemented with the Ministries of Urban and Rural Development; Agriculture, Water and Forestry; Labour, Industrial Relations and Employment Creation; Higher Education, Training and Innovation; and Gender Equality and Child Welfare.

The Ministry has started with the development of a comprehensive monitoring and evaluation framework to fast track and monitor the implementation of the activities under the Blueprint and the Zero Hunger Strategy Roadmap.

The Ministry has embarked on a social protection reform process, to strengthen, expand and consolidate the social protection systems in the country. Through this process, the Ministry will ensure an inclusive social protection system that will cater for those that are excluded by the current system; consolidate the fragmented systems and the development of a national social protection policy

A roadmap was developed during a social protection seminar, the Ministry hosted during the period under review. The Ministry, with the assistance of the European Union, is in a process of recruiting a social protection expert to assist with the social protection reform. The process of investigating the feasibility of a social single registry for an integrated social protection system was started during the 2017/18 financial year, and we believe that by the end of the year we will have a single registry of social protection.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 33**
HON BISHOP KAMEETA

The Ministry of Poverty Eradication and Social Welfare together with the Ministry of Higher Education, Training and Innovation has embarked on the development of an Entrepreneurship Development Programme, well known as Empretec, during the 2017/18 financial year. The programme is designed to provide training and mentorship to Small and Medium Enterprises (SMB), to assist them with business formation and enhance employment creation and reduce poverty. The programme targets the extremely poor, unemployed youth, unemployed women (the expected majority beneficiaries), and the unemployed from the marginalised groups and communities countrywide.

The Ministry of Industrialisation, Trade and SME Development will be the implementing agency of this programme. The implementation plan for the Empretec programme will be tabled in Cabinet, I was so quick and I said by the end of April 2018 (*Laughter*) by the second week I believe of May or during the month of May 2018 for final approval by Cabinet, so that the Ministry then can embark on this whole process of training our people how to do business, and to do serious business and come out of poverty.

The Ministry requests an allocation of **Four Million, Six Hundred and Ninety Five Thousand Namibia Dollars (NS\$4,695,000)** for the activities under Programme 2 for the 2018/19 financial year.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members

Programme 3: Policy Coordination and Support Services

This programme includes activities related to policy supervision, administration of support services, financial and human resources management, and other auxiliary services to other functions of the Ministry. The Ministry together with the Public Service Commission will ensure that key positions are filled during the current financial year to ensure effective service delivery. We have been struggling with employing people I think because of our own fault.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 33**
HON BISHOP KAMEETA

For the execution of the activities under this programme, an amount of **Thirty Seven Million Five Hundred and Thirty One Thousand Namibia Dollars (N\$37,531,000)** is requested during the 2018/19 financial year.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

I hope the General is not here. *(Laughter)* As I conclude, I want to agree with His Excellency the President, Dr Hage G Geingob that this year should be indeed a year of reckoning. Now when we talk of reckoning in theological terms, it is a year of judgement in fact, reckoning is judgement. A year in which practical implementation should be the order of the day, and a year in which our people should start to see tangible results. I therefore want to call upon those tasked with the implementation of the programmes under this Budget Vote, that implementation is long over-due and there is no more room for complacency, it is indeed judgement time

Allow me to thank the Deputy Minister of Poverty Eradication and Social Welfare, Honourable Aino Kapewangolo, the Food Bank Special Advisor Ambassador Angel Dalmau, The Permanent Secretary Mr. I-Ben Nashandi and the entire staff of the Ministry for making the motivation of this Budget Vote possible.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members

It is now my distinct honour to present to this august House, the expenditure request for the Ministry of Poverty Eradication and Social Welfare for the 2018/19 financial year, which amounts to, and please think of the senior citizens and people with disabilities and all those programmes that I have mentioned. **Three Billion, Four Hundred Thirty Nine Million, and Thirteen Thousand Namibia Dollars (N\$3,439,013,000.00)** for its kind consideration and approval.

24 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 34
HON JOOSTE

I thank you for your support. *(Applause)*

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:

Thank you very much Bishop Emeritus Zephania Kameeta. Thank you so much. It was also very brief.

Now I put Vote 34 – “**PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**” - **NS42 280 000** for the introduction by the Honourable Minister. Honourable Minister you have the Floor.

HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

I rise to present the motivation for the budget for Vote 34, of the Ministry of Public Enterprises.

Please allow me, Honourable Chairperson, to congratulate the Honourable Minister of Finance, his Deputy and the entire staff of the Finance Ministry for the thorough preparation of the budget, which is currently under consideration. Equally, I would like to extend the same congratulations to the Honourable Minister of Economic Planning, his Deputy and staff of the National Planning Commission for the meticulous preparation and tabling of the 2018/19 Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF).

Hon. Chairperson, before I present our Ministry's Budget, let me first explain to this august House the roles and importance of the Ministry of Public Enterprises, since it is still regarded as a new Ministry, that expires eventually I suppose, and some still have questions about its roles and responsibilities

In any economy public enterprises/ state owned enterprises are established

**24 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 34
HON JOOSTE**

for specific reasons. In most cases, Public Enterprises are created to achieve the following purposes:

- To provide public goods;
- To generate public funds;
- To increase access to public services;
- To encourage economic development and industrialisation through sustaining sectors of special interest for the economy.

In Namibia, our Public Enterprises were also established soon after Independence and over the years to serve as special purpose vehicles for government to accelerate access to public services; to generate revenue for the state and contribute to economic development through infrastructure development and job creation.

Although, Public Enterprises were created to perform the above functions, unfortunately over the years since independence, many Public Enterprises have failed to deliver on the mandates they were created for. For example, instead of Public Enterprises supporting the generation of revenue for the State, they have become a burden to the State by depending on annual government subsidies and guarantees to sustain their operations.

For 2017/18 alone, Commercial Public Enterprises that are supposed to generate their own revenue, have received a total allocation from the National budget of more than N\$1,2 billion, whilst the total debt of our Public Enterprises is already about N\$ 43 billion (which is 25% of GDP). Hon Chairperson, it is also important to note that the total return on the assets of the Public Enterprises portfolio is negative, with a total loss of more than N\$150 million per annum. This indicates that the current levels of performance and financial results emanating from most of our Public Enterprises are very low and therefore not sustainable.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 34**
HON JOOSTE

I am sure you will agree with me, ladies and gentlemen that this situation is unsustainable and warrants critical intervention by Government.

I therefore believe that to accelerate transformation, the State-Owned Enterprise Governance Council (SOEGC) was created in the Office of the Prime Minister, and the *State-Owned Enterprise Governance Act, 2006* (Act. 2 of 2006) was enacted by Parliament. His Excellency the President then saw it fit to elevate Public Enterprises reform and created the Ministry of Public Enterprises in 2015 with a specific mandate to ensure that Public Enterprises are transformed to play a meaningful role in the country's developmental agenda.

Hon Chairperson, the functions of the Ministry of Public Enterprises in summary are as follows:

- To establish generally accepted common principles of corporate governance and good practice governing State-owned enterprises;
- To develop common policy frameworks for the operations of public enterprises, including policies on issues relating to human resources, assets and finance;
- To provide directives on governance and performance agreements to be entered into between the portfolio Minister and the Board;
- To provide directives on performance agreements to be entered into between the board of the PE and its Chief Executive Officer and other Senior management staff;
- Review business plans, annual financial statements and Annual Budgets;
- Responsible for the Board of Directors recruitment and appointment guidelines;
- Responsible for the restructuring of Public Enterprises;

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 34**
HON JOOSTE

- Create and Monitor frameworks for policies and procedures development on human resources, assets and financing for Public Enterprises;

Since 2006 we have attempted to govern our Public Enterprises under a flawed dual-governance model. Based on comparative studies, analyses and benchmarking the MPE concluded that the dual governance model for Public Enterprises was unsustainable, inadequate and cumbersome.

As a result, our Ministry developed a new governance model, called the "Hybrid Governance Model" which was approved by Cabinet in July 2016. This new model is now being transformed into a legal framework and once Parliament approves the Amendment, all commercial Public Enterprises will be transferred to the Ministry of Public Enterprises and non-commercial Public Enterprises will remain with their line Ministries. This governance model supported by the improved legislative environment will enable us to pursue a well-crafted process to transform our Public Enterprises.

May I now move, Hon. Chairperson, that this August House considers the total Budget allocation, to the Ministry of Public Enterprises, for the financial year 2018/2019, which amounts to; **NS42,280,000. (Forty-Two Million Two Hundred and Eighty Thousand Namibian Dollars). This represent a 19, 37 % reduction compared to the 2017/18 revised Budget.**

Honourable Chairperson

The activities of the Ministry of Public Enterprises are grouped under two main Programmes; namely:

- Legal, Economic and Financial Advisory Services; and
- Policy Coordination and Support Services.

Programme 1: Legal, Economic and Financial Advisory Services

An amount of **NS8,528,000 (Eight Million Five hundred and Twenty-Eight Thousand Namibian Dollars)** has been allocated to this Programme.

The main activities to be carried out under this programme are as follows:

- Finalisation of the Consolidated PEGA Amendments with the Ministry of Justice and the Office of the Attorney-General.
- Drafting of the *PEGA Repeal Act*
- Development of the Public Enterprises Performance, Monitoring and Evaluation Framework
- Development of the Financial Performance Analysis Public Enterprises.
- Development of the Board E-recruitment system and board nomination guidelines
- Implementation of the Business Process Re-engineering processes
- Analysing of Public Enterprises Business, Financial and Annual Performance Reports

Programme 2: Policy Coordination and Support Services

An amount of **NS33,752,000 (Thirty-Three Million Seven Hundred and FiftyTwo Thousand Namibian Dollars)** has been allocated to this programme.

This programme consists of two (2) main components, namely: Policy Supervision and Coordination, as well as, Support Services.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 34**
HON JOOSTE

Under this programme, my Ministry will carry out the following activities:

- Development of the ownership policy
- Development of the Public Enterprises Transformation Strategy
- Development of a compliance rating framework
- Development of Public Enterprises Classification and Remuneration Framework
- Development and implementation of the Board Performance Evaluation framework
- Facilitation of strategic Public Enterprises Reform

Honourable Chairperson

The mandate of the MPE is to "position Namibia's key Public Enterprises to play their meaningful role in the country's development agenda and to ensure that public enterprises are well managed in order to reduce the financial burden on the state".

However, the biggest challenge currently facing the MPE is the legal environment, which is still in essence the same as that under which the SOE Governance Council operated. The Act in its current form merely provide the MPE with an oversight mandate and is therefore not sufficient to deal with the transformation of the Public Enterprises landscape. Hence the urgency to Amend the Act and to give legitimacy to the Hybrid Governance Model, which was approved by Cabinet in July 2016.

I am however delighted, Honourable Speaker, to inform you that a number of milestones have already been reached:

- **PEGA amendment bill tabled to Cabinet and CCL:** The draft *PEGA Amendment Bill* was tabled and approved in principle by the

24 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 34
HON JOOSTE

decision making Cabinet in October 2017. The Bill was also tabled and discussed at Cabinet Committee on Legislation

- **Customer service charter implementation:** The Ministry Customer Service Charter was finalised, disseminated and uploaded on the Ministerial website (www.mpe.gov.na)
- **Re-engineering of key process:** Five (5) key processes within the Ministry has being reviewed and re-engineered;
- **The Public Enterprise Compliance Reporting and Performance tool:** One of the Ministry's mandates is to monitor the performance of Public Enterprises. To perform this function, an electronic tool was developed to strengthen the compliance reporting and performance of Public Enterprises. The Ministry will continue to monitor and evaluate the performance of these Public Enterprises after which remedial actions will be implemented and failure to comply will result in taking action on nonperforming Public Enterprises;
- **Public Enterprises Portfolio database:** One of the challenges facing the Ministry is reliable data on the total Public Enterprises portfolios since their establishment as this information was found to be extremely inaccurate. To address this problem, the Ministry developed a fully-fledged database for Public Enterprises. This is a continuous process which the Ministry has started and will continue to collect information and update the database to ensure that real-time accurate information is always available.
- **Board members database:** The Ministry developed a database for potential Board members. This will be translated into an e-recruitment database that will be utilised to provide information and advertise vacant Board of Directors' positions. I'm happy to announce that our database currently consists of more than 600 individuals and it keeps growing continuously.

24 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 34
HON JOOSTE

- **Public enterprises reform:** The Ministry supported the development of TransNamib, NWR, Air Namibia and NAMDIA's Integrated Strategic Business Plan (ISBP), in addition MPE also provided technical guidance to the restructuring of the RCC.
- During the course of this year the Ministry will focus on the following areas:
- The **Namibian Public Enterprises Transformation** strategy and our **Ownership Policy** will be finalised and presented to Cabinet for approval to map the transformation strategy.
- **Public Enterprises Performance and Remuneration:** The Performance framework for Public Enterprises performance and an integrated performance system will be developed. All Public Enterprises will be required to have fully functional Performance Management Systems and remuneration will be incentivised. This is a simple but fundamental requirement to cultivate a performance culture within the Public Enterprise
- **Board Appointments and performance:** We have finalised our new Board recruitment guidelines which will be presented to Cabinet soon. These guidelines will introduce a new thorough recruitment process to ensure that the best possible Board members are identified in a transparent process. Our current manual database consisting of around 600 potential Board members will be transferred to an electronic format. In cases where appropriate skills cannot be sourced from our database, advertisements will be placed to provide further opportunity for professional Board members to apply. One of the factors we will have to pay particular emphasis to ensure that sector specific skilled Board members are appointed to ensure that a skills balance between the Board and the Executive is maintained. Board self-evaluation guidelines will be developed and implemented for all boards and annual evaluations will be conducted in most cases. The quality of our Board inductions will also be evaluated and improved to ensure that Boards are duly equipped to perform their tasks.

24 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 34
HON JOOSTE

- **CEO recruitments:** CEO recruitment guidelines will be issued within the first quarter of 2018. The absence of robust succession plans is cause for concern and we will request that succession plans/policies are developed to ensure that these are in place.
- **Board fiduciary duties:** The Ministry will look at ways to enforce the legal framework to ensure that boards are held accountable for financial losses if due diligence was not applied. We will also be utilising the provisions of the *Companies Act* in cases where Public Enterprises are registered under this law. The accountability of Board members, both individually and collectively, will enjoy particular attention. In cases where reckless trading or gross negligence can be determined, Board members will be held personally liable with associated unpleasant consequences. Boards must have active Audit and risk committees and risk mitigation and strategies should constantly be evaluated and modified.
- **Public Enterprises Funding:** Some Public Enterprises will be unable to borrow their way out of their financial difficulties, at a time where the ability of the Shareholder to fund "bail-outs" is constrained, and there is therefore urgent need for consultative processes to review the funding and business models of these distressed Public Enterprises. Business Plans will be thoroughly evaluated and we will not allow for "unbankable" business plans to be approved.
- **Corruption in Public Enterprises:** We will tighten up on the efforts to curb corruption by conducting more Special Investigations in instances where malpractice is suspected and if corruption is exposed, the investigation reports will be handed over to the ACC for further processing and eventual prosecution if warranted. Please take note that there should not be an assumption that all our Special Investigations are aimed to target corruption. These investigations take multiple forms and are also intended to identify corporate governance failures, flawed policies, structural constraints etcetera and to then propose suitable remedial actions.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 34**
HON JOOSTE

Honourable Chairperson, Honourable Members

As I conclude, I wish to thank the Honorable Members of this august House for their support and interest in the mandate given to our Ministry. I particularly would like to thank His Excellency the President, The Vice President, Right Honorable Prime Minister, Deputy Prime Minister and my dear colleagues in the Executive, for their patience and support. I equally want to thank my former Deputy Minister, Honorable Nawatiseb, my new Deputy Minister, Honorable Nekundi, the Acting Permanent Secretary, Deputy Permanent Secretary and all staff of the MPE for their hard work and dedication.

The process to transform the Namibian Public Enterprises will be complicated and even unpleasant at times but we are led by our conviction that every proposal we make and every decision we take will always be in the best interest of the Nation and the respective Public Enterprise rather than the interest of an individual or a group of individuals. The reality is that the successful revival of the Namibian economy will not be possible if the current status quo is maintained. The year 2018 will be recorded as the year where the State as shareholder is transformed into a professional active shareholder where governance boundaries will be respected but deliberate and decisive calculated interventions will take place as and when required to protect the interest of the State as the representative of the people of Namibia.

We at the Ministry of Public Enterprises are ready and excited about the year ahead where we will truly activate our mandate to transform our Public Enterprises into model Enterprises that each and every one of our 2,4 million Namibians are proud of. We are steering through uncharted territory, but we remain guided by evidence-based facts and reference to Global Best practices. We will not fall into the trap of taking hasty, undue ill-conceived decisions and I want to plead for more endurance as we together embark on the journey to reform Namibia's Public Enterprises.

I wish to thank all the Honorable Members of this respected House in advance for the overwhelming support they always given to Vote 34.

24 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 35
HON DR KAWANA

I thank you Honourable Chairperson. *(Applause)*

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:

Thank you very much. It was also very fast. Thank you.

Now I put the last Vote for today for motivation. Vote 35 – **“ATTORNEY GENERAL” - NS\$201 757 000** for the introduction by Attorney General. Doctor Kawana you have the Floor.

HON ATTORNEY GENERAL: Thank you Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, I rise with humility to motivate Vote 35, Office of the Attorney General.

The legal profession all over the World is one of the professions which is looked at with great suspicion by some individuals. Lawyers are often described as **State licensed professional liars** who have a habit of benefiting from the proceeds of crime. It is said that when a criminal steals money and is arrested, he or she hires a lawyer to defend him or her. Once the criminal is acquitted, the stolen money is shared with a lawyer in the form of legal fees.

In this manner, lawyers are regarded as financial mercenaries. The moment they realise that the prospects of acquittal are slim and, therefore, the client will be unable to pay legal fees, they are often heard telling the judge that they are not properly briefed, a lawyer's terminology which means they withdraw from the case because they are not paid by the client

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, the same persons who do not like lawyers, when they are in trouble they are heard saying **don't talk to me, talk to my lawyer.** *(Laughter)*

Law is an important element in human existence. It regulates the behaviour of society with an ultimate aim of maintaining peace and

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 35**
HON DR KAWANA

Harmony. In the 21st century, we cannot imagine a nation State which can exist without laws. Equally we cannot imagine the existence of a modern law without the role of a lawyer. It is in this context that I am motivating Vote 35, Office of the Attorney-General. In addition, I want to point out that this is not an Annual Report, it is a Budget motivation which is required to be in line with the *Appropriation Bill* as tabled by the Honourable Minister of Finance.

The Annual Report, which will be full of details, will be presented to this august House at a later stage. It is against this background that my motivation will be reasonable in length.

Honourable Chairperson, Honourable Members

Vote 35 is sub-divided into five programmes in line with the Medium Term Expenditure framework, namely, Office of the Attorney General; Central Administration; Legal Advice; Civil Litigation and Prosecutor-General. The total amount that is requested for all these programmes is **Two Hundred and One Million, Seven Hundred and Forty-Seven Thousand Namibia Dollars (201,747,000)**. I now turn to individual programmes.

Programme 1- Office of the Attorney-General.

Chapter 9 Article 87 of the Namibian Constitution provides the powers and functions of the Attorney-General as:

- a. To exercise the final responsibility for the office of the Prosecutor-General;
- b. To be principal legal advisor to the President and Government;
- c. To take all action necessary for the protection and upholding of the Constitution; and

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 35**
HON DR KAWANA

- d. To perform all such functions and duties as may be assigned to the Attorney-General by Act of parliament.

Under this Programme, an amount of **Two Million, One Hundred And Sixty-One Thousand, Six Hundred and Thirty Seven Namibia Dollars (N\$2,161,637)** is requested to cover salaries, travel and entertainment of three persons, including myself, who are covered under the Programme.

Programme 2-Central Administration

Central administration plays an important function in the Office of the Attorney- General. An amount of **Thirty-Six Million, Six Hundred and Sixty-Five Thousand, Five Hundred and One Namibia Dollars (N\$36,665,501)** is requested.

The requested amount will cover salaries of staff members who work in the directorate, S&T, materials and supplies, transport, maintenance expenses, utilities, printing, case management, transcription fees, property rentals and membership fees.

Programme 3 - Legal Advice

An amount of **Twenty-Seven Million, Seven Hundred and Twelve Thousand, Three Hundred and Thirty-Four Namibia Dollars (N\$27,712,334)** is requested.

The requested amount will cover the salaries of staff and S&T who are employed in the Directorate. The Legal staff of the Directorate are required to accompany delegates of other Offices, Ministries and Agencies whenever there are negotiations or meetings at the official levels at institutions such as the United Nations, the African union, SADC, and SACU. In addition, negotiations at bilateral levels also require legal advice before agreements are concluded.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 35**
HON DR KAWANA

This Directorate plays an important role in assisting the Attorney-General to render legal advice to all Offices, Ministries and Agencies. The Directorate also renders legal advice to Regional and Local Authority Councils via the line Ministry of Urban and Rural Development. On average, the Directorate receives about Seventy-four (74) new files each month for legal advice. Out of 131 staff members of the establishment, only fifty (50) positions are currently filled.

Programme 4 - Civil Litigation

An amount of **Forty-Two Million, Nine Hundred And Ninety-Three Thousand, Six Hundred and Ninety-Three Namibia Dollars** (N\$42,993,693) is requested. Apart from the Namibian Constitution, the Government- Attorney exercises functions in terms of *Government Attorney Proclamation* No. 161 of 1982.

The requested amount will cover salaries and S&T for the Directorate, as well as legal costs as a result of civil litigation in all our courts. The Directorate plays an important role in the Office of the Attorney-General in that it is used as fire brigade during civil litigation. It represents the Government in all civil litigation in all the courts. In addition, it represents all civil servants in litigation which arise in the performance of their duties.

It also institutes legal proceedings aimed at recovering money or property on behalf of the Government arising from contractual relations or damage caused to the State as a result of negligence of third parties. In addition, it institutes legal proceedings to recover costs awarded to the State in legal proceedings. During the 2017/2018 financial year, the Directorate handled 1,204 cases out of which 600 were motor vehicle accident cases

Allow me, Honourable Chairperson, to point out that the measure of success in any litigation is not whether the Government has won or lost the case, the true measure of Government success should be whether justice between the parties is done.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – INTRODUCTION – VOTE 35**
HON DR KAWANA

To me the fundamental issue is that Namibia is a constitutional democracy with an independent judiciary which must seek to dispense justice to all the parties, including the State.

Programme 5 - Prosecutor-General

An amount of **Ninety-Two Million, Two Hundred And Thirteen Thousand, Eight Hundred and Thirty Five Namibia Dollars (N\$92,213,835)** is requested

Honourable Chairperson, Honourable Members,

The Prosecutor-General exercises her powers and functions in terms of Chapter 9 Article 88 (2) of the Namibian Constitution. The most important among them are:

"(a) To prosecutein the name of the Republic of Namibia in criminal proceedings; and

(b) To prosecute and defend appeals in criminal proceedings in the High Court and the Supreme Court."

Currently, the staff establishment of the Office is 203 but only 172 are filled. Honourable Members have already been provided with criminal case statistics at all levels of our Courts by the Honourable Minister of Justice when he motivated the Vote of the Judiciary. I, therefore, do not wish to bore the Honourable Members with the same figures.

Honourable Chairperson, Honourable Members,

Allow me to conclude by saying that my office is open to engage with all our stakeholders in order to find a solution to the problems facing our nation. Very soon I will engage in face to face consultations with relevant stakeholders so that weaknesses of my office can be identified and addressed in order to promote efficient service delivery to our nation.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 13**
HON DIENDA

In some cases, there will be a need to produce manuals to guide staff members in Offices, Ministries and Agencies. I am also willing to coordinate with the School of Law of the University of Namibia so that interested learners, particularly senior students, can be involved with my Office at an early stage given the fact that most graduates from UNAM School of Law are employed by my Office upon completion.

I take this opportunity to salute all my predecessors and my staff members for their service to the Land of the Brave. My office is wide open to all so that we work as a team and avoid what His Excellency Dr. Hage Geingob, President of the Republic of Namibia, calls the silo mentality.

I therefore, humbly request this august House to approve an amount of **Two Hundred and One Million, Seven Hundred and Forty-Seven Thousand Namibia Dollars (NS201,747,000)** for Vote 35 - Office of the Attorney-General.

I thank you.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:

Thank you so much. All the three Ministers motivated their Votes very brief. Now we are going to go into the discussions of the four Votes. However I would like just to remind ourselves to say that reading newspapers is prohibited. Now I put Vote 13 Health and Social Services. Any discussions, Honourable Dienda. You are the only one

HON DIENDA: Yes it is only me I am paid to talk. Honourable Minister, I thank you very much Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee.

One – Honourable Minister on Page 3 of your speech. Honourable Minister you said that the Ministry could not absorb these graduate nurses

and a lot of explanations. My question to you is:

Honourable Minister when will the **contracts of the Kenyan Nurses come to an end** in Namibia so that the Namibian graduates can be appointed in those positions?

Two – Honourable Minister, on the same page three (3) of your speech. The ministry has been working on the **restructuring of its staff establishment** within the ambits of the policy of compensatory reduction as directed by the Office of the Prime Minister. Honourable Minister, I have read in one of the latest Auditor General is Reports that your restructuring is outdated, it was last done in 2003, and since a lot of clinics have been opened around the country it needs to be updated. When can we receive that update?

Three – Then Honourable Minister, regarding your **bank accounts in the Ministry**. Like let me say there is a bank account for treatment for State patients and that account has a balance of N\$2 million. Honourable Minister when I looked into this Auditor General is Report and I saw that treatment of State patients, a lot of things come into my mind, and one of it is that, treatment of patients, it means that these accounts are not supposed to have so much money in it because it must be spend on the treatment on patients. What is your say about this specific account?

Then my second question also on this one. All these accounts that your ministry is having. How frequently are these accounts monitored and evaluated, because there is too much money here? Nine million, four million, it is a lot. Petty cash bank account four hundred and forty seven thousand.

Now Honourable Minster, I will go to my famous book, estimates of revenue on income on page 188. Under main division 1 – Office of the Minister. Honourable Minister I have realised that your establishment is six (6) your positions filled at present are three (3) and we are funding only three (3) people in your Ministry, in the Office of the Minister.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 13**
HON DIENDA

So it is the Minister, the Deputy Minister, maybe the Permanent Secretary. What about the other positions, where is the money coming from to pay them? So are these positions still vacant and until when?

Then on page 190 in the same booklet, main division 2 – Human resources management and general services Honourable Minister. Honourable Minister I have noticed the **claims against the State**, and I can remember that currently a claim against the State for women who were forcedly sterilised in the hospital. How far is your Ministry in settling this debts to this women, because there was a Court case and they won the Court case, and you did not pay it, but now I see the is claims against the State provision made for it.

Honourable Minister I go further, my last question, let me just see where it is. My last question is on page 198, **under old age homes and welfare organisations**. Honourable Minister there is a long waiting list for people who want to be taken up in the old age homes, and there are also eight (8) old age homes that are not registered with your Ministry because of certain reasons. Is your ministry giving any incentives to these old age Homes or what is the current situation regarding that?

Honourable Chairperson I support the Vote.

Thank you very much.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:

Yes before the Minister responds, I would like to humbly ask Honourable Dingara, can you go and call others from the restaurant. Please can you help us? Okay, Honourable Minister. *(Interjection)* Come again? Honourable Minister you have the Floor. Oh sorry, did you go out or you where there all along.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: I have been here all along, I even greeted you.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Oh sorry. Honourable Minister, sorry.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Thank you Deputy Speaker of the Whole House Committee. I want to appreciate the Budget that was tabled by the Honourable Minister of Health.

However I want to make an observation on page four (4) of the **Central Medical Stores** that talks about adequate medicine. Honourable Members I was trying to look through this Budget to see whether there is Budget for research. As much as I have seen a Budget tabled by the Ministry of Higher Education, I thought Health was going to embark on research on natural medicine. Because natural medicine is proving that it does not have medical nemesis as modern medicine.

I remember that why I am saying the research is important, while growing up in the Zambezi Region for example. When families lost members, or mothers of little babies, they did not depend on feeding kids from the bottle. People used certain herbs to reactive milk from one of the members from the family to breastfeed this child until this child was until two years or so, and this was working. However that knowledge seems to be dying, because we do not appreciate indigenous knowledge or natural medicine.

Equally the issue that for example has been taken to a higher ground. The example that I have is aloe. Aloe has been used by us for many years, but it was said if you take Aloe directly, if you take the roots directly as they

are, you are either a witch doctor, you will not go to heaven, because of being too traditional. This terminology of witch doctor, is negative for our understanding, because a witch is not a doctor, but people that practice natural medicine are referred to as witch doctors, In other words they are witches before they become doctors. I am therefore encouraging that as much as we do not have money as a country, we should really develop a strategy to research on natural medicine in this country, it does not have many complications as modern medicine.

The second point I want to raise is the issue on page eight (8) where I want to compliment the Ministry with the partners that have really helped to develop the infrastructure for the Ministry for the Health Sector. However, I passed Linyanthi Clinic, where the contractor somewhere 2013/2014 on page eight, page eight comes immediately after page 7. A contractor was contracted to construct Linyanti Clinic.

The building was constructed up to waist level, there is not even a single door on that building, and since the contractor abandoned that clinic somewhere in 2014, the Clinic is still laying as it was. Can we consider even approaching donors also to take care of that situation if we do not have our own funds, because the community there is now being forced to come to Katima Mulilo or Chinchimani which is far from linyanti Clinic.

Then we have the Malengalenga Clinic which has been requested for since Independence, because the community of Malengalenga is far from the nearest Health Centre. Can the Ministry also consider taking care of that situation in the next financial year.

Then the other thing that I have seen here is the lack of inter-sectoral collaboration. Health is not a one sector or one institution thing. It requires inter-sectoral planning. I do not see where the involvement of other Ministries are, especially for example in planning clinics and the construction of Clinics, and I just want to appeal that we need to encourage inter-sectoral approach to health care delivery.

Thank you.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Thank you I recognise Honourable (*Interjections*) I recognise Honourable Jerry Ekandjo.

HON EKANDJO: Thank you Comrade Chair. Mine is just an, if it is maybe possible for the Ministry of Health and Social Services, and the Ministry of Higher Education, Training and Innovation to coordinate, to make **first aid** compulsory in secondary and higher institutions. First aid especially because you find, you come across an accident the person cannot be assisted and that person bleeds to death while they are waiting for an ambulance, if it is possible to make first aid compulsory maybe.

The other question I asked the Minister some time back. **Why do male persons die earlier than females?** I am asking this because, even if you come to the villages (*Interjections*) (*Intervention*)

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Sorry.

HON EKANDJO: you will find, widowers, females

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Honourable, can you repeat yourself again, we did not quite get you.

HON EKANDJO: I asked the Minister some time back, and said maybe can research be done, because you will find that in a household, a couple,

the male dies earlier than the female, in most households, what does it mean? (*Interjections*) is it may be men are lazy they do not work and they die earlier (*Intervention*)

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Sorry, order.

HON EKANDJO: You come to a household in a village, (*Intervention*)

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: I should think it is a relevant question which should need scientific biological explanations.

HON EKANDJO: You might find that in the village, most households are run by females, their partners die earlier, what is the secret, or whatever. (*Interjections*) Are the men reckless, drunkards, they drink and whatever, they do not take care of themselves, because you will find the female is taking care of the husband and everything, but the husband goes earlier than the female... what does science say can research be done on that.

Thank you.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Okay, with this I recognise madam, Honourable Mahoto.

HON MAHOTO: Thank you Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

I thought the previous speakers will just touch on two things that are burning issues in the Region, like the issue of **overtime of drivers of ambulances**. That is a burning issue in all regions.

I witnessed a state where one patient wanted to die (*Interjections*) (*Laughter*) yes, live like this, I was in the Office. I want to share it with other members who are here, it is not a joke. The transport officer was trying to call the ambulance driver to come and take the patient to the national level here. Maybe you always think it is far to transport the patients from the faraway places or Regions to the central here. What happened? All the drivers switched off their Cellphones saying that there is no overtime money.

The patient was supposed to come 4am, the drivers were refusing. The staff were trying until it reached the highest authority. When they were called in, all the transport officers were saying they all refused, what is that. If you find a Region where all the drivers are insisting I am not going until I get my money, what must be done? So the issue of overtime must be looked upon. The ministry must look into that.

Secondly the issue of **maternity wards** is also a serious issue, because you find that here in the central, the headquarters, people at maternity ward bath with cold water, what is that, you are from the labour ward, you just come and bath with cold water, when you go there you feel pity. We are seated comfortably here, but those people are really suffering, sometimes the person does not have a kettle, you see her struggling touching on the other bed going to the other person ‘can I use your kettle, I want to boil water I want to go and bath’, this is not good.

These two things must be looked into. They have to repair, what you call that, the geyser of the maternity ward. If you are from there (*indistinct*) you will laugh because you did not go through it. (*Laughter*) If you do not

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 13**
HON DR HAUFIKU

bath with warm water, you can easily die, warm water is medicine on its own. If you bath with cold water, you find that your body is becoming heavy, and you find that you have small pimples and they get bigger, and you start to shiver. So I humbly request the Ministry to look into this.

Thank you very much. I thought that the people will incorporate it.
(Applause)

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:

Now Honourable Minister you have the Floor. *(Interjection)* yes
(Laughter)

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Thank you very much Honourable Members of the Whole House Committee, and thank you very much for the questions. Maybe I have to apologise a bit because I am using two things.

One is that we have a platform of technical people from all over the country who are watching the proceedings, the Directors, they are feeding me back on some of the questions *(Intervention)*

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:

Through your cellular phone?

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: So we already employed technology. All of the Directors are communicating. So we are connected *(Intervention)*

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
They must just be quick.

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: I cannot pretend to answer all the questions now.

Let me just start with the Kenyan nurses. Maybe I should start with a correction there. It is not only Kenyan nurses, there are lot of expatriate nurses that are working in our public hospitals. We have nurses from Zambia, Zimbabwe, Botswana and other countries. The contracts of these nurses, and I really want us to listen carefully have been modified a bit. Originally it was like four years, but since we are now having a lot of Namibians graduating from nursing colleges, we have reduced these contracts to two years.

Obviously there are some challenges, for instance the Kenyan government was not keen to take up a contract of only two years which is basically just a few months and we did understand that, before a person settles in Namibia the contract is basically already expiring, so we made some exceptions to those ones, and we are looking at critical areas such as midwifery (those are the ladies working in maternity) psychiatric nurses and other critical areas.

The way we are phasing these contracts out is in the form of a relay, I always compare those people who run; before you give the stick to the next person you always run with it for a short distance. Precisely because, the young graduates, Namibians and not all of them are young, some of them were nurses already, they need at least to be inducted, they need to be infused in their field in the wards, or wherever they are going to work, so they will need someone for a couple of months. So the phasing out of expatriate nurses is going to be in stages, and it is never going to be completely phasing all the expatriates out of Namibia, it does not happen anyways. There will be one or two from outside.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 13**
HON DR HAUFIKU

So let us not have the expectation that we will clean the Namibian health sector of Kenyan, or Zimbabwean nurses or doctors, there will be some of them but overall we will try to accommodate the Namibian graduates that is true of any other country. So I hope that is clear to *Honourable Dienda*.

Now the structure of the Ministry is one aspect of the Ministry I always mention. I particularly refer to the operations structure, human resources. It is true we completed it, it is finished. We have submitted it to the Office of the Prime Minister, after that we had meetings with officials from the Office of the Prime Minister, even with the Prime Minister herself.

The unfortunate challenge that came in (*Indistinct*) is two. Number one obviously we all agree. If we have to have the ideal structure of the Ministry of Health, we will have to have close to twenty or even more than twenty thousand people, but we realised we cannot do that. So what we decided is on 'faith approach' of implementing the structure, unfortunately because of the economic situation we have not managed to implement more than 20% or 30% of the new structure and we are grappling, we are struggling as we are at the moment.

We have the positions, all the vacancies, well described and detailed, but we do not have the funds, this is the reality, we simply do not have enough money to implement. That is why I put a joke yesterday at the end of my speech, 9 billion. I think 9 billion could be a fair level to say we can implement or bring the health system up to a certain level 9 billion at the moment we are sitting at 6.5 billion. So but these are all idealised situations, the reality on the ground is that we cannot get all of these that we require.

Obviously it is also a matter of efficiency issues in the Ministry. We know what has been happening in the Ministry. There has been cases of theft, and I believe some of them are still continuing. There has been inefficient utilisation of resources, that we admit and a whole other things

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 13**
HON DR HAUFIKU

that we are now trying to stem out, but the reality is that we need more funds to clear all of these problems. Yesterday when I spoke I have mentioned that if we get more funds, and apparently this House has got more power actually to decide, give money to health or education or etcetera, so if you say we must get the money we need, I tell you in the shortest possible time we will clear all these issues.

