NATIONAL ASSEMBLY ASSEMBLY CHAMBERS WINDHOEK 18 OCTOBER 2016

The Assembly met pursuant to the adjournment.

HON SPEAKER: took the Chair and read Prayers and the Affirmation.

**HON SPEAKER**: Honourable Members, any Petitions? Reports of Standing or Select Committees? Other Reports and Papers? Notice of Questions? Honourable !Auxab.

### NOTICE OF QUESTIONS

### **QUESTION 96:**

**HON !AUXAB**: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. Honourable Speaker, I hereby give Notice that on 27<sup>th</sup> of October 2016 I shall ask the Minister of Mines and Energy Honourable Obed Kandjoze the following questions:

Any adequate access to electricity especially in rural areas is a challenge of extending affordable energy services to under serve population and the need for self sufficiency and energy independence of our country Namibia, can the Honourable Minister share with the public and the Members of this august House how the renewable energy policy currently address the climate resilient enable to secure energy access even in non stationary natural environment.

Can the Honourable Minister explain to the House the following scenarios, expressions and different possible paths Namibia can take with varying levels of installed capacity of renewable energies for wind, solar scenario with kudu, a fore hydro scenario without kudu, a 70% renewable energy in 2030 scenario.

### NOTICE OF QUESTIONS HON VAN DEN HEEVER

Honourable Speaker, on the same day I shall ask the Minister of Agriculture, Water and Forestry Honourable John Mutorwa the following questions:

The Government of Namibia targets green schemes to free the nation from poverty, hunger and unemployment and from other social economic problems and challenges will the Honourable Minister share with this august House how far your call to Agri positive a (indistinct) the instance development of green schemes targeting Katima Mulilo, Lizelo and zone green scheme projects.

Can the Honourable Minister appraise this august House about the targeted 27,000 hectares in Vision 2030 to be put under irrigation has been made so far and how the private entities and the Government have embraced the moment task to mobilise the required investment.

Can the Honourable Minister tell the House with the initiative taken by the Government and the private entities on the 27,000 hectares how many direct employments haves been created if any?

I so Move, Honourable Speaker.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you. The Honourable Jennifer Van Den Heever.

### **QUESTION 97:**

**HON VAN DEN HEEVER**: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. Honourable Speaker, I hereby give notice that on Thursday the 27<sup>th</sup> of October I shall ask the Minister of Environment and Tourism the following:

### NOTICE OF QUESTIONS HON VAN DEN HEEVER

I refer to my question to your Ministry on the 6<sup>th</sup> of October 2016 and your subsequent response thereto. In that response you indicated that my question was misdirected and should have been directed to the Ministry of Mines and Energy instead. Despite this claim that the question was misdirected I have in my possession a Clearance Certificate issued by the Ministry of Environment and Tourism to the Chief Operations Officer of the Namibian Marine Phosphate. The letter is dated 5 September 2016.

It is thus surprising that the Minister claimed that my question was misdirected and perhaps this was just a diversion tactic. Moreover, in this letter it is stated that this Clearance Letter does not in any way hold the Ministry of Environment and Tourism accountable for misleading information nor any adverse effects that may arise from this project accountable for misleading information, no any adverse effects that may arise from this activity. Instead full accountability rests with Namibia Marine Phosphate and their consultancy.

My question is, is it prudent to issue Clearing Certificate without first properly ascertaining the environmental impacts of phosphate mining if proper environmental impact assessment have been completed, can those now be shared with this august House, how can the Ministry of Environment and Tourism as the chief custodian of the Namibian environment shift the responsibility of protecting the Namibian environment to a private company that is profit driven and whose primary priority is not environmental conservation? I thank you.

**HON MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM**: You forgot a quorum issue.

**HON VAN DEN HEEVER**: The proof is there.

3

### NOTICE OF QUESTIONS HON SMIT

HON	MINISTER	OF	<b>ENVIRONMENT</b>	AND	TOURISM:	The
quorur	n is (interventi	ion).				

HON SPEAKER: We will soon find out. Honourable Nico Smit.

**HON DIENDA**: The proof is there, misdirected answers.

### **QUESTION NO. 98:**

**HON SMIT**: Honourable Speaker, I give Notice that on Thursday the 27<sup>th</sup> of October 2016 I shall ask the Minister of Higher Education, Training and Innovation Honourable Idah Kandjii-Murangi the following – and I hope she will be here (laughter).

In September 2015 the Namibia National Students Organisation NANSO called on Government to address excessively high rental fees faced by Tertiary Education Students studying in Windhoek. According to a media report at that time the NANSO leadership called on Government to build a student village to provide students from outside Windhoek with affordable accommodation in the capital city and they gave Government a deadline of the 2016/2017 Financial Year for such a complex to be budgeted for and built. Very recently NANSO has reiterated its threats and I quote that should Government institutions fail to show any willingness in terms of their efforts to provide adequate accommodation for students, students will erect shacks around compasses as temporary accommodation come March 2017 that is next year thus I ask.

1) Were you aware that NANSO raised the issue of unaffordable rent for tertiary students in Windhoek? They demand for a student village to be built and the threats of erecting shacks on the University Campuses in 2015.

### NOTICE OF QUESTIONS HON SMIT

- 2) What was the response from the Ministry to these issues when they were raised in 2015?
- 3) Are you aware that NANSO has reiterated its threats to erect shacks on the University campuses in March 2017? Should their concerns regarding students accommodation not be addressed?
- 4) What plan and/or action if any has the Ministry developed to address NANSO's concerns, demands and threats regarding student accommodation?
- 5) What will be the Ministry's plan of action should students erect shacks on University Campuses in March (interventions) 2017? (Intervention).

HON SPEAKER: Can you just repeat that?

HON SMIT: Pardon.

HON SPEAKER: If you could just repeat that.

**HON SMIT**: That is question 5; what will be the Ministry's plan of action should students erect shacks on University Campuses in March 2017?

6) Are you aware that tertiary students in Windhoek face a situation where they must pay excessively high rental fees for the most basic accommodation often located far from their compasses?

### NOTICE OF QUESTIONS HON SMIT

- 7) For what percentage of their respective student population are the Namibia University of Science and Technology (NUST) and the University of Namibia (UNAM) able to provide on on-compass accommodation what percentage?
- 8) What percentage of students enrolled at NUST and UNAM in Windhoek come from areas outside of the capital city and must thus find alternative accommodation?
- 9) What is the average annual increase in student enrolment at NUST and UNAM?
- 10) What portion of capital funding received for the Financial Years 2014/.2015, 2015/2016 and 2016/2017 receive from Government as NUST and UNAM respectively spend on developing student accommodation?
- 11) What provision have both NUST and UNAM made for student accommodation in their respective developmental plans?
- 12) Would you say that the provision of affordable accommodation for students is a priority to the Ministry and via Education Institutions in Namibia?

I so Move.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you. The next on the list is the Honourable Nauyoma.

**HON NAUYOMA**: Thank you Honourable Speaker. Honourable Speaker, can I ask the Honourable Idah (indistinct), Idah the Minister of Higher Education an oral question?

6

### ORAL QUESTION HON NAUYOMA

HON SPEAKER: What was the question again?
HON NAUYOMA: I asked if I can ask the Honourable an oral question.
HON SPEAKER: To whom?
HON NAUYOMA: To the Minister of Higher Education?
HON SPEAKER: Yes.
ORAL QUESTION
HON NAUYOMA: Honourable Minister (intervention).
HON MEMBER: Idah.
HON NAUYOMA: Dr Idah Kandjii-Murangi Minister of Higher Education. I know she is my sister, I know her name very well.

### RESPONSE TOORAL QUESTION HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

**HON MEMBER**: You are coming from there?

**HON NAUYOMA**: Yes, I am from there. Doctor we are at it again like at the beginning of the year, can you enlighten this House and the nation at large what is the status quo at the compasses with regards to the fees that has created a problem at the beginning of this year.

We are hearing another (indistinct) at UNAM again, what is the situation? Can you maybe just enlighten us what is happening in this regard?

HON SPEAKER: Thank you very much. Honourable Minister.

### RESPONSE TO ORAL QUESTION

HON MINISTER OF HIGHER EDUCATION, TRAINING AND INNOVATION: Thank you, Honourable Speaker, and indeed thank you Honourable Nauyoma. I think your question actually borders on the list of questions that were already forwarded by Honourable Smit.

I think if you want a fair and very broad response that can cover everything in terms of what he has already put forth and what you are bringing forth I think an elaborate response will come on Thursday.

However, with regards to the actual current situation at UNAM, yes it is true yesterday students did go on strike demanding the fact that those who are owing should be allowed to sit exams and then at least at the beginning of the year have their results withheld.

### RESPONSE TOORAL QUESTION HON DR KANDJII-MURANGI

The institution is actually of the view that they have been doing that all these years, allowing debtors to write and then withhold the results and that has led to the accumulation of debt so this is where we are, we are still engaging the leadership of the institution both actually and as I have said you are better placed to wait for Thursday to get a full response. Thank you.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you very much indeed. Honourable Members these are important issues managed quite well by academic institutions, the leadership from the Ministry of Higher Education and other stakeholders. Let us leave it to them to deal with that in a very calm manner and they will in due time report to us as the Minister indicated. I really do not want us to get involved by attempting to provide advice etcetera because let us leave it to them they will report to the House in due course. Thank you very much. We move on. Yes, please.

**HON MAAMBERUA**: Yes thank you Comrade Speaker. Last week I missed Thursday and if you were not congratulated last week for being the Chancellor of NUST congratulations. Thank you very much.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. Any expression of congratulations and etcetera are most welcome and coming from you is being very much appreciated.

Notices of Motions? Messages from the Head of State? Ministerial Statements? Right Honourable Prime Minister Dr Saara Kuugongelwa-Amadhila.

#### MINISTERIAL STATEMENT INTERMS OF

## MINISTERIAL STATEMENT RT HON DR KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

#### RULE 98 OF THE STANDING RULES AND ORDERS

# APPRAISAL ABOUT COLLECTIVE AGREEMENT SIGNED BY GOVERNMENT, NAPWU AND NANTU

**RT HON PRIME MINISTER**: Yes, thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. I would also like to take this opportunity to congratulate you on your appointment as the Chancellor of our New University of Science and Technology.

We have true confidence that you would steer that infant institution to excellence and meet the expectations of the Namibian public.

Having said that, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members I would like to appraise this august House about the recently concluded collective agreement between the Government, the Namibia Public Workers Union and the Namibia Teachers Union at State House on Saturday 15<sup>th</sup> of October 2015. The signing of the said agreement resulted in the calling off of the strike by NANTU and paved the way for teaching and examinations to resume at our schools.

Further the agreement concluded the tripartite negotiations covering salaries and benefit adjustments for the Financial Year 2016/2017 and 2017/2018 Financial Year and will be implemented as follows:

1) Salary adjustments for 2016/2017 Financial Year, the parties agreed that the salary adjustments for 2016/2017 Financial Year shall remain as follows: A salary increment would remain at 10% for Grades 15 to 13 at 5% for Grades 12 to 5 and at 4% for Grade 4 to 1A. The benefits are as follows, housing allowance for staff members below management cadres 9%, housing benefit for management cadres 8%, housing loan amount under home owners scheme for staff members 10%. The effective date for the salaries and benefits adjustments stipulated above is April 2016 and was implemented for staff members

## MINISTERIAL STATEMENT RT HON DR KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

except NANTU Members who will now receive the adjustment backdated to that same date of April 2016.

- 2) Salary and benefits adjustment for 2017/2018 Financial Year the parties agreed to amend the agreements of April 11, 2016 on the salary adjustments for the 2017/2018 Financial Years as follows:
- (a) The 7% salary adjustment across the board is increased by 2 percentage points to make it 9%.
- (b) The parties agreed that the agreement relating to the 7% increment on transport allowance for staff management below management and 7% of motor vehicle allowance for the management cadre remains the same and that the effective dates for the salaries and benefits adjustments for the 2017/2018 Financial Year shall be April 1<sup>st</sup> 2017. The agreement signed by the parties supersedes the agreement entered into between the Government and NANTU relating to the salary adjustments for the 2017/2018 Financial Year.

I would like to thank His Excellency the President for his support and guidance in resolving this matter. I also want to thank all the parties who were involved and all stakeholders for their understanding in resolving this matter.

I want to clarify, however, that the allegations that Government delayed the conclusion of the negotiations by postponing meetings or decisions and thus the timing for the strike to coincide with the commencement of examinations at schools are untrue. Delays in reaching an agreement was due to NANTU's non acceptance of the Government's offer for 5% salary increment for Grades 12 to 15. I should state that negotiations between Government and NANTU and NAPWU started as early as March of this year and an agreement was concluded and signed with NAPWU in April of this year already.

Never mind we are pleased that the situation of a strike is now behind us and learning and examinations have resumed at our schools. The

### MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON MUTORWA

postponed examinations from last Thursday and Friday have now been rescheduled as announced by the Minister of Education, Arts and Culture. It is my hope that this mutual understanding will continue to guide our future engagement in the interest of our country. Thank you Honourable Speaker.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. Prime Minister I also wish to thank you for your kind words about my appointment as the Chancellor of Namibia University of Science and Technology (NUST).

Furthermorem I am sure the whole House welcomes the agreement signed between the Government and NANTU this is all in the interests of all stakeholders and the country at large. Thank you.

Next on my list is the Honourable John Mutorwa.

## MINISTERIAL STATEMENT INTERMS OF RULE 98 OF THE STANDING RULES AND ORDERS

BRIEF ON THE RESPECTIVE NATIONAL MANDATES
OF AGRICULTURAL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT AGENCY

### **HON MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY:**

Thank you very much, Comrade Speaker, for giving me the floor to make a Ministerial Statement with regards to the roles, mandates and responsibilities of two important agencies within the Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry, namely the Agricultural Business Development Agencies or, AGRIBUSDEV in short, and the Agricultural Marketing and Trade Agency – AMTA in short.

### MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON MUTORWA

I am doing so because of the realisation that sometimes the roles and responsibilities of these two agencies are not clearly understood. The AGRIBUSDEV and AMTA are State Owned Enterprises under the direct supervision of the Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry.

The two agencies are governed by the State Owned Enterprises Governance Act and also the Agronomic Industry Act which very soon will come here in the form of some amendments.

Both AGRIBUSDEF and AMTA so far share one Board of Directors consisting of members selected and appointed from specific Government Institutions namely the Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry, Ministry of Finance, the National Planning Commission and the Ministry of Industrialisation, Trade and SME Development.

AGRIBUSDEV mandate is to manage and supervise the production activities at the Government of the Republic of Namibia's National Green Scheme Projects. The National Green Scheme Projects are operated and managed in terms of specific farming models as articulated and outlined in the Government's 2008 Revised Green Scheme Policy Document. The production activities at the Green Scheme Projects are executed between the parameters of the Agronomic Industry Act of 1992.

Currently, the AGRIBUSDEV supervises the activities that are implemented at the following 11 Government Green Scheme Projects namely Etunda, Hardap Green Scheme Project, Kalimbeza National Rice Projects, Masare Green Scheme Projects, Musese Green Scheme Projects, Ndonga Linena Green Scheme Projects, the Orange River Green Scheme Project, Satikongoro Green Scheme Project, Litemo Green Scheme Project, Likongo Green Scheme Project and Uvhunguvhungu Green Scheme and Dairy Projects.

**HON MEMBER**: And Kunene?

### MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON MUTORWA

**HON MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY**: We are still waiting on Kunene and Liselo. My friend has already asked that question.

AMTA's mandate on the other hand is to manage the National Fresh Produce Business Hubs in the Republic of Namibia as well as the National Strategic Food Reserves commonly known as silos in our country towards the attainment of food safety and food security. Meaning that AGRIBUSDEV ensures the projection takes place and AMTA make sure that that production at the green scheme projects find space in the Fresh Business Hubs and with regards to grain in the silos.

In practical executing its mandate AMTA does collaborate with AGRIBUSDEV and the Namibian Agronomic Board so as to properly coordinate and manage the marketing and trades of agricultural projects in Namibia. Thus AMTA manages, maintains and support the two existing fresh produce business hubs in Rundu and in Ongwediva.

Furthermore, AMTA facilitates for the sourcing of agricultural produce from the green scheme projects but also from individual private producers or farmers across the length and breadth of the Republic of Namibia. I must also inform the public through this august House those construction activities that the much bigger and modern Windhoek National Fresh Produce Business Hubs in Wanaheda in Katutura is progressing well.

Now let us look at the marketing and trading activities that AMTA is doing, has been doing and shall continue to do. Under its Fresh Produce Business Hub Division AMTA does provide cold storage, marketing, trading and processing facilities for local fresh produce. AMTA's main aim therefore is to market and add value to local fresh produce and thereby help to stimulate local production in line with the Government of the Republic of Namibia's growth at home strategy an industrialisation policy which are managed and implemented through the Ministry of Industrialization, Trade and SME Development.

From January this year up to July for example nine catering companies

### MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON MUTORWA

were sourcing fresh produce from the two National Fresh Produce Hubs at Ongwediva and Rundu. I am sure that number could have increased by now. We would like to applaud those companies and urge others to also come on board. Furthermore we remind and urge the Procurement Board former Tender Board of Namibia to ensure that those catering companies who are awarded tenders to provide foodstuffs to Government institutions must comply with the relevant provisions of the said Act but also appropriate Cabinet decision to source where possible the foodstuffs that are provided to our institutions from the local Namibian markets and citizens as producers.

Admittedly the notion of free market and lack of varieties are some of the challenges that are still being used by some to import cheaper and sometimes lower grades produce from elsewhere. For the Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry AMTA, Namibia Agronomic Board and farmers through their organisations are seized with finding mutually acceptable solutions with the mentioned challenges as we move forward.

The factual truth is and remains that the Ministry and AMTA are not advocating for agricultural products to come all the way to the Fresh Produce Hubs for example. As per their motto (AMTA's motto) from land to nation AMTA was, AMTA is and AMTA shall remain ready to facilitate the movement of agricultural products wherever such produce are directly from the farm to the client they have got all sedentary possibilities. This means that AMTA has also the duty and mandate to transport agricultural products directly from the farm from the producers to let them know that you have got some fresh produce, contact them they will come there, get the produce from there of course, pay them to pay the producer and take the fresh produce to the business hubs.

Concluding remarks, Agri Business and AMTA are essentially twin brothers or twin sisters. The relationship between the two could be characterised as one simplistic interdependence in Afrikaans (Afrikaans).

Let us all be reminded that although the international marketing of Namibia's agricultural products is relatively well developed, we are proud

### MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON MUTORWA

of that. With exports destined for markets outside Namibia, the truth, Honourable Members the truth is that the marketing of the same such products inside the country locally has not witnessed similar progressive developments. That is why some people say we produce what we do not consume and consume what we do not produce and that picture must progressively change.

26 years after the attainment of political freedom and national independence the marketing systems in the domestic markets here locally remains fragmented, non transparent, based on foreign pricing systems and does not promote equitable or fair benefits sharing across all role players in the long agricultural value chain.

While appreciating the visible presence of Namibian products in international markets and we do appreciate that it is equally true that consumer demands in the domestic markets is largely serviced by imported products. Surely Honourable Members will agree with me that such trend is undesirable and risky.

The government of the Republic of Namibia through the Ministry of Agriculture, Water and Forestry have developed policies which are currently being practically implemented that are aimed to improve the country's agricultural marketing and trade in both the domestic and international markets.

Chief among such polities is the Namibian Agriculture Marketing and Trade Policy and Strategy. Its main aim is to guide the agricultural sector towards utilising the opportunities in both the domestic and international markets that would result in the country being Namibia reaping maximum benefits to achieve the objectives of the Harambe Prosperity Plan, the National Development Plans we are busy with the Fifth one now, my colleague the Minister of Economic Planning and also Vision 2030.

So that is within that context that the responsibilities and mandates of AGRIBUSDEV and AMTA to be understood and we would like to thank the general public, business people for the support to these two agencies

# 18 October 2016 COMMENTS ON MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON DIENDA / HON VAN DEN HEEVER

that are making their footprints in the market. Thank you.
HON SPEAKER: Thank you, Honourable Minister. Yes, a quick one from Honourable Dienda.
HON DIENDA: Just for clarity, Honourable Speaker, I want to thank the Minister for that information because it is just in front of my house and I was wondering what are all the Chinese people doing at that specific place.
So maybe, yes, if the Honourable can just enlighten me now further on to whether they are just doing the ground work or what is it because the construction site I could not find any Wanaheda residence working there? Thank you.
HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Honourable Jennifer Van Den Heever, is it the same issue? Yes just a quick one because we want to (intervention).
HON VAN DEN HEEVER: Mine is very quick. The Honourable Minister mentioned the projects, the green scheme projects. Amongst others he spoke about the Kunene one which is still in waiting. Just for interest sake Honourable Minister, what will be the timeframe for this one to be launched?
HON SPEAKER: Yes just a quick one about the time frame?