The 2 million in a special fund is not there idling. This money is being used up every single day. In fact what we need is maybe a hundred million in that fund, but again this is money that we get from treasury and we send to South Africa straight away and to other places, it is not money that stays here, because it is money that is used to, okay some of it one can say it stays here, because it is used to send State patients for instance for dialysis in the private sector, because we do not have a dialysis centre up to now. This is the word I have been singing every now and then, that we need dialysis units of our own. At the moment we are paying something like 44 million for roughly 290 or 300 patients that need to be dialysed in the private sector. If we have our own machines we will tremendously reduce this cost.

The other thing is, and I have brought this thing up several times. We send children, small kids under the age of 12 or so, who have heart conditions. If we can just listen please Muharukua before we can Debate. We send small kids to South Africa who have heart conditions to be operated in South Africa, for one reason only, it is because we have no ICU for these kids here in Namibia. We have been in contact with the doctors in South Africa, at the children's hospital red cross, who are willing to come and help us here. So if we get, all of you support us, to get money wherever we can cut, or we get some miraculous funds we will put up the paediatric ICU immediately, and this is my next assignment actually. So that we prevent children from going to South Africa for heart operations. In fact this morning we discussed with the Acting Permanent Secretary. One of the points I raised is that, we might have to ask maybe the Prime Minister is Office and Cabinet to approve, (*Interjection*) no I am only sharing this with you, it is not that I am exposing myself in sharing what she asked. Maybe we close one department, maybe catering that our

people cook themselves, or security, we approach defence ministry to help us with the police man there and we cut out these security, so that we spend the money (*Interjection*) I am only sharing what we are sharing, these are some of the avenues, then the situation will be better, but overall the future is not bleak as we try to remain innovative.

We have a tender now or bids, call it what it is, coming up with the PPP unit in the ministry of Finance. That will hopefully sort out all of these problems, not only the paediatric unit, but even trauma centre, even dialysis centre, and including equipment that we need at some of our centres. We hope that the so called business people do not torpedo us again at the Tender Board, because that is what happened last time. We were supposed to have renal dialysis the year before last year.

Somebody from Oshikango came up here and apparently complained to the Tender Board, no this thing is not legal, or it is not what what? Up to now it has been dragging in Courts, but these people do not realise how many lives and money we are losing. We could not find any bases for this interdict, it is probably somebody who realised that his interests are not catered for, therefore I launch a Court case to spoil it, and these are the things that are frustrating us sometimes and these are the things you do not feel because you are not in there. So but the reality is that we are struggling to get this dialysis up but hopefully within the PPP context we will get it done.

The many bank accounts, I just got a response from Mr Beukes, who is the financial Director, he is actually upstairs there. He explained it nicely to me, I have it here. There are basic differences I can just refer to them. One of the things is that the Ministry has got development partners and people who are funding programmes and projects such as WHO, Global Fund, etcetera, PEPFAR for HIV. So by law an agreement with these organisations, the money is not and I think it is also the rules of treasury. This money is not supposed to come into our ministerial accounts, it has to be dealt with separately for accounting mechanisms.

The other programmes of the Ministry and Mr Beukes kindly informed me. He said reconciliation takes place every week or every month. Auditing takes place at the end of every year. So it is not that I am covering anything or defending anything. But where we pick up pitfalls we act on those immediately, and I am one of those people who question everything that does not make sense in front of me. It is difficult as I said, because not everybody maybe is thinking the same way in the ministry like all other ministries, but we are doing the best we can to make sure that we increase efficiencies within the ministry as far as financing or money is concerned, because we are the most, we need the money anyway.

The other question, is that my Office, only three people in the Office I have heard about that. Well it is three people, because since Advocate Bience Gawanas left the ministry, I did not request a special advisor, there is no special advisor and that saves us some money actually even though it is just a little bit. I also do not have a Personal Assistant, I actually have one secretary only, she is a bit overloaded, but we make use of the Personal Assistant of the Permanent Secretary and their secretary, that is how we (*Indistinct*) the staff, it is all because of toughness it is not something deliberate, maybe that is where you picked up how come there are only three staff. Even the drivers, I only have one, but they say it is because I am difficult, but I do not know (*Laughter*) they do not want to come to me, so maybe that is what you picked up. I cannot really say. The other officials maybe will help me on that.

On the case of forced sterilisation, it is a matter between, involving the ministry of health, but mostly also handled by the Office of the Attorney General. I can maybe get more detailed answers on the forced sterilisation case, I do not want to indulge in it now, and because I can be quoted it is a legal issue. So I will have to consult with my colleague and give you an answer, and you know I will always come back to you, I promise.

Honourable, I think somebody asked about the welfare organisations and old age homes, the long waiting list. I always say that the fundamental thing as far as aging is concerned, is for all of us to try and take care of our

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 13**
HON DR HAUFIKU

old people. I was brought up by my grandmother, and I lived with her until she was 97 when she passed away. So if we can do our part as a society, and the same with abandoned babies, etcetera single parents. I think our society is just moving the wrong way, and we have become more and more dependent on public institutions. Well it is not a bad idea because the government takes care of us, all of us, I understand we are the only few countries on the continent who even have pension pay-outs, maybe three or so out of 54 countries. It is a good thing, the government is doing very good, but I think we must also do our bit, especially in taking care of our beloved aged persons, because all of us if we are lucky we will get old one day, but I would not encourage a system where we only depend on public institutions or any other institutions to put our old people there, because they can be there with all the water and electricity, but I do not know they will still miss that bonding of family.

This is not to say that I am trying to run away from the point, as part of our infrastructural challenges almost everything they are queues. If you go to outpatient department now at Katutura you will find queues, why, because our health centres and clinics here cannot open 24hours. Why because we do not have the necessary staff to operate 24hours, so all of these things create queues and backlogs because we do not have enough staff that is another problem. You know the year before last year or last year, I was actually saying we are determined to do more with little, I have reversed that position, we are unable to do with what we have at the moment, I must just be honest. We are trying innovatively, but the main constraint is actually financing.

This Budget sounds a lot but it is not enough to cater for things that we want, that is why we go for partnerships between the ministry and the private sector, and part of this infrastructural development includes the old ages homes and the same with the nurses home at Windhoek Central Hospital, we are aware of all those and we are trying our best, but we have to prioritise, if patients are dying from maybe a lack of doctors or medicine somewhere else we will run for that first before we build an old age home, it is just a matter of triaging.

Honourable Sankwasa thank you very much for the contribution in fact we shared a bit outside. One of the things that, it is not only our medicinal products that we are moving away from, we are basically moving away from ourselves in all aspects, as Africans, and I am one of the persons who always questions things. Even here, I understand this system in parliament is a British or some form of system. The names we are carrying are either European or something, the clothes we are wearing is theirs, the food we are eating is theirs, what else could we expect, even the hair or other products is not ours, (*Laughter*) is not ours. So I think it is a whole complex continuum of Africa moving away from itself, and that includes things like medicinal products, but I will challenge maybe new graduates and we collaborate with the school of medicine at the University of Namibia that we start researching these products, because 99% of the medicine that we use comes from plants, so there is an avenue there Comrade Sankwasa for research and I will strongly support them.

I was however a little disappointed when I read the Annual Report of NUST, Namibia University of Science and Technology. I do not know how many of you paged through that Annual Report. How much was allocated, how much did we allocate to NUST for research, I want to take a guess. I heard somebody say one million, one million for research, we need to give more for research if we want to get not only our own products but new inventions, everything depends on research and development, without it we cannot develop, and we have the institutions, we have UNAM we have NUST, we must just support them and fund them appropriately so that they can carry out the research, so that is one aspect I can say. (*Intervention*)

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER OF THE WHOLE HOUSE
COMMITTEE: Comrade Ekandjo.

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: On the issue of contracts. I was also just reading the Report of the Committee tabled by one of the members yesterday, I think it is Honourable Katoma. Just look there on the projects, or under the police, almost 80% of them abandoned by the contractor. In our own ministry I have complained several times. We have the TB ward in Keetmanshoop locked up by the contractor and he moved away with the key. We have the maternity ward in Rundu same story. Epupa Clinic abandoned. Okahao Hospital. You can name the list, but I realised this is not just in the Ministry of Health it is actually everywhere, and it is not necessarily because of the government intervention to cut Capital Projects, it is something that has been going on.

On that Comrade Sankwasa, it is not just the ministry of health and social services, all of these projects, and I think you did mention that you encourage collaboration of sectors. In fact the ministry of works and transport is driving this project. We only come in but the main driver of building of hospitals and clinics is actually the ministry of works and transport. We always liaise and collaborate with them but they determine the specifications and everything.

The Tender Board, now the Central Procurement Board, is the one that awards these tenders. The ministry of health and social services only adjudicates the tenders and submits to the Central Procurement Board, which is the Tender Board of yesterday. We know that in the Tender Board somehow there must have been people working differently there in awarding contracts, and these are not people necessarily under the instruction under the ministry or something. It is people doing their own work and their own businesses, we know them. That is why we got so many of these companies getting tenders but not completing the work they take the money. These are not like members of this bench only, it is our brothers and sisters, some of them your own brothers. So the truth is this, it is this kind of conduct that is everywhere (*Interjection*) no I am just telling you that I think the introduction of the Central Procurement Board with new measures is precisely in time to plug these holes (*Intervention*)

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:

Can we listen please, can we listen?

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: But as long as we, people get tenders, and they are not able to do the work, we will remain stuck like we are today. Obviously there are maybe one or two companies that they said according to the Report here yesterday, they were not paid by the government, yes because of the economic situation maybe one or two companies I can agree, but the majority of them are people who do shoddy work, who do not complete the work, they take the money. That is what we need to fight and to take them to task if we really have to give meaning to our fight against corruption.

I am almost done (*Intervention*)

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:

Honourable Ekandjo and Madam Mahoto

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: There was transport issues, the drivers not getting overtime. Again it is the same problem in the ministry. Nurses are overworking and not getting overtime. The reality of the situation we have is that, if we have a bit of money, one – we try not to have a day where salaries are not paid, that is very crucial. Two - we look at some critical elements, for instance ICU or theatre not working. We communicate to the nurses to the drivers that your payment will ultimately come on overtime. They get their salary, maybe some of them get their overtime sometimes or S&T, but we know there are those that we know we are behind in terms of paying them overtime, that we are not denying it, again referring to the same

denominator funding. Hopefully once we capacitate many of the District Hospitals, Katima Mulilo, Rundu, Opuwo, Keetmanshoop, that we do not have so many people every day coming to Windhoek, it is clear we will cut down on this overtime, because it will not be necessary to come to Windhoek there will be specialists based in the Districts.

On *Comrade Ekandjo*, first aid at schools fully supporting that, but I think it must be everywhere in other sectors as well. I was thinking that if everyone who goes for a driver's license, first have to have first aid then at least we have every driver knowing what to do when he is involved or when an emergency comes. If every company before it gets its certificate for registration, all employers in key positions or we can determine that in every company at least 15 or 20% of them must have done first aid, including here. If fire breaks out here or if all of us collapse, how many of us can rescue all of us here (*Laughter*) we can say before you come to Parliament, before you are a Member of Parliament, you must do first aid so that if your colleague collapses, and it is true. Let me tell you what happened yesterday. I was on the plane with (*Intervention*)

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Can we listen?

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Comrade Calle, we were flying from London to here, somewhere midway they were shouting is there a doctor on board, (*Intervention*)

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
What happened?

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Is there a doctor on board, the usual call, and I went. Only to find that some German guys who were maybe under the influence of alcohol, burned themselves with hot water. So if one of the air hostess (*Intervention*)

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Can we listen?

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Were trained in first aid, they could not even have called the Doctor, it was a superficial burn, and they could have just patched it nicely. So I think first aid is important for all the industries. I think the military is already doing it, the police, the schooling system all the industries especially transport industry, sea going all of them and we can create employment. We can just have a company with the law, you go and pay N\$10.00 or whatever and we create employment because there are people who can take it up. So I agree with you Honourable Ekandjo, but I want it to be wider rather than just confined to schools. Actually school going kids are the most healthy, they may be able to help, but they are much healthier than all of us here, so all of us should be able to help somebody who is about to die or threatened.

On the dying of men instead of women, I think, ok men die first, I think because it is simple (*Intervention*)

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Can we listen please?

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: I think it is because women are stronger, I think so, that is why they last longer, I do not know. The other aspect is that (*Intervention*)

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Men marry young women.

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: The other aspect is that, men generally are exposed more to stresses of life than women. That is one theory (*Intervention*)

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
And they keep it to themselves.

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: If there is war, 90% of the army will be men, and therefore 90% of the deaths will be men. All the responsible stresses and heavy mechanical work is usually done by men. They take the biggest risk as well, they are the most that perhaps consume alcohol, smoking, cocaine, and you name it. These are maybe some of the factors, but if not then it is because women are stronger, I will want to end there.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Ok thank you. Honourable Minister. Honourable Mahoto asked about the cold water and so forth in the hospital. The maternity mothers washing in cold water.

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: I do not know. It must be maybe an incidental event, because every time. Well I have not been there for a while. The Permanent Secretary is here, but we did not get any Report of cold water in maternity. Was this maybe not a day or two days, something happened with the geyser or something like that. I can find out via the platform or maybe it is here. Hold on
(Interjections) (Intervention)

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Okay fine. *(Interjection)* No he has already told us what is it now?

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: No, I cannot find it, but I promise to come back to you on that. I believe it must have been either repairs. Remember they were doing repair work at the maternity ward for quite some time. If you pass through you see a lot of activity there up to last year. It is either there were some maintenance work that was being done, or maybe that specific geyser was not working at that time, and maybe repair work took a while, but generally there is hot water in the hospital in all the wards including theatre that is what I know, but I will come back to you and give you more details.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Thank you, any objection to Vote 13? Agreed to. Are you objecting? Alright.

I put Vote 27 – “**SPORT YOUTH AND NATIONAL SERVICE**”. Any discussions? I recognise Honourable Van Wyk.

HON VAN WYK: Thank you Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee. I rise to support this very important Vote, but also very neglected Vote.

First let me appreciate the work done by the Ministry. I think sometime ago when we had the stakeholders meeting the stakeholders explained to us what they are doing, and I was especially impressed by the work done by the National Youth Service, but Honourable Members really this Vote need more money at least we want to see this N\$287 Million to double next year. Congratulations to our sports women and sportsman. They made us proud and we are proud to be Namibians. In order for us to support our youth, we need to invest and I am very surprised to see that it seems that we are not interested in supporting our young people. We are interested in supporting our sports people. When we need to cut, we first cut at the Ministry of Youth and Sports and that is something that we need to change.

Very soon Honourable Members we will participate and I am confident that our senior rugby team will qualify for next year's World Cup. They need money to prepare not only to be there but to perform. We need to win our first game at the rugby World Cup and for that they need financial support from Government.

Now Honourable Minister to come to the Budget book on page 429, page 431, page 433. It is indicated for example on page 429 that on the establishment for that division you do have 126 approved positions. 86 are filled, but only 86 are funded in the new Financial Year. The same on page 431, the same on page 433.

My question Honourable Minister what is the reason for not budgeting to fill these positions? Is it that these positions are not important or what is the problem there?

Then just to conclude I have noticed when it comes to school sports, that we have championships all over the country and we see school athletes competing, but I miss especially when it comes to middle and long

distance codes, the San learners I am of the opinion that the San learners are very likely to perform like we see the Kenyans, the people from East Africa performing, and I would say that we should identify San learners and with a special program, train them, support them to become world class athletes, world class runners and I would really like to see a program.

They are there. I think it is just that we overlook them. There is no effort made to recruit them and to train them, so I would like to see that. With these few words, I support this very important Vote.

Thank you.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: I recognise Honourable Anna Shiweda.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY: Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

I also rise to contribute and support this very important Vote 27, of Sport, Youth and National Service. Before I start, I really want to congratulate the Honourable Minister for introducing this Vote in a clear and concise fashion. Thank you Honourable Minister for doing that. In my language or vernacular that is where I want to start, we have a proverb that goes like this, "*uhena omtanda, kuna ongobe. Uhena omahona kuna oilya*" a direct English translation of this statement may go as follows. If you do not have weaners or calves you will not have cattle, and if you do not have millet for those of us who consume millet, you will not have a good harvest.

Now in the context of Vote 27, the message that is contained in this proverb literally means that if you do not have I will come to the page.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON SHIWEDA

If you do not have the youth, you will not have a future generation, and without the youth there is no progress and continuity.

Honourable Chairperson in preparing for my contribution to this Vote, I considered and perused the Medium Term Framework going back six years before this Financial Year, and also looking in front three years ahead up to 2020/2021. In studying these documents I particularly focused on the appropriation for the development programs under Vote 27 that are reflected on pages 557 to page 562, with the main objective of appreciating and understanding the trends and dynamics of the funds allocation to this very important Vote.

While there is no benchmark or guideline on the most adequate funds that one should allocate to any Vote in particular, my analysis of the amounts of funds that were appropriated to this Vote for development projects especially concluded that, the allocations had been generally increasing over the years with very few exceptions. This is an indication of the commitment of our Government and of course of the SWAPO party Government to youth development as clearly stipulated in our manifesto. This is also a job well done.

Now however, whilst this achievement is to be applauded, I want to come now to specific projects that are indicated on those pages I have indicated. The implementation of some Capital Projects Honourable Minister have been very and painfully very slow, for example, it took the Ministry about four years to construct the Eenhana Sports Complex and much longer to construct the Outapi Sports Complex, which started in 2011 and is only planned to be completed in 2021. Honourable Minister we are speaking of a period of ten years.

I have also noted that the construction of the Nkurenkuru Multipurpose Centre is also progressing at a snail pace. In addition, the construction of the Otjiwarongo Multipurpose Centre started in April 2014 but it is only envisaged to be completed in 2020 a period of six years.

I am of the opinion Honourable Minister that should funds permit, the speed at which the Multipurpose Centres and other related infrastructure that are to be constructed should be proportional or at least should respond to the current rate of school dropouts and the population of unemployed youth, and here I call probably a coordination between the Ministry of Youth, Sport and National Services with the Ministry of Education. I am confident that with appropriate planning and proper prioritisation this will be possible.

Special attention and speed should also be given to infrastructure development for the youth in rural areas more specific, where there are hardly any alternative to what the Government is putting out there. There are hardly an alternatives that the youth can use, and it is no longer a secret that the high youth unemployment of 43.4% is a ticking bomb waiting to explode. I would not want such extremes to happen in our country but is a reality.

Honourable Chairperson, Honourable Members,

Apart from considering the infrastructure development I have highlighted above for youth, I also analysed the main activities of the youth programs and the Minister read them yesterday. There are two main activities which is capacity building for unemployed youth and also entrepreneurship development. There my analysis has established that a very little amount of funds were allocated, and I want to concur with Honourable Van Wyk that very little amounts were allocated for these specific activities and there is an amount mentioned of N\$12 Million there and also of N\$7 Million which is not enough, but we understand where we are standing, we understand the issue.

Now given this high unemployed youths of that percentage I mentioned which is equivalent in figure terms to 246, 77 unemployed young men and women. This translate into a per capita annual allocation of a mere N\$48.76 and N\$28.45 for each unemployed young men. Definitely this amount will not take us out of this dilemma.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON EKANDJO

Therefore before I have indicated your pages, I want to come now to my last issue before I pose my question to the Honourable Minister and this is an issue of vocational education and training which is also a concern, and we saw on those pages that there is a lack of accreditations for courses offered at these skills and training centres, partly due to centres not conforming to standards. This one is a concern because the products that we are bringing out of those centres will not meet the conditions of the market that we have to feed. Therefore now my questions Honourable Minister I have three questions.

1. Could the Honourable Minister enlighten us or enlighten me to the justification for the delays in the implementation of the development programs or projects at those areas or towns I have indicated.
2. What alternatives are at the disposal of the Ministry to avail more resources to the two main youth activities that I have indicated, that is the capacity building and entrepreneurship, and the last one,
3. What measures is the Honourable Minister envisaging to ensure that courses offered at the VTCs conform to standards and are accredited.

I thank you for your attention and I support Vote 27.

Thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Anna. Honourable Jerry Ekandjo you have the Floor.

HON EKANDJO: Thank you Comrade Deputy Chairperson. Firstly, I would like to congratulate the Minister, the Deputy Minister and his staff for the two gold medals Namibia won at the Commonwealth of nation

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON EKANDJO

games in Australia and I would also like to congratulate the signing of the MOU between the Minister of Higher Education and the Minister of Youths regarding Ghaikanakab because the idea there is that the vocational training under the Ministry of Youth only complete phase 1, and from phase 1 in Ghaikanakab, they will automatically go to phase 2 into the Ministry of Higher Education just like in the same premises we have a Primary School and a Secondary School. Congratulations for that and I hope also all the other vocational training centres will do the same so that our students are credited.

Comrade Chairperson I think the Honourable Minister of Finance and the Minister of Mines and Energy when he was still Director General for the National Planning and their staff. I think they will remember, whenever we have Budget hearing when the Ministry of Youth is called, it was a fight they themselves know. It was a fight there, even in those meetings I used to tell them the money is not sufficient. Are you sabotaging the Ministry or what? That is what we have been doing. Whenever we are called there at the Budget hearing, I used to attack their officials there and I said are you deliberately sabotaging the ministry of youth of allocating less than N\$300 Million.

When the former Permanent Secretary of the Ministry Comrade Ilukena, when he was transferred to the youth Ministry he was shocked to come and operate on a Budget of N\$300 Million. He was saying when he was at the Ministry of Education the Budget for renovation was N\$500 Million only for renovation, and now here he comes N\$300 Million. Like know in this case Comrade the Budget allocation of the Ministry is N\$288 287 000 and for that the development Budget is N\$25.7 Million. Out of this, they must construct sport facilities, they must construct youth Offices. The Head Office of the Ministry is there at the old compound there at Katutura Multipurpose. You see that wall that is where the Head Office of the Ministry should be. It is for more than ten years, it just stands there.

he Ministry up to now is still renting three flats at the NBC. At one time I think 2016, they wanted to kick us out because we are renting. Even the Minister of Gender was built later while the youth is still renting. Now

even the Ministry of Mines and Energy at the Airport was later built while the Ministry is still renting and now there are also other Ministries being built and the youth is still just renting. Can one really do anything with N\$25 Million? Comrade Anna has said it all. Eenhana Sport field is just there. In Otjiwarongo the Ministry is renting a tiny office and the plot is there fully paid, but the Ministry cannot go further. No money. In Outapi is only a fence and the years go, yet we talk of the youth as the backbone. Are we really sabotaging the Ministry or what?

I do not blame the Minister. I do not blame the Director, but the officials in the Ministry of Finance and the National Planning those who are dealing with the Budget. They are the ones that say the youth must just get N\$288 Million and out of that N\$25 Million for the development. Really it is unfair.

At Rietfontein last year or this year I do not know, I think early this year, the National Youth Service had to send the students back home because there is no food to feed them, no food.

Even here when the Ministry as per the Report of the Minister. If I read page 14, here the Ministry goes to page 15 which says it places the Ministry in a position not to honour our obligation for salaries, and then also when it comes to sports, to the sport Directorate. The Directorate of Sports only received N\$34.7 Million and this must cater, and out of this N\$7.2 Million is for the Namibia Sport Commission, and all the sports codes they must get money from the N\$7.2. It is now soccer, rugby, tennis, everything they must survive from N\$7.2 Million. Are we really fair if we think about that? No I do not think it is fair.

So I think really in the future something must be done if we really want to see the Ministry, because the Ministry has many obligations sports all over. It is Olympic, Commonwealth, youth games, they must go there and then they are also students who perform. The Ministry cannot even afford to give them an ice-cream as thank you because there is no money. There is no money when it comes to boxing, when it comes to athletics. I really pity the Ministry. So I think really those responsible for the Budget next

time at least even half a billion. If some Ministries got billion and the youth just got N\$200 Million not even N\$300 Million and really one expects the Ministry and the youth to perform.

For instance here the National Youth Council only gets N\$10 Million. For the National Youth Council. The National Youth Council has got regional youth forums and they have constituency youth forums. How will they survive with N\$10 Million? We have 14 regions and we have 121 constituencies. How will they survive of the N\$10 Million?
(Intervention)

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Can we have order in the House. We are having so many meetings now.

HON EKANDJO: Will the youth perform, and when it comes to sport N\$7 Million? Is it really fair? I really think it is not fair. Let us make it clear. Do not let those who are in the Ministry think that it is deliberately done to sabotage the Ministry. I do not want us to get that idea. I do not want. I am saying this because whenever we have a Budget hearing that was my language, the Deputy Minister can testify. That is my yes even last year I decided that I did not want to go there, but the officials said no, go because whenever we have a Budget hearing is only a fight. It is really unfair.

With that Comrade, I support the Vote. Let us or let the Budget really ensure that next time the Ministry is adequately funded so that it fulfil its calling and its obligation. If we are talking of the youth every person from the age of 18 up to 35. We must not only think of the youth the school children. The police, the civil servants, the teachers all of them are in that category.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON LIMBO

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Can I remind Honourable Jerry you are running out of time. You have two minutes to conclude.

HON EKANDJO: So with that Comrade I support the Vote.

Thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you. Honourable Limbo you have the Floor.

HON LIMBO: Thank you Honourable Deputy Chairperson. I will start by saying that I really want to concur with all the Colleagues who spoke before me that this Ministry it deserves more than what it is having now.

First I will start on page 3 with regard to youth development. There is a powerful statement here a sentence which goes by saying ‘youth constitute a big part of the Namibian population, and in fact current and future leaders and it is therefore critical to empower them.’

If we say we want to harvest the dividends from these people, we really need to empower them and it is now, because if we go round our Regions, we see how many youth we have in our holding cells. They are quite a number. Wherever you go in any holding cell the majority are our youth.

You go to our location like in the suburb of where I stay in Khomasdal every corner you turn you find youth, I do not know whether they are planning something or they are smoking. It is groups, and as mothers we are even scared of our sons now. It is becoming a serious issue.

Today we were told by General that we have a group of gangsters and I also saw it on TV when the Honourable Kandjii was talking to them. I think it is a good start. Maybe all of us we must try to engage our youth. I know it is difficult, but the only way to get them out of this problem is better to engage them in sports, because with sports you do not need to come from University, You can still make a living.

So therefore, I really support the call by many others, Colleagues who said let us put more money into this Vote if we really want to get the gold coming out of our youth. For now we are going to be talking but the real issue is, that as Honourable Shiweda said that we are always talking that our youth are the future, our youth are the future, but what are we doing for them. There will be a time when our kids are going to be very frustrated and we are going to start running. They are not going to check who the mother is and who the father is. They will just come to us and say we have been waiting for too long. Now we want to get what we deserve.

Therefore Colleagues I want to urge. I know money is never enough. I want to urge that next Financial Year, let us look for a way to add. I think it is one of the Ministries which deserves to get a billion. For now what we see here is very, very little because what can you do with N\$25 Million.

Whenever we go to the Regions we are told that you see this open space here this is where the sport ground is supposed to come. I think we went to three different Regions, we were told the same, and those people are waiting and the kids are frustrated. You find some of those who want to engage in sports like in football they are just squeezed. They are forced to play on the streets, and if they are knocked by cars, whom are we going to blame. It is ourselves. So let us try to really I know it is not easy but let us try to give money to this Vote. With this, I support Vote 27.

Thank you.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON KOOPER

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Limbo. Honourable Kooper you have the Floor.

HON KOOPER: Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members,

Let me take this opportunity to recognise the Minister of Sport, Youth and National Services, the Deputy Minister and the administrative staff. The leadership of the National Youth Council, the National Youth Service and all the good soldiers, the young people from local youth forum, Regional, Constituency and the national level. Your efforts were reported by the Minister in the motivation speech.

Despite the 2017-2018 Budget cuts, training was also to the youth and is noticeable and appreciated. Just to mention a few. Skills training have produced 235 from the semester course, 260 youth graduated from the first year in various skills training centres. 793 children of the liberation struggle completed certificates in skills training and employment of the 732 young people into Offices, Ministries and Agencies and the establishment of six constituency based youth enterprises are noticed.

Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee,
Honourable Members,

I have reservations with regards to the youth development Budget. For the past two decades our nation has been trying to resolve youth problems. Academically, drug abuse and teenage pregnancies, juvenile crimes, lack of workforce readiness and more. These efforts have returned mix to poor results. Youth problems are often caused by underlying issues that are widespread and chronic, as a result many youth experience difficulties in schools, have poor navigation in decision making skills. They have lack of a sense of purpose and lack of skills or access to affect change.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON KOOPER

Even when problems are addressed, youths are not automatically prepared for higher learning institutions and learning for work and life.

Repeated studies across the nation shows that today's work force lack resource skills needed to ensure worker success. The low volunteer rate is a sign that youth do not understand their civil obligations, youth must be prepared appropriately so they can respond to the challenges and opportunities of navigating adolescents and preparing for adulthood. Thus I plead to both Honourable Minister of Sport, Youth and National Service and Honourable Minister Calle Schlettwein to consider the importance of this subject matter and avoid Budget cuts during the 2018/2019 Financial Year for that particular Ministry.

Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee,
Honourable Members,

2017/2018 Financial Year was not friendly to the youth, especially the singling out of the housing of the National Youth Service. I applaud the Office of the President for a speed intervention. It is my hope that we will ensure that the interrupted services towards the youth will not be halted in this Financial Year. I understand Honourable Deputy Chairperson and Honourable Members that we have to content with less and aspire to do more.

It is in the same Motion that I am proposing to the Honourable Minister of Sport, Youth and National Services, to exhaust options of integrating youth enterprise creation with local Council and national development activities, and as a streamline benefactor of our national procurement system. I take note that the SME component has be factors in the *Public Procurement Act*. However, let us be distinguished that SME does not mean a youth by the categorisation of the business scale.

Honourable Chairperson, Honourable Members,

Finally allow me to congratulate the Ministry of Sport, Youth and National Services for the gold medals they have attained and that we see

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON MURORUA

more planned sport programs and activities for the MTEF of 2018/2019 Financial Year. With these few contributions, I support the Vote.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you. Honourable D T Murorua you have the floor.

HON MURORUA: Thank you very much Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee.

First and foremost, allow me to congratulate Honourable Jerry Ekandjo for the expression that he has made. Indeed it shows that the concerns that the opposition and backbenchers are expressing are very much important, and that is the real truth. If it comes from a person that was in the Executive, (*Interjection*) you are not my dictionary. I just hope that you are not going to be silenced. I just hope that people are not going to be silenced by being offered high Executive positions. That is all that I am saying. Honourable thank you very much.

The practice that we were having when it comes to vocational training of the youth at the various centres was done in the past in such a way that the application forms were sent to the Regions and the Regions on their turn send them to the Constituency Offices whereby it was announced and the youth applied, but that system since 2016 has not been in practice.

My big question is how are the youth being recruited now to enter these training centres and does it not lead to a situation that those youth that are in the rural areas are excluded to receive this kind of training?

I would like to appeal that indeed it was a good system and that we have to go back to it so that youths from all the regions and all various constituencies should receive this kind of training. It is not only those youth that are in the cities, or those that are very close by the Offices that

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON NEKUNDI

need this training. With those few words, I would like to support this Vote.

I thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you. Honourable Murorua. Honourable Veikko Nekundi.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Thank you very much Comrade Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee.

I took the Floor to contribute to this very important Vote. The Vote that is talking to the youth, very important indeed. A number of Honourable Members who took the floor have expressed in a broader context my views on the Budget allocation to this particular Vote. I just want first and foremost, to get an understanding that in any fund allocation that is known so on a global scale that funds are always limited and in this way that our own funds are equally limited and it has also shrunk to where we are finding ourselves today.

In an event of that nature you prioritise based on the importance. I want to seek the understanding. Is it so that the decision to cut the Budget allocated to **the youth Ministry** by 67% in comparison to other Votes. Is it that the youth are regarded less important? I really want to understand that, or it is not a priority in the context of the needs of our young persons because, 67% cut is not a joke?

Comrade Deputy Chairperson I went further to look at the Budget allocated in the particular Vote to the **National Youth Council**. Their Budget alone on personal expenditure it is N\$12 Million, but the total allocated to the National Youth Service is N\$7 Million. Are we saying they must retrench or what are we saying?

What are we talking about? It is my expectation that before you do any cutting the personal expenditure is of paramount because that is what we all say you cannot touch. Now in this context, National Youth Service will not be able to pay its employees for the next 12 months. They need N\$12 Million just on personnel. In total looking at other operational issues they need plus minus N\$24 Million. How are they going to cater for this much required resources for them to be functional? How are they going to allocate the funds to the regions of which is integral part of their organization? It is not possible.

The other aspect that I really have an issue with I see there is an allocation to the National Youth Service, which is equally a drastic cut. However, I also plead to the Minister of Youth. National Youth Service has a number of infrastructures including the Rietfontein, which was meant for production purposes. These farms have now grown into shrubs. Nothing has been happening there, and they are crying that apparently they had to send youth to their houses last year. That was uncalled for. If they were to manage those farms productively, the things are standing, the equipment are idling, there is nothing happening on those farms. These colleagues must also pull up their socks.

We cannot have things that are standing idling. Grass is now growing all over. The maize were to be produced on those farms. Wheat is supposed to be produced on those farms. There is cattle or animals on those farms. Nothing is happening, so they must also pull up their socks. We understand the minimal sources we have, but you cannot have land allocated to you, hectares of land allocated to you yet you are not using productively. You are coming again to the Central Government wanting to adjust operational costs, yet you have a farm which ought to be a productive farm that is able to generate revenue for your own operation and also to feed the nation. They must pull up their socks equally. I am very much concerned about that.

Comrade Deputy Chairperson,

Let me go to I hope I still have five minutes. (*Interjection*) I am saying I hope. Then Comrade Chairperson on page 399, there is an allocation of N\$30.8 Million on others, which is then not put up for what it is. I am just asking to Comrade Minister, could this N\$30 Million possibly be considered to top up to the National Youth Council in order for them to meet their financial obligations especially on salaries, because that N\$30 Million is just on others? I do not know for what, but I hope it is of importance to be considered.

The other one Comrade is under the main division 1 - **Office of the Minister**. The youth are in the Regions and it is where their problems are being experienced on a daily basis, and we expect the Minister to be in touch with the youth to engage with them. Now there is a zero allocation on travel and subsistence allowance. That means the Minister will only be in Windhoek. How will the Minister and the Deputy be able to reach out to the youth? So I just want to understand how is the Minister going to engage with the young persons? (*Interjection*) Comrade Chairperson can I borrow you my mouth so that he can proceed with his mouth?

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Is it a Point of Order. Yes.

HON MUHARUKUA: Yes, Point of Order, Point of Information. I completely understand.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: You have the Floor.

HON MUHARUKUA: Yes, and I am talking. I agree that the Minister must be in the field. Maybe it is about time that the particular Minister that you are referring to, sets the example and travels to the field without S & T. He does not even have a free car. He has free fuel. Maybe he can be out in the field meeting the youth without S & T. It is a good example. I would encourage you to do that.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Yes Honourable Nekundi continue.

HON MUHARUKUA: The Honourable young person here he possibly needs time to think what he wants to say and he asked the Floor for that purpose.

The issue of the sport it was addressed. I think it was adequately addressed.

My final say on the youth Ministry is that, the young persons are really in need of employment for that matter, productive employment. We have a number who graduates especially from the agricultural Colleges under UNAM or agricultural schools under UNAM. These are trained persons who should be able to go in the field and produce food for us. Could the Comrade Minister of youth for example engage with Comrade Minister of Lands and Agribank, so that these young persons are located plots of land even it is 8 000 hectares of farm. If you partition that farm into small allotments, even of 5 hectares each, and you equip them even using imagine just, if you can take one hectare under hydroponic farming, how much food you can produce and they yield of that nature is enormous
(Interjection)

There is a difference between irrigation and hydroponic. These are two different things. *(Interjection)* I am saying hydroponic.

If you want to talk about irrigation you have that floor.

HON MEMBER: One hectare of hydroponic?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: That is why you are paid to be here and talk. (*Interjection*)

HON MEMBER: The Minister of Finance is not? (*Indistinct*)

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: We know about it. I am seeking the Comrade attention so that if this thing can be considered and you look at we have the Kavango River, the Kunene River and Zambezi River and also other water point's catchment areas. If throughout the Kavango River all these rivers if this can be put up allocated into small irrigation hubs, production hubs, how much employment are we going to create for the young persons and honesty speaking, we understand? I understand for that matter that we have institutions created, but some of these institutions are not driving the agenda of the Government of the day. That is my serious concern. One time one side we are saying we have this institution, but in particular let us look at Agribank for example.