### HON MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY:

Thank you, Comrade Speaker. I thank my two colleagues from the DTA of Namibia but the two of Namibia.

Honourable Dienda your question is spot-on and in as far as the progress at that Windhoek Fresh Produce Hub is concerned first it must be stated that the geographical location, the site where the hub is being constructed is quite rocky and therefore when they started up to now they are mainly concentrating on what they call levelling the grounds and so on, the earth work.

My information is that towards the end of this year they will finish with that earth work now and so when it comes next year and I would like to already lobby this House to approve the budget then the actual construction of the infrastructure itself (intervention). No he is just the Minister but he is also a Member of the House, all of us must support him.

In terms of employment I do not want to go as far as you have alleged all what I can say is that the contractors they are both the main contractor and the subcontractors have been awarded their respective contracts to do specific work and also to employ not only Chinese I was there myself but Namibians also and there are many Namibians there so let us not be xenophobic. Let us not be xenophobic the world is a global village now.

Kunene Madam Honourable Van Den Heever, I know that your colleague on your left is trying, no lend me your ears. There I must inform the House that at one point I think it was last year through the Office of the Governor and it was the former Governor who started this Honourable Niester! Oebeb.

We did receive a proposal but it did not emanate from him but from a specific community I have just forgotten the name of that area where they were proposing, requesting also that we should go and look at the possibility of maybe putting up a green scheme project in that particular area and we sent out experts there. They did a good job and the report that they brought to us in as far as the land and the proximity to the water is

### 18 October 2016 COMMENTS ON MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON NUIOMA

concerned no problems but they did indicate in the report the issue of electricity and the issue of roads infrastructures this is an issue that we need to look at if we are to finally decide to access that particular land.

Therefore, it is on the books but I cannot give you a deadline once we have got clarity on all those aspects including the politics, the local politics also. the local politics is other group is pulling this side the other one that side I do not know where my colleague is maybe he is in the middle or maybe he is instigating both groups I do not know but that is where we are and those are the factual situations as far as that particular proposed projects is concerned. Thank you Comrade Speaker.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. I think we have exhausted that within the time possible. The next – oh okay, Honourable Utoni Nujoma.

\_\_\_\_\_

**HON MINISTER OF LAND REFORM**: Yes, I would like to thankHonourable Mutorwa for really answering the questions sufficiently and adequately and I wanted to elaborate on the Afrikaans word he used here to say that Honourable Dienda and Honourable Smit (Afrikaans)(laughter).

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you. I know there are many people in this House who I would like to characterise as things, very good in Afrikaans and in the old days we used to talk about sever Afrikaans there are many in this House but for now we move on.

Next is Honourable Pohamba Shifeta.

\_\_\_\_\_

### MINISTERIAL STATEMENT INTERMS OF RULE 98 OF THE STANDING RULES AND ORDERS

# ON OUTCOME OF 17<sup>TH</sup> CONFERENCE OF THE PARTIES TO THE CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE

**HON MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND TOURISM**: Thank you very much Honourable Speaker.

Honourable Speaker let me first and foremost congratulate you for having been appointed as the Chancellor of the Namibia University of Science and Technology by that University Council, Honourable Speaker, I rise to take a mutual statement on the outcome of the 17<sup>th</sup> Conference of the Parties to the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild fauna and frère.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members the Convention on Trade in Endangered Species (CITES) as we call it Conference of the parties which took place in Johannesburg South Africa during the period of 24 September to the 5<sup>th</sup> of October 2016 saw Namibia emerged with all our conservation priorities retained and our voice strengthened.

The Namibian delegation included a modest Government Delegation which was supported by communities through integrated Rural Development and Nature Conservation and Namibia Association, the Community Based Support Organisations, Namibia Nature Condition and the Game Products Trespass of Namibia.

The Namibian delegation was very well coordinated and organised in advocating our position guided by Conservation and Sustainable Development and our common vision. The discussions apart from those on the scientific and procedural merits involved complex diplomacy and supportive advocacy. CITES is essentially a battle ground between

### MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON SHIFETA

preservation and conservation ideologies. Regrettably finer animal, welfare and animal rights organisations are at the forefront of driving preservationist agenda. Namibia as per our Constitution firmly advocates for conservation which entails both protection and sustainable utilisation regimes. The Conference Committee's discussions prior to the final Plenary Sessions were long addressed and at times quite broad but in the end some reasonable compromises were attained.

The main discussions concerning Namibia were those surrounding elephants, lions, pangolins, hunting trophies, ivory trade and including domestic ivory trade and a community representation at CITES.

The trend coming into this COP17 has been promptly preservationists a point which was highlighted by the resolution to encourage countries to close their domestic ivory markets arising from the International Union for Nature Conservation World Conservation Congress.

Namibia proposed for a removal of restrictions in the form of an annotation linked to the elephant population what is listed in Appendix II as well as a decision mechanism for future trade in ivory.

There was also a proposal by Coalition Group of Africa to up list Namibia's elephant population among others to Appendix I from Appendix II to Appendix I. Namibia vehemently objected to that proposal of up listing elephant population to Appendix I and with the support of other countries this proposal was rejected by the Conference. This is good news for Namibia's future trade in elephants and elephant products if we wish to trade.

Honourable Speaker, a number of African countries led by Kenya proposed for a complete closure of all domestic ivory markets globally. The global closure of all domestic ivory market was not adopted after Namibia raised a procedural motion in terms of CITES rules and procedures and CITES mandate which is to regulate international trade but not domestic trade. A compromise was reached rather to adopt a resolution which encourage the closure of markets that can be linked to

### MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON SHIFETA

illegal trade and poaching since our elephant population will remain on Appendix II and no annotation was removed or added nothing has changed we will continue trading in all specimens where we were allowed to trade in before CITES Conference.

The African lion which was proposed by some other African countries led by Niger to be moved from Appendix II to Appendix I was rejected and has also been retained on Appendix II. In this case the status quo remains and we will continue with our business as usual for example, sustainable use to ensure the survival of the lion in the wild. The only change will be that no commercial train in lion films from Namibia will be allowed which is a bonus to us because Namibia discouraged trade in lions bones for a number of reasons.

Honourable Speaker, the Motion on Hunting Trophies has also been strengthened and recognises the important contribution to conservation but hunting can make when well regulated as it is in the case of Namibia. A Motion to secure a stronger voice of our communities who are arguably the most important killers and partners in our conservation efforts has been deferred to any inter sectional discussion and they will be brought up at the next conference of the parties.

In the case of the pangolin which has been transferred from Appendix II to Appendix I, Namibia does not trade on its specimens for primary and commercial purposes hence Namibia supported the up listing of the pangolin from Appendix II to Appendix I. Therefore the result of this conference does not affect Namibia negatively.

The pangolin is protected in Namibia and will continue to focus our efforts on its conservation and also enhance our efforts to catch the criminals involved in this trade. We face serious challenges to our conservation models that has since independence seen many successes a growing elephant population from 7,000 to approximately 22,000 currently to an expanding lion population up to more than 1,000 and a range outside of course the protected areas and above all the world's only truly pre branding black rhino population in our conservancies.

### MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON SHIFETA

This is all underpinned by a network of private, communal and State protected areas that cover about 425 of the country's landmarks. This success has been driven by enlightened Government policies that empower our communities to take responsibility for the conservation of wildlife and the habitat and generates benefits from the bio diversity economy through hunting, harvesting and non consumptive uses such as eco tourism.

In brief we held firm in our deep pre rooted belief that our conservation models are succeeding and in part we have managed to get the global community recognised this consideration model of Namibia. The Namibian delegation stood firm, spoke up of our way of doing things and in the end resolvedly safeguarded our position and further promoted our approach to conservation model.

But the work starts now. We need to build better and stronger regional and global alliances and we will work at every level in Government, private sector and civil society to ensure that when the next meeting of parties is held that is CITES COP18 in Sri Lanka our voice has already been held. We are already preparing for the upcoming 13<sup>th</sup> Conference on Bio Diversity Conference of Parties in Cocoon, Mexico in December this year where once again we will advocate the Namibian way of conservation and sustainable development.

I therefore request Honourable Members of this august House to promote our conservation model and every opportunity you get internationally which is based on two principles, a principle of the creation of positive instances through sustainable use for land holders whether communal or private and to set land aside for wildlife and to coexist with the wildlife instead of opting for forms of land use that will displace wildlife and cause the loss of the habitat.

The second one the generation of revenue from the sale of wildlife products to finance wildlife conservation programmes including the management of protected areas and the combating of illegal killing of our animals and also combating of illegal trade.

### MINISTERIAL STATEMENT HON SHIFETA

Honourable Speaker, I thank you very much.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much Honourable Minister. We thank you for standing firm in defence of the interests of this country and I also wish to thank you for your kind words with respect to my appointment as the Chancellor of NUST, thank you. I think that said and done we move on.

The first Notice of Motion is the one of the Honourable Minister of Industrialisation, Trade and SME Development. Does the Honourable Minister move that the Bill be now introduced?

**HON MINISTER OF INDUSTRIALIZATION, TRADE AND SME DEVELOPMENT**: Yes, thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. I Movethat the Bill be introduced.

**HON SPEAKER**: Who seconds? Any objection? Agreed to. Honourable Minister you have the floor to Table the Bill.

The Secretary will now read the Bill the First Time.

### NAMIBIA INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT AGENCY BILL [B.16 – 2016]

**SECRETARY**: Namibia Industrial Development Agency Bill [B.16 – 2016].

24

### NAMIBIA INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT AGENCY BILL HON NGATJIZEKO

**HON SPEAKER**: Does the Honourable Minister move that the Bill now be read a Second Time?

HON MINISTER OF INDUSTRIALISATION, TRADE AND SME DEVELOPMENT: I so Move Honourable Speaker.

**HON SPEAKER**: Who seconds? Any objection? Agreed to. Minister you have the floor.

HON MINISTER OF INDUSTRLISATION, TRADE AND SME DEVELOPMENT: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members of the National Assembly.

I rise to introduce and Table for consideration and subsequent approval by this august House the Namibia Industrial Development Agency Bill.

The purpose of this Bill is to establish NIDA and to define the objects, powers, duties and functions of NIDA.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, in consideration of a strategic priorities, role and responsibilities towards achieving the industrialisation of Namibia's economy the Ministry of Industrialisation, Trade and SME development as part of its repositioning has identified the following needs:

- 1) To integrate certain key functions and operations of some of the State Owned Enterprises under this Ministry.
- 2) To achieve economies of scale and enhances sustainability of services delivered by it.

### NAMIBIA INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT AGENCY BILL HON NGATJIZEKO

3) To reposition existing State Owned Enterprises to be able to move with current demands in the field of industrial development noting that circumstances have changed considerably since some State Owned Enterprises were established 20 or more years ago and in particular to implement the first industrial policy of Namibia and its implementation strategy the growth at home strategy.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, a limited realignment of functions and State Owned Enterprises is required to better support and facilitate industrial development in the country.

The following essential industry support services could in such manner be strengthened and consolidated. Supporting the implementation of Namibia's first industrial policy and implementation strategy which provides for greater and more direct engagement by Government to facilitate and provide support to the industrialisation process and in particular value addition to raw materials and participation in cross border value change.

Secondly, developing key industrial and business infrastructure throughout Namibia in support of private sector development, Urban and Rural Industrial development and economic corridor development, promoting and facilitating foreign and domestic investment, the introduction of new technology, product development, manufacturing, value addition to raw materials, marketing and improvement of competitiveness of the Namibian exports.

Researching on and development of new opportunities, technologies, products etcetera, implementing incentives and other and business development support mechanisms assigned to it by Government including the incubation of new business ventures and mentor the establishment of new enterprises and enterprises in SME sectors.

Implementing and managing projects on behalf of OMAS especially in the fields of industrial development and production of industrial inputs

### NAMIBIA INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT AGENCY BILL HON NGATJIZEKO

through for example agriculture, fisheries and mining etcetera. Also making on behalf of Government is maybe appropriate, equity investments or tap on equity holdings acquired in the process of establishing a new industry or company in selected new ventures or enter into public/private partnership to ensure a public safe and strategic or priority industries but also to help with the incubation of bringing industries and also to provide for any support or interventions required in the context of the implementation of the industrial policy of our country.

Honourable Members, in pursuit of the attainment of the Vision 2030 and the drive to industrialise the Republic of Namibia the Ministry, our Ministry has elected to realign the functions being performed by selective State Owned Enterprises that fall under our Ministry.

The motive for such alignment being inter alia the need to integrate selected key functions and operations of State Owned Enterprises in order to achieve economies of scale, remove identified duplications of key responsibilities and functions, enhances sustainability of services delivered by the State Owned Enterprises and to empower the selected State Owned Enterprises to be able to meet the current demands prevalent in the fields of industrial developments.

The State Owned Enterprises which has been identified to be realigned in order to achieve herein the fore stated is the Namibia Development Corporation known as NDC and Offshore Development Company which is also known as ODC.

A new entity will be created by the aforesaid realignment exercise which entity will in all likelihood be known as the Namibia Industrial Development Agency or NIDA.NIDA shall foster economic growth and development in order to raise income and promote investment and employment in Namibia by coordinating industrial and agricultural development and implementing Namibia's industrial policy both efficiently and effectively.

### NAMIBIA INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT AGENCY BILL HON NGATJIZEKO

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, key chapters in the media Bill are as follows. These Sections:

- Section 1 and 2 merely define words used in the Bill for ease of reference and clarify and specifically establish the Agency.
- Sections 3 and 4 these Sections state the objectives to be achieved by the Agency which are inter alia aimed at fostering economic growth and development in order to raise income and promote investment and employment in Namibia.
- Section 5 of the Bill, this Section bestows crucial powers on the Agency which powers the agency need to achieve its objectives as granted by it in Section 4.
- Section 6 to 19 these Sections establish the Board of Directors of the agency who are attached with administering and controlling the attests of the Agency.
- Section 20, this Section ensures that the Minister retains ultimate control over the Board of Directors of the Agency and ultimately over the Agency.
- Section 21, this Section regulates the appointment of the Chief Executive Officer of the Agency who is responsible for the day to day running of the Agency and further specifies the duties of the CEO as a Chief Executive Officer and the methods of the removal of the CEO if required. The Agency shall strife to be self sustainable in a medium to long term and this Section explains from where the Agency shall source its funding.
- Section 23, this Section seeks to assist the Agency in achieving self sustainability by alleviating specified financial burdens on the Agency. This Section does not absolve the Agency from the liability to pay

### NAMIBIA INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT AGENCY BILL HON NGATJIZEKO

taxes, duties or fees imposed by a law relating to Customs Excise of Sales Tax.

- Section 24 to 27, these Sections deal with the routine financial aspects
  of the Agency. For example its Financial Year end, the annual
  estimates, annual reports etcetera and it is in conformity to the
  requirements laid down in the State Owned Enterprise Governance
  Act.
- Section 28, this Section ensures that the Minister retains control over the powers conferred upon the Agency, I have mentioned that.
- Section 29 to 37, these final Sections deal with further provisions applicable to the Act. These provisions include among others the application of the Companies Act to the Agency, the use of the name of the Agency etcetera. These Sections further deal with the administrative task needed to match the Namibia Development Corporation and the Offshore Development Company and to hereby NIDA.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, the scope of functions and all responsibilities I have outlined previous could be a sign to a single realigned entity and would be comparable to those of similar specialised institutions in the SADC Regions tasked with Industrial Development.

The exception is that the Developing Financing that is the lending is not covered for reasons that Government has already established other specialised development financing institutions such as the Development Bank of Namibia and the SME Bank. The establishment of the Namibia Industrial Development Agency is thus proposed on the basis of a new founding Bill that would repeal the NDC Act as well as require consequent amendments to the foreign investment Act as well as the Export Processing Zone Act and minor amendments to the Development Bank Act required pursuant to the resentment of a decision to wind up the NDC.

### NAMIBIA INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT AGENCY BILL HON NGATJIZEKO

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, allow me at this juncture to make reference to the envisaged financing of NIDA. It is foreseen that NIDA should have a broad variety of income streams to enhance its self sustainability, lessen dependence on budget support and generate its own operating capital. This would require that operations should be aimed at cost recovery and in some instances to generate surpluses to allow that some purely supportive activities could be pro subsidised from other operations.

There should also be provision for co-investments by other institutions both public and private and for the formation of tailor-made public/private partnerships in specific dangers.

NIDA would generate operating capital or revenues from project management and implementation on behalf of Government, equity holdings and profit of ventures, sourcing of loan finances through development finances and institutions, developing and leasing of business infrastructure, production operation in for instance farming, agro processing and other Bills, rendering of services on a business basis and an appropriate direct capitalisation by Government through the line Ministry.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members the Ministry of Industrialisation, Trade and SME Development has led to the development of this Bill to establish NIDA with the assistance of the NDC and the ODC as well as the two relevant Boards of Directors which includes the presentation from economic OMAS and the private sector.

Allow me now here at this juncture to table the Namibia Industrial Development I have done so already, for your consideration.

Your positive consideration and adoption of this Bill Honourable Members will be enforced and grant momentum for the speedy implementation of a growth at home strategy which would result to bring about the realisation of Vision 2030 and the Harambe Prosperity Plan

### NAMIBIA INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT AGENCY BILL HON VAN DEN HEEVER

aspirations. I am counting on your usual support and continuous support and I thank you in advance. HON SPEAKER: Thank you. Any further discussion? Yes, Honourable Jennifer Van Den Heever. **HON VAN DEN HEEVER**: Thank you. Honourable Speaker, I would like to postpone it to Tuesday the 25<sup>th</sup> of October for the discussion on this Bill if there (incomplete). HON SPEAKER: If there are no takers can we agree to that, to post the discuss until next week Tuesday? So decided? On the 20, ha? HON MEMBER: Tuesday 25<sup>th</sup>. **HON SPEAKER**: Next week Tuesday. **HON MEMBER**: Thank you.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you, let us move on. The second Notice of Motion is the one of the Honourable Minister of Finance. Does the

### NAMIBIAN SPECIAL RISKS INSURANCE ASSOCIATION BILL HON SCHLETTWEIN

Honourable Minister Move that	at the Bill be now introduced?			
HON MINISTER OF FINAN	NCE: Honourable Speaker yes I do move.			
HON SPEAKER: Who secon Honourable Minister please tal	nds? Any objection? Agreed to. Will the ole the Bill?			
Thank you the Secretary now r	reads the Bill the First Time.			
NAMIBIAN SPECIAL RISKS INSURANCE ASSOCIATION BILL [B.9 – 2016]  SECRETARY: Namibia Special Risks Insurance Association Bill [B.9 –				
HON SPEAKER: Does the now read a second time?	Honourable Minister move that the Bill be			
HON MINISTER OF FINAN	NCE: I Move so.			
<b>HON SPEAKER</b> : Who seco the Minister of Finance.	nds? Any objection? Agreed to. I call on			

### NAMIBIAN SPECIAL RISKS INSURANCE ASSOCIATION BILL HON SCHLETTWEIN

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Honourable Speaker thank you for the floor and may I join the others to congratulate you to the appointment and with that a promotion that you were provided and now you are (indistinct), congratulations.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members I have the honour to re-table the Namibian Speaker Risks Insurance Association Bill 2016. This Bill seeks to (see speech to 4:20:18).

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. Any further discussion? I recognise the Honourable Maamberua.

**HON MAAMBERUA**: Thank you Honourable Speaker. Oh, that is the one that is (indistinct), yes since I am just receiving the document now, Comrade Speaker, may I beg for your indulgency and that of the House to postpone discussion on this Bill to next week Tuesday?

**HON SPEAKER**: Tuesday? Yes the request is granted. The discussion will commence in the full swing next week Tuesday. So decided. We move on.

The Secretary will read the First Order of the Day.

Actually, I was going to thank the Honourable Minister for his kind words to my appointment as Chancellor of NUST, thank you indeed.

The Secretary will ready the First Order of the Day.

# 18 October 2016 COMMITTEE STAGE – NAMIBIA CITIZENSHIP AMENDMENT BILL HON IIVULA-ITHANA

### RECONSIDERATION – NAMIBIA CITIZENSHIPAMENDMENT BILL [B.11 – 2016]

**SECRETARY**: Reconsideration – *Namibia Citizenship Amendment Bill* [B.11 – 2016].

**HON SPEAKER**: Does the Honourable Minister move that the Assembly now considers the Bill? The Assembly will now go into Committee and any objection? Agreed to. The Chairperson of the Whole House Committee will take the Chair.

\_\_\_\_\_

### ASSEMBLY IN COMMITTEE

-----

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: The Whole House Committee is called to Order. The Committee has to consider the Namibian Citizenship Amendment Bill. The National Council considered the Bill and unanimously objected the principal thereof. The Honourable Minister of Home Affairs and Immigration now has the floor.