Agribank we train the young persons in agriculture, they go to Agribank, they are asked to give a guarantee. Where will the young person get a guarantee from? Possibly my daughter, possibly my son might have a guarantee maybe. What at whose parents does not even have an asset registered in Windhoek or any Municipal land?

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON NEKUNDI

What are they going to do? We are basically training them to again be a job seeker. I am just seeking from the Comrade Minister to engage. I do not want a question.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: It is a Point of Order. Did you agree?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Is it a question?

HON NAUYOMA: Comrade Nekundi are you aware that even people that are already in this business of producing, with the small scale cabbages that they have they are still failing to get a proper market for them to sell these products?

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Continue Honourable Nekundi.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: That is a problem of not knowing the difference between a question and a non-question.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON DIENDA

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Just talk through the Chairperson. Do not pay attention there.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: That is a question. I will continue. That is a question and I am not going to entertain that for now. I am not going to address that. My purpose to take the Floor is to seek the attention of the Minister to engage with the institution entrusted to drive certain agendas productive agendas. As I take my speech I am speak upon that Comrade Minister of Youth and Comrade Minister of Finance, to engage on the possible reallocation of the Budget to the Ministry of Youth.

I am sure this Budget will not be able to operationalise the Ministry of Youth and its Agencies, unless we are setting them up for failure. So they are going to collapse Colleagues. So my appeal the Minister of Youth, the Minister of Finance maybe with the heads of these institutions particularly the National Youth Council to engage each other so that they find a common ground in addressing these serious situations. I so submit my support to the Vote.

Thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Nekundi. Honourable Dienda you have the Floor.

HON DIENDA: Thank you Honourable Chairperson.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON DIENDA

Honourable Chairperson. As a mother of youth let me also rise my concerns. Honourable Minister with youth, David James Dienda and Elmarentia Jonell Dienda they are youth. Honourable Minister on page 405 of the estimate of revenue income and expenditure. Honourable Minister before I speak to this page, I do have a concern and my concern is that there is no National Youth Act in Namibia to guide our youth.

In the absence of a National Act, things will go as it goes now. We have a *National Youth Service Act, 2005* (Act. 6 of 2005). We have a *National Youth Council Act, 2009* (Act. 3 of 2009) but the same cannot be said for your Ministry. There is no Act which includes all these organisations which is the guiding document for these organisations, and this is one of the reasons that we are sitting with these problems.

We have a National Youth policy, but we do not have a National Youth Act to guide our children. Honourable Minister let me continue. The National Youth Service will receive N\$36 Million on page 405. The National Youth Council will receive N\$7 Million. As was said by the previous Minister of Sport and Youth. I do not know the comparison. How did you come up with the N\$36 Million and the N\$7 Million, because when I go through the activities and programs of the National Youth Council and the National Youth Service, I came up with a concern and this is that, how come that we are budgeting so high for the National Youth Service and so low for the National Youth Council?

Honourable Minister allow me to go further. My second concern with your Ministry is, the youth are in the category of 18 years until 35. These are the youth of our country. Now if you look at these youth, 18 years and 35. It is either some of them just a small percentage might be in school. Others are at universities. Others are unemployed or others are working.

Now you are looking at the ones who are currently working, the ones who are at UNAM or any other tertiary institution. Your youth Offices, centres are open from 8 o'clock in the morning until 5 o'clock in the evening. Now the people that you are catering for are not available during these hours, unless they are unemployed. So your target group, you did not

involve your target group. They are the ones who are left behind and they cannot benefit from this program and not only that it is only open from 8 until 5, even over weekends, your Offices are closed because your people do not work over time. So Honourable can we look into how can we collaborate the timing, shift working or whatever, just to make the youth centres applicable to the youth for whom they are meant for and not for the few which are unemployed?

Honourable Minister I also want to give another concern. Honourable Jerry Ekandjo has said and I support him, because last year I asked him the same. (*Interjection*) Honourable just listen. Do not fight me, let me rather not say that word (*Laughter*) Honourable the fight is over why are you still fighting, the fight is over you are now there with me. Honourable my concern is also the construction of the youth Head Office in Katutura. Really the amount of rental there they are paying is too much.

When we went to Kavango Region, we have noticed that the Ministry of Youth and Sport are renting youth offices in an area that is just surrounded with shebeens. It is just shebeens all around this youth centre, and I asked myself is this the way that we want to educate our youth or to bring them up. So if they have proper facilities maybe this problem of alcohol abuse, drug abuse, and teenage pregnancy might be solved.

Now Honourable Chairperson my second question is actually for the (*Intervention*).

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: There is a Point of Order.

HON EKANDJO: I just want to tell the opposition they must not use my name. I am not in their dictionary. No references to me.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Honourable Dienda continue.

HON DIENDA: Yes, you are not, but you are everybody's punch bag. Even in your party they are punching you every time.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Can you continue.

HON DIENDA: Honourable Deputy Chairperson this question is a concern Honourable Calle, Ministry of Finance. Honourable Calle it is a concern for me.

I have noticed that the Office of the Minister of Youth and Sport, their personnel expenditure is N\$2.5 Million for two people, the funding for two people. Then I noticed that for the Minister of Higher Education, Training and Innovation, also two people the Budget for personnel expenditure of N\$1.7 Million.

So my concern is are there people more senior than others, and that is why there is such a big gap between the salary of these two officers? The one for two people that N\$1.7 Million and the other one for N\$2.5 Million so if the Honourable Minister can look into this one, just to see what is wrong here because I am not convinced that *(Intervention)*

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: A Point of Order, yes, Honourable Minister. Honourable Minister. Can you wait for the microphone?

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON DIENDA

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: For the language I heard of saying Comrade Jerry is being punched

HON MEMBER: Punch bag.

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: Punch bag by them, is just not a good terminology. It pains some of us who have been serving under him because miracles can happen. We have experience of man leaders who are served as President. I was sitting here with the current President Comrade Hage Geingob. I was sitting somewhere with Comrade Pohamba also, so punch bag it may respond in the near future. Be careful you may call him His Excellency one day, so do not try to put our heads together that we fight each other this side. If you are used inside there, here we are matured people.

Thank you very much.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Honourable Dienda continue.

HON DIENDA: Honourable Doreen if he will contest for Presidency one day, how can I divide something which is already divided? No I cannot

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Honourable Dienda you have the Floor please. Those are just suggestions. He does not have the Floor.

HON DIENDA: No. I cannot. He made the political statement and now that I am answering you feel bad.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: No, no, what I am saying is Honourable Dienda to continue. The others who do not have the Floor, can you listen to Honourable Dienda to respond not you. Please I do not want the other people to intervene. Please Honourable Dienda continue.

HON DIENDA: Thank you Honourable Deputy Chairperson. I will listen to you thank you. I will listen to you, but people must also not try to make political statements and expecting from me to keep quiet and not to make a re-political statement. I am very good in that one. I will make it.

Honourable Deputy Chairperson. Farm Du Plessis is just a white elephant. When we visited farm Du Plessis we found so many new equipment there on that farm just there doing nothing, just there, just dumped everywhere. Even the people who are working there were sitting around there and said they do not know what to do because nothing is going on. So we are not using the (*Indistinct*) facilities that we have to our disposal. That is what we are doing.

Honourable Minister, can I go back to your speech on page 6. The National Youth Council fully promoted youth participation and development through the credit for youth in business program facilitated the process of securing of bank loans.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON KAVEKOTORA

Honourable Minister I do not know, how did you jump from the credit scheme system which was there whereby the youth got financing from the Ministry of Youth through the credit system without getting loans from the bank, because as Honourable Nekundi was saying where will they receive the collateral for these bank loans. It is here so that is my concern. There was a credit scheme which worked very well and the youth made use of this credit scheme, our Committee visited it and I know there some irregularities in that scheme but still it was working because it did not need collateral for that one. Honourable Minister with these few words, I support your Vote not full heartily because it is too little. Thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Dienda. Honourable Mike Kavekatora.

HON KAVEKOTORA: Thank you very much Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee.

I rise to make some contributions to Vote 27. I am honestly starting to have a serious concern about why we are here, and what we are doing with this whole budgeting process. We have raised some serious material concerns about the Budgets of many Ministries including from my perspective, the Ministry of Basic Education that is totally underfunded, the Ministry of Health and Social Services that is totally underfunded and now the Ministry of Sport and Culture that is also totally underfunded by youth and sport, why are you shaking your head, but anyways, which is totally underfunded.

These are good rhetoric that you are putting forward, but it looks like at the end of the day we are just back to square one. That is why I am saying that we really, I am casting doubt on the whole purpose of having to go through this exercise. It is just an exercise for the sake of exercise. Even come next year Budget, the comments and the inputs that we put into

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON KAVEKOTORA

deliberating on this Budgets will not be taken into account. It will just be business as usual. Education will be underfunded. Health will be crying for money, and so forth, so I am really concerned about it and I have to say that.

Having said that Honourable Speaker, promoted Deputy Chairperson, what in my view I have a serious issue with cut - a – Budget, including some statutory obligations, that to me is a serious concern. Some of the Votes and some of the expenditures are statutory obligations for instance, if you cut somebody's salary yes there is another act that you have to perform. You have to retrench this person to be able to cut his or her salary, but how do you cut the salary of somebody who is still employed? That is the contradiction, and I think it needs to be rectified somehow and that is what I am appealing for. In my view personnel expenditure is a statutory obligation.

You cannot cut until you retrench, and I am saying this in view because if you look at some of the Ministries Budgets, they jumped exponentially, and when that happens you ask yourself,, but when we talk about these things and we know that there is critical need for funding in some of these Ministries, why do some of these Ministries really not give over some of the funds, and I am talking specifically to the Ministry of Finance. If you look at this book where she was trying to explain, the Ministry of Finance Budget moved from N\$4.2 Billion in a revised Budget of 2017/2018, to N\$9.8 Billion according to this book.

So there is an excess of N\$5 Billion into this so if we are serious and we are being told that yes, the Budget can be changed, why do we not start looking into those items and really reallocate resources where the priorities are, and here just to remind the Honourable Members about the Maslow hierarchy of needs. We are failing in that.

Lastly, Honourable Deputy Chairperson, perhaps I only have one question to the Honourable Minister. As much as I concur with you that your Budget is cut to the bone, I just give you morale support, because I do not

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON KAVEKOTORA

have any other power apart from giving you my moral support but I want to address one specific sport court. A sport court that in my view is not being properly supported by the Ministry, but it has strategic benefits to the nation. It is a sport that instils discipline in the youth. It is a sport that gives you absolute confidence about yourself. It is a sport that gives you physical fitness even at an age of 60, like the General. It also gives you respect for other human beings, and you also have very little fear of your environment, and I am talking about traditional karate.

It does not cause any concussions like other sports like boxing and what have you, it is traditional. How much and I know that they participate in championships. Last year they also participated in Zone 6 championships on a SADC level. This is a solution to some of the social problems that we are facing among our youth, because the more you take them out of the street and you start giving them karate lessons, all things will fall in place, so I just want to urge Honourable Minister, to what degree are you really promoting the sport of karate not sport karate, but the traditional karate like the Okinawan Goju-Ryu karate, and some of these karate clubs that are more traditional than sports, because sports has injuries associated with its own?

I just want to ask the question, and if you are not contributing to that, I would like to humbly request you in this Budget that is so small to seriously look into that because that will resolve some of the social problems that we are facing today.

With that, as I have indicated before it is very difficult for me to support the Vote as I did not support the Vote of Basic Education and Health, on the basis of the fact that they are totally underfunded.

Thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Kavekatora. Honourable Katrina Himarwa you have the Floor.

HON MINISTER OF EDUCATION, ARTS AND CULTURE: Thank you very much Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee. I would like to air my timid voice to this important Vote that deals with the youth and sport that is running like a golden thread through every single individuals household.

Having said that, let me start by appreciating the Ministers, the current and the previous Ministers for the efforts they have put into making it happen under very tiring circumstances seeing the fashion in which the Budgets have been cut. Not only the Budget of this specific Vote, but many other Budgets due to the economic downturn that we have gone through.

I must also thank the Honourable Minister for having it come to the reality that the Kai //Ganaxab skills training centre has finally become a fully-fledged vocational training centre in the Hardap region. (*Applause*) That is commendable and appreciated. I have been reading today on the memories of Facebook 2013, some statements I put on Facebook 2013, when I was still the Governor of Hardap Region, where I promised the youth of the Hardap Region that I had a meeting with the Minister of Youth and Sport about the Kai //Ganaxab skills training centre to be turned into a fully-fledged vocational training centre, and to witness that it has become a reality is commendable. Thank you so much to the Minister, and for the Government of the day for that visionary leadership we are providing.

I must go further by saying also as much as we are concerned about the allocation that is given to this specific Vote, we must also appreciate that as I have already indicated it is cutting across, and that in some way that youth is catered for under the other Ministries as well, that must be appreciated also. While we think there is a need for the existence of this

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON HANSE-HIMARWA

Ministry with a specific mandate, and that is where it becomes important especially if one looks at the proportion, the number of the youth in the total population of this country. It requires that dedicated resources should be allocated for the youth of this country, if we want to propel them which is currently not the case.

If you also look at sport, we can pride ourselves as a nation with a lot of talent in terms of sports, looking at how our people are doing, our athletics, our sportsmen at the front of boxing, athletics and many other fronts, we are proud when they are bringing back gold medals, but how much have we contributed into that gold medal that is coming back home, and if we could put additional resources, how many gold medals can we acquire as a Namibian nation with the immense skills that we are having. So with that, I think there is definitely a need for us to look into the allocation.

While I am on the youth and sports, I also want to add my own challenge where we allocate mainly for education which is also not sufficient, but leaving out completely the arts and culture which can equally if it is supported appropriately contribute to the GDP of this country. I have travelled elsewhere where arts and culture have been the sole contributor to the GDP, and that can only happen when we are sufficiently supporting the heritage, the arts, and the culture. We pride ourselves few weeks back with the inauguration of the second world heritage site in Namibia, that would be boosting again our tourism and that is part of our heritage and little do we know many at times the significance and the importance of arts and culture in contributing to the GDP, and broadening up also the pie for us to again redistribute to those important activities of the Government.

Comrade Deputy Chairperson it is also important, as much as we appreciate the importance of the cutting of the Budget and the economic climate in which we have been, that we must appreciate that we all unlike in the past, performing against our performance agreement and that as much as some of the things can happen without money, but there are most

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON HANSE-HIMARWA

of the things that has to happen with resources, especially when we have to achieve our performance agreements and the promises that we have made to our countrymen under our Ministerial intents, and that is where it becomes important that when we cut, we should do it also with the caution.

I want to agree with Honourable Kavekatora the observation he made is the same observation I made, and I want to be very honest and frank, that in some instances we are observing that as much as we cut very, very generously into the other Ministries, we are also increasing in some of the Ministries, and here I have observed that the Ministry dealing with finance, has increased its Budget with if my mathematics has not left me in the dark, around 128%. I want to agree. *(Laughter)*

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: A Point of Information, Point of Order. Yes, Comrade Minister of Finance.

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee I do believe that it needs some verification. First of all, I am quite disappointed that the Chairperson of the Standing Committee of Accounts, does not understand the Budget *(Laughter)* because what the increase is in the Ministry of Finance was explained many times. There are two items. One is debt servicing it goes up by N\$3 Billion, and the other increase is condition of service is *(Indistinct)*. Those are the two items that the Ministry of Finance is Budget has increased. If you go through the Budget both of you please, look at salaries, look at services and others, we are reducing. So it is not the Ministry of Finance who is increasing in Budget, it is matters that you call statutory matters that oblige us. *(Interjection)* Well, if you do not agree, then you default be my guest. *(Laughter)*

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON NAMOLOH

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Yes, Honourable Minister of Education continue.

HON MINSTER OF EDUCATION, ARTS AND CULTURE: Thank you very much Comrade Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, I maintain for whichever reason it maybe there is increase, and we all can bring excuses and we all can justify, but I maintain that for whichever reason it may it is increased and that is what I am addressing, unless I am made to understand but definitely we cannot disagree that there is an increment, there is.

In conclusion Comrade Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, I hope that comes and moving forward as the tides are improving in terms of our economic situation that the youth and sports and arts and culture would definitely receive the necessary attention it requires.

I thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Minister of Education, Honourable Namoloh.

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Thank you very much.

HON MEMBER: The senior youth.

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: We also started as youth, we are young at heart. I fully sympathise with the Minister and I think we have noticed in the past when our Budgets were fine that when we were given money, as we lead the uniform Ministries, my uncle and my neighbour they are distracting (*Laughter*) so you know that the uniform both safety and security, the Nampol and the Correctional Service the majority of them are young people who have been recruited. You go to Defence is the same the young people. The ‘Jang’ people (*Laughter*) they train in their centres. The young people they train in their centres mostly are taken by us, the Ministry of Safety and Security and the Ministry of Defence, most of them.

HON MEMBER: It is your duty.

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Yes, we have a duty but it is now this time, when we are only talking about the Ministry itself when our Budgets were also being increased in previous times you were complaining, not knowing that we are the main recruitment of the youth. We take in big bulk of the youth in the uniform, Defence and Safety and Security. So we must know that this does not only disadvantage the youth in the Ministry itself. In all our Ministries we are responsible for recruiting them. So next time when there is something, you must also take cognisance that we are also responsible for recruiting the youth. That is all I want to tell you.

Thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Minister. Honourable Kavetuna you have the Floor.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Thank you very much Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee.

I stand up to give a voice to this very important Budget. Firstly being the former Secretary-General of the National Youth Council, and a former Deputy Minister of this Ministry. The allocation is really heartening that just a drop in the ocean has been allocated to this Ministry, but I would like also to air some issues that we need to look at as a Ministry in order to make sure that whatever resources we are getting, they are used optimally.

The first thing the National Youth Service has reported that Kai //Ganaxab has become a vocational training centre, but I think that vocational training is having an assigned Ministry. So in order for us also not to be all over, I think it is better that we can also hand over that facility to the right Ministry, and we look at the content of skills training. There are two things, having a vocational training and giving skills to the people are totally two different things. So ours in that act is a skills training but we started indulging ourselves in a very expensive exercise of running a vocational training centre that is not our mandate as a National Youth Service. I think that one we can hand over and have an agreement. It is still the same Namibian young people that are going to benefit from that centre. So it is one issue that I would like to raise.

The other thing is actually also the two organisations, the National Youth Service and the National Youth Council, the streamlining of your Executives. When I left the National Youth Council we were getting N\$10 Million in 2017. N\$10 Million was our allocation, and I am really, really disappointed that they are still at the same allocation, but then when I visited the National Youth Council and both the National Youth Service, they are having strategic Executives. They are having A, B, C Executives. I think it is very, very important that we should streamline our functions with our positions that we are creating, in order to make sure that we are

maximising whatever resources we are having to the benefit of the young people on the street.

Then the other one is, I was just looking at Honourable Ekandjo. I do not want to use him as reference but I was wondering (*Interjection*)

HON EKANDJO: You are welcome. (*Laughter*) She is family.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: I was just wondering why the Ministry did not build an Office. The National Youth Service have the most extravagant Office there in Windhoek West or Windhoek North. The National Youth Service that are actually a subsidiary to the Ministry have built this. Is it because the Ministry was first trying to look at their children the small organisations to first build their own before they start with the big building of the Ministry? I think it is very, very important that we also have to look at how we really allocate the funds to priority areas because the renting is there since day one.

This Ministry has been renting. It was first at Nictus. Then the National Youth Council was established. We moved out of building there, because we were having a corridor office in Nictus. We moved to that building. We bought it maybe for two hundred and something thousand and we started building from A to B to C and other things. Then they moved from there and they went to NDC still renting, and then the National Youth Service was started, they were somewhere here first renting, then they went to build their own building. So the Ministry is still renting. In 2016, they were actually given an eviction notice but then we are still renting.

I think we should be able to start processing ourselves and make plans. Even if we have to go to the Multipurpose Centre and start building two-

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON DR MUSHELENGA

three Offices, but it is not wise that we are remaining at that Office renting.

All in all I am really happy that credit for the youth has gone to the National Youth Council because it is a very well designed program that is building rapport of a young person to be creditworthy, rather than the money that was carried around to be given in the bush. What did you call the bush bank so for me, the scheme. I am not talking because I am biased with the National Counseling, it is my product by the way, the credit scheme. It is just that we are building a society that can create their own credit rapport. They borrow with Bank Windhoek for some time. After that when they have completed the cycle of benefiting as a young person, you can enter a bank in your own capacity and be given a loan because you have built a rapport. That is actually what they want. It is nothing to do with collateral because the fund is actually serving as a collateral. So at the end of the day the young people can be creditworthy and they can actually borrow money as they want.

With these, I will not support this amount. I am saying that I actually support the efforts of the Ministry, but I think this Chamber should be able to recommend another amount for us to approve that amount.

Thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Kavetuna. Honourable Doctor Peya Mushelenga you have the Floor.

HON MINISTER OF URBAN AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT: Thank you very much Chairperson. I spent a sizeable part of my lifetime serving the course of the youth, and I want to address a very fundamental issue here, the issue of equity in this context. Equity means the quality of

being fair and impartial. A few years ago here we passed a Bill where we differentiated that all persons below the age of 18, by the 21st of March 1990, would be catered for by the Ministry of youth, those that participated in the struggle in one way or another and not by the Ministry of Veterans Affairs. With the allocation provided to by the Ministry of Youth not only this year, but also the previous year, I am sure when the Ministry is faced with a number of these youth coming to say we want to work on this and that project, we need funds. These youth credit schemes or whatever you have will not be sufficient to cater for them. A fundamental equity constitutional principle.

Now when you do not make enough allocation to cater for those, many people have already spoken about the other youth. I am now talking about these ones that are told to go to the Ministry of Youth. You go there, there are no funds. What happens to the issue of equity, if we do not make funds available to the Ministry to also cater for this category? I really think we should pause and let our consciousness speak to us, to what we want to do for the youth of our country. Do we want to prepare for a stable future of our country by making the necessary provisions that cater for the youth in order to engage in the programs that are able to make them self-sustaining?

I really want us to pause, and if we mean business let us ensure that enough allocation of resources is provided to their programs.

With these words, I put my case to rest.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you. May I have Honourable Minister Nujoma?

HON MINISTER OF LAND REFORM: Thank you Comrade Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON NUJOMA

I simply rise to support Vote 27 and I agree with other Colleagues that this is one of the most important Votes which need our undivided support. I just wanted to comment on this issue of consecutive reduction of the Budget of the youth, and when the Colleagues were speaking, I was just wondering since Independence we have been providing some support to the various sport codes. Now that we are encountering some financial difficulties I am just noticing that our sports codes are producing more and more. You look at the Brave Warriors their performance in Morocco, you look at the boxing codes excellent up to this day.

Maybe it is good to reduce a bit (*Laughter*) it encourages the people to do more or what is happening. I just do not understand. You look at the Commonwealth, we came out with two gold yet we have bemoaning the fact that there is no money, so I think the combination of both I agree with those Colleagues that says we must increase our support to the youth. It is true. They deserve the best and we need to do that, but I have realise that with the little Budget, we have done tremendously actually a very good. I do not know. So I just wanted to give my credit to the former Ministers of Youth Comrade Jerry and the others. Really we have seen results. (*Interjection*)

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: Even Pendukeni also.

HON MINISTER OF LAND REFORM: Pendukeni is just like me, the old youth. (*Laughter*) not expired, but still young at heart. So I think I agree with the former Colleagues. Let us increase the Budget for the youths. I think with this little Budget we have done more, maybe if we increase we will be able to get more gold medals in boxing, in karate but not that traditional karate to beat women, because what Honourable Kavekatora is promoting is for men to have gender based violence. (*Laughter*)

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON SHANGHALA

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: Women can even do Karate.

HON MINISTER OF LAND REFORM: So with those few comments, I support the Vote of the youth.

Thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Comrade Nujoma, Honourable Shanghala.

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: I am relatively young and compared to the retired youth, the ones who are young at heart. I think Honourable Minister what you are hearing from all the Members of this House is to say that young people are at the core of the regeneration and rejuvenation and longevity of our nation, and certainly you have our full support. I only stand to encourage you to innovate with the little that you have, because what I have seen along the lines of what Honourable Uutoni Nujoma has said, adversities maketh a person. If you take the story of Julius Jonas Junias, the young man went to Brazil, regrettably got entangled in an issue where he was accused of rape.

He could not leave the boxer who got the goals from the Commonwealth like this. (*Interjection*) I am a lover, not a fighter. So his family what he went through, his family went through and what we went through as a country literally arms tight, there was little that you could do. Comrade Jerry there and his staff, Deputy Minister and the rest he worked to try and see how we can assist the fellow. That adversity he put aside and he continued and became a gold medallist. I think that example is a good example to the Namibian youth.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON SHANGHALA

Comrade Minister when you have the opportunity, it would be great if you invite him to come and visit the Chamber even the young lady who went to run and got a gold medal the whole team at various levels they performed so we have talent. *(Intervention)*

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: A Point of Order,

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: It is just for your information Colleague.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: A Point of Information.

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: It is just for your information Colleague. The lady who is in the Defence today was promoted to a big rank she was promoted today *(Interjections)*

HON MEMBER: No, two days ago.

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: sorry she was promoted two days ago.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON SHANGHALA

Now my question is this one. Colleagues do you not feel that every Member of Parliament who is seated here in this House including the National Council, we should each have a team as for football, netball sponsored by each Member of Parliament, football for youth. In fact for me I have four named after me. So can we not do that so that we try and alleviate unemployment? From my pocket also I do sponsor them.
(Interjection)

HON MEMBER: You have money.

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: Let us do that. Each Member of Parliament should have either in your village to have a team of youth and you sponsor that team. Do you not think that it is better?

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Yes, Honourable Shanghala.

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Honourable Doreen Sioka a mother, speaks the truth. I know that for instance, I was very impressed to learn that for many years now the Chief Justice always has a tournament. The Minister of Health in his village, villages actually around there always has a tournament, and Brendon Simbwa tournament of AK47 Doctor Kawana, so people are doing this. I think what we are saying is and really this is through you and through this Budget Vote. What the Namibian people are saying to the Namibian youth is, it may be difficult wherever you are, and I am using again the example of the boxer.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON SHANGHALA

It may be hard for you but there is always hope. There is always a possibility to turn your adversity into championship.

So Honourable Minister the Budget maybe cut but the spirit is not dampened. If anything, we should now rise up and challenge more. It is being done by business. I see Government entities more than I even see some of these companies which are from South Africa the Sanlams, the Old Mutuals in the financial service sector. They do not produce anything by the way, but they are here and have a good market. They should also plough back into sports and culture. Towns like Omaruru if they could do it in Grahamstown, and there is an arts festival being done by corporate entities there and sport stadium, FNB stadium, why are those companies not investing in our youth, it is left to Government alone.

Lastly Comrade Minister, I am just saying reach out to them, and if it means that we have to beg them all of us, we tell them because they cannot do business in an environment where the youth are not constructively engaged. Tomorrow we can all die out, and those young people must be engaged productively, economically for them to have products to sell.

Lastly Comrade Minister I was just thinking at the back of my mind. You do not have to answer maybe now. You can think about it. It is a thought that I am just trying to express. We have the National Youth Service. Will it graduate into a proper civic duty type of system where you finish school, you go through and then once you have gone through, you are available in times of need. I do not know if it is feasible, it has lot of logistics, administration and costs etcetera, but the product of it, when I engage with German citizens, when you engage with Swiss citizens, you can tell that these people have had some service, some period of service. The patriotism that they have is just different, and at the back of my mind there is the question of are we at some point going to introduce even maybe for the young people pledges of allegiance, (*Interjection*) because now we have too many of these. I am not saying conscription *per se* but something along that line, does not have to be with that.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON UUTONI

A cadet type of thing because back in the days as the elders will tell you they had boy scouts and girl scouts and it taught them survival skills.

These kids of ours if you take the iPad away then they become disabled. They are not social creatures anymore, one to one, they are social creatures on social network, so I am just saying those things are good to think of, and while I was talking about the pledge of allegiance yes, I believe in religion and I believe in what we do there it is perfect, but that pledge of allegiance to Namibia. Ask any of those kids who have schooled in countries where they have a pledge of allegiance, you will never forget it, and that bond with that allegiance and the commitment you make on a daily basis engraves your attitude towards your country.

With those few remarks Comrade Minister, mine is just really words of encouragement to you and your staff, to your entities, to the youth of Namibia that if that boy could do it, he has taught us and a lot can emulate from that.

Thank you very much.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you. I have now exhausted the list. Can I invite now the Honourable Minister of Sport to provide the answers or to reply?

Yes, Honourable Minister you have the Floor. Just take your time. The questions are too many just take your time.

HON MINISTER OF SPORT, YOUTH AND NATIONAL SERVICE: Thank you very much Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 27**
HON UUTONI

First of all, I would want to say thank you very much to all of you here for the support towards this Vote of your young people. It really shows, and it is an indication that the leadership of this country has the sympathy, and they really want to see the young people to be assisted despite the economic difficulties in our country. Thank you very much for that point.

To start with the first person is *Honourable Van Wyk*. You have mentioned that the Vote is neglected, but you are impressed by the work done by the staff in the Ministry. Thank you very much for the support, and you have also a kind of a worry when it comes to the rugby team and you really want them to win for them to qualify. Yes, they will qualify. We are committed. Having learned about this support from the leadership, I think their morale is now boosted so they are going to try their level best.

You asked about the establishment under the Directorate of General Service the 126, and it is only 86 the posts that are filled. Yes, Honourable Van Wyk, you know you are a leader in this country and you are following what is happening. The Prime Minister's Office has just issued a moratorium that vacancies now in the Ministries should be frozen for the time being should not be filled. So now with this establishment we really want to fill some of the very important or key positions, but due to the economic difficulties that we are facing, we cannot fill all the vacancies in the establishment so that is the situation not only with the Ministry of Sport, Youth and National Service, but it is a cross cutting situation to all Ministries in Namibia.

School sports you are concerned about the san children school-going, that maybe we could have reach them for them to participate in the long distance marathon kind of running. Yes, we are there and maybe if you had followed my statement when I just started talking to my people, I said let us move to the Regions and also into schools. We need to strengthen the school sports. It is very, very important so we are going to reach them. We understand and thank you very much for the advice.

Two, *Honourable Anna Shiweda* you have started with the proverb without young people or youth then your future is doomed.

Thank you very much. Yes, but what I have seen here is that every one of us have an interest in the promotion of the activities of the youth in this country. You have also indicated that the Budget it has been drastically cut from years back. Now it has gone down. Yes, there I do not want to say much. Yes, the Budget is cut of course, other Budgets in other Ministries were also cut so I do not want to comment on that one.

You are concerned about the slow implementation of Capital Projects in our Ministry. You said some of the projects took about three to four years or even more than that. Sometimes as we are talking about the financial constraints, sometimes this year you are budgeted, and this year there is nothing and you have to wait. Just an example, just to give you an example of the project in Outapi. We want to develop a sports field there but this it was only budgeted in the last Financial Year. This Financial Year it is only a, how do you call this fee, the retention fee but what have been done there is just a fencing and the combating of the field.

It means now you are expecting this sport field to be finalised but due to financial problems you have to wait. In this Financial Year there is nothing so these are some of the examples that may delay the process of finishing some of the capital projects.

You are saying we need to go to the rural areas to put up infrastructures, yes, you are hundred percent correct Honourable Deputy Minister, and our target is there. I have already mentioned Outapi, Kavango-West is one of them because these are some of the Regions that have just been established like Kavango-West for example. We are going there. We are trying our level best.

Vocational education, lack of accreditation, yes, at the beginning what we were doing we did not have enough resources in terms of equipment, materials to put us at standard, where when somebody has finished that trade of study, then we would be accredited. Now we have realised that no, this is one of the weaknesses and will not be able to get sufficient money in our Budget allocation, so what we have decided and it is one of the innovations. We said let us start to identify partners within

Government. We then identified Ministry of Higher Education. We are now cooperating with Ministry of Higher Education. They now have not sufficient, but some finances together with NTA, so now they are going to support as the Minister of Education has just alluded saying that she is so happy to see that Kai //Ganaxab Centre is now a fully-fledged centre. It is the idea that we have just put on the table. We have now signed that Memorandum of Understanding. Now those who are going to graduate from that centre their qualifications are going to be accredited, so we are moving.

Honourable Jerry Ekandjo you have congratulated the work of the Ministry and I also want to congratulate you for what you have done. What we are doing, some of the things are things that you have done together with other Ministers who were there. My former Minister of Home Affairs was also there first one. (*Interjection*)

HON MEMBER: First one.

MINISTER OF SPORTS, YOUTH AND NATIONAL SERVICE:
First one, Congratulations Mam. You are saying the allocation is not enough, and you are saying there is only N\$7.2 Million to sport. Yes, that is the Sport Commission. They are only give N\$7.2 Million. It is true that is the situation. There is nothing that we can do now, but as Honourable Shanghala said we can always do with little. We will try our level best.

Honourable Limbo, youth, young people today if you follow, if you check very well. When you went to visit the Regions, a big number of young people are kept in holding cells in the Ministry of Safety and Security, so they ae there. It is true I agree with you.

I was also working under Ministry of Safety and Security and I can see a big number of battalions of young people majority of them are men, it is not a good picture at all. So you are just cautioning that we should support the youths and then sport should also be allocated with sufficient money or funds. So thank you very much Honourable Limbo.

Honourable Paula Kooper, so you are saying at least we should support the Ministry. This Budget cut is not good, and you also thank the President for his intervention. Maybe you read what I have mentioned in my statement there that the trainees at Rietfontein were send home just because there was not sufficient funds and then the President intervened. Yes, all of us, we really want to say thank you very much to His Excellency the President.

Honourable Murorua applications of young people to vocational training centres. You are saying that previously they used to be announced through the constituency level but now it is like it has changed. No, it has not changed. We are still maintaining the same style of inviting young people through the constituency Councillors, and we are not only training people in urban areas, we are drawing people from all the constituencies. If you have noticed something please come to me and let me know, but we are still maintaining the same style.

Honourable Nekundi Budget cuts to 67% is not a good thing. Yes, you are saying the Budget is drastically cut and you are not supporting this. Well, it is true the Budget is cut (*Laughter*) but you are cautioning us and I think it is good when you raised this issue that sometimes we should also be blamed here and there because, you have specifically mentioned projects at Rietfontein and nothing is happening there, and it is good that all of us are here from the Ministry and majority top level management are here, we are listening and we will try our level best to adjust. If we are sleeping on duty, we hear that alarm that we are sleeping on duty, so Colleagues I hope you are listening. Then you are advising that we really need to innovate. (*Interjections*) So you are also advising us that maybe we can start engaging Ministry of Lands maybe through their land

resettlement program maybe to allocate some farms to the youth so that the youth can start engaging in farming, I really applaud that suggestion. I am also maybe thinking of saying that *Honourable Mutorwa* yesterday was saying there are many Government cars there in the Government garage, they are just parked and we have trained many, many young people in mechanics, in many things and maybe we can together test whether the young people that we have been trained in vocational school can do some maintenance of those cars, and then buy some spare parts here and the renovation of the buildings that we are talking, maybe also say those who were trained from vocational schools, who did brick laying and electrical work, carpentry. So we can maybe organise ourselves because you are talking about innovation, instead of maybe just asking big companies there to come and do maintenance yet we have many people. I think maybe we can look into that thinking.

Honourable Dienda there is no National Youth Act in place despite those Acts, *National Youth Service Act*, *National Youth Council Act*, *Sport Act* but what we want is an overall National Youth Act. Thank you for the proposal, and these are the ideas that we want so that we can come up with something. I will just take it up and then see if my Colleagues will also add on what you have said because you are talking about the overall, the umbrella National Youth Act that will guide the youth. Not the *National Youth Service Act*, that one is in place. *National Youth Council Act* is in place. *Sport Act* is in place, but you want the other one the umbrella one. That is what you are saying.

Honourable Dienda you have also mentioned that maybe we need to change our way of operation. You said from 8 up to 5 we are in our Offices but the people that we are targeting that time they are at school. They do not find time to come at the Offices. Maybe you want us to rotate. We are talking about the financial constraints. We are going to look into that, although it is not an easy thing. The other question you pose it to the Minister of Finance.

Honourable Kavekatora the traditional karate is there, well recognised. Nine constituencies are practicing this, so it is there, recognised and one

of our karate players won a medal in America. It is there. (*Interjections*)

HON MEMBER: The United States of America

HON MINISTER OF SPORTS, YOUTH AND NATIONAL SERVICE: The United States of America. *Honourable Hanse-Himarwa* you have expressed your happiness to see that Kai //Ganaxab is now a fully-fledged centre. That is the innovation and the initiative that we have taken, and then our people there now are to when they graduate they will have accredited qualification and then you said the allocation to the budget should be looked into seriously.

Honourable Namoloh you have just. Thank you very much. We know that those who are training are coming to you. We know.

Honourable Kavetuna your main question here is that why are we not building the Ministry Head Office. We are just renting, renting, renting since many years. (*Interjections*) exactly. You asked questions. So Honourable Kavetuna it is true we need a Head Office, but since now we are prioritising first to go to the rural areas to build some sport infrastructure and youth centres so of course we will be coming there, but we take the advice. Excuse me Honourable Kavetuna did I not answer you?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: You did.

HON MINISTER OF SPORTS, YOUTH AND NATIONAL SERVICE: I did.

Honourable Mushelenga the allocation to credit scheme is not sufficient. Thank you very much for the advice. I think everyone here is listening not only to the Minister of Sport but everyone here is listening.

Honourable my “*mbushe*” (namesake) *Uutoni Nujoma* our sports codes are producing fruit it is true. We have won those gold medals. You have seen them and we will try to do more with your support as you have shown it here today we are going to win more gold.

Honourable Shanghala innovation, you said we really need to innovate with the little that we have. We are listening Honourable Shanghala for your advice. So you mentioned something that you want me to take it with me. I will take it up. I do not want to repeat it here and Honourable Mushelenga I have answered him.

I just want to propose that Honourable Members when we hear that there will be a tournament or a game between Brave Warriors here in Namibia, I will come and invite you, and I want to see a big number of Honourable Members there, and then if you are there your presence is going to boost the morale of our players. Please try your level best.

Thank you very, very much for the support. (*Applause*)

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Minister for that reply. Any objection? Agreed to.

I put Vote 29 - “**INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY**”. I recognise Honourable Doctor Ankama you have the Floor.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 29**
HON DR ANKAMA

HON DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE PRIME MINISTER OFFICE:
Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee.
(*Intervention*)

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Can I have order in the House?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE PRIME MINISTER OFFICE:
Tell them to keep quiet. Honourable I support Comrade Simataa, I support you wholeheartedly. There are just one or two things that I wanted to allude to.

I was looking at program number 2. Perhaps before that, I must say that with regard to **communication** in general, communication in general I do not know why? From my understanding there are towers for MTC and the others. I do not know who they are. Now so many towers, each has their own. I do not know could there not be a possibility for all these towers to be shared among the companies like MTC, Telecom and the likes?

You see I could also see that perhaps because of the acquisition of communication tools, telephones, cell phones and what have you. The reception is getting poorer. Signals are getting poorer and poorer and then the encroachment of this new companies that are bringing in additional equipment for boosting signals. I think we need to revisit the issue of whether we can, or what is CRAN doing? CRAN should do their work to compel all these companies to work together, so that the towers are used for the benefit of everyone. Where the signals were reachable in the areas perhaps. (*Intervention*)

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 29**
HON DR ANKAMA

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Can I ask Honourable Nekundi to go to your seat please? You are conducting illegal meetings there. Yes, Honourable Ankama can you continue.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE PRIME MINISTER OFFICE:
Thank you Sir. So what I am saying is where for example after two years or three years communication or signal was very good or reception was good, currently, it is no longer good. Perhaps people have multiplied those who have acquired equipment, or perhaps because towers are being shared singly MTC theirs, Telecom theirs and so on. Let this be looked into. CRAN should do their work probably better.

Then I have a query with regard to **NBC** particularly TV. You know both TV and radio services. TV in particular, I do not know whether there is a problem with the Journalists or with the Editors, one of the two.

Even on TV now, yesterday I was on TV. Let me tell you yesterday I was on TV my brother. They said someone from the Office of the Prime Minister. You did watch. These are people who I was delivering a speech by the Prime Minister, and there were journalists and then they said yes, the speech was read by someone from the Office of the Prime Minister. I have been watching this for quite some time now. I think it is deliberate, but I have been watching for quite some time almost two or three years. I would say perhaps the problem with the journalism training maybe we have younger journalists or we have irresponsible journalists, or either if it is not journalists, then it should be editors and I think Comrade Minister this must be looked into seriously.

Take charge and bring them to book. If they need retraining they must be retrained. I have done photo journalism. I have been working for in fact, (*Laughter*) let me tell you for your information Comrade, but you know very well. I established what we called the Namibian worker. This was a newsletter for the National Union of Namibian Workers (NUNW) in those

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 29**
HON NGHIMTINA

Years, and even for the Namibian the Oshiwambo section. It is me who started it that time, but we used to report responsibly. I have done this photo journalism (*Interjection*) even Omukuni yes, I did but let me tell you. What I am saying is the most important thing here is not for Chief Ankama. Also when they write names they should know names of people.

Today you hear Chief Samuel Ankama, Samuel Ankama and my name is Samuel Chief Ankama. If you want me to get my ID to you, I will send it. (*Laughter*) All what I am saying is we have Honourable Members here, and if you listen to what they are writing about the Honourable Members names it is disgusting. I think retraining is important for these people to be just taken in through so that they can write professionally. Let me not go too far. Comrade Simataa let me support you wholeheartedly.

Thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Samuel Chief Ankama. I think I am correct. I pronounced it correctly. Honourable Errki Nghimtina you have the Floor.

HON MINISTER OF LABOUR, INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS AND EMPLOYMENT CREATION: Thank you Deputy Chairperson. I stand to support our people is Ministry, which is the Ministry of the Pensioners because they are listening to NBC all the time, every day, education, entertainment and for information, but I support your quote Honourable Minister where you came up with on page 5 there, when you quoted Malcolm X. Media is the most powerful entity on earth, they have the power to make the innocent guilty and to make the guilty innocent, and that is the power because it controls the minds of the masses.

It is very powerful mostly in our country also but also all over the world whereby you find now our social media which are misusing, misleading, misinforming the people, they also disrespect anybody, forget elderly people, no respect for authority even. They write left and right anything they feel they want and they do not even consider the rights of other people. This is what they are doing. If those who are writing are the young people, they should remember that one day they will also be old (*Laughter*) and what they are planting they should remember that their children will do it also against them.

Then we have also the issues coming up now **breaking news**. This whole thing is only time consuming for the Government is time, for the work of the Government and even your own time because you are only reading and following and we can see even here everybody some of them are looking on this issue. It is not breaking news now, but we are being colonised by the system we bought. You are only following until you have forgotten the time something you were supposed to have done, but Honourable Minister when is our Bill coming to control the situation. For us to know that all the dos and the don'ts? I think it will help us a lot. Our children are being spoiled and destroyed by all these issues what is happening, because they are destroying even images of the people for nothing, but I am thankful for those using the system very well with respect for everybody hundred percent they are welcome. We have no problem with them.

Number two, **cellular coverage in rural areas**. There are some areas which are not covered whatsoever, and the community want to meet them. Most of the time they are always reporting no, in our area we can only communicate once you are on top of the tree etcetera and what about if somebody falls from that tree. It is another issue.

The other problem is also that our community they now like cellular phones. Everybody even elderly people, but in the rural areas there are not even repair shops for the cellular. There is not even charging stations for the cellular whatever, even just to have the solar system for charging but we need probably Honourable Minister to encourage those people who

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 29**
HON IIVULA-ITHANA

are selling the cellulars also to sell the cellular chargers to assist our people who are in the rural areas.

The other issue is also for our **school children in the rural areas**. Honestly speaking our kids in the rural areas they do not know the difference between the computer and cellular even. Everything is only the same because they are not used to all this system.

The last Honourable Simataa speed up with **paperless Namibia** and I support your Vote.

Thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Minister. The next one is Honourable Pendukeni Iivula Ithana.

HON IIVULA ITHANA: Thank you Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee.

I rise to support Vote 29, that is our Vote all of us because each one of us has a cellular phone or two. Some have even three. I do not know how we use all of them. Comrade Minister Technology is a resource. It has enriched many countries in the world. Some countries that were said to be poor such as Finland and others today because of the invasion of technology, have become one of the richest countries in the world. I am raising this issue of technology because of what we are experiencing in our own country. We could benefit economically from these benefits brought about by technology if we take this sector very, very serious.

Comrade Errki who just spoke talked about paperless processes in particular Government. On my table here some papers I have thrown

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 29**
HON IIVULA-ITHANA

away but there are still some and I am not going to use them and I am not the only one. If we are serious with the economic situation of our country, I think this is the time we need to tighten our belts and sit somewhere and design a program moving towards paperless Namibia in the Government service in particular. This is a wastage. Papers that we do not even produce. We buy them from somewhere either South Africa or Europe, at a very huge amount of money so that should motivate us to move towards paperless service.

Comrade Minister I was lucky. One time I was travelling from somewhere to somewhere, and I coincided with your launch of the mobile application of the virtual access to NBC programs. I was very, very excited and I thought maybe in your schedule you were going to have your experts coming to Parliament now, to take Parliamentarians through.
(Interjections)

HON MEMBERS: They did. They were here.

HON IIVULA-THANA: Were they, really, I missed it because that will really keep us really connected. Wherever you are, you would be able to follow what is happening at home. So I am congratulating you on that one seriously.

The other issue although it has already been mentioned by Comrade Nghimtina is truly the **distribution of these towers** recently I have been visiting the Kavango-West more often and I am telling you. If there is a Region that is not served by MTC and other information providers is Kavango-West. You just move away from Nkurenkuru a little bit, you are in the middle of nowhere. You cannot communicate with anybody and I keep asking myself why it is like this. Maybe it is somewhere else also but I am talking about Kavango-West, where I have experienced it myself.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 29**
HON DIENDA

Please let us encourage these service providers to get where our people are wherever they can be found. Let them have access also to the goodies that every Namibian have access to. With these few words, I support the Vote.

Thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable. The next one is Honourable Dienda.

HON DIENDA: Thank you Honourable Deputy Chairperson, Just two issues. The first one is Honourable Minister **NamZim** (*Interjection*)

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION, COMMUNICATION AND TECHNOLOGY: What is wrong?

HON DIENDA: What is wrong, just wait and listen before we divorce you. (*Interjections*) What is the reason Honourable Minister that NamZim are not submitting financial reports to this August House? We are giving them money. They are here taxpayer's money, no Financial Reports. Who exempt them from not submitting Financial Reports? Is it you or me or who?

Honourable Minister my second question page 423 subsidy for **Namibia Broadcasting Corporation**. Honourable Tweya, can you listen to me NBC. The Budget allocation for Namibia Broadcasting Corporation is N\$140 000. NBC is our national pride. I have a problem. My problem is that you the SWAPO led Government. (*Interjections*) Can I finish?

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 29**
HON DIENDA

You always talk about SWAPO led Government. You the SWAPO led Government you are sabotaging NBC. Let me tell you why. You have shares in Multi-Choice the competition of NBC.

HON MEMBER: No we are not.

HON DIENDA: Yes. If you have shares in NBC is a conflict of interest. That is why you make sure by only giving NBC N\$140 Million. You will make sure that the people will subscribe to Multi-Choice instead of watching NBC.

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Point of Order.

HON DIENDA: Thank you very much, on what?

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: It is a Point of Order, but the Honourable has finished. *(Interjection)* She is done. There is nobody having the floor Honourable Shanghala. *(Interjection)* The Honourable has finished Honourable Shanghala. Let the Honourable Minister reply.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 29**
HON BEZUIDENHOUT

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Are you aware Honourable Chairperson that (*Interjections*) (*Intervention*)

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Yes make your point.

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: the current unpopular party used to be an equity participating in democratic media holding?

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Good (*Interjections*) I am doing my work.

HON MUHARUKUA: No you are not doing your work

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: No, no. Honourable Steve Bezuidenhout you are the next. Yes, Honourable Bezuidenhout you have the Floor.

HON BEZUIDENHOUT: Thank you Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee. I want to (*Interjections*).

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 29**
HON BEZUIDENHOUT

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Now the Honourable has taken a seat because there are some Honourables who are having illegal meetings. Can the Honourable Bezuidenhout continue now?

HON BEZUIDENHOUT: Thank you very much. I thought they are intervening that is why I am sitting.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Honourable Muharukua please I am controlling the House and it is you who are just disturbing me not to control the House. Otherwise, I will send you out then you come back when you are controlling the House.

Thank you. Honourable Bezuidenhout you have the Floor. *(Interjection)* no you do not have the dialogue with the person who is chairing. I did not give you the Floor to speak, and you cannot speak while you are seated.

First, Honourable Bezuidenhout you have the Floor.

HON BEZUIDENHOUT: Thank you Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee.

Honourable Minister I want to congratulate you on the theme of your budget motivation “*leveraging ICT*”. My question is leveraging ICT for what? For efficiency, for cost saving, for protection, our citizen protection and for various things. You can use ICT to make advances in this country? Honourable Pendukeni Iivula-Ithana has mentioned the papers that we have here. It is a way of saving cost. Paperless is the way to go, but we should not talk about it, we should actually do something about it

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 29**
HON BEZUIDENHOUT

and I want to encourage you to really take your programs forward in your focus manners that you have delivered it and the reason for the programs is that and I want to read you your third paragraph. We must take advantage of the people who use dividends and place the youth at the centre of the digital economic activity. This implies that our actions should be able to create economic activities and opportunities for our young people. Now the young people are very skilled in doing that. I am sitting with my cell phone on.

I have access to IT program that they develop over a cell phone which they can do for this country as well. There is a quite a lot that we can do in this country that I am very glad that we have reached the point of economic starvation because that one will wake us up to look for innovative ways of dealing with our money support shortage. Then we can really leverage the ICT to really get to where we want to be.

I just want to highlight one program, **program information communication development**. That is something that has huge potential for this country if given the right status in this country, if given the right support in this country, if given the right everything. Now if you have plans, regulations, contacts, institutions just share with us that information. Where do we go to? If a young person has an idea where does he go to, to get information, to get plans, to know what is your policy and to submit, because so many times we make statements in this House but when the young people want to inquire we give them the run around.

For five years I was a Member of the Development and ICT amongst the young people and am still with them but I can tell you guys Honourable Members Namibians are very, very skilled. *(Interjections) (Laughter)* No I am saying Honourable Members. I think we should really become quite serious in our endeavours. We should say what we mean and we mean what we are saying. We must put our efforts behind our plans. With these words I really want to encourage you to keep on Minister and I support your Vote.

Thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Bezuidenhout. The next is Honourable Caley.

HON CALEY: Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members.

I rise to support Vote 29 of the Ministry of Information and Communication Technology. I think I do not want to repeat what was said the benefits of if we have to embrace ICT in this digital world we find ourselves. Let me start with the good things just to register my appreciation to the Minister. Thank you very much in advance for the promise you made to everybody the Parliamentarians to get the ipads. (*Applause*). That is to demonstrate that the Ministry is serious to cut on these papers when in our Parliament. Just for the benefit I just want to give you an example which we observed when we did some visits to different institutions.

Number one, Office of the Prime Minister which is operating in the Ministry of Trade. When they demonstrated, you can see now emphasis on the issue of efficiency. You can see that morning how many babies were born where, and how many are registered so it makes it easy for planning. At Roads Authority they demonstrated for us when they switched on, and then we could see how much was deposited at the different is it Natis offices? So monitoring and then it gives you an idea so it cuts on many fraud. GIPF (*Interjection*)

HON MEMBER: Many what?

HON CALEY: Fraud. GIPF they demonstrated to us that in the past when you do the verification of the people who are paying, they used to lose a lot of money, but nowadays with the bio electronic verification and they can go up to the rural areas. They have a mobile car and they do this one. They really sad they curb also on the loss just to mention a few. To emphasise the fact the previous speaker was saying, if we use it correctly, we can go far.

Now the other point what I want to make is on page 3 to 4 of the Minister's statement. He was talking about this Bill which was referred to by Honourable Nghimtina **Electronic Transaction and Cyber Crime** which was made for one Bill is now at this stage passed. I am happy to hear Honourable Minister through the Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, that you reached a stage to finalise the consultation. We are really waiting for this Bill and now in a form of two because it will be separated Electronic Transaction a different Bill, and Cyber Crime a different Bill.

We need this legislative in place. The police are complaining that when you have to charge somebody, if you do not have law in place, you charge him on what. To make their work easy it will be appreciated so that we do not wait for another ten years again. This Bill must come. The other issue this Bill will assist our children when it comes to phonography and the other issues. The stakeholders are complaining and saying children are really in danger. We call for this law to be put in place.

The other issue is on the development Budget of the Ministry page 564 on the *construction*. I was looking at how many Regional Offices will be catered for in this MTEF. The target is on Keetmanshoop urban constituency, Katima Mulilo urban constituency, Mariental urban constituency, Rundu urban constituency which is in Kavango East and then Nkurenkuru in Kavango-West. You know to my surprise if you look when this project was started and where we are now. The one of Rundu, Kavango-East, is among the first one which site was given in 2014 and I was asking myself why it cannot finalised. Before we discuss this one I verified that this week Thursday I hope it is true it would be inaugurated.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 29**
HON DR HAUFIKU

Now if the Ministry could get it right I want it to use that same strategy to accelerate the ones you are embarking upon.

Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House and Honourable Members,

To conclude I was really impressed when the statement was made, the way it was presented, but Honourable Minister to my surprise I think we put it last year again. We are going for a electronic. There is no e-mail at the end and there is no website. I think please if you have to give a good example that people can contact you electronic. With that remark, thank you very much for your attention. (*Applause*)

I support the Vote.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Caley. The next is Honourable Doctor Haufiku.

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: Thank you very much Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee.

In supporting this Vote I have three points on which I want to seek your support and concurrence in supporting the Honourable Minister of ICT.

The first one is already highlighted by Honourable Pendukeni Iivula Ithana and is about the **piles of papers** that we are having here. In fact we are having in all our Offices, Cabinet, everywhere you go. Now there are two things here Honourable Members. One is what is already clearly demonstrated. The other one is that I am not so sure whether we have the data or statistic how much money we spent in exact figures whether a study has been conducted on that or not.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 29**
HON DR HAUFIKU

The second point I know as it has been said that we are importing papers, we do not plant trees. We only consume them. I was actually thinking that maybe apart from cleaning up on the 25th of May, as His Excellency has declared, we must also plant trees just an extension of my point in terms of saving paper.

The second point I wanted your indulgence and your support in supporting the Honourable Minister is well, before I go to that one, it does not cost us much to put **computers** here. We can even share a computer with Honourable Kapofi here, and two can share one computer there. It is going to save us a whole lot of money.

The second point I want to raise and this maybe a little bit of disappointment to many of us, but I do not think it is entirely a disappointment because as for the good future of Namibia when we talk about young people. May I propose that before every Member of Parliament gets an ipad, we should make sure that no child finishes Grade 12 without exposure to a computer at school? For me that is more crucial. Half of us or more than half of us have got computers and ipads. So it is a good gesture from the Honourable Minister, but the reality up there and I have seen it even at Dobra.

I have a niece who is doing Grade 10 at Dobra and I was pushing for her to get exposed to computer classes. They do not offer because they do not have computers, and they are many of these kids from very poor backgrounds who are attending schools and not getting exposures to the computers so they will finish Grade 12 without knowing how to operate a computer except those that are from our families. We can buy them laptops, we can buy them computers.

Can we try Comrade Minister a project where we make sure that we support the Ministry of Basic Education, to make sure that every school in Namibia has a computer even if they are sharing it does not matter. Even if they are sharing, but at this moment at this technologically advanced world, to let kids leave High School without exposure to a computer is a retrogressive step. We should support that. That is one.

The last one I want to plead with the Ministry as far as health is concerned, two things.

One – (a) we have carried out a study to look at how we can successfully implement the E-Health project that is to transfer paperwork to electronic patient record. That is one. (b) To be able to do a CT scan at Oshakati or Katima Mulilo Hospital, but the data or the scan can be transferred to Windhoek for interpretation by radiologists or even in India or Europe. Now the problem Comrade Minister what we are told is the issue of opening up the bandwidth. Apparently communication Ministry somehow for some reasons does not seem to want to open up that space called bandwidth for either some radio frequency or whatever technical term they use, and as a result of that, we cannot get data from a distant clinic even if we install a computer like we do have now to get this up here. Is it used up by Home Affairs? That is one.

The second one is what I always plead with all the audience. NBC Oshiwambo radio is a billboard for selling lies. People are buying space or time and they have money, on NBC Oshiwambo radio. That is the one I know for instance. Maybe others as well but Oshiwambo radio and I think is a young man with a very small voice who always goes this forever reading will cure your blood pressure, will cure your diabetes, will make you strong if you are a man, will make you all, all, all of this thing so it is a lie, we know that. I am pleading for Members please of this House in support of the Ministry, and I will bring a Motion here actually that we Debate this issue that we say no advertisement on medical products, no advertisement because the people at Oshakati listen to that.

I know that they spend queues in the hospital. They go to Omagano. I am sorry to mention the name but it is all over. They go to Omagano. They pay a minimum of N\$600. They got a plug. They are plugged on ordinary computer no magic in it and almost every single one of them is told check your cholesterol is a bit too higher. "*Inolya inina ina omaghadhi*" (Do not eat fatty food). N\$600 gone if you want the herb, you pay an extra N\$1 200.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 29**
HON DR HAUFIKU

They do not claim from Medical Aid. What are we doing? We are pushing people in poverty. That is what we are doing. That is literally what we are doing so I plead with all of us here Colleagues to support. *(Intervention)*

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Yes, Point of Information or?

HON DR ATTORNEY GENERAL: Comrade Doctor you are doing very well but you forgot one thing. Can you tell us about some of these adverts regarding enlargement and tightening and whatever? *(Laughter)*

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Yes, Honourable Minister of Health. Doctor Haufiku you have the Floor continue.

HON MINISTER OF HEALTH AND SOCIAL SERVICES: No, thank you very much maybe I was getting too serious. The Comrades they let me just bidal you know. I appreciate the input so what I am looking here in conclusion Honourable Members, is concurrence and support wherever we go and I need to commend the General of the Namibian Police Force. I have seen him yesterday, emphasising how we are being crooked by these thugs. Some of them pretending to be the preachers and the apostles but they always buy time on NBC. They buy time even the guy who comes in the evening with a glass of water, let us take water now and the misconception and the danger is that they pick someone to say something on the screen. I was a drunkard and I was what no marriage, now I am happily married and what, what, so people follow that and is misleading.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 29**
HON MWANINGANGE

Let us try to let the society follow what is evidence base, what is scientific and we can only do that through instruments such as NBC or other avenues especially of the State.

So with that, I support your Vote Comrade Minister.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Haufiku. The next one is Honourable Billy Mwaningange.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF DEFENCE: Thank you very much Comrade Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee.

Comrade Stanley Simataa I would like to congratulate you and your great team for the analytical and well-crafted Vote for us to follow and to comment. I really have a short comment based on the quote the Minister has quoted. “Media is the most powerful entity on earth.” I will not go further. You see it is true, media is powerful in giving information. My comment will centre on the radio. Our radio, broadcasting in our languages local languages, indigenous languages fortunately I happen to be gifted. God gifted me to have some of I think seven of our languages starting with my own mother languages, Otjiherero, Rukwangali, Afrikaans and Silozi.

Comrade I listen mostly to the Oshiwambo language when they are communicating. They either some of the broadcasters, maybe they are not well trained. In my Public Administration studies in communication. I was told that communication when you are communicating especially in the Office, you are communicating to make the audience to understand. not only to hear you but understand what you are saying. There is a difference between understanding and hearing.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 29**
HON KAPOFI

Now you find somebody reading the news in a native language, especially Oshiwambo. Then they are using either the jargon language or proverbs in that language and communicating is not only to communicate to an Oshiwambo who speaks Oshiwambo and who is born Oshiwambo speaking. Those who learn that language also non-Oshiwambo they can listen and want to listen to you, and in most cases they want to use this language beautifying it. When you are reading the news you are not expected to beautify it. Read so that the audience, people listeners to understand what you are saying. By the way we also have now members of our society who want to follow either in the sign language or in visual language.

If you start with reading the news then you put jargon and proverbs, that particular person will not be able to interpret in the sign language or in any language. So this is what I want to advise that please let our journalists, our news readers to be trained when they are reading the news, when they are making some story maybe to make young people to be happy, then they can use other words, but when they are reading the news, whether sending messages, they must be send correctly, clearly as well so that communication can reach and can be received and it must be a correct one. I support the Vote Comrade Minister.

I thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you. The next one is Honourable Frans Kapofi.

HON MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS: Thank you very much Comrade Chairperson.

I would like to firstly thank my Colleague Honourable Simataa and his team for the Vote what he has presented to us.

Honourable Members I want to raise one or two points.

Number one is we have a telecommunication company called **Telecom**. I have raised this matter with my Colleague already, but that is a company we own one hundred percent, but at the same time as a Government we have people who are providing similar service to us as Telecom. Whatever Telecom has done to be discarded by ourselves I do not know, but we decided to hire another service provider using the same facility of that telecommunication company that we own.

I want to plead with you Comrade Minister to look into this matter because I do not understand, how do we own a company if at all we are not happy? We must just insist that they should improve and provide the service they were created for, and not to have other people coming on the side. I did not know until recently when I was redeployed. I called and I thought I knew. I thought the system is the same only to find that it is not the same, I was wondering what is going on. Only to find out that this is what is happening. I do not know. I have some names of some companies that are doing that, but I really want to appeal to you Comrade Minister and to you all Honourable Members here really it is unfair.

Telecom, they inherited control, the whole backbone of communication in the country but still we are told they are not efficient, therefore we get some other additional people on the side to provide services. I do not understand that. I want you to look at that and you said you are going to look into it, but I wanted to raise it here so that everyone else takes note of this.

The other thing Honourable Minister is really to thank you again and to congratulate you in your efforts as you champion “my country, my pride” project. I hope at some point you would be able to tell us how far you are in particular of the song. We need to be updated as to what is happening. I suppose the choreography demonstration, I think is the work of the Comrades of Culture but it is probably a joint effort. We have seen that done the recent one was in Tsumeb. It was very beautiful, and those of you who have seen it, you could see that it is bringing people closer and

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 29**
HON SHANGHALA

we should encourage that.

With that Comrade I wanted to speak about the NBC and all others but my neighbour here has spoken about them but it is fine. This Bishop who takes water every evening before we sleep and he speaks in he has mastered our languages now. (*Interjection*)

HON MEMBER: Holy water.

HON MINISTER OF HUMAN AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: so I think he is paying probably, but he is paying that prime time just before we all go to bed. He has timed his time, but I think we need to be careful because we are at a stage. We are not supposed to be promoting one particular religion so we need to be very, very careful about that. I know it is some businesses and all that, but we are not supposed to be the ones promoting a specific religion or a specific splinter group of other people. I support you Comrade.

Thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Kapofi. The next one is Honourable Sackey Shanghala.

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Thank you very many Deputy Chairperson. Also to support the Vote, very short comments.

Honourable Minister I have been engaging with the community of people who use sign language to communicate and they have been complaining that national documents are not translated into languages they can utilize such as **braille and sign language**. I did not know that sign language is also translatable into documents. I had not known that so for instance the constitution and many of our legislation literally including those that are promulgated to assist people who live with disabilities. I think we need to get some training. We are hoping to work with them to get some training on that so we can have lawyers who can communicate in that fashion.

The only thing I know how to do is to make Namibia that is it, but the rest I do not know. We need to learn so that we do not leave anyone behind. They are members of our society and community, and I think we require some intervention.

The other thing is when we travel even at home or somewhere, while I understand that you can get the television which I am still struggling to, this NBC thing that was happening here it is not working for me. They know I tried to tell them, but what is even frustrating is trying to get NBC on line just electronically so you can listen to the news on line. I do not want to watch it, I just want to go to the website and it hardly ever works even when you have Wi-Fi dedicated from a fixed line or somewhere it just does not work. NBC on line I think you understand me. They need to look at that.

I do not think this is your problem but rather I will look to the Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee. We sit here for hours and you do not give us access to Wi-Fi or internet. I have tried many times with the passwords you have given me. You know Apple, but the idea is if I am with my computer I can contribute much more effectively because I have access to the worldwide web and it is infinite resources that can assist us in the meantime while we do not have researcher systems for particularly backbenchers' etcetera.

Then Honourable Minister I want to support you in your vision and I think Honourable Minister of well, everybody spoke about the positive usages

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 29**
HON NAMOLOH

of technology, but we talk of positive usage of technology and access to information, but we forget to talk about the responsibility to protect information and to protect ourselves from the adverse impact of the worldwide web.

I am being harassed. Now my concern is and yes like the Ministry of Justice we are doing NAMCIS the Namibia Court Information System, E-Justice, but my concern is are we prepared for a Wiki-leaks type of events or for terrorism which attacks our networks and disables. Are we prepared? I am not saying let us reveal all our secrets, but I am just worried that we are leap frogging into the 22nd century if I may be bold so to say, but we are not carrying the armour that will protect us going forward.

With those few remarks, I want to support and I want to say that indeed Doctor Haufiku you are so right. If future generations, the future is not prepared to the type of world that they will live in tomorrow, they may have a handicap when they live in that life, so it may assist if we look at digitization of the schooling. Honourable Caley also have mentioned that, but it will still be expensive if you are importing VAT imports and maybe as a community we need to look at how we can lower those duties so that those products are affordable even for Government to supply them to any number of people.

Thank you very much.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Shanghala. The next one and I assume is the last one on this Vote is Honourable General Namoloh.

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Thank you very much Comrade Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 29**
HON NAMOLOH

I want to thank the Minister and also to rise to support the Vote. I am having few disappointments on especially on our systems network. When I was in India thirteen (13) years ago when we just put on your computer the flow of data is so fast, so when I came back here we were disappointed with my children what is this, what is this and we had. You know if you are promised you have high expectations that no, wait. We have WACS coming, the West African Cable System. When it is rolled out, the flow of data, uploading and downloading will be fast as promised. When it came the disaster now.

We have been speaking this thing in this Parliament for many years now since I came here, on this disappointment of information flow. Why we do not have all these connections, it is because of this system. Possibly the system it was completed but the same, and then introduction of 2G, 3G, 4G we are hearing that 5G is also to be rolled out, while these other Gs' are not working even in some parts of Windhoek. Why are we jumping to certain things if we have not completed the other? This one is not working, we jump to another one. You see, I think we need to finish one at a time and I think we are not also Comrade Minister your Permanent Secretaries and technical people I think they are here. We are not blaming the WACS.

I think the systems we have in place with MTC and Telecom are outdated and they are not telling us. I think they are very slow. They cannot process because this WACS has passed through us and went to Botswana, and Botswana is fast when you are there. Why is it not fast here if it has passed here? It is the system we have here, and that I think is what they are not telling us the cables and what have you possibly (*Interjection*). No, you see it is very disappointing. It is like possibly they did not want to change the lines which have been there already very old, maybe it is copper and what have you very slow and it is like connecting slowly

I heard one Councillor complaining you know. People are complaining. They connected a pipeline of a small calibre to a bigger one and there are so many people who are getting from that line. The water would be coming slow. It is the same I think here, as we want to tap the information

from there, the thing is so slow because we are so many the wires are very small. I think Comrade Minister I want you to look at that maybe is narrow gauge or whatever you have, but it should be providing us with satisfaction like the Botswanans are happy, why are we not happy? And it entered Namibia from our coast and we are disappointed. Why, and all these 3G? I think 5G must come when 4G is working throughout the country. 3G is not working even in some parts of Windhoek. Do not talk about 2G which came first. It is not working in some other parts, but they say fine we roll out to 3G and put to other regions, nothing. When you go there it is always E, E, E, E empty or whatever it says. I do not know what it says.

I think we need to also on the internet. I think there is a section I do not know how maybe it started there. When you drive with B1 going to the South you have communication maybe throughout these farms and all this, or when you go to other farms somewhere here but when you try with B1 go to the north there, you will get disappointed like as if there are no people there. They are too many people. You should now bring service to where people are also too many people. It is disappointing also, very disappointing when you look at that and in farming areas all over there in here, there is communication but you go to villages there even near Oshakati just two kilometres from Oshakati no communication. *(Interjections)* Jerry I should not go chase you to the *(Indistinct)*

I think there is something there we should be done Comrade Minister. We want to support you and we want also to support this system because our children in most of the schools there, even people cannot get communication. Even if we say energy, energy now we ask the Minister of Mines and Energy to put up electricity there. You put up electricity, you bring computers there, no internet nothing. It is white Horse *(Laughter)* white elephant. You should say what is the difference of all whites is. You can say white car, white pool, white goat as long as it is white, you are fine.

I think Comrade Minister these services must be improved honestly. *(Interjections)* it must be black horse now, not white horse. It must be

improved Comrade Minister. At least we have been speaking for a long time now and there is no improvement and look what has happened during the Easter also. Of course it happens in life that systems go down, but do you not have a backup if one system goes down? Somebody asked here, are we to prepared if there is a terrorist attack? What if one installation is attacked, will others not take over? That is what we are asking also the experience of what has happened during Easter Comrade Minister. So I think we need next year when we come to this Budget again, there should be no white horses again. There must be black horses.

I support your Vote Comrade Minister.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable General Namoloh. May I now invite the Honourable Minister to reply?

HON MINISTER OF INFORMATION COMMUNICATION AND TECHNOLOGY: Thank you very much Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee. I can hear my Colleagues saying summarise, others saying take your time. Now I will have to make up my mind and do what is going to be credible and legitimate to a host of very credible questions and concerns that were expressed, including the new invention of the white horse.

Now I will try to summarise but let me start with *Honourable Doctor Ankama Chief* thank you very much in advance for your support in terms of the program, but you have raised quite a number of issues and so have the others. I will try to categorise the issues and then acknowledge the others along the way.

You raised issues pertaining to too many towers all over the country, and indeed you know that is the case which is also not good for the

environment. Emphatically speaking you have an ant-hill here, ant-hill there. It is even a danger to the flying saucers at night, so it is not desirable, but the good news is that that is now a thing of the past. Yes, because you know what we would have done this hundred percent coverage. If we had taken that policy position much earlier, by now we could have covered Namibia because we were simply duplicating. Here is MTC, next door is Telecom Namibia. Why should you compete on how many towers you have because the towers are facilities that you can share, and then you compete on many other things like the products and services that you deliver, but you do not outmuscle your competitors by having multiplicity of towers?

There is no economic sense in that and this is why the services provided become too expensive because you are recouping your investment from the end users. Indeed we have taken that policy position through the Ministry and CRAN has implemented that. There are regulations now in terms of sharing the infrastructure not only in terms of MTC, TN and other operators, but equally even NBC because they do not need to put separate infrastructure. They can put their equipment there where it is possible, and where it is not possible they can then develop the infrastructure. So we have taken the decision. It is only wise that we do that and then we are being kind to the environment.

The poor reception it is an ongoing challenge. Even in areas where is network here around Windhoek, by the way, there is an un-quenching thirst and hunger for data that we will never, never address. Each day the hunger for data generally increases. It is like a dinosaur which is never satisfied. Indeed those challenges are there, and that is why we have a project which is improving on the existing ICT infrastructure to address some of these issues pertaining to poor reception, but also equally expanding the infrastructure particularly like I said in my statement to the rural under-served.

All of us who are here, we owe our being here to the majority of the masses out there not here in Windhoek out there. They are in majority and it is for that reason that we have embarked on this project that was quite

expensively covered as of this year early in the media. 28 years after independence it is grossly unfair to deny fellow Namibians because of their location to services particularly when it comes to ICT. Those of you who have followed what we have said in terms of my brother here in front of me Comrade Tjekero Tweya, starting even with Comrade Kaapanda would have appreciated that we have been saying publicly, in today's world ICT is like the oxygen that all of us breathe. That is ICT. If you remove that oxygen the life giver, you cease to exist as an organism. You perish.

We need to look at ICT in the same way. We have spoken about that incident the General had after Easter, it was only for one day. Imagine for 28 years we have been subjecting fellow Namibians to this frustration. We were confronted by that only for a couple of hours. What happened? We were insulted, but those are part of the dangers of holding public Offices anyway. Imagine others 28 years there is no Uhuru in terms of ICT so that is why we are expanding. Indeed we will continue to do that.

The problem with the journalists you know it is lifelong learning. I know that there are challenges in terms of journalists you know for example, even knowing their leaders is not only the NBC, but you know the entire spectrum of the media in this country. We need to do a lot in terms of knowing your leaders, knowing your community members, doing your homework before you get to the studio and then you are mutilating the surnames and the names of people. You do not like it but, it is ongoing education that we will have to do. There is a lot to be done in terms of gate keeping. We need to look at the entire echo system from where it starts to where it ends. There should be need for quality checks right across the entire echo system so I fully agree with you Comrade Chief.