\_\_\_\_\_

### HON MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION:

Thank you Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee. Let me also in his absence convey through you Comrade Chairperson my congratulations to the Speaker for his appointment as the Chancellor of the University of Science and Technology.

# 18 October 2016 COMMITTEE STAGE – NAMIBIA CITIZENSHIP AMENDMENT BILL HON MUHARUKUA

Having said so Honourable Chairperson, I have read Article 75:5(a) and (b) and have taken into consideration Cabinet decision which starts among others that the Cabinet of the Republic of Namibia remained ceased with the matter of the Citizenship Act and undertakes to consult widely with the view to seeking long term solutions to deal with the issues of this nature in the future.

Having said so I would like to say the following that while concurring with Cabinet directives, directive in this matter I would however take issues with the statement in the explanatory notes of the reasons why the National Council has rejected the principle of the Bill. The attempt to try and interpret Article 81 of the Constitution by the National Council is misplaced.

Therefore I would rather advise that should they intent to interpret any Constitutional Provision they should rather seek appropriate institutions to do so and having said so Comrade Chairman as I said I plead to this august House that the decision of the Cabinet of the Republic of Namibia on this matter should prevail. I so move.

**HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE**: Thank you. Any further discussions? I recognise Honourable Muharukua.

HON MUHARUKUA: Thank you Honourable Chairperson. Perhaps at the end of the Honourable Minister's statement she made a statement of a decision of Cabinet prevails I do not know whether I missed it somewhere in her contribution or whether it was reflected somewhere where I did not take notice of it. Perhaps maybe in coming back she would like to, if she said it already then I be indebted for not giving due attention.

# 18 October 2016 COMMITTEE STAGE – NAMIBIA CITIZENSHIP AMENDMENT BILL HON MUHARUKUA

However, let me come to the said Article 81 and profoundly and simultaneously shamefully agree with the National Council. The Attorney General as this is, is interpreting Article 81 to be saying that Parliament is the last judicial recourse for example that if (intervention).

**HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE**: Point of? Yes, Honourable Minister of Finance.

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Thank you very much, Honourable Chairperson. I need your guidance on this matter. My take is that the Whole House Committee is to deliberate only on whether we agree with the Council's recommendation or not and I think we are now discussing the substantive matters of the principle and I need your guidance to see how, it is not the Second Reading anymore it is just whether the Council decision or re commendation is agreeable to or not and I need that guidance from you Comrade Chairperson.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you, Honourable Minister I agree with you 100%, but then on what he is asking that I will then allow Honourable Muharukua just to conclude, because we cannot deliberate on it now and bring new issues to it unless you refer to the Bill itself but for now it is just for us to consider and as put forward by the Honourable Minister of Home Affairs.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Honourable Chair?

### 18 October 2016 COMMITTEE STAGE – NAMIBIA CITIZENSHIP AMENDMENT BILL HON MUHARUKUA

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Yes Honourable Muharukua you have the floor.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Yes I will not conclude, I will make submissions. Full submissions and then we come to a conclusion. I am making my submission and in the submissions I am substantiating as to why I agree or disagree with the National Council and not only am I doing that in isolation I am doing it in conjunction with the statement that Honourable Minister has made so I do not see how you can teach me to argue otherwise.

Look, it is Committee Stage in one of the three provisions that you are referring to the Act purports to interpret the Constitution on behalf of the Supreme Court and how do we not argue? An argument upon which that provision was made was embedded in Article 81 that was the substantive argument used to (intervention).

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Sorry Honourable Muharukua I am not lecturing you but we are dealing with the (intervention).

**HON MUHARUKUA**: I am lecturing you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: We are dealing with the principal.

## 18 October 2016 COMMITTEE STAGE – NAMIBIA CITIZENSHIP AMENDMENT BILL HON MUHARUKUA

<u>SE</u>
go
s.
<u>SE</u>
<u>SE</u>

## 18 October 2016 COMMITTEE STAGE – NAMIBIA CITIZENSHIP AMENDMENT BILL RT HON DR KUUGONGELWA-AMADHILA

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: But remember I am reminding you to consider we are dealing with principals here, continue.

HON MUHARUKWA: Which principals?

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: The rules.

HON MUHARUKUA: Which ones?

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Continue. Do not ask me questions. Thank you.

HON MUHARUKUA: Yes there is (intervention).

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: It is a principal of the Bill. It is a principal of the Bill. Yes, I recognise the Right Honourable Prime Minister.

**RT HON PRIME MINISTER**: ... What is a Bill? He asked the matter of principle (off microphone) not for us to discuss the merits or demerits of

### 18 October 2016 COMMITTEE STAGE – NAMIBIA CITIZENSHIP AMENDMENT BILL HON MUHARUKUA

the position of the National Council but doing it within the context of the position that is taken by the Cabinet which is the one that brought the Bill to Parliament in the first instance to say that Cabinet would want to have this matter looked at, at another time. So can we not just agree to let the matter rest and wait for when the issue is brought again to this House?

I think that really is the request of the Minister. I think that that would spare us time and efforts because a discussion now would not yield any benefits for the country because there would be no decision taken the matter would be reconsidered anew so that is my appeal Chairperson.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Thank you. That is the appeal from the Right Honourable Prime Minister. Are you insisting that you still have the floor?

**<u>HON MUHARUKUA</u>**: I am not insisting I still have the floor. I have the floor. You gave me the floor.

The Prime Minister gave a way forward which I am amenable to agree to or profoundly disagree with and I so happen to disagree. Why because what is being and I understand why the Cabinet would so not wish this to be discussed and just let it slip through but the point is this that I am driving home. I will talk about the Bill.

At some point I will come with a solution that I have given the Attorney General before with regards to the specific provisions but this is a classic case. Honourable Chair, I am told I must speak with you. This is classic case (intervention).

### 18 October 2016 COMMITTEE STAGE – NAMIBIA CITIZENSHIP AMENDMENT BILL HON MUHARUKUA

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Through me not to me.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Through you, you are lecturing me. This is a classic case of the Executives dominance and muscling of its powers in the Legislative body. Yes for the Prime Minister to say (intervention).

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Point Of Order.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: By who now?

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: By Honourable Maamberua.

**HON MAAMBERUA**: Yes, thank you Comrade Chairperson of the Committee of the Whole House. The direction that you are giving that we need to strictly stay within the confines of the decision of the National Council may I humbly request that we be provided with what the National Council has decided because we do not have. We do not know what National Council said, that is one.

Secondly, much as one perhaps could agree with the Minister of Justice I seek to understand whether, is Cabinet withdrawing the Bill that they submitted to this House or are we reacting on information or a decision of

### 18 October 2016 COMMITTEE STAGE – NAMIBIA CITIZENSHIP AMENDMENT BILL HON SHANGHALA

Cabinet of which we are not privy to? Which of the two? So it is a question of procedure. Can you guide the House in that respect? Thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: I recognise the Attorney General.

**HON ATTORNEY GENERAL**: Thank you Deputy Chairperson of the Whole House Committee.

First of all I think we need to be reminded of the Constitutional function we are engaging in. Please let me just say this and then you can come in? In terms of the Constitution of the Republic of Namibia we have two Houses one is the primary house and the one is the House of Review.

When a Bill is referred to the National Council and the National Council rejects its principle it is referred back to this House and the House can either consider the principle, affirm it and the Bill does not lapse or if two-thirds majority exists the Bill is considered and it is that issue again. I thought that the process initiated was for the purpose of considering that particular report.

Now, there may be issues rightly put that the availability of the report should Honourable Members may be an issue that they want to familiarise themselves with the contents I have no issue with that so I am not taking issue with that and I think perhaps it ought to have just been provided. The issue here is as follows.

If we open the debate the debate should be to consider the principle of the Bill in the context of the report that has been submitted. Bills in this House are tabled by Members of the National Assembly either in their

### 18 October 2016 COMMITTEE STAGE – NAMIBIA CITIZENSHIP AMENDMENT BILL HON SHANGHALA

capacities as Members of the Executive or as Members of the House in principle. Now, there can be no issue that the Executive is dominating because we sit in this House in our capacities as Members of the House.

Now, Honourable Chairperson (intervention). No, I was just contributing to the guidance that we seek to object to move forward and if it is not appreciated I understand clearly well but you also had the floor and I now have the floor.

Now what I suggest Honourable Chairperson is if we could direct our comments to the report whether or not the Bill becomes an issue again a proposal was made. This side of the House agrees with it and it should now be put.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Point of Order from Honourable Muharukua.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Honourable Chairperson of the Whole House Committee it is procedural for you to allow me to make a point of order on his point that is my view but (intervention).

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: You have the floor, otherwise I will rule you to sit down.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: No, but you have allowed him to make a submission and not a point of order that is why you are justified in

## 18 October 2016 COMMITTEE STAGE – NAMIBIA CITIZENSHIP AMENDMENT BILL HON IIVULA-ITHANA

allowing that so please make this point or order a point of order so that I can continue having my floor?

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Can you sit down you have made your point of order to the Attorney General, thank you very much. (Laughter) Attorney General continue and conclude.

**HON ATTORNEY GENERAL**: In conclusion, Chairperson, and will never be amazed enough in this House apparently, in conclusion I think we ought to be directed by you that we then first of all time frame. Secondly to the issue, does the Bill become an issue, the proposal is on the floor and that is the issue that needs to be discussed. Does it lapse or does it become an issue? Thank you.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOIUSE COMMITTEE: May I then recognise the Honourable Minister of Home Affairs and Immigration. You do not have the floor Comrade Muharukua sit down. No sit down.

Honourable Minister of Home Affairs and Immigration. You will come just sit down. Sit down.

**HON MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION**: Sit down my son.

Comrade Chairperson of the Whole House Committee, before I proceed

## 18 October 2016 COMMITTEE STAGE – NAMIBIA CITIZENSHIP AMENDMENT BILL HON IIVULA-ITHANA

on this matter I thought I gave guidance as to what we are supposed to be embarking upon and how. We are not guided by this booklet in this matter we are guided by the Constitution. I referred to Article 75(a) and (b). Read it my son. Understand it then you should know what we are dealing with. The National Council although I am not the one I think to read this to you I got my copy maybe I was privy to this because I am the mover of this Bill here. It says in paragraph 2, "The National Council dealt with the aforementioned" meaning the Citizenship Amendment Bill. "The National Council dealt with the aforementioned Bill in terms of Article 75:5(a) of the Constitution and unanimously objected to the principle of the Bill" that is what they said.

Now, the Constitution tells us, in that instance where the National Council has objected to the principle of the Bill what the National Assembly should do.