Comrade Nghintina thank you very much my senior brother for the support and for appreciating the quote that I drew in terms of Malcom X, because that communicates to the media that nobody is saying do not go out and report. All that we are saying is report. You can be critical to the highest degree, but make sure that you are accurate. There is no prejudice.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 29**
HON SIMATAA

You do not write your story, and then you go to Honourable Kawana to then verify yet your story is already written and whatever you generate you do not go back to your prior written story. You simply affirm and then you regurgitate the story to the masses out there, because like I said the damage that we do we will not be able to rectify it when there is an outcry.

To the young people by the way, who have made it their business to condemn elders you see we are an African society. We were born and oriented differently. Let us not discard our values as Africans, because I do not want to be around myself when today's generation will take over the leadership of this country. There will be total chaos, and by the way young people keep in mind I am yet to see any person who will forever be young. As you see me here with this stature, I used to be a scrawl young person, but I have gone through the cycle of the echo system of human beings, and I will go back to the stage where I started if I live long, go back to crawling, go back to being cared, but that is where we started so for young people you are right Honourable Nghimtina.

It is a bad omen by the way and for every bad thing that you do to an adult, God your creator is subtracting from your days here on earth. It is also written in the Bible. There is a book up in heaven subtracting minus one day, minus one day, minus one day and cumulatively speaking, you will gather so many days that you will then have to be barred, so be very careful young people.

This Facebook and breaking news. Whoever is engineering that, whatever the reasons are, be informed, what goes around comes around. Your evil will catch up with you one day, and that day will come and you will have to dance to the tune. That is all that I am saying, so let us be careful. Let us not abuse these platforms that are at our disposal. Let us use them in the right way not to vilify individuals. Your sins will catch up with you one day and that day is not very far by the way. The judgement day is coming.

Now we are expanding the network and by the way, we are also through this expansion when we launch the network, we challenge particularly the

local community, young people, entrepreneurs to say please ensure that the services such as the charging of the phones, it is an opportunity for you to stand up and grab it with both hands so that you become involved. Really we are challenging ordinary Namibians wherever these networks are launched. Grab the opportunity so that you have your solar system complete as it is. You are providing the services. The recharge vouchers you provide the services. That is how you create wealth and that is how we can move people out of this deep sea of poverty but not sitting down and then you are singing the song even God your creator will not listen to your tune. You will say you have the opportunity but you are not grabbing the opportunity.

The learners in rural areas indeed they are left out, and so are the health services and that is the reason why we are expanding so that truly speaking we can enjoy the benefits of e-Learning, e-Health, e-Government, e-Parliament, e-Communication, e-Everything. By the way very soon the Prime Minister would be launching the improvement of the network right across Namibia for the Government, so that we have the necessary bandwidth, the necessary efficiencies all over the country and our intention is to take the services even to the level of the Constituency Offices so that the speed is there, the facilities are there and when we migrate totally to e-Government, then we will not be challenged. We will soon be launching that and the Prime Minister will have the pleasure to do that.

Honourable Iivula Ithana thank you very much for your support. Indeed it is very true that if we take advantage of ICT we will take Namibia out of the current state of what I am fond of saying is self-imposed poverty, yet we are surrounded by plenty in terms of ICT services. People have spoken about WACS Generally. Indeed it is true that we are little bit slow, pedestrians too slow for my liking, that we need to populate this broadband throughout this country. So that we do not talk about WACS landed in Swakopmund yet the services continue to be poor. Those that we are providing like Botswana they are even much better compared to those of us who have the wealth of the services.

It is an ongoing program that we have.

The NBC mobile application I will enjoin this because this was mentioned. The Colleagues were already here. I know that I was on a mission, but we will again organise if they need to come back, we will organise for them to come back. If we need to organise one to one so that you can be assisted to access this application, for now it is free, but there is nothing for free forever. After this trial period, we are simply enticing you. We are trying to appetise you and once you are comfortable, please like I said in my speech I want to see us as Parliamentarians leading the crusade in terms of subscribing to this service. Please I thought yesterday when I was introducing I had a support of the Prime Minister. I am sure she does so that we can subscribe to those services.

Kavango-West is a new region of course formally Kavango but very vast but equally under-serviced same you know with Ohangwena and a couple of other Regions. Even Zambezi I have often said, in my village, if I am at my village, even if the President wants to contact his Minister of Information, the President will not be able to do that unless I am alerted in advance. There is spot, there is a tree, but if it is in the news that the President carries is that Simataa today you are fired, I will forget I am somewhere there. I will just collapse so indeed we need to expand the network coverage, but even Stanley Simataa the now Minister of ICT also has to climb a tree to get the necessary service, but it is very dangerous.

NamZim. Yes, where is my in-law are you still around. NamZim yes, you know the Reports would be coming by the way. I know that over the years we have been in default. We have recognised that and we will be able to rectify and we will be submitting the Reports. We are not going to allow that situation to continue any longer. Moreover we have heard that this year is the year of reckoning, and the whole system has to reckon from the Minister to the lowest level of staff. So indeed we shall rectify.

NBC the SWAPO led Government. Yes, it is a SWAPO led Government for now, and I am sure even in the future the challenge is for you to take the leadership away from us, the challenge is up to us as a ruling party to

ensure that we do not allow you that opportunity to even open the window even the slightest. We will continue closing it. Now Multi-Choice and NBC are serving different mandates. They may share a platform but they are serving different mandates. For your information no political party is barred from investing in any. The challenge it is up to you. So if SWAPO is creative that shows why we are the ruling party and why you will never beat us. You will take years to beat us. If SWAPO is creative to use its knowledge and capacity to invest, do not blame the party. On the contrary emulate, because all that you are doing is to follow what we are doing ourselves. We have even introduced real State of the Nation Address. Where have you seen something like this?

There is only one State of the Nation Address. So my in-law remember (*Interjections*) the Minister of Justice also said it is not long time ago that you were shareholders in DMH. (*Interjections*) that is your problem.

Honourable Bezuidenhout thank you very much for your support my dear brother. I know we have a journey that we are travelling and we will continue to travel that journey together. ICT leverage indeed you answered the question. We need to leverage ICT in all dimensions whether it is in the area of advancing the economic activities of this country, we need to do that. Whether we want to drive the necessary efficiencies, we need to do that. Whether we want to advance innovation, we need to do that. So ICT is the key. It is there. We must simply maximise on the potential of ICT to address poverty you can do that. To address youth issues, you can do that.

By the way the youth are the biggest component in terms of the digital natives. It is the young people. They are the digital native but we are not taking advantage of that. How many young people have innovated application and we have closed the doors in their eyes? This is what we do in Namibia and by the way, Namibia we love everything foreign and we hate everything that is Namibian and locally produced, all of us. As a country we need to change because how do you create, how do you induce local industries if you have no confidence and no faith in what you are able to produce yourself?

That is the challenge you know that we have. You are right my dear brother that indeed we need to encourage some of these innovations.

Yes, we have the opportunity to go paperless. Like I said, all these mountains of papers sometime if you are moving from here down there if you are not careful, you need to watch your steps. You will collapse because you are stepping over a mountain of papers and Doctor Haufiku is correct. If we were to do a cost exercise to see how much do these papers cost, we will have to sit down because some of us will collapse. It is a lot of money and money that we can invest in the ICT sector, money that we can invest in the youth sector, all the sectors that are currently under provided.

That is the challenge that we have. We can do that. The network is there. We can start indeed. Even here in this Parliament myself, Honourable Tjongarero we have spoken time and again on this. Look at that mountain. Honourable Fleermuys is not here very intimidating these papers, and that is the reason why we have taken that decision as a Ministry to provide tablets to you as Parliamentarians so that we can start here. We need to start here. We will provide you with the training to operate those instruments.

Honourable Caley of course you are our partner as the Chairperson of the Standing Committee on ICT. Thank you very much for your support as always and for joining the digital crusade to take Namibia out of analogue way of doing business to the digital way of doing business. Indeed when you use the e-Application you have the benefit of reducing all these frauds and manipulation by human beings. You submit your application, maybe the person does not like Simataa the way you are, maybe you have disagreed previously and the person will conveniently pull your application out and then at the end of the day say no, we never received the application. It happens. Some may even have vested interest. They realise that your application will cause competition, conveniently they pull it out and they continue to camouflage under ‘we never received the application.’ The application was there.

You simply engineered the process to your advantage. So with ICT you remove all those human prejudices and behaviours (Interjection) where, we need to start with you.

The Bill is on its way. It will be coming and hopefully we will be able to conclude it, but we have taken the decision to separate electronic transactions because the consultations that we have had on electronic transaction clearly indicate that we are in agreement and we can go ahead. Cyber security we need to move carefully, take advantage of many other jurisdictions, fine tune in our Bill but the Bill will have to see its birth before the end of this year and there is no miscarriage in terms of tabling and then withdrawing it, no miscarriage whatsoever. So it will be coming because we needed this Bill yesterday and yesterday or yesterday. Like I said we are over exposed.

I remember the last time the General said that we are naked. Indeed we are in the Garden of Eden when it comes to cyber security, and we are in the Garden of Eden. We are courting disaster. We are waiting for disaster to happen so really we need to dress ourselves for lack of a better word.

The website yes, I have taken note. We should have done that so that we should lead by example. The colleagues are here. They have taken note. There is no reason why we should continue to operate in this analogue fashion.

Doctor Haufiku they need to expose learners you are spot on Honourable Minister. We need to do that and this is where the private sector and all of us as citizens need to come in. We need to invest in our communities. It does not help for you to be progressive to be advanced yet the majority of the community this is where there is witchcraft, because of iniquities in what we do. They look at you. It is only you with a big “*kapunda*” (stomach) growing every day. The rest they look as if they do not live in the country. They will find a way to summarise you. (*Laughter*) They will expedite your departure on mother earth and by the way, when they do that, there is no possibility Comrade Sacky for litigation because there is no evidence that we can advance.

So we spoke about sport. It really pains. Sport the Government must provide. Everything the Government must provide. Education Government. Where is corporate Namibia in this country? Where are we? We can provide computers all this you can do. There is no company that will make business in a sick society. I keep on saying you need to have a healthy society who will have a healthy bottom line for your bottom line to continue to be healthy. You cannot conduct business in a sick society so we need to invest in our communities but this is where corporate Namibia must come to the party in ICT, in education, in youth, in sport issues. You need to create a vibrant society, a vibrant nation. Even the Namibian companies that are now owned by you and me, all we are doing is to chop and chop our money, share. Do not simply chop the money. You need to share it.

The CT scan Doctor I fully agree. We need to be using these services. You can be in Katima. You will simply send the information to Windhoek. You are a Doctor, you are assisted, you do your consultation, and the patient is saved. These are the benefits of e-Health so once the Prime Minister launches that, hopefully the quality of the services would have improved because our targets are health facilities and education facilities *Comrade Katrina*.

Honourable Mwaningange yes, our people need to be multilingual it helps, so that if you go to the south you know how to ask for water. Otherwise, you will die of thirst, so we need to be true Namibians and do that. In simplicity, in communication is very important because the idea to communicate is that the message must precipitate. So if you use complicated jargon, then you are losing your audience. Then you are simply talking to yourself. You can go England to Hyde Park corner and speak to yourself there anyway, but if you need to communicate with others, then you need to use simple language. I fully agree so we will continue to train them.

Honourable Kapofi you are right Honourable Minister. We have spoken but that is what I said. We do not appreciate local service providers, but again Telecom must come to the party. They need to wake up and smell

the coffee because if you continue to provide services that are not up to it, the customer has a choice so our service providers whether it is Government supported, private, they need to pay particular attention to the quality and efficiencies of the services they provide. That is very important but indeed, we have an obligation as Government to support. You cannot bring a baby on this earth and then commit a crime, and then you are taking the life of the baby but those are issues that we need to attend to.

Sign language *Comrade Shanghala* yes, we are working on that but the biggest challenge that we have is the money. We will see how best we can address that.

The NBC on line innovation I have attended to.

Comrade Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee. Wi-Fi, please it is in your domain. I took that issue Honourable Caley was it last year when we were at Safari when we launched the 100% coverage. MTC came to this Parliament. They offered the services. Apparently you are not keen to take their offer. I do not know whether we are tied to the contract that we have, but we need e-Services in this Parliament by the way. Budget no Budget, we need to be provided with better ICT services here. So we need to attend to that.

The migration General for 2G, 3G, and 5G I agree with you. We need to moderate our appetite. What purpose does it serve statistically for us to say we were the first for 4G, we were the first for 5G, but yet there is no stability in the services that you provide? So we need to pay attention not some of those issues and stabilise the network so that the services provided can be better.

I believe on that note Honourable Members I have tried. White horse I am not going to comment on that. I think we will find the right words to say that white horse General in way or the other one but otherwise, thank you very much for your support.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 32**
HON DIENDA

The other issues the Colleagues you were there. You were listening. And we need to rise to the challenge. We need to the challenge as NBC, MTC, TN Mobile, NamZim, New Era and NAMTA. It is about the quality of the services that we deliver and not the fact that we are occupying these positions.

So on this note let me say, Meshandangi, Mbamana. Opuwo.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Minister for the reply. Any objection? Agreed To. I put Vote 32 – “**HIGHER EDUCATION, TRAINING AND INNOVATION**”. Honourable Dienda you have the Floor.

HON DIENDA: Honourable Deputy Chairperson, I just have one question Honourable Minister. One page 436, estimates of revenue. I will wait my sister. Namibia National Students Organisation (NANSO)

HON MEMBER: It is the old one.

HON DIENDA: it is the old one, no it is the same. Are you with me Honourable?

HON MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, TRAINING AND INNOVATION: Yes I am.

HON DIENDA: Yes Honourable I just want to know I was surprised to hear that **NANSO** will receive N\$422 000.00. My question is when can we receive the Financial Report from NANSO, and my second question is which criteria is being used to fund this students organisation because there are a lot of other students organisations, so what criteria did you use to fund them.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable. Just a reminder, that instead of the other people to summarise us, can we summarise ourselves. Instead of Honourable Simataa saying we need to be, some people are summarising us, (*Laughter*) can we summarise ourselves when we are having the Floor, Just to make like the Honourable Dienda did. Not to have long speeches like you are inviting other people to summarise you.

Honourable Van Wyk.

HON VAN WYK: Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, I will try to summarise.

Honourable Minister on page 569 and 571 of the development Budget. A provision was made for a construction of a VTC in Keetmanshoop. What I would like to find out Honourable Minister is, in the previous development Budget for last year that is, 2017/2018 to 2019/2020. Provision was made for the construction of a VCT in Eenhana and upgrading and renovation of the Rundu VTC and then also a centre at Gobabis, I just want to find out how far are those projects.

Then I would like to find out if one looks at the **cost**, for example the Eenhana VTC it was about N\$1 billion, N\$600 million for Gobabis, and N\$117 million for Keetmanshoop training centre.

Now I would like to find out, why the big difference in these allocations. One would like to see a standard centre, and also one would like to see the hostel accommodations' being the same, instead of one having a higher allocation than the others.

Then also Honourable Members, is we had to look at the **current rate of constructing VTCs**, at this current rate it is going to take some years at least to have a VTC in every Region. What plans are in place to speed up the process, because I think it is also important that in the years to come we will have to construct Centres on constituency levels.

Then also Honourable Minister if we have these VTC Centres for example in Keetmanshoop what will you put in place to make sure that **the people from that area will be admitted into those centres**. (*Interjections*) I am asking this many times. A person can apply at his duty station but will not be admitted there, but he will be admitted for example in Gobabis so how will we attend to that problem. That is also just to save cost. If you look at the cost for example, if we take NIMT for example it is a private training centre. Now it is very expensive and most of the time it is only the parents that is paying for the fees or paying for the students, so it is an issue of assisting the parents.

Then also **the entry requirement** Honourable Minister currently it is a pass in Grade 10, but we are sitting with the issue of high failure rate when it comes to Grade 10. Should we not rather consider a pass in Grade 9 as admission requirement into VTCs? (*Interjections*) yes it is a lowering of standards but we need to do something to attend to our, and also maybe to revisit the *Vocational Education Training Act* of 2008, and finally

Honourable Minister on page 573 of the development Budget **construction of the Namibia Qualification Authority house**. I just want to make sure is it not that this facility was already constructed, just over here. Is that a new, (*Interjection*) no it cannot be retention. It is N\$173 Million it is too much. So if the Minister can just maybe explain on that. With this few remarks, I support the Vote.

I thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Van Wyk. The next is Honourable Murorua.

HON MURORUA: Thank you very much Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House.

I would like to first and foremost thank the Honourable Minister for what she is really trying to do, and I must say I am firstly very much pleased with the strategic plan that has been developed to assist the Namibian students in general. Honourable Minister I am also taking note of your statement that we have to reduce the **dependency on Government subventions**, which is probably a very good move at this point in time but I think it is a little bit premature.

Looking at the allocations that is going to the different stakeholders here, for example to UNAM, it is N\$960 Million which is taken from the gross allocation that you are receiving plus minus 25% to 28%, and NANSO is getting N\$422 000 which is plus minus 12 to 13% from the gross while NUST is getting N\$600 Million which from the gross is plus minus 18% but NSFAP is getting N\$1.4 Billion which is plus minus 44%. Now if you deduct all this from the gross that you are getting, then you are sitting with something like N\$220 Million leftover for yourself as operations.

The big question that we are having is looking at UNAM and NUST, *(Interjections)* what is wrong *(Laughter)*

HON MEMBER: Just ignore them my brother.

HON MURORUA: You do not see the pronunciation mistakes when it is on your side, just listen carefully behind you. These institutions Honourable Minister are almost spread over Namibia and they are to the explanation that you have given catering for this year, for close to 38 000 students whereas NSFAP does not have a clear indication of how many students are they going to cater for, but looking at the operations that is required if we take 50% of their Budget to be for operations, then still they will be sitting with N\$725 Million which is much more than what yourself as the Ministry is going to sit with.

Honourable Minister, my concern is not that I want to question the work that is being done by NSFAP or that I doubt the objectives they are standing for, but the fact of the matter is the Higher Education institutions that we are having are also having hostels, and as well as other facilities like farms which they are operating from. So my big question that I am having is Honourable Minister, how do you think you are really going to make it? I do not believe that it is a question that is to be answered by the Minister herself.

I believe it is a question that we as leaders in Namibia have to ask ourselves, because it is my humble belief that if we really want Namibia as per Vision 2030 to become an industrialised nation, then it is important that we have to develop our own Engineers, our own graduates to help develop this country. We cannot rely on Engineers from other countries. We cannot rely on Graduates from other countries. We have to pump in money in those institutions that they really have to produce the people that are going to be needed in future, but with the little money that we are allocating at this point in time I doubt honestly that we will really make it as a nation to rely on our own people for the development of our country.

With that Honourable Minister I really would urge that you need to sit with the Minister of Finance, to request for a higher allocation so that in future we can really support these Higher Education institutions to such a standard that they have to meet the requirements of a nation that really wants to develop itself.

I thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you. The next one is Honourable Nekundi. Yes, Honourable you have the Floor.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Thank you very much Comrade Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee.

Let me start with the Budget book titled 'estimate of revenue and income and expenditure'. I would like to start with page 447 that moves over to 448 on page 447 the last Budget item on that page it speaks of **State Owned Enterprises**, and there is an allocation of N\$10.9 Million. When you look at that you move to the next page 448 State Owned Enterprises, it is Rundu VTC and Eenhana VTC. There is zero allocation. My understanding is that the two VTC are the derivatives of the previous page. They basically come from the previous page. The first one is the allocation of N\$10 Million but when they come to the actual allocation of these institutions there is no allocation.

Two - I also want to my understanding and knowledge, there are more than these two VTCs. Are they not being funded for or they are self-funded? I just want to seek clarity in terms of that.

Then on page 448 just above the VTCs there is support to **non-profit organisation**. There is an item there called entrepreneurship, allocated N\$4 Million. What organization is this entrepreneurship? It is an organization not a program so let us distinguish. It is called organisation not program. I am thinking of what that entails. Then on the same page on the same grouping support to non-profit organization there is this institution Laudima. I just know that it is not a Namibian word, so I have a

challenge possibly to pronounce it (*Interjection*) whichever. Comrade Deputy Chairperson you will give him chance to pronounce that.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Continue do not worry with them.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Now here I just want to my understanding, it is just an understanding I have been following this. I just want to find out how many students are there and when do we expect them to complete and will it be continuous or it was just a once off program, just basically that which I want to find out.

Then Comrade Deputy Chairperson we go to page 446 the allocation of **NSFAF** Namibia Students Financial Assistant Fund. I really want, with an allocation which is N\$1.4 Billion. I am just seeking clarity to understand the operations of this organisation or this institution. Over the past years the students complained on the same aspect that the money is not being dispatched on time and they continuously find challenges with regard to that element and it is an open secret that that is a known fact.

Are we really having a challenge just to address a process where you allocate the student in January-February, still in November there is just no dispatch, and it seems there is no engagement with the institutions of higher learning. Every time the students must go on unnecessary threats with the institutions. What are you doing? I am just trying to understand the effectiveness of the people deployed to administer these institutions. How long should we be confronted by the same problem that has nothing to do with the resources but purely administrative? For me it just does not auger well to have an institution of this nature. So if that matter could really be addressed Comrade Minister.

Then the other aspect in terms of NSFAP I am one of them possibly one of them. I believe there are many others including those who are present here who are at multiple times being approached by students at NUST and UNAM who have no access to funding they accepted. They have no funding. What are you going to do about these students, and when you do background checks, their parents in reality they unemployed. Some are orphans, complete orphans mother and father are all gone. They come to us so what are we doing. I understand the limitation of the fund but yet we are also funding these institutions. Why can we not reach a compromise? Honestly speaking because I just do not understand. These students are forced to go out of education yet you want them to study. So I just really want us to find a mechanism of how we should be able to assist the needy students.

My next one is I think almost five years ago, I have discussed this thing with the prior Ministers who have found the same position as you are in Comrade Minister. I also discussed this thing with you I think last year or earlier this year. We have a challenge of a potential student a legitimate Namibian who have 35 points for example, but have performed badly in English. I am concerned as a citizen. Why am I concerned? One we have none English speaking persons who come and get admitted, and they go under a particular program to catch up with English. They get admitted with the same institutions and I bet with you even after the year of going through the entry level of English lecturing or being tutored in English they will never match a Namibian who has gone through English from Grade 0 to Grade 12. It will just be a basic communication.

Can we not address these things once and for all? I think it is unfair that a person who is not going to be a linguistic person be denied access with the required marks yet the person cannot just enter the special institutions because of the language. So I again just appeal to Comrade Minister that you consider this matter as a matter of priority and be addressed once and for all. We cannot really have this matter pending and pending. It is frustrating us. It is frustrating the young persons.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 32**
HON NEKUNDI

The other one Comrade Minister I should really appreciate your efforts I must submit and the entire Government of when you look at NUST the institute Higher Learning. My first time when I went to NUST then Polytechnic it was 1999. It was a small institution, very small with I think only one block lecturing block, one small. Now they expansion both in Windhoek and in the Regions. It is really such that we must appreciate our Government. It is the realistic perspective. The infrastructure, the intake has improved. Look at UNAM it has expanded to many of our Regions. It is something we must appreciate. The VTCs it has expanded we must appreciate and you Comrade Minister you are again continuing to expand the VTCs and the funding of the high institutions to be able to accommodate more persons.

Point of conclusion well noted. Is that possibly as you go about this expansion process just to consider the ratio of the potential incoming, versus the rate of expansion because it is also very important. We are doing very well but not extreme but we are doing good because looking at the previous year, 2017, my information is that there were over 17 000 applications to the VTCs, but because of the limited space it was only around 4 000 who could be taken up into VTCs. That is an intake of 27 out of the potential trainees. So I appreciate but I just want us to look at how much if we can again possibly look to increase the scope of expansion.

Comrade Deputy Chairperson with this talk of 20 minutes of our time, I wholeheartedly support this very important Vote.

I thank you very much.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE
COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Nekundi. The next one is Honourable Tom Alweendo.

HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: Thank you Honourable Deputy Chairperson.

I also rise to support Vote 32, but before I do that Honourable Minister, I just want to make a quick comment on the **innovation** part, and I will try to summarise before I get summarised. (*Laughter*) Honourable Minister today innovation has become I think the buzz word, I think, everybody talks about innovation, where innovation is seen as a key to development and sometimes innovation comes in different ways like it comes in where it involves devising new technology for example, or maybe in creating a new approach of doing things or at times finding a better way of delivering public service like when it comes to Government, and coming to that, when I was listening to our Debate earlier on when we were deliberating the point of how we did not enough money for our Votes for our Budget and we do this all the time. Every year we do the same thing probably suggesting that we have not been innovating in terms of finding better ways of how to deliver this.

When it comes to the world of business for example innovation refers to generation of new products, and usually that is done through the process of creative entrepreneurship and also then putting such products into production and also defusing such products in more widely and through increased sales and that is normally what business people talk about when we talk about innovation.

Now Honourable Minister innovation is therefore really I think a costly enterprise and it will require a clear strategy on how to pursue it. Otherwise, if we are going to pursue it just everywhere else, we will probably end up not having all the resources we need to innovate. We need to put clear boundaries around the innovation process and recognising the fact that not everything can or maybe should be innovative.

Now my question Honourable Minister is what kind of innovations are we actually pursuing and therefore prioritising given the fact that not

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 32**
HON NAUYOMA

everything should be or can be innovated, so at least we earmark innovations or you prioritise innovation in the areas that can help us to develop? With that comment and question Honourable Minister, I will support Vote 32 of the Ministry of Higher Education.

Thank you very much.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Alweendo. The next one is Honourable Nauyoma.

HON NAUYOMA: Thank you very much Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee.

Mine also would be a very short intervention. I must also congratulate the Minister for the work she is really trying to do, but I have only two concerns with regard to the **synergies between UNAM and NUST**. As the scope is extending I think it is about time that maybe we really target these two public institutions into what we want to achieve, because in my view why can we not take say for instance NUST as the University of Science and Technology to deal primarily with the technological advancement research, and UNAM on more academic field so that the complement each other not to be like competing some of the fields of study. That is one.

Two, when it comes now to the question of **VTCs** they are extending and there might be other challenges in a way of knowing which programs are and at what level these program would be offered by Valombola for instance or Keetmanshoop Vocational or Rundu. Can we not also have maybe some of these VTCs classified as like maybe Keetmanshoop or Windhoek Vocational training as more advanced maybe level 6 or whatever levels, they put levels on this?

I am not very well school into these levels so that at least we get into a direction of being specialised in what we are trying to achieve, because another issue one can look at you want to get to Vision 2030, and how do we get there if we are not targeted. Many at times when you look at the figures that you are provided with, there is no proper synergy between what the labour market is requiring and what they are producing, because that is why most of these youngsters are not able to find jobs in the market neither in Government or let alone the private sector. Government we know our problem maybe in the private sector. I think it is about time that we get really closer with the business community so that we produce what the market really requires, so that we do not waste people's time, our children's time four years Degree in Public Administration.

When he comes out you hang around the streets of Windhoek or Oshakati wherever, without finding anybody, no business, Pupkewitz is not looking for anybody with the public administration and so on. So that we know exactly *(Interjection)* Parliament is something else and we must get serious. They must come here. If we encourage them to come here, then you are out, because the young people are coming to put you out of here if you do not know the reason they would be here also. I think in my view that is really what we need to do so that we really create a close link between institutions and the businesses so that we know nothing or nobody is left to chance, so that at least at the end of the day we know we have what we really want to achieve.

Like in terms of the Engineering that my Colleague talked about, we need these foreign Engineers at least in ten years we fight them out. Then we have our own trained Namibians. **(Interjection)** You know what I am talking about. I think the efforts leaders are being made must really be commented and we need just to streamline these efforts so that at the end of the day we really want to get what we want to get.

The last Honourable Minister is a question of NSFAF. My brother here has touched little bit on the NSFAF issue, but we still hear people from last year. There are students from last year their debts with UNAM for instance are not yet settled up to this time. What are the issues?

Maybe you can enlighten us on the problems that are there so that these kids who are being harassed from time to time, from last year to this year or maybe if you have done it now, then that is bonus for me. Then with that, I support the Vote.

I thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Nauyoma. The next one is Honourable Jerry Ekandjo.

HON EKANDJO: Thank you Comrade. I am going to be short.

First of all, I am going to be tall

HON MEMBER: You are tall already.

HON EKANDJO: I would like to congratulate the Minister and also thank the Minister and her staff. I have only got some not a question, maybe some ideas. You see at one time John Kennedy said he dreamed that I do not say the exact words but the meaning is the same that one day human beings will land on the moon. (*Interjection*) We will put a man on the moon and it means everything is possible. I was thinking now our education system we keep on teaching, we give scholarships, students go and graduate, come back. Do we make a follow up to say for instance in five years we want to train so many Doctors, so many what according to the needs of the country, and then we give scholarships accordingly and then we do a research after five years where are those, are they back, what are they doing, because currently a person can apply for a scholarship

learning anything he or she likes and then we also maybe say we train people for the job markets? Are we to training people for the job market or are we training people to uplift the country, because I was thinking it is now high time we do a research about the needs of the country, how to develop the country, the mineral resources, what we have, food security and then we train people accordingly, so that we can say in five-ten years we must be able to train people who can transform that stone we call copper, diamond, uranium into a useful commodity. I think we must now move towards that instead of we let students apply for scholarship, they go and study for their own benefit.

Is there may be no way where we can establish a national research institution where we can research in food security, in mineral resources, so maybe the two Education Ministries, the National Planning, the Fishery Ministry, the Agriculture, the Industrial and Trade, Mines and Energy, Finance and Labour maybe if they can come together, put up a technical team and say give five years or ten years come with a blue print so that in the future we have our own institutions, because Namibia is endorsed with mineral resourced but we keep on just exporting that stone, exporting, until when. Is there maybe if we study a country like China, Vietnam, North Korea and Cuba I am sure their education system produce things which benefits for their country but we only keep on, I can study for my own benefit, the student goes, they get Degrees, Doctors, they come and work for their own benefit, but are we not maybe now to move from that to see how we can really, because we can put a research station. We have rivers, food security.

If you see our veterinary services today it is foreign nationals mostly from Zimbabwe, veterinarians who are running. If you want a veterinary Doctor most of them. (*Interjections*)

HON MEMBER: There are many Namibians, they are there.

HON EKANDJO: Okay, 90% are Namibians, but I think it is really time I am speaking. I am not economist but I am speaking that until when are we, we have to the mineral resources we can utilise it. We cannot allow somebody from somewhere must come and do it for us. I think we must now move from that and say and I am just giving an idea and say is there no way where we can research to so that for 27 years if we do a research, how many scholarships did we give and those 27 maybe thousands and thousands of students where are they. Are they here or are they jobless. So we must not only train people for job market but according to the needs, so that they must come because I am sure even during the struggle when SWAPO was sending students abroad for scholarship even to the front, they see the enemy what is the situation so that they can train the people according to the situation on the front, and also the students to go so that when they come back, they can come and run the country.

That is why SWAPO has trained people to run the country so when the country got independence SWAPO just started with the full army component and the General here was commanding. Everything was just, we did not send people to go and study whatever. Can we not really also maybe move in that direction. I support the Vote Comrade Minister more than one thousand percent.

Thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE
COMMITTEE: Thank you. The next one is Honourable Kavekatora.

HON KAVEKOTORA: Thank you very much Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee. *(Interjections) (Laughter)*

I want to focus on one specific item because Honourable Mutorwa, Honourable General and Honourable Shanghala and I have reached

a point of diminishing returns. So I am just going to focus on one aspect. Honourable Nekundi touched upon it, but I want to approach it from a different angle and that is the issue of the **Namibia Financial Students Assistant Fund**. We heard recently that a decision was taken to reincorporate the Fund into the Ministry of Higher Education, and if my memory serves me well, it is during the time when a Fund was under the Ministry of Higher Education that some of the amounts could not be accounted for. Now to be very specific I am talking about N\$1.7 Billion that could not be accounted for.

Now I just want to understand as much as I do not have a hostile reaction to that, I want to understand what has the Honourable Minister put in place to make sure that once the Fund is now reverted back to the Ministry the same thing does not happen again? (*Interjection*) “*Mbwaë mwina, Mwina uhingira tjinene*” (Keep quiet, you talk too much). I really want to understand that because it does not make any sense for me to just push the Fund from left to right and from right to left, without really identifying the problem because in the end, the beneficiaries are suffering as a result of this. I think the N\$1.4 Billion which is a good allocation to the students, one would not want to see it happen like in the same fashion of the N\$1.7 Billion that could not have been accounted for.

Lastly is a question to the Honourable Minister on money that is being given to our foreign students. It looks like there is also an issue there, where some of the accounts that is being managed and controlled by our Embassies in foreign countries are still showing positive balances of money that was intended to go to specific students for study purposes. Can the Honourable Minister perhaps just update us on that particular score to have a better understanding of what is actually happening with these funds? Is it surpluses that are being allocated for? Why are some of these balances still showing positive balances? With that, I support the Vote.

Thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Kavekatora. The next one is Honourable Pendukeni Iivula Ithana.

HON IVHULA ITHANA: Thank you Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee to this very important Vote.

A person of my age and of my standing cannot waste the opportunity to add a voice of support too. Comrade Chairperson many great minds have said education is the greatest equaliser, and that is very, very true. We have seen how education has made children of the poorest be competitive in this competitive world.

Comrade Minister I want to applaud you or the emphasis your Ministry is giving to the area of vocational education. Vocational education is what will give a push to the employment creation in the country. I have seen a young man who graduated from a Vocational training somewhere in either Swakopmund or so, and this fellow, young as he is, he maintains the infrastructure in Omuthiya. Everybody runs after him while others are waiting to be employed by others, he is employing other young people because of vocational education, and Comrade Minister I want to add my voice to those who have already said so, that let us popularise vocational education.

How do we do it? When I was Minister, I used to be invited to the graduation ceremonies either at UNAM or NUST, and when there is a graduation ceremony, you see the pride on the parents' faces, on the young peoples' faces, but I have never been invited to a graduation at vocational training centre anywhere, why? Does it mean that when they graduate, they are just given certificates and send home? Let us do something about it, so that the young people start to see the importance of vocational education.

One other issue I would like to raise is the fact that many people who would like to come up with training institutions, seem to be facing some high struggles somewhere in getting their institutions accredited. The rumour mill has it that somewhere somehow in the Offices, somewhere there seems to be somebody who is favouring those coming from across the borders than the local initiatives. In as much that I do not want to paper the rumours, maybe what they say where there is smoke, there is fire, and maybe we need to look into that.

Now while talking about, I have jumped to another issue but it is related to. Comrade Minister traditionally our people have been innovative. They have been innovative in a way that they were able to do certain things on their own. Basketry, pottery, the production of oil, but you know all those crafts they have it traditionally, naturally but I do not see us pursuing these crafts. While we are talking about innovation, I do not see efforts towards modernising these traditional crafts or skills.

In the north there people produce omagongo. Omagongo is just being taken or consumed or processed the natural way our great, great parents used to do it. Why can we not modernise it that it is bottled, that we can drink omagongo throughout the year? From the marula tree or marula fruit you get the nuts. Out of the nuts traditionally, people got to know how to extract oil. They are still doing it the traditional way. Why can we not modernise? Why can we not purify that method of extracting the oils that we can sell it in our shops? This way we will also be adding more products to the training courses, so that when a young person leaves from vocational institution, he or she comes out of there knowing this, that, that and the other, modern and what we traditionally use to produce in a more modernised fashion?

Lastly Honourable Minister I read in one of the newspapers recently after the graduation of UNAM students, and I got so shocked. When I read the figures of the disparity between male and female graduates. You know they said I think this was in either New Era or the Namibian Sun. The ratio between male and female graduates for this year was 67% females to 20% males, sincerely speaking. (*Applause*) I got so worried.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 32**
HON NAMOLOH

No, no, it is not something to celebrate, or we are moving on a slipping slope or slippery slope. When you have male students so much left behind this is dangerous. It is a dangerous situation that we are observing. Where are the boys? Where are they? Those who have been longer in the National Assembly you may recall, one day I made a plea. I said male Comrades, male Honourable Members let us think how to help our young men who are growing up there in the locations with no uncle, no father, no male person around.

Let us see how to help them really to become men like yourselves. If we are going to leave these young boys behind like that, they are going to haunt us very, very soon if they are not haunting us already. We are going to regret and also to have a society that is so skewed. Females are educated and males not. We are encouraging domestic violence really. Let us see how to help this situation. Really it is not nice so with those few words Comrade Minister, I support the Vote.

Thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Honourable Members before I will give the last Honourable Member to make either question or observation. I have to remind the Members the Honourable House that we now only have 48 Members in the House present instead of 49 Members for us to pass this Vote. We do not have a quorum for now, unless we have one Member to come in. Yes, the last one on my list is Honourable Charles Namoloh. Yes, Honourable you have the Floor.

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Thank you very much Comrade.

I also just want to (*Interjections*) (*Intervention*)

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Yes Honourable Minister you have the Floor.

HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: I also just want to support the Vote of the Ministry of Higher Education. In Africa we have heard of recent countries which are progressing. Everybody applauds Rwanda. What did the Rwandese do in order for them just to come out of war? What did they do? The Rwandese send a mass of their people to be trained abroad in schools, and they do not differentiate whether you are coming to work for the Government or for the country in the private sector. That is why they are progressing. For us here, you have those who go to study on Government and those who do not, you do not send them never mind how clever they are, but Rwanda has done it. I have seen it. That is why today in cleanliness and everything Rwanda is ahead of all of us and this is what they are doing.

So for us Comrade Minister if you want, we need to train more people in different disciplines instead of training two people in one discipline. When they come back, how will they form a team to be able to design and innovate and what have you, but if you have many, then they can design and innovate if they are many, not two people but many? Some are saying Rwanda is a one party state. Many people have developed. Look at India. Look at China. Look at what, what. They have trained like that and they are developing, Singapore also. People are developing because they have a vision how to train their people. Here even if you have very intelligent children, they are not earmarked to go and study specific disciplines.

Otherwise, when they appear there they will be summarised, as you said. They will first be summarised and then they are gone. They will not go because they are being summarised. It is Alpheus, it is who is child and

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 32**
HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

so forth they will be summarised and then the challenges. We always cry we are not developing. Look at China. Yesterday, I always give an example of China. I was in China in 1983. They only had bicycles no cars. Today they have cars which we are selling in Namibia today. After 22 years they have made a car. They only had bicycles. Here Namibia we have so many opportunities for our people if they concentrate and if they are supported.

You know the tourism industry everywhere you go our tourists are in Toyotas. Who is going to make a car called Etosha or called what, what and yet when they come here they are in our cars? Will it happen? I do not think so the way we are training it may not happen. That is true it may not happen the way we are training. It may not happen. So I thought we should prepare our minds to train people in that way. When we were fighting somebody mentioned here, when we were fighting we were so pressed.

The Soviet children supplied us one rocket launcher with a single barrel. We made those barrels multiple barrels, put them together six and we were going to eight at that time (*Indistinct*) for us to come. It is innovative if you want to achieve something, you can achieve it. You know when somebody speaks it is Namoloh talking and no, no, no. I have not wasted the time. It is not me who started this Debate. I just started now. It is not me. I also have a right to speak is it not, and it is the guy started only on me.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you. Honourable Minister of Higher Education can I invite now to provide the response?

HON MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, TRAINING AND INNOVATION: Thank you Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 32**
HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

Committee. I think I will just directly get to the issues that were raised by the different Members.

Honourable Dienda the first concern that you raised is the one of NANSO, the financial statements or financial Reports from NANSO and also the criteria used for funding students' organisations. I must say that indeed the financial statement for NANSO for the year under review will be available this September.

With regards to the criteria used, I must say that for quite a long time there has been in our country only one Namibia national student organisation NANSO, representing both learners at general education as well as tertiary education so indeed, so far there has not been really a serious interrogation with regards to the criteria to be used to fund student organisation because there has been only one thus far.

Honourable Van Wyk construction of the various VTCs and the variation in the resources allocated to such construction. I must actually emphasise the fact that the upgrading that took place at Eenhana it has been done as well as Gobabis VTC. Keetmanshoop is yet to be done, but I must emphasise the fact that these various VTCs actually offer different levels of TIVET training and hence the need each time when we upgrade to ensure that at those VTCs where we offer higher levels, there is more infrastructure that is put in place and hence the variation for example at Eenhana we offer more programs as opposed to Gobabis.

You also went further to talk about well, how far the differences, the plans to speed up the process. It is taking long in the Regions. Well, certainly it will take long. I must say, in fact it took long to even in some regions where they were no public VTCs to actually sort out the land issue where some of this infrastructure would be put up. Now that actually delayed the process somehow but I am happy to say that where land and has been allocated or availed, indeed we are busy fast tracking the process of construction of such VTCs.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 32**
HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

I am looking here at for instance in Kunene at Khorixas also Nkurenkuru. Those are some of the areas. With regards to Hardap for example where land again was a problem for some time, we have actually resolved that one with the MOU that is signed with the Ministry of Youth and I must say that it is my hope that going forward, we will continue to see some of these developments particularly the MOU between ourselves the Ministry of Higher Education, and that of Youth.

This does not mean that we take over as a Ministry of Higher Education. It is important for us to have a collaborative type of relationship, but make sure that the programs that are on offer at these various VTCs are properly accredited. Wherever we find that some are at the lower level, where the industry is also questioning the employability of those who graduate from these VTCs. It is imperative that together with the other Ministries we work towards ensuring that there is proper accreditation of such programs.

People in the area admitted. You know different tertiary institutions that are set up in the different parts of our country are not necessarily confined to admitting students and trainees from those Regions only. When we have a VTC say at Hardap or in Khorixas for example in Kunene, every eligible Namibian student has to be admitted. That is if they meet the requirements. If indeed there is a space, there is no reason why a Namibian child should be barred from entering any of these institutions. So really for us to talk about the fact that perhaps maybe the admission process should lean more towards those who are from the Regions. Well, they must make the points and compete on the same platform with all the others.

NIMT is a private institution and is expensive but again, perhaps I need to stress this in this august House, the fact that at VTC level private or public particularly private. When I say private I mean those that are accredited, students are paid for by Government. It is only the nominal fee or amount that parents actually contribute like transportation and maybe accommodation where accommodation is not provided for on Campus, so really the other thing of course is to say that indeed it is true. NIMT does charge much higher than the broader public VTCs.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 32**
HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

The entry requirements and so on. The entry requirements currently we are working at actually looking at the policy of TIVET to ensure that there are standardised entry requirements. I mean it does not really help anyone particularly those who are providing the teaching and learning process at these VTCs to have a mixed ability class. To have those who have left at Grade 10, be in the same class with those who have left at Grade 12. It is a terrible, terrible challenge to the teacher or the instructor in that class and it is also a disservice to those who may have acquired the necessary competencies, skills to be able to advance at a higher level when we have so many who really are holding you back as an instructor or a teacher so we are working towards making sure that when we say someone has left Grade 10, there is a proper path into entering TIVET. Is it going to be level 1, is it going to be foundation to be given the foundational work of being able to function at VTC or what level? All those things are being looked at.

The NQA house actually is phase 2 that was supposed to be put up. However, it has since been put on hold because of the budgetary cuts.

Honourable Murorua thank you for acknowledging our strategic plan. Yes, we expect our tertiary institutions particularly our Universities to gradually show that through their research, through their collaboration they are actually working towards reducing their dependence on Government funding. It is a gradual process but somehow there has to be that commitment to ensure that with time as our Universities mature into truly academic institutions that actually conduct renowned research that is reviewed by external professional bodies in a position to actually say that yes, we will not require hundred percent funding from Government this year, we will rather require maybe 80%, and as time goes we expect to see that probably we reach the threshold of 50-50 where our Universities would be funded by Government to the tune of 50% when the other 50% comes from their own initiated generated income.

I know that will take long. You said it is a bit premature yes, one does not expect it to happen right away, right now but it is important to plant that seed in the minds of our academicians so that as they do research, as they

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 32**
HON DR KANDJIL-MURANGI

cooperate, they actually move towards ensuring that they benefit from some of these partnerships. You know in my statement when I motivated the budget of the Ministry, I indicated that UNAM and NUST are actually functioning and operating under serious financial constraints and having said that, that is a reality that we have and this is why we are also encouraging our public universities to really be aggressive as it comes to exploring possibilities out there for fundraising.

NSFAF getting more. Well, I think as we look at the funding towards our Universities it is not only the direct subvention that goes to these institutions that at the end of the day sits with the institutions. Through student funding through the fees, also our Universities do benefit from NSFAF funding because it goes to the tuition at the institutions. We talk of NSFAF getting more. NSFAF is not only catering for students locally. It is catering for students who are also studying abroad, and the majority of those students who are studying abroad are those who are pursuing what we consider to be the critical areas or the prioritised areas of study.

Well, once in a while you will see a few who are not necessarily in those areas, but the majority of those that are funded by NSFAF who are studying abroad are those who are pursuing studies in the areas that are considered to be priority areas of study, because the idea is for them to come back and actually ensure that they contribute through taking up the critical positions within our Government. Not only Government but also within the country broadly in other industries as well.

UNAM and NUST the students population is 38 000 students. NSFAF, well, I will tell you that the number that is sponsored by NSFAF when you look at continuing students locally, as well as continuing students abroad and those who are likely to be funded this year, the number is far, far much higher than this because even within the 38 000 quite a huge number here is also NSFAF funded.

How to make it little money, I think I have covered that.

Honourable Nekundi really I must say that the first part of your question where you referred to the page I was somewhat lost. I could really grasp what you are getting at.

I will start answering your questions with the entrepreneurship, what is this. I think that is the bottom line. You were asking what organisation is this. Entrepreneurship is a program that cuts across the different tertiary institutions. I know that at UNAM, at NUST it is a cost that is integrated within the curriculum. It is also true with our VTCs. It is introduced as a program that is part of training at all our tertiary institutions.

Ludima I think the Honourable Members here, will remember that a year ago or a year and half ago we had challenges with the Ludima Institute in Congo Brazzaville. We currently now only have fourteen (14) students there. They will be completing their studies later this year. However, I must say that the Ministry is busy actually reviewing the agreement that is jointly, the two states are reviewing the agreement that is guiding or governing Ludima.

Again, NSFAP, operational of this institution. I must say that we all know that indeed there were challenges or there are challenges at NSFAP and that does not mean that the important functions of this particular entity are on hold. They are still being carried, and therefore there is a need for us to have a full Budget for this, because this is where we carry the funding to our students both within the country and outside the country.

However, it is important that what we put in place are the necessary effective systems and structures to ensure that while the assessment process that is taking place there currently, is taking place and the service delivery is not hampered in any way, and I am here to actually state that indeed the service delivery is not hampered in any way.

Student complaints being directed to different Members here. Yes, Honourable Member Nekundi, you know as leaders students will approach all of us for whatever challenges and hardships they face, but I think it is

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 32**
HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

important that we arm ourselves with the right information, so that whenever we engage them, we give them the right information. Now your concern is it has been the trend that resources take long to be dispatched to students and also to institutions. Indeed it is the very institutions and students who indicated that when for instance NAMMIC was put in place it was somewhat easier for the institution itself NSFAP to be able to trace the students their funding. The institutions were saying it is also easier for them not to deal with the administrative process of refunds, so it was considered to be a plus but indeed in introducing some of these new measures you are likely to run into problems, but I think the perfection of every system is in its application or implementation because that is when you pick the actual challenges that are there. I do not know what is problem is Van Den Heever. Thank you.

Five years ago, yes, the issue of English proficiency. I think as a nation and as leaders in this august House we must be realistic and truthful to ourselves and the nation out there. English is critical for progression at any University in the world. Namibia, I do not know why we want to make Namibia an exception. Secondly, our tertiary institutions particularly UNAM and NUST are offering English language programs to help those who have challenges. You may have scored your 35 of 45 points, but if you have F in English honestly. How are you going to proceed? The medium of instruction is English. Your own assignments or engagements in the lecture halls is English. You have got to perfect this medium of instruction for you to actually make it at University.

The other thing is we do not want to confine graduates to certain specific areas of function. We want to train global actors. Now (*Interjection*) well, let us talk about it Comrade. I know we did and we could not reach a point of convergence. I am sure maybe in future as we engage we will, but really I would like to make a point that we understand that English is critical for progression even at VTCs. We are actually saying they must have that proficiency, starting with the foundation courses that we are introducing at VTCs. We are saying English must be a compulsory subject there as well.

Otherwise, how are you going to negotiate your proposal with the banks?

Well, Chinese I am not talking about Chinese here now.

Yes, it is true Comrade Nekundi the expansion must actually also be coordinated with the actual possible numbers on the ground. We should not expand for the sake of expanding. We should actually assess the market, but as I said earlier with the scarcity of tertiary institutions it does not matter where we put these VTCs. The influx is so much.

Honourable Alweendo yes, the issue of innovation. It is a buzz word indeed, but perhaps I think what we need to understand like I always say is that innovation is not confined to formal education. Innovation is out there in our communities, in our Regions. What is critical is for us to develop a system of identifying these creative minds wherever they are, and make sure that we nurture them. We develop them and hone them properly in the areas of their talents.

You also went further to ask what kind of innovations. I am trying to get to the question, you know this technology also. I am trying to raise it here, but the response is here. My folks brought it and now I cannot get it out here. Anyway (*Interjection*) they are confusing who. What we are looking at currently with regards to the types of innovations that we are advancing or focusing on currently is indigenous innovation. For example through UNAM MRC, we have a project looking at understanding and modernising traditional methods of production, and I think someone here earlier one Honourable Member spoke to that.

I also know that we are trying to improve innovation within our students' entrepreneurs program. That is to have them actually come up with new business ideas, where they can develop proposals and then they are assisted by the team within the Ministry, also within the Ministry of Industrialisation as well as Poverty Eradication. So there are many areas that we are looking at. Also when you look at our national research agenda which is being driven by the Namibia Commission on Research Science and Technology, they are specific areas there that they are

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 32**
HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

pursuing for instance bio technology is one specific area that they are currently also pursuing, and I think the broader research agenda of our different Universities they are specific things that they are looking at which are aimed at ensuring that we arrive at what one may call home grown solutions to our social challenges as a country. For instance energy which is being done at NUST. Thank you Honourable Alweendo.

Now *Honourable Nauyoma Madala* yes, you raised a very important point and this is the aspect of making sure that UNAM and NUST, the academic programs they offer are well aligned and each knows exactly what are the parameters within which I can offer programs, and the other as well knows. They will be areas where they will overlap but those should be controlled. It should not be a case where nearly every program that you see at UNAM you see at NUST, and this is what we are trying to do, to do away with overlaps and duplications.

How are we doing that? We are saying this year these two institutions will have to do an audit of the academic programs to actually establish those that have really run their course and they are no longer useful, and also to ensure that we pick the obvious duplication and then decide the best placement of this program. We are also saying going forward, it is important the Ministry as well as other stakeholders are involved when new programs are being discussed or being considered for inception.

VTC challenges, what programs are offered at what level? You see currently we have what I will call an open menu of programs, because basically all our VTCs tend to offer similar trades. It is only at very few that you find unique and specific programs that are unique to them. For example this year we can talk of Rundu and Zambezi VTCs, as being the ones that are currently now in the whole country offering agriculture related programs. That is that. We are also looking at identifying some VTCs that can actually move into leather works, production of shoes, and production of bags. I am not talking this, but really designer type of shoes and bags and furniture as well, yes.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 32**
HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

The labour markets, pardon (*Interjection*) a tracer study if you were listening yesterday to my motivation you must have picked up the fact that a tracer study on Higher Education or rather yes, Higher Education was done last year where NUST, UNAM and IUM students were actually followed for the past four years, as to where they are, what they are doing, are they working in the area where they have trained, and indeed the majority were in the relevant areas? About 2% if I remember quite well were self-employed while the majority were absorbed by the labour market.

Honourable Ekandjo thank you for your ideas, and I think indeed we will take heed of some of your suggestions. They are quite valuable. Your fundamental question was do we train people for their own benefit or do we train people to serve the country? I think it is the latter. Well, I think the fundamental one is the latter. Yes, at a personal level one will certainly benefit. Why am I saying the national thing is the critical one?

At this point of development as a country I think where Government funding is involved we must commit to looking at the priority areas of our Government, the priority areas that are put forth by our national planning. The National Planning does that because we have to pull through with industrialisation turning Namibia into a knowledge based society. Really the main goal of for instance funding through NSFAP the main goal of our public Universities is to ensure that as a country we move forward with all the plans that we have and therefore we cannot actually put forward individual benefits as opposed to the national demands.

Honourable Ithana our people are innovative I concur hundred percent and in different communities indeed they have demonstrated that the crafts, baskets, the omagongo and other things. I think some of the things you outlined here like omagongo we need to preserve this. We need to develop a strategy of ensuring that in communities where some of these traditional knowledge and expertise are abound, we somehow develop systems of preserving this, imparting it to the youth and so on. So that going forward we do not lose it, but again, it is proper also maybe to try and integrate it within the formal education system.

24 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE 32**
HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

One thing that we are trying to do as a Ministry maybe where we can also include this is to try and identify a regional economic niche areas and this we hope will lead to value chain development within the Regions. We doing this in conjunction with UNESCO, and it is a project that is ongoing. We hope we will be able to actually conclude it either towards the end of this year or maybe mid next year but it is something that we are looking at. We are trying to look at the unique products within each Region to actually develop what we call this value chain.

Newspapers after graduation, yes, this is a challenge that is facing our tertiary institutions, particularly our Universities. I cannot verify the numbers. I think really this one for males is rather too low, but it is a major concern. I think our tertiary institutions particularly Universities must actually take time to mobilise students to access higher education particularly the boy child, because if we do not do that, this will actually erode the social fabric. It will also affect marriages, quite a number of things and families. Quite a number of things will be affected. So it is important that we actually find a way particularly our Universities to mobilise students graduating at Grade 12, boys and girls to access higher education.

Honourable Namoloh well, the case of Rwanda I think it is important that as a country we aim to learn from the best, but of course as we learn from the best, we must also aim to develop our own systems that others can actually learn from. We do have the national human resource development plan in place, put in place by the National Planning Commission. As a country what we lack is the national human resource development strategy and that is what our Ministry is currently working on. We believe once that is in place, we will be in a position to actually help direct the admissions at our tertiary institutions of course emphasising again the priority areas of study. I think that was the last one. If I have not answered you.

I thank you. (*Applause*)

24 April 2018

**ADJOURNMENT
HON PROF KASINGO**

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you Honourable Minister. I shall report progress and ask leave to sit again. Any objection, agreed to.

ASSEMBLY RESUMES

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Honourable Deputy Speaker I report progress and ask leave to sit again.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you and congratulation to ourselves that we have worked until 11:30. So with this, I wish each and everybody a good night up until tomorrow 14:30 sharp.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 23:30 UNTIL 2018.04.25 AT 14:30

**NATIONAL ASSEMBLY
ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS
WINDHOEK
25 APRIL 2018**

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON SPEAKER took the Chair and read the Prayer and Affirmation.

**ANNOUNCEMENT IN TERMS OF RULE
20 (B) OF THE STANDING RULES AND ORDERS**

HON SPEAKER: I think the whole nation has taken note of their determination, perseverance and the will power of the Members of the National Assembly. We did take note of the fact that we went almost close to midnight last night. I can only say there are many people who admire you out there, and we have taken note of your commitment to the process of law-making, well done. (*Applause*)

Honourable Members we have some few information to share with you. This announcement serves to inform all Honourable Members that the Old Mutual Limited is exhibiting their promotional packages for this calendar year to all Members of Parliament and staff. The promotion is being presented today Wednesday and tomorrow Thursday in our courtyard from 09:00am until 16:00pm and those of you who would like to hear more should visit the Old Mutual stand to hear and to learn from the officials who are ready to serve you, make use of the opportunity.

HON SPEAKER: Any Petitions? Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Oh yes of course, the Minister of Finance.

25 April 2018

**TABLING OF REPORTS
HON SCHLETTWEIN**

TABLING OF REPORTS

TABLING - REPORTS OF THE AUDITOR-GENERAL

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Honourable Speaker, I lay upon the Table, Reports of the Auditor-General on the accounts of the following five institutions:

- i. The Diamond Evaluation Fund for the Financial Year that ended 31st December 2016;
- ii. The Fisheries Observing Fund for the Financial Year that ended 31st March 2017;
- iii. The Office of the Attorney General for the Financial Year that ended 31st March 2017;
- iv. The National Planning Committee for the Financial Year that ended 31st March 2017, and
- v. For the Game Products Trust Fund for the Financial Year that ended 31st March 2017.

I so Move, Honourable Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Notice of questions? Notice of Motions? Notice of questions. Yes let us have your microphone ready?

25 April 2018

**NOTICE OF QUESTIONS
HON VENAANI**

NOTICE OF QUESTIONS

HON VENAANI: I would like to say without notice that we thank you the Speaker and the Table Office to grant us a prayer every afternoon, because I know Members of this side hardly go to church and every time when they come to prayer they really go down because they forgot to pray, so we want to thank you for that (*Laughter*).

HON SPEAKER: Actually Honourable Venaani I must say, I have been to a meeting recently, it took us from Friday to Sunday and I was attending that meeting with Bishop Namupala and we asked Bishop and said, "Bishop will you pray for us every day before we commence our discussions?" and he did that and the last day Sunday he visited a particular reference in the Bible that moved all of us and I think we are deeply Christian people and we need guidance from time to time from the above so we will continue to do so and thank you for reinforcing that spirit.

HON SPEAKER: We move on and I call from the Deputy Chief Whip. Oh, yes? (*Interjection*) I am not yet there, I am still coming. Deputy Chief Whip.

NOTICE OF MOTIONS

MOTION ON BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

25 April 2018

**NOTICE OF MOTIONS
HON HAMBYUKA**

HON HAMBYUKA: Honourable Speaker, I Move without Notice that the proceedings from Votes 33, 34 and 35 of the *Appropriation Bill* be in terms of Rule 99(c) of the Standing Rules and Orders not interrupted if still under consideration at 17:45.

I so Move Honourable Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Table the Motion. Messages from the Head of State? Ministerial Statement? Minister of Justice you have the Floor.

MINISTERIAL STATEMENT

ANTICIPATED CHANGES TO SUCCESSION ON NAMIBIA

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Thank you Speaker. Comrade Speaker, Honourable Members,

Let me start by thanking Honourable Stanley Simataa and his Deputy for the information that they put up in the public regarding the work being done. But also to thank him for amusing us last night, we have discovered a new vocabulary of being summarised and the white horse. "*Calavo branco*" (Laughter)

Honourable Speaker, the Ministry of Justice is in the process of reviewing all legislation relating to succession matters. I know Honourable Van Wyk would be very happy to hear this. Which includes but is not limited to the administration of the *Estate's Act*, 1965 (Act. 66 of 1965),

25 April 2018

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON SHANGHALA**

the *Wills Act*, 1953 (Act. 7 of 1953), *Estates and Succession Amendment Act*, 2005 (Act. 15 of 2005) and the Rules of Inter Estate Succession such as the remaining Sections of the Native Administration Proclamation of 1928, (Proclamation 15 of 1928), Schedule 2 of the Administration of the Estates (Rehoboth *Gebiet*) Proclamation of 1941 (Proclamation No.36 of 1941) and the Common Law.

This Legislation is outdated and does not provide for the proper protection of the Inheritance Rights in modern Namibia. As society and technology progress, our laws must be aligned to this progress.

Our existing Inheritance Laws are confusing and discriminating. Amendments to our Inheritance Laws have been made since Independence but fail to address the real challenges and discriminatory provisions.

The administration process of deceased estates provided for and the *administration of the Estate's Act* 1965 is costly, and causes more hardship to beneficiaries. Houses must sometimes be sold from the Deceased Estate to pay for Executors' fees and other administration costs.

The review process aims to include all inheritance matters under one law and will include a new Legal framework, Administration process, testate and intestate succession, Wills, guardian's fund and curatorship's. Yesterday the Honourable Simataa said, no Honourable Mwaningange said one must not only be heard but one must be understood. By intestate I mean when somebody has died and they have not left a will. By testate I mean that somebody has died and they have left a will.

Amendments have been made to certain parts of the *administration of the Estate's Act* 1965, but did not address issues relating to the administration of the Guardian's Fund, safe custody and record keeping of the Offices of the Master of the High Court. These provisions are outdated and not in line with current basic practises. The guardian's fund is administered by the Master of the High Court in terms of the provisions of Chapter 5 the *Administration of the Estates Act* of 1965.

25 April 2018

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON SHANGHALA**

The Guardian's Fund is a fund created to administer funds which are paid to the Master on behalf of various persons known or unknown, such as minors, persons incapable of managing their own affairs, unborn heirs (*nasciturus*), missing or absent persons or persons having an interest in the money of the *usufructuary* (the right to enjoy the use and advantages of another's property short of the destruction or waste of its substance) or *fideicommissary* (the owner of a property transfers this property to another person, subject to it being transferred from that person to yet another person at a later stage) nature.

The monies consist mainly of inheritances and death benefits that are due to a beneficiary from a deceased estate or pension fund.

The Guardian's Fund administers at present approximately N\$1,400,000 for more than 40,000 beneficiaries. Payments to the amount of N\$65,000,000 have been made to beneficiaries during the 2017-2018 Financial Year.

There are several urgent issues that need to be addressed in particular to ensure effective governance.

There is no provision in the existing administration of the *Estate Act of 1965*, to determine the standards of bookkeeping. The *administration of the Estates Act 1965*, must be aligned to the newly developed integrated financial and case management system. Applications will be done electronically and the Guardian's Fund will operate 95% paperless. All of the existing documents will be scanned and stored electronically. The storage of paper documents is not only too costly to sustain for an undetermined period, but sometimes they invite rats and when you have flooding in the buildings you lose a lot of documentation, and most dangerously subject to tampering. I know Honourable Simataa will be happy to hear that. We are moving to paperless.

Although the Guardian's Fund, Honourable Kavekatora? Honourable Kavekatora, (*Laughter*) although the Guardian's Fund is audited currently

25 April 2018

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON SHANGHALA**

by the Auditor General and *administration of the Estates Act* of 1965, does not provide for a compulsory audit, the *administration of the Estates Act* 1965, does not provide for the proper protection of moneys due to minors or deceased estates, these are things I am picking up from your Reports.

The proceeds of policies which are due to a minor are paid by the insurance companies to either the guardian or held in a Fund administered by the insurance company. Many complaints are lodged with the Master by minors that never receive such moneys from their guardians.

The administration and trustee fees payable on moneys kept in trust by private institutions are not currently regulated.

Trusts administered by insurance and financial institutions in most cases charging an acceptance fee and an annual administration fee. An acceptance fee is a percentage of the capital amount that is immediately deducted upon receipt of funds by the institution. For example when a capital amount of N\$100,000.00 for a minor is paid to the institution, an acceptance fee of 1% depending on the fee structure which amounts to N\$1,000 is immediately deducted from the capital amount. The minors' investment would therefore start with a negative an amount less than the capital the minor received originally.

Section 28 of the *administration of Estates Act* 1965, provides that Executives shall pay moneys due to Deceased Estate into a bank account opening the name of the estate unless the Master directs otherwise.

There are several cases where Executors (which includes admitted legal Practitioners) transfer the monies due to an estate late, from the estates late bank account into their own bank accounts for their own use. The Master will only detect the misuse of the estate monies once the liquidation and distribution account is lost and examined. It is usually too late to recover the funds because evidence becomes now the issue.

25 April 2018

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON SHANGHALA**

It has further come to light that many legal practitioners do not pay interest earned on the monies of the estate to the beneficiaries.

It is unfortunately to see an increase in these matters and these Amendments that would be coming for which I hope I will have your support because they affect everybody here, you do not know when you are dying, you do not know if your will is proper or it will be rejected. So I hope you are listening very seriously. So when these Amendments come there will be a necessary safeguard to the estate monies. Funds need to be paid directly into the account of beneficiaries and creditors with interest earned thereof from the Guardian's Fund.

Numerous problems are experienced with deceased estates that are supervised by Magistrates Offices due to lack of statutory control.

Rehoboth had their own Estates Office which was under the jurisdiction of the Rehoboth Magistrate. Many complaints are received daily regarding the poor administration of the estates that were handled by the Rehoboth Estate Office.

Properties in Rehoboth were either not transferred to the beneficiaries or transferred to other persons who were not entitled to these properties. Many beneficiaries do not have funds to take these matters to Court to seek relief. I have found at least seven files that are on my desk now and we need to find a solution.

Urgent intervention is necessary to provide proper protection over estates handled by Magistrates Offices.

The *Estates and Succession Amendment Act* of 2005, brought only procedural changes. The Master supervises of the administration of all deceased estates irrespective of racial grounds or geographical boundaries. You remember that that was the *Berendt case* where up until then estates of people who were defined as "*Bantus*" and "*Basters*" were dealt with separately from those who were defined as "*blanke*" (whites). "*Die blanke was anders*" (The whites were different).

25 April 2018

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON SHANGHALA**

The *Estates and Succession Amendment Act* therefore needs to be dealt with holistically. The *Amendment Act* does not provide for the harmonisation of Customary Law with the *Administration of the Estates Act* of 1965. A Customary Law, listen to this very carefully particularly those of you who may find yourselves with more than one spouse. A Customary Law spouse is not recognised as a spouse, and can only be appointed as executor if the spouse provides a Bond of Security which is difficult to obtain but many a times the Master has just been waiving the Bond of Security.

A Customary Law spouse is not recognised as a spouse under the *Administration of the Estates Act* and can only be appointed as executor if he/she provides a bond of security which is difficult to obtain and the Master as practise been able to just waive it.

There is furthermore no provision to deal with property that falls usually under Customary Law. I was giving the example that if Sacky Shanghala passes away today, and I live in town in Windhoek and I have property in Windhoek it will be dealt with by the Master, but the property that I have in the village will be dealt with by the headman or the Traditional Authority. So this fragmented system has led to a lot of abuse. The result is that all assets must be distributed in terms of one Act, one Estates Act.

Lastly, the *Administration of the Estates Act* of 1965 does not provide for clear and transparent investment processes. Now what the Master has, she has got money she puts it into accounts, they are probably not yielding the best returns and then appoints one or two investment companies to invest, no processes.

The proposed Amendment do not adversely affect stakeholders as it is meant to strengthen the already existing protection provided for in the *Administration of the Estates Act*, but they are a result of complaints from stakeholders such as beneficiaries, such as some lawyers, such as some financial institutions, such as the Committee of Parliament that has reported on the fact that the fund is not audited etcetera.

25 April 2018

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON SHANGHALA**

Auditor General is Reports:

There are not financial implications in the process of the Amendments neither as a result of the Amendment, except for it should be possible for the fund money to be used to maintain the fund, and for example the fund money should be able to pay for an auditor to audit the fund.

Honourable Speaker,

This issue is very important. I decided to make a Ministerial Statement before I come with the Amendments here, so that you have time to reflect and think about what I am saying, so that you have time to go and listen to the people so that when we consider the text here it meets the needs of the people. You are the people. You are one of the people who will be affected by this law. Everybody will be affected by this law. So I hope I do not have political discussions, but we have meaningful discussions.

To conclude, the proposed Amendment which are done and are going through the process are to ensure a more transparent and effective governance of the operations of the Master of the High Court. The Auditor General and External Auditors have time and again pointed out in the findings the lack of transparency in the current investment decision making process, and how this Fund is managed, now it is time for change.

I thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Honourable Venaani.

QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS ON MINISTERIAL STATEMENT

25 April 2018

**QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS ON
MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON VENAANI / HON VAN WYK**

HON VENAANI: It is a very interesting piece of legislation that will be coming that will dovetail both the current powers some Traditional Authorities have in managing estates and so forth, but coupled with what you are bring in when are we going to have the law that will also be able to Amend matrimonial rights while people are alive. I remember there was a Motion maybe ten years ago here that was discussed when Honourable Nujoma was the Minister of Justice, and we were promised then that a Bill of that kind will be coming.

Why do we not consolidate everything so that we discuss all these things in unison so that we really try to formalise these regimes because sometimes and it is just a question, sometimes you are in this situation where the one partner, the wife or husband is in business but when they got married they got married through say in-community of property, and now the risk of the businesses are so high that if this one partner is messing up plus a number of mistakes in the business to a point where all the estate will be taken by bonding.

Now in South Africa and other jurisdictions have modernised that, you can be able to approach a Judge and be able to change that matrimonial status while you are still alive and others that are also marrying for frivolous reasons that are known. So when are we going to have that piece of legislation?

HON SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Let me take the next question and then we stop there then the Minister will come back. Honourable Van Wyk.

HON VAN WYK: Thank you Honourable Speaker. I would like to thank the Honourable Minister for this very important information. I think it is the right time for us to attend to these issues, and I hope that

25 April 2018

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON SHANGHALA**

especially people from Rehoboth and Rehoboth “*gebiet*” (jurisdiction) take note of this. You know it is, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members. It is very disturbing when you hear on certain platforms for example on radio that community leaders try to misled people by saying that for example the laws of this country does not have jurisdiction over Rehoboth. Those are lies, it is false and I am not scared to say it. I brought this to the attention of Government, to the relevant Ministries and I hope that some action will be taken. Just last week Tuesday, people were encouraged over the radio not to register estates in terms of the current laws but to register at a certain Office with no jurisdiction. Even the *Deeds Act* apparently does not have jurisdiction over Rehoboth land. Those remarks are false and I want the people of Rehoboth to take note of this.

We will not have an Independent republic within an Independent republic we will not support that. Thank you very much Honourable Minister and I am looking forward to discussions and I hope that you will solve the problems.

Thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Honourable Minister of Justice I think you are on the right path. Just a quick response to those two comments.

RESPONSE TO MINISTERIAL STATEMENT

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Honourable Speaker, thank you very much for the questions, I think they are very relevant. Let me also just respond to some of the questions that I received in writing which I think

25 April 2018

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON SHANGHALA**

could benefit the House. I was asked whether the Minister can issue directives. Yes the Minister will be empowered under the amendment to issue the directives. The old Act is a 1953, stiffed in a very old dispensation where the Master was sort of, on their own and did things. So to bring in an element of governance the Masters operate but this separated by the Minister so the Amendment seeks to do that.

Secondly, in those directives that will come there will be exactly what is expected of every executor, particularly lawyers. There are some lawyers who have made it their career to focus on these areas and are doing a great job but there are those who are also using it as ways to just keep their law firms afloat, that happens everywhere and we will root them out with those regulations that are going to be issued.

Let me start with the *Honourable Van Wyk* and say that what you have done is patriotic, and it is very necessary for us to remind our people that the days of Suid Wes Afrika and the Gebiet are not coming back. Those days are long gone. As the Founding President said on that Wednesday evening of March 21, 1990, “*Forever we are the masters of our own destiny*”. So they can forget about this thing of some exclusive whatever. Unfortunately because of our Constitution and because of the reality that we could not at Independence wipe the slate clean and every law is gone. We have laws like the *Native Administration Proclamation* of 1928 still applicable where you have discrimination based on racial and on geographic grounds.

These Amendments will remove the last part remaining of the *Native Administrative Proclamation* and the other laws which Honourable Venaani is referring to are going to remove the last section. I just want to warn the men in this House that particularly the black men you are unduly favoured now under that law because it allows a native man in terms of the definition of native men, to be able to marry a Common Law wife and multiple Customary Law wives, but that is for instance not allowed of my brother Leon Jooste there because he would not qualify to be defined as native under that definition, so it is also a racial discrimination. So that has to go if it comes it is applicable to everybody.

25 April 2018

**MINISTERIAL STATEMENT
HON SHANGHALA**

HON MEMBER: And also Comrade Calle.

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Oh yes also Comrade Calle Schlettwein but I am sure he does not want to have multiple wives does he (*Laughter*).

Honourable Venaani the question you asked about those laws, it is true what Honourable Utoni Nujoma indicated, we have gone through a couple of drafts when I was at Law Reform, we completed it and we went through a couple of workshops. A new Commission came in, changed it we are now back to where we were. That Bill, the Minister who administers the Marriage Register is not the Minister of Justice. It is Honourable Kapofi, Minister of Home Affairs and Immigration. So we have done workshops with the then Minister of Justice and Attorney Generally, with the Minister of Home Affairs, and then there was a change so he has to now go through the process and take himself to understand all the arguments because he has to come and advance it here and know if you make a suggestion here will it impact something else so he needs to be taken through, that (*coughing*) is now the *Marriage Act*, the uniform matrimonial regime act.

What it means is that Namibia now has two regimes. If you are married in the areas north of the police zone you are married by default, out of community of property, unless a month prior to the marriage you sign a declaration saying that we intend to be in community of property, and then this side of the police zone which is automatically in community of property unless you specify through a, do you know what it is called, ante nuptial contract so ante meaning before and nuptial meaning marriage. So both are ante nuptial the only difference is the one for the area of the north of the police zone is prescribed in content by the law and this one is done on your own and you can specify it. So that is coming.

As well as what is coming is the divorce law. So the only one that will be outstanding then thus far will be the customary marriages because that

25 April 2018

**COMMITTEE STAGE – APPROPRIATION BILL
HON SCHLETTWEIN**

takes a little bit longer to get into. So that package will have the laws that are administered under Home Affairs that is the marriage, and the uniform Matrimonial we will have to now see whether we are doing it Home Affairs and Justice. Customary marriages maybe Urban and Rural because they deal with the Customary Law and then divorce is the Minister of Justice. So they are coming they are ready, they are being fine-tuned as we speak.

Thank you very much.