The National Assembly, if I may read this paragraph to you. It says, "If the National Council in its report objects to the principle of the Bill the National Assembly shall be required to consider the principle. If upon such consideration, the principle if upon such consideration the National Assembly reaffirms the principle of the Bill by a majority of two-thirds of all Members the principle of the Bill shall no longer be an issue. If such two-thirds majority is not obtained in the National Assembly the Bill shall lapse".

I proceeded from there to say since I am bound by the collective decision making principle of Cabinet and Cabinet has expressed itself on the matter that this Bill should not be proceeded with because, wait so that I read it for you properly. "So that Cabinet remains ceased with the matter and undertakes to consult widely with the view to seeking long term solutions because the matter is not concluded. Cabinet wants to be ceased with the matter so that it consults widely and a solution should be found so that we put the matter to rest".

That is the position and therefore I am proposing, I have proposed that let

### 18 October 2016 COMMITTEE STAGE – NAMIBIA CITIZENSHIP AMENDMENT BILL HON MUHARUKUA

the principle of this Bill be withdrawn and the Bill lapses. That is the proposal.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: With that principle to withdraw and the Mover has withdrawn the Bill now what are discussing again. I only invite for further discussion. Who is having the floor? Yes.

HON MUHARUKUA: Yes hear out, we are not at school we are in Parliament. Honourable Chairperson, as we are sitting my Honourable mother Minister has said Parliament must consider or reconsider whichever the word but what word entails it apply your mind. Parliament must apply its mind in whether or not to agree to the withdrawal whether or not to decide to send the thing back, the Bill back sorry to the National Council with the two-thirds, yes with the two-thirds majority. We have that right, but you cannot argue because Cabinet has decided that it is not going to discuss this thing therefore Parliament must not.

At this point this document is not a Cabinet document it is a Parliamentary document and we should have the full right to discuss the document. When we make the decision whether or not to withdraw or to refer the Bill we have made our contributions.

HON DEPUTY CHAIRPERSON OF THE WHOLE HOUSE COMMITTEE: Before I give the floor to Honourable Kawana there will be no further discussion. I shall report the Bill being rescinded. So agreed.

Honourable Speaker, the Committee has reconsidered the Bill, [B11 –

## 18 October 2016 COMMITTEE STAGE – NAMIBIA CITIZENSHIP AMENDMENT BILL HON MUHARUKUA

2016] as set forth in the accompanying copy and agreed as it should be rescinded.

#### **ASSEMBLY RESUMED**

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you. Honourable Members let us calm down. Having considered the Bill the Assembly has now finally concluded the business on this item. Yes?

HON MUHARUKUA: Honourable Speaker, was not looking at me when I raised my hand before I suppose using the gallows. What was reported to the Honourable Speaker, I have to also report, is false. The Deputy Chair oppressed the Chamber us here, no one had the right to speak. The Cabinet is oppressing the Backbenchers (interruptions).

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you I think in democracy we can debate we can discuss but the report that was given to me left me with no option but to accept in line with the rules but I think this is not the end of the matter. For now it has been concluded.

The Secretary will read the Second Order of the Day.

RESUMPTION OF DEBATE ON FAMILIARISATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS IN OPUWO AND KUNENE REGIONS

#### CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON DIENDA

**HON SPEAKER**: When this debate was adjourned on Thursday the 13<sup>th</sup> of October 2016 the question before the Assembly was a report by the Honourable Jagger.

The Honourable Dienda adjourned the debate and now offers her the floor.

**HON DIENDA**: Thank you Honourable Speaker, and also allow me to congratulate you with your appointment on behalf of the DTA and we hope that you will make us proud and may God Bless you always.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you.

**HON DIENDA**: Honourable Speaker, allow me as one of the delegates to visit the Kunene Region as part of the report currently under discussion to clear one issue and that is that nowhere in the country will you find so many mobile schools like in Opuwo and that is what we want to emphasise in our report, the mobile schools. What is happening in Opuwo is very different from the rest of the country.

Honourable Speaker, qualified teachers will maybe work for one year at these mobile schools or until such time as they can find permanent employment at a school with proper fixed conventional structures. Why am I saying this Honourable Speaker?

Firstly because of the distance and the road infrastructure, as a woman, as a feminist I want to make it clear that female teachers are not encouraged to teach in those areas because of the distance. It will be difficult for

#### CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON DIENDA

female to fall pregnant there because you will be stuck there for nine months in that area yes. (Intervention).

months in that area yes. (Intervention).
HON SPEAKER: On a point of order?
HON DIENDA: Can I finish? If I fall pregnant Honourable Speaker must lose my child where I have (intervention).
HON SPEAKER: On the point or order.
HON DIENDA: You cannot fall pregnant.
HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY: Of course, Honourable Dienda, a male cannot but did the Honourable Member know that there are people born in those villages so far away from the centre and that they are born from male or how are they born from trees if you as an ordinar female cannot live there? I think that statement is out of place and in factual.
HON SPEAKER: Honourable Member continue.

#### CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON DIENDA

HON DIENDA: ...Out of touch with reality. Honourable Speaker, travelling those roads is so difficult it was like a natural massage that is going through the way those roads. It is difficult for females to sit there because if anything happens to you within that ninth month of pregnancy for you to travel that distance to the nearest clinic it will be difficult. You might lose your child. No you will not know you were never pregnant in your life.

**HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY**: I am a Member of the House and therefore an elected official to defend the rights of everybody including those that do not fall pregnant. Your statement Honourable Dienda is in-factual and cannot hold water.

I, therefore, suggest that you withdraw and carry out with the rest of what you should.

**HON SPEAKER**: Honourable Member.

**HON DIENDA**: Honourable Speaker, because of the lack of accommodation and the conditions in which they are teaching it will be difficult to find people that teach who want to stay there permanently. There are no services available like clinics.

For example, Honourable Chairperson we were there and there was a child bitten by a snake and the child could not be taken to the nearest clinic because there was no transport. So the child was waiting for the parents to pick her up to take her to the nearest clinic or hospital, lack of availability

#### CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON DIENDA

of water whereby animals are given preference to drink before the children.

Honourable Speaker, learners are doing the cooking and the cleaning because of lack of institutional workers. Are we not in breach of the Labour Act and other International Instruments that prohibits child labour?

**HON MINISTER OF MINES AND ENERGY**: Were they asked to cook?

**HON DIENDA**: There is nobody to cook. What can you talk about of course there is nobody to cook. Teachers, oh Saki please leave me in peace. Teachers in most of the cases are using their own resources to cater for the needs of the children. When the main meal is not delivered on time it becomes the responsibilities of teachers to feed learners from their pockets otherwise they will not attend school. Why can these not also be supplemented with canned fish and other durable foodstuffs. It is the ten teachers who are sharing also the tent with the learners.

Honourable Speaker, the Universal Primary Education Fund which is not paid also on time is also another challenge. If that problem can also be overcome the burden from teachers might be lighter.

Honourable Speaker, let me address the issue of funding of private schools.

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, Article 20 of the Constitution reads as follows:

#### CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON DIENDA

- 1) Primary Education is compulsory;
- 2) The State shall provide reasonable facilities;
- 3) To render effective these rights for every residence within Namibia by establishing and maintaining State schools at which primary education will be provided free of charge.
- 4) All persons shall have the right at their own expense to establish and to maintain private school, colleges or other institutions or tertiary education provided there.

Honourable Speaker, the Constitution is very clear. Our children are suffering at State Schools due to the lack of resources while we are funding private schools.

This is not in the Constitution, it is in the Education Act but it is not in the Constitution that we must fund private schools. The money that is (intervention).

**HON SPEAKER**: Is it a point of order?

**HON MUHARUKUA**: May I ask the Honourable Member whether I am hearing her correct to be saying that to the funding (intervention). Ah, it seems to me you are not caucusing with Nekundi and Swaartbooi here next to me (laughter). Whether I am correct to be hearing her to say that it is unconstitutional to be funding private schools, just to clarify if whether that is the interpretation of the (indistinct).

# CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON DIENDA

HON SPEAKER: Yes I am sure she will offer that.

**HON DIENDA**: I am very clear on it, I said the Constitution says that private schools a person shall have the right at their own expense to establish and maintain private schools. Nowhere in the Constitution is it written that we must maintain and fund private schools.

Honourable Speaker, the money that is in use to fund private schools can be used to uplift the standards of our State schools. Parents are paying enormous amounts of money to private schools. Private school teachers are teaching not more than twice to five learners in the class, have better learning and teaching materials, better equipped classrooms and other infrastructures because parents opt to pay for these facilities. Why must the Government on top of that (intervention).

HON SPEAKER: On a point of order, Honourable Ithete, microphone.

HON MEMBER: (Not on microphone).

HON DIENDA: I am that is why I come with the question.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Honourable Speaker, Honourable Member, on a point of information regarding the issue of

#### CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON DIENDA

funding private schools or not. Let me give information that our Government is responsible for all its citizens and when it comes to learners for every learner whether you are in private school or not in private school as long as you are under 16 you must be at school. As long as you are under 16 Government should make sure that the children go to school without mentioning the word private or not private. Whether you go to whatever school you remain the responsibility of Government. Thank you very much it is just a condition.

**HON SPEAKER**: Honourable please continue.

**HON DIENDA**: This information is misguided because this is not what the Constitution says. The Constitution says own expenses for private school and State to fund, for us to fund State school so your information is misdirected cannot be true.

Honourable Speaker, why must the Government on top of that still fund private schools in whatever manner we are doing it? No child is being blocked from attending State schools which are being funded by the Government. It is the parents' rights and decisions to put their children in the schools of their choices so they must also pay for that choice. Why must other people suffer because their parents do not have that choice?

Are we not indirectly disadvantaging other children if we as the Government are saying that we will find learners who are schooling in private school? What is the amount, Honourable Speaker, (intervention).

#### CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON DIENDA

**HON SPEAKER**: Point of order. Okay it is coming.

**HON JAGGER**: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. I am totally confused because the contribution that the Honourable Member has made does not speak to the report that that is now under discussion. Nowhere in the report is there anything to do with private schools, so I would advise through you Honourable Speaker that the Honourable Member stays within the report. Thank you very much.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. Thank you very much, please continue.

**HON DIENDA**: Honourable Speaker, I am bringing in private school because what I am saying is the money that we are giving to private schools can be better used to State Schools who does not have the resources this is why I am bringing this. If we bring that money to the State schools our situation might change. This is why I am bringing change.

Honourable Speaker, what is the amount given to private schools? Are we giving them the same amount of N\$250,00 per child like we are doing with learners who are in State Schools?

Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members it is time to put our money and our resources into the right places and for the right purposes, I thank you.

#### CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON HINDA

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you, the Honourable Maureen Hinda please.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS AND COOPERATION**: Thank you very much. Honourable Speaker I rise to firstof all compliment the Committee that has worked on this report or that has made the effort to visit that came up with this report. I must say that it came up with information, I hope I have the floor and I wish to be listened to. Honourable Speaker (intervention). Who is disturbing me I do not know if I have the floor or somebody else has the floor?

**HON SPEAKER**: Let us have order.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS AND COOPERATION**: Honourable Speaker, I am saying I want to congratulate or thank the Committee that has worked on this report.

It is very painful information that comes through this report but I must also say that there are some pertinent questions that come to my mind looking at the report and the combination of the Committees that visited the area considering the realities on the ground, the first one would be was there be perhaps not communication gap in discussing these issues that probably there are more pertinent or serious matters that never have come out, because the discussions there have been limited. I am saying that because I can see that most of the people in the group will not have been able to communicate.

What is painful to me also in terms of the reports is that the report is very

#### CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON HINDA

general. For example on page 4 it says, 'The delegation was informed that many learners have graduated from the mobile units". I think with the background given and the reality as described elsewhere in the report, the report needs to be more specific to tell us is these mobile school efforts or the unit systems effective? Does it result into how many graduates or what percentage of output does it give you? How many children that go through this process and are in Grade 12 or at the University.

I am also saying that in the recommendations I missed the point of alternative intervention or recommendations in terms of alternative intervention because I believe mobile unit systems is probably what was decided on 20 years or 30 years ago to say this is how we will deal with the challenge of the communities that are, how do they call it? That moves around a lot.

HON MEMBER: Nomadic communities.

**HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS AND COOPERATION:** Nomadic communities, thank you very much. For the nomadic communities that will be the approach. Was there ever any reassessment done to see if it produces any results?

I am also of the opinion that there is a need for interventions of Social Workers or with social work responsibility interventions or even for psychologists to see how do we redress the situation of the community to integrate at least those ones who want to advance further that can join the Economic Ministry in the process of education or are we simply allowing these kids to be in what seems to be a school to comply with compulsory education to a certain age or what is it that we wish to achieve? (Intervention).

# CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON HINDA

HON SPEAKER: On a Point of order.
HON MUHARUKUA: I just want, just for clarity so that we are on the same wavelength. I want to understand from the Deputy Minister as to what exactly she wishes the Social Workers to do to ensure that the students are part of the Economic Ministry just to link the two, I think I missed somewhere?
HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS AND COOPERATION: I do not think Honourable Speaker my responsibility here is to give the job description of that (indistinct) but what I am trying to say is that there is some social problems. There are other issues. For example talking about lack of involvement of parents (intervention).
HON SPEAKER: Yes, point of order.
HON MINISTER OF FINANCE: Thank you very much. Honourable Speaker I just wanted to ask the Honourable Member whether she takes the question from me.
HON SPEAKER: To take the question? Will you take the question?

#### CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON HINDA

### HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS AND COOPERATION: Yes I will do.

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Thank you, and I am sorry for disturbing your line of thought, I think you are doing very well.

Honourable Member I assume you have heard the argument from Honourable Dienda questioning the funding of private school. Now I just wanted to know from you whether you are aware that the subsidy that private schools get are linked to the obligation to take 10% of the total pupils in the school free of charge and if that is so whether that is not and very cost effective way to propagate and like possible for the disadvantaged kids to have good education, are you aware of that?

### HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS AND COOPERATION: Thank you very much.

Honourable Speaker, I did not take my line of argument from Honourable Dienda, I am in full appreciation with the funding model for private schools. I am an owner of a private Vocation Training Centre that benefits so what I am trying to argue is that we have children of nomadic community whose education is being advanced through mobile unit training systems.

The report does not give us details in terms of percentage of dropout rates or percentage of succession rates of these efforts of intervention and what the intervention or the report tells me is that there are other social issues around the education of these learners but the report does not address or recommend other interventions to deal with this matter holistically.

#### CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON SANKWASA

Mobile unit systems could have been seen as appropriate at the time, can it be reassessed? Are there other interventions so that is the gist of my intervention. I thank you Comrade Speaker.

HON SPEAKER: Thank you. The Honourable Sankwasa.

### **HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT**: Thank you Honourable Speaker.

I appreciate what Honourable Dienda has said but my mind pulls me back to where the report says Familiarization Visit to Capital Projects. I was expecting to understanding the state of the Capital Projects be they school construction, roads construction whatever project is going on there to have shed light for me to understand what is the state of the Capital Projects in the area not private schools funding.

However, I appreciate the fact that we also must be cognisant of the fact that mobile schools provided by Government are in line with the Constitutional provision that has been quoted here for the Government to provide reasonable facilities to the citizens that is education level. When you deal with a nomadic community coupled with the issue of topographical situation you need to findthe best way to deal with that situation.

You cannot create a permanent structure which will be constructed at a cost to Government but which will stand idling for the better part of the year because the people have left the area. It will be a wrong investment it is rather the school should follow the people not the people following the school that should be the principle.

#### CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON KAVITA

Therefore to argue that maybe that form of module is a bit misplaced brings me to the issue of common knowledge because my grandmother taught that there are times when common knowledge is not common.

Therefore I would rather feel that the Committee should bring this House to discuss capital projects not funding. Can I get that from the Committee? Thank you.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. The Honourable Kavita.

**HON KAVITA**: Thank you very much, Honourable Speaker. Honourable Speaker I am part and parcel of this Committee that is why I stood up and want to support my colleagues.

Honourable Speaker, I do not speak many times in this Chamber but I rose today because I am in support of this report on a visit of a mobile school in the Kunene Region.

As we all know Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, education is a very key to the development of any country having Vision 2030 in mind. Without education our people shall lack knowledge and skills and will not be knowledgeable and industrialised nation as envisaged.

Therefore, Honourable Speaker, as a person who grew up in Erongo Region I have never seen an experience that I have seen in Kunene. I heard about mobile schools but I thought it is teachers in a vehicle that goes from Point A to B to teach, go from Point C and stop and teach there. When I saw with my own eyes I can also just say that I was in pain. It is not a good situation where under our learners are taught. I fully understand that Government's responsibility over the nation, I also knew

#### CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON KAVITA

this is not just a Kunene problem but I did not visit schoolsin the whole country since I joined this Parliament last year. But the situation of Kunene speaks for itself. It speaks for attention, it seeps for changes from current situation to a more conventional school situation.

It is my belief that enough teachers, although teachers are trying very hard to teach those learners in the mobile units we cannot expect, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members that absolute quality education is realised because of the conditions under which they teach.

For example when the wind is blowing pens just go with the wind, when it is raining water is flowing into the tents and the teaching aids are damaged and destroyed. I do not think that the mobile school has not produced learners up to Secondary or University level but there was a teacher who taught the team that he was learning in a mobile unit later went through the Secondary Education and completed BETB in-service training. He told us that he would not like to see his own children taught in a mobile school so it means that really it is a very serious problem but that is realised later that it is not good for my child to come in the same school where I am going through.

Lastly, Honourable Speaker, Honourable Members, I kindly ask the Regional Councillors to support the educational regional office to bring changes to the situation so that learners from Bondao Mobile Units also benefit the same sources as the other learners in the country. I must applaud the Regional Office of Education, the Management of Bondao, the teachers, school committee and parents for that they do and needs for those children (intervention).

**HON SPEAKER**: On a point of order or point of information?

# CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON LIMBO

HON KAVITA: I thank you.
<b>HON SPEAKER</b> : Thank you very much I think she is done. The Honourable Agnes Limbo.
HON LIMBO: Thank you Honourable Speaker, I want to start by saying I am a Member of this Committee although I did not take the journey to Opuwo. I know exactly (intervention).
HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Why not?
HON LIMBO: I was busy somewhere.
HON MINISTER OF SAFETY AND SECURITY: Where?
HON LIMBO: Honourable General, please.

What I want to say Honourable Members is that I know exactly what the colleagues are saying. We saw it all. All these years we have been going now the situation is even getting worse because as the sister is saying that when the wind blows the whole thing is shifted. When the rain comes it is

#### CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON LIMBO

something else, I think every time every year things are getting worse.

I know Government, we are not saying Government did not do anything. They tried because of the conditions of the area itself but what I want to appeal to the House is that yes the report is here, the recommendations are here maybe I want to borrow what Honourable Mutorwa was saying the other day, let us look at this report, we take the recommendations seriously and give it to the people so that at least where we can improve we can improve the situation.

It will be very unfair for us to say the Namibian child is given the equal opportunity because my child who is seated in Katima Mulilo for example as compared to the child in Opuwo I do not think they are given the equal opportunity because the condition is different and the teachers themselves are also exhausted and somehow depressed so they are not going to give their best to these kids.

Coming back to what my sister Dienda was saying that if a woman is in Opuwo she cannot get pregnant I just want to correct her, no, (intervention).

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF GENDER, EQUALITY AND CHILD WELFARE: Thank you, Honourable Member. Just on a point of clarity, based on the cover letter of the report.

Did the Committee and I think that Honourable Member knows? Did the Committee visit Capital Project to see how far the progress is with those Capital Projects or did the Committee visit schools in the Kunene region? I just wanted clarity.

#### CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON MUHARUKUA

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you.

**HON LIMBO**: Thank you, Honourable Chairperson. I think I hear what my sister is saying but I will leave that question to the capable Chairperson of the Committee to do so. But what I wanted to say is that Honourable Dienda is not falling pregnant that is the (incomplete), the delivery. But what I can tell you Honourable Members is that when I was telling my last born and that is the time we were putting up what is that, Epupa Clinic.

I was five months pregnant and I was on that truck going because when you are supposed to give the service there is nothing you can do whether you are pregnant or not because I found myself at that time I was even in a better position as compared to my colleagues women who were in those villages so I sacrificed my own child thank God she is a qualified Accountant today so she was born boldly because she even came earlier because I was jumping.

So that is what I wanted to say that I just want to appeal to the House that let us take this report seriously and whether you are looking at the title of the report put the fact remains schools, clinics whatever is part of the Capital Projects but I will leave that to the capable Chairperson to do so. Thank you very much.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you very much. Next is the Honourable Muharukua.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Thank you. I think we heard it from the

#### CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON MUHARUKUA

Honourable Speaker just before me that if all ladies want successful children they must just go to Opuwo (laughter).

**HON SPEAKER**: Are you saying they should go by air or by road?

**<u>HON MUHARUKUA</u>**: By trucks or whatever they must just set foot in Opuwo come back children will become successful.