HON SPEAKER: Good, thank you very much. Let us leave it at that and I noticed when you are talking you are looking at some various places, this side and that area there (*Laughter*). Thank you Minister. The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

**RESUMPTION OF COMMITTEE
STAGE - APPROPRIATION BILL [B. 2 – 2018]**

SECRETARY: Resumption of Committee Stage – *Appropriation Bill* [B. 2- 2018]

HON SPEAKER: Does the Honourable Minister of Finance Move that the Assembly now goes into Committee?

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: I so Move Comrade Speaker.

25 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 33**
HON BOOIS

HON SPEAKER: It is moved that I leave the Chair. Any objection? Who seconds? Agreed to. I now call on the Chairperson of the Whole House Committee to take the Chair.

ASSEMBLY IN COMMITTEE

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
The Whole House Committee is called to order. Before I proceed I just want to make a humble appeal to all of us to give ourselves a bonus so that we can briefly comment and intervene so that at the end of the day we should not knock off too late like last night. When you make interventions I should think five minutes is enough.

When progress was reported yesterday, the 24th of April 2018, Votes 33, 34, and 35 had been introduced and Votes 01, 02, 03, 04, 05, 06, 07, 08, 09, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31 and 32 had been agreed to.

Now I put Vote 33, - “**POVERTY ERADICATION AND SOCIAL WELFARE**” for discussions. Any discussions? I recognise Honourable Boois.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LAND REFORM: Thank you Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee.

First of all before I start with my contribution, I also want to make something very clear, thank you very much that you pronounced me as Boois, and not Beukes because that Beukes is something that is really extra tug on my heart. I do not want to hear that Beukes. Sometimes people are sending messages, invitations and then they say Priscilla

25 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 33
HON BOOIS

Beukes, I will not. (*Interjections*) I am coming back that is why I said before I start with it, I will not attend to anything.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Okay we take note of that.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF LAND REFORM: Okay otherwise say Simataa then (*Laughter*). Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members, it is with pride and profound joy that I rise today to tender my support to Vote 33, as the former Deputy Minister of this care driven Ministry.

I want to make use of this opportunity to thank the President, the Minister of Finance and the Minister of Poverty Eradication and Social Welfare for their relentless efforts to ensure that our elderly are well catered for as we all know the invaluable role they play in our society as pillars of the parental gap that is as a result of the continuing onslaught on human lives by HIV/AIDS and other killer diseases. I applaud you for the **increase of the Old Age Grant**, and I am sure that the elderly are equally grateful for this generous gesture.

Further on page 9 and 12 the Ministry motivates the efforts made with respect to the **food bank programme**. I am conscious of the many strides the Ministry has made and give due recognition of their tireless efforts to ensure that people do not go hungry in Namibia.

However, while on page 9 and 10, the Ministry made reference to the **research of University of Namibia (UNAM)** and streamlining of eligibility criteria, the experience is that people who are not really under the vulnerability criteria are still benefiting. Now my question therefore is whether the Ministry will continue to employ strategies that will resolve the aforementioned situation.

25 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 33**
HON DIENDA

In addition reference is made to roll out the food bank to //Karas and Hardap. I applaud the Minister for these bold steps that he and his team has taken. Now my question in this respect is, how soon will the rollout be taken out to other Regions especially Opuwo in Kunene, where urban hunger is high especially at the site called Epupa.

In conclusion may I assure the Honourable Minister and the House that I support the **Entrepreneurship Development Programme**, the entry tag as a concerned mother that carries the unfortunate situation of the unemployed youth at heart? It is therefore my prayer that the three Ministries, the Ministry of Poverty Eradication and Social Welfare, the Ministry of Industrialisation, Trade and SME Development, as well as the Ministry of Higher Education, Training and Innovation will in an expedient manner cause the full implementation of this very important programme and with these few remarks.

I thank you.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:

Thank you. Yes I recognise Honourable Dienda, I know you are very brief.

HON DIENDA: Thank you Honourable Chairperson. Honourable Minister I just have two concerns and my first one is on page 458 of the Estimates of Revenue Income and Expenditure.

Honourable Minister I have noticed and I am glad to see that we will fund 30 people under this Division while there is only 14 people currently employed so I hope you will (*Intervention*).

HON MINISTER OF POVERTY ERADICATION AND SOCIAL WELFARE: Page what?

HON DIENDA: Page 458. So I hope the Honourable Minister will employ the others which we will fund now for this Financial Year, and the reason why I am asking this is Honourable the people outside there are crying about the food bank the distribution of food. We appreciate what you are doing, but the concern is Khomas was the pilot project but now people are complaining and saying we are spending all the time and all the money and all the resources on Khomas. So if we are saying that we do not have enough for all 14 regions they were asking then keep it on hold. It seems like we as Members of Parliament are discriminating against other Regions. So I want us to treat them equally and to make sure that other Regions and not only Khomas will benefit. I saw that you will give your attention to the South, but other Regions are crying when we visit them about this.

Also Honourable Minister on page 459, planning is very important. Without planning we cannot move any further. I have also noticed that you only have five positions currently filled in this **Ministry of Planning and Review** but we will fund you for 20 people so I do not know whether it will still be a problem for you to employ people while the funding will be there. Thank you very much Honourable Bishop and I support this Vote.

Thank you.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Thank you. Less than five minutes. Honourable Kavekatora.

25 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 33
HON KAVEKOTORA

HON KAVEKOTORA: Thank you very much Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee. I will also be brief. I rise to support the Vote of Poverty Eradication and Social Welfare. I only have a few comments to make.

One, is on page 459, Honourable Dienda just touched upon it and that is the issue of if the Honourable Minister looks at the establishment of the Main Division 5 **Planning and Review**. You are only allowed to, the highest that we can employ in that Main Division 5 is only 15 people but the Honourable Minister went up to fund 20 people. That is illegal. And I would ask the Honourable Minister to reduce the funded number from 20 to 15 because that is the highest we could go. Your establishment is 15 so you cannot go beyond 15. Could you please reduce that and also corresponding to reduce the remuneration of N\$3,400,000 to fit the 15 people and not for 20 that is one.

Two, Honourable Minister you have a very important task of Poverty Eradication and it is caused by a number of factors. Unemployment leads to poverty, low economic growth leads to poverty, corruption leads to poverty, skewed wealth distribution also leads to poverty. So eradicating poverty through **social grants** as much as it is very important especially for the vulnerable segment of our population is not sustainable, and I think it is about time for Government to start looking at more sustainable long term solutions apart from social grants, because if I look at your Budget allocation N\$3 billion, of the N\$3,3 billion, is actually allocated to social grants which is good but I think Namibia as a country needs to look at a much more longer term solution to poverty alleviation, than just relying on social grants. With that I support your Vote.

Thank you.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Honourable Hoffmann.

25 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 33**
HON HOFFMANN

HON HOFFMANN: Thank you Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members, (*Intervention*)

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Honourable Karupu.

HON HOFFMANN: I rise to support the Poverty Eradication Budget together with this House and I support it, Vote 33. Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, allow me to be able to table my concern.

Has the Minister of Poverty Eradication and Social Welfare taken into account the entire number, the entire population of the destitute, the needy and the disadvantaged across Namibia in allocating the funding necessary for their upliftment. What exactly does the Minister want to accomplish for the poverty stricken during this Budget cycle? The South is most possibly the most hit area in Namibia by poverty and destitution. Has the South been given the attention it deserves in general, and has the problem of the Southern destitute been given due consideration, the consideration it deserves, if so can the Honourable Minister please elaborate?

What is the number of the destitute this Budget is calculated to reach across Namibia? Poverty is becoming a matter of great concern in Namibia. Previous national Budget was set that they were seeking to eradicate it in Namibia, poverty still persists and it seems it is on the increase. What is different about this Budget from the previous Budget? How is this Budget going to accomplish what the previous pro-poor Budget did not?

Lastly, Minister Bishop Zephaniah Kameeta, Namibia has a big backlog in its efforts of uplifting the poor. Is the current allocation of funds to look after the poor in Namibia the best that could be done for them?

25 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 33**
HON SIOKA

Chairperson of the Whole House Committee I trust that my concern which is well grounded is well understood by this House and especially by Honourable Bishop Zephaniah Kameeta, Minister of Poverty Eradication and Social Welfare and with this I support the Bill.

Thank you.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Thank you. Honourable Minister Doreen Sioka?

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: Thank you very much I will be brief like others Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members. I cannot go without praising my father what he is doing in the Ministry, and really you have to do it because I know he is one of the Founding Fathers of our Constitution. So there is no way somebody will praise you daddy while you are alive, I do not want to praise you while you are no more. Thank you very much that in your eyes you are watching me. I think right now we have got only four people if not three, the Founding Fathers of our Constitution. That is Comrade Zephaniah Kameeta, Honourable Jerry Ekandjo and Honourable Pendukeni Iivula-Ithana, Founding Fathers and Mothers and the Speaker, yes they are four Founding Fathers and Mother who are watching us. Came up with the *(Intervention)*.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Two minutes. The budget *(Laughter)*. Please?

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: What is it?

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: I am saying it is okay we take note, I would like now for you to concentrate on the Vote.

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: I am coming. I have got ten minutes according to the rules. So I have to say thank you to them because they are watching us when we praise them. I cannot shy away, because they are the ones who came up with this Constitution and came up with the decision of increasing our pensioners. So I want to praise them, I am not wasting time.

Honourable Deputy Chairperson, I promise that I am not going to take long it is only just on page 5 where I have seen a big number of pensioners which has increased. The recipients which have all the old age grants and beneficiaries which has increased from N\$165,376 to N\$170,000 there is an increase there. So we have to say thank you, and the funeral benefits which our pensioners are getting, and the N\$60 which we have increased this year is something to our pensioners, and really to tell the truth people are so happy there. Our elders are so happy there that they will even manage to look after their grandchildren whom we are dumping to them. So I am really saying thank you very much Honourable Minister I know you negotiated for this N\$60 it is not just for free, you need to negotiate and say oh now I need this to be increased. It is what we also do in Gender Equality and Child Welfare when one comes to our vulnerable children and orphan children.

Therefore Comrade Minister I thank you and I thank the Government for having a listening ear to us as Ministers and to the people of Namibia and I know they have to remain voting for SWAPO for their benefits because

25 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 33
HON KOOPER

they have been suffering for a long time during those days R30 or R15 which they were getting it is no more to be talked about these days. So vote for SWAPO elders so that we keep benefitting.

Thank you very much.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Thank you, order. I recognise Honourable Kooper. You have the Floor.

HON KOOPER: Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Honourable Members, allow me to submit my contribution (*Intervention*).

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Yes can we listen to Honourable Kooper please. Yes you have the Floor. Yes just talk. Start.

HON KOOPER: Allow me to submit my contribution to Vote 33. The Ministry of Poverty Eradication and Social Welfare is mission statement gives a clear direction of the Ministry is roles, activities and its significant purposes. Thus I recognise and acknowledge the efforts of the Minister of Poverty Eradication and Social Welfare, Honourable Minister Bishop Emeritus Dr Zephaniah Kameeta, and his team for the outstanding work and continuing efforts in fostering eradication of poverty in this great nation.

Your efforts Comrade Minister and indeed, your detailed programmes in your motivation speech gives justification that the Ministry is indeed

25 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 33**
HON KOOPER

driven by strategic methods to eradicate the social evil called poverty. Moreover the cause to distribute the social grants pay-outs towards eligible recipients amongst the N\$77,000,000, this itched my thoughts to articulate alternative cost effective methods to attain the distribution on time and in a secure manner.

I therefore, propose to the Ministry to deduce a comprehensive Report of the current pay out distribution modes costs, which are banks, NamPost and cash distributors for the purposes of alignment to the cost effective Ministry initiative. I agree that the Ministry needs to educate the public about the experience, high cash cost towards cash pay-out methods and the Ministry should handle the change management aspect of the current norms pertaining physical cash pay-outs which is costly at micro and macro level of any economy.

Honourable Chairperson, Honourable Members,

I applaud the Ministry's efforts by undertaking cost taking measures to not renew the current contract of the service provider to administer the payment of **funeral cover claims** to the undertakers which will now be performed by the Ministry and not outsourcing the task. This is indeed an effort to demonstrate that the resource allocated is indeed for the intended purposes.

Finally, allow me to make an observation with regards to the N\$52,319,000 allocated for the acquisition of the **food parcels**. Honourable Chairperson, Honourable Members, let this very important programme activity be performed in a two-fold view of poverty eradication which are as follows:

The beneficiaries should be the real need. The Ministry should procure the food parcel products from the local SMEs and youth enterprises which are truly Namibian owned and in this manner poverty reduction will be felt which shall lead to eradication. With these few contributions I support the vote.

25 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 33
HON VAN DEN HEEVER

I thank you.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Thank you very much. I recognise Honourable Van Den Heever.

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: I will take two hours, you took ten last night. Thank you Honourable Chairperson. I would just like to help my senior Minister saying that the provision for pension comes from the Ruling Party. Our Constitution (*Intervention*).

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Which one? (*Interjections*) No, please.

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: Our Constitution, I am talking on, I want to speak. I want to speak on the grant.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Can you talk on the Vote?

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: She (*Indistinct*) and I want to correct her. Article 95

25 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 33
HON VAN DEN HEEVER

HON MEMBER: Which one?

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: (f) Promotion of the welfare of the people
(*Intervention*).

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Sorry why did you not (*Intervention*).

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: I am contributing towards the Vote of
Poverty (*Intervention*).

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
No, no (*Intervention*).

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: No you did not help her. You did not help
(*Intervention*).

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Honourable Chief Whip of the (*Intervention*).

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: You did not correct her. You did not rule
her Out of Order.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:

Honourable Chief Whip of the Opposition, when a Presiding Officer talks you sit and you listen please. You are the Chief Whip of the Official Opposition you know these things. When Honourable Minister spoke you could have stood up and said Point of Order. Now I give you the Floor to comment on the Vote please.

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: Honourable Chairperson, my contribution is towards the old age people and that is why I want to bring it into context and I want to help her here. I want to read this Article to the Whole House to take note of this Article 95 (f) is saying, ensuring that senior citizens are entitled to and do receive a regular pension adequate for the maintenance of a decent standard of living and the enjoyment of social and cultural opportunities. (*Interjections*) It is not SWAPO is Constitution.

Honourable Chairperson, I am having a very short intervention regarding the pensioners (*Intervention*).

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:

Point of Order.

HON ATTORNEY GENERAL: Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, just for the record because what the Honourable Member said is on record, and we are entitled also to put on record the following information. You are aware there are three Members in fact four who are the original founders and they are going to confirm this. The provision which the Honourable Member read came from SWAPO (*Intervention*)

25 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 33
HON VAN DEN HEEVER

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: It was the Constituent Assembly Members. I still remember Attorney General please.

HON ATTORNEY GENERAL: You may recall during the Constituency Assembly the draft Constitution of SWAPO was adopted as a working document. It is documented. That provision came from SWAPO.

I so submit.

HON MINISTER: It was long before that (*Indistinct*).

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Proceed? Can you proceed?

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: On what? On what is Honourable Mutorwa standing?

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Order, proceed.

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: May I have the Floor. My contribution, on what are you standing Honourable Mutorwa, I did not say anything? I did

25 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 33
HON VAN DEN HEEVER

not say anything on what he is standing for. On what is Honourable Mutorwa standing, I did not say anything?

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: No, no this is on a Point of Order. (*Indistinct*) Now just in addition to what my colleague (*Intervention*).

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Honourable Venaani, please.

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Just in addition to what my colleague the Attorney General has stated as a matter of record. The quotation that the Honourable Van Den Heever has made is correct, but it talks about the State shall provide. Now it means the State through its Government and that Government is the SWAPO Government. So (*Intervention*).

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: So we are not part of the Government, you are not the Government. (*Interjection*).

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Honourable Venaani order. No, no wait for the person who has the Floor and then you can stand up. Can you proceed?

25 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 33
HON VAN DEN HEEVER

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: I will not label on that issue. My intervention, stand on a Point of Order? Was on the pensioners' infrastructure of pay points when they are receiving (*Intervention*).

CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Point of Order from your President.

HON VENAANI: Point of Order and Point of Information. Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee. When we narrate history we cannot change what has happened in the past, the bad, the wrong, and the good but narrate it truthfully. It is true Mr Kawana that in the Constituent Assembly the document that was adopted as a working paper was a SWAPO Constitution. It was adopted from the proposition of our party. We propose that, but there were two parties, the only two parties that had constitutional (*Interjections*) (*Intervention*).

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Listen.

HON VENAANI: Yes, let us just be truthful. Let us be truthful (*Interjections*) it was DTA. DTA proposed it, I will tell you the proposal. I will tell you the proposal and it was seconded by Mose Tjitendero and adopted by thee Chairperson who is the President (*Intervention*)

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Order.

25 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 33
HON VAN DEN HEEVER

HON VENAANI: So let us be truthful about it and I also want to address one element.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Order! Order!

HON VENAANI: I also want to address another element, this country had (*Intervention*).

HON ATTORNEY GENERAL: Point of Order.

HON VENAANI: This country had second tier Government, there were second tier Governments, and people like Tate !Naruseb, Tate Kameeta know this politics better because some of you were in the bush. (*Interjections*) Yes some of you were just in the villages.

HON DR ATTORNEY GENERAAL: And where were you yourself?

HON VENAANI: I was here. I was here (*Interjections*) (*Intervention*).

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Order!

25 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 33
HON VAN DEN HEEVER

HON VENAANI: I was here. I was in Windhoek. I was a young person in Windhoek. (*Intervention*)

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Honourable Venaani!

HON VENAANI: Who was very aware of matters happening but the issue is not Venaani where I was, the issue is the truth (*Otjiherero*).

HON DR ATTORNEY GENERAL: I was not in the vicinity I was in the bush (*Intervention*).

HON VENAANI: I respect that. I respect that, but you were in the bush.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
“*Handiti*” (Excuse me) Colleague, colleague.

HON VENAANI: I respect that. You were doing a very important favour to this country that I honour and respect but it is true that you were in the bush. Let me just answer one element.

25 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 33
HON VAN DEN HEEVER

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Colleague, colleague.

HON VENAANI: When we are talking about history do not write the history of the victor write the history as it was. In this country there was a second tier Government. The second tier listen I want to correct him, the second tier Government that was running the white administration was not a DTA Government. (*Interjection*)

HON ATTORNEY GENERAL: It was DTA

HON VENAANI: No it was not the DTA Government it was Jan De Wet. I will even tell you the leader. They defended apartheid yes Jan De Wet was the Chairperson of the second tier Government, so when you are talking about the pensions that were paid higher for blacks and lower for blacks and higher for whites. It was a Government that we were in opposition to. (*Interjection*)

HON ATTORNEY GENERAL: And you were supporting it.

HON VENAANI: No we were not supporting it.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Honourable Venaani, Van Den Heever (*Interjections*). Can we listen now.

25 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 33
HON VAN DEN HEEVER

HON VENAANI: Do not even say that as if we were not in the country.

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: You see Honourable Chairperson, if you would not have allowed Honourable Doreen Sioka to go on with this statement this would not what happened. That is what happened.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: I am going to leave this Chair I am telling you.

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: Leave it, it is your prerogative (*Intervention*).

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: If you are going to be like that I will leave.

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: Can I continue, please protect me from Nekundi. Honourable Nekundi you are looking at me, it is not me.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: No, colleagues can we listen now? Can we listen? Last night we knocked off at 12:30 in the morning actually, are we not tired? Please Honourable Van Den Heever can you now stand up and try to say what you say and conclude?

25 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 33
HON VAN DEN HEEVER

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: Thank you Honourable Chairperson, my question to the Honourable Minister of Poverty Eradication (*Intervention*).

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Honourable Venaani and Honourable Nekundi do you want to fight?

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: Send them out.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Honourable Right Honourable Prime Minister I am going (*Interjections*).
Yes please everybody must be quiet. Everybody must keep quiet please.
Everybody must keep quiet. The leader of the Opposition Party and, can you say what you want to say?

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: Chairperson, my question is whenever our pensioners are getting pay-outs the conditions, the shelters, under the trees and wherever they are getting these pay-outs, the conditions are quite harsh. We got so many complaints, robbers are taking over (*Interjections*) (*Intervention*).

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Point of Order. (*Interjections*)

25 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 33
HON VAN DEN HEEVER

HON DR ATTORNEY GENERAL: Point of Order. Honourable. You people. (*Interjections*).

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE COMMITTEE: Are you not tired.

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: Can I ask my question what is a Point of Order?

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Yes on a Point of Order.

HON ATTORNEY GENERAL: Honourable Chief Whip of the PDM. I do not know whether it is Poor and Destructive Movement or whatever I do not know

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: Popular Democratic Movement.

HON ATTORNEY GENERAL: But I was told you are now PDM. Do you not think that those who were in the bush are the ones who were fighting to make sure that the welfare of this nation is looked after, including the pension? Do you agree with me that those who were in the bush who were SWAPO, were the ones who were fighting to make sure the welfare of this nation is looked after? Do you agree with me?

25 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 33
HON VAN DEN HEEVER

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: Honourable Chairperson?

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Can you ignore that, just proceed put your question?

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: Chairperson, I will really now proceed because that is totally out of order. (*Intervention*).

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Put all your question.

HON VAN DEN HEEVER: Honourable Bishop I said that the conditions are really not very conducive, people are complaining they have to stand for hours in the sun etcetera. We know what the situation is. I think many Members last year also mentioned about it. I humbly request that the Ministry should look into it. There are not even toilet facilities for the attention of our elders. We want to treat them with dignity, we want to treat them as elders, but if they have to just sit there where they are I mean we are really depriving them from the dignity. So I would like the Ministry to look into it and see what can be done even if we put up temporary shelters to help them to receive their pensions in a dignified manner.

I thank you.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:

Thank you. Honourable Bishop? Honourable Minister you can stand up and respond that is the end of comments and questions. Can we listen to the Bishop, to the most senior Member in this House?

HON MINISTER OF POVERTY ERADICATION AND SOCIAL

WELFARE: Thank you very much Comrade Chairperson of the Whole House Committee yes thank you. It is really a pity that the Vote of a Retired Bishop unleashed such a (*Laughter*). I hope now that there is a little bit calmness. You know I represent two things. I am a Member of SWAPO I am very strong Member of SWAPO for many, many years; but I work also in an institution where we do not talk of they and us. So I am standing here now in front of Honourable Members of Parliament so I am also happy now that calmness has returned a little bit.

The first person to speak is our former Deputy Minister *Honourable Boois* in our Ministry and she congratulated the Ministry and expressed her support and she referred to the research which was done by the middle discipline, ah what? MDRC of Multi-Disciplinary Research Centre of the University of Namibia. We already have the strategy we are working on that.

The new re-registration of the people in the Khomas Region is done according to what we have learnt, and also in Keetmanshoop and Mariental. We are working according to these new stringent methods of registration where we are really looking at those who are very much in poverty and who are living in extreme poverty. So it is already done.

When are we going to the other areas? We would have been already to Opuwo, Omaheke, the Northern Areas, but because of the Budget so we stopped for the time being. Within a week or two we will be in Opuwo and the other Regions. I am so happy that the Research Unit of the University of Namibia has really helped us also with this work they did.

25 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 33**
HON BISHOP KAMEETA

We learnt a lot in what they have done and I really want to use this opportunity also to thank them for that particular work they have done.

Honourable Dienda, you referring to the document on page 458. We will look into that. The points you have raised are very much valid so we will look into that. I will contact you and share with you. The other Regions we have, I have mentioned it already (*Intervention*).

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Order in the House.

HON MINISTER OF POVERTY ERADICATION AND SOCIAL WELFARE: So we will be going to the other regions. At this stage I want to say also that the people of Namibia are reacting very positively and in a caring way. When we were in Mariental and Keetmanshoop, the distribution would be in Mariental but we call upon farmers, business people and the reaction is so positive and it is so good. We said we are distributing in Mariental and in Keetmanshoop and in Lüderitz, but we call upon you. You have Rehoboth, you have places like Gochas which are outside, of course the (*Intervention*).

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Honourable Venaani and Honourable Nekundi do you listen to what the Minister is saying?

HON VENAANI: We are listening.

CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: No, if somebody is talking please Honourable Venaani can you come back to your place (*Laughter*). Come back to your seat. Come back to your seat, yes thank you. Okay please go ahead Honourable Minister.

HON MINISTER OF POVERTY ERADICATION AND SOCIAL WELFARE: Thank you very much. And so we called upon all these people to look at these small places surrounding these towns where we will be distributing food and the reaction has been very good. We said they can contact directly the Councillors and give what is to be given there so that they can also share it with those who have nothing. So we are very much serious in looking into that whole question of the people who are outside Khomas who really need the support. Of course we must not forget that from the Office of the Prime Minister, that we have then the drought relief and which also caters for many of these areas.

Honourable Kavekatora, Planning and Policy, we have 20 people instead of 15. Well I do not think really it should be now said that it is illegal having more with five people, but I will check with our office what precisely is going on here and look into that.

I agree with you when you say the problem is very much serious and we cannot only concentrate on social protection, of course we are not concentrating on social protection only. I have mentioned that or I should say it will be very good for Honourable Members to look into the implementation plan of the blue print which we distributed here, and that we should not only see the Ministry of Poverty Eradication and Social Welfare in isolation.

Also in my speech I mentioned the different Ministries with which we are cooperating and working together, in order to address this whole question. Poverty eradication is not only taking place within the Ministry of Poverty Eradication and Social Welfare, but we are coordinating, we are working together, we are looking into the different programmes it is also not only

25 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 33**
HON BISHOP KAMEETA

theory we have time limes in the implementation plan. What should be done before what time? So we should look into that document and I would say that during our popularisation visit in the region where we then popularised the blue print and the implementation plan, we had the question of how would the Councillors assist in discussing with the population what is in this document. So we have been translating a short version of what is in the blue print and also the implementation plan.

When we were in Rundu we were confronted also by someone who said well, what about those who cannot see and read what has been written? So I think it is already now being done having those summaries of those documents in braille writing, so that the Regional Councillors can discuss it with the people but also that the people can ask questions and say well you said you will do this by this time why is it not done. So, that is what we are doing, but please look into the implementation plan Honourable Kavekatora and see that we are not only concentrating on the social grants and on the distribution of food. It is much more in that we have heard about the Entrepreneurship Programme which will be in due course maybe during May will be tabled in Cabinet, to see how we then assist the people in this way.

Honourable Hoffmann, thank you so much also for the support of this Vote, and also your plea for the consideration of the south. You have heard that that we are already busy in the Hardap Region and in the //Karas Region, and we you have places like Karasberg, Warmbad. We plead with those who have and who want to support also to contact the Councillors. So we are very much, I agree with you that it is very much important that we look into those who are suffering from hunger and poverty.

Honourable Sioka, Thank you very much for your support although it unleashed screaming. I think it was good that you could support this and also express your thankfulness for the increase of the pension of the grant. When we talk of this grant we only think of those of my age, but we are giving this grant to people who are 16 and above, very young people who are benefitting from this and also the funeral support is given also to them

25 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 33
HON BISHOP KAMEETA

so we treat them completely the same. These young people from 16 they are getting these grants and I have been talking to the families, to the members themselves who are receiving that and they are very much thankful about that.

Honourable Kooper, thank you very much for your support for this Vote. I just want to say that well, we have heard what you are saying that we should buy from the SMEs and so forth, but what we do is we also look at the prices. It will not help, we will help the SMEs through the imperative programme really to assist them so that they become fully-fledged businesses, but when it comes to buying food it does not make really much sense if you buy from the SME which is buying from another shop, then it becomes more expensive and we have to look at our Budget. So I do understand what you want and what you are saying but there are other ways of helping these SMEs and I have mentioned here the imperative programme. I do not know why, I think I left out Honourable Dienda (*Intervention*).

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Honourable Van Den Heever.

HON MINISTER OF POVERTY ERADICATION AND SOCIAL WELFARE: Oh yes, about the shelters? No, okay I go to *Honourable Van Den Heever*. Yes it is very true that the conditions are not very good where our pensioners are receiving, the pay points but it is not all over. There are places where it is very good and where we are very much happy and where the Local Councillors and the Regional Councillors are assisting and making sure that there are shades, toilets and they can sit and wait in shade and so on. But I agree fully that there are also places where we should do more. So your concern is also our concern and we will continue to make sure that the situation improves and that our senior citizens and our young people who are disabled are treated in a dignified

25 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 34**
HON DR ANKAMA

way all over the whole country from the north to the south, from the east to the west. Again thank you very much for your support for Vote 33.

I thank you.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:

Thank you. I put Vote 33. Any objections? Agreed to.

I put Vote 34, “**PUBLIC ENTERPRISES**” any discussions? I recognise Chief, Honourable Doctor Chief Ankama.

HON MEMBER: Doctor Samuel Chief Ankama.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:

Ha? Doctor Samuel Chief Ankama you have the Floor.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE OFFICE OF THE PRIME

MINISTER: I think it is okay I think you will have enough sessions to practise that thank you (*Laughter*). Okay Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, I support the Vote of Public Enterprises. You see one thing I simply stood up to support this because I am happy. I am happy with the way the Minister Comrade Jooste spelled out the reason why we have created the Public Enterprises Ministry. It is created for example to provide public goods of course, yes and public funds to make sure that they look at the generation of the public funds and then things like service delivery and the economic development. You know all this, these are goods and that is why the Public Enterprise was created for, these are in essence the business arms of the Government if you want.

So if these are Government business arms they should make money. They should make money. Meaning when you are given a start-up capital the capital that you are given is for you to generate. Even the Bible says itself, if you are given and you go and bury that (*Intervention*).

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: It will be taken away from you.

HON DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE OFFICE OF THE PRIME MINISTER: It will be taken away from you. So the simple reason why these enterprises generate money, but then you have got a number of those that do not live up to the expectations, and then on page 10 the Minister says corruption in Public Enterprises will be dealt with on suspicion of malpractices if they suspect that there are malpractices in certain enterprises they will feel it because suspicion could be identified in terms of corporate governance failure, they would give you a business plan and then when they go you give them money, they go. They go and embark upon something else other than the business plan they have signed for. How come that some do a proper job, but others time and again, “Oh my business plan, oh you know what, we no longer have money” “bail us out” so this situation of providing a business plan. You get money you are assisted by the parent. You go and change the business plan and you want to come back after you have failed. It is unacceptable, and I think Comrade Jooste you are just going to do that with that thing ha, I believe so.

Then things like flouting, you know policies you flout around the policies, you do not follow the policies (*Intervention*).

HON MEMBER: Flouting?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE OFFICE OF THE PRIME MINISTER: Flouting, flouting, do you understand?

HON MEMBER: Floating?

HON DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE OFFICE OF THE PRIME MINISTER: No. Well, okay it is alright you are right. All what we are saying is that if you do not follow the policies that are spelt out for you to follow you should be fired, finish and “Klaar”, why should you be there when you agreed in your contract, “I am going to follow this I am going to make sure that this enterprise produces” and then you went contrary. If you go contrary? There is no discussion. I hope Comrade Jooste, no discussions, fire. Yes just fire.

If I have a business and you are my manager I give you stock you eat up the stock and you come to ask for more money, to get the money from where? Suck them from my thumb? So I think I would like to applaud the Honourable Minister for spelling out these very important regulations. I hope you will go into these matters of enterprises that are not maybe up to expectations. I support your Vote,

Thank you.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: I recognise Honourable Nauyoma.

HON NAUYOMA: Good, thank you Chairperson of the Whole House Committee. I rise to support this very important Vote, and before I do that

25 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 34**
HON NAUYOMA

I have got two queries to make to the Honourable Minister. Honourable Minister on page 2 of your motivation speech you have highlighted the **debt that the Public Enterprises has** of N\$43,000,000,000 which is 25% of our GDP. I want to find out what plans if there are to really deal with this huge debt that is 25% of our GDP. I hope Honourable Calle Schlettwein is also listening. That is one.

Two, on page 7 on the question of **Board Members**. I also want to find out Honourable Minister on the criteria that will be used on these individuals that are listed. Will there be interviews when this recruitment is done from the database which is transparent?

Another one is on page 8 on **the appointment of Board Members and their performance**. I have a worrying issue that I have with these enterprises, where you have Board Members that are working for Government that are not remunerated from this thing when they are sitting on these Boards. What really informs this decision of not paying public employees not to be paid on most of these enterprises, because I do not see a reason why somebody is coming from his Office, come to sit on these Boards, given some important task to do. The other people that are there are also coming from their Offices maybe in private and non-Governmental organisations and they are being paid for the job. What motivates these individuals really to put effort in the work of the Board of the enterprise if there is nothing really that this person as an individual gets from this exercise?

I think it is about time that you review these kinds of situations, because I see people are not attending. Some people are just not coming to the Board meetings because after that they have nothing to lose they are not getting anything anyway, even if they come as long as they come they do not feel duty bound because there is nothing, because even those left behind are just being paid just as normal as possible. Can you maybe look into that?

I think with those two queries Honourable Minister I support your efforts that you are trying to do, and I hope in the near future not in the distant

25 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 34**
HON SIOKA

future you will be able to resolve this crisis that we have in our public enterprises.

I thank you.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: I recognise Honourable Minister Doreen Sioka.

HON MINISTER OF GENDER EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: I am sorry colleagues I am not disturbing, these are one of my favourite Ministries and they are my stakeholders that is why I am just attending to them.

First of all I am on page 7 on the **Board Members database**. I think my colleagues will remember the special executive how I do trouble there once it comes to Board Members where I need women to be involved, where I see women are lacking and where I see men lacking, I will call on the attention of my colleagues that they should consider women to be on the Board. Really now I do not have a problem because my colleagues have got an ear to listen.

They listen to me and even though I am not there obviously the 50/50 representation in the Board has been seen that is why I am very happy Comrade Minister for considering our call of a database, so that it will give us a light to know how many women are Chairpersons of Boards, how many women are sitting in the Boards, so this is very important. It is an achievement for women as far as I am concerned because women are being advanced. For men my son I think you guys are already there so we want to meet where you are so that we do that. We are not pulling you down but we want to be there. We pull together.

On page 8 yes what I wanted to say **Board Members appointments when it is performance**. I would like to see women performing on those

25 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 34**
HON VENAANI

Boards so that they should not disappoint us especially even Chief Executive Officers we wanted women in those positions and we wanted them to be there and they should perform so that if we leave like some of us if we leave Parliament we are sure that we left a picture there, we left history there so that Namibian women should not be left behind because when we waged the war of liberation women were there so we are not shying away from it.

The other thing which I wanted to conclude with is just to say Namibian women wherever we are, either in private sector, in parastatals we should make sure that we are calling on our women, we are advising our fellow women to come up not to shy away from positions. Let us come up and take over these positions. We are aging some of us and so we want to leave our children. We are not a jealous Government we are a Government with a big ear unlike the previous Government.

I thank you.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: I recognise Honourable Venaani in the absence of Mushelenga not there.

HON VENAANI: Please, please Opposition. It is true that the Government is a SWAPO Led Government there is no quarrel about it, but the biggest problem with the SWAPO led Government is that they are leading the Government into the ground (*Interjections*) and I am going to elucidate how you are leading it in the ground. You are just scratching where it is not itching. Now I am coming to the serious matter.

Honourable Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, Minister I support your Vote. (*Interjection*).

HON MEMBER: She is not Deputy Chairperson.

HON VENAANI: There is no Deputy Chairperson, there is a Chair.

HON MEMBER: Yes Chairperson.

HON VENAANI: She is a Chairperson of the Whole House Committee. She is a Deputy. I am aware that you want to reform the State Owned Enterprises that is a basic raise in the tray why the Ministry was created, to bring back the ethos and values of corporate governance, but the more and more that we talk about corporate governance and its values and its purpose, the more and more that we talk about fiduciary duties of both members everyday this country is inundated with stories about stories of how we are collapsing the corporate governance.

This morning, I was just implying, how I read the paper where we are hearing that a Board is being advised for N\$25,000 per day. N\$25,000 per day there was a story, I do not want to mention people's names. A Board member who is supposed to have a background in auditing and accounting none of them have and they went to outsource that function now this company is milking N\$25,000 per session when this advice is being given. It is in the papers today right or wrong?

Now I am aware first and foremost fundamentally I want to question the two of you Ministers that you have internal reformists or consultants that are advising you internally in the Ministry. Each one of them costing to a tune of N\$2,000,000 more than the President, they earn more than the President. When the whole Ministry was created I thought perhaps it is a route to go to. First and foremost I just want to ask one fundamental question, in your assessment the Minister and your Deputy, are we getting value for money for these consultants that we have put in the Ministry to

25 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 34
HON VENAANI

bring about turnaround strategies at SOEs, because the costs if I look at the cost of N\$2,000,000 per person I know they do not come cheap, N\$2,000,000 per person that is probably the highest salary paid in the country and what I am seeing currently happening with State Owned Enterprises I want you to marry these two, whether we are getting value for money from the consultants that we are having or are the consultants advising us but we are refusing to listen. That is one.

Two, I am aware that the current structure as it is, is that all SOEs resort under the previous Ministries and now you are playing a midwife role and it seems to me that the midwife is either partially consulted or consulted late when matters are taken. How are you taken into confidence in this zoom? Are Ministries consulting you when they are firing and suspending because we are seeing a consistent suspension over suspension of Chief Executive Officers, Chief Operating Officers, Board Members, people are firing one another, and it seems to me that the thing that is achieved and people perhaps could write thesis about it.

One of the things that our boards have achieved in Namibia is to fire each other. They are more in the business of firing one another than rescuing these ailing companies. So I want to know from you Mr Minister whether there is a consistent notification to your Office because, most of the time when you are commenting or your Ministry is commenting and most of the time it is yourself commenting that this suspension I was not consulted, this one I was not consulted, this one I advised them against that. How soon can we marry the Bill that must give you power so that you can be able to have oversight on all these Boards.

The other question that is very important and I want to know from the view of the consultants that I asked perhaps as Appendix 2. I want to add whether and we have been propelling that argument for a long time until it has hit home. The other day the Minister of Safety and Security said the same thing that I have been honing on for a number of years here and that is that we have a culture when we are legislating and perhaps the Attorney General must help us also. Every legislation that we bring to this House comes with a State Owned Enterprises in creation. It seems to me that all the legislations that they are bringing into the House comes with an

institution that needs to be borne out of it.

Now in your view as Minister of Public Enterprises how many Public Enterprises do we want to create in this country, because nearly every Bill, I will not even be surprised if the Marriages Bill comes here with a Board that needs to manage marriages, yes, because everything that we have in this country must be managed by a Board, so that issue comes to mind.

Now in conclusion, two issues very briefly. Where are we standing with Road Construction Company (RCC)? At one go we were told they are going under Judicial Management on the other hand we are told they are looking for a billion dollars to aid 400 and some odd, 420 to be exact 420 something staff members. Where are we standing with the RCC? Is RCC going to be bailed out? Are we putting it under Judicial Management and if RCC was a creation of this House before you put it under Judicial Management at least you need to appraise this House through a Bill because it is a creation by this very same institution but we have not heard the future of RCC. People are calling us asking us they do not know their future because they do not know where this institution is going to.

HON MEMBER: Calling you as what?

HON VENAANI: I am a people's representative. The difference between me and you, you wear a suit, you go to your Office and you go home. Venaani when he goes out of Parliament he is addressing the people (*Interjections*). The man is around with the people.

HON MEMBER: When were you there?

HON VENAANI: I am from, every day I sleep there. How could you ask when last I was there?

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Honourable Venaani?

HON VENAANI: To some of you Katutura is a place that you visit whenever you want to go and buy “Kapana”. (grilled meat) Some of us are Katutura people born and bred there. We are living there so please. But let us come to the important issues. (*Interjections*) (*Laughter*)

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
No please do not respond to informal interventions.

HON VENAANI: The votes of Katutura are changing. If you remember what my vote was and the votes that, and even in Kashete you know that Kashete is now (*Indistinct*) is alive and you are very worried. And he knows that (*Intervention*).

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Honourable Venaani do not respond to informal interventions.

HON VENAANI: Please stop them. Please stop them. I am able and I am capable to retaliate so if they are going like that I will retaliate.

CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: No I am just advising you to follow the procedure please.

HON VENAANI: Yes, yes. Let us come to the, “*Owulimondjila Shiveli*” I am also going to comply” (you are correct my dear) So RCC was the one.

Just in conclusion TransNamib and this is the problem of the SWAPO led Government. At one go, listen very carefully. At one go the Ministry of Finance Head of Treasury says he has gone to China he has not signed any new concession alone, fine, I respect that. On the other go the President announces that he has found money N\$5,600,000,000 to revitalise the rail infrastructure now where are we standing? The status of TransNamib I am aware that over 700 employees at TransNamib do not have job descriptions. We have a new Managing Director. We have a Board of a former colleague of mine, in fact I am very angry with you, Mr Smit is a Board member there, but things do not seem to be moving there what is happening with TransNamib? Are we facing another collapse of TransNamib or where are we standing? So colleagues we support your Vote we want the Ministry to be empowered.

The problems of State Owned Enterprises are not SWAPO problems unfortunately, they are not a Government problem they have become a societal problem. If we do not resolve them coupled with corruption that is engineered through their existence, if we do not resolve the corporate collapse of this country we would have many problems for years to come and that is why we support you, (*Interjection*) no PDM we are not stealing money. This guy is destructing me. (*Intervention*)

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Can you leave him?

25 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 34
HON DR MUSHELENGA

HON VENAANI: So this problem of State Owned Enterprises has become a national problem, and we must find solutions and we have to meet the Committee of Economics and Public Administration, where is the Chairperson? The Committee of Economics should also start engaging this sector so that we also come up with a holistic approach as Parliament how we are going to resolve the collapse of State Owned Enterprises in our country, I think it is one of the most contemporary issues that is facing our country at this point in time.

I support your Vote my brother.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Honourable Minister Mushelenga, Doctor Mushelenga.

HON MINISTER OF URBAN AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT:
Thank you very much Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee.

I also rise to support the allocation for the Ministry of Public Enterprises. I would want to start with the issue of stability in management of public enterprises. When you have **Acting CEOs** that is when you do not have stability in governance of the companies, because the Acting CEO either because he/she wants to be confirmed instead of taking decisions decisively, will just be dancing to the tunes of the Chairperson of the Board. That is very dangerous.

Secondly, the **managers under this CEO** do not feel his authorities as such because they know that this fellow is here temporarily, is not effectively my boss so I can decided to follow or not to follow. It is that important to ensure that we really try to effect the appointment of substantive CEOs of Public Enterprises in order to provide stability to these companies.

25 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 34**
HON DR MUSHELENGA

Then we come to the second layers of **strategic executives**. I have noted that some of the Public Enterprises have started with this second layer of management the General managers or strategic executive whatever you call them appointing them on contract basis which is very important because they will be forced to live up to their performance agreements. Previously these were permanent appointees and before you know it there will be complacency. So I suggest that this be spread across the board with all Public Enterprises to have contract appointments for the Senior Management.

Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, now doing business coming to our **National Airline**. It is known that some of the routes here are known as cash cows, but when you look at the prices of the tickets for these cash cows there is no consideration that that there is where this Airline makes its profits. It is quite exorbitantly high.

Two, there are no **strategies** for example where you have activities going on in a particular Region. For argument sake if you take a period of the Trade Fair of Ongwediva that is the time that you cannot find a flight on that Air Namibia aircraft that leaves from Eros to Ondangwa. I would have expected that either for that particular time they would increase the frequency of flights or they use a larger aircraft, if it means people to live from Windhoek International Airport. It is just one thing that I think our airline needs to consider.

We also need to minimise these **squabbles in public enterprises** between the Board and among management divisions among the Board and so forth, by the way these Board Members are purportedly appointed on merit because I know some companies where people had to apply to be Board members after advertisements. The problem comes in those statutory enterprises whereby provision is made in the Act that there should be some representatives from some institutions. Whom to me the experience that I have seen is that they are not necessarily subjected to say the minimum qualifications. An institution can just appoint a person they think can represent them, but whether these people understand their fiduciary responsibility as Board Members is another question.

25 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 34**
HON MUTORWA

Fiduciary responsibility means you owe your legal and ethical responsibility in trust to the shareholders. Now because these Board Members receive their retainer fee and sitting fee from the Public Enterprises they actually think they are recruited by the management of these enterprises and at times fail to represent the interests of the shareholders and rather represent the interests of the management of the company.

So perhaps we need to have a standard training. We can approach our institutions of Higher Learning say Namibia University of Science and Technology (NUST) for example, they have a business school to have a standard tailor made course for the Board Members instead of wasting more money sending our people outside for Management Development Programmes to other institutions outside the country. To have one tailor made for our Public Enterprises where all our Directors should go through. I know sometimes it is difficult to convince everyone to go through this. But it is absolutely necessary if we want delivery of service from our enterprises.

With these few words I support the allocation to thee Vote.

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:
Thank you. Honourable Minister Mutorwa.

HON MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT: Thank you Comrade Deputy Speaker and Chairperson of the Whole House Committee for giving me the opportunity just to contribute in a small way to this very important Vote of my colleague the Honourable Leon Jooste.

I would like to start off by saying that I am taking this floor as a maybe not so new, but still newly appointed somebody in the Ministry of Works and Transport. Where at least there are seven or eight State Owned

25 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 34**
HON MUTORWA

Enterprises whose legislation are administered through that particular line Ministry and line Minister just to support my colleague.

First Honourable Jooste I fully and I think that is also the position of all of us on this and that side of the House maybe here also. I support your statement on **page 4 of your motivation speech**. I categorically support, the Ministry supports, when you stated that this new model of the hybrid governance model is now being transformed into a legal framework, and once Parliament approves the Amendment all Commercial Public Enterprises will be transferred to the Ministry of Public Enterprises, and non-Commercial Public Enterprises will remain with their line Ministries. This governance model supported by the improved legislative environment will enable us to pursue a well-crafted process to transform our public enterprises. I fully support that statement and you know also in our bilateral discussions I have expressed this particular position. It will solve many unnecessary misunderstandings at times.

Secondly also on the **last page of your motivation statement**. I also support fully, rather the Ministry of Works and Transport fully supports that statement when you say “WE” at the Ministry of Public Enterprises are ready and excited about the year ahead, where we truly activate our mandate, transform our Public Enterprises into model enterprises that each and every one of our 2,400,000 are proud of. Count me in, in supporting you to achieve that very noble objective.

Then another contribution that I would like to make is based on **Article 40(a) of the Namibian Constitution** and I am making this statement because of sometimes uninvited and unnecessary misunderstandings that sometimes occur between the political leaderships of specific Ministries and specific State Owned Enterprises whose legislation are administered by a specific Ministry or Minister. Now Article 40(a) is very clear, to take out any confusion or any misunderstanding, because it deals with the duties and functions of Cabinet Ministers and just that Article 40(a) reads as follows: “*The Members of the Cabinet shall have the following functions and listen very carefully to the verbs that are used here.*”

(a) To Direct.

25 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 34
HON MUTORWA

(b) To coordinate, and

(c) Supervise the activities of Ministries and Government Departments including Parastatal Enterprises.

It continues but the emphasis is on Parastatal Enterprises. It means therefore that if Parliament passes a law that regulates the operations let us say of Roads Contractor Company or the Namibia Airports Company or Roads Authority or the Motor Vehicle Accident Fund, and when you read that law it is clear that the definition of the Minister is the Minister responsible for example Transport. Then it means the Minister of Works and Transport, and that Minister in terms of this constitutional provisions which is also further elaborated upon by the specific law governing the operations of that particular State Owned Enterprise, is empowered to direct, to supervise and to coordinate but within of course the framework of the provisions of the law. So we should not have any misunderstanding as far as that is concerned.

Then lastly, I know that my colleague to whom the specific questions were directed particularly with regards to RCC, is competent enough to answer those questions. I just want from my perspective as the line Minister of the State Owned Enterprises called the Namibia Roads Contractors Company to say the following and very briefly. Maybe it may help also in answering the question the very important question of the Honourable Venaani.

In November of 2017 the issue of the Roads Contractor Company (RCC) under my able leadership of my predecessor here served before Cabinet. First it was at the Cabinet Committee on Overall Policy, and then it came in front of Cabinet in November. Now at that particular Cabinet meeting there were two issues in that submission that Cabinet was requested upon to reflect, to Debate and then give or take a decision. It was the issue of the *Judicial Management Bill* to place RCC under Judicial Management and the finalisation of that Bill.

25 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 34**
HON MUTORWA

Then 2. There was the issue of exploring the possibility of finding a credible self-sustaining financing model which if found to be credible that will then be adopted by the Cabinet to save RCC from Judicial Administration. Now when I arrived here at the Ministry I looked at these two decisions Judicial Management and self-sustaining financing model. Now from a layman's person I was asking myself, are these two mutually exclusive? Can one exist without the other, or they are to be implemented together? Of course I could not answer that question and I approached my learned colleague the Attorney General to help me.

The former Attorney General has already given an opinion on that, but this one also went into and he gave us a lengthy legal advice, and that legal advice to sum it up and he will correct me if I am stating incorrect facts here, is to say that if that process of engaging in developing a self-sustaining financing model is finalised and it is discussed and it is eventually approved by Cabinet to be the way to go then necessarily there will be no need for the placing in the judicial management and therefore where are we now? We have now and I called in the leadership of RCC, both the Board and the management and the management of the Ministry, and I conveyed this with the instruction that for now and the Judicial Management is not off the ground, no it is there but for now go now and work it out.

Give us a credible business plan that will answer whether this is a credible, viable, sustainable, self-sustaining financing model, and I must report to the Namibian nation through this Parliament that only yesterday did I receive, they first sent something and then when I consulted with colleagues it was found that no this is not enough and I went back to them and said go and develop this thing. Yesterday evening I received it. I received that.

Now we are at a stage where that particular thing has to be subjected, the model, the draft has still to be subjected to, because Cabinet has put up a Technical Committee of Senior Civil Servants chaired by the Permanent Secretary of Works and Transport with members such as Permanent Secretary of Finance, Permanent Secretary of Public Enterprises and then legal person from the Attorney General.

25 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 34**
HON SHANGHALA

They now also have to look into this submitted document and then when that process is finished, we will have both the business plan from RCC and the critical evaluation by the Technical Committee and it is only with that that we will now reach a stage of considering taking this matter to the Cabinet. Of course the deadline because this is a crucial matter the more we delay more other complications can come in.

My own as the line Minister's wish is that during the very first or second week of May, we would be able then after all the necessary consultations that were done to go back to the Cabinet and say that this is where we are and then thereafter Cabinet will then take a final decision whether Judicial Management or self-sustaining.

So that is what I thought the line Minister who is tasked to administer the law currently of the Road Contractor Company that I am able to Report to this Parliament as per Article 41 of the Namibian Constitution and through this Parliament with the Namibian nation but I know that my colleague will probably elaborate more on this.

Thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you. Honourable Sacky Shanghala.

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Very shortly I would like to lend my support to this Vote and the job that the Ministry has. Quite necessary, quite needed and quite timely. Just to emphasise on two issues.

Parastatal Enterprises are as much as part of Government as a Government Ministry is Government. What happens is that these quangos are either put out there so that they can specialise in and perform a certain function? Regrettably what has happened in the recent times is that some of these

25 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 34
HON SHANGHALA

Public Enterprises become the turf for personal fights and vendettas. Board Members sometimes arrive and the first thing they do is to get rid of the CEO. We all remember what happened to the then CEO of TransNamib and everybody comes with an agenda. Apart from serving the public which is the main function people come and utilise this as a very good reflection on one's CV, profiling around but they forget that as Directors you have a fiduciary duty, things go wrong you can be held accountable and I think maybe Government must start holding people accountable.

Secondly and shortly because I do not want to make a long intervention. That fiduciary responsibility notwithstanding is something used as a shield by a Director not wanting to take instructions from Government? Now the Article that was read into our record here by Honourable Mutorwa Article 40(a), makes it pretty clear that the Minister shall coordinate and supervise the activities of the Ministry, Government Departments including Parastatals. Then a Parastatal Chairperson decides to be a person of their own you see because I know the Prime Minister, Sacky is just a Minister I do not need to listen to Sacky anymore, this is the problem.

They will waive the fiduciary duty above the accountability, and I want to request all of you who are either serving as Parastatal Board Members who have the inclination one day of serving as Parastatal Board Members, please if you do not want to come and take instructions from Government Ministers stay away. Stay away, it is simple. They come and they tell you, "Me I am a professional, I am so and so", nobody is questioning your professionalism, but the Constitution is very clear. Members of Cabinet who are Ministers shall have the following functions, to direct, coordinate and supervise, nothing could be clearer. You could not even speak Gaelic and not understand this, to direct, coordinate and supervise.

Then you come because you think you are so and so, we do not want to listen. It is a problem we are having. People are using Boards to grant, *(Interjection)* I am telling you the experience that I have had and the shoe-fit you must wear it but if it does not fit do not wear it, it is not yours. Why do you want to wear other people's shoes? *(Intervention)*

25 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 34
HON JOOSTE

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Are you done?

HON MINISTER OF JUSTICE: Please it is the service of the public, do not make the work of the Ministry any more difficult.

Thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Very good, now I shall give the Floor to the Minister for reply.

HON MINISTER OF PUBLIC ENTERPRISES: Thank you Honourable Chairperson. The first question was from Honourable Ankama. Just a comment where there are a number of these questions which I will try to group that I do not repeat the same thing over and over again.

Honourable Ankama, said Public Enterprises should be making money. Of course they should be making money so we have spoken about that frequently and that is obviously one of our aims.

He spoke about corruption in Public Enterprises and the way that or the perception that Public Enterprises deviate from business plans. Now I want to explain to the House, to use this opportunity that the legislation in fact prohibits that. According to the *Public Enterprises Governance Act* that all Public Enterprises must submit business plans to the Portfolio Ministers that is then forwarded to the Minister of Public Enterprises to make comments and it says under Section 19(5) and I quote, “*The Public Enterprises must act*”, not may, “*must act only in accordance with its business plan unless it has first obtained the written approval of the*

25 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 34
HON JOOSTE

Portfolio Minister to do otherwise". So where Public Enterprises do that it is deemed to be illegal.

Then we had a question of the amount of debt of Public Enterprises for the level of debt and what plans. I do not know, obviously us addressing the inefficiencies and poor performance through our soon to be tabled Public Enterprises Transformation Project or Strategy, will address the issue of debt at the same time. But the levels of debt is a concern, so it is something that we are highlighting more than in the past and that it does need particular attention.

Then a comment/thread one of them and that is a recurring one as well year on year, on the platform of Boards and the quality of Board Members. The question is, what criteria is used or will be used to our database and on the appointment of new Boards, and if interviews will be conducted. The short answer is that we have finalised a new Board recruitment and appointment guideline which is in fact on the way to Cabinet as I speak. This is a comprehensive guideline spelling out a very comprehensive thorough process. The process of replacing Boards will start six months in advance before the end of a term of a Board and it will follow various stages, and will be a very transparent process. Where we are not convinced that we have the level of skills from within our database there will be advertisements and applications will be sought and they will be targeted probably to specifically target those fields that we require and which may not be available from our database.

On the question that was asked on the payment of Public Servants on boards that is a policy decision once again part of our guidelines that is going to Cabinet will capture that evidence as well. The Office of the Attorney General under the former Attorney General, had provided us with a legal opinion on the matter. So we would like to encourage or not would like to, we will encourage a policy decision on that, and that will spell out the way forward, but I very much understand and support the motivation and the argument you put forward as you asked the question. So that will be resolved.

Honourable Sioka, yes my dear always in Cabinet the fighter for gender representation on Boards, we are doing much better. Same thing once again, our new guidelines will make provision for gender balance on Boards as well. Equally we have prepared a CEO recruitment guideline the same thing there so we are concerned. By the way the gender balance at Board level is not that bad. It is in fact not far from being 50/50 over all looking at all the entire portfolio of Public Enterprises, but at Executive level it is a very difficult story and needs to be addressed.

Then my brother, *Honourable Venaani*, again you spoke about the quality of Boards I think as I said earlier we are very aware that we need to address that and we are addressing that. The composition of the Board is critical. The composition of the Board for each Public Enterprise will have subtle differences and they will even be different from according to the particular status of a Public Enterprise and where they find themselves. That has been a very highly distressful measure of Public Enterprise that would need a very different Board from that required by the same Public Enterprise which is not under any sort of financial operation or difficulty.

Then you asked a question which we have also heard several times, which I want to answer very clearly. One of the first things we did when the Ministry was established was to figure out what the root causes of the failure of Public Enterprise, in saying that not all of them have failed that we must also have knowledge. Some of the Public Enterprises have performed exceptionally well and they still are, but where there have been failures what have been the root causes of those failures? The outcome of that is very interesting.

I am not going to explain all of that but I am going to explain the one part, which is the question you asked on the experts that have been appointed in the Ministry. That was to address in my opinion probably one of the most fundamental root causes, and you will see in my statement I think the last paragraph I said that 2018 will be the year where we will see the transformation of the State into a professional shareholder. We are sitting on a portfolio to the value of around N\$91,000,000,000 to be the

shareholder and to perform the shareholder functions of that portfolio of multiple entities, we will for sure fail if we do not equip ourselves with professional skills to be a professional shareholder. If we fail to do that the question, and I am not asking you questions I am just putting that to the House, how would we as a shareholder as we are doing now, be in a position to evaluate the business plans that are submitted to us for approval by Public Enterprises? Those are and coming to a later question, an example a company like TransNamib are highly complex commercial entity, crucial to the development of our economy.

If the shareholder would not have those professional skills to analyse a business plan like that, the financial statements not just read them and I know many of us in this House can read financial statement. but how many of us can really analyse financial statements to know what questions to ask and to be able to dig deeper to once again identify what are the causes of financial failures? So it is for that reason that we will not be able to perform the duty of a professional shareholder if we do not equip ourselves to be a professional shareholder. And we have done multiple bench marks with other countries, and this is one of the first things when they make recommendations to us have been to equip yourself to be a professional shareholder, otherwise you shall be failing so it is incredibly important.

You then supported and asked about the legislative environment. Coming back to the previous question which I started answering the same reason why I sadly even as the political leader of that Ministry, to acknowledge that we have not been able to implement transformation and reforms at the pace that we would have wanted to the entire Ministry. So in our case one cannot blame a certain Department or group within the Ministry, rather blame the Ministry and I would welcome to take that blame has been the lack of that legislative environment for us to be able to implement that.

I have said in my statement we are very close to concluding that. It is currently with the Ministry of Justice, the legal drafters and we expect a final draft very soon. Our target is by the 5th of June when Parliament resumes we will be able to Table the legislation and we look forward to your support.

You spoke about and *Honourable Mutorwa*, the same thing about the governance model, the problems it is causing, and the lack of consistency due to that governance model. You referred to Articles in the Media during a certain position from one Ministry versus from another Ministry etcetera, and that is exactly exposing the failure of the dual governance model which we have been under for a considerable time. It is a model that has not worked anyway. The few countries that still have the model are equally evolving away from that model into a centralised governance model.

The question of consistence is one of the fundamental motivations why one would want to have a more centralised model. That is how you would ensure that you are on exactly the same level of governance in all of these entities. For interest sake, we even just learnt the end of last week our big neighbour down South, are now finally heading exactly the same direction as we are. So giving some sort of confirmation that what we are doing is relevant to our regional economic dynamics as well.

You asked a question about new Public Enterprises. I am happy to tell Parliament that Cabinet resolved last year that no new Public Enterprises may be created (*Applause*). Unless, no I am not finished, unless we follow the due diligence. The Ministry has been consulted, we have a Cabinet Committee on Public Enterprises so in each case we will have to evaluate where the function that a particular Ministry wants to have a new section outsourced which is not accurate always, to a separate entity is really required.

So we asked all of the questions you would. Is it a function that, why can it not be performed by a Directorate within a Ministry. Is there an existing other Public Enterprise where we could enlarge the scope to perform an additional function to incorporate the new function. Having said that we must be careful we are still a developing economy so there may still be instances where a very particular need is identified which is not currently created for so do not think we should be too blunt and simply refuse to create any more of these entities.

25 April 2018 COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 34
HON JOOSTE

Personally you would not be surprised to hear that I would be very happy not to see any more of them being created but we need to be practical.

You asked on the Road Construction Company (RCC). I am so happy thank you Honourable Mutorwa, you have done me a great favour he has answered exactly what I would have told you. So if you are happy with that response I would say I have no further comments on the matter. So having said that I can assure you it will be resolved very soon, and it has to be. We are currently subsidising the salaries in the entity so it is incredibly important that the process is resumed. It is at a very advanced stage so I think once again during this recess period as Honourable Mutorwa has said, I think Parliament would be able to hear the outcome of that.

TransNamib, you asked the status of TransNamib and the new CEO was appointed. There was a draft business plan and new business plan already in place when the CEO was appointed. The CEO's employment contract in fact captured the importance of the business plan and gave the new CEO a four month period from his appointment to conclude the new business plan. The reason for that is we need for the new CEO to take ownership of the document, and that period the four month period expires the end of May. So by or before the end of May we will have a new business plan for TransNamib. Your questions remain relevant. The funding for the business plan for the infrastructure is something we will address according to the outcome of the business plan, but I can assure you we will need to be creative. It is a very expensive sector and it is a critical one and so it needs to be addressed.

Then *Dr Mushelenga*, you spoke about the stability in Public Enterprises. This issue of Acting CEOs and MDs etcetera, which we all find and I can assure you, me, more than anybody else very annoying. We issued a directive. A directive the year before last year, in fact where we have not stopped the suspensions but we have agreed on a specific process before we agree to any suspension. So in short what we, unless if we are convinced that whatever needs, concerning the investigation or forensic audit of sort cannot be done with a particular person in office, we have

rejected applications for suspensions. But in cases where we are convinced that not allowing a suspension may interfere with an investigation which might have an element of corruption we have been inclined to allow that, and I am hoping to see the end of that very soon.

The issue of Honourable Peya, thank you, the contracts, and appointments absolutely. So that is one thing that is part of the whole shift towards the performance culture in our Public Enterprises which is non-existent in most of them, so that is only one part of a whole number of issues that work together performance contract, performance evaluation and then incentivised remuneration, so exactly what we are doing.

In Namibia, you spoke about the issue of flight frequencies etcetera. It is not that easy you know it sounds like simple operational issues that can be solved very quickly, and I can assure you from an Airline perspective it is rocket science, it is not that straight forward, but point taken. So Air Namibia equally working on a new business plan at the moment very important, new business plan and we are hoping to see that concluded soon as well. Currently the constraints with the current Air Namibia fleet is mostly part of the or not mostly part, it is the reason for the inadequate frequencies on some routes from time to time.

You mentioned the issue of Board Members we spoke about that.

Fiduciary responsibilities, one thing we started all new Boards that are appointed go through an induction course, it is being offered by NIPAM so all Boards are being trained on basic fiduciary duties so there is no excuse for them not to be aware of those. The flaw we have in Namibia is we do not have an Institute of Directors. Most countries have got Institute of Directors where Board Members, professional Board Members belong to and need certain minimum requirements. There is a new organisation in Namibia which is about hopefully if they get up and running, to address this called the Namibian Institute of Corporate Governance, which will play that role.

We are looking at ways how that would receive some form of endorsement from Government etcetera, that would allow us then to have that sort of grading system for Board Members.

Honourable Mutorwa, you spoke about the legal framework. Thank you for your support for the hybrid governance model Article 40(a) of our Constitution which I equally share and support obviously by oath as we all do and then you helped me with the RCC. Thank you John.

Minister of Justice, Honourable Shanghala, you spoke about the question of fights in Public Enterprises instead of serving the public. Yes quality of Board Members. So if we appoint with all due respect to any existing Board Members. If we appointed, Board Members based on merit with integrity we should not have discussions of this kind any more. I agree with you they must be held accountable and I am looking forward to seeing that very soon. We have very good provisions under the *Companies Act* which we will be utilising for that purpose very shortly.

Then you spoke about the fiduciary duties and our Board Members. Sometimes when it suits them choose to hide behind those same fiduciary duties, and where they refuse to submit to shareholder instructions. Once again a Board Member when there is an instruction from the shareholder, the stake of the shareholder that Board Member, well the entire board and board member individually have only three choices. Either to agree to that instruction and to perform that. They may try to convince the shareholder that that instruction is not in the best interests of the entity and then of course have the instructions turned around, or if they do not like that an honourable Board Member would then resign from that position, but a Board Member cannot refuse of a Public Enterprise in particular, cannot refuse an instruction from the stated shareholder.

Those were the last questions. I thank all the Members for supporting as all of you did and I hope I have answered your questions and queries.
(Applause)

Thank you.

25 April 2018 **COMMITTEE STAGE – DISCUSSIONS – VOTE - 35**
HON DR KAWANA

ON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:

Thank you. I put Vote 34. Any objection? Agreed to.

I put Vote 35, - “**ATTORNEY GENERAL**”. Any discussions? Any objections? Agreed to.

I put Clause, are you coming because we are about? Wait, can it wait? Oh (*Interjection*). No please, sorry do you want to say something, pardon me.

HON ATTORNEY GENERAL: Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee. As I said in my statement this is your Office. This is the Office of the Namibian nation. Whatever happened (*Intervention*).

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Sorry, all those Members you must ensure just one minute you must come back please.

HON ATTORNEY GENERAL: Whatever happens in that Office which is wrong it will affect the Namibian nation, the stability of our nation because the functions of that Office are very heavy. To advise from the President, the Head of State, the Government and the Government it means now Central Government, Offices, Ministries and Agencies including Regional Councils, including Local Councils so it is a heavy responsibility. In fact to some extent even some Parastatals so which means now my Office is very open. If we do something which you feel is not correct, is not right please engage us but we will also be engaging you.

Amen (*Laughter*).

25 April 2018

**APPROPRIATION BILL
HON SCHLETTWEIN**

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:

Thank you. We have already agreed upon the Vote.

Now I put Clause 01 in the Bill. I put Clause 01. Any discussions? Any objection? Agreed to.

I put Clause 02. Any discussions? Any objection? Agreed to.

I put the Schedule. Any discussions? Any objection? Agreed to.

I put the Title. Any discussions? Any objection? Agreed to.

I shall Report the Bill without Amendments

ASSEMBLY RESUMES

HON CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE:

Honourable Speaker, the Committee has gone through *Appropriation Bill*, [B. 2 – 2018] as set forth in the accompanying copies, and agreed to it without Amendments.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Any further discussions? Does the Honourable Minister of Finance wish to reply?

HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Honourable Speaker, Honourable Deputy Speaker, Honourable Members of the National Assembly, first of all I want to express my gratitude to Honourable Members who have actively participated in

25 April 2018

**APPROPRIATION BILL
HON SCHLETTWEIN**

the discussion of the 2018/2019 Budget. The Debate and the questions raised during the discussions were very valuable and enlightening of the budgeting and implementation process as we go forward.

During the last seven weeks of deliberations, Honourable Members have had the opportunity to interrogate the Budget and they did this with vigour. I am therefore grateful to all Members for their support and their guidance.

Significant emphasis was placed on the need for effective implementation of the Budget, policy reforms, to amplify the impact of the Budget on development outcomes and innovative reforms to improve internal efficiencies. This cannot be over-emphasised indeed.

In this fiscal consolidation framework we are called upon to work collaboratively for sustainable development results and to do more with less.

Honourable Speaker, allow me to reflect briefly on the core principles underpinning the 2018/2019 Budget. This Budget underscores Government's commitment to uphold the principles of macroeconomic stability and fiscal sustainability, while at the same time addressing socio economic challenges facing our country in the short term, medium term and for the long haul.

In the short term the fiscal policy is aligned to other macroeconomic policies, namely monetary policies, the creating enabling environment for a stable growth, inflation and health balance of payments. It is for this reason that the Budget commitment is made to boost production and investment in growth enhancing infrastructure. Our focus is to support growth on priority sectors of the economy in which growth and job creation potential is the greatest. At the same time, Government forges ahead with commitment to implement fiscal and real sector reforms aimed at improving State revenue, skills development and overall investment climate.

25 April 2018

**APPROPRIATION BILL
HON SCHLETTWEIN**

Honourable Speaker, fiscal policy has increasingly become critically a tool to address domestic socio economic and developmental challenges and competitiveness. Government therefore remains committed to confront challenges of poverty, inequality, unemployment, economic growth and infrastructure deficits among others, now and in the future. Consistent with this notion the 2018/2019 Budget is a demonstration of our consistent policy commitment towards investment and human capital development and provisions of health and other social services.

Over the long term, our investment and reform agenda will pay dividends. As the economy currently assumes a positive growth trajectory, we have to rein in the expenditure in order to introduce the fiscal space again, in favour of long term sustainable and fiscal outcomes.

I should emphasise yet again that during the current Medium Term Expenditure Framework (MTEF), fiscal prudence remains a principle policy objective of Government. We will remain firm on course to align expenditure and to the levels of revenue and economic growth in order to be sustainable.

Honourable Speaker, many Members raised issues of and bemoaned too low levels of funding, and I do understand that our consolidation efforts indeed prevails in an alignment of expenditure through revenue which in the difficult times that we face translates into a reduction of expenditure.

Honourable Speaker, we have looked into a balance that balance is out, what one could call adequate funding, which means according to the dictionary a satisfactory level of funding in quantity and quality. On the one side that is therefore adequacy, on the other side it is affordability, and affordability is prescribed as having the meaning of being reasonably priced.

Now in these economic times of ours, we have to look whether the Budget that we are proposing is in fact reasonably priced. Is it affordable? Can our economy afford what we have proposed tot the House and to the citizens, and indeed we believe that with the reduced expenditure

25 April 2018

**APPROPRIATION BILL
HON SCHLETTWEIN**

envelope, with reducing deficits we do move into affordable ranges. We do not deteriorate we balance. So the affordability question has been answered in our opinion positively.

Adequacy whether we are reasonably satisfying the needs of the funding levels required it is probably a little bit more difficult to answer, and we need to also think if we talk about adequacy of funding, is the return on that investment, it is the output, the outcome of that funding adequate, and I think we say that we can do better with the less funding that we have, and I really want to commend the Right Honourable Prime Minister who has been very supportive of the 'do more with less'.

I was very impressed with the answer of the Honourable Minister of Youth Honourable Uutoni yesterday, who has indicated the great difficulties that he has to bring adequate services to the youth and I was supported by Honourable Nujoma again. He indicated strongly that we can do more with less and indeed we should do more with less.

Other Members did the same but still in my observation on the discussion of the Budget we were preoccupied with inputs. We were preoccupied with saying we have too little funds to do this, we have too little funds to do that and we did not engage in an equally deep level in efficiency gains and what we can do better with what we have. In the reforms and State Owned Enterprise sector is one indication that Government is ceased with that difficult question. I think we are in a better situation than we were last year around, but we are not yet out of the sticky patch so let us do more with less and get out quicker..

The last part and comments maybe is the question whether our youth have a prosperous future. I cannot answer that in full, but what I can do, say if we run this economy into a situation where it becomes unsustainable and where we would at the end of the day default we would have lost our fiscal sovereignty and in that case we would have left the youth with a much bleaker future than if we pull through with what we are suggesting to the House, and that it is to tighten the belt temporarily, recover, gain fiscal space, gain sustainability and prepare the economic climate for the

25 April 2018

**APPROPRIATION BILL
HON SCHLETTWEIN**

youth to prosper in instead of lapping it for shortfall gains default. It is not that we do not have the youth and in fact all our future in mind and at heart. All of us want to prosper and all of us must work together to achieve just that and build a better Namibia for tomorrow.

Honourable Speaker, there is one aspect that I want to just explain and that is the technicality and I think it was in the statement that was erroneously made, and that is that the Ministry of Finance allocated more funds to it while other Ministries were cut. Let me explain it and then you can follow it in the book. The Operational non-interest allocation for the Ministry of Finance that is the total Budget that we spent was for the year 2017/2018 N\$4,298,000,000.

This year in the book you will read a figure of N\$9,828,000,000, but that figure includes the interest payments that we have to pay to service our total Government debt. That total interest or debt servicing cost is what the *State Finance Act* calls a deemed expenditure and that is why it is appropriated for. It is a figure of N\$4,782,000,000, now if you subtract the cost of borrowing from the N\$9,800,000,000 the Ministry is finance expenditure is N\$4,450,000,000 so it is a reduction of almost N\$2,000,000,000. I just wanted to explain that to dispel this erroneous statement that we have serviced ourselves better than other Ministries. In fact we have reduced our Operational Expenditure in tune with what we have done with everyone else.

So with those few observations I thank you very much for your support and I hope to be with you in a year's time with better news. (*Applause*)

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Thank you very much for taking care of that issue that created a bit of confusion, duly noted.

I now put the question that the Bill be now read a Third Time. Any objection? Agreed to. The Secretary will read the Bill a Third Time.

25 April 2018

**ADJOURNMENT
HON PROF KATJAVIVI**

APPROPRIATION BILL [B. 2 – 2018]

SECRETARY: *Appropriation Bill [. 2 -2018] (Applause)*

HON SPEAKER: This brings us almost neatly to our time. We will continue tomorrow. We will deal with some of the outstanding items that we have then perhaps not all of them but at least many of them.

HON DEPUTY SPEAKER: Question time tomorrow I should think.

HON SPEAKER: Question time, you are reminding us, yes. So the House stands adjourned until tomorrow the usual time 14:30.

HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 18:00 UNTIL 2018.04.26 AT 14:30