Look, I am quite glad that this report came to the fore of discussions or to the floor of this Parliament. And I think at times we fail to study what the underlining reasons are for doing something or how we got to a specific place.

One is talking about why do we have mobile schools and two, why are we discussing the problem that we are discussing now? My own assessment of it is that we are having this problem as a result of the success of Mobile schools. If we are to be honest and to be true with ourselves and speaking as a person who comes from that community, mobile schools were a deliberate targeted intervention by the Norwegians after which the Government took over.

This programme in my mind was run pretty good. The results of it are pretty good that is why we are having these discussions. Why am I saying we have succeeded? Because the programme was designed to reach a community, a Himba community who: Apparently would refuse to take the child to school because the child must herd cattle or stay at home. So in order to provide a situation where this current would not have any objection to take the child to school (intervention).

#### CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON MUHARUKUA

**HON SPEAKER**: A point of order.

**HON MINISTER OF FINANCE**: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. Can I ask you a question please? You said just now that the programme was a Norwegian programme now if I remember correctly it was actually a Government Programme assisted by Norway, is that correct?

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Honourable Chairperson, perhaps the nitty gritties the Honourable would be better vested in the actual agreement but whichever the case may be the Norwegians assisted and then at some point they left and Government continued. Even after Government continued they did a pretty good job there is no dispute about that.

Firstly, it was about bringing a situation where the parent had no objection or reason to object to take the child to school that succeeded because now we have more mobile schools and we have bigger mobile schools that is why I am saying the programme has succeeded and the reason why we have these problems which are all genuine problems is because the programme has succeeded. Yes it is my Constituency. Now he took me out of my drift but be that as it may we have bigger schools now.

The problem in my mind or in my view or in my observation comes in where these schools must now move from the point of being a mobile school to become to be rehabilitated if that is the correct word to use as a formal school. At times we take a bit long in that area. Here you have a school of 150 kids hypothetically and with the lack of all these provisions.

Perhaps we must have placed systems or regular checks that ensures that schools that mobile schools that succeed immediately would get the attention and the funding to be converted into formal schools and to

#### CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON MUHARUKUA

actually afford the kids in those particular schools the same facilities as the whole country brought but to say that, I would not quite agree coming from that community to say that a mobile school just like the Honourable Sankwasa said must become a stationary school. I do not think anyone said that but I am just saying it: 1) It will be a waste of resources and 2) because it is not necessary.

What I would propose in terms of mobile schools is that maybe the mobile facilities that are used become more perhaps, can say more mobile, we can make it perhaps more accommodating, more conducive to the harsh environmental situation that we have. For example maybe instead of having tents for schools or having tents for accommodation dorms we can have this (intervention).

HON SPEAKER: Point of order, Honourable John Mutorwa.

HON MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY:
(Not on microphone).

HON SPEAKER: Can you take care of your microphone. Honourable Mutorwa your microphone.

**HON MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE, WATER AND FORESTRY:** 

You are important, I like your logical analysis of the issue. May you take a question from me? As a former Minister of Basic Education I do agree with the essence of your argument that in certain respects the fundamental

#### CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON MUHARUKUA

main objectives of the mobile school could be characterised as having been successful.

Now I just want to understand, in my own view as you have also argued mobile schools had to come in to respond to a unique situation of providing very essential education services to a nomadic community am I right to understand you that after these years where we have scored some successes that we have a situation where in those communities we may find some acceptance if that is the right word that yes now we have reached a stage where a possibility of a permanent proper structure could be established here and there despite our nomadic life but we will accept that this school should be permanently here, have we reached that stage because if we have then I fully agree with you that I think then we can address some of the problems to maximise further on the successes that we have recorded.

HON MUHARUKUA: Thank you very much, Honourable Mutorwa. That is exactly what I am saying because remember we are not just dealing here with the physical location of individuals or certain people we are dealing here with the mindset of a certain group. We have reached a stage where parents are actually, Ovahimba parents are actually yearning for a school and I profoundly believe that the proposals and requests as they are in this report maybe the Chairperson will say some of them will perhaps come to school with school dogs, school dogs that are of Ovahimba community because through this process Government has taught this community the importance of, I am saying that because I am a member of that (intervention).

<u>HON</u>	<b>SPEA</b>	KER:	Point	of	Order.

#### CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON MUHARUKUA

HON DEPUTY MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IMMIGRATION: Honourable Speaker, thank you very much I am a little bit left behind. Honourable Muharukua if you can help me out and the Committee Members, I want to understand about these mobile schools.

I just want to have a broader understanding because in our case Ministry of Home Affairs and Immigration when you talk about a mobile registration you move from one Constituency to the other Constituency maybe four or five times a year.

Now, these mobile schools how many times do they move from one area to the other area? Are the transport facilities allocated to teachers and maybe accommodation facilities?

I am not exposed to this type of information I just want to understand it is very interesting to me.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: It is not out of disrespect that I will not perhaps enlighten I think the Committee Chairperson will do that. I am not part of the Committee but I believe she is the best to that. But in light of the time I think I want to if you may allow just so that I may finish (intervention).

**HON ATTORNEY GENERAL**: Honourable Speaker, may I kindly just ask one question so that he can wait?

**HON MUHARUKUA**: No, Speaker, no more questions. After I have spoken I will give time for questions and that.

#### CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON MUHARUKUA

**HON SPEAKER**: I thought you had an understanding now?

**HON ATTORNEY GENERAL**: I think the point that Honourable Muharukua is making is a very important point, because he said I think he is supposed to know he was intending to mean.

He has spoken about the cultural existence of the group not the mindsets but relating to that cultural existence and how they live out their culture in a modern world as we are trying now to have schools and clinics and other amenities that are in the area, would the Honourable Member agree then that the discussion and contribution made by Honourable Kapofi is then a point to say at some point we need to find a way in which we can coexist the modality and the cultural existence and not always just say this is how cultural, we are and then allow the proliferation of mobile schools?

Whereas the Honourable Member is saying that they are actually successful and if they are successful would you find harmony in that discussion then so that we can find an optimal way for the education and maybe other services as well be rendered to the communities.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: As much as I want to really venture into both that argument and the argument that the Honourable Calley Schlettwein made I just do not have the time and as the Speaker said the Speaker will indulge. I will at the end of my address also briefly, okay whatever it is, my contribution also just briefly touch on that if the Speaker would allow.

Now I was saying that with regards to the schools that we assess and say must continue to be mobile schools they continue to be mobile (intervention).

#### CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON MUHARUKUA

**HON SPEAKER**: Actually to be fair to the Honourable Muharukua, can he just continue to elaborate because he was just about to say something and maybe let us allow him to advance the argument taking into account the talk.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: Yes it is good that we are interested in our children and our students' lives but maybe the time is a problem. Whatever I am Namibian. Now my in-laws are in Outapi so what are you talking about?

**HON SPEAKER**: Just continue please.

**HON MUHARUKUA**: I am just saying yes the schools that we intend to continue to be mobile we must make sure that the facilities that we provide are perhaps more rigid to deal with the environmental environment that we are talking about. Perhaps instead of, yes maybe that I will leave that there.

Let me address another issue. The Committee really talked about the state of education in the Kunene North specifically Epupa Constituency and some parts of Opuwo Rural Constituency where these mobile schools are. But it is my famous belief having lived in the former Ovamboland now all Os are known for quite a number of years and I believe to a certain extend also the state of education across the whole northern part, okay part of it.

Ask the Honourable Calle Schlettwein he would know but the whole northern band up to the Zambezi I think perhaps it is time that we look and as part of these recommendations and whilst there I would second the

#### CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON MUHARUKUA

proposal of the Honourable Mutorwa that the Ministry perhaps be directed to go and conduct an investigation or an assessment of the whole educational need of the whole northern band because this is not only peculiar (intervention).

Well perhaps also I am not vested but those that are vested in that maybe they should do that. They should also recommend such but we perhaps have a look at the whole educational sector and needs so that we can have a comprehensive report of where we really stand just briefly and specifically going back to these schools and the success of these mobile schools.

There is one peculiarity of Epupa Constituency where most of these mobile schools are. There is only one junior Secondary School in the whole of Epupa, one and that is in Okangwati. This school was created or the hostel of this school was created or designed to cater or built to cater for 150 children. The whole of the community and/or children of the Epupa Constituency have to make use of this school.

What happens is this school has said okay fine let us take 300 children avoid the rest to go. The rest stay in the location exposed to alcohol, girls they must live have accommodation and this is where we have teenage pregnancies.

Alternatively, these children must go to Opuwo for school. Remember a child must apply, this is some sort of maybe relatively recently procedures that are put in place. These children must apply and I will finish now Honourable Speaker. They must apply. The child is of a Himba parent who does not know so we expect a 13 year old Grade 7 to apply on their own to a school. We would really expect our own children as we sit here to do that, so one of the things that I think is very much a need in that particular Constituency is the upgrading of the Okangwati Junior Secondary School to a Senior Secondary School, the exigency and need to construct a hostel that can cater for a maximum number of students at that

#### CONSIDERATION OF REPORT ON FAMILIARIZATION VISIT TO CAPITAL PROJECTS HON MUHARUKUA

particular school because we are really prejudicing our own children by not providing these things.

Quickly, on the argument of the Honourable Kapofi. I agree. I agree that, yes briefly I agree that at some point some modernisation and culture must meet. Right, but it is also important that this must be done gradually and systematically so as not to prejudice the person.

To give you an example you bring modern life to Ruacana, actual real life example, a place where the Himbas lived where the Zembas lived. Modern life comes there, modern life comes with alcohol what happens? People who do not know money they only know herding cattle and to trade with cattle because they are trading with Angola with cattle, what happens? These people start trading their cattle with alcohol.

Extinction, totally pure extinction people actually died out that is why the demographics of Ruacana would look like it does now, people died (intervention).

HON	SPEAKER: (	ood. We leave	it at that.		
<u>HON</u>	<u>MUHARUKI</u>	J <u>A</u> : Just lastly -		saying (int	erruptions).
		Thank you vekotora, just to	•		

#### ADJOURNMENT HON PROF KATJAVIVI

HON KAVEKOTORA: Something. Thank you.

**HON SPEAKER**: Thank you. We will adjourn the House with Honourable Mike Kavekotora, continue the debate tomorrow. Can we call it a day?

Respectfully thanking everybody who has spoken and those who have wished me well in my new assigned led by the Honourable Dienda.

With that, the House stands adjourned until tomorrow the usual time.

**HOUSE ADJOURNS AT 17:48 UNTIL 2016.10.19 AT 14:30**